# CHAPTER ONE

# INTRODUCTION

## 1.1 Personal motivation

The author, as flute player and music educator, became involved with the MEUSSA (Music Education Unit Standards for Southern Africa) project in the Music Education division of the University of Pretoria early in 2000. This project involved the generation of unit standards throughout the area of music(s) for all genres practised within the region of Southern Africa, and will be explained in more detail later in this chapter.

The enthusiasm of the project leaders, Proff. Caroline van Niekerk and Heinrich van der Mescht, as well as the transitional character of the current scenario in South Africa have both played a significant part in convincing the author to participate in this unique undertaking. The opportunity to play a part in determining the direction of music education in South Africa could simply not be ignored.

Because the author's field of expertise lies, inter alia, in the instruction of the flute at secondary school level, the generation of standards for Aerophones (performance) was personally regarded as essential.

## 1.2 Background

South African education authorities have, with the introduction of a new educational dispensation in 1994 (SAQA 2000a:5), instituted a new system of training and education. This new approach has as its main goal the cultivation of attitudes, skills, values and knowledge in learners of all ages to "build the country into an international role-player" (Olivier 2000:i). In order to achieve this, Olivier regards five elements as of utmost importance, namely

- effective and critical learning;
- development of opportunities and challenges;

- problem-solving abilities;
- the developing of positive inter-personal skills; and
- the enhancement of a culture of lifelong learning and creative thinking.

Curriculum 2005 has been progressively introduced since 1998. A revision of Curriculum 2005 was facilitated by the South African Department of Education during 2000-2001 and a simplified version introduced in August 2001. The approach of Curriculum 2005 is outcomes-based. This means that training has to be directed towards furnishing learners with the necessary skills and knowledge to cope with life after school, as well as developing and educating the whole person. "The focus with outcomes-based learning lies in acquiring the capability to know what to learn and which skills to master in managing one's own learning" (Olivier 2000:3). The scope of cultural background, individual differences and different learning abilities of pupils are included in this approach.

A curriculum consists of specific outcomes, as packaged into learning areas (Olivier 2000:5). The South African educational structure consists of eight learning areas, and specific outcomes for these eight learning areas, as educational means, will be formulated by relevant Standards Generating Bodies (SGBs) in the form of unit standards. Unit standards may be defined as "nationally agreed and comparable statements supported by specific outcomes and their associated assessment criteria together with other relevant and needed information" (Olivier 2000:23). This system closely resembles the system currently used by the New Zealand educational authorities.[1] In this regard, the new educational structure for South Africa is still in its first stages, with the generation and registration of unit standards in a developmental phase.

The first step towards formalising the new system was taken in 1995, with legislation that would enable an integrated education and training system. The SAQA Act of 4 October 1995 provided for the development and implementation of a National Qualifications Framework

---

[1] The reader is referred to the corresponding section on the educational system of New Zealand, which is discussed in chapter 3. Another member of the MEUSSA group, Petro Grové, provided a detailed discussion of the format of the new educational approach in South Africa.

and the establishment of the South African Qualifications Authority (Olivier 2000:8). The implementation of a new education system effected a need for music educators in Southern Africa to come together and plan the way forward for reform in music education, thereby defining and ensuring its role within the new education system.

On 17 July 1999 a music educators' organisation, called the South African Music Educators' Forum (SAMEF), was formed in Pretoria. Grové (2001:2-2) formulates the events as follows:

> To start the process of restructuring music education systems in Southern Africa, music educators were called upon at the *23rd Biennial World Conference of the International Society for Music Education* held in Pretoria from 19–25 July 1998, to establish a *South African Music Education Forum* (SAMEF) that would function as a representative forum for music education nationally.

Role players in South African music education, including state, community, labour, business, providers and critical interest groups were represented (Grové 2001:2-3). The purpose of SAMEF, as formulated by Hauptfleisch (cited by Grové 2001:2-2) was stated as follows:

> [...] SAMEF will act as an umbrella body for organisations and institutions with a material interest in music education in our country. In essence, the SAMEF will promote continuity of purpose between the activities of the different music education structures and organisations in South Africa and serve as a strong and representative voice for all aspects of music education.

SAMEF was never intended to replace any of the many music organisations on South Africa, but rather to facilitate music educators to speak with one voice at the ISME conference.

### 1.3 The MEUSSA project

Within the new educational system, unit standards indicating learning achievements or outcomes in all subjects must be generated by a Standards Generating Body (SGB) and registered on the National Qualifications Framework (NQF) in order to provide for an integrated National Qualifications Framework. This system is explored in more detail in another MEUSSA member's thesis, namely J.P. Grové: Grové, J.P. 2001. *Music Education Unit Standards for Southern Africa: A Model and its application in a General Music Appraisal Programme*. DMus thesis, University of Pretoria, Pretoria.

A brief outline is also provided in chapter 5 of this thesis.

By the time SAMEF was formed in 1999, there was a lack of co-ordinated attempts towards the goal of generating unit standards for musics in South Africa. According to Prof. Caroline van Niekerk of the University of Pretoria, one of the founding members of SAMEF, facilitating unit standards for only the ten most widely acclaimed subjects could, at that stage, be funded by the Department of Education. To prevent the marginalisation of Music in the field of education, she offered to gather a group of post-graduate students to start working on the task of generating unit standards as soon as possible.

A group of music specialists who could work together to produce unit standards based on thorough research and many years of collective practical experience, encompassing the whole field of music(s), was therefore brought together by the Music Education section of the Department of Music at the University of Pretoria early in 2000. The group consisted of eighteen Master's and doctoral students from various fields of expertise, and the project, of which the author is a member, became known as the MEUSSA project.

By means of research and workshops within the group, the first steps towards a coherent and inclusive set of standards for the whole spectrum of music(s) in Southern Africa were taken. The aim of the MEUSSA project was to specifically produce unit standards for music(s) in the new education and training dispensation, even though this group was not officially registered as an SGB.

At the time of the forming of the MEUSSA group in 2000, no music standards were in the process of being generated, indicating a bleak future for music education in the country. This situation has changed early in 2001, as funding for the generation of unit standards for music, under the umbrella of NSB 02, has been made available by SAQA. Three Music SGBs have consequently been launched in August 2001, namely one each for Music GET, Music HET and Music Industry, with the members of the MEUSSA group forming a substantial part of the Music SGBs for GET and FET. Any unit standards produced by the MEUSSA group will therefore be presented to SAQA for official registration, together with standards generated by the three official Music SGBs.

The common ground within the group was to focus on the provision of unit standards for music in the broadest sense, and not to isolate one or two genres. "[C]onstituent elements

(rhythm, harmony, melody, form) and expressive elements (tempo, dynamics and timbre) are inherent in the musics of many cultures" (Miller 1988:94).

The approach was one of considering music as human expression, consulting high quality music from many genres without isolating one or two styles for educational purposes:

> Music is a truly comprehensive human behaviour. Particularly in its more challenging, subtle and complex manifestations, it requires a just combination and integration of thinking, feeling and sharing – precisely those elements which define humankind. Music education can help students become effective in their use of artistic musical experiences to discover and share thoughts and feelings. Both critical thinking and critical feeling are vital to effective personal and social development for life in the century ahead (Artsedge 2000:1).

In this sense it is important to keep in mind that music and therefore music education cannot be separated from the community and that it is inconceivable to conceptualise music education without keeping in mind the contribution and impact such a successful programme could have on the supporting communities. On the other hand, it is just as important not to isolate the learner from the cultural upbringing and influences of his/her community, but to use this as the starting point of an education in music.

A project of such a range and size is a new one for music(s) in Southern Africa. The coming together of this many post-graduate students from different areas, practices and styles of music to produce an innovative set of unit standards for music education could prove to be of significant value for learners, and could be indicative of the future of music education in this country. This thesis forms part of the MEUSSA project, therefore the author recommends that it be regarded as part of the total output of the group. Work done by other members of the MEUSSA group will be referred to throughout the thesis.

The scope of the MEUSSA project covers all aspects of music, including new aspects (in the Southern African context) like Music Technology, Music Industry, World Musics and

indigenous Southern African music, as well as offering a comprehensive and innovative model for teaching music in Southern Africa.[2]

### 1.4 Research questions

In the light of the scenario introduced in the previous section, the main research question can be presented, namely

> What outcomes are desirable for performance on aerophones, and how would this translate into unit standards for Southern Africa?

The formulating of outcomes and unit standards for aerophones, as part of the MEUSSA group, posed the following sub-questions:

- What do the unit standards produced by other countries world-wide look like?
- What role did the current philosophical climate, such as postmodernism, play in the forming of a project such as the MEUSSA project?
- What is the influence of postmodernism on the widening of the canon in music education in Southern Africa?

### 1.5 Aim of this study

The aim of the study may be defined on two levels, namely the proposed end product of this specific thesis, as well as that of the MEUSSA project.

With regard to the first level, **this thesis** specifically addresses the aspects of performance on Aerophones in a postmodern South Africa. Extensive research on the present situation with both drawbacks and benefits of the current curricula is widely available, and the author does not intend to duplicate this work. The aim of the study is rather to approach this project in a

---

[2] The reader is referred to the work done by other members of the group. A MEUSSA model for accommodating all relevant music genres in Southern Africa was designed by Petro Grové during 2000, and refined during many workshops and action research sessions by the MEUSSA group.

new way, opening up fresh perspectives on music performance and enabling the inclusion of learners from all cultural backgrounds. In this way it is intended that the learning base of children benefiting from music education will be extended, and that the current approach to music performance be broadened by means of the unit standards provided.

As a group, the participants in the **MEUSSA project** needed to formulate a broad and common set of goals, namely to generate unit standards for music(s) in Southern Africa. As part of the MEUSSA group, the author therefore aims to formulate an inclusive set of unit standards for performance on Aerophones in a postmodern South Africa, as well as providing a theoretical basis for these standards.

The framework of NQF qualifications and component unit standards produced by the MEUSSA project will, finally, be offered to the NSB 02 (Culture and Arts) to be considered for official registration.

### 1.6 Delimitations of this study

The structure of education authority in South Africa, passed into law with the South African Authority Act in 1995 (SAQA 2000a:5), was investigated and discussed in the thesis of Petro Grové, another MEUSSA member. Therefore many assumptions regarding the infrastructure of the NQF, SAQA and NSBs will be made in this thesis without detailed explanation of their respective structures and functions.

Chapter 5 presents unit standards and outcomes for Aerophones, but range statements for technical and scale prerequisites will be provided for flute only. This is because the author does not have the advanced expertise or experience considered necessary to spell out desirable technical outcomes for other Aerophones. The range statements for flute may therefore be taken as example of the minimum technical fluency expected for other instruments at each NQF level.

