

INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN
FOR
DISTANCE MUSIC EDUCATION

by

SANET SCHOEMAN

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree

Doctor Musicae
in the
Faculty of Arts
University of Pretoria

Promoter: Dr. H.M. Potgieter
Co-promoter: Prof. Caroline van Niekerk

Pretoria - August 1999

SUMMARY

This study applies the parameters of instructional design and distance education to the field of Music Education. The outcome of this study is the development of an instructionally designed Distance Music Education Programme that can be used for the training of post-graduate Music Education students at a traditional contact teaching tertiary institution.

The increasing awareness, both internationally and nationally, of the importance of a need for distance education forms the background to this research. The paradigm shift towards more learner centred study, independent of time and place, necessitates the redesigning and development of learning material at tertiary institutions. The design of distance education material therefore needs to take cognisance of learners' educational backgrounds, demographics, age and access to learning material.

The challenge was to effectively facilitate the practical components of Music Education namely, singing, listening, playing on instruments, being creative, moving and reading notation, without having physical contact with the learners. To address this challenge, the design structure of planning, implementing, observing and reflecting was used. Relevant literature concerning instructional design and distance education were consulted, after which the programme was designed and evaluated.

Although the design is based on general instructional design principles, it is argued in this study that the successful facilitation of the practical skills involved in Music Education could best be handled by a Music Education subject specialist who takes the responsibility of the instructional design or works in collaboration with an instructional designer. By doing so, an effective distance Music Education programme can be facilitated.

Key words: Instructional design, systems approach, distance education, telematic learning, post-graduate, teacher training, lifelong learning, Music Education, delivery modes, multi-media.

OPSOMMING

Hierdie studie pas die parameters van instruksionele ontwerp en afstandsonderrig toe op die gebied van musiekopvoeding. Dit het die ontwikkeling van 'n instruksioneelontwerpte afstandsonderrigprogram wat gebruik kan word in die opleiding van nagraadse musiekopvoedkundiges tot gevolg.

Die toenemende bewuswording, beide nasionaal en internasionaal, van die belangrikheid van afstandsonderrig vorm die agtergrond tot hierdie navorsing. Die paradigmaskuif, na meer leerder-gesentreerde studie, onafhanklik van tyd en plek, beklemtoon die noodsaaklikheid vir die herontwerp en ontwikkeling van studiemateriaal by tersiêre inrigtings. Dit is dus nodig om met die ontwerp van afstandsonderrigmateriaal aandag te skenk aan leerders se opvoedkundige en demografiese agtergrond, ouderdom en toegang tot studiemateriaal.

Die effektiewe fasilitering van die praktiese komponente van musiekopvoeding, naamlik sang, luister, instrumentale spel, kreatiwiteit, beweging en lees en skryf van notasie, sonder om fisiese kontak met die leerders te hê, is die vernaamste uitdaging. Ten einde hierdie uitdaging aan te spreek is die ontwerpstruktuur van beplan, implementeer, waarneem en bepeins, gebruik. Toepaslike literatuur oor instruksionele ontwerp en afstandsonderrig is geraadpleeg, waarna die program ontwerp en geëvalueer is.

Die ontwerp is op algemene instruksionele ontwerpsbeginsels gebaseer. Tog kan die suksesvolle fasilitering van praktiese vaardighede betrokke by musiekopvoeding ten beste deur 'n musiek vakspecialis gehanteer word. So 'n vakspecialis kan verantwoordelikheid vir die instruksionele ontwerp neem, of kan dit in samewerking met 'n instruksionele ontwerper hanteer. Sodoende kan 'n effektiewe musiekopvoedkundeprogram vir afstandsonderrig daargestel word.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to express my sincere thanks to the following persons for their support, encouragement and guidance:

- My promoters, Dr Hetta Potgieter and Professor Caroline van Niekerk.
- Professor Johannes Cronje.
- My husband, family and friends.

