UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

The Public Intellectualism of Phyllis Ntantala

By

Zaphesheya Noluthando Dlamini

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirement for the degree

Master of Arts in Political Science

In the Department of Political Science at the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

FACULTY OF HUMANITIES

SUPERVISOR: DR. SN MBETE

MAY 2022

© University of Pretoria

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

DECLARATION

I declare that the dissertation, which I hereby submit for the degree MA (Political Science) at the University of Pretoria is my own words and has not previously been submitted by me for a degree at this or any other tertiary institution.

Signed: Zaphesheya Dlamini

Date: 13 May 2022

© University of Pretoria

ABSTRACT

South African scholars have not substantively engaged with how they have conceptualized *who* the public intellectual is and *where* intellectual activity occurs. The dominance of men in the scholarship is attributed to scholars defining public intellectuals according to the roles and functions they supposedly perform. Consequently, intellectual activity has been confined to the public sphere to be performed by a male figure. This has encouraged the under-exploration of how African/Black women have pursued and enacted public intellectualism. In South Africa, Black women have been erased from genealogical accounts of public intellectualism. Erasure has occurred despite their visibility in the fight against colonialism and apartheid. Black women are public intellectuals, and this is a matter of historical fact and necessity. The study adopts Phyllis Ntantala as its referential subject. Ntantala's public intellectualism is characterized by fluidity between the public and private spheres. She utilized what many regard as private issues to inform her work in the public sphere. Issues confined to the private sphere became her entryway into the public sphere. The ways Ntantala pursued and enacted public intellectualism urges us to reconsider how we might re-envision the public intellectual and what counts as intellectual activity.

© University of Pretoria

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am indebted to my supervisor, Dr. Mbete. Thank you for coming in seven months after I started doing this master. It was a tumultuous period and your guidance, patience got me through. Ngiyabonga for being more than a supervisor and dragging me across the finish line. I have learned so much from you- especially the importance of writing about black women and how to do this with patience and care that is often not given to us.

This study would not have been possible without funding from Andrew Mellon Foundation. It provided invaluable support that allowed me to create time and space to pursue this degree. I am further indebted to the administers, Ms. Thuynsma and Prof Schoeman. Ms. Thuynsma, thank you for the guidance and assistance whenever I came into your office.

I wish to extend my gratitude to the Ntantala-Jordan family for donating Phyllis Ntantala´s papers to the archives at the University of Fort Hare. Without their sacrifice, I would not have the opportunity to meet the wonder that was Phyllis Ntantala.

My heartfelt gratitude to my mother and family. Ngiyabonga boDlamini, Malandela nina boNdaba! I know it was not easy for many of you to believe that I should study further but you came around and rallied behind me.

To all my friends and their family, I am eternally grateful. Zama Zulu for lending me your bed whenever I ran to Durban to sleep. Most importantly, for getting on a plane when I was at my lowest and being a place of refuge. Thank you to your parents for opening their home and feeding me whenever I was in Durban. It meant more than words can express. Kagiso Zwane, for being a sounding broad and travelling down many rabbit holes with me. Austin Malesona, Milisauthando Mbete, Itumeleng Mafatshe and Mpume Nzimande for their words of encouragement whenever we could catch up. And finally, Kulani Bamuza who held my hand with firmness and kindness. Your unshakeable belief that I could finish and annoying questions on how I was progressing, made the last year of the masters manageable. To a lifetime of figuring things out.

And finally, I want to thank myself. This was probably the hardest thing I have had to do. There were so many setbacks. The person who started and ended is vastly different. Over three years, life moved at lightening pace and parts of me were broken. Somehow, I managed to finish. It's been a journey and I'm proud of myself for sticking it through. Now its time to heal what's been broken and start anew.

© University of Pretoria

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

© University of Pretoria

DEDICATION

I dedicate this study to the women and men who have poured into me.

To my late aunt Rose Mkhize. And my mother, grandmothers and great-grandmother; uMaDlamini, umaNyide noMakaMabaso kanye noMaNcube. You scaled mountains, braved winters, and dared to dream long before I came.

This study is also dedicated to my late grandfather, Amon “Shukela” Dlamini whose unwavering affection for his daughter, has been the greatest display of love. Siyakukhumbula mkhulu.

© University of Pretoria

Table of Contents

Chapter One: Introduction 1

1.1. Research Theme 1

1.2. Research Problem and Question 4

1.3. Aims and Objectives 4

1.4. Research Design and Methodology 5

1.5. Theoretical Framework 10

1.6. Chapter Outline and Summary 14

Chapter Two: Literature Review 15

2.1. Introduction 15

2.2. Critiques from Foucault, Gramsci and Said 17

2.3. Studies on Black Public Intellectuals in the United States 19

2.4. The Post-Colonial Public Intellectual 21

2.5. South African Studies on the Black Public Intellectual 23

2.6. The Erasure and Marginalization African Women's Public Intellectualism 27

2.7. Of Being and Knowing: African Women's Public Intellectualism in South Africa . 28

2.8. The Public Intellectual and Private Sphere 31

2.9. Conclusion 34

Chapter Three: Tracing the Influences and Development of Ntantala's Intellectual Trajectory 36

3.1 Introduction 36

3.2 Biological Sketch of Phyllis Ntantala (1920-2016) 37

3.3 Influences and Changes in Intellectual Life 40

3.4. Autobiography and Self-Representation 50

3.5. Conclusion 57

Chapter Four: The Intellectual Thoughts and Contributions of Phyllis Ntantala 59

© University of Pretoria

4.1 Introduction 59

4.2 African Woman Under Apartheid 60

4.3 Black Women's Political and Intellectual Contributions to the Anti-Apartheid Movement. 64

4.4 Ntantala on Bantu Education 66

4.5 Questions of Freedom: The Failure of 1994 72

4.2 Conclusion 77

Chapter Five: Conclusion 80

5.1 Introduction 80

5.2 Thesis Summary 80

5.3 Chapter Summaries 81

5.4 Research Questions and Significant Themes. 83

5.5 Implications for Future Research and Recommendations 84

Bibliography 87

© University of Pretoria

Chapter One: Introduction

1.1.Research Theme

South African scholars have not adequately interrogated how they have conceptualized who the public intellectual is, what counts as intellectual activity and where this activity takes place. Furthermore, they have not substantively engaged with and researched black women's public intellectualism. The dominance of men in the scholarship is attributed to scholars defining public intellectuals according to the roles and functions they supposedly perform (Howe 1984: 303; Collini 2006: 46). Public intellectuals are tasked with detaching from social life to engage in the world of ideas. This enables them to intervene and defend universal values, critique shortcomings of prevailing social order whilst advancing social progress (Benda 1927 [1980]: 27; Mannheim 1936: 143; Shils 1958: 28).

The most widely used definition derives its logic and popularity from the Dreyfus Affair of 1894, where French intellectuals protested the arrest of Jewish military captain Alfred Dreyfus (Fleck, Hess & Lyon 2009: 1). The supporters of Dreyfus, comprising writers, artists, and teachers, were united by the role of "intellect" in the occupations they pursued. Furthermore, intellect set them apart from others in society and endowed them with rights, privileges, and duties (Bauman 1989: 21). The influence of the Dreyfus Affair has led to the importance of "intellect" as defining feature utilized to determine who the public intellectual is and what constitutes intellectual activity. Mannheim (1936: 138) identifies public intellectuals as a distinct class-bound group whose shared interest in intellectual pursuits and engagement with education unifies them beyond class or professional differences. Due to their immersion in education and search for intellect, public intellectuals traverse class lines to voluntarily align with antagonistic classes.

This perspective interjects into the debate two considerable tensions and contradictions. Firstly, public intellectuals´ detachment and submersion in the world of ideas allows them to justify their role in society; however, it alludes to the public intellectual viewing himself in a hierarchical position to the public. Furthermore, submersion into the world of ideas equips them with distance and knowledge to judge society's socio-political and economic conditions (Baert and Booth 2012: 113; Mills 1963: 300-301). It stands in contrast to the universal ideals of freedom, justice, and liberty that public intellectuals are charged with advocating. In addition, passing judgment implies that public intellectuals view themselves as distinctly

© University of Pretoria

placed to render judgement. To render judgment further implies speaking on behalf and in place of others. Consequently, others can be excluded from arenas to speak publicly (Pels 1995: 82).

The second point of contention that arises when education and intellect are used as definitional features is whether public intellectuals should use their knowledge to speak on general matters or remain in their field of specialization. The Dreyfusards' ability to master their primary intellectual disciplines became the springboard from which they launched critiques of other issues (Baert & Booth 2012: 113). Their successors are tasked with acquiring specific knowledge and speaking on universal ideas to the general public (Brouwer & Squires 2003: 204; Posner 2003:23). There is considerable tension when specialist knowledge is viewed as granting authority to speak on political and general issues that the intellectual may not be well-versed in.

With the arrival of modernity, this definitional schema injected into discussions the perception that Dreyfusard's successors have declined and retreated from their duties. However, a noticeable few have been able to resurrect themselves (see Mills 1963; Jacoby 1987, Bauman 1989; Posner 2001, Collini 2006; Ezitoni 2006). When public intellectuals betray their role and functions, they are characterized as rejecting universal truths, adopting partisan positions and reflecting the sectarian interests they seek to curry favour (Benda 1927 [1980]: 70). The most influential of these accounts are found in late capitalist societies. Modernity has induced a decline in public intellectuals, pushing them to utilize their knowledge to secure power and pursue individual interests (Bauman 1987; Gouldner 1979). However, Collini (2006: 249) cautions against proclamations of decline as these are based on comparing 21st-century public intellectuals against a stereotyped account of their counterparts in France. The perception that French intellectuals enjoyed a valorised position as uncontested mediators in public life has been encouraged by their high visibility in political life, especially during political crises. According to Collini (2006: 252), French intellectuals like elsewhere have encountered hostility and anti-intellectualism.

Critical and African/Black studies on public intellectuals have led to the questioning and criticism of the overriding influence of defining intellectuals by their roles and functions. Gramsci (1971) challenges detachment to argue for organic intellectuals who are embedded in the class that has produced them. Fanon (2001) steadfastly locks the public intellectuals in their specialist's knowledge. Unlike their Western counterparts, African/Black public intellectuals do not envision themselves negotiating between detached or committed to their communities.

© University of Pretoria

Even as the public intellectual is embodied and throws his lot with the people, the referential subject for scholars remains masculine. While scholarship on African/Black public intellectuals proposes an alternative way of looking at the role and purpose of the public intellectual, it remains deeply seeped in the language of oppositions (Smith 1999: 69).

These studies share a common perception of what constitutes intellectual activity and where it occurs. The referential subject is male, performing intellectual activities in the public sphere. This has encouraged the under-exploration of how African/Black women have pursued and enacted public intellectualism. In South Africa, Black women have been erased from genealogical accounts of public intellectualism. Erasure has occurred despite their visibility in the fight against colonialism and apartheid. We can attribute this to the foregrounding of masculine figures and existing frameworks not adequately capturing women's participation in and contribution to the world of ideas. Black women are public intellectuals, which is a matter of historical necessity and fact. Their absence from genealogical accounts and scholarship presents a significant gap in the literature.

This study examines Phyllis Ntantala's intellectual contribution to South African socio-political thought to fill in these gaps. Ntantala comes from a family of highly praised public intellectuals, specifically A.C Jordan and Pallo Jordan. These men feature prominently in the intellectual genealogy of the country; however, rarely is Phyllis Ntantala included. This stands in contrast to her documented political activism and intellectual thought. However, to the author’s knowledge, this is the first study conducted that looks at Ntantala’s intellectual ideas and contributions. The study departs from the assumption that Phyllis Ntantala is a public intellectual. However, she is not recognized nor celebrated as one.

At the centre of Ntantala’s work is a concern for Black women, leading to her public intellectualism being characterized by fluidity between the public and private spheres. She utilized what many regard as private issues to inform her work in the public sphere. Issues confined to the private sphere became her entryway into the public sphere. Ntantala demonstrated that issues cannot be restricted to the public or private sphere but are informed by the socio-political or economic orders governing society. The ways Ntantala pursued and enacted public intellectualism urges us to reconsider how we might re-envision the public intellectual and what counts as intellectual activity.

