UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

Denkleiers • Leading Minds • Dikgopolo tša Dihlalefi

MINI-DISSERTATION

SUBMITTED TO THE

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

BY

TABAZI SIDE NTSALUBA

STUDENT NO: 15239439

JURISPRUDENCE DEPARTMENT

RESEARCH TITLE:

#AFRIKAANSMUSTFALL, DECOLONIAL IMPULSES AND THE PERSISTENCE OF WESTERN IDEOLOGICAL POWER IN SOUTH AFRICAN LEGAL EDUCATION

SUBMITTED IN FULFILLMENT OF THE DEGREE:

LLM (Law and political justice)

30 OCTOBER 2022.

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

Denkleiers • Leading Minds • Dikgopolo tša Dihlalefi

I, **TABAZI SIDE NTSALUBA** (15239439) under the supervision of **DR SANELE SIBANDA** do

hereby declare the following for this Mini-Dissertation submitted to the University of Pretoria, for the degree (LLM):

1. I understand what plagiarism is and am aware of the University's policy in this regard.
2. I declare that this **MINI DISSERTATION** is my own original work. Where other people's work has been used (either from a printed source, Internet, or any other source), this has been properly acknowledged and referenced in accordance with departmental requirements.
3. I have not used work previously produced by another student or any other person to hand in as my own.
4. I have not allowed and will not allow anyone to copy my work with the intention of passing it off as his or her own work.

30 OCTOBER 2022

_____ _____

SIGNATURE DATE

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

Denkleiers • Leading Minds • Dikgopolo tša Dihlalefi

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS AND DEDICATION

I acknowledge and thank my extraordinary supervisor Dr Sanele Sibanda who is a Senior lecturer at the University of Pretoria, Jurisprudence department. Thank you for reigniting my passion for jurisprudence. I am grateful for the privilege of having you as a teacher.

I acknowledge and thank my family: Nandipha Ntsaluba, Kuselo Ntsaluba, Maria Micheal-Ntsaluba, Sula Ntsaluba, Simbongile Flatela, Nomlindo Petros and Madoda Petros. I acknowledge E Rinaldi, and Ms AR Chagopa, the Editor-in-Chief, of the Pretoria Student Law Review (PSLR), whose encouragement enabled me to persevere through challenging aspects of my masters.

Lastly, I'd like to dedicate this paper to my big brother, Sula Ntsaluba whose mentorship, leadership, sacrifices and support has greatly assisted me in my studies. I would like to acknowledge and thank you for all you have done to enable me to succeed. I dedicate this paper as a token of my gratitude and adoration for you.

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA
Denkleiers • Leading Minds • Dikgopolo tša Dihlalefi

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Abstract 6
2. Introduction - an evaluation of the #Afrikaansmustfall movement 7-15
3. Dissecting the various implications surrounding the institutional use of languages 16
   3.1 The implications surrounding the institutionalisation of Afrikaans 16-20
   3.2 The ideological underpinnings of language policies 20-23
   3.3 The implications of English remaining as the medium of Instruction 23-25
4. Ideology, the capitalist formation and the creation of a material existence 26-27
   4.1 Ideology sets out an imaginary conception and is utilised to shape Society 27-31
   4.2 Ideology creates the subject 31-32
   4.3 Ideology is within the subject 32-34
5. Apartheid ideology and the construction of the material existence of racial identities 35-36
   5.1 The apartheid racial project 36-41

5.2 Biko's looming presence in #Afrikaansmustfall 41-44

6. Western ideology, the racial contract and the construction of separate material existences for black and white bodies 45-46

6.1 The material impact of racial classifications that persist today 47-49

6.2 The racial contract as the ideological foundation of society 49-50

6.2.1 A discussion of what the racial contract entails 51-55

6.2.2 How does the racial contract manifest in #Afrikaansmustfall? 55-58

7. The colonial dynamic in terms of the role of languages 59-60

7.1 The internal effect of the ideology of the white world 60-63

7.2 The effects of the exploitation of black culture and the economic utility of white culture 64-67

7.3 Ideology and mastery of the white world 68-69

8. Shifting the paradigm –the Gramscian role of intellectuals 70

8.1 Utilising the role of intellectuals to foster an epistemic culture shift 71-73

8.2 Utilising a general jurisprudence in order to shift the culture of legal education 74-80

9. Conclusion - Towards the regaining of cultural control as a strategy to combat the prevalence of western ideology on African soil 81-83

10. Bibliography 84-88

1. Abstract

This paper evaluates the outcome of the #Afrikaansmustfall movement at the University of Pretoria, namely, that Afrikaans's 'fall resulted in its displacement by 'English as the medium of instruction. This study concerns the institutional use of languages and the various implications of the choices made on the back of #Afrikaansmustfall student protests across South Africa. Beyond language, the student-led movements and academic literacies were implicitly concerned with the issues relating to mastery of a 'way of being' required of students as they engage with higher education in historically white institutions. These issues, this paper argues, implicate the influence western ideology as a means of maintaining the dominance of western ways of being in the South African higher education space, with a particular focus on legal education. Arguing that Afrikaans was merely a symptom of a much larger issue, rather, as this paper argues, the relations of power premised on white supremacy, imperialism and later capitalism operate systematically and are sustained through ideology. I utilise the work of various theorists who provide a material analysis of ideology to demonstrate that the 'fall' of Afrikaans is not as transformative as might be imagined. Ideology is more than an imaginary, ideology effects material reality. Ideology is not outside the subject but rather it is within the subject, within their everyday consciousness and within their society. This article sets out an argument that ideology does not mirror society rather, it is active in the construction of the material existence of society, including the constitution of racial identities. Ideology has both an external and internal effect. Furthermore, Ideology plays a role in how we view ourselves and how we experience society.

Themes: Race, Ideology, Language, Legal education and Institutional culture.

2. Introduction - an evaluation of the #Afrikaansmustfall movement.

In 2016, students of the University of Pretoria (UP) took the initiative to protest against the use of Afrikaans as a medium of instruction with the movement labelled #Afrikaansmustfall.[1] The students demanded that Afrikaans be removed as a medium of instruction and that English remain as the only medium of instruction.[2] The expressed rationale for this was that Afrikaans as a medium of instruction limited the access to university for non-Afrikaans speaking people with the Afrikaans language being a barrier to entry.[3] Furthermore, culturally, it provided privileges for Afrikaans speaking people beyond the classroom and into shared spaces and residences.[4] It was highlighted that Afrikaans students (I add aside from English students) were the only students who could enjoy the privilege of being taught in their home language.[5] This was an indication that Afrikaans students were given preferential treatment and consequently this perpetuated their cultural supremacy on campus.[6] Furthermore, the use of Afrikaans as a medium of instruction illustrated the lack of transformation at UP.[7] The call to replace Afrikaans with English, it is noted here, is ironic because English is not an apolitical language and neither is its ubiquity.[8] By this I mean that

* Tabazi Ntsaluba LLM student at the University of Pretoria. E-mail u15239439@tuks.co.za
ORICD iD 0000-0002-7430-0108.

[1] Dube, B. (2017). Afrikaans must fall and English must rise-ironies and contradictions in protests by South African university students. *Africa Insight*, 47(2), pp.13-27. P13. This protest was inspired by the #Rhodesmustfall movement which prompted students in all major universities in South Africa such as the University of Stellenbosch (SU) and University of Cape Town (UCT) to protest.

[2] As above.

[3] As above.

[4] As above.

[5] As above.

[6] As above.

[7] As above.

[8] As above.

the global use of the English language is not an apolitical exercise.[9] It was part of the colonial project to make English a universal language.[10]

English was used as an instrument of domination and silencing of the colonised people.[11] Wherever colonial conquest is established the conqueror imposes his culture and language on the conquered.[12] Therefore, whilst one can understand the rejection of Afrikaans as it is a language strongly linked to apartheid oppression, one cannot lose sight of the fact that English cannot be separated from colonialism which Fanon described as a violent institution.[13] The violence Fanon refers to goes beyond physical violence and extends to epistemic and psychological violence.[14] Epistemic violence targets the overhaul of knowledge and language of the colonised.[15] Psychological violence relates to the adverse consequences of disempowerment that are experienced by the colonised people due to the harm done to their sense of self-worth and integrity.[16]

Ngugi asserts that on the African continent, the real power of the west came after the conquest that was achieved through physical violence.[17] Physical violence was followed by psychological violence.[18] The conquest was made permanent by the

[9] Ngugı˜, wa Thiongo. (1986). The Language of African Literature in Decolonising the Mind: *The Politics of Language in African Literature. London: James Currey* p11.
[10] As above.
[11] As above.
[12] As above.
[13] Dube, B. (n 1) 20.
[14] As above.
[15] As above.
[16] As above.
[17] Ngugı˜, wa Thiongo. (n 9) 9.
[18] As above.

construction of colonial schools and universities.[19] These institutions were used as a vehicle for power as they fostered the spiritual subjugation of the colonised people.[20] Physical violence was used to achieve physical subjugation whilst the colonial schools and universities were used to achieve spiritual subjugation.[21] As Ramose explains, South Africans have suffered more than physical colonial violence, but have suffered institutional violence and the dehumanisation of African people, leading to the disregard of indigenous perspectives and voices resulting in, I suggest, ideological violence.[22] By ideological violence, I am referring to the exclusionary or alienating violence that is induced or allowed to be experienced or manifest in society as a consequence of how the dominant paradigm has structured society, socially, politically and economically.

Although #Afrikaansmustfall was outwardly successful, Dube has correctly pointed out that English is neither an African language and was imposed on black people just like Afrikaans by acts of colonial and apartheid violence.[23] However, the framing of Afrikaans as the main issue that black students face with respect to higher education is to miss the point.[24] Firstly, it ignores or bypasses the larger systemic issues that perpetuate the privileges and disadvantages that are present in various institutions in South Africa, including institutions that provide legal education.[25] Secondly, it has done very little in alleviating the cultural alienation and marginalisation of indigenous cultures and languages in South Africa.[26] All it has done is remove the privileges that

[19] Ngugı˜, wa Thiongo. (n 9) 9.
[20] As above.
[21] As above.
[22] Mogobe R, an African perspective on justice and race p4.
[23] Dube, B. (n 1) 17.
[24] As above.
[25] As above.
[26]As above.

accompany the institutional use of Afrikaans.[27] Therefore, this paper argues that firstly, the abolishing of Afrikaans will not necessarily solve the issue of access to legal education for black students as there are other systemic barriers at play.[28] This is addressed in my discussion regarding the manifestations of the racial contract on UP campus which sparked the #Afrikaansmustfall movement.[29] Secondly, the fall of Afrikaans has not disrupted UP's and arguably by extension South Africa's, continued subscription to western ideology as the framework to imagine solutions to the problems it faces. The consequences of the persistence of western ideology in South Africa is dissected in my discussion regarding the material effects of ideology. The ideology that informed institutional practices which place white race and culture above the other racial groups is active within higher learning institutions which acted as a trigger for the #Afrikaansmustfall movement. Lastly, the institutional discard of Afrikaans does not change the fact that black South Africans succumb to cultural alienation as they must speak, read and write in English (consequently taking on its culture) in order to gain admittance to valuable institutions present in society such as those that provide legal education. The impact of cultural alienation experienced by black students is discussed in this document's discussion of the apartheid racial project and language component of the colonial dynamic.

For black people, I will seek to demonstrate here, English is both institutionally alienating for those who do not speak it but also culturally alienating, even for those

[27] Harris, Cheryl I.(1993) "Whiteness as Property." *Harvard Law Review 106, no.8* p1737.

[28] An example of a systemic barrier is that the underfunding of universities and inadequate financial aid is a barrier that hinders many students from disadvantaged backgrounds to enrol or even complete their studies. The removal of Afrikaans and retaining of English had done very little to dismantle larger systemic structures at play. Dube, B. (n 1) 17.

[29] Mills, C.W. (2014). *The Racial Contract. Cornell University Press* p81.

who do. By this I mean English functions as a barrier to entry to institutions and black students must assimilate to the culture of their institution by assuming the institutionalised culture. To speak a language is to assume its culture.[30] Similarly, when a language is institutionalised that institution assumes the language's culture.[31] In other words, Afrikaans was merely a symptom of a much larger issue, namely that the white supremacist, imperialist and capitalist relations of power have largely remained undisturbed.[32] By white supremacy, in accordance with Modiri, I refer to a system that is based on white dominance and black subordination rather than extreme right-wing racism.[33]

Beyond UP, the situation at Stellenbosch University (SU) illustrated the effects of the white supremacy on university campus. Following students' complaints surrounding the language policy at the university, a documentary named Luister was made where black students expressed their discontentment with the university based on their experiences in the university and the town itself.[34] The students discussed their reported experiences of difficulties comprehending the content as it was predominantly taught in Afrikaans.[35] Although some students may have been conversationally competent in Afrikaans, they were academically out of their depth not because of cognitive challenge but due to linguistic and cultural marginality and exclusion. The

[30] Fanon, F. (2008). Black skin, white masks. Grove press. p25.
[31] Fanon, F. (n 30) 25.
[32] Nelson Flores A Tale of Two Visions: Hegemonic Whiteness and Bilingual Education p14.
[33] Modiri JM. (2012) The Colour of Law, Power and Knowledge: Introducing Critical Race Theory in (Post-) apartheid South Africa, *South African Journal on Human Rights* p 406.
[34] Contraband Cape Town. (2015). Luister. Available online: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sF3rTBQTQk4 (Accessed 9 July 2022) (Luister documentary). Luister means listen in Afrikaans. I suspect the documentary was named this as these students had gone years without being heard and this documentary allowed them to have their voices heard and their stories told.
[35] Daniels, S. and Richards, R. (2017). Equitable multilingualism? The case of Stellenbosch University writing laboratory. *Stellenbosch Papers in Linguistics Plus, 53(1),* p67.

