A review and update of the conservation status of *Kalanchoe* species (Crassulaceae subfam. Kalanchooideae) in the *Flora of Southern Africa* region

Gideon F. Smith¹, Estrela Figueiredo² and Kenneth Oberlander³

- Department of Botany, Nelson Mandela University, P.O. Box 77000, Gqeberha (Port Elizabeth), 6031 South Africa (smithgideon1@gmail.com) Orcid: GFS, https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5417-9208. Corresponding author
- Department of Botany, Nelson Mandela University, P.O. Box 77000, Gqeberha (Port Elizabeth), 6031 South Africa (epnfigueiredo@gmail.com) Orcid: EF, https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8511-8213
- H.G.W.J. Schweickerdt Herbarium, Department of Plant and Soil Sciences, Plant Sciences Complex, University of Pretoria, Private Bag X20, Hatfield, 0028, South Africa. (email: kenneth. oberlander@up.ac.za) Orcid: KCO, https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6248-351X

Photographs: Gideon F. Smith

Summary: An overview and update is provided of the conservation status of the twenty species of Kalanchoe (Crassulaceae subfam. Kalanchooideae) indigenous in southern Africa. Fourteen of the species grow abundantly in extensive natural geographical distribution ranges and from a conservation perspective are of Least Concern. One species, K. laciniata, has a very wide global distribution range but is restricted to Namibia in the southern African region. The other five Kalanchoe species that are of conservation concern are all southern African endemics, being additionally endemic to specific Regions or Centres of Endemism. These are: K. alticola (Barberton Centre of Endemism), K. crouchii (Wolkberg Centre of Endemism), K. crundallii (Soutpansberg Centre of Endmism), K. longiflora (Maputaland-Pondoland Region of Endemism) and K. winteri (Wolkberg Centre of Endemism).

Zusammenfassung: Es wird ein Überblick und eine Aktualisierung des Erhaltungszustands der 20 im südlichen Afrika heimischen Kalanchoe-Arten (Crassulaceae subfam. Kalanchooideae) gegeben. Vierzehn der Arten kommen zahlreich in weiträumigen natürlichen Verbreitungsgebieten vor und sind aus Artenschutzsicht ungefährdet. Eine Art, K. laciniata, hat ein sehr großes, weltweites Verbreitungsgebiet, ist aber im südlichen Afrika auf Namibia beschränkt. Die anderen fünf Kalanchoe-Arten, die aus Sicht des Artenschutzes relevant sind, sind alle im südlichen Afrika endemisch, d. h. sie kommen nur in bestimmten Regionen oder Endemismuszentren vor. Diese sind: *K. alticola* (Barberton-Endemiszentrum), *K. crouchii* (Wolkberg-Endemismuszentrum), *K. crundallii* (Soutpansberg-Endemismuszentrum), *K. longiflora* (Maputaland-Pondoland-Endemiszentrum) und *K. winteri* (Wolkberg-Endemismuszentrum).

Keywords: conservation history; endemism; grassland; herbarium records; restricted distribution range; savanna; south-tropical Africa

Introduction

Geopolitically, the region covered by the *Flora of Southern Africa (FSA)* project includes Namibia, Botswana, Eswatini (formerly Swaziland), Lesotho and South Africa, the five southernmost countries on the African continent. Three of the countries abutting the *FSA*, i.e. Zambia, Zimbabwe, and Mozambique, as well as Malawi and Botswana (the latter also covered in the *FSA* region), are included in the *Flora zambesiaca* region. Angola was previously included in a separate floristic project, the now defunct *Conspectus florae angolensis*.

The family Crassulaceae is rich in both species (c. 260) and genera (5) in the *FSA* region (Tölken, 1985; Meyer et al., 1997: 69; Smith et al., 2019a: 17–22). With twenty species of *Kalanchoe* Adans. indigenous to the *FSA*, the genus is the fourth most speciose in the region (Smith et al., 2019a; Smith, 2021; Smith & Figueiredo, 2021). Along with the predominantly southern African *Adromischus* Lem., *Cotyledon* L. and *Tylecodon*

	Reference	Kalanchoe taxa included		
1	Hall et al. (1980: 29)	 K. alticola (Rare¹ in southern Africa and overall) K. crundallii (Vulnerable² and declining in southern Africa and overall) K. laciniata (Rare in southern Africa; not threatened overall) K. longiflora (Uncertain whether safe or not³ in southern Africa and overall) 		
2	Hall & Veldhuis (1985: 32)	No Kalanchoe taxa included.		
3	Hilton-Taylor (1996a: 66)	 K. alticola (Insufficiently known⁴ in Eswatini; Rare⁵ in South Africa; Rare overall) K. crundallii (Rare overall) K. laciniata (Rare in Namibia; not threatened overall) K. longiflora (Insufficiently known in Eswatini, however the species does not occur in that country) K. sexangularis (Insufficiently known in Eswatini; not threatened overall) 		
4	Walter & Gillett (1998: 210)	K. crundallii (Rare ⁶)		
5	Scott-Shaw (1999: 54)	No Kalanchoe taxa included		
6	Craven & Loots (2002: 88), for Namibia	K. laciniata (Data Deficient)		
7	Dlamini & Dlamini (2002: 131), for Eswatini	<i>K. alticola</i> (Data Deficient) <i>K. montana</i> ⁷ (Data Deficient) <i>K. sexangularis</i> (Data Deficient)		
8	Victor (2002), for South Africa	No Kalanchoe taxa included		
9	Burgoyne et al., in Raimondo et al. (2009: 310) Von Staden et al., in Raimondo et al. (2009: 310)	K. alticola (DDD ⁸) K. crundallii (Rare ⁹)		
10	http://redlist.sanbi.org/genus.php?genus=3823	Thirteen <i>Kalanchoe</i> taxa assessed (see Table 2)		

Table 1. Chronology of the inclusion of southern African *Kalanchoe* taxa in South African, southern African, and global conservation assessments. With the exception of *Kalanchoe laciniata*, which has a very wide distribution range beyond Namibia, the only *FSA* country from which it has been recorded, all the taxa included in the Table are endemic to southern Africa (see notes opposite).

¹'Rare'. Used for a plant with a relatively small world population that is not declining and is under no known immediate threat. Because of its rarity, the plant should be checked regularly for a decline due to some unexpected pressure (Hall et al., 1980: 9).

