

WINNING HEARTS AND MINDS: CHARACTER FORMATION IN MISSION EDUCATION WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO LOVEDALE MISSIONARY INSTITUTION

Graham Duncan

Department of Church History and Church Polity
University of Pretoria

Abstract

Character formation was the most pervasive subject in the curriculum of mission schools despite the fact that it was nowhere to be found on the timetable. It was a major tool in the Christianising/civilising process with a view to forming compliant Christians and destroying students' commitments to their traditional cultures. Lovedale Missionary Institution is studied as a major locus of the transformation of black students through its WHAM (winning hearts and minds) programme. This transformation affected their spiritual, social, cultural and educational development.

1 INTRODUCTION

In addition to the formal curriculum, there was present in the schools what today is called a 'hidden curriculum'. Missionary education was doing more than purvey knowledge or teaching skills. It was an important part of the missionary effort to effect a transfer of pupils from one universe to another ... Although initially, mission education was primarily concerned with communicating Christianity, the emphasis changed to its role as an agency in civilising the natives, this being regarded as the necessary preliminary to conversion. Because of the difficulty encountered in converting people from the traditional to the Christian universe, the missionaries were prepared to co-operate with the Government in carrying out policies which aimed at effecting large-scale change in the Xhosa belief and value system.

The size of the task and the shortage of missionaries led to the creation of native agency, i.e. native converts who could extend the work of conversion (Ashley 1980:35-36).

2 CHARACTER FORMATION UNDER PRINCIPAL WILLIAM GOVAN

William Govan, First Principal of Lovedale Institution established the values on which work at Lovedale would be built:

A third principle is *to place first the Native student's becoming a Christian*. Education and other things, however important, rank second ... The immediate thing is their personal salvation. Where there is Christian character, other things - education, fitness for responsibility, and civilisation - will follow; otherwise the Christianity is not genuine (Christian Express [CE], XX, 1 September 1891:139).

Here is the defining value - Christian character. It is Christianity which defines the nature of the character which is to be developed in students at Lovedale. Education, then, is a vehicle for and a by-product of the making of Christians. The salvation which is valued is of an individualistic nature and signals a break with the continuity of the corporate nature of African tradition and culture.

Thus, the formation of 'character' became a central feature in mission education from its inception. It was fundamental to the ethos of the hegemony which governed Lovedale. Once internalised, it became part of the essence of the person.

Govan stood as "a true exponent of the 'principle of conversion'" as "a missionary of the old school" (Brock 1974:111). The:

strong influence of Christian missionaries in education in Africa did not come about by accident. The important role that education could play in christianising Africa was thoroughly appreciated by mission leaders, and is reflected in the quotation ... 'where it is impossible for you to carry on both the immediate task of evangelisation and your educa-

tional work, neglect your churches in order to perfect your schools. Who owns the schools owns Africa' (Saayman 1991:29-30).

The link between school and church was, therefore, a potent one for:

Evangelism was inseparable from education. It was not merely that the school was the 'door to the church' (Etherington 1978:54). Schooling actually provided the model for conversion; conversion, the model for schooling. Each aimed at the systematic, moral reconstruction of the person in a world in which individuals were increasingly viewed as capable of being formed and reformed by social institutions (Comaroff & Comaroff 1991:233).

In fact, "teachers were expected to take an active part in church work as pastors, evangelists, preachers and Sunday school teachers" in order for the influence of Christianity to become all pervading. There was no space for neutrality in the exercise. Everything was subsumed under the one ideological purpose - to evangelise black people. Its influence was total:

The early English-speaking missions in South Africa, in formulating their teacher training programmes, were inheritors of the nineteenth century perception [i.e. "this education bore all the marks of being designed to establish the 'proper place' in society of those who received it"], added to which was the Protestant work ethic of hard work, obedience and duty (Hartshorne 1992:220).

Missionaries obviously stood at the border between traditional African culture and religion and European Christianity and all its trappings and the place they occupied was a determinant in the outcome of the interaction between the two:

The mission schools were seen as very efficient and strategic aids in this civilising process, and as Western civilisation was the Christian norm, little attention needed to be paid to African culture, including its educational dimension.

Mission schools were therefore generally viewed as beachheads of Christian civilisation in pagan territory which had to help in vanquishing pagan culture, not in propagating it (Saayman 1991:30).

This was not a one-way perception since local chiefs:

also suspected [that] the inherent consequence of missionary enterprise, if not restricted and controlled, was the subversion of the entire edifice of African society and culture [while] [t]he missionaries saw their task as the capture of souls, but in the process they proved a powerful solvent of indigenous political, social and economic systems (Keegan 1996:133).

It is interesting to note that Sir George Grey, Governor of the Cape in the 1850s, in promoting industrial education, did not aim at destroying the classical education offered at Lovedale because he recognised the need for a class of educated persons whose primary allegiance would be to their white benefactors rather than to their own people and also to educate blacks who would be accommodated to the economic needs of the white population. In this task, he foresaw a central role for the missionaries:

Grey's generous support of the missionaries was a recognition of how far-reaching their influence could be. Taking their educational task in its widest aspect, they had to help build up a whole system of new ideas, new needs and desires, new allegiances, new authorities, and a new morality, all leading to an *acceptance* of the new civilisation by the Africans. From the beginning the mission station was a school where Christian dogma and moral instruction went hand in hand. The convert was taught the importance of faith and obedience to the word of God, the indisputability of faith as being above reason. Thus his individual relationship to God set up a new authority in his mind. At the same time he learned new ideas of good and evil, reward and punishment and sin, ideas appropriate to the white man's civilisation ... The tribal morality that had hitherto ex-

exercised authority over him became immorality ... The new morality had a great deal to do with the undermining of tribal culture. But the particular aspect we stress here is the link between the new morality and the new money-economy (Majeke 1952:69).

This was linked to the process of character formation with the aim of alienating students from their traditional world view and life-style and making them 'modern' men and women fit to operate in a western-based economy. Whether or not Govan was fully in support of Grey's aims, he was drawn to the financial assistance that would be provided by Grey. Lovedale Institution, like all other such colleges, suffered continually from financial problems, particularly with regard to programmes of expansion. Grey was possibly viewed as a saviour in this regard.

3 CHARACTER FORMATION UNDER PRINCIPAL JAMES STEWART

Christian character is the end of missionary education ... We do not want to educate unless our work here produces both stability and resource in the individual, moral and mental, and a sense of responsibility to his fellow-countrymen ... Without this, we feel that our work is poor and barren (Lovedale Missionary Institution [LMI] Reports I, 1890:6-8; cf. Dr Roberts, Acting Principal in 1899 Report:2; the 1900 Report:2; and the 1902 Report:2).

But character was also the foundation of education at Lovedale. "Where there is Christian character, other things - education, fitness for responsibility, and civilisation - will follow; otherwise the Christianity is not genuine" (Andrew Smith,¹ LMI Reports I, 1891, Appendix: vi; cf. CE, XX, 254, September 1891:139). The formation of character among the students was a prime focus of James Stewart's time as Principal of Lovedale (De Kock 1992a:129): "we have entreated you throughout the year and we once more impress this upon you tonight that your great requisite is character, and not merely a little knowledge" (LMI Reports III, 1894:3). Either wittingly, or unwittingly, this formation was concerned with the internalisation of missionary he-

gemony agency in order that the person being prepared would learn to react and respond automatically at an externalised level on receiving instruction from a Christian missionary if only to please him/her. This exercise of liberal democracy caused missionaries to establish:

schools and religious-education programmes based on personal honesty, dedication to work, temperance and moderation, respect for civil authorities, self-control, and avoidance of vices and worldly pleasures. They established seminaries, institutes, or theological faculties where pastors, teachers, and administrators could be trained in accordance with liberal ideology. Finally, there was the task of interpreting the faith in symbols and categories that corresponded to the liberal project through translated literary works and original publications (Costas 1993:64).

Here was the essence of the programme of character formation employed at Lovedale.

Stewart (1906:362) patronisingly alludes to a difference between the perception and the reality with regard to blacks who had been exposed to mission education:

Taking the average native African as he is found over wide areas, a fair and unprejudiced judgment would admit that he possesses a larger amount of good sense, a firmer texture of mind, and more intellectual ability than he generally gets credit for.

This might account for the regulation relating to admission to Lovedale. One of the criteria for admission was based on “special enquiry ... on ... his [previous] character and moral training” (LMI Reports I, 1872-88:9). No misfits are envisaged for admission: “It is expected ... that the character and the spirit of those who are admitted into it to prepare for their future work in life, and of others connected with it in whatever capacity will be in harmony with the object of the Institution” (:9). The consequences of error were grave as can be seen in the:

Much mischief [which] has been done to the Institution by lads coming here destitute of good character. Their example has a bad influence on the younger pupils ... They never should have been here at all, and they would not be, did we know, before their entrance, what a slight experience shows (LMI Reports I, 1974:4 cf.:5-6).