Soli Deo Gloria

CHAPTER 2: PLAN

INTRODUCTION	2-2
2.1 WHAT ARE THE THEORETICAL PRINCIPLES OF DISTANCE LEARNING?	2-3
2.1.1 Learning theories	2-4
2.1.2 The learning experience	2-9
2.1.3 Distance education compared to contact education	2-13
2.1.4 Distance education theories	2-14
2.1.5 Distance education models	2-17
2.1.6 Planning of distance education models.....	2-20
2.2 WHAT ARE THE THEORETICAL PRINCIPLES OF INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN?	2-22
2.2.1 Instructional design theories.....	2-22
2.2.2 Instructional design models	2-28
2.2.3 Application of instructional design to distance education.....	2-29
2.3 WHAT ARE THE INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN PRINCIPLES FOR DISTANCE MUSIC EDUCATION PROGRAMMES?	2-34
2.3.1 Distance learners	2-34
2.3.2 Individualised instruction	2-37
2.3.3 The instructional designer	2-40
2.3.4 Learning theories in relation to design	2-41
2.4 WHAT ARE THE MOTIVATIONAL PRINCIPLES INVOLVED IN A DISTANCE EDUCATION PROGRAMME?	2-44
2.4.1 Tutors.....	2-45

CHAPTER 1: RESEARCH OUTLINE

INTRODUCTION	1-2
1.1 BACKGROUND TO RESEARCH.....	1-2
1.1.1 International perspective	1-2
1.1.2 National perspective.....	1-3
1.1.3 University of Pretoria.....	1-4
1.1.4 Music Department	1-5
1.1.5 Instructional design for distance Music Education	1-6
1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT	1-6
1.3 RESEARCH OUTCOME.....	1-7
1.4 LIMITATIONS	1-7
1.5 PROCEDURE.....	1-9
1.6 TERMINOLOGY AND ABBREVIATIONS	1-10
1.6.1 Distance education	1-10
1.6.2 Instructional design	1-11
1.6.3 Music Education.....	1-12
1.6.4 Abbreviations	1-14
1.6.5 Notes to the reader.....	1-15
1.7 THESIS OUTLINE	1-16

CHAPTER 2: PLAN

INTRODUCTION	2-2
2.1 WHAT ARE THE THEORETICAL PRINCIPLES OF DISTANCE LEARNING?	2-3
2.1.1 Learning theories	2-4
2.1.2 The learning experience	2-9
2.1.3 Distance education compared to contact education.....	2-13
2.1.4 Distance education theories	2-14
2.1.5 Distance education models	2-17
2.1.6 Planning of distance education models.....	2-20
2.2 WHAT ARE THE THEORETICAL PRINCIPLES OF INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN?	2-22
2.2.1 Instructional design theories.....	2-22
2.2.2 Instructional design models.....	2-28
2.2.3 Application of instructional design to distance education.....	2-29
2.3 WHAT ARE THE INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN PRINCIPLES FOR DISTANCE MUSIC EDUCATION PROGRAMMES?	2-34
2.3.1 Distance learners	2-34
2.3.2 Individualised instruction	2-37
2.3.3 The instructional designer	2-40
2.3.4 Learning theories in relation to design	2-41
2.4 WHAT ARE THE MOTIVATIONAL PRINCIPLES INVOLVED IN A DISTANCE EDUCATION PROGRAMME?	2-44
2.4.1 Tutors.....	2-45

2.4.2 Collaborative learning	2-46
2.5 WHAT PRINCIPLES DETERMINE THE SELECTION OF AN APPROPRIATE TECHNOLOGICAL DELIVERY MODE?.....	2-47
2.5.1 Media selection.....	2-48
2.5.2 Printed text	2-53
2.5.3 Audio cassettes	2-54
2.5.4 Video cassettes	2-54
2.5.5 Computer assisted learning	2-55
CONCLUSION	2-62

CHAPTER 3: IMPLEMENT

INTRODUCTION	3-2
3.1 ANALYSIS	3-4
3.1.1 Outcomes analysis	3-5
3.1.2 Performance analysis	3-6
3.1.3 Target population analysis.....	3-7
3.1.4 Media analysis	3-9
3.1.5 Task analysis	3-10
3.2 DESIGN.....	3-14
3.2.1 Formulation and presentation of learning outcomes.....	3-14
3.2.2 Structure and style of text	3-18
3.2.3 Guidance structures	3-24
3.2.4 Facilitation of the practical components of Music Education.....	3-29
3.2.5 Facilitation of self-assessment questions and activities	3-34