This study rests on and contributes to the literature on South African public intellectuals conducted in the past fifteen years (see Hassim 2004; April 2012; Boswell 2017; Masola 2019;

© University of Pretoria

Masola 2020). This scholarship has been spearheaded by women and driven by a desire to correct the erasure and marginalization of Black women in academic and public discourses on public intellectuals in South Africa. These scholars have interrogated and reclaimed women's intellectual ideas to insert them into the genealogy of public intellectualism. The significance of this study is to contribute from a Political Science perspective to writings about the Black public intellectual. Existing studies have covered immeasurable ground in History, Anthropology and Sociology. Phyllis Ntantala is examined for her political perspectives on socio-economic and political issues in the apartheid and post-apartheid state.

1.2.Research Problem and Question

The question that the study will ask is:

1. *How does Phyllis Ntantala pursue and enact being a public intellectual?*

This question compels us to account for her public intellectualism and the platforms utilized to express her intellectual ideas. As a result, we can interrogate which "public (s)" she engaged with. As Ntantala was an academic, the secondary issue is to engage with the subject matter of her studies. Ntantala centred Black women in her writings, and it will be prudent to examine how she positioned herself vis-a-vis these women.

This leads to the following sub-question, which will ask:

2. *What are Ntantala's intellectual contributions?*

These questions lead us to use Ntantala as an entryway into examining the marginalization and erasure of Black women from discussions about public intellectuals. However, the study does not purport to extrapolate Ntantala's public intellectualism as indicative of all Black women. Black women are not a monolithic group and occupy various subjective positions. Ntantala is studied as an example to demonstrate other ways to think and speak about public intellectuals.

1.3.Aims and Objectives

The study aims to examine and account for Ntantala's public intellectualism. The focus is not on her bibliographical or biographical data. In 2009, Ntantala published an autobiography that

© University of Pretoria

provided a first-hand account of her life. Instead, the focus is on examining her intellectual ideas, tracing their development and maturation for their political content and contributions. The autobiography will be referenced throughout to provide contextual details. The objectives of the study are:

1. *Examine Ntantala's research, fictional and autobiographical writings*
2. *Contextual Ntantala, against the broader social context she writes, pursues being a public intellect.*

1.4.Research Design and Methodology

Research design is the meeting of paradigms, strategies of inquiry and methods. These will determine data collection, analysis, and interpretation (Creswell 2007: 5). Paradigms shape the researcher's perception of ontological, epistemological, reflexive, and methodological questions (Babbie 2012: 31). For this study, the paradigm adopted is emancipatory: intertwining politics into research by undertaking research that seeks to transform lives at the individual and institutional level, speaking on social issues about marginalisation and domination (Creswell 2007: 21). However, research is guided by personal affinities that determine how one views the world and the production of knowledge. It would be prudent then to speak of my affinities at this juncture. As an individual, I came to this topic out of curiosity. I discovered Ntantala in a class about South African politics. It was the rare occasion where work by a Black woman was assigned as required reading. As a graduate student, I embarked on this project because of my commitment to studying and speaking about Black women.

The study is literature-based and uses primary and secondary sources. The primary texts consulted are Ntantala's writing. The breadth and depth of her intellectual corpus is staggering. I have chosen to engage with select works to highlight the dominant themes in this corpus. Nevertheless, this process of selection and categorising is fraught with difficulties and biases. At the beginning of each chapter, the documents used are listed, described, and contextualised. Special attention is paid to her autobiography, *A Life's Mosaic*, to offer contextual information. In addition, the study will make use of personal communication, essays, and research writings by Ntantala. This is to understand and excavate Ntantala's intellectual ideas, the conditions under which she constructed herself as a public intellectual, and the relations she formed with her public.

To access these sources, I visited Ntantala´s archives in 2020 that are stored at the Fort Hare University. After her passing in 2016, the Jordan family donated Ntantala´s documents to the

© University of Pretoria

university´s National Heritage and Cultural Studies Centre. Over a course of a week, with the assistance of the staff, I poured through the documents. Selecting which documents to use and take with was difficult. In the same year, I took a study visit to Leiden University in the Netherlands. The visit was sponsored by the Leiden University- South Africa, University of Pretoria Exchange Scholarship. The visit was informative as the African Studies Centre at Leiden boasts a large catalogue of primary and secondary sources on public intellectuals, and intellectual histories. During my stay, I wrote chapters two and three of the study.

The strategy of inquiry will be qualitative. Qualitative studies are used when the researcher wants to examine and understand the meanings individuals or groups ascribes to social or human problems (Creswell 2009: 4). This design consists of data, which is symbolic, contextually embedded, reflexive, and best understood through the researcher's interpretation. Qualitative studies are suited for research that focuses on meanings produced by individuals and emphasises the importance of capturing complexity (Creswell 2009: 4). There are various research methods deployed within qualitative studies. For this study, narrative analysis is used and supplemented with a close reading of the autobiography to identify experiences and events that significantly contributed to Ntantala's life.

Narrative Analysis

Narrative analysis is concerned with how individuals present accounts of their life experiences (Creswell 2007: 53). Experience is the phenomenon studied; however, our concern is to determine how research participants understand their experiences from a narrative perspective. This is inspired by the view that people tend to share their experiences of daily life and interpret the past through stories (Freeman 2015: 22). Stories are a way for someone to encounter the world and retell the complexities of these encounters. Accompanying this view is the idea that individuals impart meaning to their experiences through interpretation and retelling. Therefore, narrative analysis becomes a way of understanding analysing experiences from a narration by participants (Clandinin, Caine, Lessard & Huber 2016: 15).

Research participants conduct this from a retrospective angle- experiences are drawn together and interrogated into a coherent whole with a definitive beginning, middle and end. Narrative analysis is an interpretative affair for the researcher as we read for meaning from the participant's accounts (Freeman 2015: 29). The account produced by the researcher is one of many, and this renders it provisional.

© University of Pretoria

The term narrative is assigned to text or discourse that focuses on the stories told by individuals and gives an account of an event or action that can be organised chronically (Shacklock & Thorp 2005: 156). There are two types of narrative research. Firstly, analysis of narratives employs a paradigm to create descriptions of themes that can travel across stories and experiences. Secondly, there is narrative analysis, where the collected data is formulated into a story with a plotline (Creswell 2007: 54). Data consists of individuals actions, events and general life occurrences. The second approach emphasises that when individuals make sense of their experiences, they draw a thematic thread- or what is commonly referred to as a plot- to integrate experiences into a coherent structure (Burck 2005: 252). Polkinghorne (1995: 5) calls this process "emploting", whereby experiences take on a narrative structure with their inclusion justified by the view that their occurrences made a significant contribution to or influenced an outcome. For this study, narrative texts have been grouped thematically and organised into a plotline. This is to accommodate the inclusion of autobiographies, which Polkinghorne (1995: 8) argues may not be configured along a single plotline. However, the coherency and integrity of this plot is upheld by the protagonists' presence in all experiences.

The philosophical foundations of narrative analysis are drawn from John Dewey's pragmatic theory on experience. Clandinin and Rosiek (2007: 38) argue that according to Dewy, experience is the "… fundamental ontological category from which all inquiry- narrative or otherwise proceeds." The implications of this are that experience does not need to rest on precognitive knowledge of the world but can be characterised as the progressive interaction of thought with the broader social and material environment. Applying Dewey's view of experience implies that narrative analysis does not aim to produce an accurate description of life independent of research participants but generates a transformative new relationship between participants and their environments.

Three characteristics of narrative analysis emerge when using Dewey's view of experience (Connelly & Clandinin 2006: 479). Firstly, analysis emphasises temporality to describe participants' past, present and future. For the participants, the experiences they emplot as being significant will involve a series of choices. The researcher reviews this selection process and examines how the experiences that participants have chosen to emplot reflect particular behaviours or actions in the present. Secondly, analysis is occupied with personal and social conditions or what Connelly and Clandinin (2006: 480) term "sociality'. These are an individual's emotions or moral dispositions alongside the larger social world that participants inhabit. The social conditions in which participants live has considerable influences on their

© University of Pretoria

experiences. Another element of sociality is the relationship between the researcher and participant- as the former cannot abstract themself from the story and should acknowledge their positionality regarding participants and texts (Clandinin et al. 2016: 15). The last characteristic emphasises the physical and topological boundaries in which the experience and analysis occurs. This directs the researcher to consider how experiences occur within a definitive physical environment. Researchers are directed to focus on the particularities of the participants and the physical space they inhabit. Researchers need to acknowledge the qualities of the space and the impact it may have on their participants (Connelly & Clandinin 2006: 481).

The above characteristics direct our attention to the fact that to make sense of narratives; they should be embedded within the social, historical, and political context in which experiences occur. Thus, we understand that lives are not detached but socially constructed (Shacklock & Thorp 2005: 156). Furthermore, this suggests that narration and interpretation share a dialectical relation. In other words, individuals construct meaning into their lives by telling and retelling their stories. Periods of interpretation feed into the (re)construction process that participants perform to give an account of their lives (Burck 2005: 252).

Autobiography and Narrative Analysis

Ntantala argues that her autobiography is a not "political thesis". She uses her life story as the canvas to write about life and pivotal events in South Africa (Ntantala 2009:4). The autobiography is our point of departure and will be used to configure the narrative data into chronological order to identify pivotal experiences which contributed to her emergence and pursuit of public intellectualism. After that, connections and influences among events are identified to account for actions that Ntantala takes at later stages of her public intellectualism. This follows an approach to conducting narrative analysis outlined by Polkinghorne (1995:18). The autobiography and other texts allow us to demarcate themes that define Ntantala's life story, the form and structure of her public intellectualism and embed these in the broader socio-political and economic context in which these experiences occur.

The autobiography confronts two interrelated issues: self and form. A western and androcentric reading of the autobiography argues that a clear distinction is made between the autobiographer as writer/narrator and the subject of the autobiography (Gooze 1992: 412). As Gusdorf states in his seminal article, the writer/narrator is separate and distinct from the individual who has lived the narrated experiences. This leads to several claims by Gusdorf (1980: 29-41): firstly, autobiography emerges only in cultural landscapes where the consciousness of self is present;

© University of Pretoria

secondly, the autobiography is a mode of expression where the author narrates his history by collecting the scattered elements of his individual life and reassembling them into a cohesive narrative; and lastly, the aim of writing an autobiography is personal justification and salvation. Gusdorf defines the autobiography as an instrument of selfhood. The form and texture of selfhood advanced by Gusdorf (1930: 35) is the unified self: the narrated subject is a knowing being who knows themselves by differentiating themselves from others.

The marginalisation of women from autobiographical studies is attributed to the perception that female autobiographers are more aware of their "otherness" than their male counterparts (Benstock 1991: 9). Women's ideas of selfhood are relational and formed through an awareness of interdependency with others. This is a decentred self and resists the urge to dismember the text from the writer (Benstock 1991:10). This critique of androcentrism opened the room to rethink how selfhood is defined, transcend first-person narratives and include various media - such as articles, journals, diaries - in the genre of autobiography (Gooze 1992: 142).

Post-colonial studies of the autobiography have furthered these critiques by arguing that the decentred nature of selfhood and non-linear chronologies foregrounded among autobiographical writing from the post-colony are shaped by material conditions and relations that emerge from colonialism. Rejecting non-unitary forms of selfhood, the writer can etch out agency and generate capacity to reimage themselves, as well as their communities, after the devasting effects of oppression (Moore-Gilbert 2011: 96). Simek (2016: 88) furthers this critique by stating that we can conceive of the authorial voice in post-colonial autobiographies as the product of wounded subjectivity. Woundedness conveys openness and vulnerability to the structural or historical traumas that the subject has experienced and underscores that the authorial voice is not pre-existing but is permeable to be known and seen.