²'Vulnerable'. Used for a plant that was recently more widespread, but is on the decline, and is likely to become endangered if the causal factors for its decline continue operating (Hall et al., 1980: 9).

³'Uncertain whether safe or not'. A temporary category used for plants that are so little known that there is an even chance that they could prove to be safe (Hall et al., 1980: 9).

⁴'Insufficiently known'. Used for taxa that are suspected but not definitely known to be Extinct, Endangered, Vulnerable, Rare, or Indeterminate (Hilton-Taylor, 1996a: 9).

⁵'Rare'. Taxa with small world populations that are not at present Endangered or Vulnerable, but are at risk as some unexpected threat could easily cause a critical decline (Hilton-Taylor, 1996a: 9).

⁶Based on Hilton-Taylor (1996a: 66).

⁷As K. luciae subsp. montana (Compton) Toelken.

⁸'DDD'. Applied to taxonomically well-defined taxa that are too poorly known to allow an assessment of possible extinction risks, either because their distribution and habitat are unknown, or they are well known and suspected to be in danger of extinction, but relevant data to measure against criteria for the categories of threat do not yet exist (Raimondo et al., 2009: 9).

⁹ Rare'. See Material and methods, above.

Toelken, *Kalanchoe* is included in Crassulaceae subfam. Kalanchooideae.

At present five subgenera are recognised in Kalanchoe: the geographically widespread autonymic one; as well as K. subg. Alatae (Raym.-Hamet) Gideon F.Sm., Shtein & D.-P. Klein (Smith et al. 2021a), K. subg. Bryophyllum (Salisb.) Koord., and K. subg. Kitchingia (Baker) Gideon F.Sm. & Figueiredo, all three of which are restricted to Madagascar; and the exclusively southern and south-tropical African K. subg. Fernandesiae Gideon F.Sm. (Smith & Figueiredo 2018a; Smith et al. 2019a; Smith 2020a: 5). The southern African kalanchoes are split across two of these subgenera, with K. crouchii, K. luciae, K. montana, K. thyrsiflora, and K. winterii included in K. subg. Fernandesiae and the others in K. subg. Kalanchoe.

All twenty *Kalanchoe* species that are indigenous to southern Africa occur in the eastern and northern parts of the subcontinent, with representatives of the genus being largely absent from the western (Mediterranean) and south-central, mostly arid, karooid parts (Smith et al., 2019a: 47; Smith & Figueiredo, 2021).

We here present an overview and update of the conservation status of the species of *Kalanchoe* indigenous to the *FSA* region. It is shown that fourteen of the twenty species are of 'Least Concern'; one, *K. laciniata* (Figure 1) has a restricted distribution range in southern Africa but has a very wide global distribution range; and five, *K. alticola* (Figure 2), *K. crouchii* (Figure 3), *K.* *crundallii* (Figure 4), *K. longiflora* (Figure 5), and *K. winteri* (Figure 6) are of conservation concern. These six species are illustrated.

Material and methods

Information on the conservation status of the *Kalanchoe* taxa indigenous in southern Africa was derived from historical and current literature, herbarium records where accessible, consultations with specialists, and fieldwork. These four sources of information have remained of critical importance in species-level conservation biology studies over several decades.

The definitions of the conservation categories applicable to taxa that are variously regarded as threatened have undergone considerable refinement over the past forty years. We here deliberately reference the conservation assessment categories that were assigned to the various taxa in the original assessments (see 'History of conservation assessments of kalanchoes in the *Flora of Southern Africa* region') and for the sake of clarity define these in the footnotes to Table 1. However, where possible, the recommended categories as defined in the second edition of version 3.1 of the *IUCN Red List categories and criteria* (IUCN, 2012) are used.

Where appropriate and to facilitate comparable conservation discussions in the FSA region, we additionally make use of the expanded red list categories (see http://redlist.sanbi.org/redcat.php), where, for example, the category "Nare' is defined as follows: 'A species is Rare when it meets at least

		Conservation status		
	Kalanchoe species	South African Red List	Present study	
1	K. alticola Compton	Data Deficient (DDD)	Data Deficient (DDD)	
2	K. brachyloba Welw.	Least concern	Least concern	
3	K. crenata (Andrews) Haw.	Least concern	Least concern	
4	K. crouchii Gideon F.Sm. & Figueiredo	-1	Endangered	
5	K. crundallii I.Verd.	Rare	Rare	
6	K. decumbens Compton	-2	Least concern	
7	<i>K. hirta</i> Harv.	-3	Least concern	
8	K. laciniata (L.) DC.	- ⁴	Data Deficient (DDD)	
9	K. lanceolata (Forssk.) Pers.	Least concern	Least concern	
10	K. leblanciae RaymHamet	_ ⁵	Least concern	
11	K. longiflora Schltr. ex J.M.Wood	Vulnerable	Vulnerable	
12	K. luciae RaymHamet	Least concern	Least concern	
13	K. montana Compton	Least concern ⁶	Least concern	
14	K. neglecta Toelken	Least concern	Least concern	
15	K. paniculata Harv.	Least concern	Least concern	
16	K. rotundifolia (Haw.) Haw.	Least concern	Least concern	
17	K. sexangularis N.E.Br. var. sexangularis	Least concern	Least concern	
18	K. thyrsiflora Harv.	Least concern	Least concern	
19	K. waterbergensis van Jaarsv.	_1	Least concern	
20	<i>K. winteri</i> Gideon F.Sm., N.R.Crouch & Mich.Walters	_1	Rare	

¹Not described at the time.

²Included in the synonymy of *K. rotundifolia* at the time (see Figueiredo & Smith, 2017; Smith & Figueiredo, 2017a; Smith, 2021).

³Included in the synonymy of *K. crenata* at the time (see Crouch & Smith, 2009; Smith et al., 2018).

⁴In the *FSA* region indigenous to Namibia only and therefore not treated in Raimondo et al. (2009) nor at http://redlist.sanbi.org/genus.php?genus=3823.

⁵Not recognised as occurring in the *FSA* region at the time.

⁶Treated as *K. luciae* Raym.-Hamet subsp. *montana* (Compton) Toelken at the time (see Smith et al., 2016).

Table 2. Conservation status of *Kalanchoe* taxa in southern Africa as recorded by Raimondo et al. (2009) for two species, *K. alticola* and *K. crundallii*, at http://redlist.sanbi.org/genus.php?genus=3823 for thirteen taxa, and as given for one species, *K. laciniata*, in Namibia by Loots (2005), as compared to the outcomes of the present study. A conservation status is proposed for recently reinstated and newly described species (see text for discussions). The taxa are arranged in alphabetical sequence..

one of four South African criteria for rarity, but is not exposed to any direct or plausible potential threat and does not qualify for a category of threat according to one of the five criteria used by the IUCN (2012). The four criteria are as follows.