References to aural training and outcomes for ensemble playing are made in, inter alia, chapter 5. Annarine Röscher and Antoinette Hoek, two members of the MEUSSA group, either generated or are in the process of generating unit standards for aural training in the

foundation phase and ensemble playing respectively, therefore the author does not intend to duplicate work already done.[3]

### 1.7 Structure of the study

The author structured the research around the research questions posed earlier in this chapter. In chapter 2 the author therefore briefly poses some perspectives on the current situation in South Africa, especially with regard to arts and music education. In chapter 3, the structure and content of the frameworks produced and/or currently being developed by the USA (1994), Australia (1995), New Zealand (1999) and England (2000) are investigated, with the aim of integrating the most suitable and progressive aspects into a possible South African structure for performance on Aerophones.

Chapter 4 was structured around the last two research questions, namely to formulate a postmodern perspective for Southern African music education and the establishing of the MEUSSA project. Because the characteristics and trends of postmodernism are relatively unknown in the field of music education in South Africa, the author deemed it necessary to present an extensive layout of both modernism and postmodernism, especially in the way they reflect in the arts and music. Because the MEUSSA project, in character and approach, closely resembles the shift from modernism to postmodernism, a deconstruction of Western art music as only medium for formal music education is also offered in this chapter.

Unit standards for Aerophones (Performance) are provided in chapter 5, together with an exploration of the model for music education developed by one of the MEUSSA team members, Petro Grové.

---

[3] The reader is referred to A. Röscher, 2001: *Music standards for the Foundation Phase and Teacher Training*, doctoral thesis, University of Pretoria, Pretoria; and A. Hoek, 2001: *South African Unit Standards for a General Music Appraisal Programme and an Ensemble Specialisation Programme for Available Instruments*, doctoral thesis in progress, University of Pretoria, Pretoria.

## 1.8 Value of the study

No unit standards in the field of musics for South Africa have been registered at the time of completion of this thesis. The specific value of this thesis will therefore lie in the provision of unit standards for Aerophones (performance) in Southern Africa, as well as the exploration of a theoretical framework within which the MEUSSA project is functioning.

The scope of this project will have a widespread impact on all learners in Southern Africa, as it was the intention of the author, as part of the MEUSSA group, to utilise as many aspects and genres of the music field as possible in the process of generating unit standards. Therefore the inclusion of genres that are new to formal music education, such as jazz, popular music, African music or Indian music, are capacitated in the unit standards produced by the author. The target group consists of all learners from pre-school to tertiary level, providing a solid and wide learning foundation for music leading up to NQF level 1 (grades 1-9), and also assisting learners and educators who wish to pursue or support a focused education in Music from grades 10-12.

The trends and characteristics of postmodernism are described in this thesis as, inter alia, a shift in cultural expressions and a widening of the canon. As the current transformational character of music education demands a fresh outlook and flexible approach from music educators, an exploration of postmodernism, especially as it manifests in the arts and music, must be considered a necessary pre-condition for transformation in music education. By exploring postmodern directions in this thesis, the author hopes that educators may be assisted to understand the current situation and direction of music education in Southern Africa.

With this contribution the author hopes to encourage music educators in shifting traditional boundaries and widening perspectives, and by doing this to maximise the level of participation in music education for all Southern African learners.

## 1.9 Methodology

The author, in the process of writing unit standards, used a variety of methods to be as inclusive and informed as possible for the task of generating unit standards.

- The collective expertise of the MEUSSA group in the form of various workshops and meetings held on a regular basis was utilised extensively. This includes the diverse perspectives offered during the course of these workshops, the multiple documents produced by the group and the formulation of different aspects regarding an approach to music education in Southern Africa. The workshops were often characterised by lively discussion and the expression of opposing viewpoints. During these occasions the author utilised feedback from the group to shape and refine the proposed standards. The author was also in a fortunate position to benefit from the experience of Meki Nzewi, professor of African Music in the Department of Music at the University of Pretoria.

- A common vision for the MEUSSA project was formulated, which is to "empower learners with music skills and knowledge, leading to lifelong active involvement in a variety of musics." This vision was continuously utilised as a benchmark for the formulation of unit standards.

- As the learners being taught at school by the author were employed to test many of the suggestions of the group, as well as the model for music education developed by Petro Grové, the chapter on unit standards (chapter 5) was informed by a process of action research.

- The thesis was characterised by a qualitative approach to research matter. In this regard a content analysis of relevant frameworks and standards (chapter 3), as well as the qualities of a postmodern condition (chapter 4), was deemed necessary to gain a holistic view of both the process and content of generating unit standards. Guidelines and qualities that were personally regarded as transferable or useful in a Southern African context were explored, evaluated and interpreted.

## 1.10 Sources

The sources utilised by the author during the research may be presented in four categories.

### *1.10.1 Frameworks and standards*

A review of existing and recently written frameworks and standards was undertaken in chapter 3. Only four countries have, up to now, produced frameworks for music education in the format of unit standards, namely the United States of America (1994), Australia (1995), New Zealand (1999) and England (2000). These have been closely analysed in order to gain a broad perspective on the format, approach and content of unit standards produced thus far.

### *1.10.2 Books*

The most important sources used in the thesis included the following:

- J-F. Lyotard. 1979. ***The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge.*** Manchester: Manchester University Press. Lyotard more than hints that a break with modernism's characteristics and legitimation of meta-narratives was brought about by a change in methods of storing and retrieving knowledge, as well as altered modes of communication. He also reviews the status of science and technology in a postmodern era, offering alternative ways of contemplating the fibre of society.
- D. Harvey. 1990. ***The Condition of Postmodernity: An Enquiry into the Origins of Cultural Change.*** Oxford: Blackwell Publishers. The passage of modernism into postmodernism is explored by Harvey, as he describes a change in cultural as well as political-economic practices since the early 1970s.
- M. Comte. 1993. ***The Arts in Australian Schools: The past 50 Years***. In: J. Thonell (ed.), *Australian Music Education Source Book no. 1.* CIRCME, School of Music, University of Western Australia, Perth. Valuable information regarding Australian music education, approaches and practices were taken from this publication.
- H. Gardner. 1993. ***Multiple Intelligences: The Theory in Practice***. New York: Basic Books. This ground-breaking work has to be taken into consideration in any contemplation on the value of music in education. The theory of multiple intelligences was developed as part of Harvard's prestigious Project Zero, influencing curriculum development and educational theories world-wide.

- C. Hamm. 1995. ***Putting Popular Music in its Place.*** Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Hamm offers a collection of essays dedicated to the studying of popular music. He advocates an approach that values each example as worthy of attention while staying receptive to both the text and the circumstances under which it originated.

- L. Kramer. 1995. ***Classical Music and Postmodern Knowledge.*** Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press. Exploring new scopes for musicology and classical music, Kramer contemplates fresh possibilities offered by postmodernism to the understanding of Western art music. Although the focus of this book is on music written before the modern and postmodern era, the author drew upon principles of a postmodern nature and applied it to the position of the MEUSSA group in providing relevant unit standards for Southern Africa.

- N. Cook & M. Everist. 2001 (2nd edition). ***Rethinking Music.*** New York: Oxford University Press. A collection of essays on current issues in and challenges to musicology. The author of this thesis focused on articles relevant for her study, especially those offering current views on popular music and musicology, and postmodernism in music/music education.

### *1.10.3 Articles*

Various articles used during the research process reflect the current lively debate on the nature and influence of postmodernism, as well as challenges to music education associated with the transition of social conditions. Articles from the disciplines of Theology and Science, as well as news magazines such as *Time Magazine*, were also utilised to accumulate balanced and informed understanding of this matter. Authoritative and informed articles in popular magazines such as *Time Magazine* and *BBC Music Magazine* were put to use in order to include opinions on popular music and current scenarios regarding Western art music, as these are often difficult to access in academic literature. The *BBC Music Magazine* also provided fresh perspectives on the current international classical music scene, as perceived from a British viewpoint. This magazine also served to inform the author of current trends and compositions in the genre of Western art music.

Magazines dedicated to music education were frequently consulted, especially *The American Music Teacher*, *The South African Music Teacher*, *Music Educators Journal* and *Music Teacher*.

### *1.10.4 The Internet*

One of the characteristics of postmodern globalisation, as discussed in chapter 4, is the world-wide accessibility of data and material. As the postmodern climate played a significant role in conceptualising the MEUSSA project and this thesis, information available on the Internet was utilised extensively. In this way it was possible to download, although not always with the same measure of success, detailed information on frameworks as well as supporting material produced by the USA, Australia, New Zealand and England. These were critically consulted and regularly visited in order to provide a background for an indigenous and flexible approach for music education in South Africa.

Reference for sources obtained from the Internet often presents difficulties. The author took utmost care to provide the accurate addresses for web sites, but some of these may already have been moved to other addresses by the appropriate webmaster by the time that this thesis was finished. Other web-sites, such as the Australian Qualifications Authority, are updated on a regular basis because the process of establishing a framework is still under construction. Therefore the author made use of information available at the time of completing the study, which in no way pretended to be the final version of relevant structures.

Resources for some parts of this thesis, for example references to rap and punk, were more accessible on the Internet, because the informal style of this music has not yet sedimented much in musicology.

## 1.11 Glossary

To avoid confusion, four concepts will be briefly explained in the way they are used in this thesis:

- **Western art music/classical music**: This term refers to art music in the (predominantly) Western tradition, created within a formal discipline and striving to

resemble a model of excellence. This style, denoting music with characteristics of, inter alia, balance, objectivity and a strict adherence to form (Apel 1976:154-155), was, and still is, generally created by highly trained composers (Moore 2001:924). Western art music also possesses a notated canon spanning roughly 1 500 years, from c. 500 to the present (Apel 1976:494). In the context of this thesis, this style of music is mainly used in comparison to popular music, of which the canon originated roughly after the turn of the century, and which is created by composers/songwriters with generally little or no theoretical training.

- **Popular music**: After much discussion within the MEUSSA group, this caption for informal, improvised or so-called "light music" was accepted as an umbrella term.
- **Ensemble**: By this is meant more than one instrumentalist performing together, with all parts owning approximately the same technical standard. A teacher/professional accompanist supporting a pupil or student is not, for the purpose of this thesis, accepted as part of an ensemble as described in the unit standards.
- **Improvise**: to deviate from or add to the melody, rhythm, texture and/or harmony, without losing roots of the original.

### 1.12 Notes to the reader

The process of writing unit standards is neither easy nor simple. To the uninformed reader it may seem like a mere task of putting a few words to paper, but experience in the MEUSSA group and in the practical education situation taught the author that substantial research has to precede these succinct words. Therefore the reader is asked to bear with what may seem like unnecessary duplication in Chapter 5, in order to be presented with the complete standard for each NQF level. A rather detailed exploration of frameworks produced in other countries was also necessary in order to contextualise the generating of appropriate unit standards for the South African situation.

The format of unit standards, as prescribed by SAQA, also entails duplication when presented from NQF level 1-8. Because this large amount of reproduction was deemed

unnecessary, the author only included one unit standard in the prescribed SAQA format in chapter 5.

For the sake of simplicity, the author will avoid the double form of "he/she", and uniformly refer to "he" or "him" when both sexes are implied. Furthermore, a reference such as the Florida Department of Education, the Nebraska Department of Education and the South African Department of Education will be referred to as Florida, Nebraska and South Africa.

