



UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

**A SPEECH PROGRAMME
FOR
DEAF LEARNERS TO BE USED
IN THE CLASSROOM BY TEACHERS**

**BY
ZELDA ISAACSON**

DISSERTATION SUBMITTED
IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT
OF
THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY,
THROUGH THE DEPARTMENT OF
COMMUNICATION PATHOLOGY,
FACULTY OF HUMANITIES,
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA,
PRETORIA

NOVEMBER 2000

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA



2101138

© University of Pretoria



This thesis is dedicated to...

All Deaf learners

In the hope that speech teaching will be enjoyable.



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My grateful thanks go to:

My supervisor, PROF R HUGO, for providing me with the magical balance of creative freedom and structure. I was fortunate to have had someone of her calibre.

My husband, CHARLES, for his encouragement, transport – ferrying me far and wide throughout South Africa - and the monumental task of editing the thesis.

ALIDA VAN DYK for her marvellous typing, cheerfulness and friendship.

The SISTERS OF THE DOMINICAN GRIMLEY SCHOOL FOR THE DEAF in Houtbay. Their belief in me, set me on my path and is still a source of encouragement.

The PRINCIPAL AND STAFF of the Wittebome School for the Deaf, for allowing me the freedom to apply my theories.

My children, ROBERT AND TALIA, and my parents WALTER AND LESKA GORDON for their ongoing support.

To G_D, for giving me the ability and the endurance.

ABSTRACT

TITLE: A Speech Programme for Deaf Learners to be used in
in the Classroom by Teachers

NAME: Zelda Isaacson

PROMOTER: Prof. R. Hugo

DEPARTMENT: Communication Pathology

DEGREE: D. Phil

This thesis sets out the rationale and design for a speech programme for Deaf learners to be implemented by teachers in the classroom. Theoretical and empirical research are provided to support its design. Speech teaching is set against a backdrop of current issues so that the programme is seen to take cognisance of these. To this end the disappointment and conflict which surround speech teaching and newer educational and audiological trends are described. Following this, the deviant speech of the Deaf is described. Prevoical aspects of speech production, namely aberrant respiratory functioning and deviant vocal set are described. The latter is a term coined for this research to denote psychological, functional, physical and neural changes that deleteriously affect the speech of the Deaf. Suprasegmental and segmental problems are next delineated. An argument that supports the view that vowels are less accessible to correction than consonants is proposed to explain the emphasis accorded to consonants. Hereafter, theories of speech teaching are set out to clarify their incorporation into the proposed programme. Critiques of Haycock, the Ewings, Ling and van Uden are provided. The role of computers and biofeedback is evaluated.

The Whole Language Approach to mainstream education, the phonological method of speech correction, and creative techniques, speech and drama, and singing, are described in relation to speech instruction for Deaf learners. Empirical research that investigates attitudes and needs of educators of Deaf children, with the emphasis on the class teacher, is delineated. Finally, the proposed programme is presented emphasising its potential to interrupt the current self-perpetuating negative cycle. Theoretical principles are a defocus on lipreading cues to provide information on speech production, restriction of digital contact with the larynx or throat, repeated cycles of intervention at phonetic and phonological levels, and the employment of five multisensory avenues to enhance speech perception. The latter are orosensory, graphic, kinaesthetic, hand analogies and use of inanimate objects. Skills targeted for development are control of vocal organs, suprasegmental, segmental and phonological development. The fit of the proposed programme to the education paradigm in terms of learner, teacher and school system is described. The thesis concludes with an evaluation of the programme and recommendations for future research.