- 1. Restricted range: Extent of Occurrence (EOO) $< 500 \mathrm{km}^2$; or
- 2. Habitat specialist: Species is restricted to a specialised microhabitat so that it has a very small Area of Occupancy (AOO), typically smaller than 20km²; or
- 3. Low densities of individuals: Species always occurs as single individuals or very small subpopulations (typically fewer than 50 mature individuals) scattered over a wide area; or

4. Small global population: Less than 10,000 mature individuals.'

This category, 'Rare', is marked with a superscript 'N' (see above) to indicate that it is a national, non-IUCN Red List category used for species that are not in danger of extinction, but nonetheless considered to be of conservation concern.

Note further that two 'Data Deficient' categories are used: the category 'DDD' is used when there is inadequate information to make an assessment of the risk of extinction of a taxon, but it is taxonomically well defined. This contrasts with 'DDT', a category used for taxa where taxonomic problems negatively impact on determining their distribution ranges and habitats, so preventing an assessment of the possibility of a risk of extinction (see Raimondo et al., 2009: 2, 9–10).

Author citations for the names of southern African *Kalanchoe* taxa are given in Table 2 and not repeated elsewhere. References to the protologues of the names of the species used in this paper are not provided. The names of the authors of other, non-*FSA Kalanchoe* taxa are given at first mention in the text.

Results and history of conservation assessments of kalanchoes in the *Flora of Southern Africa* region

In the first attempt to assess the threatened plants problem in southern Africa, a state of threat or rarity was assigned to four species of Kalanchoe (Hall et al., 1980: 29) (Table 1). These were K. alticola (Rare), K. crundallii (Vulnerable and declining), K. laciniata (Rare), and K. longiflora (Uncertain whether safe or not). The conservation status of the species in southern Africa, as well as their global conservation status, was given. Although the work towards Hall et al. (1980) is now more than four decades old - it was started in 1974 - this pioneering version of what was then widely referred to as the 'Red Data List of southern African plants' set a useful baseline for further work in subcontinental plant conservation biology research.

Sixteen and eleven years, respectively, after the publication of Hall et al. (1980) and Hall & Veldhuis (1985) (the latter being a partial update for the Fynbos and Karoo Biomes of South Africa), Hilton-Taylor (1996a) presented an updated list of just over 4,000 southern African taxa whose conservation status had been assessed (Table 1). As in the case of Hall et al. (1980), the geographical coverage was the *FSA* region and the conservation status of the species in the countries where they are indigenous, as well as their conservation



Figure 1. *Kalanchoe laciniata* has a restricted distribution range in Namibia in northwestern southern Africa. As currently understood the species has a very wide global distribution range. For the species in Namibia a conservation status of Data Deficient (DDD; see text for a discussion of this category) is retained.



Figure 2. For *Kalanchoe alticola*, which is known from the Barberton Centre of Endemism in the Mpumalanga province of South Africa and the adjacent Eswatini (Swaziland), a conservation status of Data Deficient (DDD; see text for a discussion of this category) is retained.



Figure 3. The conservation status of *Kalanchoe crouchii*, which is endemic to the Wolkberg Centre of Endemism, South Africa, is 'Endangered' (D1).



Figure 5. The conservation status of *Kalanchoe longiflora*, a central-KwaZulu-Natal endemic, is confirmed as 'Vulnerable'.



Figure 4. The conservation status of *Kalanchoe crundallii*, which is endemic to the Soutpansberg Centre of Endemism, Limpopo Province, northern South Africa, is confirmed as 'Rare'.

status overall was given. Hilton-Taylor (1996a: 66) included five species of Kalanchoe, i.e. K. alticola (Insufficiently known in Eswatini; Rare in South Africa; Rare globally), K. crundallii (Rare globally), K. laciniata (Rare in Namibia; not threatened globally), K. longiflora (Insufficiently known in Eswatini), and K. sexangularis (Insufficiently known in Eswatini; not threatened globally). However, K. longiflora does not occur naturally in Eswatini and the species was likely confused with K. sexangularis, which is rather common across its geographical distribution range, likely also in Eswatini. The two updates of Hilton-Taylor (1996a) that were published in quick succession did not suggest any changes to the conservation



Figure 6. The conservation status of *Kalanchoe winteri*, an endemic of the Wolkberg Centre of Endemism, South Africa, is 'Rare'.

status of *Kalanchoe* in southern Africa (Hilton-Taylor, 1996b, 1997).

For the conservation status of plants in southern African countries, Walters & Gillett (1998) (Table 1) drew largely on Hilton-Taylor (1996a, b, 1997) and, at least for Namibia, Loots (2005: 4) noted that conservation assessments included in Walters & Gillett (1998) that were not based on Hilton-Taylor (1996a, b, 1997) are questionable.

In a regional study of the rare and threatened plants of KwaZulu-Natal and neighbouring regions, Scott-Shaw (1999: 54) found that, of the Crassulaceae assessed, three of the six taxa of the genus *Crassula* L. included in the study were 'Data Deficient' and the other three 'LOWER RISK (Least Concern)' (Table 1). Note though that 'Data Deficient' is not a category of threat, nor an indication that a taxon is 'Lower Risk'. Rather, for a Data Deficient species data are lacking on the abundance and/or distribution of the taxon, with the implication that more information is required and that future research may indicate that a threatened classification might be appropriate. In contrast, taxa regarded as 'Lower risk Least Concern' do not qualify as 'Conservation Dependant' or as 'Near Threatened'. Scott-Shaw (1999) did not include any of the eastern seaboard kalanchoes in his work, even though K. longiflora has long been known to have a very limited distribution range in the KwaZulu-Natal Midlands (Hall et al., 1980; Hilton-Taylor, 1996a).

The book entitled Southern African Plant Red Data Lists that was published in 2002 contained information on threatened plants for ten countries, including for the five covered by the FSA project (Table 1, row 6). For these five countries, four kalanchoes, K. laciniata (Craven & Loots, 2002: 88 for Namibia) and K. alticola, K. montana, and K. sexangularis (Dlamini & Dlamini, 2002: 131 for Eswatini) were included, with all the taxa treated as 'Data Deficient'. South African species of Kalanchoe were not included in the work (Victor, 2002).