Major Geddes, Boarding Master, had occasion to voice the same complaint. "Another thing, which I think lowers the standard of discipline, is our readiness to receive any and every body that comes" (Cory MS 9138, Geddes to Stewart, 2 November 1900). Someone, somewhere, had slipped up in following the investigative procedures prior to admission of those who interrupted the flow of coercive agency in perfecting fallen souls. In the year 1874, Stewart reported on the problems encountered in allowing students to leave the coercive confines of the Institution even for a short period. "It is our constant and invariable experience, that the pupils are deteriorated by a visit home, whether for longer holidays, or during a short recess" (LMI Reports I, 1874:6). Positive results are only to be found among those who have "became [sic] living Christians" (LMI Reports I, 1874:7). Yet, despite this potential for change through conversion, the black person does not achieve significantly despite the ability to comprehend "decision of character as well as any man on earth" (Crais 1992:126). This may have been due to the understanding white settlers had of blacks because they simply saw them as tools in the process of "imperial expansion and the development of a racial capitalism in South Africa which rested on massive state coercion" (Crais 1992:126). Also, Stewart's comments must be seen in the light that they provided an apologia for his methods, designed to counter white criticisms of his work. But all of this took place against a background of military conquest which was giving way to other means of coercion:

Less interested in the infliction of punishments, the state became preoccupied with institutions aimed at transforming the very inner character of the individual. Part of a much larger change in the way power was exercised punishment became progressively 'interiorised' (Crais 1992:127).

Having succeeded in the externalised subjugation of black people in the Eastern Cape by the late 1870s, this internalised coercion was further developed using the disciplinary institutions it had at its disposal, mainly mission education. Majeke (1952:137) exposes the worst effects of the internalisation of character formation:

The stress on religious and moral instruction, to which far more time is devoted in a school for the non-White than for the White child - is not by accident. For this religious and moral instruction is made synonymous with training in obedience, humility, patience, fear, and passivity. It bids the individual accept his lot, not struggle against it ...

The missionary institution intensifies the process on the growing youth. The mind of the young man or woman has to be moulded even more rigorously than that of the child. For the mind of youth wants to expand; it has hopes, ambitions, dreams, no matter what conditions of poverty it has lived in. And this is a quality that has to be controlled. Yet the very impressionability of the mind of youth can be turned by the educator to his purpose, making it easier for him to divert that energy along circumscribed channels. It is possible to indoctrinate the youth with the desired ideas, to insinuate into his mind all the habits of thought that will make him accept inferiority. To enlist obedience to a supernatural censor of all one's actions and all one's secret thoughts, is to reinforce obedience to authority in whatever form or shape it may subsequently appear. Thus locked in the narrow confines of the segregated missionary institution the youth has been steadily conditioned into accepting, unquestioningly, the place assigned to him in the social system. In most cases he has not even been aware of what was happening, but accepted his position as the natural order of things.

Despite the polemical approach employed by Majeke, her assessment of the process of internalisation of character formation is cogent (cf. Saayman 1990:31). It is confirmed in a more positive sense by Smit (1990:10 quoting Niebuhr 1941:51-53): "In internal history social

memory is our own past, living in every self. When we become members of such a community of selves we adopt its past as our own and thereby are changed in our present existence.” In other words, “we script our lives and characters by the stories which impact upon us” (Prest 2000:3 referring to Taylor 1999:11).

The English language was employed as one means whereby “the coercion of colonisation was transformed into the cultivation of civilisation” (De Kock 1992:41). Three times in the course of Lovedale Regulations (LMI Reports I, Introductory Regulations: 4, 9, 10) the use of English is confirmed as mandatory regulations - in examinations and in “Classrooms, Workshops, Dormitories, Dining Hall and elsewhere within the Boundaries”. The matter of English was also raised from time to time in connection with the debate on the use of classical languages:

But if one thing is clearer than another, it is that a taste for the study of English literature, and an acquaintance with its treasures, are the things best fitted to produce real culture in the minds of Native young men; and that English ought to be the basis of Native Education (LMI Reports I, 1886:6-7).

Referring to Tiyo Soga’s translation of *The pilgrim’s progres*, and to his influence among his own people, De Kock (1992:42) suggests that “‘Literature’ therefore had a clearly defined, but circumscribed, role in the colonisation of consciousness and the recreation of ‘form’.” This was not quite a voluntary process for black people as they were forced:

to make some concessions to the regulation of individuality premised on the conceptions of self handed down to them by missionary teachers, since such conceptions were embedded in the very fabric of ‘truth’ and ‘knowledge’ implicit in missionary teaching (De Kock 1992:42).

The success of this project is confirmed by Hunt Davis (1969:99 in De Kock 1992:47) where he claims the mission education acting as a

link between traditional Xhosa society and the western economy achieved 'deeper penetration'.

However, for Stewart, prior to exposure to western education:

The mind of the African is empty, and he had a great idea of what he calls 'getting knowledge'. Hence his anxiety about instruction merely, apart from mental discipline and habit ... there is the erroneous idea that manual work is servile toil, and mental work is supposed to elevate a man to a higher class (University of Cape town [UCT] Stewart Papers [P]BC106D 16:3-4, undated in De Kock 1992a:128).

This was in conflict with Stewart's basic presuppositions about education which were about more than book learning. So we may agree with Beinart & Bundy (1987:82) as they assert that "Lovedale must have conferred on its students more than the formal benefits of an education" as "they strove to achieve a broader 'civilising' influence" (Maylam 1986). Stewart was a captive to the Manichean allegory (JanMahomed 1985:63):

The dominant model of power- and interest relations in all colonial societies is the manichean opposition between the putative superiority of the European and the supposed inferiority of the native. This axis in turn provides the central feature of the colonialist cognitive framework and colonialist literary representation: the manichean allegory - a field of diverse yet interchangeable oppositions between white and black, good and evil, superiority and inferiority, civilisation and savagery, intelligence and emotion, rationality and sensuality, self and Other, subject and object ... The writer is easily seduced by colonial privileges and profits and forced by various ideological factors ... to conform to the prevailing racial and cultural preconceptions.

Interestingly, the missionaries themselves were subject to external coercive influences though they were also part of their originating context. Nonetheless, prior to the influence of character training,

blacks are perceived in terms of “idleness, vacuity, degradation (‘witchcraft’, marriage rites, circumcision rites etc) and then transformed into ‘low’ and ‘fallen’ states” (De Kock 1992:43).

Stewart’s, more (than Govan’s) ‘practical’, approach aimed at the development of ‘character’:

The formation of character, the development of it till it is consolidated and the man or woman is fitted by his or her training for the work of this life beyond where all depends on character is the *true object* ... And as character decides a man’s [sic] fate in the life to come it also decides a man’s real usefulness in this. We cannot set before us a simpler [sic] truer or better idea of our work than this, in so far as we secure this in those who come under our care we succeed (UCT SP BC 106 D4, undated:5-6 in De Kock 1992a:129-130).

The basis of this view of character is Stewart’s own historical and culturally hegemonic Protestant background with its emphasis on human worth and ‘usefulness’. With reference to one group of converts, Stewart commented that “[b]oth were pure Kaffirs, once ignorant, and troublesome, and *unprofitable to themselves and to others*, but very different men when they became Christians” (UCT SP BC 106 D3, undated:12 in De Kock 1992a:130 [De Kock’s emphasis]). The concept of practical ‘usefulness’ was considered by Rev John Buchanan (CE, VII, 82, 1 July 1877:5-6; cf. Keil 1999:9), a teacher at Lovedale:

They [missionaries] are telling us that our natives must now rise out of their idleness, and ignorance, and sloth, and fit themselves to cope with the white man, if not in learning, yet at least in skilled activity and practical usefulness, or, they must eventually and soon sink out of sight, their name as well as nation disappearing as a rotten thing.²

Allied to the perceived problem of idleness as sin and its solution through work:

so to Christianise a Kaffir is the shortest way, and the sur-est, to make him put his hand steadily and willingly to the work that is waiting to be done. This will make it both his interest and his duty to work, will enlist, besides his bodily appetites, his home affections, his mental powers, and his conscience, on the side of industrious habits (CE, VIII, 95, 1 August 1878:1-2).

Education is the glue which cements *Work and character* as the end of education:

Without these, neither an individual nor a race could make much progress ... Along with this effort to produce work both in quantity and quality, such as would pass reasonable inspection, there must also be *good character*. That is to say, a workman must be conscientious, honest, truthful, and diligent in his duty - no matter how humble his occupation may be. The value of the individual both to himself and to society is his character - and the most complete, compact and reliable form of that is the religious or Christian character (LMI Reports IV, 1904:1-2).

The source of character development is the atmosphere which inheres in the physical institution itself and was constituted by the "thought, ideas, feelings and emotions which form the prevalent mood of ourselves and others" (UCT SP BC106 D4, undated:1 in De Kock 1996:91). These qualities were, therefore, caught and not only taught. It was necessary that there be 'unity of aim' in order that this aim can be achieved.