The emergence of the political autobiography, a term coined by Angela Davis (1974: xvi) to describe the form and structure of her autobiography, further complicated the notion of unified selfhood. The political autobiography transgressed values encoded in western autographical tradition by decentring the individuality and exceptionality of the author (Perkins 2000:9). At the centre of the autobiography is the story of struggle and resistance. The author acts as a conduit for those voiceless to articulate their stories whilst exposing inequality and oppression. However, Davies (1991: 268) argues that African women representing themselves as relational beings to their families and communities forestall the revelation of self until these relations are exposed. This has produced a silencing of the woman-author. Albeit this may reflect broader

© University of Pretoria

social patterns where women are publicly silenced. When reading African women's autobiographies, Davies (1991: 268) urges us to view them as containing a dominant and muted story of the broader group and woman-author. These should be read as co-existing views. Furthermore, the substance and form of selfhood advanced by African women is continuously becoming. Unlike their male counterparts, African women's narrative takes the form of a journey undertaken to complete a task that they left unfinished such as claiming autonomy or caring for a child they left behind (Untehalter 2000: 163). It is a journey that Davies (1991: 278) further attributes as being structured by three modes of self-representation: the self is explained as being synonymous with the political struggle; the self is demonstrated to be in dialogue with family, friends or society; and the self is identified as resisting patriarchal or racial systems.

Narrative analysis in this study is supplemented with a close reading of the autobiography. The aim is to strike a balance between providing an interpretive account of Ntantala's life-gleaned from the autobiography, letters, and research publications- and creating an analysis dynamic enough to capture the texture and complexities of the experiences that coloured her life. On the other hand, there is a necessity to read the autobiography along the themes identified by Davies to further define and engage with the protagonist. By making use of Davies' narrative modes, the experiences and events that Ntantala emplots are further illuminated to determine the public intellectual she became. Lastly, combining narrative analysis with a close reading of an autobiography allows for greater contextualisation of Ntantala in the socio-political, economic, and historical moments in which she narrated her life story.

1.5.Theoretical Framework

Theoretical frameworks are empirical theories of social processes used to understand phenomena (Anfara & Mertz 2015: 16). Researchers draw on frameworks to point towards existing knowledge about phenomena and point to possible new research areas. In addition, frameworks are a lens to view phenomena and guide data collection, analysis, and interpretation of data (Merriam & Tisdell 2016: 85). From this perspective, theoretical frameworks will shape research design and justify the necessity of undertaking research. This occurs because theoretical frameworks spell out the epistemological assumptions underlying methodologies, the propositions and beliefs that shape a study. Furthermore, theoretical frameworks act as containers by demarcating the scope and limits of a study (Collins &

© University of Pretoria

Stockton 2018: 4). In this study, theory is viewed as fundamental to undertaking research and guides all aspects of the research process.

Black feminist theory will be used as the theoretical framework for this study. The decision to use black feminist theory is motivated by two factors. Firstly, Ntantala research writings and intellectual corpus. Ntantala placed rural women at the centre of her public intellectualism and writings. She employed an analytical schema premised on the troika of race, class and gender to determine their experiences living under apartheid. To be clear, Ntantala did not identify her work as being influenced by or articulating the building blocks of what is termed as Black feminist theory. This assessment has been made by reviewing the similarities between Ntantala's approach and the central tenants of Black feminist theory. Secondly, the use of Black feminist theory is motivated by its potential to give us an alternative angle of vision on a topic or data. Public intellectuals have been extensively studied, with existing literature being male-centric. Utilising Black feminist theory to analyse Black women's intellectual activities can provide a different perspective on public intellectuals. Informing this perception is the view that existing frameworks used to study public intellectuals are limiting and cannot adequately capture black women's intellectual contributions and public intellectualism. Black feminist theory is used to excavate their public intellectualism and provide a new angle of looking at who the public intellectual is, what intellectual activity is, and where it occurs.

The depths and borders of Black feminist theory are broad and cannot fit into an agreed-upon canon. For this study, the central tenets will be identified and applied to answer the questions and achieve the study's aims. Firstly, Black feminist theory has emphasised the position of Black women in society, producing two lines of inquiry. On the one hand, attempts have been made to emphasise that women speak from and live within various socio-political and economic locations (Allen 1998; McCall 2005; Hancock 2007). This precludes the universalisation of “women" or "womanhood". The other line of investigation has inspired the creation of a framework to study the lived experiences of Black women. Existing frameworks, fraught with epistemological biases, were viewed as unable to fully capture Black women's experiences (Brewer 1999; Collins 2000; Simien 2004). This has created an interpretive framework commonly emphasising race, gender, and class. Black feminist theorists have focused on understanding the interactions between these concepts and social processes to analyse power and oppression.

© University of Pretoria

The use of race, gender and class to form an interpretative framework began as early as the 20th century. By emphasising the polyvocality of Black women's experiences and the multiple social locations they occupied, Black feminists sought to analyse oppression and exploitation that would centre women. At first, analysis was restricted to an additive formulation using race and gender to demarcate the particularities of Black women's experiences within their communities and contrast their womanhood experiences from white women (Almquist 1975; Beal [1970] 2008). However, as Beal indicates in her formulation of double jeopardy, questions about class were looming during the early days. Beal ([1970] 2008: 166) expanded on the social position of women as being intricately tied to their exploitation within capitalism, which reduces them to surplus labour and whose control over was pivotal to the functioning of capitalist relations. During the same period, other Black feminists began to move away from using formulas that focused on addictive models and dual discrimination focused solely on racism and gender. The Combahee River Collective ([1977] 2017: 17) stated that their approach to analysis viewed systems of oppression as interlocking or simultaneous. Members of the collective stretched analysis beyond race and gender to include sexuality and class to capture their experiences as Black lesbians. Black women's oppression for the collective could not be quantified using single categories, but their interactions produced enmeshment of oppression that created new forms of discrimination.

King (1988) expanded on the collective and emphasised triple jeopardy to surpass addictive formulas, which were viewed as adopting a simple relationship between various discriminations. King (1988:46-47) argued for multiple jeopardy, which did not view each discrimination as having a direct or independent effect but was simultaneous with a multiplicative relationship. Brewer (1999) emphasised the simultaneity of each discrimination and eschewed addictive analyses to foreground the possibility of oppression and struggle existing side-by-side. The popularity of viewing discrimination as existing simultaneously and interlocking gained traction and began to form a central tenet of black feminist theory, with Crenshaw's (1989) studies on discrimination and law. This led to the coinage of the term "intersectionality" built on a metaphor to visualise the simultaneous and interlocking oppression that Black women experienced (Crenshaw 1989: 149). The traffic metaphor emphasised that it was impossible to account for the discrimination faced by Black women by focusing on one analytical category. Black women's lives were a traffic scene where multiple categories collided, interlocked and could not be easily separated to locate the single source of their oppression. On the other hand, Collins (2000: 18) offered the "matrix of domination" to

© University of Pretoria

understand the interlocking and intersecting oppressions at work in Black women's lives. In contrast to Crenshaw, Collins emphasised that the matrix of domination focused on the structural operations of each category, whereas intersectionality was more concerned with subjectivity.

This brief historical account of the developments of Black feminist theory leads to the second tenant of Black feminist theory; how the biases in epistemological frameworks marginalise and erase Black women. From the onset, Black feminists attempted to demonstrate how existing frameworks could not capture or include the experiences of Black women. The desire to render Black women's experiences eligible and knowable through the creation of interpretive frameworks is a testament to the belief that dominant frameworks could not include Black women. Black feminist theory is interventionist as it aims to resist the power relations that dictate knowledge production.

We arrive at the third tenant of Black feminist theory with this last point. Centring Black women's experiences in analysis revealed what is often missed yet significant about how power functions (Nash 2011: 456). This is motivated by the idea that Black women's experiences allow them to produce knowledge from a particulate vantage point. The vantage point demonstrates that power works in their lives in a totalising manner. Furthermore, to argue for a vantage point as the beginning of knowledge production, Black feminist theorists emphasise that all knowledge is situated and partial (Haraway 1988: 538). Although it is important to highlight that knowledge is produced from a specific body and residing in a particular location to resist relativism and positivism, the position of those facing oppression should not be reified.

The use of black feminist theory is applicable in this study for the reasons stated above. Furthermore, Black feminist theory offers an entryway to locating and exploring the positionality or situatedness of Ntantala across multiple places. Although Black feminist theory has often been utilised to demonstrate how Black women's subjectivity is characterised by marginalisation and erasure, efforts have been made to focus on the varied locations they occupy (Collins 2000: 25; Nash 2008: 3). Simply put, black women are not a monolithic group-their experiences are vast, but the overriding influences of social hierarchies and discrimination imbue a common feature in their lives. Ntantala's experiences were different from the women whose lives she documented. The difference in social position amongst other factors -such as the social milieu in which she grew up and the effects of this on shaping political awareness-

© University of Pretoria

will be used to locate Ntantala. Through situating Ntantala, other components of this study are answered.

1.6.Chapter Outline and Summary

The structure and outline of the study is mapped out in this section.

Chapter two follows and is a review of the literature on public intellectuals. The review is integrative and provides an overview of the themes that dominate studies on public intellectuals. The review begins with examining critical perspectives which present the public intellectual as a racialised and classed subject. This public intellectual has rejected disembodiment and is firmly rooted in their class or community. Thereafter, the review examines studies on black women's public intellectualism in South Africa. Finally, the review ends with surveying studies on the public sphere.

Chapter three traces the influences and development of Ntantala's intellectual trajectory. The chapter aims first to contextualize Ntantala in the milieu she was born and lived. This is done by using narrative analysis to determine the themes and events she viewed as having a defining effect in her autobiography, *A Life's Mosaic*. The chapter will outline how these themes and events shaped her public intellectualism. In later parts of the chapter, the relationship Ntantala shared with the women she documented will be examined to determine her position.

Chapter four provides a thematic outline of Ntantala's public intellectualism. Three themes are identified as dominating her public intellectualism: 1. black women, 2. education, 3. liberation and the post-199 dispensation. Attention is paid to how Ntantala operated as an actor within the context of apartheid and post-apartheid state and the strategies she deployed to engage with her public and manoeuvre intellectual spaces. In the end, Ntantala's public intellectualism is shown to be informed by fluidity between the private and public spheres.

Chapter five offers a conclusion to the study by reviewing and consolidating the insights reached in preceding chapters.

© University of Pretoria

Chapter Two: Literature Review

2.1.Introduction

The literature review of this study is integrative and provides a broad overview of the various themes in the literature. The structure of the review begins with an account of critical perspectives from Foucault, Gramsci and Said. Thereafter, the focus shifts to perspectives that present the public intellectual as a racialised, gendered, and classed subject. Under this section, attention is given to post-colonial and South African studies on public intellectuals. This structure mimics the changes in research modes, interests, and paradigms that scholars have adopted when analysing public intellectuals. A shift occurred that moved analysis from the macro-dimensions influencing intellectual life towards understanding the strategies intellectuals deploy to work and manoeuvre their intellectual environment (Baert & Isaac 2012: 204; Fatsis 2018: 217; Camic & Gross 2004: 237-246). Furthermore, the structure of the review is influenced by Ntantala's travels through various historical periods and places. Ntantala begins her journey in colonial Africa, migrates to the U.S., and writes during the decolonial and post-apartheid moments. Therefore, the literature on African/Black public intellectuals in

© University of Pretoria

these varied geographical and temporalities can be used to understand Ntantala's public intellectualism.

Critical and African/Black perspectives analyse the public intellectual through their relations to and position in the public sphere and the historically specific conditions under which the public intellectual arises and exists (Bourdieu 1991: 659). A noticeable feature is their critique of the Dreyfus Affair, the definitional schema it encourages and the normative ideal it imposes. Positioning the intellectual across and within the myriad social relations results in the rejection of disembodiment. As a result, the tensions and contradictions which characterise the Dreyfusards appear resolved. However, these studies continue to think about the public intellectual in oppositional terms, - offering accounts of how they differ from the successors of Dreyfusards. Much of the literature on African/Black public intellectuals is heavily laden with Marxist revolutionary thought and was written during political struggles (Smith 1999: 69). Nevertheless, the referential figure that scholars investigate is overwhelming male.