Because some chapters, such as chapter 5, contain many tables, a neat layout sometimes resulted in empty spaces at the bottom of pages. Many tables could not be reduced to one page, and the reader is thus asked to accept tables sometimes stretching over more than two pages.

Footnotes were separately numbered for each chapter, and for ease of reading they were placed directly at the bottom of each page where the reference was made.

References made to theses by other MEUSSA members were correct at the time of submitting this document. As some theses are still in progress, this may result in a possible change in page numbers or titles.

The use of the term Southern Africa implies that the MEUSSA project is aimed at providing unit standards for music education for all countries in the SADC (Southern African Development Community) region, potentially including Botswana, Lesotho, Namibia, South Africa, Swaziland, Zambia and Zimbabwe). However, the structure and system of education used as backbone for the development of unit standards was developed in South Africa. SAQA is an official South African structure, and does not form part of the formal educational structures in the other Southern African countries.

# CHAPTER TWO

# PERSPECTIVES ON SOUTH AFRICAN MUSIC EDUCATION

## 2.1 Introduction

Difficulties regarding music education in South Africa, in the context of this thesis, may be defined at two levels, namely:

- the provision of music education of a **high quality** to **all learners**, in other words, widening the basis of the learning experience; and
- providing a workable approach to **accommodate music of all cultures** in the country.

Next to these two, obstacles regarding the matter of facilities and teacher training may not be underestimated. The current President of South Africa, Thabo Mbeki, declared in his first speech made as president in Parliament on 25 June 1999 that "[t]o achieve these results, we will also have to engage in massive in-service and pre-service training" (Mbeki 1999:1). The training and provision of skilled and motivated educators are crucial factors in determining the character of music education in South Africa, but do not lie within the scope of this thesis and will therefore not be addressed. It must, however, be noted that an endeavour to widen the learning basis and music content with quality education may have an early failure without skilled and motivated teaching staff.

### *2.1.1 Widening the basis of the learning experience*

At present music education is limited to a few privileged learners, part of the problem being that very little attention is given to a solid music foundation at primary school level. Primary school music education finds itself on different levels of quality due to different levels of teaching, a shallow curriculum, the previous national policy of segregated education (Hauptfleisch 1997:7), and the stigmatisation of general music. The consequence of this practice is that proper music education for primary school learners is left to paying parents and private music teachers. This has not enabled enough learners in the past to share in the multiple benefits of music education, nor has it provided a solid and broad foundation for

high school music education.[1] It has also taken away the opportunity for many learners to benefit from an education in music in terms of the development of intelligence, social, spatial, cultural, or problem-solving skills.[2]

According to the American MENC (Music Educators National Conference) standards, the period from grades 5-8 is critical in learners' musical development, as the music they perform often becomes an integral part of their personal music repertoire (MENC 2000:8). These grades correspond to the South African senior phase in primary school through to the first year in high school. Any gap in the music education in these grades could prove to be irretrievable in later years, therefore a broad education of high quality in music seems to be especially important during these formative years.

"Ways will need to be found to enable more people to learn to play a wider range of instruments, throughout their life span, with appropriate opportunities for making music in their community" (Hallam 2000:11). Odam (1996:186), quoting Danny Farrant, a seventeen-year old British learner, also hopes that "more young people will get involved in music – not necessarily writing it, but appreciating it." In the same breath it could also be said that as many learners as possible should be exposed to music education relating to their cultural background as well as a variety of cultural backgrounds of other music traditions.

The challenge here would then be to provide a continuum in music education from pre-school to tertiary level, one which enables learners to experience a meaningful and varied education of quality to enrich their life and personal development.

---

[1] "[It is] during the formative years in the primary school that basic musical skills and perceptions are best cultivated" (Rainbow 1996:11).

[2] The British Department for Education and Employment (England 1999:40) states that music provides opportunities to promote spiritual, moral, social and cultural development, as well as key skills of communication, application of number, IT, working with others, improving own learning performance and problem-solving.

### *2.1.2 Including all cultures*

Leonhard, a well-known American music educator and former MENC president, reflects the factors influencing the need for a new approach to arts education world-wide in this extract (1999:42):

> Several developments in society, education, and the arts necessitate change in the music program. These developments include the continuing change in the ethnic composition of the school population, the education reform movement, the increasing demand for the development of students' ability to think critically, the change in contemporary art styles, and contemporary developments in educational technology.

The approach to music education in South Africa is, in the words of Education Minister Kader Asmal, still divided with regard to former "white" and "black" schools, with the "white" schools practising a formal, exam-driven approach and the "black" schools "excelling in choral music and extra-curricular choir competitions" (Asmal 2000:13). These divisions need to be addressed and workable solutions provided, so as to provide access to music education of high quality to all learners. The matter of popular music, African music, Indian music, world music and music technology is also still in a process of inclusion, and not yet widely accessible to learners who want to receive training in these facets. In this regard, Hauptfleisch (1997:10) alleges that current South African music curricula do not sufficiently reflect the globalisation trend in music in the latter part of the 20th century, because the local musical culture and popular music is not included in general music education. These remarks were written in 1997, but the content of music education has hardly changed since then, and her remarks, in the opinion of the author, are still valid.

The need for an adequate set of standards for African music is an urgent one, not only for the South African context, but for the other SADC (Southern African Development Community) countries as well, and even for the whole African continent. At the first-ever African conference of the International Society for Music Education (Pretoria, 1998), a clear mandate was given to South African music educators to take the lead in pan-African initiatives (Van Niekerk & van der Mescht 2000:3).

In the same vein, standards for popular music, world music and other music practices of Southern Africa have not been generated by the time of the conclusion of this thesis.

Therefore unit standards presented in chapter 5 will not specifically address these styles and genres, but facilitate their inclusion for performing on Aerophones.

Existing structures and systems of music education in all their facets need to be reconceived and re-engineered, in order not only to formulate unit standards as required by SAQA, but to reconceptualise the total and ongoing development of individuals through music, in music and for music (Van Niekerk & Van der Mescht 2000:3).

**2.2 The South African scenario**

For the MEUSSA team to be able to write unit standards for musics in South Africa, the current status of the arts had to be briefly considered.

During 2000 the decline of the social standing of Western arts in South Africa was clearly and sadly illustrated by the temporary closure of the State Theatre in Pretoria (due to financial mismanagement), as well as the closure of the New Arts Philharmonic Orchestra of Pretoria, the National and the Cape Philharmonic orchestras within the span of roughly two weeks. For music educators these events sounded warning bells, because the non-existence of performing platforms in the country could influence the interest in the provision of arts, and especially music education at foot level.

A lack of governmental support similar to this is not a new one in the history of the arts. Sturm (1998), for example, describes the rise and fall of the educational status of music in the American states from the Colonial times (when secular music was regarded as possessing some evil and mysterious influences) to the present (where programmes are still being cut in budget crises despite the fact that the institution of Music as a core subject is being supported by the majority of American citizens as well as by a core component of reliable research).

The fact that the arts, and especially music, are no longer financially supported by the state in the same way as previously (Nieuwoudt 2000b), forces practitioners of music education to drastically rethink both the value and outcomes of music education. According to Nieuwoudt, the face of the arts industry has changed to such an extent that a new and creative philosophy is needed from both curriculum writers and students of the arts. This prompted Prof. Temple Hauptfleisch of the University of Stellenbosch (quoted by Nieuwoudt in *Beeld* of 29 June 2000) to say that this state of affairs could mean that the accent of the music industry shifts from serious forms of art such as ballet, opera and drama productions towards light music,

one man shows and cabarets, and that the serious art forms will most probably be performed by private institutions and artists, universities and participants at art festivals. In the opinion of the author, this could also mean that institutions that formerly only taught "serious", or Western art music, would be opting to teach other genres as well. According to article writer Stephanie Nieuwoudt (*Beeld,* 29 June 2000), another implication could be that learners will choose not to be educated in the arts at all because of an uncertain future.

The second option, namely that of opting for other genres, may present an attractive and viable option for music education, and this will be explored in more detail in chapter 3. The last option, namely that of learners choosing not to receive an education in the arts, is highly unacceptable, because the positive effects of arts education, and especially music education, have been widely researched. "The teaching and learning of music has been recognised as serving a variety of human needs. Some of these needs can be met only through music (Reimer 1999:37). Also, in the words of President Ronald Reagan (Anonymous 2000:1): "We must teach [our students] the artistic inheritance of our culture and an appreciation of how fine music enriches the student who studies it, and the society who produces it [...]. The existence of strong fine arts curricula are important to keeping the humanities truly humanising and liberating education truly liberating."

## 2.3 Rationale

What is it that we want music to achieve?

It is not the intent of the author to become entangled in the detail of numerous research conclusions of the positive relation between music and non-musical outcomes, such as improved spatial abilities, but merely to provide a compact motivation for the inclusion of Music as a subject in the core school curriculum from a very early age. Research in the field of, for example, the enhancement of spatial abilities via music instruction would provide enough subject matter for an independent dissertation, and has been repeatedly done world-wide. In the opinion of the author, the reason for including music in the core curriculum should rest on the intrinsic worth of music itself.

Various institutions have formulated reasons for teaching music from the early school phases, and the author intends to hook onto some of these findings. The reason is that arts education is still regarded as an optional learning area in South Africa. The Association for the

Advancement of Arts Education (Ashton 1999:1), for example, has evaluated a wide group of research studies and concluded that "we must include the arts in the education of all students if we want our children to be prepared for the challenges of life and work in our global society." MENC (1994a:63), the American organisation responsible for frameworks in the arts, concludes that "The educational success of our children depends on creating a society that is both literate and imaginative, both competent and creative."

What then would the challenges be that our children need in order to become effective and successful citizens? The author would like to draw the reader's attention to the *Draft Document of the National Curriculum Framework* (South Africa 2000), and more specifically the national curriculum goals of which some requirements are stated as (p.12)

- to promote the social, cultural and personal development of our citizenry; and
- to improve learner performance and achievement.

One significant benefit of formulating comprehensive standards for music education would be to enable learners to establish a relationship between the individual and his/her own cultural heritage, as well as the cultural heritage of the human family. Learners must come to realise that "music making is a universal need and that the study of musics of all cultures allows us both to learn more about our own heritage and to share, to some extent, the deeper meanings of the culture of others" (Burton 2000:2). This outcome would comply with the first of the above-mentioned goals.

The tragic truth is that the arts in various countries, including South Africa, have been kept on the fringes of general education, despite research that "the arts seem to emanate from various discrete forms of intelligence" (Fowler 1992:30). Education that is both theory and practice, knowledge and skills (as Minister Kader Asmal requires) could vastly benefit from a thorough arts, and especially music, education. The reason for this is that it is music that manages to combine academic and practical thought, and it is the arts that require of their practitioners to simultaneously apply knowledge and skills. In this way a thorough music education will then comply with the second goal stated above.