Character was exemplified by being 'fitted' (*The experiment of native education* Stewart 1884:13 in De Kock 1996:93-94) for a viable occupation. In addition:

he has stored his mind with serviceable materials to such an extent that he is able to make vigorous use of the knowledge he possesses ...

his moral powers have become so developed and experienced, that he has both a high and delicate sense of duty, and when his conscience also gives its sanction to what his understanding approves (:14) ...

his will has been strengthened by discipline, the effect of which is such that he can act with decision; and bear the strain of difficulty and disappointment, and yet continue to hold on under this strain, in the belief that perseverance and fortitude will bring final success: and when Will and Conscience have been both so developed as that he recognises the importance of all action (:14-15) ...

We say a man is educated when in addition, his mind has been so awakened that he can look on all that is beautiful and orderly in nature ... and feel that his doing so adds to his pleasures (:15).

This testifies to the total transformation which character formation aims at. It negates all that has been held dear in traditional life with the assumption that blacks' minds were indeed 'empty' prior to missionary influence. Character formation was the locus of a clash of cultures. It seems strange that such high standards were set for those who were not destined to achieve equality with whites but who were to be taught their proper place in society. De Kock's (1996:95) work seems to confirm that "the educated African elite appears ... to have largely internalised the discursive regime of the missionaries" though he suggests that they were able to communicate in different ways with different groups without compromising their essential integrity in a situation of enforced ambiguous compromise yet showing signs of collusion, internalised or otherwise. A congratulatory letter written by a group of Lovedale students to Stewart signifies the degree to which mimicry is employed in formal communications. It includes references to the development of character and acceptance of this aspect of formation:

You have showed [sic] us the value of education - the value of a trained mind - in the struggle for life; that education did not merely consist in knowing certain facts, but in

qualifying the mind to perform the duties of life; you have taught us the great value of *time* [original emphasis] ... It has been your constant effort ... to show our people that all labour is necessary and noble ... we feel it our duty to acknowledge the influence of your teaching in this direction, for we think its value cannot be over-estimated ... You have done much to make us better understood ... - who were *expecting too much from a people just emerging from a state of barbarism*. We feel that in your influence there has been a protecting element ... You did a great deal to show us that there was much which *even in our present state* we could do for ourselves; and encouraged us to hope that if we embraced the opportunities for advancement offered in places such as Lovedale, *we might rise in the scale of civilisation* (UCT SP BC 106 C252, 2 May 1890 in De Kock 1996:97-99).

The degree to which Christian character formation, as a foil to barbarism, has been successful is evidenced in Molema (1920:220-221 in De Kock 1992a:135):

The missionary, then arrives among a perfectly barbarous people ... The master-aim of the missionary is to 'save souls, by persuading them to admit Christ into their lives, and to give up their sins by living a Christ-like life'. In short, his main duty is to preach the Gospel, and see that it sinks deep and it soaks into everyday life. To facilitate this his first step is to train the intellect to render it the more susceptible to the sublime truths he has to impart, and which, to a raw and void mind, such as a barbarian's must be, are of needs difficult of comprehension. Thus the missionary begins by teaching the alphabet and building on it ... The missionary, having imparted some spiritual truths to occupy the moral void, and intellectual truths the mental vacuity, next finds occupation for the hands: that is, he gives industrial training so far as he can manage, and in this way, by encouraging the development of habits of industry, promotes the formation of a sound character. In proportion as these ends are realised, so far is the barbarian

weaned from barbarism, so far is he taught self-control, so far is he Christianised, so far is he civilised.

We must constantly remind ourselves how few black people actually came under the direct influence of missionaries in proportion to the total population. Despite strong evidence for the total acceptance of the missionary world-view; adaptation to colonialism had its economic advantages (Cobley 1986:98 in De Kock 1996:101). It also appears that “few Africans, even among those educated by the missions, learnt to regard their ‘Africanness’ in a wholly negative light” (De Kock 1996:102) for there was a degree of resistance to total transformation in spite of the strenuous efforts of mission education.

4 CHARACTER FORMATION UNDER PRINCIPAL JAMES HENDERSON

It is the daily discipline of the classroom that the children are to be trained in the habits of order, attention, alertness, truthfulness and honesty which are so essential to the development of a noble character (CE, XXXVII, 436, 1 February 1907, *The qualities of a true teacher*, 20).

Character formation, crucially important though it was, did not occupy a separate identifiable place in the curriculum at Lovedale:

By combining solid education with a Christian religious foundation and sound character building, they were also carrying out ‘civilising work among the child races of the Empire’ in the only way that real civilisation could ever be successfully accomplished (Hargreaves in Walls 1982:164 in Christenson & Hutchison [ed.]; cf. Gerdener 1958:241).

This view is in line with Henderson’s view of “the importance of character as a necessary supplement to academic training which, in itself, he contended could not confer racial health or stability” (Oosthuizen 1970:42). It reflects the bias that ‘civilisation’ is a western concept which is incompatible with the African way of life which is still understood in terms of the ‘infant’ metaphor. That character development was defective, Henderson suggests:

but the regard for truth, which the moral teaching of the civilisation that you are embracing inculcates, and which is one of the primary obligations of that Christian religion which so many of you profess, I am obliged to say I have too frequently failed to find. Here there is a defect that is bringing shame upon your people (LMI Reports IV, 1907:2).

Perhaps this is related to the fact that traditional educational methods are described as “[i]gnorance [which] is the seed-bed of fear and superstition, while knowledge and enlightenment foster the qualities of mind and heart which lead to self-directing and self-supporting churches” (Gerdener 1958:241). The influence of character development was more pervasive and subtle. The internalisation of western Christian character was an exercise in indoctrination. In response to a challenge from Van Niekerk, a Dutchman of the Native Affairs Commission, who saw no point in educating blacks, Henderson (Cory Library for historical Research [Cory]MS 14431/3, SP’s Diary, 27 [November 1925?]) commented “we had to shape and form stable character as well as to instruct, and that work upon the inner being took time” because: “A great secret in the development of character is the art of prolonging the quieting power of right ideas, of perpetuating just and inspiring impressions” (Cory MS 14851/1, Henderson, sermon on Phil 5:8,9, sa). Because the development is an internalised matter, the role of the teacher is eventually limited. Part of the internalisation process involves the student:

It is not our words, not even our actions in themselves that make us good soldiers of Jesus Christ, it is character; and character is formed not by the single brilliant achievements which we carry through under the approving eyes of friends but by the daily and hourly petty inward conflicts which nearly all are fought out when we are alone and so far as men are concerned unaided ... the best and most effective ornaments, however, are the structures of admiration and respect which we erect in our minds from a knowledge of their lives [i.e. ‘great thinkers and workers’] and their deeds a knowledge of history builds up within our

minds (Cory MS 14854/12, Henderson, sermon on Hebrews 12:1-2, sa).

With regard to the influence of others, Henderson continued:

it is not possible for us to attach too much importance to the influence which we exert the one over the other ... Our lives lie alongside each other touching at more points than we realise, and while it is true that it is we ourselves that are forming our character, the mould in which we are shaped is our environment, the chief element in which is the characters which press against ours.

The 'Moulder' (Henderson's nickname, Mbumba) can rightly speak of moulding characters. The right ideas used to 'modify' character are determined by the teacher and are Christian. This was important work which had to be taken very seriously for "It is a truism that we see only as we are trained to see" (Cory MS 14854/5, Henderson sermon on Rich Man and the Kingdom of God, sa). It can be seen how important it was to have teachers who were committed to the Christian ethos of Lovedale. Character formation was part of the 'atmosphere' of the institution. The acceptance of pupils who were considered not to be able was justified because:

We believed ... the discipline of Lovedale, the moral atmosphere of Lovedale, and the influence of the daily contact with educated Europeans would have upon their lives, were all likely to help them in after life, and to strengthen them in making a stand against the temptations of their heathen surroundings (Cory MS 14851, The lack of success in the Upper Departments in relation to the proposed Native College, anon, sa).

This was related to the residential nature of institutions: The beneficial influence which residence here exerts upon the boys' characters' where they are "brought practically into the family life of the white man" through alienation from their traditional lifestyle leads to the situation where "the order and discipline of such a place as this, in time as we see it doing, certainly leaves its mark" (16 November

Winning hearts and minds: Character formation in mission ...

1895 in Ballantyne & Shepherd 1968:77). This was especially true of the temptations which students were exposed to. It was far easier to develop character in a residential context where outside influences could be minimised:

You are tried in every lesson that you are taught as to what you will aim at. We are tried in our reading, bright flashes of interest are sent across our mind by the Spirit suggesting to us in this science or that testing us as to what we are willing to grow into. We are tested in kindness, courtesy, politeness, tested in reverence, tested in faith, tested in steadfastness and obedience to God, and every test we pass means to us a step up in the life spiritual (Cory MS 14854/10, Henderson sermon on The Temptation of Christ, sa).

Residential education was part of Lovedale's historical succession and vision.

Time and space were also co-opted into Lovedale's economy of character building:

The essential element in Lovedale today is its history. It is this which gives a unity to all its manifold activities ... But what Lovedale really does, whether it teaches carpentry or Latin, is to put its students into a historical succession and to give them the sense of belonging to a distinguished company (Murray 1929:116-7).