From these perspectives, the review contends with the valorisation of males and confinement of intellectual activity to the public sphere. Firstly, strategies used to restrict African/Black women's inclusion into genealogical accounts of public intellectualism accounts are examined. African/Black women lie in marginality that should be interrogated. Unlike their white counterparts, African/Black women have not been associated with the sedentary private sphere. Their exclusion from the genealogy of public intellectualism becomes a peculiar matter. Thereafter, the review surveys the bourgeoning literature on studies conducted to correct this erasure and reclaim women's contributions to the country's genealogical accounts of public intellectuals.

The review ends with an account of studies that interrogate how the public sphere has been defined. Critical and African/Black studies on public intellectuals take for granted that intellectuals will engage with a public- this public may even be distinguished along class, ethnic and racial lines. However, the "public" is treated as an autonomous space without linkages to a private sphere. The historical relationship between and how the public and private spheres have been conceptualised is not interrogated. This section of the review interrogates how definitions of the public sphere derive their impetus from disrupting and refuting the liberal type popularised by Habermas (1981). Habermas' account has been challenged to demonstrate its exclusionary and oppressive nature.

© University of Pretoria

2.2.Critiques from Foucault, Gramsci and Said

Foucault, Gramsci, and Said's views on public intellectuals complicate the contradictions and tensions imposed by the Dreyfus Affair, the definitional schema it gave rise to and the normative ideal it imposed. Gramsci (1971) advocates for the organic intellectual who has surrendered his autonomy, chooses to participate actively and advocates for the interests of a group. For Gramsci (1971: 134), public intellectuals become class-bound, with each class stratum organically creating a group of public intellectuals. Gramsci resolves tensions created by detachment. He distinguishes between traditional professional intellectuals and organic intellectuals. Traditional intellectuals derived their authority from past and present class relations. Organic intellectuals are members of social classes who direct the ideas and aspirations of the class from which they originate (Gramsci 1971: 137). Gramsci presents the organic intellectual as being naturally linked with the drudgery and flow of proletarian life. Public intellectuals could only be organic if they are fully immersed in proletarian culture and life, their intellectual activities rooted in specific class struggles and rise in defence of this class's interests (McLaren, Fischman, Serra & Antelo 1998: 25)

Another set of tensions and contradictions that Gramsci resolves are those presented by the hierarchical posturing of public intellectuals. Gramsci states that all men exhibit a minimum of creative intellectual activity in their work. This leads to the often-repeated dictum: "All men are intellectuals… but not all men have in society the function of intellectuals" (Gramsci 1971: 140). Distinguishing between work that fulfils the function of intellectual, Gramsci (1971: 140) proposes that it should be measured against the effort to which this work is directed- either to "intellectual elaboration" or "muscular-nervousness". Gramsci's (1971: 139) contribution to studying public intellectuals is to place them against the network of social relations in which intellectual activity is carried out. Resultantly, the historical processes that have influenced the public intellectual's formation are discerned. This demystifies the notion of public intellectuals as seemingly benign figures who derive their authority from intellectual contemplation.

Foucault complicates the tensions caused by using specialist knowledge to justify speaking on general issues by confining public intellectuals to their area of expertise. As a specialist, the public intellectual pursues and articulates ideas within her field of specialisation. Foucault (1977: 207) rejects the notion of universal intellectual as championed by Benda (1927 [1980]) by arguing that intellectuals have become agents within systems of power- the very notion of an intellectual taking on responsibility for social consciousness forms part of the system. This

© University of Pretoria

view is informed by the perspective that people no longer require the public intellectuals to offer representations of truth or consciousness (Foucault 1977: 208). Foucault justifies this claim by arguing that values have been touched and appropriated by power. The public intellectual task is to rebel against the forms of power which turn him into an instrument to pursue total truth and knowledge (Foucault 1977: 208). Foucault's idea strikes a similar chord with Benda's rejection of truth being instrumentalised as an end unto itself. However, Foucault rejects the possibility of truth existing in any other form but to reinforce regimes of domination. Nevertheless, Foucault complicates the idea of an intellectual stuck between the sways of generality and expertise by locking them in their field of specialisation.

Gramsci and Foucault share a common belief in the utility of praxis. For Gramsci (1971:142), the organic intellectual cannot be satisfied with being an orator, moving people to feelings and passions through his eloquence but should strive to be an active participant in practical life. This calls for the public intellectual to pursue a state of praxis and facilitates the emergence of a politics geared towards liberation- or what Gramsci (1971: 142) terms as "…humanistic conception of history". The joining of theory and practice should be read against Gramsci desire to project the organic intellectual and his work past the separation that occurred between the intellectual and vanguard party (McLaren et al. 1998: 25-26). Unlike his traditional counterpart, the organic intellectual does not need to be subsumed under the revolutionary party. On the contrary, they could lend a hand in the organisation of the workers and play a more political role within the party. This results in the meeting of theory and practice.

Foucault's understanding of praxis is mediated by his claim of knowledge as a product of human statements and is validated within a material framework patterned by discourses. This is a rejection of Enlightenment epistemology that links knowledge acquisition to emancipation (Schneck 1987: 19). Knowledge for Foucault is irreducibly tied to the production of power, which opens the possibility of public intellectuals becoming agents in the system of power. To overcome this, Foucault argues for the public intellectual to resist being made an instrument of power and make visible the operations of power- not from a safe distance but with those who are struggling against it. Theory, in this instance, is actional as it becomes practice and functions not to serve itself (Foucault 1977: 207-208). Foucault calls upon the public intellectual not to offer interpretations of theory and power but to work alongside those struggling against power. We are left to consider if this shared belief in praxis encourages their efforts to mediate some of the tensions and contradictions they address.

© University of Pretoria

The last critique resolves the tensions induced by modernity. Speaking truth to power becomes the linchpin that secures intellectuals against decline. Initially proposed by Benda (1927 [1980]) and popularised by Jacoby (1987) and Said (1994), the idea gains currency as public intellectuals were viewed as betraying their roles and functions. For Said (1994: 89-94), speaking truth to power requires more than returning to the defence of universal truth. Truths are constructs, and this precludes the existence of universals. However, he argues that public intellectuals should uphold justice and fairness. Resultantly, a more balanced representation of social life emerges, and situations are evaluated according to accessible information and moral principles such as "…peace, reconciliation, abatement of suffering…" (Said 1996: 99). This solution is premised on the idea that although truths may no longer be universal, values can be. For the public intellectual to speak truth to power requires that they uphold these values whilst being cognizant of the differences between nations and individuals (Said 1996: 94). In advocating for the pursuit of values, Said cautions against a persisting trend among public intellectuals of toeing the line and shying away from their responsibilities. This can induce malaise and is influenced by the public intellectual's desire to gain inclusion into the mainstream (Said 1996: 100). Said proposes is a bulwark against decline and retreat- it becomes a clarion call for public intellectuals to supersede their roles and purpose.

2.3.Studies on Black Public Intellectuals in the United States

The literature reviewed here speaks to studies conducted about Black public intellectuals in the United States (U.S). "Black", in this instance, denotes a political category. Similar to Gramsci, Foucault and Said, these studies transcend the tensions and contradictions imposed by a definitional schema that draws its logic from the Dreyfus Affair and the normative ideal it enforces. Furthermore, as these studies present a racialised public intellectual, this adds layers to the above critiques, focusing primarily on class. A noticeable feature of this literature is the facticity of race and its bearing on the public intellectual. Race calls into question the Black public intellectual's ability to become a part of the broader intellectual class.

Black public intellectuals closely identify with their ethnic or racial group; resultantly, they are viewed as embedded within and reflect the socio-economic conditions of their communities. Writing during the civil rights era, Record (1954: 232) argues that in comparison to the white intellectual, the negro intellectual's grievance and preoccupation remains consistent and align with his identity as a member of a racially suppressed minority. The facticity of race imposes multiple constraints. Chief among these is that although he may pursue public intellectualism,

© University of Pretoria

awarded a measure of prestige within the Black community, however, to the greater intellectual community, he will always be regarded as a "Black writer" or "Black artist" or "Black professor" (Record 1954: 233). His community and others see the Black public intellectual entangled in his ethnic and racial affiliations.

Banks and Jewell (1995: 83) study on the effects of ethnic and racial attachment on Black public intellectuals working in academia in the U.S. concludes that many believe that they have a responsibility to champion the interests of their communities in intellectual work. For these intellectuals, Blackness is ".... sadly total, encompassing, and central to being a Black intellectual…" (Banks and Jewell 1995: 84). This view contradicts the idea of the intellectual community existing as a subsector in a society bound by a commitment to universalism and abstract ideals capable of transcending racial and ethnic attachments (Banks & Jewell 1995: 83). The very existence of Black public intellectuals who remain attached to their ethnic and racial affiliations questions the effectiveness and the validity of universalism in the intellectual community (Banks & Jewell 1995: 79). Their findings reveal that Black public intellectuals regarded members of dominant racial groups as the only ones capable of assuming a posture of detachment. Consequently, the intellectual community views Black public intellectuals as going against normative thinking and expectations by maintaining their racial and ethnic affiliations.

Even as Black public intellectuals choose to be embedded in their racial or ethnic affiliations, their relationship with the community is tenuous. West (1985:113) describes this relationship as being coloured by feelings of deep mistrust and suspicion. Multiple factors influence this; the absence of infrastructure to encourage and support the engagement of intellectual activity and the arrogant and self-righteous nature of intellectuals towards the Black community (West 1985: 113-114). At the extreme end, this can result in the view that Black public intellectuals engage for social and material gain. West acknowledges that many Black public intellectuals seek material wealth and social prestige in their intellectual pursuits, but this is influenced by the constraints placed on Black upward mobility. Black public intellectuals who succeed in breaking into the mainstream -largely white-dominated intellectual spaces- often adopt paradigms and research programmes detrimental to the Black community. The cost of success is estrangement from their community.

Suppose we were to utilise Gramsci's approach to analysing the public intellectual. In that case, it becomes clear that social relations premised on racial domination have determined and

© University of Pretoria

coloured how intellectual activity is conducted. It has produced a close affinity between Black public intellectuals and their communities whilst breeding mistrust and establishing hierarchical posturing by Black public intellectuals. Embedding the Black public intellectual within his community and demanding that they reflect its public's socio-economic conditions disrupts the tensions and contradictions such as detachment vs free-floating. For Black public intellectuals, detachment is a privilege reserved for dominant racial groups. It seems that race compels Black public intellectuals to identify with their communities. The facticity of race propels Black public intellectuals to be organic intellectuals. However, for the reasons outlined by West, these very same affiliations tear apart or strain the relationship between the Black public intellectual and their community.

2.4.The Post-Colonial Public Intellectual

The literature from post-colonial public intellectuals furthers the critiques presented by Foucault, Gramsci and Said. The post-colonial public intellectual is described as "African" to denote a geographical categorisation. Public intellectuals in the post-colonial state are depicted as needing to undergo fundamental change during the struggle for independence by forging closer links with the people, acting as their mouthpiece and offering alternative conceptions of freedom. This is informed by the perception that public intellectuals during colonialism were mimicry of their Western counterparts and intellectually dependent on Western traditions (Fanon 2001; Mazrui 2005; Mkandawire 2005; Ntuli & Smit 1999). However, once independence has been achieved, the intimate links between the public intellectual and the people- especially those shared with the political class-, produce contradictory and adverse effects on the intellectual's ability to fulfil their roles and functions (Neogy 1970 [2017]; Sono 1994; Tendi 2008; Gumede and Dikeni 2008; Sithole 2012). It must be noted that as much as these studies provide break and further advance critiques, there is the noticeable absence of studies on African women as public intellectuals.

Fanon (2001: 36) describes the process that the public intellectual must undergo to change their intellectual disposition. He argues that it is akin to an ontological rupture transforming the colonised intellectual into the native intellectual. The colonised intellectual transition occurs in three phases. The first phase represents his assimilation to the culture of colonial masters, where the colonised intellectual draws inspiration from Europe. The second phase is marked by the intellectual questioning and remembering who he is. This phase is characterised by immersion into the people and disregarding Western values such as egotism, pride and

© University of Pretoria

individualism (Fanon 2001: 175). Immersion is necessary because an intellectual not aligned with the people is rootless and a free-floating subject. However, the intellectual is not part of the people, has only attained "exterior relations" with them, and is satisfied with merely recalling their lives (Fanon 2001: 179).