University administrations (the administration or administrations) reportedly showed very little sympathy for the position of these students. This is clear because the adopted means to assist these students such as an in-class translator, were not able to adequately address this issue.[36]

It was clear that no one had been listening to the students for a very long time.[37] The documentary made for painful watching and drove home a hard point about whose voices were heard and whose perspectives mattered on campus.[38] For real transformation to occur on university campuses, dissenting and othered voices and perspectives ought to be heard.[39] This fed into the #Feesmustfall movement which followed.[40] Boughey and McKenna illustrated that these student-led movements and academic literacies are concerned with the mastery of a 'way of being' required of students as they engage with higher education.[41] Furthermore, the focused attention on Afrikaans (and English) language deficits allows for the social differences and institutional culture matters to be dismissed since the issue is understood as merely a language competency problem inherent in the student.[42] One thing was clear in that documentary and that was the ideology which placed white race and culture above the other racial groups was active and continuously reinforced through various institutional practices. The ideology prevalent in the town and university shaped the experiences of the students depending on their race.

[36] See Luister documentary (n 34).
[37] As above.
[38] As above.
[39] As above.
[40] As above.
[41] As above.
[42] As above.

As the pressure to transform at SU increased, so did the need for a new strategy.[43] Le Cordeur argues that the transformation of a university has an impact on its language policy in that the language policy is closely intertwined with the institutional character of the university.[44] Of course it is, because, to speak a language is to assume its culture, this goes for institutions as well. South Africa's higher education institutions have a moral obligation to assist the creation of a better society by (I suggest) fostering a climate where indigenous perspectives, languages and cultures be elevated and take up space.[45] The right to education is a fundamental right of every citizen and the provision of quality tuition to a diverse group of students has been described as a matter of social justice.[46] A significant portion of students were academically unsuccessful; not due to a lack of intelligence, rather it was due to the fact that many students are unable to express themselves properly in the dominant language of the university.[47] Therefore, the students expressed a preference for English to be instituted as the medium of instruction.

This apparent victory of discarding Afrikaans can be read as being inconsequential in disturbing the larger systemic relations of power and will preserve the continued submission of black people to oppressive cultures in one form or another.[48] The white world, still holds superiority.[49] The white world is the symbol of success to which we

[43] Le Cordeur, M. (2017). The future prospects of Afrikaans as a university language in a multilingual setting: The case of Stellenbosch. *L1 Educational Studies in Language and Literature, 17(Special issue),* p12.
[44] Le Cordeur, M. (n 43) 12.
[45] As above.
[46] Le Cordeur, M. (n 43) 13.
[47] As above.
[48] Dube, B. (n 1) 17.
[49] Fanon, F. (n 30) 25.

must aspire. In the past, it was made explicitly clear that we would never enter this world as black people. However, the liberal project, provides hope however realistic with conditions prescribed (some overt, others covert) that we can achieve access to this world.[50] The west continuously attempts to shape us in their image, from our laws to our languages down to the self-perception, informing our everyday consciousness. English has become the language one must adopt to function optimally in South African society.[51] It is a foreign language that is not only an official language but materially functions as THE official language.[52] English is the language that unlocks opportunities and allows for individuals to exercise institutional self-efficacy. Therefore, like Afrikaans at UP, English institutionally functions as a barrier to entry into specific elements of South African society. To speak English allows one to assume its culture and demonstrate cultural adequacy, its mastery also allowing access to the possibility of economic adequacy.[53] English is a language attached to an ideology that perpetuates the cultural domination of South Africa by western society.[54]

Due to the position English holds in South Africa, black South Africans must adopt the language, take on the culture and are set in a perpetual state of striving for the white way and world in the hopes of bettering their socio-economic position.[55] Ngugi argues that without cultural control we as Africans will never be able to control our economic and political institutions.[56] Thus, I propose that we make use of the vital role

[50] Kapur R (2014) "In the Aftermath of Critique We are Not in Epistemic Free Fall: Human Rights, the Subaltern Subject and the Non-liberal Search for Freedom and Happiness" 25 *Law & Critique 25* p28.
[51] Ngugı˜, wa Thiongo. (n 9) 11.
[52] As above.
[53] Fanon, F. (n 30) 17.
[54] Cavanaugh JR. Language ideology revisited. *International Journal of the Sociology of Language*. p53. Languages can carry a language ideology.
[55] Fanon, F. (n 30) 17.
[56] Ngugı˜, wa Thiongo. (n 9) 93.

intellectuals play as set out by Gramsci as a strategy to gain cultural control through engineering an epistemic culture shift.[57] In doing so, we can start to disrupt the hegemony of western culture in South Africa.

[57] Gramsci, Antonio, 1891-1937 (1971). *Selections from the Prison Notebooks of Antonio Gramsci. New York :International Publishers,* p132.

3. Dissecting the various implications surrounding the institutional use of languages.

Protests such as #Afrikaansmustfall highlighted the conflicts that were present on campus regarding the cultural supremacy of Afrikaans in universities. The administrations showed little effort to understand the reasons for non-Afrikaans students discontentment with the cultural supremacy of Afrikaans, which only exacerbated the issue and led, to the #Afrikaansmustfall movement and the Luister documentary at SU.[58] The historical placement of Afrikaans as the designated language in accordance with the UP and SU language policies effectively made Afrikaans a barrier to entry to university for majority of South African students. Before I discuss the implications surrounding the institutional use of languages, I would like to discuss the constitutional provisions which set out guidelines for the institutional use of languages.

The Constitution section 6 (1) sets out the official languages as the following; Afrikaans, English, isiNdebele, isiXhosa, isiZulu, Sepedi, Sesotho, Setswana, siSwati, Tshivenda, and Xitsonga.[59] There are 11 in total. Section 6 (2) recognises the historical disregard of indigenous languages and places a duty on the state to take practical steps to elevate and advance these languages.[60] Section 6 (4) of the constitution stipulates that all official languages must have equal status and fair use.[61] Section 6

[58] This is actually my observation as a black female law student who was also having to navigate the same issues and the University of Pretoria. Regarding Stellenbosch see Luister documentary (n 34).
[59] The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996) s6.
[60] The Constitution (1996) (n 59) s6.
[61] As above.

(5) sets out that the National Language Board must promote and create conditions for the development of all official languages.[62] Section 29 (2) of the constitution allows South Africans the right to receive tuition in public educational institutions in the official language of their choice subject to the qualification that this is "reasonably practicable and fair".[63]

These provisions serve as the foundation for the institutional use of languages in South Africa. Although the constitution seeks to encourage the use of and celebrates indigenous languages, I am of the view that there is still a clear preference for English. The constitution's efforts to recognise indigenous languages has done little to disrupt the hegemony of English. To function effectively in South African society, one must learn English. Not only is it an official language, but it also practically serves as THE official language. The ability to speak English opens doors and enables people to practice institutional self-efficacy. By retaining English as the main language and subordinating other South African languages as secondary, we succumb to hegemonic whiteness in ways that will continue to marginalise African languages and by extension further the cultural alienation of African students. In this section I will discuss the implications surrounding the institutionalisation of the Afrikaans language, the ideological underpinnings of language policies and the implications of English remaining as the medium of instruction.

[62] The Constitution (1996) (n 59) s6.
[63] As above.

3.1 The implications surrounding the institutionalisation of Afrikaans

Aside from the Luister documentary mentioned in the introduction, the situation in Stellenbosch University (SU) resulted in students requesting transformation of the university as well as of the language policy.[64] A language policy and a university's institutional culture go hand in hand.[65] This is because to speak a language is to assume a culture - to assume a world. Like UP, Stellenbosch, as an institution, assumed the Afrikaans culture due to institutionalisation of the language. This privileged Afrikaans speaking students beyond classes and into shared spaces such as residence.[66] The Afrikaans culture was able to exercise cultural supremacy in this way.[67] During #Afrikaansmustfall the UP students challenged the standardised institutional preference for Afrikaans and moved for English to remain as the medium of instruction. The SU students also advocated for English instead of Afrikaans.[68] The rejection of Afrikaans is understandable because the institutionalisation of a language means that the institution takes on the culture of the language. Afrikaans was imposed during the policy of apartheid which was entrenched as the apartheid government came to power.[69] The ideology during the apartheid era was segregation and discrimination based on race.[70] The culture of the Afrikaans language is the Anglo Boer culture which is a culture that practiced the exploitation, dehumanisation and subjugation of black people.[71]

---

[64] Le Cordeur, M. (n 43) 12.
[65] As above.
[66] Dube (n 1) 13.
[67] As above.
[68] Le Cordeur, M. (n 43) 14.
[69] Dube (n 1) 20.
[70] As above.
[71] Biko, S. (1977). *I write what I like. Ufahamu*, p23.

In line with the apartheid ideology, the National Party launched a campaign to solidify apartheid policies when it came to power.[72] People were divided based on race under apartheid policies.[73] All of the nation's socioeconomic and cultural institutions were required to use Afrikaans as part of the apartheid policy.[74] Afrikaans came to represent Afrikaner nationalism and its racialised and tribalistic chauvinism (s).[75] Due to the fact that the majority of the National Party's representatives speaking Afrikaans, there is a strong symbolic and practical connection between apartheid and the language.[76] Through the state's arrogance and cruelty, Afrikaans came to represent oppression which was the apartheid regime's defining quality.[77] In black schools, Afrikaans was mandated as the medium of teaching, which sparked the Soweto uprising in 1976.[78] The hatred of the Afrikaans language can be understood as the indigenous people recognised it as the symbol of oppression and loss of dignity suffered under the apartheid government.[79] Afrikaans is associated with oppression and inequality.[80] Thus when the language policy of an institution, whether it be SU or UP, valorises and prioritises Afrikaans, that institution assumes the culture of exploitation, dehumanisation and subjugation of black people associated with that language's imposition under conditions of colonial-apartheid.

[72] Dube, B. (n 1) 22.
[73] As above.
[74] As above.
[75] As above
[76] As above.
[77] As above.
[78] As above.
[79] As above.
[80] As above.

Although I recognise the role of the Afrikanerdom in the oppression of black people, Afrikaans cannot take all the blame. Afrikaans is merely a symptom of a much larger issue. There has been a misidentification of Afrikaans and apartheid as the main sources of black people's troubles. However, the west as a whole, in both geography and ideology, has been incredibly destructive to black people. Throughout the diaspora we as black people have constantly had to view ourselves, cultures, languages and perspectives as secondary to those of white people. To be acknowledged in society, our perspectives, customs, cultures, and being must mimic the white world. This submission is what is encouraged by our society. Covert forces are deployed to perpetuate and reconfigure the terms of our constant subjugation. In the case of language, this subjugation is spiritual. There are other ideological means that are used to achieve this spiritual subjugation as well however, in this study, I limit this discussion to language.

3.2 The ideological underpinnings of language policies

The standardised institutionalisation of languages by universities is underpinned by an ideological framework.[81] This ideological framework contains the rationale behind the institutionalisation of languages.[82] By this I mean, that a particular ideology that sustains the aim of the language policy and consequently, how the languages and cultures are to be utilised. There are two ideologies I would like to discuss surrounding

[81] Nelson, F. (n 32) 17.
[82] As above.

the standardised institutionalisation of languages, one being race radicalism and the other being liberal multiculturalism.[83]

Over time, the policy discussion regarding the growth of bilingual or multilingual practices in institutions has moved away from the conversation surrounding the politico-ideological battle informing the institutional use of languages.[84] Consequently, we are left to misunderstand the implications and rationale behind the institutionalisation of a language and the larger political ideologies that language policies endorse. In the case of UP and #Afrikaansmustfall, English remained as the medium of instruction and English was preferred by black students. However, the question is whether there is sufficient cognition of the nature and aims of the ideologies animating the language policies that lead to the adoption of English as the solution.

I argue that the ideological framework surrounding the language policy of UP is liberal multiculturalism. Liberal multiculturalism in language policies echoes the constitutional vision that governs the country.[85] The constitution, which is the supreme law of the country (the law to which all other laws and policies must adhere to) endorses multiculturalism under liberal constitutionalism.[86] Thus, institutions such as UP enacting language policies that endorse multilingualism under the ideology of liberal multilingualism serve to foster the extant constitutional vision and enterprise.[87] In this study, I will not dissect the constitution's involvement in perpetuating the white

[83] Nelson F. (n 32) 17.
[84] As above.
[85] The constitution (1996) (n 59) s6.
[86] The constitution (1996) (n 59) preamble and s2.
[87] As above.

supremacist and cultural imperialist relations of power. I simply draw the connection between the ideology that informs the language policies in universities such as UP and the ideology that informs the country's constitutional vision. Liberal multiculturalism positioned multilingual education as part of an assimilation project into the dominant white supremacist and imperialist power relations.[88] Liberal multiculturalism creates an appearance of solidarity. It produces idealised antiracist subjects based on their antiracist feeling and pro-diversity preferences. This is despite the current social and material arrangements continuing to favour and benefit white people whilst disfavouring and burdening black people.[89] The postulated idea is that prejudice can be alleviated by the diversifying of perspectives, based on a social-psychological focus on individual level prejudice rather than on the unfounded and embedded structures of intended cultural, linguistic, academic and social marginality and hierarchy.[90] This approach does not address the ways in which schooling practices have been structured institutionally and systematically in ways that endorse and reinforce hegemonic whiteness.[91]

Race radicalism positions bilingual and multilingual education as being within a larger political struggle against white supremacist and cultural imperialist relations of power.[92] Through utilising the race radicalism framework we can start highlighting the political ideologies that inform the institutional use of languages. This assists insight not only into institutional language preference, but also into the cultural and

[88] Nelson F. (n 32) 14.
[89] As above.
[90] As above.
[91] As above.
[92] As above.

political implications of that preference.[93] I draw on Flores who reviewed the argument that the liberal multiculturalist institutionalisation of bilingual education has undermined race radicalism.[94] I argue that to focus the debate of #Afrikaansmustfall on whether we prefer to be taught in English or Afrikaans also undermines race radicalism.[95] This shift in focus ignores the continuing white supremacist, imperialist and capitalist relations of cultural, linguistic, academic and social power that western ideology sustains through the guise of maintaining an apolitical and non-racial society.[96] English cannot be separated from the violent institution of colonisation, conceptualised as deliberate cultural, linguistic and epistemic violation and denudation.[97] Therefore, under the liberal multiculturalist vision, UP is bound to a culture and paradigm that is not only foreign to the desired and sought character of our land. Historically, it is predicated on the subjugation of the indigenous people. Therefore, the institutional discard of Afrikaans is an inconsequential victory in the fight against the white supremacist and cultural imperialist relations of power. Axiomatically, this regime necessitates that black South African law students should still succumb to cultural alienation as they must speak, read and write in English (consequently taking on its culture).