There is a permanence that inheres in all that is done at Lovedale. Institutionalisation makes for a sense of being part of something larger than and beyond themselves, along with a sense of superiority. It is almost as if the academic subjects are incidental to the achievement of a higher purpose. Not only that, the physical environment is co-opted into the greater scheme of things as "Lovedale ... enlarged its pupils' sense of community in terms of time as well as space" (Roberts 1990:228). This is evident from its organisation of space and solid architecture. For instance, with regard to the library and refectory:

This [i.e. library] in itself carries the business of education beyond the day only, and brings it into touch with the past. The dining hall is reminiscent of an officers' mess in England or a college common room ... It has a tradition about it which ... has its value in that elusive process known as 'character-building' ... in Lovedale the sense of that history seemed to me to be woven into the life of the institution (Murray 1929:117).

With regard to the Institution library: "There is of course attention also given to books intended for the upbuilding of character" (Cory MS 14851, 1918/1, Henderson to Reid, 15 May 1919). This makes it clear how successfully Lovedale has become a total institution as it almost seems to possess a life of its own, independent of what goes on without its confines and what is done within. However, even the subjects in the curriculum are co-opted into the totality of the programme which affects the totality of the life of its residents: "the boarding school represents a new world – an association of people to whom the subjects of 'education' are not 'subjects' but life itself" (Murray 1929:232):

It is only when men's effective likes and effective dislikes are touched that the basis for character is laid ... In the African boarding school, therefore, those things which normally appear as school subjects are part of the make-up of the place and cannot be found outside. In a literary and debating society for instance, problems of a text-book become 'causes' to be defended or attacked ... A library also helps ... All this gives men something to think about and talk over in the dormitories and elsewhere, and so these subjects can become part of them, and, ... help to 'form their character' (Murray 1929:232-3).

But more than just preserving a historical heritage, Lovedale's concept of time also had a proleptic emphasis in terms of influencing future behaviour:

These arrangements, it is recognised, are open to the criticism that they provide too many meetings, too many

occasions of stimulus to produce a robust type of Christian who will stand firm in face of the dreary unhelped loneliness and the insidious temptations of heathenism, which will be the lot of not a few when they first go out of the Institution. There is force in the criticism, and our consciousness of it must always have effect upon our arrangements. The situation with which we are faced is that perhaps barely ten per cent of our entrants are able to help themselves spiritually by reading and study. A course of religious training and discipline is what they thus require, and it is to provide such that our arrangements aim at; and it will be noted that the variety of activities carried on serve not only to draw into service a large proportion of the Christians but also accustom them to the working or maintaining and controlling of organisations which they are expected to develop in their own districts on leaving for their life work (Cory MS 14851, 1916/2, LMI Report to the FMC on Evangelistic Work, 22 May 1916:4-5).

The Sunday routine Henderson inherited from Stewart was largely unchanged:

- Dawn: Prayer meeting held by the students themselves in connection with the work of the preachers going to the villages.
- 9am: Bible classes - attendance compulsory - divided according to church standing.
- 11am: Forenoon service - attendance compulsory - an overflow service is held for the younger boys.
- 2 pm: Vernacular service - Xosa, Sesuto, Zulu and Dutch, addressed usually by senior students according to a programme prepared at the beginning of each session, but including also addresses by senior members of staff.
- 4pm: The Bible Circles meet.
- 7.30pm: Evening Service - attendance compulsory. From this there is also an overflow service for the younger boys.

(Cory MS 14851, 1916/2, LMI Report to the Foreign Mission Committee [FMC] on Evangelistic Work, 22 May 1916:4)

In addition, there are daily prayers, morning and evening as well as weekly meetings of the Students' Christian Association.

The hegemony of timetabling can be noted from the amount of compulsory activities but, more important, is the long-term aim of enabling students to cope with the frustrations of life after leaving "the sheltered care of the Institution" as well as promoting such work in the future in the places where they are located. And this is accepted despite the awareness of the pressure placed on students' time and energies with responsibilities for academic study, manuals and leisure activities. The same situation was in force at Fort Hare where:

you will be amazed at their endless activity, for every hour of the day, in fact every minute is allocated to some useful occupation. Similarly, all teachers of the progressive sort should have a time-table for their activity ... Remember that half-hearted activity does not achieve much. It is willing and keenly enthusiastic action that counts in this world (Jabavu 1920:89-90).

Such is the concern to maintain the fruits of coercive agency in students' later life that it is lamented that "the same cannot be said of the *following* up of those *that leave annually* ... never to return. Lovedale possesses no machinery for keeping in touch with these despite the situation that "in nearly all Native communities throughout South Africa there is now some leaven of Christianity at work" (Cory MS 14851, 1916/2, LMI Report to the FMC on Evangelistic Work, 22 May 1916:6-7). The emphasis on evangelism as a prime aim of mission education becomes clear from this. The future must be assured while students are open to the influence of the missionaries.

And so, not a moment of time is spared for idle thoughts or actions. Time is also co-opted into the development of Lovedale's value system. While within the confines of the institution, virtually every waking moment is timetabled and provides the opportunity to advance char-

acter formation and the spirit imbued is internalised as it becomes 'part of them':

Has the value of time ... been sufficiently recognised? It is in the economy of time that the successful student and the serviceable worker differ as a rule from others. The other chief respect in which they differ is that their work is purposeful. I hardly need say that the teacher who is not day by day prepared to start off teaching the moment his pupils take their seats, and has not in each lesson a definite purpose for his class as a whole, and particularly for individual members of it, cannot hope to achieve success neither in imparting knowledge nor in upbuilding character. The pupil, who lies idle through part of the session, depending upon a spurt at the end, may by chance succeed in passing his examinations, but he himself is no success. He is not attaining self-control. The effort that carried him through was not self-directed (LMI Reports IV, 1907:1-2).

What is at issue here is not simply in the domain of the secular but includes the spiritual and moral because character or 'moral earnestness' (Anderson 1988:58):

resides not in things as such but in the mind that interprets them ... The difficulties that exist in human life are all at bottom spiritual difficulties, because they owe their existence to people ... Character building is the effect of all the agencies of education working together, rather than the effect of any one of them ... A man's character is built up by his association with other people in action and in thought, by facing moral issues in the atmosphere in which they can rightly be solved, and by learning good manners from those who have them (Murray 1929:211).

In making a plea for religious and moral education which are 'one and the same' (cf. CE, XXXVI, 437, 1 April 1906:122) to have an officially identifiable place in the curriculum, it was argued that:

A school is the only place where they have a chance of getting morally educated. If it is said that in mission schools religion and morals are everywhere and even in the very atmosphere of them, my reply is that what is supposed to be everywhere is sometimes nowhere, and that what is said to be in the atmosphere I want to be on the timetable too (CE, XXXVI, 426, 1 March 1906:6).

The moral education is, of course, Christian moral education and: “the fundamental difference between the most highly civilised, and the barbarous, races of today lies in the fact that the former are in large measure dominated by the impelling and restraining influence of Christian ethics” (CE, XXXVI, 429, 1 July 1906, Why religious teaching is indispensable in native education:159). The purpose of education is, therefore, to form the mind in such a way that it interprets things aright and crucial to this formation is atmosphere which includes associating with the right kind of people. This would include being open to the influence of teachers who “educate (that is bring out) [w]hat will be the opinions of the next generation”. This approach to education is formative of subsequent generations’ opinions and attitudes as the teacher “takes upon himself some responsibility for the capacity and character of the rising generation”. In this regard, Henderson was deeply impressed by the work he saw at Tuskegee Normal and Industrial Institute in the USA during a visit in 1923, whose staff possessed:

the idealism, the vision, the breadth of outlook and the practical skill that ... [assisted] the making of the best teachers. It was not in any disloyalty to our own workers at Lovedale that I allowed a desire to possess me to get across to South Africa one or more of these most energetic and pushful personalities. One or two of them would bring in some new standards and new ideas that would help our workers to make more effective use of themselves and their opportunities (Cory MS 14428/2, Henderson to family, 17 April 1923).

The training of teachers is fertile ground for the implantation of morality as they will pass on the values they have learned to future genera-

tions. However, this morality is also contextual and had to take account of the racial situation in South Africa, encapsulated in the thorny 'Native Question'. Lovedale took the view that it had a duty to deal with this issue in some way:

In the whole course of our wide educational curriculum no place is found for such definite teaching as should fit our boys and girls to face and solve intelligently and wisely and righteously the problem as it is likely to confront them when they step into the front ranks. Each new phase must be met with reason and understanding and sympathy if we are to steer clear of a disastrous inter-racial struggle ... If there is to be in this great ... land the happy, contented, prosperous and united people God intends there should be, both races must learn the hard lesson of approaching the racial question from the point of *duty* rather than that of *rights*. That is a lesson every South African without exception should begin to learn while still at school (CE, L, 694, 1 May 1920, A Lack in South African Education:69-70).

Mission education, while admitting its defects in terms of provision of means by which the racial question could be addressed, certainly promoted the vision of a South Africa where there would be harmony, if not integration, between the races. This was supported by the report of the Commission on Native Education where "the aim of a Native school should be to improve the moral, social and economic conditions of the Native people among whom it is situated" (CE, L, 598, 1 September 1920:134).