From the other five non-*FSA* countries included in that study, the following kalanchoes were included on the regional Red Data List.

Mozambique

- 1. *K. fernandesii* Raym.-Hamet (Vulnerable) (Izidine & Bandeira, 2002: 50).
- 2. *K. hametorum* Raym.-Hamet (Lower Risk-Near Threatened) (Izidine & Bandeira, 2002: 54).

Zimbabwe

- 1. *K. velutina* Welw. subsp. *chimanimaniensis* (R.Fern.) R.Fern. (Lower Risk-Near Threatened) (Mapaura & Timberlake, 2002: 173).
- 2. *K. lobata* R.Fern. (Data Deficient) (Mapaura & Timberlake, 2002: 173).
- 3. *K. wildii* Raym.-Hamet (Data Deficient) (Mapaura & Timberlake, 2002: 179).

Loots (2005:121), in the *Red Data Book of Namibian plants*, included *K. laciniata* in Appendix 2, a list of data deficient (DD) taxa. The other three kalanchoes that occur naturally in Namibia (*K. brachyloba*, *K. lanceolata*, and *K. rotundifolia*; Kolberg et al., 1992: 31; Craven et al., 1999: 86) were not considered to be of conservation concern. Raimondo et al. (2009) included only two species, *K. alticola* (DDD) and *K. crundallii* (Rare), under Later, at http://redlist.sanbi.org/genus.php?genus = 3823, thirteen taxa of *Kalanchoe* were recognised as occurring naturally in South Africa, with the only species indigenous to the *FSA* region that does not occur in the country being *K. laciniata*, which in this region is restricted to Namibia.

Since 2009 three new species of Kalanchoe have been described from the FSA region (K. crouchii, K. waterbergensis, and K. winteri), two were reinstated as accepted species (K. decumbens and K. hirta), one was newly recorded for the FSA (K. leblanciae), while the one species excluded from Raimondo et al. (2009) (K. laciniata), indeed occurs in the region, in Namibia only. In addition, K. montana, which was treated as K. luciae subsp. montana by Raimondo et al. (2009), has since been reinstated at species rank.

Discussion

Geographically, southern Africa east of the Drakensberg massif is home to the largest diversity of Kalanchoe species in southern Africa, with this region being host to a total of seventeen (85%) of the twenty kalanchoes thus far recorded for the subcontinent (Smith & Figueiredo, 2021: 208, Table 1). Eight of the twenty indigenous subcontinental species (40% of the southern African kalanchoes) have comparatively narrow distribution ranges that stretch from central KwaZulu-Natal in the south in a broad swathe to the Limpopo River in the north (Smith & Figueiredo, 2021). A further nine species are also indigenous to eastern southern Africa, but have very broad distribution ranges. Two other southern African species are endemic to the north (K. crundallii) and west (K. waterbergensis) of the Drakensberg massif, while one (K. laciniata) occurs in northern Namibia in the far northwest of the FSA region.

Most southern African kalanchoes are very common in their natural habitats and, from a conservation perspective, the majority of the species is of least concern (Table 2).

Southern African kalanchoes of least concern

Based on information available at present, fourteen of the Kalanchoe taxa indigenous to southern Africa are of least concern given their wide geographical distribution ranges and abundance in their natural habitats. These taxa are: K. brachyloba (Smith & Figueiredo, 2017b), K. crenata, K. decumbens, K. hirta, K. lanceolata, K. leblanciae, K. luciae, K. montana, K. neglecta, K. paniculata (Smith & Figueiredo, 2017c), K. rotundifolia, K. sexangularis var. sexangularis (Figueiredo et al., 2016), K. thyrsiflora, and K. waterbergensis. Included among these are all ten Kalanchoe taxa that Raimondo et al. (2009) listed as being of 'Least Concern'.

Southern African kalanchoes of conservation concern

The six southern African species (30% of the total number of indigenous species) of *Kalanchoe* that are of some conservation concern are: (1) *K. alticola*, (2) *K. crouchii*, (3) *K. crundallii*, (4) *K. laciniata*, (5) *K. longiflora*, and (6) *K. winteri*. Five of the six species are southern African endemics, with the discussion of their conservation status therefore also applicable on a world scale. One species, *K. laciniata*, which in southern Africa is restricted to Namibia, is common elsewhere and on a world scale is of Least Concern.

A. Kalanchoe alticola

In Raimondo et al. (2009: 310) *K. alticola* (Figure 2), an endemic of the Barberton Centre of Endemism (Van Wyk & Smith, 2001: 116–119), was listed as 'Data Deficient' because of a lack of precise sites in South Africa and existing collections being 'old'. Its occurrence in Eswatini (at the time as 'Swaziland') was noted as being impacted by the cultivation of sugarcane.

This situation persists. Kalanchoe alticola is a low-growing species that often evades detection in its natural habitat and only a few herbarium specimens have been collected and recorded to date. In terms of both vegetative and reproductive morphology K. alticola resembles K. rotundifolia and can easily be mistaken for the latter species. The main character that differentiates K. alticola from K. rotundifolia is the much longer, rather robust, erect to claw-like sepals. In K. rotundifolia the sepals are usually not significantly developed. It should further be noted that the Barberton area in the Mpumalanga Province, South Africa, adjacent to northwestern Eswatini, from where K. alticola has been recorded, is undergoing very rapid urban expansion.

We at present retain a status of Data Deficient (DDD), i.e. a category that includes well-defined taxa but since their distribution and habitat are too poorly known an assessment of extinction risk cannot be conducted, for *K. alticola*.

B. Kalanchoe crouchii

As understood at present, the recently described *K. crouchii* (Figure 3) has a very limited natural distribution range in South Africa's Mpumalanga Province, in the vicinity of Pilgrim's Rest, a

former gold mining town. This locality falls in the Wolkberg Centre of Endemism (Van Wyk & Smith, 2001: 120–125), within which about thirty succulent plant species, including *K. crouchii*, in at least eight families are endemic.

Kalanchoe crouchii is a grassland species that evades the regular fires that pass through such habitats by growing in shallow, humic soils along dolomite ridges (Smith & Figueiredo, 2018b; Smith et al., 2021b).

Only about 100 plants are known at and near the type locality, which is in very close proximity to forestry activities. Given the apparent natural paucity in populations and individuals, and that plantations for commercial timber, paper and pulp production are encroaching on the known populations, prompt the treatment of *K. crouchii* as Endangered (D1, i.e. less than 250 mature individuals in the global population).