[93] Nelson F. (n 32) 14.
[94] As above.
[95] As above.
[96] Nelson F. (n 32) 17.
[97] Dube, B. (n 1) 20.

3.3 The implications of English remaining as the medium of instruction.

#Rhodesmustfall reignited conversation surrounding decolonisation.[98] Students consigned Rhodes to history but were not able to remove the English language and culture associated with the empire he served.[99] The students see Rhodes and the English language as being divorced from one another. Yet these phenomena are two sides of the same coin.[100] The notion that English is a pure and benevolent language appears to be the foundation for the student's willingness to embrace it.[101] Nonetheless, as was already established, Afrikaans and English were both forced upon the African people through acts of violence.[102] When the English colonised South Africa, they forced English as the official language of government and the courts, and the era's language policies ignored all other languages, including indigenous languages.[103] Today, since English is still used as the primary language of teaching, black people must speak it and subscribe to a worldview and set of life-ways that harm indigenous identities, languages and cultures. I argue that this undermines section 6 (3), 6 (4) and 6 (5) of the constitution since I am of the view that the state has not adequately acted to increase the prevalence and respect of indigenous languages.[104] Indigenous languages effectively occupy an inferior status to English because South African society has not cultivated conditions for the development of all official languages.[105]

---

[98] Dube, B. (n 1) 19.
[99] Dube, B. (n 1) 19.
[100] As above.
[101] As above.
[102] As above.
[103] Dube, B. (n 1) 19.
[104] The constitution (1996) (n 59) s6.
[105] As above.

Dube notes Ngugi's argument that the coloniser's imposition of their language was destroying an integral part of the culture and identity of the colonised people.[106] This resulted in the creation of a man who mimics the coloniser's culture, viewing the world through the eyes of the coloniser, upholding his values, adopting his language and mannerisms as universal all whilst rejecting his own culture.[107] According to Dube, Gupta argues that, this mimicry and embrace of western ways of knowing hinders the growth and development capacity of the individual and the nation as a whole.[108] I agree with this point based on the fact that language carries with it a culture. Therefore, should a nation or individual be bound to a culture and paradigm that is not only foreign to them but is predicated on their subjugation, they both are limited in their ability to self-govern and adequately assert themselves – since they are bound to the will, ways, aspirations and political values of their conqueror.

The ideological influence of the west in South Africa has remained largely undisturbed. Western ideology has a systematic effect of alienating other ideologies and epistemologies that might be present in society. This is problematic because western ideology alienates the perspectives of the indigenous people, effectively becoming dominant in a continent in which it is foreign and has no legitimate stake. The positioning of English as the solution to the problems attached to the institutional use of Afrikaans demonstrates the pernicious influence of western ideology in South Africa. South Africa's continued subscription to the western paradigm colours how issues are

[106] Dube, B. (n 1) 20.
[107] As above.
[108] As above.

problematised and how solutions are presented, developed and applied. It also informs which ways of being and understanding are desired and ought to be utilised and which are undesirable and ought to be ignored, marginalised or discarded. Furthermore, the western lens informs the choice of solutions to the issues faced in South African society. Therefore, western ideology enables the maintenance of western ways of being in South Africa. By this I mean, that western ideology preserves the hegemony of western culture in South African society, and by extension, in South African universities.

The dominance of Afrikaans on university campuses is an expression of white culture. It a sign that white supremacist and cultural imperialist power relations have largely gone unchallenged. This is what sparked the #Afrikaansmustfall movement. These power dynamics are maintained through ideology and operate in a structured manner. I shall analyse the tangible impact that ideology has on South African society in the next part.

4. Ideology, the capitalist formation and the creation of a material existence

The previous section evaluated the implications of the institutional use of languages which culminated in the #Afrikaansmustfall movement. This section buttresses my earlier suggestion that the fall of Afrikaans has not disrupted South Africa's fidelity to western ideology as the basis to imagine solutions to its problems. As I have already stated, the Afrikaans 'problem' is a symptom of a much larger issue. That issue is that white supremacist and cultural imperialist relations of power have largely remained undisturbed, operate systematically and are sustained through ideology. It is on this basis that it becomes necessary to dissect ideology to illustrate the impact ideology has on a society. Huaco explains that ideology is a collection of ideas shared by a group of people and can be understood as a socio-cultural and group phenomenon.[109] People may be unaware of the ideology that guides how they live.[110] Ideology is utilised to shape a society.[111] The term ideology was first assigned as the theory of ideas.[112] Marx ascribed the meaning to ideology where ideology meant the system of ideas and representations that dominate the minds of humankind.[113] I understand ideology as the conceptualisation of what facts are important and what actions entities, groups and individuals are to take as acceptable, given the facts presented as important.[114] Ideology cannot be divorced from the way society is structured and creates and situates the subjects within the society.[115] Ideology cannot exist without

[109] Huaco, G.A. 1971. On ideology. Acta Sociologica, 14(4) p248.
[110] Huaco G.A. (n 109) 249.
[111] As above.
[112] As above.
[113] Althusser L,(1971) Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses (Notes towards an Investigation); *Lenin and Philosophy and Other Essays, Monthly Review Press* p31.
[114] Philosophy Tube (2017): What Was Liberalism? #1 Ideology & Violence https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VlLgvSduugI (Accessed 25 April 2021).
[115] Althusser L. (n 113) 31.

the subject who is positioned within a specific category and function.[116] Examining the structure of society and the function of ideology, Louis Althusser, placed ideology as a representation of the imaginative relationship individuals have with their material conditions of existence.[117] Althusser's thesis is that the individuals practicing the ideology (acting out the ideology) conceptualise themselves, their world and their place in that world (in relation to others) according to the imaginary of the ideology.[118] Ideology has an imaginative element in that ideology has a conceptual element.[119] Individuals create an imaginative transposition of their material existence in order to represent that material existence.[120] The work of Althusser illustrates that ideology is more than just an imaginary but that it has a material impact on our lives.[121] I will illustrate how Althusser's work manifests in South African society by highlighting the following three assertions. Firstly, ideology sets out an imaginary conception and is utilised to shape society. Secondly, ideology creates and recreates subjects through interpellation. Lastly, that ideology also exists within the subject.

4.1 Ideology sets out an imaginary conception and is utilised to shape society.

Althusser argues that it is not the subject's real conditions of existence (as in their real world) that subjects represent to themselves in ideology.[122] Rather it is their relationship to those conditions of existence that they represent and that represents to them in ideology. In other words, the imaginary representing the subject's material

[116] As above.
[117] Althusser L. (n 113) 31.
[118] As above.
[119] As above.
[120] As above.
[121] Althusser L. (n 113) 35.
[122] Althusser L. (n 113) 32.

reality incorporates the way this subject conceptualises their relationship to those conditions.[123] This means that an ideology provides us an imaginative reality but also prescribes the way we relate to this imaginative reality. This imaginative reality may be less the objective reality and more the imaginary enacted by that particular ideology.[124] This leaves room for imaginative distortion, misrepresentation and falsification. When examining the individuals who live under a dominant ideology, their imaginative distortion depends on their imaginative relationship to their conditions of existence.[125] Regarding a capitalist social formation which sets out the relations of production and class relations, ideology would be an imaginative relationship to those relations, that being the relations of production and class relations.[126] It is important to note here that the imaginary itself is already contextualising the frame of a material reality.[127] Put differently, within an imaginary prescribed by an ideology, the imaginary portrays the nature and dimensions of a material existence, since it takes into account an individual's relationship to conditions of existence. I will utilise Section 6 (4) of the constitution to demonstrate the imaginative distortion, misrepresentation or falsification in South Africa. I will utilise the ideological construct of whiteness to illustrate how an imaginary to some degree always defines, parametrises and projects material existence.

The constitution is the supreme law of South Africa, to which all other laws and policies should adhere and forms the country's basis for nation building. Section 6 (4) of the constitution stipulates that all official languages enjoy a parity of esteem and must be

[123] Althusser L. (n 113) 32.
[124] As above.
[125] Althusser L. (n 113) 34.
[126] Althusser L. (n 113) 32.
[127] As above.

treated equitably.[128] I interpret this to mean that the constitution requires that all official languages must enjoy equal status and fair use.[129] This constitutional imaginary regarding the equal status and fair use of languages best coheres, under ideal conditions of existence.[130] However, this imaginary is distorted, misrepresents or falsifies since the South African society does not exist under ideal conditions. Consequently, materially (in reality), the official languages do not occupy equal status nor are they equitably used. Arguably, it is undeniable that English and Afrikaans materially occupy a superior status through their hegemonic and common use and dominance in South African public institutions and life. This is illustrated by the complementary effects of institutionalising both these languages and their accompanying institutional privileges. The #Afrikaansmustfall movement, challenged the combined material reality of Afrikaans language and culture institutional preference and privilege over indigenous languages and cultures. Furthermore, the retention of English as a medium of instruction illustrated the preservation of English's hegemonic material existence in South African society which runs contrary to the imaginary prescribed by s6 (4). Thus, it is not South Africa's material reality that is represented in the constitution's ideological imaginary. It merely reflects the relationship South African society would have with its official languages under ideal conditions of existence. The fact of race in the origins of the prevailing hierarchy of languages in South Africa's material reality should also not be lost on us.

[128] The constitution (1996) (n 59) s6.
[129] As above.
[130] Ntsaluba TS,(2022) An exploration of justice: Ideal and Non ideal perspectives on the constitution. *Pretoria student law review journal* p2.

Ramose asserts that the professed superiority of the white race imposed on African societies has led to the alienation and side-lining of indigenous African cultures, perspectives.[131] Harris explains due to constituting an ideological construct premised on white supremacy, whiteness was designed and defined in ways to increased its value by reinforcing its difference and, thus by extension, its exclusivity from other races and marginalisation of those other races.[132] Therefore, whiteness as an ideological construct entailed the right to exclude.[133] The theoretical construct of whiteness' evolution was purposed for exclusion.[134] This exclusion extends beyond mere racial exclusion and reaches into the epistemic and cultural dimensions attached to racial constructs - including language. Section 9 (3) of the constitution prohibits unfair discrimination against anyone on the grounds of race, language and culture.[135] At UP, the institutionalisation of Afrikaans and its attendant privileges meant that students, without Afrikaans proficiency, were systematically, and inherently if indifferently excluded from enjoying these privileges on campus. Thus UP was unfairly discriminating against a significant portion of students who were not Afrikaans speaking, based on language and culture. Due to the fact that whiteness was constructed on this mistaken but useful premise of exclusivity and superiority, UP's expression of whiteness and platform for Afrikaans cultural supremacy indirectly instituting practices of exclusion based on race as well. This was a material manifestation of the exclusion and marginalisation entailed and endorsed in the ideological construct of whiteness. Therefore, materially, UP had an institutional

[131] Mogobe R. (n 22) 4.
[132] Harris, Cheryl I. (n 27) 1737.
[133] As above.
[134] As above.
[135] The constitution (1996) (n 59) s6.

culture of whiteness and was institutionally practicing systematic exclusion and marginalisation based on race, language and culture.

4.2 Ideology creates the subject.

Althusser asserts that ideology recruits subjects into ideology and it transforms the concrete individual into a conceptual subject.[136] Thereafter it recreates that conceptual subject which informs the subsequent concrete subject through interpellation.[137] All ideology interpellates subjects into concrete subjects by the designated category and functioning of the subject.[138] Thus it interpellates individuals as subjects and moreover, particular kinds of subjects.[139] This is constantly occurring; hence they (the individuals) are abstract in respect of the subjects they are in reality.[140] In other words, ideology creates particular kinds of subjects and thereafter recreates them through the process of interpellation.[141] These subjects in ideology experience a material reality as parametrised by the ideology.[142] This means that different kinds of subjects experience different material reality. Consequently, subjects would grow to view themselves and the society differently. I will utilise race to illustrate ideologies creation of subjects and its material effects.

---

[136] Althusser L. (n 113) 40.
[137] As above.
Ideology hails and stabilises our identity but it takes material shape as our actions and the subjects continuously reproduce and perpetuate the ideology.
[138] Althusser L. (n 113) 41.
[139] As above.
[140] Althusser L. (n 113) 42.
[141] As above.
[142] As above.

Race is not just a construct. Race is an ideology.[143] Race was constructed as the economic and social markedness of society's ideals for its subjects.[144] Race created black and white subjects and constructed their material existence. These subjects are recreated through interpellation. Similar to ideology in general, race constructs a society's attitude toward a language, a culture and a people. I argue that under the western paradigm, black people are viewed as inferior and sub-human.[145] Thus, African people, languages and cultures experience the consequent material existence in society because they are victims of the kind of subjects western ideology created and interpellated. Furthermore, race constructs a particular world view. Black people view and experience the world differently from white people.[146] This is because due to race, black people do not enjoy the same privileges in society as white South Africans do. The privilege of being taught in your home language at tertiary education level is an example of this.