The proposed new government courses gave the missionaries cause for concern as their implementation would inevitably reduce the influence of mission education as they were:

drawn up by a Government Department which in doing so has not, and can hardly be expected to have, the same object in view as the Church ... It makes no provision for, and takes no account of, the training of the heart and character to which one might, not unnaturally, expect a place assigned in a course for men and women whose sole *raison*

d'être as teachers is that they may carry on the work of a Missionary in their villages, and raise the tone of Native social life (CE, XXXVI, 433, 1 November 1906, The Native Teacher -1: His Work and His Preparation for it:206).

Consequently, mechanical rote learning is criticised for taking priority over “the development of faculties, not to say of good true character”. Commitment is required in teachers for “where the discipline is feeble the teaching is generally on a par with it” (6 December 1896 in Ballantyne & Shepherd 1968:209).

A former student who has clearly been diligent lauds Lovedale for its achievements in himself in his post-Lovedale education:

I am proud, Sir, that I owe my educational achievements to the fact that I passed through Lovedale. I have never realised better than now what Lovedale has been to and done for me. This Institution has given me a broader outlook upon life and considerably widened my mental horizon. I have found it to be a characteristic of Lovedalians to work with confidence anywhere, so I feel had I not passed through Lovedale, I would not boast of half the efficiency which is at present mine. Experience has taught me it is only those who have never been to Lovedale who are prone to despise her and to cast all sorts of epithets at her, but we that are her ‘products’ regard her with love and reverence. Lovedale enables her students to move into the future with confidence and optimism ... EFFICIENCY MEANS ACCOMPLISHING MORE WITH LESS EXERTION AND LESS EXPENSE (Cory PR 4214[a], letter received from past pupil, 28 March 1930).

How well Lovedale had succeeded in instilling a Protestant work ethic in this student! Perhaps he was one who was influenced by the presence of white students at Lovedale who:

could never forget that they were in the presence of another race backward in so much of matters of education and civilisation who took notice of their learning and con-

duct and valued themselves and the European people generally. I am clear that on most the contact had a beneficial effect upon character in giving it force and individuality (Cory MS 14851, 1918/2, Henderson to Pim, 6 August 1918).

Even white students were co-opted in an overtly racist manner to assist in the process of character formation as were some theological students who could also disappoint trust placed in them. Regarding one such, Gqalana, Henderson commented: "He was disappointing in his inability to fall into line with the rules of the Institution and he was in that way of less help than he otherwise might have been" though later, once freed from the restrictions of coercive agency "he seemed to have pulled himself together again, and created quite an impression on me" (Cory MS 14851, 1918/4, Henderson to Scott, 13 December 1918). Resistance to coercive agency does not necessarily indicate a personality pre-disposed to negativity in the arena of church life. Even those who apparently conform can fail in later life as Henderson must have been well aware.

Consequently, in the matter of good manners, the assumption is made, presumably, that blacks do not possess good manners while their teachers do. However, discretion is the better part of valour for:

Reverence for other people, a great love for them, a desire to be nothing if only they might rise to the best that is in them, a vicarious acceptance of their faults, and a refusal to pry with vulgar curiosity into their innermost hearts are the very fundamentals of 'character-building' ... Education is at bottom a matter of faith (Murray 1929:212).

Doubtless the faith referred to is the Christian faith and the presumption is that Christianity alone can produce reverence, care and concern for others and wish to see the best possible development in others. "You are right, Christianity alone can moralise as well as evangelise the Natives of all creeds and castes" (National Library of Scotland [NLS], MS 7780, Smith to Henderson, 3 March 1908:643). However, no account is taken of character formation prior to missionary influence which "transformed the lives of blacks and inculcated the

principles of humility, love, obedience, peacefulness, of work and honesty, of cleanliness and sanitation” (Jabavu 1928:118). In this regard, Jabavu (1928:111-112) further claims that:

It is now being discovered that some of these customs had something in them worth preserving ... For example, in the case of circumcision ceremonies for males and the female puberty rites of the ‘intonjane’ we had the grave exhortation to the young men and women when they were enjoined to acquit themselves henceforth like true men and women. This being followed with a valuable enumeration of all the highest and noblest duties and virtues of ideal manhood and womanhood ... Indeed the lack of appropriate substitutes for all the things that have been annihilated by missionaries in the social life of new converts is being felt now as having been a mistake in tactics.

It is strange that what had been known all along was only now being discovered, or perhaps was in reality now being rediscovered! Nonetheless, this view is corroborated by none other than CT Loram³ (1917:74):

Their [missionaries] greatest mistake ... was in breaking down *all* the organisations and customs of the Native people without waiting to discriminate between good and bad. Had they studied native life they would have found some good qualities which would have served as a basis for the superstructure of Christianity and European civilisation.

Henderson lauds developments in the formation of character but deplores failure in this respect. Commenting on the successes among senior students:

of high character and earnest purpose, who by example and direct influence took some responsibility to set the tone of the Institution for goodness and purity, truth and honour. Not that much in these directions did not remain to be done. The traditions and influence of the evil environment of heathenism touched them and tempted them at

every point. But progress away from its degrading sanctions was being made. A Christian conception of what pure manhood and pure womanhood meant was being formed and Christian ideals of character were winning their way (LMI Reports V, 1913:2-3).

This is important to the spirit of the boarding school establishment which is involved in the process of 'moulding' character. The risk is that the process is as likely to produce opposition as it is to form non-conformists not because it is more character-building but because the institution represents and "indicates *ipso facto* a quite different society from that of the African village or tribe" (Murray 1929:231):

education, while in a certain number of cases it has had the effect of creating in the Natives an aggressive spirit - arising, no doubt, from an exaggerated sense of individual self-importance, which renders them less docile and less disposed to be content with the position for which nature or circumstances has fitted them - has had generally a beneficial influence on the Natives themselves, and by raising the level of their intelligence, and by increasing their capacity as workers and their earning power, has been an advantage to the community (SANAC, 1903-5, sect. 328 in Loram 1917:41).

It is just a pity that rebels were considered to be failures when their independence of spirit was the result of the same process of character building, though not the anticipated result!

Related to the failure of mission education to replace traditional processes of character formation with adequate substitutes, the missionaries "failed to supply their converts with organised leisure activities, individual and corporate, as substitutes for the Native pastimes which they condemned as demoralising" (Loram 1917:120; cf. Jabavu 1928:120). This criticism might at first appear strange in terms of Lovedale's highly organised and structured timetable of activities. However, what may have been lacking were meaningful recreational activities relative to the proportion of time spent in study and "manual training in the common duties of the Institution on the roads and in

the fields [which] appeared to be carried on heartily” (LMI Reports VII, 1925:17). But appearances can be deceptive!

Sadly, the production of clones in terms of the liberal spirit of the age was considered to be the mark of successful inculcation of the Lovedale spirit. Shepherd (1940:269-270) interpreting Henderson’s views on character, valued the “steady discipline of the Institution, its spiritual influence and ideals, its claims upon obedience and self-restraint” in addition to an internalised effort so that products of Lovedale would be fit leaders for the future. RV Selope Thema, a founder member of the ANC, claimed with a degree of pride, that:

Lovedale not only gave me a book education, and taught me the dignity of labour, but it also taught me how to be [a] useful citizen of South Africa ... when I left Lovedale in 1910 I had ceased to think as a barbarous boy and was already grappling with the problems of civilised life (Switzer 1997:192-3).

It is interesting to note from Thema’s attitude, despite its positive critique of mission education, that he uses ‘barbarous’ to describe his traditional background presumably, and not his inner nature, and that as the very antithesis of civilisation. Further, it is not clear whether the problems he refers to are in trying to become civilised or if civilised life has its own problems, though it would appear to be the latter as Lovedale occupied a hallowed place in his memory. “When I saw Lovedale with its inspiring school buildings, its beautiful avenues lined with oak and pine trees, I felt I was standing on the threshold of a new life and so I was” (Wilson & Perrot 1973:188) and this was before he had been inducted into the ways of the institution! As it began to affect his development:

Thema’s epiphany, Christian and Nationalist, was wrought in Lovedale’s halls of learning ... The avenues of advancement in western ways stretched ahead, tinged with a positive glow ... Religion gave him the language to express both Christian love of mankind and Nationalist love of his race ... Lovedale not only gave him language; there he literally redefined himself by changing his name ... He imag-

ined himself a crusader against heathenism and barbarism and for moral and political regeneration (Starfield 1988:28).

However, both Thema and H Selby Msimang, another founder of the ANC, “accepted without seeming to question, that people without education are usually ‘barbarous’ whereas the educated are ‘civilised’” (Starfield 1988:24). They were not aware as Sol Plaatje (1917:162) [quoting William Pitt in 1792 in a debate on the slave trade] and others were of what the effect on whites would have been had they been subjected to the same conditions as blacks: “... we who are enjoying the blessings of British civilisation, of British laws, and British liberty, might at this hour have been little superior either in morals, in knowledge, or refinement, to the rude inhabitants of the coast of Guinea”.