3.3 DEVELOPMENT	3-38
3.4 IMPLEMENTATION	3-43
CONCLUSION	3-43

CHAPTER 4: OBSERVE

INTRODUCTION	4-2
4.1 LITERATURE REVIEW	4-4
4.1.1 Theoretical principles	4-4
4.1.2 Design principles	4-5
4.1.3 Motivational principles	4-6
4.1.4 Technological principles	4-6
4.2 RESEARCHER'S EXPERIENCE.....	4-7
4.2.1 Theoretical principles	4-7
4.2.2 Design principles.....	4-8
4.2.3 Motivational principles.....	4-9
4.2.4 Technological principles.....	4-9
4.3 INFORMAL QUESTIONNAIRE.....	4-10
4.3.1 Theoretical principles	4-11
4.3.2 Design principles.....	4-12
4.3.3 Motivational principles.....	4-13
4.3.4 Technological principles.....	4-15

CONCLUSION	4-16
-------------------------	-------------

CHAPTER 5: REFLECT

INTRODUCTION	5-2
5.1 THEORETICAL PRINCIPLES	5-5
5.2 DESIGN PRINCIPLES.....	5-22
5.3 MOTIVATIONAL PRINCIPLES	5-39
5.4 TECHNOLOGICAL PRINCIPLES	5-51
CONCLUSION.....	5-59

CHAPTER 6: RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

INTRODUCTION	6-2
6.1 WHAT ARE THE THEORETICAL PRINCIPLES OF DISTANCE EDUCATION AND INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN?	6-3
6.1.1 Learning	6-3
6.1.2 Distance learning.....	6-4
6.1.3 Instructional design	6-4
6.2 WHAT ARE THE DESIGN PRINCIPLES FOR DISTANCE EDUCATION?...	6-5
6.2.1 Role players in the design process	6-5

6.2.2 Learning theory in relation to design	6-6
6.2.3 Course content.....	6-7
6.3 WHAT ARE THE MOTIVATIONAL PRINCIPLES INVOLVED IN A DISTANCE EDUCATION PROGRAMME?	6-8
6.3.1 Motivational structures.....	6-8
6.3.2 Student support services.....	6-8
6.3.3 Assessment	6-9
6.4 WHAT PRINCIPLES DETERMINE THE SELECTION OF AN APPRO- PRIATE TECHNOLOGICAL DELIVERY MODE?.....	6-10
6.5 RECOMMENDATIONS	6-11
6.6 CONCLUSION.....	6-18

ADDENDUM - DISTANCE MUSIC EDUCATION PROGRAMME

BIBLIOGRAPHY

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 2.1: Difference between contact and distance education	2-13
TABLE 2.2: Situational evaluation components (Seels 1995:122)	2-25
TABLE 2.3: Application of instructional design to distance education (Moore & Kearsley 1996:9)	2-30
TABLE 2.4: Learning requirements of contact and distance learners (adapted from Oosthuizen 1997:70 and Hamilton 1994:123)	2-35
TABLE 2.5: Individualised instruction (Romiszowski 1984:9)	2-39
TABLE 2.6: Advantages and disadvantages of constructivism	2-42
TABLE 2.7: Advantages and disadvantages of different types of media	2-51
TABLE 2.8: Advantages and disadvantages of Web-based instruction	2-57
TABLE 2.9: Interface design	2-60
TABLE 3.1: Parameters of a target population analysis	3-7
TABLE 3.2: Checklist to help identify major changes that might be required (adapted from Melton 1997:94)	3-11
TABLE 4.1: Summary of assessment criteria	4-4
TABLE 4.2: Literature review - theoretical principles	4-4
TABLE 4.3: Literature review - design principles	4-5
TABLE 4.4: Literature review - motivational principles	4-6
TABLE 4.5: Literature review - technological principles	4-7
TABLE 4.6: Researcher's experience - theoretical principles	4-7
TABLE 4.7: Researcher's experience - design principles	4-9
TABLE 4.8: Researcher's experience - motivational principles	4-9
TABLE 4.9: Researcher's experience - technological principles	4-10
TABLE 4.10: Questionnaire - theoretical principles	4-11
TABLE 4.11: Questionnaire - design principles	4-12
TABLE 4.12: Questionnaire - motivational principles	4-14
TABLE 4.13: Questionnaire - technological principles	4-16
TABLE 5.1: Questions on learning theory	5-6
TABLE 5.2: Behaviourism compared to constructivism (Houton Mifflin 1999)	5-7
TABLE 5.3: Learning theory case study answers	5-9

