

it did not necessarily explicate the rule of power necessary to succeed in the academy. What emerges very clearly is the way the implementation of this course continued to perpetuate, perhaps unintentionally, misunderstanding and flawed perceptions grounded in separatist ideas between African and Coloured students.

In essence, Anderson argues that, while UWC was reasonably successful in ideologically challenging the apartheid system, its efforts were not as successful in addressing the dynamics brought about by the changes in the composition of the student body and the underlying racial, cultural, and academic tensions. *Building a People's University in South Africa* presents a convincing argument that succinctly demonstrates the conflicts between ideology, theory, and practice. While students, activists, academics, and administrators viewed UWC's open admissions policy as a strategy to challenge apartheid and to create an inclusive, socially just university for the people, in practice, institutional policies failed to systematically address deeply seeded roots of segregation among diverse groups of black students on campus.

This book makes a significant contribution to the literature examining the continuing significance of race, identity, and culture in the landscape of higher education transformation. Since 1994, in particular, there has been a flurry of new legislation and initiatives both institutional and governmental implemented to redress inequities stemming from apartheid policies. There are few empirical studies that systematically investigate and document the impact of these efforts. Anderson's work offers an insightful analysis of the complexity of change in a context where institutions of higher education are still negotiating the nuances of the new social, political, and cultural order.

REITUMETSE OBAKENG MABOKELA

Michigan State University

The History of Education under Apartheid, 1948–1994: The Doors of Culture and Learning Shall Be Opened edited by Peter Kallaway. New York: Peter Lang Publishers, Inc., 2002. 399 pp. \$34.95 (paper). ISBN 0-8204-5754-X.

The distinguished social historian Charles van Onselen, in a personal conversation, made a pointed observation by asking me to “name one single-authored South African monograph in your field [education] that has achieved distinction.” I mumbled for a while and then conceded ignorance—and a bit of embarrassment, for educational research in South African is distinguished by two things: a mediocre journal publication base and a growing collection of edited volumes. Yet there is no immediate shame in the latter, because edited collections have the potential to bring together great authors under one conceptual or methodological umbrella and, in the South African context, to provide access and capacity building to young black men and women scholars who initially find it difficult to independently test their intellectual labor in peer-reviewed journals. But there are pitfalls in edited collections, to which I will return later.

Peter Kallaway's *The History of Education under Apartheid, 1948–1994* could be seen as his third major work in a trilogy of historical writings that cordon off apartheid education as its main subject matter. His highly valued *Apartheid and Education: The Education of Black South Africans* (Johannesburg: Raven, 1984) is an edited collection that—in the theoretical trajectory of the times—brought together several authors who trace the correspondence between apartheid schooling and the reproduction of capitalist relations in economy and society. He followed this up with a second edited volume, *Education after Apartheid* (Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press, 1997), which assessed educational change since the first democratic elections of 1994 and which brought into being the Government of National Unity headed by President Nelson Mandela. This third edited collection goes further back historically than the first contribution, to 1948, when the apartheid government of Prime Minister D. F. Malan first came to power, and traces various themes in the history of education to the eve of the 1994 elections. The goals set for the third volume are modest: “to restore a sense of history and a sense of the value of the multiplicity of traditions that makes up education in South Africa” (p. 28).

In about 400 pages, Peter Kallaway and his colleagues do exactly that: present (some of) the traditions that characterize history of education research and scholarship in South Africa. Originating in a multi-institutional project, the 19 chapter contributions are divided into four sections. Part 1 deals with continuities and changes in South African education after 1948, including an outstanding chapter on “State Formation and the Origins of Bantu Education” by Braam Fleisch. This section discusses origins, transitions, borrowings, and continuities in education and training over the past four decades. Part 2 discusses various sources and patterns of resistance and alternatives forged against the imposed will of apartheid's education ideologues. It contains a brilliant (and unusually honest) analysis of the model school built by the African National Congress in Tanzania during the years of exile. The authors, Sean Morrow, Brown Maaba, and Loyiso Pulumani, all of whom were actors within the Solomon Mahlangu Freedom College, discuss the limits of this model postapartheid school through observations that include the imposition of corporal punishment, the superficial commitment to linking education with production, and the patronizing attitudes of the exiles toward their Tanzanian hosts. Part 3 succeeds in incorporating biographical accounts of teachers and teacher activists working under and against apartheid education. Part 4 takes on critical themes that include “correctional” education for boys, the construction of school spaces (a rare subject of educational research), practices of initiation in rural South Africa, and the struggles over teacher professionalism (vs. unionism). There is no concluding chapter to this volume.

This book has much to commend it. First, it addresses a curious silence in postapartheid education writings with respect to the history of education. Most academic writings focus on education policy and very little on anything else. Second, it brings into the company of established authors a number of young scholars who, presumably, grew with the project and no doubt gained confidence in writing the history of education. This is crucial in a national context that systematically undermined the development of black scholarship. Third, it sustains a critical tradition in education writings that threatens to fade inside the academy as schol-

arship finds itself tilted precariously in the direction of a mindless servitude toward the social project of the postapartheid state.

However, there are also serious problems in an ambitious undertaking of this kind. This edited volume does little more than place in a glass cabinet interesting individual trophies without giving a sense of the value of the overall display. To be sure, the chapters by Braam Fleisch (origins), Crain Soudien (teacher identities), and Jenni Karlsson (physical spaces) are outstanding pieces of writing, but there is very little that connects them conceptually or methodologically within the edited collection. If there are underlying connections, these are not made explicit—and this is why the absence of a final editorial chapter is particularly puzzling. More seriously, the displays are quite uneven in size and quality, with some chapters being simple repetitions of what the authors had written elsewhere and others lacking depth and substance—especially the case reports on activist projects and the anecdotes on the lives of activist teachers.

Another weakness of this collection is its extraordinary English bias on apartheid education. The cast and the plot are familiar: the white Afrikaner did things to the black oppressed, but did not entirely have their own way, yet powerful legacies of Afrikaner nationalism remain. English observers look out on this scene with various pronouncements of indignation, only to absolve themselves from the horrendous story of apartheid education. This is disingenuous. Where are the critical historiographies of white English education during the apartheid period? In what ways did English education systematically participate in and benefit from the apartheid project? Why is it that most elite English schools remain overwhelmingly white (and English) almost a decade after the termination of legal apartheid? This one-sided Anglophile narrative on the history of apartheid education represents a long undisturbed and troublesome account on the part of the white English universities and their scholars.

In this regard, there is another weakness. Despite the claim to represent “the multiplicity of traditions,” this volume completely ignores liberal and conservative writings on the history of education. The authors are broadly associated with critical traditions (radical would be too generous) in South African education, and this reflects in their chapter contributions. It would truly represent an engaging and critical project to include in such a volume the contending perspectives on the history of education as seen from this side of the apartheid project.

There are other problems, including the failure to locate apartheid education systematically within the broader context of colonial and postcolonial education across the world. And then there is the failure to explain the fact that the vast majority of urban and rural teachers were not part of the heroic opposition against apartheid described so well in the individual stories collected for this book. This may explain, incidentally, why it remains so difficult to transform education after apartheid. Such deep explanation can only come from a more focused and inclusive history of education—and this is unlikely to emerge from another edited collection.

JONATHAN D. JANSEN

University of Pretoria, South Africa

Copyright of Comparative Education Review is the property of Comparative & International Educational Society and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.