Fanon (2001:179) calls the intellectual's last destination the "fighting stage". The native intellectual disavows any desire to offer the people an honoured place in his system and chooses to produce combative literature that will speak to and reveal the nation's heart. Fanon (2001:179) claims that the native intellectual becomes the mouthpiece of the people but will not offer representations of the nation's culture. The native intellectual undergoes a process of transformation that results in him creating space for the people to exercise freedom and agency. Fanon (2001: 183) characterises this as ushering the people towards the "zone of occult instability". The colonial intellectual undergoes a redemptive journey akin to an ontological rupture. However, Fanon does not account for the possibility that the people's perception of freedom may differ from those of the native intellectuals' (Maldonado-Torres 2005: 160).

The demand placed on the native intellectual to identify with the people produces contradictory and adverse effects post-independence. Neogy (1970 [2017]: 50) gives a historical account of the African intellectual from colonialism, independence and post-independence. He argues that public intellectuals adopted a position of ambiguity during independence and preferred not to articulate their criticism against the political class publicly. They chose to voice their disagreement through the interpersonal relationships shared with the political class. Post-independence, the shift towards authoritarian rule by the political class demanded that public intellectuals clearly define and articulate their criticism. Failure to do so included malaise, with many condemned to silence. However, those who voiced their criticism faced police brutality and punishment (Neogy 1970 [2017: 53). In the post-colonial state, the relationship between public intellectuals and the political class is characterised by distrust and disdain.

Mkandawire (2005) offers an alternative analysis of the journey that African public intellectuals have undertaken at the end of colonial occupation. He casts doubt on popular sentiments claiming that African public intellectuals were silenced, aloof, or detached. Mkandawire (2005: 38) argues that the shift towards authoritarian rule resulted in the public space - which could have facilitated the growth of public intellectuals - being occupied or destroyed. African public intellectuals could not run to the ivory tower, nor could they become detached and adopt self-imposed marginalisation. Some went into exile or became complicit

© University of Pretoria

with the ruling class. However, a group chose to fight and often met their death or faced imprisonment (Mkandawire 2005: 38). He argues that relations between African public intellectuals and the state were not characterised by detachment. On the contrary, African public intellectuals held a state-centric focus and viewed the state as an institution that could drive development and nation-building (Mkandawire 2005: 42). African public intellectuals had a steadfast desire to become organic intellectuals, which led them to adopt a state-centric view and direct their energies towards the nationalist project (Mkandawire 2005: 42). Consequently, a trend towards "entryism" arose as African public intellectuals sought to become part of state machinery to influence its policies and ideological direction (Mkandawire 2005: 35).

According to Tendi (2008: 395), African public intellectuals' state-centric focus resulted in them losing credibility and their ability to claim neutrality. However, entryism is not restricted to the state and extends to opposition parties and non-government organisations (NGOs). The growing demand for African public intellectuals to act as consultants by foreign donors and NGO's opened new public spaces; however, these developments coincided with a shift towards the compradorization of intellectual work. African public intellectuals commercialised their work and began to engineer demand for intellectual labour by exaggerating failures and bending analysis to maintain international donors' interests (Tendi 2008: 391).

2.5.South African Studies on the Black Public Intellectual

In South Africa, the literature on Black public intellectuals is characterised by several features. Black in this instance denotes racial categorisation. Firstly, there is the dominance of men. Few studies have been conducted which take up women as their subject of inquiry. Secondly, considerable attention is given to Black public intellectuals during apartheid and the challenges this period brought on the intellectual. The totalising nature of racial oppression necessitated that this intellectual undertake a similar journey as their post-colonial counterpart. Thirdly, these studies tackle dissent and autonomy of the intellectual in the post-apartheid state. As many intellectuals joined the vanguard party to fight racial oppression, they faced similar challenges as their post-colonial counterparts. They must mediate their relations with a ruling political class they developed close affiliations with during apartheid.

Male figures dominate studies on public intellectuals. A few examples illustrate this. Ndletyana's (2008) monograph of Black intellectuals in the 20th century is composed only of men. Sono (1994) mentions only one woman - Mamphela Ramaphele - as one of the few

© University of Pretoria

exceptions of Black public intellectualism in the country. Sithole (2012) focuses on three Black men to investigate the influence of Fanon and Black Consciousness in the formation of public intellectualism in the post-apartheid state. This focus on men has been tempered by the noticeable contributions of April's (2012) study on Charlotte Manye Maxeke, Sanders' (2002) brief examination of Olive Schreiner's intellectual work, Hassim's (2011) study on feminist intellectuals in the post-apartheid era, Masola's (2019) examination of the politics of the Black printing press in the 1920s through intellectual thought of Charlotte Maxeke and Nontsizi Mgqwetho.

The totalising nature of apartheid posed considerable demands for Black public intellectuals. The intellectual needed to undergo a transformative journey due to racial oppression, becoming embedded in their people and recognising the limitations they encounter (Sono 1994; Sanders 2002; Dikeni & Gumede 2011). Biko (1987: 28) states that apartheid led to total contamination of the self and, by extension, the Black public intellectual. Apartheid locked one into an intimate dance and infiltrated subject formation. Resultantly, Biko's intellectual development and social relations have been formed under the institutionalisation of apartheid. This awareness presents an opportunity to outgrow the lessons and behaviours that the system has instilled. The task that Biko (1987: 29) outlines is that Black men need to be "…remind[ed] of his complicity in the crime of allowing himself to be used and therefore letting evil reign supreme in the country of his birth. This is what we mean by an inward-looking process". Biko (1987: 28) does not perform this task from a detached perspective. On the contrary, it occurs from the body he occupies. This is a rejection of disembodiment as being fundamental to the pursuit of public intellectualism. Apartheid may have intended to foster social separateness, but it filtered into every aspect of daily life and caged the public intellectual into a racialised body and mind through its institutionalisation.

Suppose the Black public intellectual needs to grow aware of the contaminating nature of apartheid to become embedded in their people and operate from a place of embodiment. In that case, the vanguard party becomes the ideal vehicle for that. Following Gramsci, Suttner argues that the label "intellectual" can be applied to political parties and, by extension, to the national liberation movement. The focus here is on the party as an institution that creates knowledge rather than individuals. The party is the "collective organic intellectual" whose function is directive and organisational (Suttner 2005: 119). The liberation movement fulfilled an intellectual role by connecting a variety of intellectuals to create and communicate a populist vision that explains colonial and, later on, apartheid conquest by elucidating its nuances

© University of Pretoria

(2005:120). Under the banner of the party, these intellectuals were able to provide the people with tools to understand and escape the dehumanisation of apartheid (Suttner 2005: 121). For example, Suttner (2005: 127) illustrates how the early communist party decided to address the national question, which required that they appeal to the majority. Initially, the party trained recruits by publishing newspapers in African languages. Soon they were confronted by issues of illiteracy. The party started night schools to deal with this and foster ideological coherency, with many of the students becoming acquainted with written texts over time. For Suttner (2005: 130), the early communist schools performed the role of a collective intellectual by communicating a vision and inculcating values into cadres who were leaders of the movement. Suttner presents apartheid as a difficult environment for intellectual development but demonstrates that the liberation did cultivate its own class of intellectuals.

The vanguard party growing its class of organic intellectuals has significant ramifications in the post-apartheid state. Again, this literature strikes similar tones to those on the post-colonial intellectual. The Black public intellectual is now faced with negotiating a relationship with the Black government. This leads to a strong focus on the intellectual's autonomy and scope for dissent. These discussions take on various forms. Ndlovu-Gatsheni (2008:69) traces the establishment and eventual disintegration of the Native Club- an organisation of self-professed "native intellectuals". Its participants claimed to have formed the club in response to the decline of the native intellectual. Furthermore, they argued that Black intellectuals had to be mobilised due to the mental paralysis that many experienced during apartheid. The Native Club would be a platform for the group to undergo psychological decolonisation to cure themselves of this paralysis (Ndlovu-Gatsheni 2008: 71). The Native Club's close links to the Mbeki administration resulted in the widespread view that the club was another channel for Black intellectuals to gain proximity to power. The middle-class composition of its members substantiated this criticism (Ndlovu-Gatsheni 2008: 76).

On the other hand, Gumede and Dikeni (2011:6) lament the statist outlook of Black public intellectuals. With the advent of democracy, intellectuals joined the government or civil service, resulting in intellectual discourse being dominated by the state, leaving little room for grassroots organisations or civil society participation. Gumede and Dikeni (2011:2) identify the Mbeki administration as creating a polarised intellectual space with intolerance for differing opinions and demands for loyalty to secure job appointments and tenders. As a result, those lone intellectuals who voiced their dissent were marginalised and retreated to working for grassroots organisations.

© University of Pretoria

Sithole (2012) and Ally (2005) bring discussions on intellectual autonomy and dissent into sharper focus. Sithole's (2012) contribution is to provide a nuanced approach to understanding power and intellectual autonomy. Sithole (2012: 120) states that intellectual autonomy is always viewed as being oppositional to and affronted by political power. However, autonomy and independence are not analysed against the various institution's public intellectuals are affiliated with or work for. Public intellectuals cannot claim independence because they seek to curry the favour of the state, white capital or act in the interest of popular ideologies. For example, Black public intellectuals are aligned or employed by various think tankers (Sithole 2012: 121). These institutions, with various ideological values, are engaged with the market economy and operate as a collective to provide a platform for Black public intellectuals. According to Sithole (2012: 123), the notion of autonomy and independence becomes blurred when we analyse the various relations that the public intellectual shares with multiple vectors of power outside the state. The idea of free-floating and autonomous intellectual then becomes a liberal bourgeois ideal. Sithole (2012:125) proposes that we view interactions between public intellectuals and power beyond their confrontations with the state and its machinery. Authority in its various manifestations should be analysed to resist criticising at the most visible and organised political institutions.

Sithole (2012) adopts an approach followed by Gramsci (1971), Foucault (1977) and Karabel (1996). He seeks to understand the public intellectual by identifying their positionality concerning social and class struggles. The analysis is expanded to accommodate other relations that the public intellectual may share. Ally (2005: 67) argues that the relationship between intellectuals and the state should not be viewed as occupying two extreme polarities- "ideological subservience" or "moralistic resistance". The shift between these two is mediated by oppositional intellectualism- or speaking truth to power- where the public intellectual frees themselves from the constraints exerted by power. Ally (2005: 71) argues that oppositional intellectualism does not necessitate the rejection of power and should be divorced from being associated with the state. Power operates in all social spheres, between actors who make political claims and redefine politics. Using this definition, Ally (2005: 73) critiques the emergence of Marxist oppositional intellectualism as an attempt by white intellectuals and students to respond to the radical and highly racial politics of the Black Consciousness Movement, which began to exclude them. Far from being a rejection of power, Ally (2005: 80) argues that Marxist oppositional intellectualism was a way for white English-speaking academics to preserve their political and intellectual roles.

© University of Pretoria

Post-colonial and South African studies on public intellectuals are bound by their attempt to present a contrasting picture of the intellectual. The multiple narratives that emerge give an account of how the intellectual is fashioned into being through the various social relations in which they are embedded. This is a public intellectual who is embodied and firmly aligns with his people. However, the journey to this state appears to occur in reverse to the one walked by public intellectuals of high capitalist societies in Bauman and Gouldner's accounts. Fanon's and Biko's accounts point to the intellectual as emerging from a state of decay. This is an indictment on western intellectual traditions and the racial oppression it imposed. They begin their journey from the interstices of this system and venture into a rupture. What occurs is a dialogical and intertextual process as they may be using the very same intellectual traditions to wage their war. This calls into question the native intellectuals' activities and his ability to articulate a vision of freedom that aligns with the people. Furthermore, another set of challenges arose with the arrival of democracy. Intellectuals wrestle with the relationship they should lead when the vanguard party controls the state. The focus here shifts to autonomy and scope to wage dissent. Nevertheless, as studies demonstrate, power manifests in many forms, and the public intellectual can manipulate the normative aspects of speaking truth to power in their bid to wrestle control.