C. Kalanchoe crundallii

In Raimondo et al. (2009: 310) K. crundallii (Figure 4) was listed as 'Rare', with the Extent of Occurrence given as 52km² and the Area of Occurrence as $< 1 \text{km}^2$. The species was then only known from four or five sites with subpopulations being small and considered to be severely fragmented. A slight potential threat of harvesting for horticultural purposes was recorded. However, the species hardly has gardening potential as it has the general, horticulturally unexciting appearance of K. rotundifolia, albeit a somewhat more robust version of that species. Although the flowers of K. crundallii are very different from those of K. rotundifolia, it is additionally shy to flower in cultivation, and acquiring material will only interest completist collectors.

Kalanchoe crundallii, a cloud woodland specialist, is endemic to the Soutpansberg Centre of Endemism in the Limpopo Province in northern South Africa (Van Wyk & Smith, 2001: 134-139: Hahn, 2002, 2017). Based on the known geographical distribution range and the sizes and health of known populations recorded during fieldwork in February and July 2018, Smith & Hahn (2018: 112-117) proposed that a conservation status of 'Rare' (see http://redlist.sanbi.org/redcat. php) be retained for K. crundallii, a view with which we agree. Smith & Hahn (2019: 112-117) argued that, while there might be justification for treating the species as 'Vulnerable', additional information on its geographical distribution range would be required to warrant such a classification. In early- and mid-2018 the observed populations appeared to be stable, with the largest population consisting of more than 1,000 plants.

Smith & Hahn (2019: 117) further noted that future fieldwork should focus on locating previously unrecorded subpopulations that might occur between the western- and eastern-most populations of *K. crundallii*. In addition, long-term monitoring of the restricted habitat of the species within the high-altitude, cloud woodlands should record environmental and climatic trends that may negatively impact on the survival of the species.

D. Kalanchoe laciniata

A number of species of *Kalanchoe* have extraordinarily wide natural geographical distribution ranges. At least three southern African species fall in this category with, especially, *K. laciniata*, *K. lanceolata*, and *K. rotundifolia* having been recorded from southern Africa in the south, northwards well into the northern hemisphere.

In southern Africa, K. laciniata (Figure 1) is only known from a single record collected in bushveld vegetation (Mopane Savanna sensu Giess, 1971: 10, 23, 37-38, 1998: 10-11, 22-23, 35–36) in central Kaokoland, northwestern Namibia, on a weathered dolomite koppie. In this vegetation type Colophospermum mopane (J.Kirk ex Benth.) J.Léonard is the characteristic species. The specimen, Bernard de Winter & Otto A. Leistner 5579, was collected on 21 April 1957 (see South African National Biodiversity Institute, 2021; Tölken, 1985: 66). De Winter and Leistner, then both attached to South Africa's Botanical Research Institute (one of the forerunners of the current South African National Biodiversity Institute), jointly collected in Kaokoveld, Namibia, then South West Africa, from March to May 1957 (Gunn & Codd, 1981: 130). We are not aware of any other specimens of K. laciniata having been collected in southern Africa in the more than sixty years since. Kalanchoe laciniata also occurs in neighbouring south-western Angola, in eastern and north-eastern Africa (see for example Pickering & Darbyshire, 2015: 155–156 and Smith et al., 2019a: 165–169), on the Arabian Peninsula (Collenette, 1985: 190), and in Asia.

Craven & Loots (2002: 88) noted that the area where *De Winter & Leistner* 5579 was collected in 1957 had been transformed. For *K. laciniata* in Namibia we at present retain a status of Data Deficient (DDD), i.e. a category that includes well-defined taxa but since their distribution and habitat are too poorly known, an assessment of extinction risks cannot be conducted.

D. Kalanchoe longiflora

From a conservation perspective, *K. longiflora* (Figure 5) is a distinct paradox as it has a very

small natural geographical distribution range in central KwaZulu-Natal, where it is endemic to the Maputaland-Pondoland Region of Endemism (Van Wyk & Smith, 2001: 82–85), but it is one of the most popular kalanchoes in horticulture in southern Africa (Smith, 2020b). It essentially thrives in virtually any soil type and situation where temperatures do not fall below freezing (Smith, 2020b: 41–43), is very drought-tolerant, and is easily multiplied through stem cuttings (Smith & Figueiredo, 2017d). It has also gained popularity as a garden subject in other parts of the world (see for example Maire, 1976: 255, Figure 85, on the kalanchoes encountered in North Africa).

At present no information exists that would be indicative of a relaxation in the current conservation status of *K. longiflora* as 'Vulnerable'. Given that *K. longiflora* is extremely common in cultivation, chances that it will ever become extinct ('EX') are very slim, but its natural habitat should be monitored to determine any decline in the occurrence of the species.

E. Kalanchoe waterbergensis

Although initially known only from the type locality in the Waterberg, Smith & Figueiredo (2021) and Smith et al. (2021c) have recently shown that in the case of K. waterbergensis, essentially a K. rotundifolia-lookalike species like K. alticola, its distribution range stretches beyond the type locality (see also Peckover, 2020: 190). The Waterberg mountain range was recognised by Van Wyk & Smith (2001: 15) as being a possible Centre of Endemism, but they did not treat it because it could benefit from additional floristic surveys; it falls within the Savanna Biome (Distant, 1892: 77; Rutherford et al., 2006), and virtually exclusively in the Limpopo Province of South Africa. In 2001 the Waterberg, which covers an area of 654,033ha, was recognised as a Biosphere Reserve, i.e., an ecosystem of unusual scientific and natural interest (see also Wadley, 2019).

Kalanchoe waterbergensis is a typical bushveld (savanna) species often growing in the shade of mostly deciduous trees, and frequently in close association with the very widespread *K. paniculata* and *K. rotundifolia*.

We regard *K. waterbergensis* as being of 'Least Concern'.