## 2.4 Music, the brain and education

Because arts education is very often regarded as optional, education authorities are easily convinced to scale down on input, funding and available periods on the school timetable for these subjects. The following section will briefly outline the importance of quality education in the arts, especially music, at school level.

In general it could be argued that a thorough music education programme benefits a basic educational outlook. According to Sturm (1998:4), the United States Council on Basic Education, established in 1956, advocated the "policy that 'schools exist to provide the essential skills of language, numbers and orderly thought, and to transmit in a reasoned pattern the intellectual, moral and aesthetic heritage of civilised man.'" These policies co-ordinate with Minister Asmal's educational goals as set out above, and therefore also link with the motivation for a well set-out music educational programme as an integrated part of a general curriculum.

Why? "Few areas of music psychology have seen as many recent advances as research in music-induced plasticity of the brain" (Rauscher 1998:197). Recent research has showed a direct link between the study of music and improved cognitive achievement in areas such as language, mathematics and reading, as well as psychomotor and spatial development (Sturm 1998:5). Music students, as the results of various research projects have come to show, are well-prepared to handle a wide variety of tasks outside the field of music itself (Martin 1995:16).

Rauscher and Shaw, in their prominent and controversial experiment resulting in the "Mozart effect", concluded that music enhances the spatial-temporal reasoning of a student. "In their experiment, a group of college students listened to ten minutes of either silence, relaxation instructions or a Mozart duo-piano sonata before being given a test of their spatial-temporal reasoning. After listening to the sonata, the students scored eight points higher [...] than they did after the relaxation instructions and nine points higher than after silence" (Pohlman 2000:38). It is important to note that Rauscher and Shaw themselves did not claim a shortcut to improved intelligence, but merely a temporary improved spatial-temporal behaviour. Grandin, Peterson & Shaw (1998:4) continued this research and suggested that certain mathematics and science concepts, known to be difficult to teach, can be learnt using spatial-

temporal reasoning methods, and that music instruction from an early age can enhance the developing of these facilities.

This research has generated much excitement in scientific as well as musical circles, but, as Weinberger (2000b:1) says, "the Mozart effect actually does not increase general intelligence and lasts only a few minutes, it does not provide a substitute for music study and practice". It has, however, focused attention on the link between music studies and brain behaviour, with a general acceptance that long-term music studies have the greatest effect on various brain activities.

Current research in this field has utilised two aspects of musical activity to establish the relationship of music and its relationship to cognitive education, namely

- *listening* to music[3] (passively); and
- *making* music (actively).[4]

According to Hetland (Waleson 2000:27) the music making activity had a larger, more consistent effect on cognitive ability than the listening activity, but both seem to have substantial effects. This correlates with the findings of other researchers in this regard, including Hurwitz et al (1975), Costa-Giomi (1997) and Rauscher et al (1997), as quoted in Overy (1998:97). These researchers concluded that long-term music lessons had the greatest impact on brain activities: "Costa-Giomi demonstrated that two years of piano instruction significantly improved the verbal, quantitative, and especially spatial abilities of 10-11-year olds, compared to controls" (Overy 1998:97).

Weinberger (2000a:8), together with a host of other musicians and music education experts, however, are of the opinion that scientific experiments such as the Mozart effect have no say

---

[3] The author refers the reader to research done in 1993 by Shaw and Rauscher of the University of California, of which the results became commonly known as the "Mozart Effect". This phenomenon is, however, still under debate, with authors such as Reimer (1999) and Pohlman (2000) putting the process and results under a magnifying glass.

[4] Research by Hetland on both the listening and music-making activities concluded that "[I]t does indicate that these music programs that are being cut from schools *are good for education*" (Bosman's own italics) (Waleson 2000:27).

in music education as such, but "that music has major relevance in the overall development of children." In a process such as learning to play an instrument, the following minimum systems and processes are engaged:

- sensory and perceptual - auditory, visual, tactile, and kinaesthetic;
- cognitive - symbolic and score reading;
- planning;
- motor actions - fine muscles and gross muscle co-ordination;
- emotional/motivational;
- learning;
- memory; and
- feedback and evaluation of music produced.

This entire process, according to Weinberger, is repeated virtually every few seconds, in this way enhancing the positive effects. At the same time these brain systems and processes are being continually integrated in complex ways, influencing other processes applicable in life such as creative thinking, problem solving, mentally constructing solutions and plans as well as organising thought, feeling and knowledge into action.

The following table, intended to be illustrative rather than comprehensive, is useful to summarise this line of argumentation:

*Table 1-1: Illustration of the effects of music on cognitive behaviour (Weinberger 2000b:6)*

| **Amount of effort and involvement** | **Duration of Some Effects of Music on Cognition and Behaviour** | |
|---|---|---|
| | **Minutes** | **Years** |
| Passive listening for 10 minutes | "Mozart effect" (Increases ST reasoning) | None |
| Educated listening in music classes for one or more school years | None | Understanding and appreciating musical forms, genres, meanings and performances in historical, social and cultural context. |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| Instrumental or vocal lessons and regular practice for several years | None | Reading musical notation, integrating sight, sound, touch and movements to perform and express self musically, solo, in co-operative group or both. |

The difference between the effects of short-term passive music making (namely a temporary increased ST or spatial-temporal reasoning) and the permanent cognitive and behavioural effects of an extended musical effort is clearly explained in this table.

Howard Gardner (1993:17-18) describes musical intelligence as a separate intelligence, one of eight intelligences.[5] This theory, which is the product of the prestigious Project Zero of Harvard University, has been tested over many years, and has gained academic support in many respectable circles.

In the opinion of the author, the assumption of this theory would imply that a learner, while receiving basic tuition in language, mathematics, physical development and spatial development at school, must also have the opportunity to be educated in music, in order to facilitate a broad approach to basic education. There is one condition, however, and that is that the music education must be of high quality. "Good teaching has been the strongest specification as regards the conclusivity of positive extra-musical outcomes from (extended) music education" (Spychiger 1998:199).

Good music education must also, importantly, not only be used and considered relevant for its extra-musical benefits, but ultimately for the general experience of participating in a very human act of expression. Viewed together with the argumentation above, music education cannot be a separate item, to be reserved only for the privileged, but constitutes a basic educational encounter.

## 2.5 Curriculum planning from a musical perspective

The value of music education is being questioned like seldom before, part of the reason being that a quality music education is costly and time-consuming. The mere fact that instrumental

[5] The other intelligences, according to Gardner (1993:17-26), are bodily-kinaesthetic, logical-mathematical, spatial, interpersonal, intrapersonal, linguistic and naturalist. Naturalist intelligence was recently added to the previous group of seven (Weiss 2001:1), totaling eight.

tuition is normally directed on a one-to-one basis means that it is more expensive teaching Music than teaching Mathematics. "No wonder then that art education was most likely to flourish when the audience was independently wealthy, or when some vocational dividends were glimpsed" (Gardner 1990:36).

Another reason is that the field of education, and especially arts education, entails consideration and reflection of the values and priorities of the local community (Gardner 1990:ix). "Education influences and reflects the values of society, and the kind of society we want to be" (England 1999:1). The value that a society at a certain time allocates to the practising of arts is usually reflected in the content of a curriculum. Policy makers, underscoring the values of a society, usually perpetuate these values.

Furthermore the educational scene in many countries demands that the content of syllabi shifts its focus to support the local corporate and commercial ideals, and to exclude the arts because, "in the light of the main purpose of education, they appear expendable, extraneous and nonessential" (Fowler 1992:76).

### *2.5.1 The inclusion of music in a curriculum*

Music as performing activity, as well as the transmission of the knowledge of music (also called music education), has been part of societies in all ages. Used for ritual, work, entertainment, therapy, communication or aesthetic satisfaction, the phenomenon of music has been considered desirable and worthwhile to study (Mark & Gary 1992:vii).

Few general teachers, and even fewer curriculum planners, however, have an intimate knowledge of perceptual or conceptual issues of aesthetic subjects. Artists themselves are generally not concerned with reflective issues "except as they arise in the course of fashioning an artwork. It is hardly surprising that these potential areas of curriculum have been underdeveloped until now" (Gardner 1990:36).

As a result of many years of research, this situation is slowly changing, and in many countries "educators are searching for the optimal way in which to provide to ordinary students aspects of artistic knowledge that, until now, have only been available to those who continue formal study of the arts" (Gardner 1990:37).

Perry, in his thought-provoking article on the advocacy of music education, discussed possible approaches to curriculum planning. One of these approaches (Perry 1973:108) is to emphasise the cognitive educational content, subordinating other fields and subjects because of presumed lower cognitive advances. Extreme situations, such as requiring justification for the inclusion of apparently less cognitive subjects on grounds of cognitive content, are also a common scenario amongst many curriculum designers.

The question of the possible inclusion of music as a core school subject has been treated in this way in many countries, because musical outcomes cannot be measured purely in terms of cognitive advances. It is a pity, however, that "noteworthy aspects of education in which study of fine arts appears to contribute considerably to the outcome are ignored in this approach" (Perry 1973:108). Although this article was written more than a quarter of a century ago, policy makers still treat Music as school subject in this way, in other words, valuing it for (a lack of) conceived cognitive content.

Economic considerations also play an important role - when experiencing budget problems, administrators very readily make cuts in aesthetic areas of curricula. The facilitation of a music education policy with an appropriate framework may also prove problematic because of a lack of sufficient funds, lack of expertise and unequal opportunities between learners.

### *2.5.2 Curriculum planning*

Lepherd (1994:2) suggests three theories into which curriculum planning generally falls, namely

- *Essentialism,* which concerns the question of what subjects are essential for a normal education;
- *Encyclopaedism*, the assertion that all knowledge should be found in a curriculum; and
- *Pragmatism*, which considers the question of what is important for living.

The question "What is an educated person?" comes to mind, especially when educational content which cannot be measured purely in an intellectual or cognitive way, is being discussed. Perry (1973:110) offers three possible ways to describe an educated person, namely when someone possesses:

- an increased perceptual range, along with conceptual readiness;
- aptness of judgements (practical, aesthetic or meditative);
- an increase in knowledge and complexity of reasoning processes together with the closely allied types of intellectual judgements.

To treat a curriculum as solely involving and developing intellectual processes is to grossly ignore the cultivation of an educated person. Using such an approach, the criteria of perceptual and conceptual education, together with awareness not markedly cognitive in quality (such as the aesthetic kind), will inadvertently be overlooked and neglected in favour of cognitive education. "Students' work in art comes through a fusion of intellectual, emotional and physical energies. Through such expression of their feelings and ideas, children grow inwardly in personal awareness and sensitivity, and outwardly in confidence and in their capacity to communicate with others" (Crosskell, Condous & Schapel 1984:165). The process of educating learners to become informed, responsible and well-rounded citizens must, in the opinion of the author of this thesis, include education in all aspects of personal development. "Education may be detected in trained scientific analysis, philological investigation, but no less in relationships, planning of policy, aesthetic judgement" (Perry 1973:111). In short, the cognitive content of a curriculum has a very definite place, but it must be viewed together with other aspects of education to produce educated and balanced persons.