2.6.The Erasure and Marginalization Black Women's Public Intellectualism

Studies on black public intellectuals in South Africa are dominated by men. This reflects trends elsewhere, but South African academics have conducted research to correct this in the past decade. This study rests on the shoulders of this scholarship. Spearheaded by women, this scholarship has covered considerable ground to rewrite Black women's intellectual ideas and contributions into genealogical accounts. Black in this instance denotes racial categorization. Before venturing to explore this scholarship, it is prudent to demonstrate how Black women's public intellectualism has been erased and marginalized. The tactics identified as contributing to their exclusion in genealogical accounts and academic discussions about public intellectuals.

Black women's erasure and exclusion can be attributed to privileging male subjects and curtailing intellectual activity to the public sphere. Fraser (1990:61) argues that the erasure of women from the public sphere reflects class and gender-biased notions of publicity. This definition can be expanded to include race and demonstrates that within the margins of exclusion, power relations have led to the erasure of Black women from the public sphere. Despite their hypervisibility in public discourse, this has occurred and can be attributed to three

© University of Pretoria

factors. Firstly, there is a lack of willingness to engage with the ideas that Black women produce. Gender and sexual politics that envelope women are rehashed to showcase how these inhibit them from emerging as public intellectuals. Secondly, existing frameworks cannot adequately capture women's participation in and contribution to the world of ideas (Masola 2019: 65). Lastly, sexist socialization has taught Black women that intellectual work is secondary to reproductive labour. A passionate pursuit of intellectual work is seen as betraying familial and communal relations (hooks 1991: 156). Women find it difficult to pursue intellectual life as they feel torn, potentially cast off from their communities and families.

The confluence of racial and sexist oppression that Black women face is at the crux of these tactics. Unlike their white counterparts, these vectors of oppression have robbed Black women of the luxury of being private thinkers. The confluence of racial and sexist oppression has meant that Black women could not access institutions of higher learning and were not granted legal or social protection of the private sphere that white women enjoy (Cooper 2017: 15). Magaziner (2011: 57) argues that for Black women, the domestic realm is a deeply politicized sphere due to the demands of the liberation movements, which confined women's activism to their roles as mothers. As a result, the domestic sphere was routinely politicized by nationalists as an example of the colonial or apartheid state´s encroachment in the lives of Black families (McClintock 1993: 66). Collins (2000:256) reflects on the consequences of this and argues that because Black women have been denied access to the podium, they have spent time theorizing alternative conceptualizations of community and liberation. The first step is to speak on Black women's marginality and elucidate how gender politics have erased their public intellectualism. The next and most crucial step is to speak on and illuminate their public intellectualism.

2.7.Of Being and Knowing: Black Women's Public Intellectualism in South Africa

The literature on Black women's intellectual ideas and contributions details the effects of sexism and racial domination. Black women were denied access to the podium and, in some cases, higher institutions of learning. However, in response, they have developed alternative ways of knowing that craft independent self-definitions and self-valuations (Collins 2002: 328). These alternative ways have seen Black women utilise oral and written modes of expression, including fiction, poems, and song alongside non-fictional or academic texts (Daymond et al. 2003: xviii). These modes of expression are not typically regarded as representing intellectual work. However, Black women articulate their public intellectualism

© University of Pretoria

through these modes, complicating and extending our analysis beyond racial and class-based questions. Scholars have explored these modes to recover black women's intellectual ideas and contributions. These studies are united by the revelation that these public intellectuals have endeavoured to bring the concerns of Black women into the public sphere. In other words, these public intellectuals have illuminated the contours of the public sphere to showcase and challenge their exclusion.

April's (2012: 18-20) study on Charlotte Maxeke falls under the ambit of feminist histography as she is concerned with demarcating women's theoretical and political discourses from the meta-narratives of the nationalist movement (April 2012: 18-20). April (2012: 126) argues that Maxeke's intellectual ideas rest on the theorisation of everyday life and the domestic sphere. Maxeke brought into focus what was rendered unintelligible and invisible components of Black women's lives into the politics of the 20th century and nationalist discourse. Maxeke critiques the collusion of the state with traditional institutions, which lead to the gendering of native life (April 2012: 27). Furthermore, Maxeke dismissed the notion that colonialism and Christianity freed b\Black women from the constraints and savagery of pre-colonial life. These discussions, according to Maxeke, endorsed a nefarious agenda that promoted women's traditional roles to the benefit of the state and male-dominated nationalist movement. Through this critique and drawing the everyday and ordinary into public discourse, April (2012: 29) argues that Maxeke was able to bring about theoretical shifts into debates regarding the native question and native life.

Masola (2019) conducts a study on Maxeke and Nontsizi Mgqwetho that centres around the politics of the black printing press in the 1920s. Masola (2019: 1) argues that far from being silent, these Black women were robustly involved in the politics of the day. Masola states that their textual insertion into political discourse through the Black printing press challenges the notion of the public-private divide. Furthermore, Masola (2019: 11) demonstrates that these women transcended this divide by directly responding and debating opinions in leading newspapers like *Abantu-Batho* and *Umeteteli waBantu*. Maxeke and Mgqwetho, through their letters and poetry, respectively, offered differing opinions and cultivated alternative discourse. In a series of poems, Mgqwetho bemoaned what she perceived as the South African Native National Congress (SANNC) failure during the 1920s to rid itself of fractional battles and represent the people's aspirations (Masola 2019:9). One poem, "Imbongikazi noAbantu-Batho", addressed the editor of *Abantu Batho* for his misuse of the periodical to build up fractional support. Mgqwetho offered her views on leadership as divinely ordained, and a

© University of Pretoria

position laboured for (Masola 2019: 14). These poems and articles were a refusal by Maxeke and Mgqwetho to be locked out of public discourse. Instead, they took a position to broaden and question the parameters of debates.

Healy-Clancy (2012) argues that Black women's defence of their rights to establish and tend to their homes during colonialism and apartheid should be considered a source of their intellectual ideas and thoughts. As stateless beings, their defence of domestic sovereignty put them in a violent battle with a highly equipped and aggressive state. Furthermore, Healy-Clancy (2012:4) argues that Black women fighting for domestic sovereignty was an intellectual undertaking that resulted in the creation of a Black body politic. Black women during colonialism and apartheid expressed this endeavour through voicing concerns about the social welfare of their communities and homes. Their engagements in social clubs and self-help groups were the practical and tangible form of intellectual work (Healy-Clancy 2012: 5). She explores this through examining Cecilia Lillian Tshabalala and the social welfare organisation she started, the Daughters of Africa (DOA). Tshabalala modelled the DOA after club movement in the U.S. The club movement utilised what Higginbotham (1992: 266) terms politics of respectability: emphasising the importance of schooling, maintaining dignified homes and appearances to promote respectability for themselves and the race.

Tshabalala urged Black women to establish DOA branches in widely distributed Black newspapers such as *Bantu World*. In one article, "Club Woman", published in April 1936, Tshabalala defined women as guardians of their homes race and urged them to ensure that the ideals required to maintain the home and society were strengthened through their efforts (Healy-Clancy 2014: 429). Tshabalala's emphasis on educating Black women to strengthen their communities and households is echoed by her contemporaries such as Florence Jabavu (in Daymond et al. 2003: 194) in the article "Bantu Home" published in 1928. Jabavu and Tshabalala's intellectual ideas and contributions have been read as storing up conservativeness. Their support for domestic concerns has been described as espousing an agenda that stored up patriarchal power and gender inequality (see Walker 1990; Charman et al. 1991; Hassim 1991; Wells 1991). Gasa (2007: 211) attributes this to these scholars and activists utilising ideological frameworks developed elsewhere. The methodological and theoretical tools that these frameworks were associated with led scholars and feminists to impose interpretations that did not consider the nuances of Black women's lives. Furthermore, reading these acts as conservative can be attributed to the liberal feminist assertation that demands emanating from women's roles as mothers are incomparable to democratic citizenship (Dietz 1985: 33).

© University of Pretoria

These select readings were chosen because they were Ntantala's predecessors, and some like Maxeke and Jabavu come from the Eastern Cape. Jabavu and Ntantala met and interacted during her time in Fort Hare. This is the first step in contextualising and localising Ntantala's public intellectualism. The accounts are concentrated in feminist approaches to Histography, but we can draw one observation; for many Black women, their ability to become public intellectuals depends on their class. Maxeke and Jabavu's middle-class positionality offered them opportunities to become educated, gaining access to social networks and cultural institutions that offer platforms to express their intellectual ideas. The following sections will examine the linkages between education as an enabling contributor to upward social and economic mobility for Black women.

2.8.The Public Intellectual and Private Sphere

The literature on public intellectuals does not sufficiently interrogate its formulation of the "public sphere". When scholars pay attention to the public, they engage with it from the vantage point of delimiting the expansion of the public sphere due to class or race-based conflict. However, the public sphere is treated as an autonomous space without any linkages to the private sphere. The silence on the private sphere from all accounts is glaring. In this section, studies on the public sphere are examined. The literature is characterised by its dissent to the ideal liberal type popularised by Habermas (1981). The influence of Habermas' account has been challenged to demonstrate its exclusionary and oppressive nature from the perspective of the colonial state, Black counter publics, and the significance of the private sphere to the creation and continuation of the public sphere.

Habermas' (1981: 40) argues that the emergence of the public sphere can be traced to the 18th -19th century. Its growth was encouraged by the broadening of political participation, expansion of early capitalist trading systems and economy, as well as the proliferation of ideals relating to citizenship. Consequently, the arbitrary power of monarchs and absolutism of the feudal state was challenged. Habermas (1981:49) describes the public sphere as bourgeois in nature and the "…realm of our social life in which something approaching public opinion can be formed. Access is granted to all citizens…." However, Eley (1989: 1) argues that Habermas' conceptualisation of the public sphere is effectively an ideal of critical liberalism that never materialised. Habermas draws the normative characterises of the public sphere from a distant past that finds its logic in the Enlightenment period and locates its genesis in Roman law and Greek socio-political orders. Furthermore, Eley (1989: 3) argues that Habermas does not

© University of Pretoria

consider how the exclusive nature of this public sphere fundamentally compromises his historical claims.

Eley's arguments can be read in studies discussing the public sphere in Africa. Ekeh (1975) and Mamdani's (1996) accounts showcase that the imposition of a western public sphere on Africa was fuelled by capitalist accumulation in the colonial metropole. In their attempts to grasp this event and its consequences, they describe it as producing a post-colonial state that is bifurcated and Janus-faced. Ekeh (1975:95) argues that there are two publics with varying levels of moral obligations to the private sphere. Mamdani (1996: 4) focuses on settler-colonial societies whose institutional framework rested on direct and indirect rule. Direct rule regulated life in urban centres and partially incorporated Africans; however, they could not claim citizenship rights. In comparison, indirect rule was the mode of domination over subjects living under the tutelage of customary law. Mamdani (1996: 19) argues that the outcome of this was the racialisation of civil society and the tribalisation of customary authority.

Kaarsholm (2009: 415) takes up Mamdani's argument to contend that citizenship in post-apartheid South Africa continues to be characterised by the co-existence of the citizen and subject. However, he argues that new hierarchies have emerged. The dominance of the African National Congress (ANC) has allowed them to assume the position of the super-citizen who is privileged above the ordinary citizen and presents themselves as the sole representative of the people and nation (Kaarsholm 2009: 416). The ANC has become the super citizen due to their dominance of nationalist discourse and confinement of public debate to party structures. Hassim (2009: 456) offers a similar analysis of the post-apartheid state. The adoption of the constitution was designed to unify the subject and citizen into a single polity, sharing a common public sphere. However, the ANC's adherence to democratic centralism placed considerable limitations on the emergence of this public sphere by limiting discourse to its party structures and viewing any dissent as a betrayal to the governance and development of the country.