F. Kalanchoe winteri

At present, the recently described *Kalanchoe winteri* (Figure 6) is known from only three different localities that span a 50km range (Crouch et al., 2016: 220; Smith et al., 2019b: 65–

	Species (countries in which it occurs)	Hall et al. (1980)	Hilton- Taylor (1996a)	Raimondo et al. (2009)	Red list of SA plants ¹	Proposed status
1	<i>K. alticola</i> (South Africa, Eswatini)	Rare	Rare	Data Deficient	Data Deficient	Data Deficient
2	<i>K. crouchii</i> (South Africa)	-	-	-	-	Endangered
3	<i>K. crundallii</i> (South Africa)	Vulnerable	Rare	Rare	Rare	Rare
4	<i>K. laciniata</i> (Namibia)	Rare	Rare	-	-	Data Deficient
5	<i>K. longiflora</i> (South Africa)	Uncertain	_2	-	Vulnerable	Vulnerable
6	<i>K. winteri</i> (South Africa)	-	-	-	-	Rare

¹See http://redlist.sanbi.org/genus.php?genus=3823.

²Treated as 'Insufficiently known' in Eswatini. However, *K. longiflora* does not occur naturally in Eswatini and the species was likely confused with the common and widespread *K. sexangularis*.

Table 3. Chronological comparison of the conservation status of southern African *Kalanchoe* species that have a history of being of conservation concern. A dash indicates that the species was not known at the time or that it does not occur in the country treated in the reference cited.

66). It occurs on quartzite in grassland vegetation, always in fire protected microhabitats on or near rocks. This species is largely restricted to the Wolkberg mountain range which is included in a broader area that has been recognised as the Wolkberg Centre of Endemism.

Given that *K. winteri* is known from a very small geographical area we treat it as 'Rare'.

Conclusion

Of the twenty species of *Kalanchoe* that are indigenous to southern Africa, fourteen are considered to be of 'Least Concern'. These species occur over very wide geographical distribution ranges and are generally abundant where they grow.

Of the six species that are of conservation concern, four have a history of inclusion on Red Lists for South and southern Africa (Table 3), even though one of them, the Namibian *K. laciniata*, has a massive global geographical distribution range. The conservation status of the three other species (*K. alticola*, *K. crundallii*, and *K. longiflora*) with historical conservation assessments and records has remained static over the past more than ten years (Table 3).

Of the Kalanchoe species that were newly

described or reinstated over the past ten years, the conservation status of two, *K. waterbergensis* and *K. decumbens*, is 'Least Concern'. However, the other two recently described species (*K. crouchii* and *K. winteri*) are narrow endemics with very small world populations with a status of 'Endangered' published here for *K. crouchii*, while *K. winteri* is treated as 'Rare'.

With the exception of the Namibian *K. laciniata*, the other five southern African species that are of conservation concern are endemic to the subcontinent, with all of them additionally endemic to recognised Centres or Regions of Endemism. All are restricted to either South Africa, or South Africa and Eswatini (*K. alticola*).

References

- BURGOYNE, P.M., BURROWS, J.E., LÖTTER, M. & VON STADEN, L. (2009) Kalanchoe alticola. DDD.
 In D. RAIMONDO, L. VON STADEN, W. FODEN, J.E. VICTOR, N.A. HELME, R.C. TURNER, D.A. KAMUNDI & P.A. MANYAMA (EDS), Red List of South African Plants 2009. Strelitzia 25. Pretoria, South African National Biodiversity Institute: 310.
- COLLENETTE, S. (1985) An illustrated guide to the flowers of Saudi Arabia. Meteorology and Environmental Protection Administration,

Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. Flora Publication No **1**. Buckhurst Hill, Scorpion Publishing Ltd.

- CRAVEN, P. & LOOTS, S. (2002) Namibia. In J.S. Golding (ed.), Southern African Plant Red Data Lists. Southern African Botanical Diversity Network Report No. 14. Pretoria, Southern African Botanical Diversity Network (SABONET): 61–92.
- CRAVEN, P., MAGGS-KÖLLING, G., MANNHEIMER, C., AUSTALLER, S., BARTSCH, S., KLAASSEN, E., UIRAS, M. & KOLBERG, H. (1999 [November]) A checklist of Namibian plant species. Southern African Botanical Diversity Network Report No. 7. Windhoek and Pretoria, Southern African Botanical Diversity Network (SABONET).
- CROUCH, N.R. & SMITH, G.F. (2009) Kalanchoe crenata subsp. crenata. Crassulaceae. Southern, eastern and tropical Africa. Flowering Plants of Africa 61: 62–68.
- CROUCH, N.R., SMITH, G.F., WALTERS, M. & FIGUEIRE-DO, E. (2016) Kalanchoe winteri Gideon F.Sm., N.R.Crouch & Mich.Walters (Crassulaceae), a new species from the Wolkberg Centre of Endemism, South Africa. Bradleya 34: 217–224. https://doi.org/10.25223/brad.n34.2016.a9
- DISTANT, W.L. (1892) A naturalist in the Transvaal. London, R. H. Porter. https://www. biodiversitylibrary.org/item/20046#page/11/ mode/1up
- DLAMINI, T.S. & DLAMINI, G.M. (2002) Swaziland [Eswatini]. In J.S. Golding (ed.), Southern African Plant Red Data Lists. Southern African Botanical Diversity Network Report No. 14. Pretoria, Southern African Botanical Diversity Network (SABONET): 121–134.
- FIGUEIREDO, E. & SMITH, G.F. (2017) Notes on the discovery and type of Kalanchoe rotundifolia (Haw.) Haw. (Crassulaceae). Bradleya 35: 106– 112. https://doi.org/10.25223/brad.n35.2017.a9
- FIGUEIREDO, E., SMITH, G.F. & CROUCH, N.R. (2016) The taxonomy and type of Kalanchoe sexangularis N.E.Br. (Crassulaceae). Bradleya 34: 92–99. https://doi.org/10.25223/brad.n34.2016.a24
- GIESS, W. (1971 [November]) A preliminary vegetation map of South West Africa. / 'n Voorlopige plantegroeikaart van Suidwes-Afrika. / Eine vorläufige Vegetationskarte von Südwesafrika. Dinteria 4: 5–114, + map.
- GIESS, W. (1998 [January]) A preliminary vegetation map of Namibia. Third revised edition. / 'n Voorlopige plantegroeikaart van Namibië.
 3^{de} Hersiene Uitgawe. / Eine vorläufige Vegetationskarte von Namibia. 3. überarbeitete Ausgabe. Dinteria 4: 1–112, + map.
- GUNN, M. & CODD, L.E.[W.]. (1981) Botanical exploration of southern Africa. An illustrated

history of early botanical literature on the Cape flora. Biographical accounts of the leading plant collectors and their activities in southern Africa from the days of the East India Company until modern times. Cape Town, A.A. Balkema.