> It is important to note that the ultimate objective of all standards, all school curricula and all school personnel is to help students to gain the broad skills and knowledge that will enable them to function effectively as adults and to contribute to society in today's world and tomorrow's (MENC 1994b:1).

The National Curriculum of England (England 1999:2) describes the following aims for a school curriculum:

- It should aim to provide opportunities for all pupils to learn and achieve;
- It should aim to promote pupils' spiritual, moral, social and cultural development, and to prepare all pupils for the opportunities, responsibilities and experiences of life.

Both of these aims are equally important, and should receive equal attention in a curriculum. "These two aims reinforce each other. The personal development of pupils, spiritually, morally, socially and culturally, plays a significant part in their ability to learn and to achieve. Development in both areas is essential to raising standards of attainment for all pupils" (England 1999:3). The South African educationalist Cas Olivier (2000:1) is of the opinion that "[b]oth education and training aim to furnish learners with the ability to cope with the world outside."

A rounded education not only means the acquiring of cognitive knowledge, but also the internalising of creative and social skills. It is in this regard that a music education of high quality plays an important role.

### *2.5.3 Music as a core subject*

"Perhaps underlying all of the critical issues evident in arts education today is a continuing need to change the attitudes towards arts education of the 'decision makers' at all levels. This, in turn, underscores the importance of gaining community support for the needs of arts education" (Comte 1993:44). Lehman (1993:202) links with this statement when he outlines four assumptions commonly accepted in the United States before 1993, but which, in his opinion, are "flagrantly in error". These faulty assumptions are that

- The purpose of education is to help the individual get a job.
- The purpose of education for society is to contribute to the nation's economy and the gross national product.
- The most urgent need in the curriculum is for mathematics, science and computer studies.
- The arts are essentially frills to be added to the curriculum when time allows.

These assumptions were reformulated in the latest National Standards of the United States,[6] and changed sufficiently to include tuition of art subjects on the same level as mathematics

---

[6] The author refers the reader to chapter 3, where a brief discussion and an overview of the initiatives leading to the National Standards of the United States of America are provided.

and science. In South Africa policy makers, however, still seem to support these four assumptions with regard to arts education. In an article in *Beeld*, an Afrikaans newspaper, article writer Stephánie Nieuwoudt (2000c) quotes one of the suggestions made during a discourse *Kunste quo vadis?* (*Arts quo vadis?*) on the future of the arts in South Africa, namely to convince the state of the multiple benefits of arts education and arts practice in a community. The policy-makers, in other words, still need to be convinced of such benefits.

The NQF states that the first formulation of standards needs only to be addressed at the end of level one (grade 9). It would, however, be short-sighted not to conceive music education in a holistical and continuous way. A thoroughly planned set of standards should be produced for the full educational spectrum, from early childhood to tertiary level, across formal, non-formal and informal education. It should also offer alternative ways to reach desired outcomes so as not be blinded by pre-formulated ideas.

It would, in the light of the aforementioned, be sensible to follow the point of departure of the legislation of the 1994 *Goals 2000: Educate America Act* to list Music and other arts as core subjects from primary school onwards.[7] In the National Standards of the United States (MENC 1994a:22), the arts are viewed as core subject together with the other subjects such as English, Mathematics, History, Civics and Government, Geography, Science and Foreign Language.

The MEUSSA group would, in this project, suggest the inclusion of Music as a core subject from primary school through to secondary school, so as to give a broader group of learners the opportunity to gain from the benefits of music tuition. Hauptfleisch (1997:287) formulates this goal as follows: "Because music education provides learners with the key to a unique and major source of fundamental life values both now and in the future, music education must be an integral part of the education of all South Africans."

In the opinion of the author, the following conditions posted by Spychiger (1998:199) are absolutely applicable to the South African situation:

---

[7] Arts, including Music, was added to the GOALS 2000 mission as a core school subject in 1994, for both elementary and secondary school curriculum (Hopkins 1997:2; MENC 1994a:22). This important policy-changing document is discussed in more detail in chapter 3, as part of the American frameworks.

- Music teachers have to be given a high quality of training that should guarantee musical and general didactic competence, as well as psychological knowledge in the domain of music.
- Music education has to be given status in the curriculum.
- The quality and outcomes of music teaching, in terms of non-musical outcomes, but especially for the experience of music itself, need to be evaluated and applied to general educational goals.

Music instruction must therefore be regarded as basic, important and very necessary.

## 2.6 Curriculum 2005: Outcomes-based approach

The following vision for South Africa, "Lifelong Learning through a National Curriculum Framework", is quoted in a policy document (South Africa 1997:1): "A prosperous, truly united, democratic and internationally competitive country with literate, creative and critical citizens leading productive, self-fulfilled lives in a country free of violence, discrimination and prejudice."

This ideal is, in the opinion of the author, directly linked to quality education in the arts, as it should be one of the goals of education to produce productive and creative citizens.[8]

### *2.6.1 The learning areas*

The education and training band distinguishes three clusters, or phases, for learning purposes.[9] They are:

- The foundation phase (pre-school, or grade R/0, to grade 3);
- The intermediate phase (grades 4-6); and
- The senior phase (grades 7-9).

---

[8] This matter is briefly discussed later in this chapter under section 2.11, where the author refers to the substantial amount of research done in this area.

[9] This summary is taken from a MEUSSA document of 2 July 2000a by J.P. Grové, *Mapping the Different Musics.*

With the new Curriculum 2005 in mind, the six defined *learning areas* in the GET phase (NQF level 1) are as follows:

- Language, Literacy and Communication;
- Mathematical Literacy, Mathematics and Mathematical Sciences;
- Science and Technology;
- Human and Social Sciences;
- Culture and Arts;
- Life Orientation.

For the FET phase (NQF levels 2-4, or grades 10-12), eight learning areas were adopted by the South African Department of Education (South Africa 1997:12). They are:

- Language, Literacy and Communication
- Mathematical Literacy, Mathematics and Mathematical Sciences;
- Technology;
- Human and Social Sciences;
- Culture and Arts;
- Life Orientation;
- Natural Sciences; and
- Economics and Management Science.

SAQA represents twelve *fields* in which NSBs function. The role of the NSBs is:

- to register SGBs that will generate, update and review unit standards;
- to evaluate unit standards and recommend for approval the registration of qualifications and standards to SAQA; and
- to make cross-field linkages.

The twelve fields of the NSBs are:

- 01 Agriculture & Nature Conservation;

- 02 Culture and Arts (Sport);[10]
- 03 Business, Commerce & Management;
- 04 Communication studies & Language;
- 05 Education, training and development;
- 06 Manufacturing, Engineering & Technology
- 07 Human & Social Sciences;
- 08 Law, Military Science & Security;
- 09 Health Sciences & Social Services;
- 10 Physical, Mathematical, Computer & Life Skills;
- 11 Services;
- 12 Physical planning & constructing.

The inclusion of Culture and Arts as one of the learning areas implies that every learner will have the opportunity to have encounters with all four of the arts strands, namely Visual Art, Dance, Drama and Music, from the first year in school.

### *2.6.2 Music in Culture and Arts*

Music, as one of the strands in the learning area of Culture and Arts, should be structured both to provide a meaningful and high quality learning area, as well as to link the learner with the world in which he/she lives. This can be done by (Oliver 1993:58):

- identifying sources and materials which are relevant to cultural experiences; and
- the selection of learning content and experiences which suit the needs of learners at different stages.

Very specific goals need to be set for music education, to avoid the marginalisation or the minimising of subject content. In the opinion of the author, policy-makers in South African

---

[10] Music falls under NSB 02 – Culture and Arts (Sport).

music education should take note of the goals that MENC, according to Lehman (1988:79), set for music education in 1990. These were that:

- every student from K-12 shall have access to music instruction in school;
- every high school shall require at least one unit of credit for graduation in either music, visual art, theatre or dance; and that
- every college and university shall require at least one unit of credit in music, visual art, dance or theatre for admission.

For these goals to succeed one basic condition must be met, namely that there be ample opportunity for every student to study music at the high school level (Lehman 1988:79).

These goals are, at this stage in South Africa, ideal but still unattainable because of a severe lack of trained educators in the arts, as well as financial limitations resulting in under-provision of teaching materials and instruments. The reality is that many music teachers have been retrenched and music departments in secondary schools closed, because music education is still often regarded as a luxury optional on the time-table. It is, however, important to take notice of these goals, in order to invent a suitable strategy for quality music education in South Africa.

To follow the lead of MENC will mean that the level of general music education has to be substantially expanded. If the curriculum does not make provision for the education of children from an early age, this usually results in music tuition only being available to those privileged few who have received tuition from an early age.[11] For the rest, the inclusion of music as part of human development is cut back to music heard on the radio, with no way of nurturing aspects such as the cultivation of musical appraisal, the development of creative instincts or performance-related self-discipline.

### *2.6.3 A proposed structure for music education in C2005*

The new C2005, after being revised in 2001, is at present focusing on providing a general introduction and appraisal of the four arts strands, namely music, dance, visual art and drama,

---

[11] Tuition in music usually means private instruction, specifically learning to play an instrument. This typically includes instruction in the rudiments of music theory.

in the learning area of Culture and Arts. This will, ideally, be available to every learner up to the level of NQF 1, regardless of background or interest.

The opinion of the author, however, is that provision for two strategies in arts education should be made here, namely:

- general, **non-performance** education in all four of the arts strands up to the end of grade 9 (in the learning area of Culture and Arts); and
- focused, **performance-based** education for learners wanting to be educated at a higher level in at least one of the arts strands, up to grade 12. This can be made possible by allowing a choice of electives apart from the core set of standards, thereby opening up the possibility of taking one or more arts subject(s), on a focused or specialised level.

Unit standards and outcomes for both these options should be made available. "All music students should have the chance to produce and respond to music in *all layers of musical discourse,* whatever the activity. If students are not working at a level in which they can exercise truly musical judgements they are unlikely to be developing the quality of their musical thinking" (Swanwick 2000:10, italics by Bosman).

To equip the average learner for focused learning in music from grade 10 onwards, however, preparation has to start earlier. Depending on the instrument and specific style or genre, the learner may have to start as early as grade R/0[12] with tuition in an instrument.

### 2.7 Instrumental teaching

At present a few limited options are available to an average South African pupil learning to play an instrument:

- Lessons can be taken from a private music instructor, after school hours and at the expense of the parents or as part of an outreach programme. The skills obtained in this way are seldom recognised at school level as elective studies.[13]

---

[12] The ideal starting time for a potential violinist, for example, is as early as grade R/0 or grade 1, with many learners even starting earlier.

- The potential player is left on his/her own, trying to learn by means of self-study. This is not an ideal way to learn any instrument, as the careful guidance of a skilled teacher is essential for success.
- A few schools still offer, at the time of this thesis, instrumental tuition to music pupils. This can be taken either as school subject (for example where Music as school subject is provided), or after school hours at the few extra-curricular music centres remaining country-wide. Music as school subject usually offers a limited choice of instruments, as peripatetic teachers are costly to employ.