4.3 Ideology is within the subject.

Althusser asserts that there is no ideology without the subject who is positioned within a specific category and function in ideology.[147] He further states that individuals are subjects who practice ideological recognition toward themselves and other subjects.[148] He also asserts that in respect of the rituals of ideological recognition what is seen as

[143] Fields, BJ. (1990) Slavery, race and ideology in the United States of America. *New Left Review. May 1;181*(1): p101.
[144] Flores N. (n 32) 15.
[145] reference
[146] Modiri, J 'Law's Poverty' (2015) 18(2) (03/31) *Potchefstroom Electronic Law Journal at 248*. p236.
[147] Althusser L. (n 113) 37.
[148] Althusser L. (n 113) 38.

truth is imposed on individuals.[149] If an individual subscribes to an ideology, the individual practices it through action, attitude and rituals on which the ideas they believe are based.[150] Therefore, what the individual believes, they will act out since one acts according to the function of their beliefs.[151] Therefore the existence of the individual's ideas is material as it has material effects seen through their material action.[152] Their actions form part of material practices governed by rituals set out by the material ideological apparatus that form the basis of the individual's ideas.[153] This individual, who is a subject in ideology, conducts actions which follow a system.[154] This has led Althusser to the conclusion that practices happen as a consequence of ideology and ideology exists through subjects and for subjects.[155] Ideology is not outside the subject but within the subject, within their everyday consciousness and within their society.[156] Ideology exists within the individual and society at large. Ideology constructs how the subject conceptualises their reality and their world. In other words, ideology also constructs a particular world view. I will utilise the use of languages to illustrate how ideology is active within an individual.

---

[149] Althusser L. (n 113) 38.
[150] Althusser L. (n 113) 35.
[151] As above.
[152] Althusser L. (n 113) 36. I would like to add that this goes for institutions as well.
[153] Althusser L. (n 113) 37.
[154] As above.
[155] As above.
I would like to add that for Althusser, the subject he discusses is an active conscious subject that chooses to believe and practice ideology. To him, the subject is not a passive recipient indoctrinated by ideology but rather the subject choses freely to engage in as in practice and accept ideology. I am not sure whether I agree here and this element will be analysed in a later essay. For now, I would just like to mention it in passing because I do not need to analyse this now to prove that ideology has material effects as we end up practicing the ideology we are subjected to –leaving aside whether the we do this consciously or unconsciously.
[156] Althusser L. (n 113) 39.

As previously stated, to speak a language is to take on a world and assume the culture – a way of being.[157] Language is more than a means of communication but carries with it a status, a culture, and symbolically, is attached to an ideology.[158] In other words, language serves as more than just a tool for communication; it also conveys information about status, culture, and, symbolically, ideologies.[159] Therefore, language carries with it a language ideology. Language ideology can be understood as the ideals attached to a language's origin, culture or use that mediate the reception of the language within the socioeconomic and political spheres that the language enters.[160] The black person who assumes the Afrikaans culture assumes a state of sub-humanity and inferiority in accordance with the language ideology of Afrikaans.[161]Therefore, to speak a language is not only to assume a culture but is also to subscribe to an ideology. When a language is institutionalised, the language ideology is institutionalised as well. Consequently, when black students speak, read and write in the institutionalised language as part of their legal education, not only must they assume the institutionalised culture, they must also subscribe to the institutionalised ideology. The speaking of a language and embodying of a culture is one way in which ideology exists within an individual.

In this section I have illustrated the active role of ideology in organising society and the existence of ideology within subjects. In the next section, I will demonstrate the external material effects of the apartheid ideology utilising the work of Biko. I will

[157] Fanon, F. (n 30) 25.
[158] Fanon, F. (n 30) 17.
[159] As above.
[160] Cavanaugh JR. (n 54) 53.
[161] Fanon makes a similar point in his discussion surrounding the French language and black French speakers. Fanon, F. (n 30) 17.

demonstrate the way the material effects of the apartheid ideology were sustained into the post-apartheid South Africa manifested at UP and led to the #Afrikaansmustfall movement.

5. Apartheid ideology and the construction of a material existence.

Now that I have explained the function of ideology and its role in the creation of the material existence of subjects, we can understand that ideology is active within society. The ideological influence of the west on the African continent is evident, notably in the ideological constructs surrounding ways of socially organising, ways of being and conceptualising oneself as well as other subjects.[162] South Africa has, since colonisation, continuously been reliant on western philosophy as a guide for nation building. Consequently, western ideological constructs have been able to exist and shape South African society. One of these constructs is race.

Due to the colonial and apartheid project, black people have been subjected to doctrines that are extremely damaging. Posel explains that to give legitimacy to the other more harmful forms of depicting racial difference, the stories about race tied to apartheid as a form of government were covered with a veneer of culturalist thinking.[163] Leading designers of the apartheid system of racial classification rejected the idea of race as a science and instead acknowledged it as a social construct having cultural, economic, and social implications.[164] From their perspective, race was a determination of "social standing" based on ingrained societal norms concerning difference.[165]

[162] Nelson F. (n 32) 16.
[163] Posel, D. (2001). What's in a name? Racial categorisations under apartheid and their afterlife p58.
[164] As above.
[165] As above.

Posel states that the biological myths about race that were produced were very effective in what Gilroy refers to as a "bioculturalist" mix, which closely correlated readings of physical difference with variations in class, way of life, and reputation (loosely included under the heading of "culture").[166] Race possessed biological and cultural markers, each of which served as both cause and effect of the character of the other.[167] The basis of apartheid's racial project was this hybrid conception of race, which also made it possible for the practice of racial distinction to have a pervasive and pernicious hold on daily life.[168] The political enterprise that followed was inextricably linked to the reasoning embedded in the apartheid ideology's conception of race and racial difference.[169] In this section, I will demonstrate the external effects of apartheid ideology utilising the work of Biko and illustrate how this manifests in the #Afrrikaansmustfall movement.

5.1 The apartheid racial project

Apartheid's racial project was underpinned by a need to create an orderly state that could tame the perceived dissolution and turbulence experienced in the 1940s.[170] Many in the white community were anxious that their civilised white cities would be overwhelmed by the black danger referred to as the die swart gevaar in Afrikaans.[171] At the core of die apartheid-gedagte (the apartheid idea) was an aspiration to order a

[166] Posel, D. (n 163) 58.
[167] As above.
[168] As above.
[169] As above.
[170] Posel, D. (n 163) 57.
[171] As above.

vigorous and thoroughgoing reassertion of racial difference.[172] The apartheid order was to ensure that every race knew and stayed in its proper place economically, politically and socially.[173] Race was to be the critical and material fact that was used to shape society.[174] Race was the fundamental organising principle for how resources and opportunities were to be allocated in society.[175] Race was the basis of spatial segregation planning and development.[176] Race served as the boundary for all social interaction and functioned as the main category for explaining and justifying the apartheid social and moral order was explained and justified.[177] In other words, the apartheid ideology took a fact such as skin colour (race), made it a material fact that they would utilise to decide how the regime would conduct itself and justified that code of conduct.

The apartheid regime predicated itself on what Biko referred to as white racism.[178] Biko, who lived during the apartheid era, wrote that the South African white community was homogenous and occupied an unearned position of privilege.[179] When their position in South African society was challenged, white society sought to justify their position and its power utilising the ideology of racial segregation and white supremacy.[180] Biko, in the collection of his written works titled, *I write what I like*, gave

[172] Posel, D. (n 163) 58.
[173] As above.
[174] As above.
[175] Posel, D. (n 163) 73.
[176] As above.
[177] As above.
[178] Biko, S. (n 71) 19.
[179] As above.
[180] As above.

his account of the material reality he experienced as a black person under the apartheid regime.[181] He wrote:

"*I have lived all my conscious life in the framework of institutionalised separate development. My friendships, my love, my education, my thinking and every other facet of my life have been carved and shaped within the context of separate development. In stages during my life I have managed to outgrow some of the things the system taught me*." [182]

In my view, Biko's writings sought to break through the ideological stronghold white society had so deliberately crafted to govern and dominate black groups, as defined in the Black Consciousness philosophy.[183] In the case of the African, he wrote that the exploitative Anglo Boer culture sought to frame blacks as the problem with society.[184] Biko asserted that the problem in South African society was white racism and the oppressive actions it endorsed towards black people due to the colour of their skin.[185]

A complex issue was created as a result of apartheid and the deliberate capitalist exploitation and enslavement of black people.[186] Africans are now perceived as lacking self-awareness and as being culturally ignorant.[187] Africans are now viewed as being under the authority of white society.[188] In order to divert attention from the general battle that the majority of black people are engaged in, white society's

[181] Biko, S. (n 71) 27.
[182] As above.
[183] Biko, S. (n 71) 23.
[184] As above.
[185] As above.
[186] As above.
[187] As above.
[188] Biko, S. (n 71) 20.

ideologies encourage black people to find fault with themselves.[189] As black people read white content, they internalise a *mea culpa* concerning society's problems.[190]

The imperialist mission of the coloniser went beyond physical and mental enslavement in an effort to demolish structures formed in African communities.[191] In order to uphold the coloniser's paradigm, the mission turned to distorting, recontextualising, and destroying the history, culture and customs of the enslaved people.[192] For example, it is common practice in indigenous South African cultures to rely on ancestors as a source of wisdom and guidance ironically like the west's reliance on Christian doctrine. Since South Africa is dominated by western ideology, the African child is raised in an environment that undervalues indigenous customs and practices. Is it any surprise that an African child who experiences this terrible image in school eventually hates his culture?[193] Biko was aware of the terrible roles that religion and education played in helping black people develop a false sense of self.[194] Therefore, rather than waiting to be understood by others, Biko argued that methods should be established to promote indigenous authority in order to address this.[195] Biko promoted black consciousness in an effort to show black people the importance of their own standards and viewpoints.[196] Black consciousness, according to Biko, is the realisation by black people that they must band together and work as a collective in order to break free

[189] Biko, S. (n 71) 30.
[190] As above.
[191] As above.
[192] As above.
[193] As above.
[194] As above.
[195] Biko, S. (n 71) 20.
[196] As above.

from the chains that bind them to a life of perpetual slavery due to the colour of their skin.[197]

I repeat, a complex issue was created because of colonial-apartheid. Biko claimed that we can comprehend this complex issue, as a situation of the haves versus the have-nots in which whites have been purposefully made haves and the blacks, the have-nots.[198] The extent to which black people are abused by white society leads one to draw the conclusion that the exploitation of black people is not an accident.[199] It was by deliberate design.[200] When examining the situation in South Africa, it is important to acknowledge that the main factor influencing political activity is the colour of a person's skin.[201] Biko argued that since black people did not possess the power to subjugate, their call for collective action could not be referred to as racism.[202] Black people would merely be responding to their material existence of being objects of white racism.[203]

5.2 Biko's looming presence in #Afrikaansmustfall

As previously stated, the issue was not merely Afrikaans but rather the white supremacy that plagues South African society - which dominates the consciousness of South Africans and through institutionalising languages (which carry with them a

[197] Biko, S. (n 71) 20.
[198] As above.
[199] As above.
[200] As above.
[201] As above.
[202] Biko, S. (n 71) 50.
[203] As above.

world that is oppressive and anti-black), results in a self-loathing black person that is perpetually subjugated by the society. Afrikaans and English are both not apolitical.[204] South Africans were able to embark on initiatives and mobilise to abolish apartheid during the liberation struggle, which was successful. South African university students were able to embark on initiatives to have Afrikaans removed as a medium of instruction at UP, which was successful. Although liberal constitutionalism and English are preferred, it is part of the problem. As Modiri states, the issue was not just the apartheid regime but a long duration of black subjugation, the displacement of black culture and white domination.[205] Therefore, the ideology deployed into a society, constructs how the society will be organised socially, linguistically, economically and culturally. Since race is an ideology, race positions black people to be subjugated by white society. Race constructs how the society will be organised socially, linguistically, economically and culturally. Furthermore, race constructs a particular conception of the world and oneself. This includes black people viewing themselves as inferior to white society and white people viewing themselves as superior.

What triggered the UP students' motion to have Afrikaans discarded as a medium of instruction was the fact that through the university's institutionalisation of the language and culture, privileges were provided for Afrikaans students that went beyond the classroom and extended to other areas on campus.[206] This meant that Afrikaans students had their cultures present in classrooms, residences and shared spaces.[207] This allowed for Afrikaans to exercise cultural supremacy on campus. The

[204] Dube, B. (n 1) 19.
[205] Modiri, J. (2018) Conquest and constitutionalism: first thoughts on an alternative jurisprudence, *South African Journal on Human Rights, 34:3* p303.
[206] Dube, B. (n 1) 13.
[207] As above.

consequences of this on black students who did not speak Afrikaans was that they effectively were excluded from the domains that Afrikaans dominated on campus. Thus this had the effect of fostering an institutional practice of separate development at UP. The black students that were proficient in Afrikaans and were able to enter and navigate Afrikaans spaces existed in a space were the culture was oppressive to their racial identity. Thus, Biko's claim about the complex issue of the have's vs the have nots in South African society was true on UP campus. Afrikaans students being the have's. Due to the institution's language policy and institutional practices, the black students were not afforded the privileges that the Afrikaans students were afforded. Thus, black students were designated as the have-nots. The Afrikaans language and culture was institutionally enforced and reinforced through institutional practices. It is not by accident that the Afrikaans students would be afforded these privileges. It was by deliberate design. The fact that a culture associated with oppression and hailing from a group that is a minority in South Africa could be afforded such institutional preference is evidence that the legacy of apartheid still permeates the post-apartheid South Africa. It showcases that South Africa is materially in a state of neo-apartheid.

Regarding English remaining as the medium of instruction, English has been able to move away from being understood as a language associated with the violent institution of colonisation. English, due to modernisation, has been recontexualised to be associated with success and upward mobility.[208] This is how the students, including the black students, viewed English. English was utilised as a tool for domination and is thus equally culturally alienating to black students. Yet it is still preferred as a

[208] Dube, B. (n 1) 22.

medium of instruction. The preference for English is explained by Dube using Bourdieu's thesis of linguistic habitus.[209] Habitus is described as the set of dispositions a person acquires through lived experiences in society.[210] An individual's perceptions of the world around them is informed by their culture, lived experiences, the history they are taught and what they resultantly deem to be of value.[211] All these factors play a part in how individuals view and use the languages in their society.[212] The linguistic habitus which links Afrikaans with apartheid oppression is the same one that allows for English to be viewed as a language of success and upward mobility.[213] This is due to English being viewed as the language that unlocks doors to the labour market.[214]

In this section, I have illustrated the external effects of ideology utilising Biko's work coupled with an analysis of the apartheid ideology's effects on South African society. In the next section, I will utilise the work of Lopez and Mills to demonstrate that ideology does not mirror society rather, it is active in the construction of the material existence of racial identities.