Keywords :

Deaf children, classroom, speech programme, teacher of the Deaf, speech therapy, speech teaching, speech correction, speech development

CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION, BACKGROUND AND RESEARCH PROBLEM

1.1	INTRODUCTION	1
1.2	DISAPPOINTMENT: CAN SPEECH BE TAUGHT?	2
1.2.1	EXISTENT POTENTIAL	3
1.2.2	CURRENT EXPLOITATION OF POTENTIAL	4
1.2.2.1	Teacher training	5
1.2.2.2	Available Resources	8
1.2.2.3	Frequency of speech teaching	12
1.2.2.4	Teacher attitude	13
1.2.3	CONCLUSIONS	14
1.3	CONFUSION AND CONFLICT : SHOULD SPEECH BE TAUGHT?	15
1.3.1	TEACHING METHODOLOGIES REVIEWED	17
1.3.1.1	The Oral Method	18
1.3.1.2	The Manual Method	19
1.3.2	CONCLUSIONS	22
1.4	HOPE : CAN MODERN TRENDS INFLUENCE SPEECH?	23
1.4.1	COCHLEAR IMPLANTS	23
1.4.2	MAINSTREAMING (INCLUSION)	23
1.5	RESEARCH QUESTION, ANSWER AND AIMS	26
1.5.1	RESEARCH QUESTION	26
1.5.2	RESEARCH ANSWER	26
1.5.3	RESEARCH AIMS	26

1.6	ORGANISATION OF THE THESIS	27
1.7	CLARIFICATION OF TERMINOLOGY	29
1.7.1	TERMS DESCRIBING LOSS OF HEARING ACUITY	29
1.7.2	TERMS RELATING TO PERSONNEL WHO ASSIST DEAF PUPILS WITH THE DEVELOPMENT OF SPEECH COMPETENCY	31
1.7.3	TERMS RELATING TO DEVELOPMENTAL RESEARCH	32
1.8	CONCLUSION	33
	<u>CHAPTER TWO : THE SPEECH OF THE DEAF</u>	34
2.1	INTRODUCTION	34
2.2	VARIABLES THAT AFFECT SPEECH PROFICIENCY	35
2.2.1	DEGREE OF DEAFNESS	35
2.2.2	AGE AT ONSET OF DEAFNESS	36
2.2.3	TYPE OF DEAFNESS	37
2.2.4	AGE OF CHILD AT DIAGNOSIS AND COMMENCEMENT OF AURAL REHABILITATION	37
2.2.5	QUALITY OF EARLY AURAL REHABILITATION	37
2.2.6	QUALITY OF LATER SPEECH TEACHING	37
2.2.7	ADDITIONAL DISABILITIES	37
2.2.8	MOTIVATION	38
2.2.9	AMPLIFICATION	38
2.2.10	INTERCONNECTEDNESS OF VARIABLES	39
2.3	SPEECH AND VOICE ERRORS COMMON TO THE DEAF	39
2.3.1	NON-VOCAL ASPECTS OF SPEECH PRODUCTION	40
2.3.1.1	Deviant vocal set	40
2.3.1.2	Aberrant use of the breathing mechanism	56
2.3.2	VOCAL ASPECTS OF SPEECH PRODUCTION: SUPRASEGMENTAL AND SEGMENTAL	57
2.3.2.1	Suprasegmental deviations	57

2.3.2.2	Segmental problems: vowels, diphthongs and consonants	59
2.3.2.2.1	Comparison of the relative difficulty between vowel and consonant production	59
2.3.2.2.2	Common vowel and diphthong errors	65
2.3.2.2.3	Aspects of maximum vowel contrast	68
2.3.2.2.4	Common consonant errors	70
2.3.2.2.5	Vowels and consonants in connected speech	74
2.3.2.2.6	Intelligibility and type of speech error	75
2.4	CONCLUSION	76
 CHAPTER 3 : THEORIES OF SPEECH TEACHING FOR THE DEAF		77
3.1	INTRODUCTION	77
3.2	SPEECH TEACHING FOR THE DEAF HISTORICALLY	78
3.3	SPEECH TEACHING FOR THE DEAF CONTEMPORARILY	80
3.3.1	IMPORTANT EDUCATORS	80
3.3.1.1	England: Haycock and the Ewings	80
3.3.1.2	America: Daniel Ling	81
3.3.1.2.1	Critique of Ling	82
3.3.1.3	Europe : van Uden	85
3.3.1.3.1	Critique of van Uden	88
3.3.1.4	Comparison between Ling and van Uden	89
3.3.2	TECHNOLOGICAL ADVANCES : COMPUTERS AND BIOFEEDBACK	92
3.3.2.1	Advantages and Disadvantages	92
3.3.3	THE WHOLE LANGUAGE APPROACH: A NEWER DEVELOPMENT IN LANGUAGE TEACHING	93
3.3.3.1	Implications of the WLA to the deaf child in the classroom	93