TABLE 5.4: Questions on the learning experience	5-10
TABLE 5.5: Deep approach learning compared with surface approach learning	5-11
TABLE 5.6: Learning experience case study answers	5-12
TABLE 5.7: Questions on distance education theory	5-13
TABLE 5.8: Distance education theory case study answers	5-16
TABLE 5.9: Questions on distance education models	5-17
TABLE 5.10: Three generations of distance education	5-17
TABLE 5.11: Classification of distance education models	5-18
TABLE 5.12: Questions on instructional design theory	5-19
TABLE 5.13: Comparison of instructional design theories	5-19
TABLE 5.14: Questions on instructional design models	5-21
TABLE 5.15: Questions on the distance learner	5-23
TABLE 5.16: Individualised instruction	5-24
TABLE 5.17: Design principles of individualised instruction	5-25
TABLE 5.18: Distance learner case study answers	5-29
TABLE 5.19: Questions on the instructional designer	5-30
TABLE 5.20: Questions on learning theory in relation to design	5-32
TABLE 5.21: Learning theory case study answers	5-34
TABLE 5.22: Questions on course content	5-35
TABLE 5.23: Content of course case study answers	5-37
TABLE 5.24: Questions on motivational structures	5-40
TABLE 5.25: Four motivational categories and their corresponding outcomes	5-41
TABLE 5.26: Motivational structures questionnaire answers	5-42
TABLE 5.27: Questions on student support services	5-44
TABLE 5.28: Outcomes of motivational structures	5-45
TABLE 5.29: Student support services case study answers	5-46
TABLE 5.30: Questions on assessment	5-47
TABLE 5.31: Assessment case study answers	5-48
TABLE 5.32: Questions on media selection	5-51
TABLE 5.33: Criteria and outcomes of media selection	5-53
TABLE 5.34: Media selection for facilitating practical skills	5-54
TABLE 5.35: Media selection case study answers	5-57

TABLE 6.1: Recommendations for the successful application of instructional design to a DMEP	6-14
--	-------------

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE 1.1: Action research cycle	1-9
FIGURE 1.2: Outline of the thesis	1-16
FIGURE 2.1: Elements and concepts of music	2-2
FIGURE 2.2: Schema of learning (Romiszowski 1984:45)	2-4
FIGURE 2.3: Key elements of learning (Morgan 1995:62)	2-12
FIGURE 2.4: The evolution of distance education (Moore & Kearsley 1996:20)	2-17
FIGURE 2.5: Planning a distance education model (Rumble 1986:86)	2-21
FIGURE 2.6: Knowledge base component	2-27
FIGURE 2.7: Systems approach (Moller 1999:4)	2-29
FIGURE 2.8: Inputs and outputs of distance education (Moore & Kearsley 1996:15)	2-31
FIGURE 2.9: Planning student support services (Lockwood 1995:233)	2-44
FIGURE 2.10: Interactive factors of media selection for distance education (Thomas et al 1994:92)	2-49
FIGURE 2.11: Delivery modes common to distance education practice	2-50
FIGURE 3.1: Profiles of enrolled learners in 1998 and 1999	3-8
FIGURE 3.2: The parameters of learning outcomes	3-15
FIGURE 3.3: Learning outcomes	3-17
FIGURE 3.4: Specific outcomes	3-17
FIGURE 3.5: Cognitive assignment	3-20
FIGURE 3.6: Affective assignment	3-21
FIGURE 3.7: Psychomotor assignment	3-22
FIGURE 3.8: Textual and structural design principles	3-22
FIGURE 3.9: Textual and structural design without the use of white space	3-24
FIGURE 3.10: Icons and their meanings	3-25
FIGURE 3.11: The use of diagrams and graphics	3-26
FIGURE 3.12: Making use of learners' unique background	3-27

FIGURE 3.13: Introduction to modular structure	3-28
FIGURE 3.14: Modular structure	3-29
FIGURE 3.15: Why is singing important?	3-30
FIGURE 3.16: How to create a listening guide	3-31
FIGURE 3.17: Example of a listening guide (Potgieter 1995)	3-31
FIGURE 3.18: Music style	3-33
FIGURE 3.19: A model for designing motivational instruction	3-35
FIGURE 5.1: Example of media presentasion	5-56