[209] Dube, B. (n 1) 22.
[210] As above.
[211] As above.
[212] As above.
[213] As above.
[214] As above.

6. Western ideology and the racial contracts construction of separate material existences for black and white bodies

Although the #Afrikaansmustfall movement makes it seem like the debate is mainly about the institutional use of languages, I argue that it actually touches on cultural, epistemic, and ideological issues as well. Having discussed ideology as well as the apartheid ideology's external effects on the material realities of black and white people in South Africa, this section sets out an argument that unlike a mirror which is passive, ideology is active in the construction of the material existence of racial identities. I utilise the work of Lopez and Mills to further my discussion of the material effect of the ideology of race on black and white people. I mainly utilise the idea of the racial contract as set out by Mills in order to demonstrate ideology's ability to construct different material realities for black and white bodies. However, before turning my attention to Lopez and Mills, it is useful for contextual purposes to commence with the review of the work of De Vos.

De Vos asserts that South African society is reliant on 'grand narratives' which colours how we as subjects in the society, view the society and the issues that plague society.[215] In South Africa, the conflicts about race and justice, the causes of injustice and solutions to injustices, which modes of being should predominate, and how we should make sense of it all - stem from an adherence to two different 'grand narratives'.[216] Some contend that South Africans should look forward to a liberal

[215] De Vos, P. (2012). The past is unpredictable: race, redress and remembrance in the South African Constitution, *South African Law Journal, 129(1)* p95.
[216] De Vos, P. (n 215) 96.

future, while others contend that understanding the present requires an examination of the past and the injustices that have gone unpunished.[217] The latter narrative is motivated by (quite valid) complaints about the ongoing racial injustice in South Africa and the memory of racial prejudice that endures to this day.[218] Racism and racial discrimination did not end in 1994.[219] The society upholds the white race's superiority. One simply needs to look at the proof of this which is the fact that there are significant amounts of riches in the white community as well as the evidence of how easily most white people appear to occupy their skin.[220] According to De Vos, we should steer clear of these narratives since they can never properly capture the character of each individual and only serve to keep us stuck in a cycle of dependence on them.[221] I can see De Vos's point of view, but I disagree that these narratives are maintained by our references to them. Rather, they are maintained by the way society is structured and functions, which in turn keeps the wheel turning. This wheel is the wheel of misery or fortune depending on how the individual is situated in the given societal structure. De Vos himself says that the past is unpredictable in that how you understand and experience the past changes based on whether you were white or black and how the society consequently positioned you socially, economically and politically.[222] This hasn't changed materially and I argue that this material existence is a consequence of the society's historical ideological underpinnings. These ideological underpinnings created racial classifications which had (and still have) a material impact on how an individual experiences society. In this section I will demonstrate the structural impact

[217] De Vos, P. (n 215) 96.
[218] As above.
[219] As above.
[220] De Vos, P. (n 215) 101.
[221] As above.
[222] De Vos, P. (n 215) 102.

of racial classifications and illuminate the compelling power of Mill's idea of the racial contract, which is showcased in the #Afrikaansmustfall movement.

6.1 The material impact of racial classifications that persist today

This sub-section details the legal construction of race in order to demonstrate the material impact of racial classifications which persist today. For this sub-section, I now turn to Lopez, who discusses the legal construction of race and the material impact of the creation of racial identities which were utilised for structural domination. Lopez asserts that 'black' and 'white' are identities that develop via social contracts, particularly legal ones, between groups of people who are not initially classified as belonging to a certain race.[223] Each race's tangible existence in society was directly generated by the function that law played in its creation and governance.[224] The distribution of wealth and poverty, for example, are a direct result of social and legal actors' behaviour that has accepted in accepting the concept of race and the resulting material social conditions serve to strengthening the concept of race.[225] Furthermore, the legal system historically shaped the physical geography of social life.[226] Numerous laws were made with the express intent of fostering and maintaining racial disparities in material endowments to enable structural dominance and subjugation in and through socioeconomic interactions within society.[227] Legal decision-makers did this by translating the concept of race into actual defences for the governance of different

[223] Lopez, I.H. (1997). White by law: The legal construction of race (Vol. 21). *NYU Press* p6.
[224] Lopez, I.H. (n 223) 7.
[225] Above.
[226] Lopez, I.H. (n 223) 9.
[227] As above.

races in society.[228] Therefore, it's crucial to realise that whiteness is a social and legal construct rather than a natural occurrence.[229] In order to comprehend a white supremacist state, one must realise that it is not merely a state that upholds white supremacy but also a state that emerged from white supremacy.[230]

Racial classifications are inextricably linked to socially pervasive material realities and are reified by the legal system.[231] Lopez invented the term "transparency phenomenon," which describes the propensity of white people to be unaware of their whiteness and, consequently, of the norms, experiences, and behaviours that are unique to the idea of being white.[232] According to Flagg, the only way to overcome this ignorance is for white people to deliberately cultivate a careful idea of racial consciousness that will lead to white people being cognizant of whiteness.[233] Thus, by including white individuals in the conversations that foster white racial self-awareness, the transparency phenomenon would be avoided.[234] Through this racial self-awareness, white people would realise how the black identity was perceived as a social pollutant while white identity was built as untouched and pure.[235] Furthermore, the construction of the white character was connected to positive traits such as being intelligent, virtuous, and industrious, the black character being constructed through negative traits such as criminality, laziness, and ignorance.[236] Even today, stereotypes still exist as a result of these creations and have effects on the lives of individuals,

[228] Lopez, I.H. (n 223) 9.
[229] Lopez, I.H. (n 223) 3.
[230] As above.
[231] As above.
[232] Lopez, I.H. (n 223) 11.
[233] As above.
[234] As above.
[235] As above.
[236] As above.

including their self-perception and perception by others.[237] Legal agents and mechanisms contribute to and support the legacy of these racial constructions.[238] The transparency phenomena still persists though, as these actors and systems are frequently seen as acting passively, with little awareness and control over their effects.[239] When Zack claims that white criminals are profiled as innocent, misguided people who are naturally trustworthy, redeemable, and valuable to society, compared to the way black people are frequently categorised as criminals, she examines how the black identity is constructed.[240] The black identity encompasses everything associated with it, and how the human behind that identity who lives according to western ideology, suffers the consequences. The SU situation that culminated in the Luister documentary is an illustration of how race still shapes how black students experience the town and university, even in the post-apartheid South Africa.

The dilemma that the black population of South Africa is experiencing is that, despite what appears to be a statutory denial or ignorance of the fact, the ideology that guides South African society creates lived material and social realities that accompany race.[241] According to Calvin, anti-blackness continuously reinvents itself in response to change, preventing emancipation.[242] Every method used to protect blackness from anti-blackness only serves to strengthen or reconfigure the anti-blackness.[243] The work of Lopez has illustrated that firstly race is a construct. Secondly, it has a material

---

[237] Lopez, I.H. (n 223) 13.
[238] As above.
[239] As above.
[240] McHugh, N.A. (2016). Naomi Zack, Applicative Justice: A Pragmatic Empirical Approach to Racial Injustice, Lanham, MD.: Rowman and Littlefield, 2016, ISBN 978-1-4422-6000-9. *Hypatia Reviews Online,* p3.
[241] As above.
As well as Modiri JM (n 33) 413.
[242] Warren, C.L. (2015). Black nihilism and the politics of hope. CR: *The New Centennial Review, 15(1),* p239.
[243] Warren, C.L (n 242) 239.

impact on people's lives. Lastly, it is transparent and operates in a covert manner. I now turn to the work of Mills who discusses the racial contract which serves as the ideological foundation upon which South African society (an elements of society such as law) was constructed.

6.2 The racial contract as the ideological framework that serves as the foundation of society

Now that I have discussed the legal construction of race and racial identities' material reality as set out by Lopez, I turn to Mills to illustrate the ideological conditioning that informs society and that underpins legal constructs. Mills, in his book, *The racial contract*, discusses the impact of the ideological conditioning used to enforce the racial contract.[244] He posits the concept of the racial contract to understand the world.[245] Furthermore, he explains that the racial contract underpins the social world.[246] By this I mean the racial contract serves as the foundation of the social contract.[247] Mills attempted to use a non-ideal approach to reconcile the philosophical presumptions of western democracies with the material existence of non-white communities.[248] He discusses the racial contract, which lays out a particular worldview.[249] Before an in-depth discussion of Mills's work I would like to explain briefly what the racial contract entails, its effects in society and how it manifests in the #Afrikaansmustfall movement. In short, it is an agreement underpinned by an ideological framework that sets out how

[244] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 81.
[245] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 31.
[246] As above.
[247] As above.
[248] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 16.
[249] As above.

society would be organised in accordance with white supremacy.[250] It manifests through the allocation of resources to privilege the white race, through an epistemology of ignorance provided to misinform society and through the way racial issues are regarded and addressed in general.[251] Its effects are that the racial contract ideology constructs an undesirable material reality for black persons and bodies because of being predicated on black subjugation.[252] What does it look like today? It operates covertly. However its presence is experienced concretely in society. The racial contract serves as the foundation of the social contract. The racial contract is continuously changing but maintains its ideological framework.[253] Although it operates covertly today (no longer explicit in text but juristically enshrined and immunised, in effective terms) its effects are still experienced in society.[254] I argue that firstly, the racial contract was evident in UP's institutional preference for Afrikaans and English as well as the hegemony of white culture. Secondly, it is evident in the university's administration not adequately addressing the systemic barriers that limit, black students access to legal education. Thirdly, the racial contract manifests at UP through the Eurocentric focus in the epistemology provided in legal education.

6.2.1 A discussion of what the racial contract entails

Mills' idea of the racial contract entails an ideological foundation that informs the racial organisation of society. Mills asserts that the racial contract's moral and egalitarian aspirations for whites were accompanied by the concept of the white groups' inherent

[250] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 31.
[251] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 51.
[252] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 18.
[253] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 72.
[254] As above.

superiority, goodness, and intelligence.[255] Black people are labelled as being unequal and without freedom.[256] An idealised consensus of norms is prescribed by the racial contract.[257] The racial contract allows for an agreement for one to view the world incorrectly.[258] White religious and secular epistemology guarantee not only that people will understand the world incorrectly, but they also guarantee that this incorrect interpretation will be endorsed by society.[259] For the world, an epistemology of ignorance is created.[260] Due to the inverted epistemology that the racial contract mandates, this conception is not accurate, and as a result, there is a generalised cognitive misunderstanding of the world.[261] Since the racial contract prescribes an epistemology of ignorance, white people are unable to comprehend the world they have created.[262]

Mills asserts that the status of superiority and inferiority is represented by race.[263] The constitution of South Africa has not made much progress in tearing down colonial institutions.[264] The modern world was intentionally designed as a white-dominated state.[265] The legacy of apartheid and colonisation still exists since the white minority still controls the economy and is the wealthiest group, while the black majority continues to live in poverty.[266] Since South African society is based on the racial

[255] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 16.
[256] As above.
[257] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 41.
[258] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 93.
[259] As above.
[260] As above.
[261] As above.
[262] As above.
[263] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 7.
[264] Modiri, J. (n 205) 303.
[265] As above.
[266] As above.

contract, white people occupy the top position in the social pyramid.[267] The distribution of societal privileges is determined by the racial contract.[268] A normative and descriptive model for the exploitation of the land and labour of black communities is provided by the racial contract.[269] Being white entails being a true person and escaping the ontological reduction to sub-human level.[270] Sub-persons are perceived as being less intelligent and inferior.[271] A crucial claim by Mills is that the racial contract created white people; they did not pre-exist.[272] As a result, a specific transformation of the human population goes hand in hand with the ideology that underpins the racial contract. The white race is a creation, and in the past, one could become white through utilising the law.[273]

Mills explains that materially, whites and blacks make up two separate nations. The systematic racial exploitation of the black nation constituting the white polity.[274] Race has a material impact.[275] The concept of race is connected to oppression, exploitation, and discrimination.[276] Racial identities have psychological and material relevance; they are a source of meaning.[277] The racial contract is more overtly material than the social contract since it accepts racial privilege as the norm.[278] Racial discrimination is viewed as a lamentable departure from the ideal in the mainstream political theory, to

[267] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 103.
[268] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 33.
[269] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 32.
[270] As above.
[271] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 63.
[272] As above.
[273] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 64.
[274] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 112.
[275] As above.
[276] Modiri, JM. (n 33) 413.
[277]As above.
[278] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 38.

the extent that it is addressed at all.[279] This approach renders racial concerns as contingent and unintentional, and thus excludes them from our comprehension.[280] These racial incidents represent the norm rather than regrettable deviations from the ideal.[281] The racial contract can also be seen in society's refusal to inquire about conditions of income, poverty, and opportunity under the assumption that formal legal equality will suffice to address the injustices built upon several hundred years of racial supremacy.[282]

Finally, Mills asserts that the social contract is supported by the racial contract that acts as a covert operator to limit and alter the parameters of the social contract. [283]The racial contract exists in a variety of forms and settings, and as it evolves through time, as does the social contract's force and the cognitive dissonance between the racial and social contract.[284] The white people's qualities, patterns of insight, and blindness are affected by this transformation. The racial contract is always being revised to produce various racial polities.[285] The racial contract is no longer constitutionally and legally institutionalised.[286] The racial contract was explicit during the time of de jure white supremacy, making it apparent that whites were the favoured race.[287] Cognitively, social transparency was a strength of this era.[288] White supremacy was explicitly stated in the main text.[289] Today, similar to Lopez's discussion of the

[279] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 38.
[280] As above.
[281] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 18.
[282] As above.
[283] As above.
[284] As above.
[285] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 64.
[286] As above.
[287] As above.
[288] As above.
[289] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 73.

transparency phenomenon, the racial contract is transparent and although it is not explicitly said, its presence is felt and continues to operate in society. The racial contract underpins the social contract. The social contract has expanded the term "person" to include people from all racial groups, not just white people.[290] However, the current era is marked by conflict between the continued material privilege enjoyed by white people and the official expansion of rights to include people of all racial groups.[291] Therefore, the racial contract is still evident and experienced as it underpins the social contract and influences how society is organised.