All the above implies that the parents or caregivers of the potential instrumentalist have to spend time and money for lessons after normal school hours. The potential player of the violin, guitar, sitar, or any other music instrument, has few other options available to obtain valuable tuition in instrumental playing, and also does not receive credits in the school curriculum for extra work done.

A more ideal way would be to integrate the first option above into a curriculum framework, implying that tuition on an instrument be included in the curriculum as elective studies,[14] thereby providing the learner with the possibility of attaining credits for appropriate NQF levels. In this way recognition of the value of music will be incorporated into the school curriculum, and a science-orientated curriculum be balanced with the humanities. "The fact is that what young people need most urgently to function effectively in the age of technology is a solid, well-balanced education based on language, mathematics, science, social studies and the arts" (Lehman 1993:204).

Furthermore, when recognising extra-curricular music education as credits on the school report, the curriculum could be enriched in many ways. Music does not only imply solo performance on an instrument, but often goes hand in hand with ensemble or orchestral

---

[13] The exception to this situation is the University of South Africa (UNISA) who, in 1999, granted grade 12 accreditation for a grade VII performance examination and grade V in theory, resulting in an extra subject for grade 12.

[14] The author would like to draw the reader's attention to the format of frameworks in the United States of America, England and New Zealand, where music as elective study is offered and corresponding credits given. These frameworks are discussed in chapter 3.

participation, composition, choir, musicals or revues done after school hours. Therefore these components could even be integrated into the school time-table, and recognition be awarded to participants in these fields.[15] The motivation for this is that all of these elements contribute towards a balanced education: "It would seem unwise to base any form of music education more or less exclusively on performing, whether in individual instrumental instruction or in ensembles. The evidence supports the view that students should have access to a range of musical possibilities, including composing and audience-listening" (Swanwick 2000:11).

### 2.8 Curriculum for performance in the secondary school

The MEUSSA group reached consensus during many workshops, held during 2000 and 2001, that instructional time for music in both primary and secondary school should not be regarded as an extra on the timetable, but as an integral part of educational time. This is in line with what Lehman (1993:205) suggests:

- Primary school: instructional time at least seven to nine percent (100 to 150 minutes per week), provided by a specialist teacher assisted by a classroom teacher to carry on music instruction through the week between visits by the specialist teacher.
- Secondary school: enough periods to enable learners to elect courses in music and arts. Offerings should include bands, orchestras, choral groups, as well as classes in music literature, history, theory, composition and other fields of music. At least one course in music without prerequisites should be available to every student.

To experience music actively, either by playing an instrument or by singing, is, in the opinion of the author to be the ideal way to encourage early music encounters. This experience could gradually be supplemented by other music courses and experiences. The possibility of electives in music (or another arts learning area) should be kept open for focused learning, apart from a basic course available to all learners.

---

[15]Waterkloof Hoërskool, one of the leading schools in Gauteng, South Africa, is planning to use curricular time for an orchestra academy in the same way that curricular time is currently being used for their cricket academy, tennis academy and flight academy.

The MEUSSA project has as its main objective the generation of unit standards for music(s) in Southern Africa. In the following paragraphs a brief explanation of this concept will be provided.

## 2.9 Points of departure for writing unit standards

The common building block of learning within the framework of the NQF is the unit standard. Olivier (2000:23) defines a standard as "an acknowledged basis for measuring attainment of criteria." According to him, the word "unit" in this context refers to the size of the learning package, or the quantity of learning embedded in the unit standard. The word "standard" is concerned with the criteria, worth, quality, value, character or grade of the standard (2000:5).

The use of this means as a building block for the organisation of learning regarding content and values implies that the accumulation of credits as well as assessment strategy will be easily and clearly administrated. It also provides the potential of cross crediting, meaning that a learner could earn credits in one field or genre, and seamlessly move to another field without losing credits for a level already reached. This would then add flexibility to a previously fairly rigid system regarding content and the attainment of standards.

The fact that a learner would be able to earn credits for a certain amount of work done should, in practice, add to individual motivation levels. Assessment in this context would then imply that a learner could be assessed on the specific level that he/she has reached, and that the corresponding qualification via the credits then be awarded.

## 2.10 Aims for music education

Before any starting points for the designing of a music curriculum and the completion of unit standards can be contemplated, a few clear and applicable objectives for music education from pre-school to tertiary level must be spelled out.

A very important aim for music education is that it should be available to all learners. In this way the multiple benefits of music making will be widespread, and to the advantage of the citizens of the future. In this process the best schools must be taken as models, and not the average or below-average schools: "What we have to ask is how we can achieve equality of

arts education for all children, not by dumbing down the best schools but by lifting the others" (Harland, as quoted by Gardner 2000:14).

Another aim is to provide music education of high quality, linked to the cultural upbringing and background of the learner and expanded from there. To achieve this, the continuous training of teachers is essential. "Just as we need well-trained maths teachers, we need well-trained arts specialists with real passion for their subject. If they are practising artists, so much the better" (Gardner 2000:14).

The feasibility of music literacy will be discussed by other members of the MEUSSA team, but the author is of the opinion that, as an aim for music education, this could benefit learners across all cultures, especially when applied in the primary school and on the same level as learning to read or to do mathematics. This has been done for decades in British schools, with the result that children's sight-singing abilities were famous at the turn of the nineteenth century (Rainbow 1996:11-12).

According to Gardner (1990:xiii), "The challenge in arts education is to modulate effectively among the values of the culture, the means available for arts education and assessment, and the particular developmental and individual profiles of the students who are to be educated."

### 2.11 Factors influencing the provision of unit standards

The previous line of argumentation means that the following aspects need to be kept in mind when writing unit standards for curricula:

- cultural values and priorities;
- developmental profiles of the target group;
- economic and practical issues – cost, financial support, qualified teachers and infrastructure;
- target goals of education – the expected outcomes at the end of the educational process.

Furthermore, Gardner (1990:45) is of the opinion that three components of education should be taken into consideration when arts education is discussed, namely

- perception;

- conceptualisation (or reflection); and
- production.

An important point of departure that the author wants to establish is, in the light of solid world-wide research[16] and the aforementioned argumentation, that music training should be shifted from its position as peripheral and optional subject to core subject. This is based on the fact that music provides:

- a property to articulate the inarticulate and indescribable human experiences.
- a potential to connect learners with their own culture and the cultural content of other peoples, therefore assisting in improved interpersonal relations.
- a growing number of links between music training and the sciences, which means that music has many more spin-offs than just the obvious musical benefits. Cognitive skills that music learners seem to acquire are numerous (Martin 1995:16), for example: interpreting symbols in new contexts, improving mathematical reasoning and exercising diverse problem-solving skills. Music thus seems to have a very practical impact on reasoning and problem solving – both imperative life skills.

Furthermore:

- Music is said to be one of the basic forms of intelligence (Gardner 1993:8-9).
- To practise an art form requires self-discipline, creativity and confidence. These acquired habits have positive applications in other areas of schooling and life environment (Seidel 1996:2).
- "The arts are worth studying because of what they are. Their impact cannot be denied" (MENC 1994a:23).
- The arts in all its forms are an integral part of daily life. To exclude this element from a curriculum would leave learners culturally disabled.

---

[16] Compare the research of Gordon Shaw and Frances Rauscher in this regard. Also Howard Gardner's groundbreaking *Frames of Mind: A Theory of Multiple Intelligence* (New York 1983).

Hanshumaker (Musica Research Notes 1995:2) names, after studying a wide variety of available doctoral dissertations, even more beneficial effects of music education on social and intellectual development:

- It facilitates language development and reading readiness.
- Arts activities are valued by school children.
- Arts activities foster positive attitudes toward school, which resulted in lower rates of absentees.
- Arts education facilitates social development, personality adjustment and general intellectual development.

These findings correlate with the personal experience of a majority of music and arts teachers, author included, who have over many years witnessed the enhanced social, creative and intellectual development of music pupils in many areas of cognitive and personal development.

What could therefore be summarised as the main objectives of music education in a school curriculum?

Curriculum planning and the activity of providing unit standards reflect the current social value and standing of the specific subject in society. "The curriculum is the concrete expression of educational values, intents and experiences and, as such, provides a focus for shared reflection on the educational enterprise" (Wing 1992:196-197).

If schools were to be viewed as "factories", producing learners with commercial skills to be used as economically productive members of society only, the content of appropriate curricula would focus on commercial subjects, neglecting aspects of personal, creative and intellectual development. In this regard the author wants to quote Glasgow when he states that: "The most innovative and educational models are being created not in the schools but in corporate America" (1997:7).

Lyn Gardner remarks in her article in *The Teacher* (official magazine of the South African Education Department, 2000:14), that the introduction of the National Curriculum during the late eighties saw the gradual declining of school music services because principals opted for

buying computers rather than music instruments, absorbing drama and dance into English and Physical Education.

Directly opposite to this view taken by principals in England, is the view expressed by Lehman (1993:203) when he states that the wrong question to ask is, "What will it take to get a job?" A more important question regarding education should be "What will it take to live a rich, rewarding and satisfying life?" Getting a job is only one of the facets of living a full life. To view schooling purely as a means to provide a work force for the corporate society would, in the opinion of the author, be a shallow, short-sighted and narrow-minded exercise.

If it were the intent of a curriculum to enhance the development of the total person, this would be reflected in the selection of important school subjects and the correlating unit standards for these subjects. Following this target would then imply including courses and subjects that would serve the enhancement of life qualities and personal development, and in the process enhance the societal fibre. The truth is that mankind's most memorable achievements are represented through works of art but, somehow, these are considered peripheral to the more serious business of manufacturing, economics or job-preparation (Lehman 1993:203).

In her article in *The Teacher*, Lyn Gardner (2000:14) quotes a study published by the National Foundation for Education Research in the United States, which showed that "large numbers of learners [...] are leaving school feeling that their arts experience at school had almost no impact on them". Furthermore, in spite of the fact that music plays an important role in most teenagers' lives, very little is learnt in secondary school.

When including the arts as core subject, the total person is involved and developed. The Australian Curriculum Council (AQFAB 1998:12), for example, is adamant in its inclusion of the arts in the eight learning areas of the National Curriculum Framework when it says that this learning area involves the development of students' skills across a wide range of human activities. "The arts develop verbal and physical skills, logical and intuitive thinking, interpersonal skills and spatial, rhythmic, visual and kinaesthetic awareness. They promote emotional intelligence, a way of understanding, using and making responses through the emotions and students' intra-personal qualities and experience. Through the arts, students learn to use and experiment with a range of traditional and emerging technologies."

In this regard, it is the opinion of the author that arts, and specifically music education of a very high quality should be provided for all children in Southern Africa. Low key, low quality education has never benefited any learner. This implies the training and motivation of the skilled music and arts teachers in schools to improve the standard of music education. The viewpoint of Lyn Gardner (2000:14) is an important one in this regard, as she is of the opinion that "the single most crucial factor in the success of arts education appears to be the employment of specialist teachers who are passionate about their subjects." Children thrive on arts education when the teacher is able to demonstrate practical skills competently and enthusiastically.