3.3.3.1.1	Importance of non-linguistic variables	94
3.3.3.1.2	Inter-relationship of language components and Processes	94
3.3.4	THE PHONOLOGICAL APPROACH: A NEWER METHOD IN SPEECH REMEDIATION OF CHILDREN WITH NORMAL HEARING	100
3.3.4.1	Evaluation of the basic tenets of the phonological approach to speech problems of Deaf children	101
3.3.4.2	Evaluation of the basic tenets of the traditional approach to speech problems of Deaf children	102
3.3.4.3	Disadvantages of employing the phonological approach with Deaf children	104
3.3.4.4	Advantages of employing the phonological approach with Deaf children	105
3.3.4.5	Critique of Ling's (1991) evaluation of the phonological method for the hearing-impaired	106
3.3.5	CREATIVE APPROACHES TO VOCAL IMPROVEMENT	107
3.3.5.1	Speech and drama	107
3.3.5.2	Singing and music	108
3.4	CONCLUSION	112
CHAPTER 4 : AN INVESTIGATION INTO THE ATTITUDES AND NEEDS OF EDUCATORS OF CHILDREN WITH HEARING LOSSES		114
4.1	INTRODUCTION AND CHAPTER OVERVIEW	114
4.2	RESTATEMENT OF RESEARCH AIMS	114
4.3	RESEARCH OPTIONS EXAMINED	116

4.4	RATIONALE FOR CHOICE OF A QUALITATIVE RESEARCH DESIGN	117
4.4.1	LACK OF LITERATURE	118
4.4.2	PHENOMENOLOGICAL FOCUS	118
4.4.3	WORDS RATHER THAN NUMBERS SUITED TO CAPTURING DATA	118
4.5	VULNERABILITIES OF QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN RELATION TO THIS STUDY	118
4.5.1	LIMITATIONS OF GENERALISABILITY	119
4.5.2	LACK OF OBJECTIVITY	119
4.5.3	LACK OF CONTROL	120
4.5.4	ESOTERIC TERMINOLOGY	120
4.6	CRITERIA FOR SCHOOL AND SUBJECT SELECTION	121
4.6.1	CRITERIA OF SELECTION APPLIED TO SCHOOLS	121
4.6.2	CRITERIA OF INCLUSION APPLIED TO SUBJECTS	121
4.6.2.1	Criteria of inclusion applied to teachers	123
4.6.2.2	Criteria of inclusion applied to communication pathologists	124
4.6.2.3	Criteria of inclusion applied to school principals	125
4.7	RESEARCH INSTRUMENT: THE INTERVIEW	125
4.7.1	VALIDITY OF THE INTERVIEW	125
4.7.2	RELIABILITY OF THE INTERVIEW	126
4.7.3	RATIONALE FOR USE OF BOTH GROUP AND SINGLE INTERVIEWS	126
4.7.3.1	Rationale for use of group interviews	126
4.7.4.2	Rationale for use of single interviews	127
4.8	PROCEDURE	128