6.2.2 How does the racial contract manifest in #Afrikaansmustfall?

As indicated, firstly, I contend that the institutional preference for Afrikaans and English as well as the hegemony of white culture at UP and the allocation of resources to accommodate Afrikaans students was clear evidence of the racial contract. The university administration's failure to fully address the systemic barriers preventing black students from accessing legal education as well as the general displacement of black culture at UP are other examples of the racial contract in action. Lastly, the racial contract manifests in the epistemological basis of our legal education which largely reinforces western legal doctrines.

Through explicitly endorsing English and Afrikaans via the language policy and institutional practices, UP explicitly indicated its preference for English and Afrikaans

[290] Mills, C.W. (n 29) 73.
[291] As above.

language and cultures over indigenous languages and cultures. The institutional preference of the English and Afrikaans language and culture accompanied with privileges that extend beyond the classroom is in line with the privileging of white people informed by the racial contract. Beside the hegemony of white culture through institutional language policies, the racial contract manifests on campus through resource allocation practices. Afrikaans students benefitted from resources such as residences, lecturers, examiners and shared spaces that accommodated them. This was the status quo. The perks enjoyed by Afrikaans students were taken for granted until #Afrikaansmustfall questioned this.

Furthermore, the racial contract is evident in the systematic displacement of black culture at UP and how the administration has not adequately address the systemic barriers that limited access to legal education for black students. The administration seems to regard the anti-black systemic barriers as unfortunate deviations from the norm rather than being themselves the norm. These systemic barriers and the systematic dominance of white culture are not accidental occurrences. UP is a historically white institution and institutionally practices whiteness. Thus, the ideology that upon which UP was erected both implies and requires an intended exclusivity. Thus, #Afrikaansmustfall showcases the presence and effects of the racial contract in post-apartheid South Africa and UP. As long as the racial contract is operative, the positioning and situation of black people and their experience of university and more broadly society, will not change significantly.

Lastly, the standardised epistemology provided at UP as part of the legal education is also evidence of the racial contract through the provision of an inverted epistemology that allows one to misunderstand South African society. The UP law program's foundation of western law with an emphasis on legal positivism was the cause of the crisis in legal education according to Modiri.[292] Modiri explains that many law professors in South Africa approach their modules as if colonialism and apartheid never happened, as if new conceptions of politics, ethics, and law were not required by the new regime, and as if the modules they teach and the research they conduct is somehow immune to the demands of transformation and social justice.[293] Modiri draws on Williams, Kennedy and Cownie when explaining that due to law becoming more technical and depoliticised, traditional legal education not only perpetuates a bourgeois, western, and false conception of the law.[294] Furthermore, legal education reinforces the idea that "thinking like a lawyer" entails accepting the distinction between what falls within the domain of law and what does not.[295] Consequently, it requires the adoption of a legalist, formal, and impersonal sensibility as opposed to a conscience that is morally and politically engaged, according to Modiri's understanding of Harris & Shultz.[296] I argue that this epistemology and approach to legal education is evidence of the racial contract as it shifts the study of law (utilising cultural, epistemic, and ideological means) away from the violent nature of law.[297] In other words, the epistemology and approach to legal education moves us away from law encompassing discussions surrounding the broader relations of power and ideological battles at play within institutions which culminate in protests, such as

[292] Modiri J. (2014) The crises in legal education. *Acta Academica. Jan 1;46(3)* p3.
[293] Modiri, J. (n 292) 6.
[294] As above.
[295] As above.
[296] As above.
[297] As above.

#Afrikaansmustfall. The current approach to legal education moves us toward law encompassing technical rule-application structured around the legal rules and principles with focus placed on the economic productivity and functional usefulness of law graduates.[298]

[298] Modiri, J. (n 292) 6.

7. The colonial dynamic in terms of the role of languages

As I mentioned, one way ideology exists within a person is through language use and the assumption of a culture. #Afrikaansmustfall raised awareness of the concessions that black students make to successfully navigate academic institutions when engaging with legal education. #Afrikaansmustfall sparked conversations regarding the cultural alienation black students endure due to having to speak, read and write in the institutionalised languages. Language is not removed from politics and neither is it removed from conquest.[299] Language was utilised as a tool for domination.[300] Language is not an inconsequential aspect of society. Languages that dominate a society did not rise to prominence by accident. It was by deliberate action. Ngugi writes that whenever a people are conquered, the conqueror seeks to impose his language and culture.[301] The imposing of the conquerors ways of being sought to achieve the spiritual subjugation of conquered people.[302] Thus, when spoken by the conquered, the language of the conqueror becomes a language of slaves on the tongues of the slaves.[303] The need for physical subjugation decreases as covert methods of power and legitimation are deployed to attain and sustain dominance.

The various oppressive powers that have plagued South Africa have resulted in black people suffering from both economic and spiritual poverty.[304] The #Afrikaansmustfall

[299] Ngugı˜, wa Thiongo. (n 9) 11.
[300] As above.
[301] As above.
[302] Ngugı˜, wa Thiongo. (n 9) 11.
[303] Dube, B. (n 1) 21.
[304] Biko S (n 71) 28.

movement was motivated by the black South Africans' discontentment with their subjugation to oppressive institutionalised cultures. When used by black South Africans, the Afrikaans language which carries the Afrikaner culture, assumes qualities that oppress and degrade. Every time colonialism establishes itself with its dominating culture, it devours the native culture and leaves a distorted culture in its wake.[305] Only where the prevailing culture permits, is this distorted culture allowed to advance.[306] Since the African people imitate white society, the African culture is therefore referred to as a sub-culture - inferior to western culture.[307] Using the work of Fanon and Du Bois, this section seeks to illustrate the internal effects of western ideology on black people and showcases these effects motivation behind students viewing English as a solution to the issues raised in #Afrikaansmustfall.

7.1 The internal effect of ideology of the white world

Ideology can also be attached to elements such as languages.[308] Language is not just a means of communication but is a carrier of culture and history.[309] As previously explained, a language can carry an ideology.[310] That is, a language can carry the ideas of other ideological constructs with which it is associated.[311] As earlier suggested, language is not an inconsequential aspect of society. It is an integral socio-cultural element and also functions to perpetuate the colonial project.[312] I draw on Fanon who

[305] Biko S (n 71) 28.
[306] As above.
[307] As above.
[308] Cavanaugh JR. (n 54) 53.
[309] Ngugı˜, wa Thiongo. (n 9) 13.
[310] As above.
[311] As above.
[312] Fanon, F. (n 30) 17.

discusses language as an aspect of the colonial dynamic in his discussion regarding the French language.[313] Speaking French was more than a means to communicate and was a means of unlocking opportunities and access to the white world.[314] Black people who were well versed in French were viewed as "proper" both among whites and their fellow black people.

Both black and white people evaluate black people based on their capacity to master the white world.[315] Learning French well was an effort to master the white world.[316] As a sign of superiority, Fanon claimed that speaking French also indicated a continued cultural alienation brought on by society.[317] To appear human to the white world, black people embrace whiteness. He (the black man) wears the white mask because he is aware that he can never become white and truly possess humanity; instead, he can only mimic it.[318] The black man strives to master aspects of whiteness in order to be accepted into the white world because he longs for this position and respect.[319] He would prefer to be recognised as white rather than as black.[320] He is forced to accept that the white world would never recognise him as a human despite his attempts to become more "acceptable" by mastering aspects of whiteness such as the language.[321] His society not only reflects but also fosters a sense of worthlessness.[322] His reality and sense of himself are informed by the ideology of the white world. The

[313] Fanon, F. (n 30) 17.
[314] As above.
[315] As above.
[316] Fanon, F. (n 30) 18.
[317] As above.
[318] Fanon, F. (n 30) 36.
[319] As above.
[320] Fanon, F. (n 30) 50.
[321] Fanon, F. (n 30) 9.
[322] Fanon, F. (n 30) 13.

society does not mirror but creates an innate feeling of inferiority.[323] I assert that unlike a mirror which is passive, ideology is active within society and it creates and reinforces the social order. It is active within the individual who is a subject in ideology.

The ideology of the white world has been extremely damaging to black people's self-understanding and affects how black people carry themselves in society. For Fanon, the black man has two dimensions one with blacks and another with whites.[324] This sentiment is echoed in the work of Du Bois. Du Bois, who was an African American sociologist, historian and Pan Africanist , presented his account of the state of the "self" of African American's due to the way they are perceived and treated by white society.[325] The hostility and difference experienced by 'black folk' was so palpable that it was clear that 'black folk' and 'white folk' lived in two different worlds separated by a metaphorical veil and invoking two different consciousness'.[326] The 'black folk' form what Du Bois referred to as a double consciousness, a second sight that they utilise to navigate the white world.[327] The interaction between various constructs in American society gave rise to the creation of a double consciousness within African Americans as Du Bois saw it.[328]

According to Bruce, Du Bois used the term "double consciousness" to refer to three distinct difficulties, the first of which was the actual influence that white stereotypes

[323] Fanon, F. (n 30) 13.
[324] Fanon, F. (n 30) 17.
[325] Du Bois, W.E.B. and Marable, M. (2015). *Souls of black folk. Routledge.* P15.
[326] As above.
[327] Du Bois, W.E.B. and Marable, M. (n 325) 14.
[328] Du Bois, W.E.B. and Marable, M. (n 325) 16.

had on black life and thought.[329] Secondly, the dual consciousness brought on by the actual racism that African Americans experienced, which kept them outside of society's mainstream.[330] The dual awareness of being both an American and not an American is the last. In this context, the phrase "double consciousness" alludes to an internal struggle that divides an African American person's identity into two parts at odds with each other - that being "African" and "American."[331]

Due to their status as an "other" and "a problem," "black folk" developed a double consciousness where they feel like they "always look at oneself through the eyes of others," according to Meer's portrayal of Du Bois. Since African-Americans are shown as having a diminished cultural legacy or a minor contribution to American society, racial assumptions held by white America create an internal echo.[332] In other words, black people develop an internalization of society's racism toward them.[333]

7.2 The effects of the exploitation of black culture and the economic utility of white culture

Meer explains that Du Bois contends that self-recognition is a sort of cultural recognition.[334] After all cultural recognition requires perceiving one's cultural identity

[329] Bruce, D.D. (1992). WEB Du Bois and the idea of double consciousness. *American Literature, 64(2),* p301.
[330] Bruce, D.D (n 329) 301.
[331] Meer, N. (2019). WEB Du Bois, double consciousness and the 'spirit'of recognition. *The Sociological Review, 67(1),* p52.
[332] Meer, N. (n 331) 53.
[333] As above.
[334] As above.

in relation to the cultural identities of other members of one's society.[335] According to Fanon, the white culture exploits the black culture.[336] Consequently, the black man's inferiority complex stems from his perceived inferiority to the white world.[337] This condition is not innate in him; rather, it develops due to the anti-black environment in which he lives.[338] The social system is hostile to black people.[339] The black man is left in a society that does not recognise him as a human because it has been built up to respect and strive for what is white.[340] The white world makes constant attempts to erase him from existence.[341] To the extent that the white man forces whiteness upon him, he suffers for not being a white man.[342] The black man's worth is determined by how well he has blended in with white society.[343] He dreams of whitening himself as a means of salvation because he is unable to blacken society.[344] He makes an effort to enter the white sanctuary from within.[345] The white world's ideology is active within him as he speaks the language and absorbs the culture in his efforts to establish his cultural competency.[346]

---

[335] Meer (n 331) 53.
[336] Fanon, F. (n 30) 17.
[337] Fanon, F. (n 30) 14.
[338] Fanon, F. (n 30) 70.
[339] As above.
[340] Fanon, F. (n 30) 72.
[341] Fanon, F. (n 30) 37.
[342] Fanon, F. (n 30) 73.
[343] As above.
[344] As above.
[345] As above.
For him [the black man] there is only one way out, and it leads into the white world. Whence his constant preoccupation with attracting the attention of the white man, his concern with being powerful like the white man, his determined effort to acquire protective qualities - that is, the proportion of being or having that enters into the composition of an ego. ... [I]t is from within that the Negro will seek admittance to the white sanctuary. ... Ego-withdrawal as a successful defence mechanism is impossible for the Negro. He requires white approval.
[346] Fanon, F. (n 30) 73.

The imposition of English, a language foreign to the society it dominates, is a manifestation of the ideological hold the west has over South Africa. The society functions in a way to continuously endorse white supremacist ideals. The society is structured to embody, express and advance these ideals. Thus these ideals attain ideological merit since they are viewed as the norm whilst they reinforce the paradigmatic aim of sustaining white supremacy and cultural imperialism. English allows one to navigate modern society. Furthermore, English has prestige and is viewed as a language of success.[347] Different languages have been shown to be associated with particular concepts and ways of being because language carries a status or stigma.[348] Fanon illustrates this by showing that the French language carried a social approval that indigenous languages such as Creole did not.[349] This is reminiscent of how the black students regard the English language compared to indigenous languages which are regarded as secondary. English is a gate keeper to modern society. English allows black students to demonstrate their sophistication and exercise institutional self-efficiency. However, it comes at a cost for black students as we must alienate our cultures in order to exist efficiently and maximise our potential in society. If we do not, we run the risk of being relegated to the space of non-existence or worse, a state of sub-human existence. It is important to note that simply because we as black people speak English and assume its culture, as Fanon explained, doing this does not entail us assuming full humanity. Black identity relegates us to a perpetual state of sub-humanity.