Discipline was an integral part of character formation at Lovedale. Its use was probably based on the assumption that enforced discipline will somehow lead to self-discipline although the maintenance of order, following the practice of Stewart’s regime, was part of the process of total institutionalisation. It is a matter which is constantly stressed in the annual reports of the Institution and its lack is a source of stress: “Mr Alexander Geddes has taken a firm hold of the students and discipline has been pulled up from the start [of the session]. In that I have been relieved from a constant source of anxiety” (Cory PR 4144, Henderson to Donald, 3 March 1918:13).

Discipline in this context seems to be a constant field of contention between students and staff as is demonstrated by the resentment of one group of the imposition of coercive agency by another. This comment was related to “unrest connected with trouble in another Native Institution” (LMI Reports VI, 1918:3). This may indicate that all mission institutions were experiencing the same kind of problems possibly all resulting from the effects of total institutionalisation. A particular situation arose in 1928 from the apparent refusal of senior students to take responsibility for discipline especially among the younger students by either encouragement or sanction:

The explanation he [Major Geddes] offers of this looseness is that the students, with the exception of those in the Practising School, have too little manual work, and are consequently at loose ends many afternoons, when the younger boys are apt to get into mischief (LMI Reports VIII, 1928:23-24).

This matter received the attention of the Lovedale council. With regard to the matter of manuals, council was informed that the heads of native institutions felt that this was all the time that could be afforded:

But the conclusion to our discussion was that more could and should be done, chiefly for the sake of the younger boys who do not know how to use profitably their leisure times ... Another important matter that occupied us was the purpose of developing a house system inside the Institution for grouping our boarders in such a way as to be more helpful to one another and to take more responsibility for one another. This will go through, I hope this year (Cory MS14430/4, Henderson to family, 17 March 1929).

Taking more responsibility is one way of formalising and increasing surveillance as well as inculcating Lovedale traditions into junior students. The students were being used in a surveillance capacity, in an institution of 'maximal surveillance' (Comaroff & Comaroff 1997:114) as a 'duty' for which they received no reward save that of earning the ingratitude of their charges no doubt. A year later the problem seemed to have been resolved for Major Geddes was "now pleased to state that during the last year there was much improvement; and in the case of the High School a great deal of work was done" (LMI Reports VIII, 1929:27).

This indiscipline was not confined to the boys, however, as girls were also involved in lax discipline. One particular instance concerned the lack of authority exercised by a staff member:

Speaking on discipline, I may tell you that we have now set about tuning up the Girls' School, to get it out of the very bad state into which it has been going steadily down for so

long, and the first job has been the rallying of a sense of responsibility and a willingness to help on the staff. Tightening up is needed at every point. It is characteristic of the situation that the girls, who are certainly not a bad lot at all if they had been properly controlled, gaily set out to make things hard for their new head, whom they have named tentatively 'the little baby' - that is private as I am now saying - because she seems very gentle and speaks softly to them, appearing to be one on whom they can impose as much as they like. But they are on the point of learning that they are up against things with more steel in them than they have ever yet encountered at Lovedale, and as all of the seniors of us are determined to back up the head to the utmost, these young people are not likely to be long in learning the new lesson. My determination also is that the new head shall be head in reality over the staff, and that change is in the process of realisation. Already it has been grasped that we mean business (Cory MS14430/2, Henderson to family, 30 October 1927).

This state of affairs is not new as it stretches beyond the present head teacher who is 'new' and it appears that the staff is part of the problem since 'tightening up' is a universal need. Perhaps in the absence of leadership, some staff members have arrogated that authority to themselves without the accompanying responsibility. Henderson's determination to put things back into good order is demonstrated in his use of 'steel' indicating its unbending quality and lack of warmth, not quite in keeping with his own personality as perceived by others and even himself. Is this the mask of efficiency and distance which Henderson needed to create amongst his colleagues and students (cf. Scott 1990:10)? For him, discipline was tied to authority. In a letter to his son, Donald, who was undertaking work in the Boys' Brigade movement, Henderson counselled: "Discipline is the great need of the urchins that you will have under your care, and it will test you and strengthen you to have to win your authority over them" (Cory MS 14427/8, Henderson to Donald, 4 January 1918), i.e. it tests both the giver and the receiver.

Responsibility is a common theme in deliberations on discipline. It implies taking responsibility for the other or keeping an eye on him in the sense of exercising a surveillance function. This was the focus of a discussion in Mr Chalmer's music class:

Their difficulty was to know what to do. Was a younger boy who might be high up on the school to rebuke a person older than himself when he found him doing wrong, or breaking the rules of the Institution? What was a student to do if when he pointed out to another that he was doing wrong, the wrong doer refused to listen to him? They were all influenced, he believed, by what was discussed, and shared a disposition to help, wherever they could (Cory MS 14430/4, Henderson to family, 17 March 1929).

Certainly, this was no easy matter to resolve when it involved monitoring one another's behaviour. It would be extremely difficult to build and maintain mutual trust in such an atmosphere, but it would foster coercive agency. This would appear to be in contradiction with the desire to foster *esprit de corps*. But that quality relates only to the building up of a good spirit which is in accord with the declared aims and objectives of the Institution. All other activities which did not conform to this desired end are to be the occasion of sanctions of one kind or another.

During a visit by Sir Robert and Lady Baden-Powell, the choir leader, a student named Tseu, let the Institution down by singing an alternative tune to the hymn *Lizalis' idinga lakho*. Henderson was incensed: "If I had not been sure that Major Geddes would deal faithfully with Tseu, I would have given him myself the shaking he deserved" (Cory PR 4144, 20 February 1927). No deviation from expected norms was allowed or tolerated and although some issues might appear to be quite petty, as the example cited above shows, any deviation from the required standards of discipline was considered to be a challenge to the entire system. For Henderson, this was a matter of loyalty to the Institution. In discussing the matter of faith turned cold, he contended: "They never learned to try to understand the points of view of other people and the duty of loyalty even when you cannot fully agree" (Cory MS 14427/4, Henderson to Donald, 18 March 1924).

Winning hearts and minds: Character formation in mission ...

This was no less than the expectation of subservience in a coercive institution which was demonstrated in a subversive manner. In the matter of a male student breaching the regulations concerning communication with a female student by sending her an illicit note, the disciplinary committee was required to meet and the punishment was 'rustication for one year' (Cory MS 14431/1, SP [Samuel Pepys i.e. Henderson] His Diary Strictly Private [for his children], 28 March c 1925). Another matter referred to the disciplinary committee concerned all night singing in the district Church where, presumably, students had been present. The outcome was the banning of all from attending future gatherings, thus visiting the 'sins' of a few on the many! (Cory MS SP Diary, 11 May c.1925)

Lovedale's Principal took delight in well organised events which were a sign of good discipline. At a gala day children:

eat nicely in little circles with large basins set in their midst, some sharing their spoons by taking turns with it, others eating from their hands, but all mannerly in a manner that pleased us all ... Girl guides doing their drill, and saluting their instructors ... And to show step dancing, keeping wonderful time which infinitely pleased our visitors (Cory MS 14431/3, SP's Diary, 7 November 1925).

and also Henderson himself!

Henderson was particularly impressed by the:

discipline and control arrangements at Tuskegee. These are in large part determined by the Institute's connection with the State for military training ... The disciplinary charge of the students is under a commandant with four or five paid assistants ... The commandant has the power of arrest and may depute it (Cory MS 14428/2, Henderson to family, 23 April 1923).

While Henderson never advocated such a system for Lovedale he saw its benefits. Here was a significant difference between Tuskegee and Lovedale. Lovedale's system of discipline was more subtly en-

forced. He preferred that teachers exercise discipline through force of personality. He referred to this in a sermon on the Cleansing of the Temple (John 2) with reference to Jesus's use of violence:

He applied force of personality not physical force. You do not need me to tell you, those of you who are studying to be teachers that you must aim at ruling without applying violence. The teacher who resorts to physical force admits himself lacking in the highest power (Cory MS 14854/10sa).

Yet, Henderson so easily delegated this duty to Geddes and others. For his own purposes and especially his public image, the power of coercion was more subtle and manipulative.

Discipline was also a problem which manifested itself among staff members. Henderson was unimpressed by staff members who failed to provide a salutary example to both colleagues and students:

I regret to have had it reported that you who are the principal teacher of the Boys' school of this Institution have habitually absented yourself from prayers and grace at meals in the Dining Hall, thereby setting a bad example, not only to the pupils of the Institution but to the junior teachers who cannot but take their lead from you. I have therefore to ask you definitely before you begin another session of work whether I can depend on your loyalty to fall in with the Regulations of the Institution and to give the assistance in carrying them out which is rightly to be expected from one in your position (Cory MS 14851, 1916/2, Henderson to Makiwane, 8 July 1916).