4.9	DATA ANALYSIS	131
4.9.1	AN ART AND A SCIENCE	131
4.9.2	SYSTEM OF ANALYSIS ACCORDING TO GIORGI (1985) AND LINCOLN AND GUBA (1985 – CITED BY MERRIAM, 1991)	131
4.9.3	COMPLEMENTARY QUANTITATIVE DESCRIPTION	132
4.10	CONCLUSION	134
 <u>CHAPTER 5 : RESULTS OF THE INVESTIGATION</u>		135
5.1	INTRODUCTION : AIMS AND OVERVIEW	135
5.2	STEP ONE : THE TRANSCRIPT IS READ AS A WHOLE	136
5.3	STEP TWO : IDENTIFICATION OF UNITS OF MEANING	138
5.4	STEP THREE : CATEGORISATION OF UNITS OF MEANING AND TRANSFORMATION INTO SCIENTIFIC TERMINOLOGY	139
5.4.1	THEME 1 : ORAL MANUAL ISSUES	141
5.4.1.1	Excerpts supporting this theme	141
5.4.1.2	Discussion	143
5.4.1.3	Implications related to the proposed speech programme	143
5.4.2	THEME 2 : LACK OF PROGRESS	143
5.4.2.1	Excerpts supporting this theme	144
5.4.2.2	Discussion	145
5.4.2.3	Implications related to the proposed speech programme	145
5.4.3	THEME THREE : QUALITY AND EXPERIENCE OF TEACHER AND LEARNER	145
5.4.3.1	Excerpts supporting this theme	146

5.4.3.2	Discussion	149
5.4.3.3	Implications related to the proposed speech programme	151
5.4.4	THEME FOUR : NEGATIVE COMPONENTS OF DEVIANT SPEECH - TECHNICAL AND PSYCHOLOGICAL	151
5.4.4.1	Excerpts supporting this theme	151
5.4.4.2	Discussion	155
5.4.4.3	Implications related to the proposed speech programme	157
5.4.5	THEME FIVE : LEVEL OF TRAINING AND KNOWLEDGE OF RESOURCE MATERIAL	158
5.4.5.1	Excerpts supporting this theme	158
5.4.5.2	Discussion	164
	Implications related to the proposed speech programme	167
5.4.6	THEME SIX : RELEVANCE OF SPEECH TEACHING	167
5.4.6.1	Excerpts supporting this theme	167
5.4.6.2	Discussion	168
5.4.6.3	Implications related to the proposed speech programme	170
5.4.7	THEME SEVEN : TIME CONSTRAINTS	170
5.4.7.1	Excerpts supporting this theme	170
5.4.7.2	Discussion	172
5.4.7.3	Implications related to the proposed speech programme	172
5.4.8	THEME EIGHT: DIVERSITY OF SPEECH SKILLS	173
5.4.8.1	Excerpts supporting this theme	173
5.4.8.2	Discussion	175
5.4.8.3	Implications related to the proposed speech programme	176
5.4.9	THEME NINE: GROUP VERSUS INDIVIDUAL LESSONS	176
5.4.9.1	Excerpts supporting this theme	176
5.4.9.2	Discussion	178
5.4.9.3	Implications related to the proposed speech programme	178
5.4.10	THEME TEN : A WIDER FOCUS FOR SPEECH TEACHING	178
5.4.10.1	Excerpts supporting this theme	179

5.4.10.2	Discussion	183
5.4.10.3	Implications related to the proposed speech programme	184
5.4.11	THEME ELEVEN : THE MULTIDISCIPLINARY TEAM	187
5.4.11.1	Excerpts supporting this theme	187
5.4.11.2	Discussion	191
5.4.11.3	Implications related to the proposed speech programme	197
5.4.12	THEME TWELVE : EDUCATOR REQUIREMENTS FOR A NEW SPEECH PROGRAMME	194
5.4.12.1	Excerpts supporting this theme	194
5.4.12.2	Discussion	203
5.4.12.2	Implications related to the proposed speech programme	207
5.5	STEP FOUR : RESULTS WRITTEN AS A COHESIVE WHOLE	207
5.6	CONCLUSION	209
<u>CHAPTER 6 : DEVELOPMENTAL RESEARCH: DESCRIPTION OF THE PROPOSED PROGRAMME</u>		210
6.1	INTRODUCTION, AIMS AND CHAPTER OVERVIEW	210
6.2	POTENTIAL OF THE PROPOSED PROGRAMME TO AMELIORATE PROBLEMS	211
6.2.1	SELF PERPETUATING NEGATIVE AND POSITIVE CYCLES	211
6.3	PROGRAMME OVERVIEW	214
6.4	THEORETICAL CONSTRUCTS	215
6.4.1	DEFOCUS ON LIP-READING CUES TO PROVIDE INFORMATION ON SPEECH PRODUCTION	215