[347] Dube, B. (n 1) 22.
[348] Fanon, F. (n 30) 17.
[349] As above.

South Africa is an anti-black, bifurcated, structurally racist and capitalist nation.[350] This is a consequence of colonial and apartheid action.[351] As I stated, South Africa's submission to western ideology colours our perceptions of society and is included in our everyday consciousness. This is due to the combined power of the ideological imaginary, ideological practices, ideological recognition and interpellation that recurs within western ideology and consequently South African society. Leaving aside (for now) discussions surrounding the law and the function of other superstructures and state apparatuses; when we limit the conversation to simply the whiteness that dominates South Africa through ideology, do we as black South Africans have to pay a sort of ideological tax in order to exist in society? Is the cultural alienation we must subject ourselves to (amongst other ideological conceptions we subject ourselves to) demonstrative of an ideological tax obligation? Colonisation set off an enterprise of white domination and black subjugation which was compounded on by the apartheid regime. These actions have a legacy that has been sustained into the liberal constitutional order as the majority of black South African's find themselves the objects of social exclusion, social denial, marginalisation and poverty.[352] Furthermore, they are taught to not view societal structures as the cause of these injustices but to internalise the concept that they are the problem with society.[353]

And so I ask what Du Bois referred to as the unasked question, how does it feel to be a problem?[354] Being a problem is never easy, even if one has never had the

[350] Fanon, F. (n 30) 68.
[351] As above.
[352] Madlingozi, T (2017); "Social Justice in a time of neo-apartheid constitutionalism: critiquing the anti-black economy of recognition, incorporation and distribution" *28 Stellenbosch LR.* p127.
[353] Madlingozi T (n 352) 128.
[354] Du Bois, W.E.B. and Marable, M. (n 325) 13.

experience of being anything else.[355] A black person has this moment in their lives when they realise they are different (other) from white people and as a result, are separated from the white world by a vast veil.[356] This is whiteness' exclusionary element at play. The revelation of this veil inspires various reactions amongst 'black folk', ranging from a longing for the white world coupled with self-loathing, to a distrust and hate of all that is white.[357] Ideology effects the lives and consciousness of black people clothing ideology with both external and internal effects. When an ideology dominates a society, it creates material effects within both the society and the individuals within the society. Thus ideology is active both within the society and the individual and for better or worse is active in the lived experience of subjects in society. By this I mean, ideology plays a role in how we view ourselves and how we experience society.

---

[355] As above.

[356] As above.

[357] Du Bois, W.E.B. and Marable, M. (n 325) 15.

The work of Du Bois serves to illustrate the impact of the exclusionary veil of whiteness on the African American, Du Bois wrote: "... the Negro is ... born with a veil, and gifted with a second-sight in this American world, – a world which yields to him no true self-consciousness, but only lets him see himself through the revelation of the other world. It is a peculiar sensation, this double-consciousness, this sense of always looking at one's self through the eyes of others, of measuring one's soul by the tape of a world that looks on in amused contempt and pity. One ever feels his twoness, – an American, a Negro; two souls, two thoughts, two unreconciled strivings; two warring ideals in one dark body, whose dogged strength alone keeps it from being torn asunder. The history of the American Negro is the history of this strife, – this longing to attain self-conscious manhood, to merge his double self into a better and truer self. In this merging he wishes neither of the older selves to be lost. He would not Africanise America, for America has too much to teach the world and Africa. He would not bleach his Negro soul in a flood of white Americanism, for he knows that Negro blood has a message for the world. He simply wishes to make it possible to be both a Negro and an American, without being cursed and spat upon by his fellows, without having the doors of Opportunity closed roughly in his face.

7.3 Ideology and mastery of the white world

The #Afrikaansmustfall outcome— which is that English persisted—has had no impact on destroying the underlying, systemic relations of power that support black people's cultural enslavement to white culture. This subordination in the case of language is spiritual. Thus, in order to participate in legal education, black students must speak, read, and write in English, adopt the culture, adhere to western ideologies, and suffer cultural alienation and spiritual servitude to white culture. Ideology is within us and is evident in black people's endeavour to seek admittance to the white sanctuary. To appear human to the white world, black people embrace whiteness. When we master English we seek to demonstrate our cultural adequacy and mastering English allows for the possibility of economic adequacy.

We have already indicated that English is not only a gateway to cultural adequacy but is necessary for economic adequacy. The hegemony of English in the major facets of South African society demonstrates the truth of this claim. Ideology is active within the society and for better or worse is active in the lived experience of subjects in society. By this I mean, ideology plays a role in how we view ourselves and how we experience and navigate society. Black South Africans have grown to view our cultures and languages as insignificant to our academic and professional progress. We must express whiteness to advance in society. Reminiscent of Du Bois's assertion, black South Africans have developed a double consciousness (a second sight) that we utilise to navigate prominent institutions in South African society such as UP. As we

navigate these institutions, we utilise this second sight to assume western culture and mimic humanity.

8. Shifting the paradigm –the Gramscian role of intellectuals

#Afrikaansmust fall highlighted that white supremacy was still operative in South Africa. Despite the fall of Afrikaans black students must still express whiteness in order to advance academically and professionally. This is due to the hegemony of the western culture in South Africa. Gramsci, who is best known for his work regarding cultural hegemony, sets out how within a capitalist structure, the ruling class (the bourgeoisie) makes use of cultural institutions to maintain power.[358] Cultural hegemony is utilised to achieve consent to the capitalist order.[359] Political control stems from cultural control.[360] Eyerman notes that though distinguishing between different forms of rule and domination (some direct and based on force; others indirect and based on hegemony), Gramsci used this notion of cultural hegemony to explain the hold the ruling class ideology has over the working class.[361] The injustices experienced are normalised –accepted as the norm.[362] For example, prior to the #Afrikaansmustfall movement questioning the institutional and resource privileges enjoyed by Afrikaans students, this state of affairs was accepted as the norm on UP campus.

Althusser asserts that Marx, in the Capital volumes argues that ideology is utilised to sustain the capitalist structure.[363] The capitalist formation must be able to produce and reproduce as it produces in order to sustain itself.[364] It is a living structure that

[358] Gramsci, A. (n 57) 659.
[359] As above.
[360] As above.
[361] Eyerman, R. (1981) False consciousness and ideology in Marxist theory, p46.
[362] Gramsci, A. (n 57) 660.
[363] Althusser L (n 113) 2.
[364] As above.

deploys forces within the superstructure, shortly explained, in order to sustain itself. Jones asserts that Marx argued the existence of a level of primary economic activity, which he named the 'base'.[365] Jones claims that Marx argued that the sum total of economic relations 'constitutes the economic structure of society, the real foundation (the base), upon which a legal and political superstructure is erected.[366] This superstructure can be linked to definite forms of social consciousness.[367] Therefore, the economic base is the most powerful and crucial level of social life since it is the base that determines the character of the superstructure.[368] For example, the exploitation of black labour was the economic 'base' of the apartheid regime.[369] This gave rise to separate laws erected to provide protection for white workers from competition from their native counterparts.[370] For the most part, these phenomena (the superstructure) reinforced white racism and were not autonomous of it.[371]

The superstructure determines all legal, educational, artistic and political activities which manifest in a given society.[372] Ideology is also part of the superstructure and cultural institutions are aspects through which ideology is deployed into society.[373] The wide range of cultural institutions which constitute what Gramsci refers to as 'civil society' are also superstructural.[374] Civil society includes political organizations, the church, the school system, sports, the media and the family.[375] Moreover, civil society

[365] Jones, S. (2006) "Antonio Gramsci." p29.
[366] As above.
[367] As above.
[368] As above.
[369] Biko, S. (n 70) 62.
[370] As above.
[371] Jones, S. (n 365) 32.
[372] As above.
[373] As above.
[374] As above,
[375] As above.

includes the legal apparatus.[376] As rule and domination increasingly becomes a matter of 'everyday life', so it becomes increasingly difficult to recognise that civil society has a connection with the operations of power.[377]

I argue that Gramsci took an epistemological focus when exploring the role and impact of cultural hegemony. This is due to his assertion that for cultural hegemony to be successful, control must be asserted over the following three dimensions.[378] Firstly, it is the intellectuals of the society; secondly, the education within the society; and lastly, the philosophy that informs the political action of individuals and groups.[379] I also take an epistemological focus when presenting a solution to the issues surrounding #Afrikaansmustfall. I focus on epistemology as I propose a turning away from the western paradigm as I argue for a paradigm shift utilising the role of intellectuals as set out by Gramsci as a strategy to gain cultural control. Whilst it may not be feasible to get indigenous languages ubiquitously institutionalised, we can utilise the role of intellectuals to disrupt the western ideology in legal education through cultivating an epistemic culture shift.

[376] Jones, S. (n 365) 33.
[377] As above.
[378] Gramsci, A. (n 57) 777.
[379] As above.

8.1 Utilising the role of intellectuals to foster an epistemic culture shift

We must start to incorporate epistemologies and practices that start to disrupt the ideological power of the west.[380] Through opening the door to these perspectives, we might start to understand their languages and cultures from a different lens from that of the west. We might be able to realise the potential of non-western perspectives to be active social forces for change so that we can explore the result of these ideas. According to Jones, Gramsci sees the function of intellectuals as the structuring and expression of the ethical, philosophical, ideological, and scientific ideals embodied in a hegemonic agenda.[381] The hegemonic process is given a sense of agency by intellectuals that may not be present in more impersonal things like books and institutions.[382] Gramsci sees intellectual life as a type of negotiation, much like how he views hegemony in general.[383] According to Gramsci, organic intellectuals must be "directive" as well as "specialised" because they should have more than just specialised knowledge; they should be able to take part in the struggle against

[380] Mann theorised power as being comprised of four organisations. The first is political power which is related to the political governance of a state and is attached to a specific sovereign territory. Pursuant to political power is economic power which relates to matters surrounding commerce and industry. Subsequently, there is military power which is related to physical forms of defence against military aggression purposed to influence social life. Lastly is ideological power which is linked to the ability to give meaning to social life and provide justification for the code of conduct. See Laursen PF. Ideological power in education. European Educational Research Journal. 2006 Sep;5(3-4). p278.
Also see Rossi, Enzo, Is There Such a Thing as Liberalism? (2013) p6.
Rossi asserts Lukes' account of ideological power begins by setting out three ideological dimensions of power as being;

1. Having the ability to make others cooperate in accordance with one's decisions;
2. Having the capacity to set the political agenda in such a way that one's chosen issues are effectively dealt with as social problems, whereas other issues are neglected;
3. Implementing methods in which one can secure consent or compliance by influencing the beliefs, preferences and desires of others.

[381] Jones, S. (n 365) 54.
[382] Jones, S. (n 365) 81.
[383] Gramsci, A. (n 57) 142.

bourgeois hegemony.[384] The organic intellectual must be able to translate their area of expertise into political knowledge in order to accomplish this. The organic intellectual must actively engage in everyday life as a "permanent persuader," a builder, and not just an orator.[385]

According to Gramsci, the traditional thinker is the antithesis of the organic intellectual.[386] The conventional intelligentsia are stereotypically characterised by their detachment, in contrast to organic intellectuals who might be thought of as someone engaged with the messy complexity of social life.[387] Traditional intelligentsia is more likely to oppose integration into an emerging hegemony because it has grown to mistakenly believe that it is above politics and everyday issues.[388] This intellectual elite considers itself to be classless, or independent of the socially dominant group.[389] Despite the crucial ideological and managerial tasks they carry out on behalf of organisations, traditional intellectuals still view themselves as detached from elements of society.[390] Jones explains that Gramsci saw education as a conversation between intellectuals and "the masses".[391] Therefore, both types of intellectuals need to develop their emotional intelligence and sense of community.[392] Only then would they be able to fulfil their role- to comprehend the desires of the populace, speak on their

[384] Gramsci, A. (n 57) 142.
[385] As above.
[386] Gramsci, A. (n 57) 141.
[387] As above.
[388] As above.
[389] Gramsci, A. (n 57) 547.
[390] As above.
[391] Jones, S. (n 365) 90.
[392] As above.

behalf to those in positions of power, and provide a more accurate theoretical view of the world to the populace.[393]

As stated, Gramsci mentioned that for cultural hegemony to be successful, control must be asserted over the intellectuals. Thus should the black proletariat take control of this dimension, I argue that it would have the effect of disrupting the hegemony of the dominant institutional culture at UP. South Africa is predominantly black and so if we overturn the prevalence of western schools of thought, we can utilise the role of intellectuals to assist students to understand the context of the society in which they exist. We need to start prioritising perspectives that put material realities ahead of the western imaginary. We must start to incorporate epistemologies and practices that start to disrupt the ideological power of the west. Through opening the door to these perspectives, we might start to understand their languages and cultures from a different lens from that of the west. We might be able to realise the potential of non-western perspectives to be active social forces for change so that we can explore what the result of these ideas would be. We must acknowledge that if the knowledge that was taught to us led us to where we are now, in order to exist in a reality that is without precedent, we would need to apply different knowledge.

[393] Jones, S. (n 365) 90.

8.2 Utilising a general jurisprudence in order to shift the culture of legal education

I echo the view that South Africa and South African universities haven't ideologically transformed significantly.[394] The outcome of the #Afrikaansmustfall movement was demonstrative of this. As it stands, in South Africa, putative solutions to the problem of injustice come from the western perspective and have resulted in the preservation of systemic injustices that adversely affect black South Africans.[395] UP has been able to maintain institutional practices and systemic barriers that disempower both indigenous voices and the indigenous people.[396] This is a consequence of the dominant ideology upon which the South African society is predicated. South Africans should be allowed to have the sovereignty to explore alternative perspectives and explore and discover the full liberatory potential of these perspectives. Why should the South African society be politically, socially and economically organised through the filter of western philosophy? Why should the west hold such privilege and significance on African soil? This, coupled with the analysis of the effects of the western paradigm unfold in South African society, create a heavy brew of discontentment amongst black South Africans.