### 2.12 Unit standards for musics in Southern Africa

When the social standing of music and the arts are to be reflected in the light of the current situation in South Africa at the start of the 21st century, the picture seems to be dark and unpromising. Nieuwoudt (2000b), for example, quotes Dr. Ben Ngubane, Minister of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology, as saying: "Daar is geen toekoms meer vir staatsondersteunde ballet-, opera- en orkesgeselskappe in Suid-Afrika nie." The translated version is as follows: "There is no future for government-supported ballet and opera companies or orchestras in this country any more."

Arts, especially Western art music and ballet, do not at present enjoy nearly enough financial and moral support from administrators in South Africa. It is therefore imperative for music specialists to ensure the survival of arts education, and then to combine survival with the providing of quality education while opening up new perspectives. Arts education in our country seems to lie in the hands of practitioners, private enterprise and specialists. A project that aims to formulate unit standards for music(s) in Southern Africa, such as the MEUSSA project, is therefore immensely valuable, as it needs to establish:

- an inclusive and innovative set of standards;
- music education of a high quality;
- the opportunity to include as many learners as possible in a ground phase of high quality, so as to enable the maximum social, creative and intellectual development of the learners.

The Australian educational authorities maintained the status of the arts in the education of the youth, and described the relevance of the arts in the general school curriculum as follows:

> The arts contribute to the development of an understanding of the physical, emotional, intellectual, aesthetic, social, moral and spiritual dimensions of human experience. They also assist the expression and identity of individuals and groups through the recording and sharing of experiences and imagination (Curriculum Council of Western Australia 2000:11).

The current Frameworks, with eight learning areas for secondary training in South Africa, make provision for the inclusion of Arts and Culture. The challenge would be to fill this learning area with unit standards for music education that is accessible, of high quality and relevant to learners in Southern Africa.

### 2.13 The way forward in South Africa

Keeping the previous line of discussion in mind, it is clear that the inclusion of arts education, and thus music education as well, needs to be reconceived and prioritised. It is this content of education that provides for a well-rounded and fully educated learner, as it also provides for a better learning environment. Perry (1973:115) can be quoted here where he writes that "The fine arts play their part in enabling us to proceed from what we are, which is persons, to what we aim to be and in large measure are able to become and to remain, namely educated persons."

The backbone of the formal music educational scene in South Africa has been the Western art music tradition – a tradition that value knowledge and experience of musical elements and concepts, and encourages a high standard of performance. A single cultural group no more represents the population of South Africa. A mixture of foods, musics, languages, dance and visual art enriches the cultural heritage of a nation with eleven official languages and influences from as far as the Oriental, Indian, European, African and American cultures. This scenario demands that a fresh approach to education in South Africa, especially arts education, be used, with questions such as, "How should we express this new multi-faceted heritage through our curricular and cultural offerings? How should we address the hopes, dreams and – yes, fears of our new society?" (Burton 2000:2).

The fact is that a multi-cultural society such as ours provides for different sets of value frameworks where the labelling and stereotyping of different genres and styles of music, as well as other art forms, are concerned. These different value frameworks have their origin in different cultures and sources of music experience. They have to be acknowledged, addressed, and ultimately integrated into an inclusive music education. In expanding the content of music used for education, learners will benefit from the cultural practices of the microcosms of peoples in Southern Africa while maintaining the advantages of a music discipline.

The arts present a way to address these multi-cultural aspects of our rainbow nation, as it is the arts that provide a way to communicate and celebrate the different cultural practices of the peoples of South Africa. "Music captures the essence of a given culture, often providing a glimpse into the history, beliefs and traditions, allowing the culture to express its cultural heritage and demonstrate how the people work, celebrate, worship, court and amuse" (Burton 2000:2).

As the current curricula of music in South Africa in no way represent the multi-cultural music practices of this country, new perspectives and novel ways of approaching this state of affairs are urgently needed. Children need to be encouraged and supported to explore their own cultural history as well as that of others, and be given the opportunity to practise music actively. This situation requires that a new curriculum, reflecting the different musical values and styles of different groups of people, needs to be conceived. This new curriculum has to include many genres of music, including all aspects of Western (art and popular) music, jazz, African music, Indian music and World musics, as well as the traditional areas such as Harmony, Aural training, Form, History of Music and General Music. New divisions such as Music Technology, Music Industry and Media are still relatively unexplored, and need to be included as options.

**2.14 Contemporary music**

According to Leonhard (1999:42), few music educators are familiar with contemporary popular music from which their students are getting their education in music through the recording and broadcasting media outside school hours. In the same breath it could be said that other genres like jazz, African and other ethnic music, as well as contemporary art music

should *receive* a bigger slice of the music education cake, because it is in these genres that the present generation comfortably express themselves.

"The music that most kids are doing today is not being taught in schools. My musical experience has been largely outside school although perhaps my introduction to music was first from inside school" (Odam 1996:186). The incorporation of many more genres of music in the subject of Music seems to be lacking in the current approach, and three possible reasons could be provided for this situation:

- Teachers are themselves unfamiliar with one or more of the genres such as pop music, jazz, African or Indian music. "Most teachers have gone through the old system. They don't listen to pop music or understand it" (Odam 1996:186).
- Many examples of music from these genres are presumed (justly or not) of inferior quality, and for this reason omitted for the sake of other "more serious" genres. In the process of generally classifying, for example, all pop music as being of lesser quality, the teacher not only cuts off communication with his/her learners, but narrows musical experience in the class.
- A lack of facilities hampers the potential to utilise as many genres in the musical field as possible. To be able to provide a wide basis in, for example, music listening and appraisal, a school needs a substantial collection of compact discs from different musical styles, countries and periods together with the necessary equipment to accurately produce these sounds. "Schools haven't got the right equipment or the right sort of rooms to work in" (Odam 1996:186).

These few observations make it clear that class and instrumental music teachers have, generally speaking, too little knowledge about the music that fills the days of the learners in their classes. Furthermore it may be said that the content of music taught in class does not provide learners with a chance to develop a keen ear to distinguish between higher and lower quality in the everyday music that is heard on the radio and popular concerts. Another vacuum may be that music of our time, playing composers such as Luciano Berio, Krzysztof Penderecki, James MacMillan, John Tavener, Arvo Pärt and Einojuhani Rautavaara does not receive enough exposure – generally because of a lack of knowledge on the part of the teacher.

Does this mean that learners have to be allowed own free choice when selecting suitable musical material for educational purposes? "Unfortunately too much music today inspires young to the use of drugs, the abuse of sex, and the inclination to violence. The schools can do a lot to encourage children to listen to the right kind of music during the formative years" (Artsedge 2000:2). In other words - the inclusion of a wider range of musical genres needs to be done with care, consideration for quality and sensitivity, as not all music can be said to have a positive influence on its listeners. In this regard it can be expected that the music teachers in schools must be expected to have both the knowledge and ability to distinguish exactly which musical content to use in the educational process.

As a consequence of this, the ongoing training of music staff is imperative. Teachers need to be kept informed so as to be able to integrate music education with the everyday life of the learners in their classes. "In many places, more teachers with credentials in the arts, as well as better-trained teachers in general, will be needed. [T]he primary issue is to bring together and deliver a broad range of competent instruction" (MENC 1994a:63).

In short – learners must be allowed to experience, make and learn about all kinds of music at school, from Pop and Swing, to Classical and Jazz. In the words of Danny Farrant, seventeen-year old British learner: "Everyone should have as broad an education as possible and choose which way they want to go at the end of it" (Odam 1996:187).

The challenge for music educators, when developing a music framework and general curriculum, thus asks that students be assisted to experience a broad, inclusive musical education that positively influences, forms and prepares them to become responsible and mature adults.

### 2.15 Perspective on problems encountered

The general direction of music education in South Africa is moving towards widening the canon of the discourse by including all genres of music practised in the country and broadening the perspective of using Western art music as the only basis for music teaching.[17] For a start, some obstacles therefore had to be overcome and pre-set ideas changed within the

---

[17] A detailed motivation for this statement is provided by the author in chapter 4 , which provides a postmodern view on music education.

MEUSSA group itself. Because this group has exponents of all the major musical styles in South Africa, the problems encountered in the group may, to a large extent, be considered as representative of potential problems in the South African music education scenario.

One of the problems of providing a coherent set of unit standards for musics in South Africa, is the cross-cultural issue. As the population in this country consists of diverse cultural and ethnic groups, the provision of an inclusive set of unit standards can pose substantial problems, as it is sometimes difficult to separate *content* (musical concepts) from *value* (an emotional dimension of cultural content) and *approach.*[18] "The relative effects and merits of Western influence on cultures is often the basis for many questions among art educators" (Ott & Hurwitz 1984:58-59). Especially in African countries the tension between Western culture and traditional art forms can provide areas of disagreement between curriculum planners. "Neither country [Nigeria and Ghana] is going to cast off traditional art forms because in many cases these are still bound up with local life styles and with nonvisual art forms, yet both countries look to the West for guidance in planning curricula" (Ott & Hurwitz 1984:58-59).

A relevant question to ask in the context of the South African diversity of cultures is: "How does one institutionalise forces that have been accepted as a way of life? And, how does one preserve art forms that are linked to customs that are the casualties of progress?" (Ott & Hurwitz 1984:58-59).

Other questions to pose may be: how may a way be presented in which to incorporate local art forms and cultures into a school environment and curriculum? Are children in urban and rural areas exposed to the same cultural content? Can this content be formalised in a curriculum? (for example the relative content of popular music heard on the radio and television as compared to traditional cultural content of ethnic music).

---

[18] The MEUSSA team often came across these differences within our own group. Because not all participants were trained in the same genre, it was sometimes difficult to formulate, for example, one approach to *performing*. In the Western tradition, "performing" means reproducing/recreating and interpreting the written score accurately, but in the Indian, African or Jazz idiom the concept of producing/creating is an integral part of performing.

Further typical problems encountered specifically in South Africa in the process of establishing a set of inclusive, high quality unit standards for musics, were, inter alia:

- There is a serious lack of funding and infrastructure, as there is a large occurrence of poverty in different parts of the country. Funding for instrumental teaching and learning is virtually non-existent in all layers of the South African society.
- Communication between practitioners of Western art forms, popular music and traditional art forms is often experienced as cumbersome or absent.
- The varying character of traditional art forms in different parts of the country makes it difficult to pinpoint a version of standards to use in curricula for the whole country.
- There are different levels of schooling and education in different regions of the country, as well as drastically varying levels of skilled teachers.
- The provision of different styles and genres at the same outcome level, so as to formalise standards for different kinds and genres of music, is foreseen as potentially difficult. The technical content of Western art music and a piece of music in pop and rock style could, for example, be widely different.
- There is a big gulf between classroom music (non-performance-based) and instrumental teaching and learning (performance-based).