6.4.2	RESTRICTION OF DIGITAL CONTACT WITH THE LARYNX OR THROAT	216
6.4.3	REPEATED CYCLES OF INTERVENTION AT PHONETIC AND PHONOLOGICAL LEVELS	216
6.4.4	MULTI-SENSORY AVENUES EMPLOYED TO ENHANCE PERCEPTION OF SPEECH	217
6.4.4.1	Orosensory	218
6.4.4.2	Graphic: Diacritical symbols and graphemes	222
6.4.4.3	Kinaesthetic: Tactile experience of vocalisation, analogous tactile simulation and bodily movements	244
6.4.4.4	Hand analogies	245
6.4.4.5	Inanimate objects	246
6.4.5	COMPLEMENTARY NATURE OF MULTI-SENSORY AVENUES	248
6.5	SKILLS TARGETED FOR DEVELOPMENT	251
6.5.1	CONTROL OF VOCAL ORGANS	251
6.5.2	SUPRASEGMENTAL DEVELOPMENT	253
6.5.3	SEGMENTAL DEVELOPMENT : VOWELS AND DIPHTHONGS	258
6.5.4	SEGMENTAL DEVELOPMENT : CONSONANTS	260
6.5.5	PHONOLOGICAL DEVELOPMENT	262
6.6	FIT OF THE PROGRAMME TO THE EDUCATION PARADIGM	262
6.6.1	Learner	263
6.6.2	Teacher	268
6.6.3	School systems	269
6.7	CONCLUSION	272
	<u>CHAPTER 7 : EVALUATION AND CONCLUSION</u>	274
7.1	INTRODUCTION AND CHAPTER OVERVIEW	275

7.2	FULFILMENT OF THE AIMS OF THE STUDY	274
7.3	THE CONTRIBUTION OF THE PROPOSED PROGRAMME TO SPEECH SCIENCE FOR THE DEAF	275
7.4	LIMITATIONS OF THE PROPOSED PROGRAMME	277
7.5	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	277
7.6	CONCLUSION	278

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1	:	Intelligibility of speech among hearing-impaired subjects.	3
Table 1.2	:	Speech training for teachers of the Deaf in South Africa.	7
Table 1.3	:	The ratio of hearing-impaired students and communication pathologists at schools for the Deaf in South Africa.	8
Table 1.4	:	Books chosen by Ling, Markides and Bunch as representing those most significant for speech teaching.	10
Table 1.5	:	Comparison between the relative importance accorded to intelligibility, speech lessons and potential for deviant speech by different educational methods.	21
Table 2.1	:	The relationship between degree of hearing loss and speech deviations.	35
Table 2.2	:	How deviant vocal set affects the speech organs and resultant speech production.	46
Table 2.3	:	A comparison of relative ease/difficulty of production that vowels and consonants present for Deaf children.	60
Table 2.4	:	Subtelney et.al., 's 1980 investigation of improvement of vowels and consonants following training in auditory discrimination and speech production.	64
Table 2.5	:	Common faults of vowel production and their causes.	66
Table 2.6	:	A comparison of correct production and pitch stability of contrastive vowels.	69
Table 2.7	:	Proportion of omissions, substitutions, distortions and additions in deviant consonant production.	69
Table 2.8	:	Consonant omissions.	71
Table 2.9	:	Common substitutions and rationale.	73
Table 3.1	:	Comparison between speech teaching methods of Ling and van Uden.	89