Regarding UP, for real transformation to occur on campus, dissenting and othered voices and perspectives ought to be heard.[397] When an institution silences voices, it automatically silences the knowledge which would come from those marginalised voices and their perspectives. This problem is exacerbated by the prioritisation of

[394] Dube, B. (n 1) 17.
[395] De Vos, P. (n 215) 96.
[396] Mogobe, R (n 22) 4.
[397] See Luister documentary (n 34).

perspectives and voices that are foreign to the society they are deployed into, creating a tone deaf effect to their presence and application.

Regarding legal education, we can utilise the role of intellectuals to foster a culture shift through exploring a general rather than restricted approach to jurisprudence as postulated by Douzinous and Geary.[398] Douzinas and Geary argue that modern legal thought has moved away from a general jurisprudence (where legal education centered on philosophical considerations) and toward a restricted jurisprudence (where legal education centered on technical skills and disciplines).[399] I advocate for a general jurisprudence where legal education and university policies are perused for their omissions, repressions and distortions.[400] A general jurisprudence would allow for us to break the boundary between law and society and to evaluate legal education and university policies for their impact on society as well as subjects of society.[401]

The epistemology deployed to inform the subjects of society influences the way their material existence is consciously interpreted. Therefore, I argue that the western epistemology provided as part of legal education fosters an ignorance of South African society and captures the minds of the unsuspecting black masses[402] – encouraging a

[398] Douzinas C and Gearey A, From restricted to general jurisprudence (2005). P16.
[399] Modiri J. (n 292) 6.
[400] Douzinas C and Gearey A (n 398) 17.
[401] As above.
[402] Most law courses are organised around the current legal norms and principles, the cases in which they were decided, the laws or other sources from which they are drawn, and what, if any, exceptions may be relevant to them. These classes generally use the application of legal principles as an exercise. Rarely, when students are taught what the law or a legal principle should be, is the focus on a doctrinal critique of a court ruling or a procedural defect in a legislative scheme rather than on the more general normative, philosophical concerns of law as it should be. This is done to reaffirm and uphold the consistency, certainty, and predictability of the law and the rules of the judicial system.
Modiri J. (n 291) 6.

life of delusion inside and illusion. I not only argue for a general approach to jurisprudence but for an Afrocentric jurisprudence. To conclude my argument, I draw on Ngugi to justify why a paradigm shift to an Afrocentric jurisprudence is necessary. I draw on Ngugi to explain the strategic value of my suggestion that the intellectuals should be utilised to foster a culture shift.

The coloniser's values are emphasised inside the current educational system. African students are still being taught and encouraged in colonial institutions and universities to view the world through mainly a western prism. The predominant worldview of Africa, including its immediate surroundings, is, arguably, Eurocentric. The intellectual scholarship of Europe serves as the lens from which African students engage with legal education. Ngugi argues that without cultural control, it would not have been possible for the west to dominate the economy and politics of the African people. Thus, without cultural control we as Africans can never be able to control our economic and political institutions.

Ngugi wonders, what might the consequences of an Afrocentric education system be? What subjects would be covered, in what sequence, and from what perspective? What impact would such a legal education have on the current social, political, and economic landscape? Would it clash with neo-colonialism's political and economic goals? I wonder, what would the result of an Afrocentric jurisprudence at UP be? Would it disrupt the dominance of western ideology in South Africa? Would it enable black people to break free of the intellectual and cultural chains that have been wrapped

around them? Perhaps it can allow us to combat the whiteness that dominates our campus.

9. Conclusion - Towards the regaining of cultural control as a strategy to combat the prevalence of western ideology on African soil.

The result of #Afrikaansmustfall which was that English remained as the primary medium of instruction has resulted in English's hegemony within legal education. This demonstrates South Africa's continued submission to the west. South African society has submitted to western ideology, western language, western epistemology and western culture. Although on the surface the #Afrikaansmustfall movement appears to be a debate about language, in reality the conversation sparked by #Afrikaansmustfall goes beyond language and reaches into cultural, epistemic and ideological dimensions. Language is more than a means of communication but carries culture, knowledge and is attached to an ideology.[403] It is important to note that this statement is made in relation to the way that language functions in society, its significance to the society and its manner of interaction with ideological and epistemic aspects of society. When a language is institutionalised, the institution assumes the culture and ideology the language carries. This results in that culture and ideology being institutionally reinforced. As we utilise the role of intellectuals to engineer a culture shift, we might be able to disrupt the hegemony of the institutionalised cultures. Furthermore, through turning away from what Mills called the epistemology of ignorance prescribed by the racial contract, we might be able to incorporate an epistemology that adequately theorises the material reality of South African society and provides a more accurate theoretical view of the world to the South African populace. It is on this basis that I advocate for the strategic value of utilising intellectuals to reshape South African society.

[403] Cavanaugh JR. (n 54) 53.

There has been a long duration of the legacies of colonialisation and apartheid within SA.[404] By legacies I mean the systematic consequences of the results of apartheid and colonial enterprises. Dube reports Steyn's statement that when spoken by the conquered, the language of the conqueror is a language of slaves.[405] Dube interpreted this to imply that Africans would never be able to consider themselves free until Africans begin to utilise and develop their native languages.[406] I agree with Dube and would like to propose that as we utilise the role of intellectuals to educate students on the material reality of South African society, we can begin to create a culture shift (at the very least, the culture among intellectuals would shift). This is our home - our perspectives and cultures should be prioritised. Through opening the door to these perspectives, we open the door to the knowledge, the cultures and languages which these perspectives yield.

To conclude, Ngugi argues for the centrality of African culture in education on the premise that education is a means of knowledge about oneself and others.[407] Should the African perspective take centre stage, African cultures and perspectives will cease to exist as a supplement to other cultures and perspectives.[408] Ngugi argues that without cultural control we can never be able to control our economic and political institutions. He argues for linguistic decolonisation, which puts African languages at the centre, without which we will remain subjected to western authority.[409] I agree with

[404] Modiri J. (n 205) 303.
[405] Dube, B. (n 1) 21.
[406] As above.
[407] Ngugı˜, wa Thiongo. (n 9) 94.
[408] As above.
[409] As above.

this, I would like to put forth the argument that through prioritising the intellectuals that put the material reality of the African people ahead of the western imaginary, we would be able to bring these languages to the fore as they are part of the cultures which these perspectives come from. Furthermore, it would have the effect of disrupting the western ideology which dominates South Africa in general, and for purposes of this study legal education, in particular. My hope is that as these perspectives begin to take up space, so too will space be taken by the languages and the cultures the languages carry. This might enable African ideologies, languages and cultures to move away from the periphery and come into the centre stage.

10. Bibliography

Articles:

1. Althusser L. (2006) Ideology and ideological state apparatuses (notes towards an investigation). *The anthropology of the state: A reader.* Jan 24;9(1):86-98.
2. Augoustinos M. (1999) Ideology, false consciousness and psychology. *Theory & Psychology.* Jun;9(3):295-312.
3. Berlin I. (2017) Two concepts of liberty. *In the liberty reader* Jul 5 (pp. 33-57).
4. Bruce, D.D., (1992). WEB Du Bois and the idea of double consciousness. *American Literature,* 64(2).
5. Boxill, J. (2003). The moral significance of sport. *Teoksessa: Boxill, Jan (toim) Sports.*
6. Bucholtz, M., (2001). The whiteness of nerds: Superstandard English and racial markedness. *Journal of linguistic anthropology,* 11(1), pp.84-100.
7. Cavanaugh JR. (2020) Language ideology revisited. *International Journal of the Sociology of Language.* May 1;2020(263):51-7.
8. Daniels, S. and Richards, R. (2017). Equitable multilingualism? The case of Stellenbosch University writing laboratory. *Stellenbosch Papers in Linguistics Plus,* 53(1), pp.59-77.
9. De Vos P. (2012) The past is unpredictable: race, redress and remembrance in the South African Constitution. *South African Law Journal. Jan 1;129(1):*73-103.
10. Derrick A. Bell (1995), who's afraid of critical race theory? U*. Ill. L. Rev.* 893

11. Dube, B. (2017). Afrikaans must fall and English must rise-ironies and contradictions in protests by South African university students. *Africa Insight,* 47(2), pp.13-27.
12. Eyerman R. (1981) False consciousness and ideology in Marxist theory. *Acta Sociologica.* Jan;24(1-2):43-56.
13. Fields BJ. (1990) Slavery, race and ideology in the United States of America. *New Left Review.* May 1;181(1):95-118.
14. Flores N. (2016) A tale of two visions: Hegemonic whiteness and bilingual education. *Educational Policy.* Jan;30(1):13-38.
15. Harris CI. (1993) Whiteness as property. *Harvard law review.* Jun 1:1707-91.
16. Huaco, G.A. (1971). On ideology. *Acta Sociologica,* 14(4), pp.245-255.
17. Kapur, R. (2014) "In the Aftermath of Critique We are Not in Epistemic Free Fall: Human Rights, the Subaltern Subject and the Non-liberal Search for Freedom and Happiness" 25 *Law & Critique* 25.
18. Laursen, P.F. (2006). Ideological power in education. *European educational research journal,* 5(3-4), pp.276-284.
19. Le Cordeur M. (2017) The future prospects of Afrikaans as a university language in a multilingual setting: The case of Stellenbosch. *L1 Educational Studies in Language and Literature. Jan 1;17(Special issue):*1-21.
20. Lopez, I.H.(1997). White by law: The legal construction of race (Vol. 21). *NYU Press*.
21. Madlingozi, T. (2017) 'Social Justice in a time of neo-apartheid Constitutionalism: Critiquing the anti-black economy of recognition, incorporation and distribution' *1 Stellenbosch Law Review* 123-147.

22. Mbenenge, SM. (2018) ‘Transformative Constitutionalism: A judicial perspective from the Eastern Cape’ 32 *Speculum Juris 1*.
23. McHugh, N.A. (2016). Naomi Zack, Applicative Justice: A pragmatic empirical approach to racial injustice, Lanham, MD.: Rowman and Littlefield, 2016, ISBN 978-1-4422-6000-9. *Hypatia Reviews Online.*
24. Meer, N. (2019). WEB Du Bois, double consciousness and the ‘spirit’ of recognition. *The Sociological Review*, 67(1).
25. Miller, D. (1972) Ideology and the problem of false consciousness. *Political studies*. Dec;20(4):432-47.
26. Modiri J (2018) Conquest and constitutionalism: first thoughts on an alternative jurisprudence, *South African Journal on Human Rights*, 34:3
27. Modiri JM (2012) The Colour of Law, Power and Knowledge: Introducing Critical Race Theory in (Post-) apartheid South Africa, *South African Journal on Human Rights*
28. Modiri, J. (2014) The crises in legal education. *Acta Academica.* Jan 1;46(3)
29. Modiri, J. (2015) ‘ Law’s Poverty’ 2015 *Potchefstroom Electronic Law Journal,* Vol.18 No.2 p224-273.
30. Ntsaluba TS, (2022) An exploration of justice: Ideal and Non ideal perspectives on the constitution. Unpublished article, set for publication in *Pretoria student law review journal* (on file with the author).
31. Piller I.(2015) Language ideologies. *The international encyclopedia of language and social interaction.* Mar 11:1-0.
32. Posel, D. (2001). What's in a name? Racial categorisations under apartheid and their afterlife. *Transformation-Durban*:50-74.

33. Ramose, M. (2001). “An African perspective on justice and race.” https://them.polylog.org/3/frm-en.htm
34. Rossi, E. (2013) Is There Such a Thing as Liberalism? *SSRN Electronic Journal.* DOI:10.2139/ssrn.2378348.
35. Sibanda S, Mosaka TB. (2015) Bhe v Magistrate, Khayelitsha: a cultural conundrum, Fanonian alienation and an elusive constitutional oneness. *Acta Juridica.* Dec 1;2015(1):256-80.
36. Sibanda, S.(2011) ‘Not purpose-made! Transformative constitutionalism, post–independence constitutionalism and the Struggle to eradicate poverty’ 3 *Stellenbosch Law Review* 482.
37. Warren, C.L. (2015). Black nihilism and the politics of hope. CR: *The New Centennial Review,* 15(1), p239
38. Wilson, S. Dugard, J. & Clark, M. (2015) ‘Conflict Management in an Era of Urbanisation: 20 years of Housing Rights in the South African Constitutional Court’ 31(3) [Special Issue on Transformation and the Courts] *South African Journal on Human Rights* 472-503.

Books:

39. Biko, S. (1977). *I write what I like.* Ufahamu, 8(3), pp.62-67.
40. Douzinas, C and Gearey, A (2005) *Critical jurisprudence: The political philosophy of justice* : From restricted to general jurisprudence.
41. Du Bois, W.E.B. and Marable, M. (2015) *Souls of black folk.* Routledge.
42. Fanon, F. (2008) *Black skin, white masks.* Grove press.
43. Gramsci, Antonio, 1891-1937 (1971). *Selections from the Prison Notebooks of Antonio Gramsci.* New York : International Publishers.

44. Jones, S., (2006). *Routledge critical thinkers: Antonio Gramsci.* USA, and Canada: Routledge.
45. Mills, C.W., (2014). *The racial contract*. Cornell University Press.
46. More M (2011) *'Fanon and the land question in (post) apartheid South Africa' in Living Fanon* (Springer, 2011) 173
47. Ngungı˜, wa Thiongo. (1986) *The Language of African Literature in Decolonising the Mind*: *The Politics of Language in African Literature.* London: James Currey
48. Oyěwùmí, O. (1997) *The invention of women: Making an African sense of western gender discourses. U of Minnesota Press.*
49. Rawls, J. (1971). *A theory of justice.* Oxford: Oxford University Press

Legislation:

50. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996).

Websites:

51. Contraband Cape Town. (2015). Luister. Available online: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sF3rTBQTQk4 (Accessed 9 July 2022).
52. Philosophy Tube (2017): What Was Liberalism? #1 Ideology & Violence https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VlLgvSduugI (Accessed 25 April 2021)