As the above list suggests, music education in South Africa faces many challenges, another of which is the way formal music education might relate to the musical content of society. Styles such as popular, commercial and indigenous music styles and genres, which are part of everyday community life, must be considered in the formal education of music, as it is undesirable to divide music into "school music" and "everyday music". Lepherd (1994:5) summarises this effectively when he alleges that "What is promoted in music education in schools will be increasingly challenged as young people are influenced more by the world around them."

**2.16 Music in South African Schools**

The performing aspect of music education in South Africa has, like in many Western and non-Western countries world-wide, been primarily offered by private or peripatetic teachers.

These students usually perform in external examinations offered by the three examination bodies in South Africa, namely the University of South Africa (UNISA), the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) and Trinity College of London. Pupils taking private lessons formed, and still form, a substantial part of music audiences, music players and music-buying citizens in the classical genre.

Music education should ideally start before a child enters formal education. Many pre-schools offer music experiences to children between three and six years old. This often includes performing on Orff instruments, doing a little music appreciation, moving to music and singing songs, but worthwhile music experiences are erratic and many learners are still excluded from music as core subject at this important phase.

In South Africa, pre-school education usually continues with general class music in primary school, but in this system there is little or no chance of performing for individual learners, except outside of normal school hours and structures. Learners taking lessons on one or more instruments outside school hours are also not credited within the formal school structure, for example as an extra subject on their school report form.

Secondary school music experiences are usually scaled down drastically, with worthwhile musical experiences only available to children of paying parents taking music as extra-curricular subject. Music education then normally continues with a learner taking private instrumental (performing) and theory lessons. This scenario is not uncommon – the British scene was already described in 1963 by Chisholm (1963:189-190) as follows: "After nursery and elementary school our educational systems do little to develop the natural creative attributes of the child and much to strangle and stifle them – and that, in the interest of human development, happiness and fulfilment, it is desirable to alter this state of affairs". The National Curriculum, introduced in 2000, attempted to change this state of affairs by offering General Music as school subject from pre-school to year 13 of the school structure. An option of following a performance-based or composition-based course in music was also made available.[19]

---

[19] The reader is referred to chapter 3, section 3.9.3, where the music content of the National Curriculum is discussed in more detail.

The current approach to general education by the South African educational authorities is very concerned with subjects such as Mathematics and Sciences, and less concerned with spending the same proportion of school time on developing creativity and cultivating an arts-related discipline. This tendency is also not unique to South Africa: Crozier (1998:50), for example, explains in an article in the *Music Teacher* the British music educators' fear of losing the subject's place in the primary school timetable as a result of the proposed improved literacy and numeracy standard policy. Music is still offered as a subject in many South African secondary schools, although budget cuts have forced the exit of many skilled music teachers as well as the termination of Music as a school subject in many schools.

This is a sad state of affairs, because "all children are naturally creative, but by the time they enter a secondary school have had most of the creative faculty knocked out of them – or so I believed. [But] the creative instinct has not been strangled, but has only been lying dormant, waiting to be awakened by an intelligent hand" (Chisholm 1963:189).

It is the opinion of the author that by performing on an instrument in any genre of music, a learner is benefiting from the multiple advantages of practising a form of the arts, developing the potential as an educated and rounded person. There is a huge gap between "real" music (experienced by performing) and, what Crozier (1998:50) calls, the *Peter and the Wolf approach*, implying music taught without experiencing music-making first hand. The author agrees with Crozier that the last-mentioned method does not utilise the natural creativity and curiosity of the majority of learners, but merely provides a superficial overview of a vast subject. "It is our duty to unravel the tragedy enacted upon the child – a being full of life, creativeness and potential nobility when born, slowly as he grows, descending in tone to a state of mediocrity and unawareness with the varying symptoms that accompany the loss of creativeness, those of discontent, frustration, delinquency, nervous disorders and worse" (Chisholm 1963:199).

The author also shares the viewpoint offered by Lepherd (1994:3) that "music education does not exist in a vacuum. A national system is the way it is because of the factors that have influenced its development". Therefore the MEUSSA team, with the provision of unit standards, can play a vital role in determining the direction of music education in South Africa, facilitating quality education to learners from the foundation phase to the end of compulsory schooling and beyond.

## 2.17 Suggestions for encouraging formal music education

The author is of the opinion that it is very difficult, and certainly not ideal, to be educated in music without experiencing the performance aspect. Without being able to experience music first hand, either by singing or by performing on an instrument, a learner may find it difficult to understand the discipline of Music.

There are a number of ways to encourage music education through performance on one or more instruments. One way of achieving this could be by allowing for extra credits on the school report form for extra-curricular instrumental (solo, ensemble or orchestral) work done. The normal practice in South Africa at the moment (2001) does not allow for formal recognition of hard work done after school hours in the field of music performing.

Another way of encouraging music education through performance is by running music programmes in collaboration with professional institutions. As an example the "Time for Bows" programme, initiated by the Eastman School of Music in the Enrico Fermi Elementary School in Rochester, New York (Fitzpatrick 1999: 30-32) may be cited. This programme was designed as a community-based programme "sturdy enough to succeed under less than ideal conditions". By providing tuition and supervised practising time, a youth string orchestra was established which had as its aim a community education project with a broad approach to music education.

A third option is to include genres other than classical music in the curriculum for music education. Chisholm (1963:196), for example, suggested the inclusion of jazz in the school curriculum as early as the 1960s: "I am all in favour of persons getting out their instruments and playing jazz happily together – particularly young persons whose vital creative spark has not been bull-dozed out of existence [...]. Firstly, it is great fun and, secondly, it is creative and gives a deep-rooted satisfaction to the performer".

## 2.18 Strategies for the implementation of music education

For music education to have an impact on or benefit for the average learner, Lehman (1993:205-207) states eight requirements that need to be addressed:

- Every primary and secondary school must offer a comprehensive, balanced, sequential, high quality programme of music instruction, taught by qualified

educators. These should, ideally, be specialist teachers assisted by generalist teachers.

- Objectives for music instruction should be explained in simple and clear language, stating what the pupils should know and be able to do, and bypassing "esoteric jargon".
- Minimum expectations for the various levels of achievement in music should be clearly outlined, avoiding vague descriptions and foggy rhetoric.
- Music learning must be based on skills and knowledge, and the idea that music is only fun and games, or serving the aim of entertainment, must be avoided at all costs. Using this angle of music education serves the perception that music is a frill that may be omitted if necessary.
- Music education programmes must be made public and visible in order to build a solid base of support of parents, community, and eventually every "decision-maker, opinion-moulder and taxpayer".
- Natural allies such as arts councils, music clubs, arts organisations and other support groups must be mobilised to work on behalf of music education and arts programmes in schools.
- Pre-service teacher education should be at a very high level, meaning that music teachers should be fine musicians themselves, as well as enthusiastic and able teachers. "They should be able to analyse, describe, and discuss music knowledgeably. They should be able to improvise, compose, and arrange music" (Lehman 1993:207).
- Music teachers need to be treated as professionals, meaning that their professional judgement needs to be valued, and sufficient equipment, materials, facilities and time to do their job need to be supplied.

These requirements should, in the opinion of the author, enjoy high priority in the South African educational policy regarding music education. It is still not true that a "comprehensive, [...] high quality programme of music instruction" is provided in all schools, neither that ample skilled music teachers are valued and trained to achieve this. In

short, commitment to quality education means providing both the teaching materials and the teaching skills to comply with high quality music education. "How can any school without a strong programme in music and the arts claim to have a serious commitment to quality education?" (Lehman 1993:207).

Currently (2001), Music may be taken on three levels in those South African schools still offering Music as a subject, namely:

- Music on **higher grade** (harmony, aural training, form and history, with a first instrument on performance level);
- Music on **standard grade** (harmony, aural training, form and history with an instrument on a performance level of one grade lower than the higher grade); and
- **Music Performance** (no theoretical components, usually taken in combination with the higher grade subject, and incorporating performance on a second instrument on one level lower than that of the standard grade, or two grades lower than the higher grade).

The system of formal music education in schools in South Africa takes Western art music as point of departure. In the modernist narrative, Western art music is regarded as having superior artistic merit, but "a price has to be paid, however, for the achievement of these towering heights. The price is that with our world of music divided into a handful of creative musicians and an army of *re*creative musicians whose sole function in the art of music is the almost mechanical one of bringing again to life the ideas, musical thoughts and sound patterns of the creators, the majority of musicians are denied the opportunity of exercising their creative instincts" (Chisholm 1963:196).

This approach also excludes those learners who participate in other genres, stemming from traditions that integrate performing and creating such as Indian music, African music, popular music and jazz. Because these music genres form an integral part of the culture of the majority of students in the South African community, a serious re-evaluation of educational perspectives needs to be taken: "In music education there is also the need to examine the musical context of the society. This includes the nature of the music - a nation's traditional music as well as other forms, and the current national climate for music - the extent to which

national or local organisations of a variety of kinds influence directly the provisions for music education" (Lepherd 1994:3).

To address this vacuum, the inclusion of more genres of music into the curriculum must be considered, as well as the enrichment of the Western content with aspects such as improvisation and studying or practising music of other cultures, genres or styles. The area of popular music should, for example, be addressed by music educators, because this genre of music forms an integral part of the world which the average learner experiences from day to day. To approach music education this way is in line with a postmodern approach, as will be outlined in chapter 4.

As part of the MEUSSA team, the author wants to present relevant suggestions that were made by this group after discussing the frameworks of the USA during a workshop:

- The music education situation in the USA makes provision for many levels, but the group suggests that the current three levels in South Africa (Lower Grade, Standard Grade and Higher Grade) could be kept the same, but used in a more flexible way.
- Instruction in Music theory need not be introduced from the start, but when added later in the course of music study, more weight can be given to the performance aspect.
- The main goal of music education should not be to train specialist musicians, but to provide a general education and opportunity for experiences in music.
- Focused, career-orientated schooling for exceptionally talented young musicians should, however, also be available, as it prepares them for a viable future.

More suggestions for music education in South Africa, additional to the above-mentioned, will be presented by the author in chapter 3, after critically investigating unit standards of the USA, Australia, England and New Zealand.

### 2.19 Final remarks

"We have learned that musical doing, thinking and feeling are essential ways in which humans make contact with, internalise, express, critique, and influence their cultural contexts" (Reimer 1999:43). It is the obligation of music educators to keep the contents of the music curriculum in touch with this past and present cultural and historical context. It is

also the task of music educators to "celebrate the human capacity to express inner thoughts and feelings that transcend cultural, political, temporal and geographical barriers" (Beglarian 1991:17).

According to Sturm (1998:1) the study of music has been credited with benefiting

- the individual (maintaining a person's physical, emotional and intellectual well-being, enhancing spatial and abstract reasoning skills);
- the community (improving religious service, balancing the negative effects of scientific and technological progress, providing good social and moral influence); and
- the nation (encouraging patriotism, benefiting international relations).

This project, with leader Professor Caroline van Niekerk and co-leader Professor Heinrich van der Mescht, fills an urgent need for the re-evaluation and re-engineering of music education in Southern Africa.