Table 3.2	:	The underlying logic of a Deaf child's misspelling of the word "klippe" as "lem".	99
Table 3.3	:	Evaluation of the basic tenets of the phonological approach in relation to speech remediation of Deaf children.	101
Table 3.4	:	Criteria of traditional therapy.	103
Table 3.5	:	Tait's (1986) research findings on the benefits of singing for hearing-impaired children.	110
Table 4.2	:	Contrast between qualitative and quantitative research.	116
Table 4.3	:	Comparison of terminology used in qualitative and quantitative research.	120
Table 4.4	:	Number of schools in relation to language and mode of communication.	122
Table 5.1	:	A comparison between IPA and diacritical symbols used to represent the word "sunshine"	185
Table 6.1	:	Comparison between viseme groupings followed in the proposed programme and viseme groups suggested by other researchers.	219
Table 6.2	:	Analysis of similarities of viseme presentation, speech production and potential for auditory discrimination between juxtaposed consonant pairs.	221
Table 6.3	:	How employment of diacritical symbols and graphemes indicate suprasegmental, vowel, diphthong and consonant production, intrusive voicing and grapheme/phoneme correspondence.	225
Table 6.4	:	Exploitation of the configuration of the grapheme to represent aspects of speech production and a child-centred explanation and rationale for choice of symbol.	241

Table 6.5	:	Comparative evaluation between orthographic systems described and evaluated by Calvert and Silverman (1978) and that employed by the proposed speech programme in relation to consonants.	243
Table 6.6	:	Graded levels of consonant development.	260
Table 7.1	:	Extent to which requirements of teachers are addressed in the proposed programme.	276

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1	:	Major teaching methodologies.	17
Figure 2.1	:	Organisation of discussion relating to common errors of speech of the Deaf.	40
Figure 2.2	:	Noxious influences on the vocal set of the Deaf speaker.	41
Figure 2.3	:	The influences of school entrance on speech.	43
Figure 2.4	:	The self-perpetuating negative cycle that causes the velum to become thinner and shorter.	52
Figure 2.5	:	A photograph showing a teacher exaggerating her mouth movements during a teaching situation.	54
Figure 2.6	:	Adverse effects of psychological, educational, kinaesthetic, physical, neural and postural factors on the vocal set of the hearing-impaired child.	55
Figure 3.1	:	The negative cycle of speech perception and speech production.	83
Figure 3.2	:	Contrast between deviant production left uncorrected and deviant production that is corrected.	84
Figure 3.3	:	Stress analysis of the word “difficult” according to the system of van Uden.	86
Figure 3.4	:	The melody bow superimposed on the graphically represented stress accents.	87
Figure 3.5	:	Two separate spheres of responsibility: class teacher and communication pathologist.	96
Figure 3.6	:	The WLA emerges as a new system when the areas combine.	96
Figure 4.1	:	The aims and subaims of the study.	115
Figure 5.1	:	Identification and quantification of themes according to category of educator.	140
Figure 5.2	:	Overview	152

Figure 6.1	:	Diagram demonstrating how inadequate infrastructure initiates and perpetuates a negative cycle.	212
Figure 6.2	:	Diagram demonstrating how a change of infrastructure interrupts the negative cycle.	213
Figure 6.3	:	The proposed speech programme.	215
Figure 6.4	:	The graphic avenue utilised in the proposed programme.	223
Figure 6.5	:	Exploitation of the shape of the grapheme.	242
Figure 6.6	:	The use of a sock puppet to represent difference of labial pressure and timing between /b/ and /m/.	247
Figure 6.7	:	The use of a length of string and a knotted string to teach distinction between /s/ and /t/.	248
Figure 6.8	:	Orosensory, graphic and kinaesthetic avenues used in complementary conjunction with the paired phonemes /n/ and /l/	249
Figure 6.9	:	A variety of multisensory avenues employed for information /f/.	250
Figure 6.10	:	Non-speech activities to help learners gain control of organs of speech.	252
Figure 6.11	:	Dramatisation and bodily movements incorporated into Ling's (1976) subskills relating to intensity.	257
Figure 6.12	:	Example of the drill pattern for /ʒʊ/ modified from Ling (1976).	259
Figure 6.13	:	Intrinsic enjoyment of vocalisation in the development of nasal/oral differentiation for the nursery school pupil.	264
Figure 6.14	:	/ma/ and /ba/ differentiation using kinaesthetic and orthographic avenues for the primary school pupil.	265
Figure 6.15	:	Phonological development of /f/ for adolescents	266
Figure 6.16	:	Development of /k/ for adolescents	267
Figure 6.17	:	Cover of a speech booklet designed for teenage pupils.	268