- HAHN, N. (2002) Endemic flora of the Soutpansberg. Master of Science thesis, School of Botany and Zoology, Faculty of Science and Agriculture, University of Natal [now University of KwaZulu-Natal], Pietermaritzburg.
- HAHN, N. (2017) Endemic flora of the Soutpansberg, Blouberg and Makgabeng. South African Journal of Botany **113**: 324–336.
- HALL, A.V., DE WINTER M., DE WINTER, B. & VAN OOSTERHOUT, S.A.M. (1980) *Threatened plants* of Southern Africa. South African National Scientific Programmes Report No. **45**. A report of the Committee for Terrestrial Ecosystems, National Programme for Environmental Sciences. Cooperative Scientific Programmes, Council for Scientific and Industrial Research, Pretoria.
- HALL, A.V. & VELDHUIS, H.A. (1985) South African Red Data Book: Plants—Fynbos and Karoo Biomes. South African National Scientific Programmes Report No. 117. A Report of the Committee for Nature Conservation Research, National Programme for Ecosystem Research. Foundation for Research Development, Council for Scientific and Industrial Research, Pretoria.
- HILTON-TAYLOR, C. (1996a) Kalanchoe. Red data list of southern African plants. Strelitzia 4: 66. Pretoria, National Botanical Institute.
- HILTON-TAYLOR, C. (1996b) Red Data List of southern African plants. 1. Corrections and additions. *Bothalia* **26**(2):177–182. https://archive. org/details/bothaliavolume2626unse_0/ page/176/mode/2up
- HILTON-TAYLOR, C. (1997) Red Data List of southern African plants. 2. Corrections and additions. *Bothalia* 27(2): 195–209. https://archive. org/details/bothaliavolume2727unse_0/ page/194/mode/2up
- IUCN. (2012) *IUCN Red List categories and criteria: Version* **3.1**. Second edition. Gland and Cambridge, IUCN.
- IZIDINE, S. & BANDEIRA, S.O. (2002) Mozambique. In J.S. Golding (ed.), Southern African Plant Red Data Lists. Southern African Botanical Diversity Network Report No. 14. Pretoria, Southern African Botanical Diversity Network (SABONET): 43–60.
- KOLBERG, H., GIESS, W., MÜLLER, M.A.N. & STROHBACH, B. (1992 [August]) List of Namibian plant species. *Dinteria* 22: 1–121.

- Loors, S. (2005) *Red Data Book of Namibian plants*. Southern African Botanical Diversity Network Report No. **38**. Pretoria and Windhoek, Southern African Botanical Diversity Network (SABONET).
- MAIRE, R.[C.J.É.]. (1976) Kalanchoe Adanson (1763). Rosales: Crassulaceae. In: P.[A.] QUÉZEL, Flore de l'Afrique de Nord (Maroc, Algérie, Tunisie, Tripolitaine, Cyrénaïque et Sahara). Vol. XIV. Rhoeadales: Cruciferae fin Resedaceae. Sarraceniales: Droseraceae. Rosales: Crassulaceae. Paris, Éditions Paul Lechevalier: 239–241, 251–252, 263.
- MAPAURA, A. & TIMBERLAKE, J.R. (2002) Zimbabwe. In J.S. Golding (ed.), *Southern African Plant Red Data Lists*. Southern African Botanical Diversity Network Report No. **14**. Southern African Botanical Diversity Network (SABONET), Pretoria: 157–182.
- MEYER, N.L., MÖSSMER, M. & SMITH, G.F. (EDS). (1997) *Taxonomic literature of southern African plants*. Strelitzia **5**. Pretoria, National Botanical Institute.
- PECKOVER, R. (2020) Succulents of the Waterberg, Limpopo province, South Africa. *CactusWorld* **38(3)**: 187–193.
- PICKERING, H. & DARBYSHIRE, I. (2015) Crassulaceae. Bryophyllum and Kalanchoe. In: I. DARBYSHIRE, M. KORDOFANI, I. FARAG, R. CANDIGA & H. PICKERING (EDS & COMPS), The plants of South Sudan. An annotated checklist. Pp. 155–156. Kew, Kew Publishing, Royal Botanic Gardens.
- RAIMONDO, D., VON STADEN, L., FODEN, W., VICTOR,
 J.E., HELME, N.A., TURNER, R.C., KAMUNDI, D.A.
 & MANYAMA, P.A. (EDS). (2009) *Red List of South African Plants 2009*. Strelitzia 25. Pretoria,
 South African National Biodiversity Institute.
- RUTHERFORD, M.C., MUCINA, L., LÖTTER, M.C., BREDENKAMP, G.J., SMIT, J.H.L, SCOTT-SHAW, C.R., HOARE, D.B., GOODMAN, P.S., BEZUIDENHOUT, H., SCOTT, L., ELLIS, F., POWRIE, L.W., SIEBERT, F., MOSTERT, T.H., HENNING, B.J., VENTER, C.E., CAMP, K.G.T., SIEBERT, S.J., MATTEWS, W.S., BURROWS, J.E., DOBSON, L., VAN ROOYEN, N., SCHMIDT, E., WINTER, P.J.D., DU PREEZ, P.J., WARD, R.A., WILLIAMSON, S. & HURTER, P.J.H. (2006) Savanna Biome. In L. Mucina & M.C. Rutherford (eds), *The vegetation of South Africa, Lesotho and Swaziland*. Strelitzia **19**. South African National Biodiversity Institute, Pretoria: 438–539.
- SCOTT-SHAW, R. (1999 [November]) Rare and threatened plants of KwaZulu-Natal and neighbouring regions. A plant Red Data Book. Pietermaritzburg, KwaZulu-Natal Nature Conservation Service, Biodiversity Division, Scientific Services Directorate, Cascades.