From the above accounts, it is apparent that in response to Habermas, scholars have delineated the characteristics of the public sphere by examining the economic context and political struggles which shaped it. These accounts demonstrate that the establishment of the public sphere in 18-19th century Europe was accompanied by racialisation and tribalisation in the colonies that betrayed the liberal values championed in the metropoles. This reinforces Eley's claim that the margins of exclusion in Habermas' analysis significantly undermines his claims of the liberal values underpinning his public sphere. In other accounts, the focus shifts to

© University of Pretoria

demonstrating these exclusions by focusing on counterpublics. Fraser (1990:59) argues that Habermas's conceptualisation was premised on inaccessibility as the public person who could enter this public sphere was male and white. In response, Fraser (1990:61) contends that the bourgeois liberal sphere was one among many, and its relations with other publics - she names these "counterpublics"- was conflictual. Counterpublics challenged the exclusionary nature of the bourgeois liberal public and set out to provide alternative modes of political behaviour and speech (Fraser 1990: 68).

Squires (2002) and Dawson (1994) add to this discussion by focusing on the Black counterpublics in the US. Squires (2002: 44) contends that their emergence is contingent on the availability of resources and a decrease in oppression. This diverges from Fraser's (1990: 67) view that their emergence may be voluntary. Dawson (1994: 199) contends that even as the Black counterpublic clashed with the liberal public sphere, it did not espouse liberal ethos. The leadership of Black these counterpublics during the 1970s were dominantly male and patriarchal. Black women fought against the dominance of patriarchal leaders who tried to regulate black discourse and establish communal norms in these counterpublics.

The above accounts on counterpublics are based on advanced Western democracies. The composition of South African counterpublics is determined by the bifurcated and Janus-faced nature of the apartheid state. According to Ngcobozi (2020), counterpublics were engaged in a conflictual relationship with the hegemonic state. The bifurcated nature of the apartheid state resulted in women of the Methodist church association- omama bomanyano- forming part of a counterpublic opposed to the state. Omama bomanyano sought to oppose the dominance of the apartheid state and collaborated with anti-apartheid organisations operating within the Black counterpublic. With the dawn of democracy, the relationship between radical counterpublics and the ANC-led state is conflictual. Finaly (2010: 1719 argues that these counterpublics continue to be vehicles to fight oppression and offer alternative understandings of citizenship. However, Finaly (2010: 176) cautions that these counterpublics are dependent on government funding for their activities; resultantly, the post-apartheid state is embedded within counterpublics.

Other forms of dissent against Habermas have expanded on his public sphere's exclusionary and oppressive nature by focusing on the private sphere. Habermas (1981: 28-29) concedes that the bourgeois public sphere was formulated through the experiences of the conjugal family, which provided the necessary training for critical reflection that was utilised in the public

© University of Pretoria

sphere. However, women were denied entry. This literature elaborates on political and economic struggles that shaped the public sphere by examining the private sphere. Expanding on the realm occupied by the conjugal family, this literature has shown that the public and private spheres are defined descriptively or normatively to distinguish between various kinds of human action and physical or social spaces (Weintraub 1997: 7). The most enduring characteristic is the gendered nature of the relationship between humans in these spaces (Coole 2000: 338; Bailey 2002: 16; Arendt 1958: 31-38). In other words, these two spheres have been identified as contrasting images, dominated by inequality and sharp boundaries which imposed normative values. Furthermore, these were enforced through gendered relations of power. This inequality is said to engineer a divide between the public and private (Weintraub 1997: 31)

These critiques of a gendered public and private sphere have dominated Western feminists attempts to demonstrate the exclusivity of Habermas ideal type. However, African scholars have disputed this and argued that it reflects a double imposition: the transportation of bourgeois liberal public sphere due to colonialism and gender arrangements found in western societies. Oyewumi (2005: 3-4) argues that the foregrounding of the body in western epistemology invites a gaze of differentiation that has historically been gendered. This encouraged a separation of the public and private sphere according to gendered power relations. However, some societies, such as the Yoruba before the 19th century, social classification was premised on seniority ordered by chronological age difference (Oyewumi 2005: 13). Amadiume (1987: 62) demonstrates that the organisation of pre-colonial Igbo societies was not motivated by unequal relations of power dependent on gender but to meet socio-economic demands. The low productivity of soil and growth in population led to the scarcity of land and encouraged the emergence of an economic system where women performed farm work and men became ritual specialists (Amadiume 1987: 62). This produces a sexual division of labour, with each gender assuming control over specific crops. Amadiume and Oyewumi's studies have been pivotal to breaking the notion of public-private divide premised on gendered ideology informed by anatomical difference. Their work has shifted the needle and opened new angles to understand the evolution and current state of gendered ideology for not only Africans but other societies reeling from the disruptions caused by colonialism.

2.9.Conclusion

The chapter first began by presenting studies on public intellectuals that critique the tensions and contradictions presented by a definitional schema that draws its logic from the Dreyfus

© University of Pretoria

Affair and the normative ideal it enforces. These studies analyse public intellectuals by positioning them within and across the various social relations, they inhabit. Public intellectuals are embodied and contextualized against the historically specific conditions they operate. Resultantly, the contradictions which characterize the Dreyfusards appear to be resolved. However, whether conceived of as the organic or native intellectual, these perspectives continue to work in oppositional terms, valorising masculine figures and confining intellectual work to the public sphere.

In examining the literature, these studies have treated the "public" as a self-contained space without linkages to a private sphere. There are counterpublics, which are considered when the public intellectual is distinguished according to racial and class-based terms. Nevertheless, there is under theorization and silence about the intellectual´s position in the private sphere and how they understood the relationship between the public and private spheres. This silence has led to assumptions about who the public intellectual is and where intellectual activity occurs. The various conceptualization of the public sphere is characterized by dissent against Habermas ideal liberal type to demonstrate its exclusionary nature. These accounts document the consequences of its imposition on the post-colonial state and Black counterpublics. On the other hand, there has been dissent from western feminists who have pushed for recognition of the private sphere as crucial to the emergence and subsequent continuity of the public sphere.

This gap produces margins of erasure and marginality. The review attempted to etch these margins to locate Black women. Black women´s marginality is a particular case because they have not been associated with the sedentary private sphere. Black women's public intellectualism challenges studies that valorise a masculine figure and are silent about the private sphere. The select readings of their public intellectualism showcase that their intellectual ideas endeavoured to render Black women visible in discourse and champion their interests in (counter)publics.

This chapter lays the foundation to speak about and engage the public intellectualism of Phyllis Ntantala. As a migratory body, Ntantala moved through several public and counterpublics and linked the issues seen to be exclusively concerning the public sphere to the private and showed their interconnectedness. Ntantala continued an intellectual tradition that her predecessors set. In the following chapter, we shall trace her life story from rural Eastern Cape to her latter years in the U.S, where she lived in exile. The chapter determines how the various worlds she lived and travelled through informed her public intellectualism.

© University of Pretoria

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

Chapter Three: Tracing the Influences and Development of Ntantala's Intellectual Trajectory

3.1 Introduction

In an interview, Phyllis Ntantala described herself as an "educationist, political activist and freelance writer". Hailing from a family of landowners in the Transkei, Ntantala received formal training to become a teacher. Ntantala attributed her social awakening to witnessing the plight of others -especially her students in Kroonstad-and her rural upbringing. In her autobiography, *A Life's Mosaic*, Ntantala (2009: 5) claims that although she regarded herself as free, freedom seemed unattainable and elusive when she witnessed how others were not free. In Kroonstad, she embarked on a path to become a public intellectual and activist. The chapter will engage with Ntantala as the protagonist of the autobiography, summarising the events and experiences influential in shaping her into a public intellectual and engaging with the nature and the form of selfhood that she presented.

Firstly, the chapter identified experiences and events that can be regarded as thematic thread or plotline that Ntantala weaves to account for her intellectual journey. Ntantala is contextualised in the milieu she was born and lived. This embeds her in the social, historical, and political contexts where these experiences occur. Missionary education, family life, and exile are experiences and events analysed to determine how Ntantala emerged and became a public intellectual. Secondly, the chapter tackled Ntantala's self-representation in her autobiography. Here, the focus shifts to identifying the protagonist behind these experiences

© University of Pretoria

and events. The chapter engaged with Ntantala as an individual and determined how she constructed and presented her selfhood. Thereafter, Ntantala's positionality in relation to women whose lives she dedicated herself to documenting is examined. Avowedly middle-class, Ntantala's socio-economic status shielded her from the brute force of racial and sexist oppression. By centring the lives and experiences of rural women, Ntantala can be read as betraying her class interests. This brings us to consider what it means for a Black public intellectual to align herself with and make representation on behalf of this group. Furthermore, what does this alignment and representation signify when these utterances justify the intellectuals work and presence. These considerations are derived partly from discussions on Black public intellectuals and their relations with public spheres(s).

In this chapter, Ntantala will be shown as an actor who operated in various historical periods - colonialism, apartheid, and post-apartheid South Africa. The narrative includes her time in exile, thus placing Ntantala across three continents - Africa, Europe, and North America. The chapter lays the groundwork that, in the following chapters, helps to determine Ntantala's intellectual ideas and strategies by tracing the development and the maturation of these ideas.

3.2 Biological Sketch of Phyllis Ntantala (1920-2016)

A Life's Mosaic is the primary document used for this biographical sketch. The University of California Press first published the autobiography in 1992, and a revised edition was reissued in 2009 while Ntantala was living in Taylor, Michigan.

Ntantala was born on 7 January 1920 at Gqubeni eDutwya in the Eastern Cape province of South Africa. One of seven children born to Ida and George Ntantala. She spent the initial years of her schooling at the Duff mission station established by the Free Church of Scotland. Ntantala's male siblings died, leaving Ida and George with four daughters: Theodora Granny, Evelyn Nonkululeko, Ethel Ruth and Phyllis Priscilla. Ntantala was named Phyllis at the request of the family doctor, Dr Lumley, who was great friends with George. The doctor had a daughter named Phyllis, who died in infancy. He wished for Phyllis's name to live on and asked George to give his last born this name. Ntantala was affectionally called "Nonqgaza" or the "tiny grass warbler" after recovering from severe illness as a toddler. Western medication and interventions had failed, the family expected that Ntantala would die, but a neighbour, affectionately called Aunt MaMpethwana, concocted a secret herbal brew that saved Ntantala. Upon recovery, Ntantala was energetic and was likened to the grass bird. Ntantala (2009: 4) describes her home as a haven for the destitute. This experience of caring and assisting others,

© University of Pretoria

Ntantala states, tempered the arrogance she developed as a confessed member of the African elite.

Ntantala (2009:8) describes her family as being intensively involved in the mission's everyday operations. This stretched as far back as Phyllis' great-grandfather, and it became a defining feature of her childhood, setting them apart from their 'red blanket' family and associates. These were Ntantala's uneducated kin who covered their faces with red ochre, refrained from western attire and wore blankets. Ntantala (2009: 13-16) traces her patrilineal lineage to the court of King Maqoma, where her great-grandfather was a courtier. Her maternal lineage stretched to Noyi, baptized Balfour, who assisted missionaries stationed at Ncerha to alphabetize amaXhosa and translated the parts of the bible into isiXhosa. She locates herself as emerging from the meeting of an older precolonial order dominated by warrior kings and missionary society that had violently reshaped African life. Ntantala (2009: 17) describes her parent's marriage as the outcome of a comprehensive search. The Ntantala's searched for a "suitable" match among the families of early converts and educated elites. In comparison, later in the autobiography, she describes her family's reception of her husband A.C Jordan as being eased by the realization that the Jordan's were "no up-starters" but a "…family with a place of honour among the people…" who could also trace their lineage to the royal court of Maqoma (Ntantala 2009: 101-102). Southall (2014:6) argues that the status of the African elite was entrenched through intermarriage. This holds for Ntantala as marriage to Jordan synthesized her class consciousness.

In 1924, Ntantala's mother died from pneumonia, and George remarried two years later to another noble-born woman, Edwina Mgudlwa of Qhumanco. The Qhumanco were a royal family of the Jumbo house of the AbaThembu (Ntantala 2009: 57). Ntantala completed elementary schooling at Duff mission and went on to study at Healdtown. Although Ida's lineage could be traced to converts present at the founding of Lovedale Missionary School, Ntantala was the first of her family to attend, Healdtown. At the behest of her brother-in-law, Rhodes Cakata, George enrolled Ntantala at Healdtown as the students there were not segregated according to their financial status. Several years later, Ntantala was awarded the Transkeian Bhunga scholarship to attend Fort Hare University at age fourteen.