Henderson on more than one occasion had cause to complain about the absence of female staff and younger members of staff from worship "it seeming that they do not conceive of this worship as for them" (Cory MS 14431, SP's Diary Deciphered by JH, 21 August, 1 September 1925). "I observe with sorrow that very light causes suffice to draw away the worshippers, and that the new workers have not the steadfastness of some of the old that have gone" (Cory MS 14431/3,

SP's Diary, 22 November 1926). Following the resignation of J Terris on the grounds that there were some among us who did not look upon it [i.e. work at Lovedale] as God's work, and who served their own ends, Rev H B Coventry was moved to preach on:

'Ye cannot serve God and Mammon', saying that he believed there were but few real Christians nowadays in the world, that men were fitting Christianity to themselves instead of fitting themselves to Christianity, and holding that they were wiser than the men of twenty years ago and without respect for what then was taught (Cory MS 14431/312 September 1928).

Here we may be dealing with an instance of resistance to mission education from a younger generation of teachers less informed by Christian teaching and ideology and less amenable to manipulation.

The Commission on Native Education took this matter under consideration and urged that "suitability of character for the office of a teacher should be most carefully considered by the Training School authorities in dealing with candidates throughout their course". Reference is made in this regard to low moral standards among teacher graduates: "the Institutions are faced with this difficulty even before the men [only?] go out" (CE, L, 598, 1 September 1920:135).

Absence was a form of subversion amongst those who could not, or would not share the ideological perspective of coercive agency. Henderson seems to be referring to his own expectations of staff beyond their conditions of employment and level of remuneration. To him, they were simply disloyal to the principles of the Institution. In the appointment of Miss Terris to the teaching staff, Henderson (Cory MS 14431/3, 3 November 1925) emphasised "the matter of loyalty and how it was needed as a first duty" for one who was to work as part of a team.

For the most part, ongoing regular discipline was delegated to staff members, which is strange in one so committed to the exercise of centralised power, yet who seemed unwilling to demonstrate that he needed to depend on the use of force and/or violence to bolster his

authority. This would convey the impression that the mainstay of the educational process, that is character formation, had failed to produce the desired results. This might well be related to the view of Henderson and other missionaries as great examples of moral rectitude who could not be seen to be indulging in such basic means of coercion and social control in the light of the gospel message since they were supposed to be 'constrained by Jesus' love' (2Cor 5:14 cf. Bosch 1991:286-291), preferring only to involve himself directly by use of moral suasion as a means of manipulating students, and staff, and inducing guilt and thereby acquiescence in his wishes. He distanced himself from direct involvement by using students in a surveillance capacity, using the disciplinary committee and writing letters to offenders. Breaches of discipline which occurred outside the Institution would therefore be considered the more serious because of the image of failure which they conveyed, bringing disgrace to Lovedale as happened during a visit to Healdtown (Cory MS 14851 W/1, Watkinson the Henderson, 7 September 1922).

In large part, Henderson's approach to discipline mimicked that of his predecessor who depended on 'informers' and vigilance committees to distance himself from explicit involvement in disciplinary procedures. Both placed a great deal of trust in successive boarding masters to ensure minimum resistance and maximum compliance to the requirements of the Institution.

Much as Stewart had underscored the individual in terms of conversion and character formation, Henderson (LMI Reports VII, 1925:11; cf. 1926:11) emphasised, especially at the level of the high school, "pre-eminence in unity and *esprit de corps* ... no less in shaping manly character than in imparting knowledge, and educating the mind". This spirit had deeply impressed him at Tuskegee where "A consistent objective is the school *esprit de corps* manifested in order, cleanliness, diligence, ethos" (Cory MS 14428/2, Henderson to family, 17 April 1923). Unity and *esprit de corps* are identical inasmuch as they display the corporate nature of the Lovedale endeavour. It was further fostered through the "Lovedale weekly bulletin ... a useful idea of Colonel Houghton's for increasing *esprit de corps*" (Cory MS 14430/2, Henderson to family, 30 October 1927). This was an information sheet of the week's forthcoming events.

Esprit de corps was nowhere more evident than when a particularly virulent strain of the Spanish influenza engulfed South Africa towards the end of 1918 killing thousands of people in the Eastern Cape alone. Lovedale did not escape the disease. Six hundred cases were reported of whom four passed away. Lovedale students excelled themselves in community service in the duration of the epidemic: "It developed self-reliance and the spirit of helpfulness. Not a single grumble or complaint was made by any of them. In several cases it seemed to make men out of boys" (Shepherd 1940:331).

The promotion of *esprit de corps* may have been based on the assumption that individuals can do little on their own and that a body or organisation, well educated and prepared, can provide a more effective leaven in society. Certainly this was true insofar as Lovedale graduates were effective in banding themselves together in local political movements where leadership came from 'educated men' (Beinart & Bundy 1987:157). The early leaders of the ANC probably learned their African nationalism in their homes as well as in their schools, and possibly their parents as well as they themselves had been mission educated (Lodge 1979:17; Meyer 1999:45). *Esprit de corps* emerging from:

Lovedale for decades turned out many of the elite who were active in organising and directing the activities of the African National Congress, [which] has a certain symbolic value in the mind of the African Nationalist; it is a spiritual heartland for resisters (Williams 1970:374).

These were:

Generations of students from Fort Hare and Lovedale, many connected with the chiefly families of the Transkei, [who] would develop formidable family networks, often with strong Christian values, self-disciplined and frequently teetotal, reminiscent of early Victorian British networks like the Clapham Sect which was instrumental in founding the CMS (Sampson 1999:22; cf. Beinart & Bundy 1987:82-3).

Herein lay the core of resistance to coercive agency at Lovedale.

Within the process of formation, emphasis was placed on manual work as can be seen from the above quotation from Thema (Switzer 1997:192-3; cf. LMI Reports VII, 1925:17). Education 'makes the Native more moral and more industrious' (Loram 1917:41). "It is defended because it 'makes for character building'" (Jabavu 1920:94). This is especially true of industrial training:

When ... the apprentice is nearing the end of his third year, it is often noticed that he begins to realise what is to benefit his life and character. He begins to display a more stable, dependable and conscientious character, called forth, no doubt by the training he has undergone (CE, XXXVII, 440, 1 June 1907, The Training of Native Apprentices, 84).

This was supported by the Principal of Lovedale:

Mr Henderson said that this [industrial] training was of so much value physically, mentally, and above all in the development of character, that he was strongly in favour of its forming part of the daily round at every stage of the native student's education (CE, XXXVII, 443, 2 September 1907, Natives and Education, 140).

Consequently, "the primary objects of Native education must be the development of intelligence, the training of character, and in particular the promotion of industry" (Cape Select Committee on Native Education, 1908, sect 4 in Loram 1917:41). Dr A W Roberts (Gerdener 1958:243) of Lovedale commented "I look more to industrial occupation for the consolidating and uplifting of the Native people than I do to all the higher arts and sciences that were ever invented. It is by hard work, and plenty of it, that the African will be moulded into a strong man." We have already seen how this had different motives, including money saving, doing the missionaries' work as well as keeping students busy and less susceptible to mischief making. Yet, manual labour, especially in the trades, was used to demonstrate that sub-standard work was unacceptable in life. According to Murray (1919:208ff), the value of manual training was threefold. First, it was "associated with what is already done in the villages", and is immediately useful in a practical sense; second, a workman can "make use

of physical means as an approach to the world of mind and spirit. An education in words alone is necessarily an imperfect education"; finally workmen "have in them an element of satisfaction in the finished product which is a distinct education of the emotions". Murray (1929:211) challenges the fallacy of the efficacy of character building with regard to manual work as it:

trains people in habits of hard work, it puts men up against the resistance of physical things, it helps people to become more resourceful, and it introduces into the school the conditions of the outside world. It makes the school more 'real'.

Henderson clearly espoused a Protestant work ethic, first of all in his own life: "The waste of labour and energy irritated him" (South African Outlook [SAO], AW Roberts, 1 September 1930:189) but was also true in his teaching. In response to a query concerning the status of manual work as 'mission work', he replied: "But of course it is. We must teach conscientious work" for "real mission service" is "teaching the men what honest work is", and insisted "there is a dogged determination that the work shall go on in face of difficulty and disappointment" (6 October 1895 in Ballantyne and Shepherd 1968:63, 69, 65). Henderson addressed this issue at the closing meeting of the institution in December 1908: A prime area of manual work is agriculture. For Henderson, this was vital because of the distressing economic circumstances of the vast majority of black people:

... he was thinking of ... a poverty which imperilled the deficiencies of life and morality, and which tended towards a fatal degradation ... They had not read history intelligently if they did not know how great a part barren soils, inhospitable climates and narrow circumstances had played in the formation of the leading races. The uncertain rainfall, the denuded soils and the various hard conditions of South African farming life had made the land a fitting cradle for the nurture of a race of high qualities of patience, endurance and resolution. He believed that their future as a race was tied up with their use of the soil ... The teachers and the professional men were perhaps the most important agents

of their people at the immediately present stage of their relations with the new civilisation, but the man that counted most for the future was the tiller of the ground ... He preached the doctrine of work and not the dignity of labour merely, but its saving power ... He referred to the cultivation of character. What would determine ultimately the rise or fall of their people was not their wealth or poverty, their education or the want of it, but what they were as a race in force, in stability, in righteousness of character. Individual and national upbuilding of character was the great work to which God called them, and in this way they were offered Divine Help (LMI Reports IV, 1908:7-9).