SMITH, G.F. (2020a) Kalanchoe Adans. subg. Fernandesiae Gideon F.Sm. (Crassulaceae subfam. Kalanchooideae), a new subgenus from southern and south-tropical Africa. Haseltonia 27: 2–7.

https://doi.org/10.2985/026.027.0101

- SMITH, G.F. (2020b) Plant smart. The big easy. Gardening with *Kalanchoe*. *Veld & Flora* **106**(3): 40–43.
- SMITH, G.F. (2021) Reinstatement of Kalanchoe decumbens Compton (Crassulaceae subfam. Kalanchooideae), an endemic species from eastern southern Africa. Bradleya 39: 163–171. https://doi.org/10.25223/brad.n39.2021.a15
- SMITH, G.F., CROUCH, N.R. & FIGUEIREDO, E. (2016) Reinstatement of Kalanchoe montana Compton (Crassulaceae), a distinctive species from the Barberton Center of Endemism, eastern southern Africa. Haseltonia 22: 64–72. https://doi.org/10.2985/026.022.0112
- SMITH, G.F., CROUCH, N.R. & FIGUEIREDO, E. (2021b) Kalanchoe crouchii. Crassulaceae: Kalanchooideae. Mpumalanga, South Africa. Flowering Plants of Africa 67: 60–68, plate 2366.
- SMITH, G.F. & FIGUEIREDO, E. (2017a) Notes on Kalanchoe rotundifolia (Haw.) Haw. (Crassulaceae) in southern Africa: the taxonomy of a species complex. Haseltonia 23: 57–71. https://doi.org/10.2985/026.023.0109
- SMITH, G.F. & FIGUEIREDO, E. (2017b) The taxonomy of Kalanchoe brachyloba Welw. ex Britten (Crassulaceae). Bradleya 35: 2–14. https://doi.org/10.25223/brad.n35.2017.a2
- SMITH, G.F. & FIGUEIREDO, E. (2017c) The identity of Kalanchoe paniculata Harv. (Crassulaceae), a common species in southeastern and southtropical Africa. Haseltonia 23: 72–78. https://doi.org/10.2985/026.023.0110
- SMITH, G.F. & FIGUEIREDO, E. (2017d) The taxonomy of Kalanchoe longiflora Schltr. ex J.M.Wood (Crassulaceae), an endemic of South Africa's Maputaland-Pondoland Region of Endemism. Bradleya 35: 122–128.
- https://doi.org/10.25223/brad.n35.2017.a11 SMITH, G.F. & FIGUEIREDO, E. (2018a) The infrageneric classification and nomenclature of *Kalanchoe* Adans. (Crassulaceae), with special reference to the southern African species. *Bradleya* **36**: 162–172.

https://doi.org/10.25223/brad.n36.2018.a10

SMITH, G.F. & FIGUEIREDO, E. (2018b) Kalanchoe crouchii Gideon F.Sm. & Figueiredo (Crassulaceae), a new species from the dolomites of the Wolkberg Centre of Endemism, Mpumalanga Province, South Africa. Haseltonia 25: 84–90. https://doi.org/10.2985/026.025.0107 SMITH, G.F. & FIGUEIREDO, E. (2021) The floristics and phytogeography of *Kalanchoe* Adans. (Crassulaceae subfam. Kalanchooideae) in the Waterberg Biosphere Reserve, northern South Africa. *Bradleya* **39**: 207–220.

https://doi.org/10.25223/brad.n39.2021.a22

- SMITH, G.F., FIGUEIREDO, E. & CROUCH, N.R. (2018) The taxonomy of Kalanchoe hirta Harv. and K. crenata (Andrews) Haw. (Crassulaceae), and reinstatement of K. hirta as a distinctive, endemic species from southern and southtropical Africa. Haseltonia 24: 40–50. https://doi.org/10.2985/026.024.0107
- SMITH, G.F., FIGUEIREDO, E. & CROUCH, N.R. (2019b) Kalanchoe winteri. Crassulaceae. South Africa. Mozambique. Flowering Plants of Africa 66: 62–69, plate 2348.
- SMITH, G.F., FIGUEIREDO, E. & CROUCH, N.R. (2021c) Expanding the known geographical distribution range of Kalanchoe waterbergensis (Crassulaceae subfam. Kalanchooideae) in northern South Africa. Bradleya **39**: 172–176. https://doi.org/10.25223/brad.n39.2021.a16
- SMITH, G.F., FIGUEIREDO, E. & VAN WYK, A.E. (2019a) Kalanchoe (Crassulaceae) in southern Africa. Classification, biology, and cultivation. London, San Diego, Cambridge and Oxford, Academic Press.
- SMITH, G.F. & HAHN, N. (2019) Kalanchoe crundallii I.Verd. (Crassulaceae), the chameleon kalanchoe, a little-known South African endemic from the Soutpansberg, Limpopo Province, with notes on its conservation status. Bradleya 37: 112–117.
- https://doi.org/10.25223/brad.n37.2019.a5
- SMITH, G.F., SHTEIN, R. & KLEIN, D.-P. (2021a) Kalanchoe subg. Alatae (Crassulaceae subfam. Kalanchooideae), a new rank for K. sect. Alatae. Phytotaxa 509(2): 255–258. https://doi.org/10.11646/phytotaxa.509.2.9
- SOUTH AFRICAN NATIONAL BIODIVERSITY INSTITUTE. (2021) Precis Plant Data. Version 1.0. Occurrence dataset https://doi.org/10.15468/qfcykq accessed via GBIF.org on 2021-01-26. https:// www.gbif.org/occurrence/412334963; decimal latitude: 18.375°; decimal longitude: 13.625°.
- TÖLKEN, H.R. (1985) Crassulaceae. 3166. 4. Kalanchoe. 3166a. 5. Bryophyllum. In O.A. Leistner (ed.), Flora of Southern Africa 14. [Pretoria], Botanical Research Institute, Department of Agriculture and Water Supply: 61–74.
- VAN WYK, A.E. & SMITH, G.F. (2001) Regions of floristic endemism in southern Africa. A review with emphasis on succulents. Hatfield, Umdaus Press.

- VICTOR, J.E. (2002) South Africa. In J.S. Golding (ed.), Southern African Plant Red Data Lists. Southern African Botanical Diversity Network Report No. 14. Pretoria, Southern African Botanical Diversity Network (SABONET): 93– 120.
- VON STADEN, L., BURGOYNE, P.M. & VICTOR, J.E. (2009) Kalanchoe crundallii. Rare. In D. Raimondo, L. von Staden, W. Foden, J.E. Victor, N.A. Helme, R.C. Turner, D.A. Kamundi & P.A. Manyama (eds), Red List of South African Plants 2009. Strelitzia 25. South African National Biodiversity Institute: 310.
- WADLEY, R. (2019) *Waterberg echoes*. Pretoria, Protea Book House.
- WALTER, K.S. & GILLETT, H.J. (EDS). (1998) 1997 IUCN Red List of threatened plants. Compiled by the World Conservation Monitoring Centre, Cambridge, United Kingdom. IUCN. Gland, The World Conservation Union.