Henderson (Cory MS 14854/13, sermon on Mark 6:3, sa) continually reinforced this doctrine:

Labour is always dignified. Idleness, not work is undignified. It is when decay has set in at the heart of a people that a stigma falls upon manual labour ... By your teaching in your homes your parents are shaping human lives and souls, and we teachers in the schools are similarly employed ... What we have to ask ourselves is this: 'Are our pupils broadening and deepening in character, are they cultivating habits of diligence, carefulness, cleanliness, courtesy and obedience and respect, are they arriving at an understanding of what is truth, are they opening the eyes of their souls to take in what is truly great and good, becoming sobered and full of reverence as at stage after stage in their progress and knowledge they come in contact with the hand of God, are they getting a firmer hold of the eternal verities, are they in a word becoming Christ like?' That is the ideal of your making.

Decay seems to be associated with a traditional lifestyle. Yet, the development of character is perceived as a joint venture between home and school aiming at Christian perfection and is based in an industrious personality.

5 CONCLUSION

Character formation aimed to transform the inner mind of the students and it manifested itself as a ubiquitous although not always identifiable presence. It was an aspect of the continuity which was essential to maintain the reality of total institutionalisation through the process of 'routinisation'. This was the result of "the colonisation of their conscience" through, among other means, an emphasis on character formation, although it was, to an extent balanced by "their consciousness of colonisation" (Comaroff & Comaroff 1991:4) which was the source of resistance, both subversive and overt. It may be a tribute to mission education although it is more likely that it was despite it that, as well as producing black European clones, it also paradoxically, formed conscientised, critical and self-critical individuals such as those who were prepared to resist the different forms of social control which were imposed on them, through whatever channels were open to them both within and beyond the institution in terms of both time and space. The Black Consciousness Movement of the twentieth century had its progenitors in a much earlier period. It is also a tribute to those who challenged the system that they often managed to do so in a subversive manner without betraying their true intentions in order to safeguard themselves from a system which had made and defined their identity and which tolerated no deviants.

From a pan-African perspective, the universality of the coercive agency is attested by Some (1999:4):

The purpose of these schools was clear: to continue the work of European colonisation on the African continent by converting natives to Christianity and the ways of the west while they were still young, susceptible, and easy to persuade. This was not a localised programme in West Africa but a widespread practice spanning the entire African continent.

School, to us, was a place where we learned to reject whatever native culture we had acquired as children and to fill its place with Western ideas and practices. This foreign culture was presented as high culture par excellence,

the acquisition of which constituted a blessing. Going to school was thus a radical act involving the sacrifice of one's indigenous self.

WORKS CONSULTED

Primary sources

Cory Library for Historical Research: Rhodes University, Grahamstown:

Govan Papers
Stewart Papers
Henderson Papers
Lovedale Papers

National Library of Scotland, Edinburgh, Scotland:

Minutes and Letterbooks of the Foreign Mission Committee of the Free Church of Scotland.

Howard Pim Africana Library, University of Fort Hare, Alice:

Lovedale Missionary Institution Reports, 1872-1930:

Kaffir Express
Christian Express

Secondary sources

Anderson, J D 1988. *The education of blacks in the South, 1860-1935*. Chapel Hill & London: University of Carolina Press.

Ashley, M J 1978. Universes in collision: A study of nineteenth century education in South Africa. Unpublished paper presented to the Institute of Social and Economic Research (later published in 1980 in the *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa* 32, 28-38), Grahamstown.

Winning hearts and minds: Character formation in mission ...

- Ballantyne, M & Shepherd, R H W (ed) 1968. *Forerunners of modern Malawi*. Lovedale: Lovedale Press.
- Beinart, W & Bundy, C 1987. Hidden struggles in rural South Africa: Politics and popular movements in the Transkei and Eastern Cape, 1890-1930. Johannesburg: Ravan.
- Bosch, D J 1991. Transforming mission: Paradigm shifts in theology of mission. Maryknoll: Orbis.
- Brock, S M 1974. James Stewart and Lovedale: A reappraisal of missionary attitudes and African response in the Eastern Cape, South Africa, 1870-1905. PhD thesis. Edinburgh: University of Edinburgh.
- Christensen, T & Hutchison, W R (eds) 1982. *Missionary ideologies in the imperialist era: 1880-1920*. Denmark Aarhus: Forloget Aros.
- Comarrof, J & Comarrof, J 1991-1997. Of revelation and revolution: Christianity, colonialism, and consciousness in South Africa, 2 vols. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Costas, O E 1993. Christ outside the gate: Mission beyond Christendom. Maryknoll: Orbis.
- Crais, C C 1992. The making of the colonial order: White supremacy and black resistance in the Eastern Cape, 1770-1865. Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press.
- De Kock, L 1992. English and the colonisation of form. *Journal of Literary Studies* 8(1/2), 33-54.
- De Kock, L 1996. *Civilising barbarians: Missionary narrative and African textual response in nineteenth century South Africa*. Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand Press.

- Etherington, N 1996. Recent trends in the historiography of Christianity in South Africa. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 22(2), 201-219.
- Gerdener, G B A 1958. Recent developments in the South African mission field. Cape Town: NGK-Uitgevers.
- Hartshorne, K 1992. Crisis and challenge: Black education, 1910-1990. Cape Town: CUP.
- Jabavu, D D T 1920. The black problem: Papers and addresses on various native problems. Lovedale: Lovedale Press.
- Jabavu, D D T 1928. The segregation fallacy and other papers: A native view of some South African inter-racial problems. Lovedale: Lovedale Press.
- JanMohammed, A R 1985. The economy of Manichean allegory: The function of racial difference in colonialist literature. *Critical Inquiry* 12 (Autumn), 59-87.
- Keegan T 1996. Colonial South Africa and the origins of the racial order. Cape Town: David Philip.
- Keil, A 1999. 'To serve him all her days': Jane Philip, missionary wife and visionary. Unpublished paper. Cape Town: University of Cape Town.
- Lodge, T 1979. Black opposition: A historical perspective. *The Black Sash* (February), 16-20.
- Loram, C T 1917. *The education of the South African native*. London: Longmans, Green & Co.
- Majeke, N 1952. *The role of the missionaries in conquest*. Johannesburg: Society of Young Africa.
- Maylam, P 1986. A history of the African peoples of South Africa: From the early Iron Age to the 1970s. Cape Town: David Philip.

Winning hearts and minds: Character formation in mission ...

- Meyer, W H 1999. Christianity and The Bible in South African life and literature: Interviews with Mandla Langa and Mangena Wally Serote. *Bulletin for Contextual Theology*, 4(3), 45-51.
- Murray, A V 1929. *A school in the bush: A critical study of the theory and practice of native education in Africa*. London: Longmans, Green & Co.
- Oosthuizen, G C 1970. *Shepherd of Lovedale: A life for Southern Africa*. Johannesburg: Hugh Keartland.
- Plaatje, S T 1982 (1917). *Native life in South Africa*. Johannesburg: Ravan.
- Prest, E 2000. *Telling the greatest story ever told*. Cape Town: TFL Publishing.
- Roberts, A (ed) 1990. Christianity in *The colonial moment in Africa: Essays on the movement of minds and materials, 1900-1940*, 140-190. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Saayman, W A 1990. Christian missions in South Africa: Achievements, failures and the future, in Prozesky, M (ed), *Christianity in Southern Africa*, 28-36. Bergvlei: Southern.
- Saayman, W A 1991. 'Who owns the schools will own Africa?': Christian mission, education and culture in Africa. *Journal for the Study of Religion* 4(2), 29-44.
- Scott, J C 1990. *Domination and the arts of resistance: Hidden Transcripts*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Shepherd, R H W 1940. *Lovedale, South Africa: The story of a century*. Lovedale: Lovedale Press.
- Smit, D J 1990. Theology and transformation of culture: Niebuhr revisited. *Journal of Theology in South Africa*, 72, 9-23.

- Some, M P 1999. *The healing wisdom of Africa: Finding life purposes through nature, ritual and community*. London: Thorsons (Harper Collins).
- Starfield, J 1988. 'Not quite history': The autobiographies of H Selby Msimang and RV Selope Thema and the writing of South African history. *Social Dynamics* 14(2), 16-35.
- Switzer, L (ed) 1997. *South Africa's alternative press: Voices of protest and resistance, 1880s-1960s*. Cambridge: CUP.
- Taylor, J D (ed) 1929. *Christianity and the natives of South Africa: A year book of South African missions*. Lovedale: General Missionary Conference of South Africa.
- Williams, D 1970. African nationalism in South Africa: Origins and problems. *Journal of African History*, 11(3), 371-383.
- Wilson, F & Perrot, D (ed) 1972. *Outlook on a century: South Africa, 1870-1970*. Lovedale: Lovedale Press.

ENDNOTES

- 1 The 1898 report of LMI:5 has a reference to a bequest established by Andrew Smith where 'Character will be the chief qualification, for that is the chief thing'.
- 2 De Kock (1992a:130) suggests that later missionaries adopted the same master trope as can be seen in the work of James Henderson.
- 3 Natal's Inspector of Schools.