Upon completing her teacher's diploma in 1936, Ntantala, unsure if she wanted to study further, struck a compromise with her father; she would return to Fort Hare if she could not find a job. In February of the following year, she received a job offer at Kroonstad Bantu High School in

© University of Pretoria

the Orange Free State (OFS) and immediately took it up. The job came through her connections with A.C Jordan, whom she met at Fort Hare. After rejecting his numerous pleas, Ntantala married Jordan in 1939. Towards the end of 1944, Jordan was appointed lecturer at Fort Hare. Ntantala returned to Fort Hare pregnant with her third child. After giving birth, Ntantala (2009: 128) was "…itching to go back to work…" and jumped at an offer to teach at Lovedale. For a woman married to a man of means, going back to work was breaking an unspoken tradition in her society. Mrs Mathews, the wife of Professor Z.K Mathews, remarked that she was perplexed by Ntantala leaving a three-month year old to return to work.

In 1945, Jordan was offered a teaching position at the University of Cape Town (UCT). He would be the first African appointed as a full-time lecturer. With the move, Ntantala urged Jordan to look for accommodation outside of the designated African areas in townships. Ntantala (2009: 133) considered the squalor and confining nature of townships as squeezing out every measure of individuality. To acquire housing elsewhere, Jordan required an exemption from the housing council to bypass a clause in the 1936 Land Act, limiting where Africans could buy land and prohibited non-Africans from selling land to Africans. Jordan's position at UCT and his connections with the native commissioner influenced the council to permit him to purchase land in a predominantly coloured area, Lincoln Estate. In May 1947, construction began on the Jordan family home. They named it "Thabisano" or "the place of mutual rejoicing (Ntantala 2009: 139).

Following the move to Cape Town, Ntantala (2009: 141) became a stay-at-home mother. She hired domestic help and continued being active in education by joining the Cape African Teachers Association (CATA). By 1957, Ntantala began to write for the journal *Africa South* and enrolled for a diploma in Native Law at UCT. In 1959, she joined the Institute of Race Relations (IRR) and applied the knowledge gained at UCT to assist Africans trudging through the legal process of acquiring passes. In 1962, Ntantala and her daughter, Nandi, fled into exile. Her husband and two sons had left the previous year. They fled into exile following the repressive environment caused by the state of emergency implemented in 1960 and the introduction of the Extension of University Act in 1957, which segregated universities according to race and ethnicity. As Jordan had struggled to obtain a passport, he advised the family to apply for British passports. Ntantala was eligible for British citizenship as her parents were former subjects of the empire. Ntantala and Nandi boarded the Pandennis Castle, setting sail for England with exit permits. The family first relocated to Hull, England.

© University of Pretoria

In 1963, Jordan was offered a teaching position at the University of Wisconsin whilst on a tour of American universities, and the family left England for the United States (U.S.) (Ntantala 2009: 199). The family battled racist attacks in the U.S. and were petrol-bombed on two occasions. In 1967, Ntantala's son Pallo was endorsed out of the country and returned to England. The following year in October, Jordan died after battling cancer. Ntantala struggled to regularise her stay in the U.S. and was ordered to leave. Finally, in 1972 after numerous attempts, she received permanent residence through her British citizenship. Disaster hit again when Nandi died in the same year.

After Jordan's death, Ntantala crisscrossed the U.S. and presented at various seminars on apartheid at colleges such as Loop and Spelman. During these years, she moved from Madison to Michigan and gave addresses on South Africa whilst working to support her family as a pre-school teacher, home health provider, and lecturer. She opted to stay in the United States after the end of apartheid. Ntantala died in Michigan in July 2016. She was laid to rest in Madison, Wisconsin.

3.3 Influences and Changes in Intellectual Life

Tracing Ntantala's intellectual trajectory requires examining the social, historical, and political contexts in which she was born and lived. This is an overview of events and experiences in Ntantala's life chosen to reflect the thematic thread she weaved into a plotline. These are regarded as pivotal to the development of her intellectual journey. First, the section outlined the milieu in which Ntantala was born and raised to demonstrate Ntantala's disposition against the broader social world she inhabited. The focus is on missionary education's importance in shaping Ntantala's intellectual journey. Missionary education elevated Ntantala's class consciousness as she became further embedded in the African elites' social networks and cultural institutions. Furthermore, education brought about opportunities to travel and expanded Ntantala's social view as she became aware of racial oppression. Her first teaching position in the Orange Free State (OFS) marks the beginning of her intellectual journey. This is where her political consciousness is awakened. Ntantala's intellectual ideas matured as she travelled from the OFS into exile in England and the United States. However, missionary education left a lasting imprint on Ntantala that presented a contradictory element in her intellectual corpus.

Missionary Education, Class Stratification and the African Middle-Class

© University of Pretoria

Before discussing the social milieu into which Ntantala was born and the influence of missionary education, it is vital to outline its aims and impact on African communities. The importance of missionary education for the emergence of African women as public intellectuals cannot be understated. Ntantala (2012) states that the arrival of writing and literacy through missionaries placed South Africa onto the world's literary map. From this moment, African communities could record their stories and histories. A watershed moment that Ntantala argues was a time of intellectual blossoming and the emergence of indigenous literary traditions. On the other hand, she concedes that the imposition of missionary education was accompanied by ideological and material conditions that radically altered African life and moulded successive generations of African intellectuals. This is to be expected as Harries (2010: 405) argues that learning does not occur in a vacuum, nor is it value-free. Ntantala recognised that missionary education was part of the machinery of imperialism- missionaries embarked on an extensive campaign to civilise their converts and model them according to patterns of civility derived from the metropole.

On the ideological front, missionaries believed that control over education would allow them to exert an influence that would lead to social change by moulding their converts' cultural practices and sensibilities. In *A Life's Mosaic*, Ntantala (2009: 7) detailed her upbringing at the Duff Mission station established by the Free Church of Scotland in the early 19th century. Later, she attended Healdtown, built by Wesleyan Methodist missionaries from England in the mid-19th century. Due to this, the focus will be on the ideological beliefs of Scottish and English missionaries. English missionaries' ideological beliefs revolved around a moral code that emphasised thriftiness and cleanliness, fairness, deference to superiors, honour, virtue and hard work (Thomas 2006: 466; April 2012: 102; Tonono 2020: 466). The English focused on evangelism and education, with conversion as the channel to rebirth. In comparison, Scottish missionaries viewed their stations as political and economic units. The Scottish emphasised industrial and agricultural instruction as a conduit to materially uplift their converts (Hokkanen & Mangan 2006: 1259). Industrial activities were crucial to character building. Institutions built by the Free Church of Scotland, such as Lovedale, emphasised pupils completing outdoor projects. When James Stewart took over as principal of Lovedale after 1870, pupils were taught that idleness was incompatible with Christianity and intellectual development was tied to technical as well as agricultural activities (MacKenzie 2008: 123).

On another ideological matter, missionary education was highly gendered. A broad sectoral approach will be used to discuss the gendered ideology governing missionary education. Girls'

© University of Pretoria

education was based on Victorian notions of gender relations that were heteronormative and binary, thus demarcating separate roles for women and men. This gender system gained traction in the 19th century and demanded that women direct their energies to the private sphere whilst their male counterparts occupied the public sphere, engaging in politics and trade (Leach 2008: 336; Gaitskell 1983: 241). Missionary education groomed girls to be suitable wives, dutiful mothers, and a source of domestic labour. Girls of all races were set back as their training emphasised domestic courses such as cooking, sewing, and cleaning. Girls considered exceptionally gifted could further their studies and train to be teachers and, later, nurses. In comparison, missionary education for boys emphasised industrial training to produce a layer of men to become a source of menial labour. Again, schooling was provided for sons of monarchs and nobles to prepare them to become educators, preachers and writers (Masola 2020: 16; Tonono 2020: 479).

African converts received and interpreted missionary education in ways that did not align with missionaries' expectations. Two examples illustrate this. Firstly, converts appropriated Christian theology to justify indigenous practices such as polygamy and pre-marital sex (Harries 2010: 417-418). This would result in the infusion of Christian religiosity with indigenous cosmologies. Secondly, early converts created literacy and literary traditions. This was aided by the development of an African-dominated printing press, which facilitated the emergence of periodicals such as *Izwi Labantu, Ikwezi, Indaba, and Isigidimi-sama-Xhosa* wrestled authority and control from missionary printing houses. In addition, the printing press created an intellectual space where debates and critique could be waged (Masola 2019: 3). On these platforms during the 1800s, we witness the emergence of the first crop of African public intellectuals such as Tiyo Soga, John Jabavu, Walter Rubusana, Elijah Makiwane and S.E.K Mqhayi. As these literary traditions were flourishing, April (2012:104) notes that throughout the 20th century, debates among white missionaries raged on about the educability of Africans, with progress measured by the converts' abilities to assimilate to western notions of civility.

The dominance of white missionaries in education and religion was further challenged by the secession of African ministers from white-controlled churches. Some African-led churches were established through interactions with African American religious organisations. The most prominent was the African Methodist Episcopal (AME) Church. AME's arrival to South Africa was initiated by Charlotte Maxeke, who studied at the famed Wilberforce University in the U.S. AME church established Wilberforce, and during her studies there, Maxeke was taught by W.E.B Du Bois. Upon her return to South Africa in 1902, Maxeke maintained

© University of Pretoria

communication with Du Bois. As a result, Maxeke became part of the talented tenth that Du Bois conceptualised in his writings. Ntantala inherited this tradition of intellectual exchanges between African Americans and their South African counterparts. Like Maxeke, she became part of the "talented tenth".

Missionary schools were elite institutions that created a group of educated Africans to act as adjuncts and spread the gospel (Masola 2020: 16). Early converts' assimilation to missionary life came with the benefits of acquiring land and learning numeracy, literacy, and agricultural skills invaluable in the burgeoning cash economy (Southall 2014: 4). When succeeding generations of converts and elites were able to attend university rather than industrial training colleges, this allowed them to venture into a range of occupations such as teaching, medicine, law, and entrepreneurship. Vanguard missionary institutions were the first channels to establish class linkages and associations (Mabandla 2015: 83). The educated elite went on to form social and cultural institutions to display their newfound wealth and tastes. Graduates of missionary institutions were regarded as an elite group by their communities and missionaries. Resultantly, the group acquired class consciousness.

Class consciousness and sense of exclusiveness had aesthetical and behavioural dimensions. However, texts about the African middle class- especially their aesthetic and behaviours'- were written by white researchers and academics (Masola 2020: 340). This led to descriptions of this class's sensibilities aspiring towards western lifestyles and values. For example, Nyquist (1983:8) described these desires as mimicry of Western tastes and conflicting with pre-colonial values. The male-centric nature of these accounts makes it difficult to understand what being part of the middle class entailed for African women. Furthermore, the structural limitations- induced by living in a racist and sexist regime- make us question the existence of such as class. Colonialism and apartheid rested on regimes of coercion, which inhibited them from fully immersing themselves in their class positionality as they were unable to become part of the broader middle-class stratum and were propertyless. Resultantly, concepts such as "status" rather than class have been applied to determine its positionality (Seekings 2009; Nyquist 1983). Differentiating between status and class allowed for the contours and boundaries of the middle class to emerge and illustrated that status indicated honour and even degeneration among African communities; however, these elites did have substantive power that could shield from economic insecurity racial violence (Nyquist 1983:4). We can definitively state that the confluence of missionary education and their social networks shaped generations of African elites, stratifying and differentiating them from their communities.

© University of Pretoria

The Early Days: Missionary Education and Class Consciousness

Missionary education and her family's involvement in the church shaped Ntantala's class consciousness by further inculcating her into defined values and behaviours. For example, the Ntantala girls were routinely threatened with being sent to live with "amaqaba" or the ochred non-school people if they used foul language. However, Ntantala comments that she was fond of her red blanket family and associates. Nevertheless, the effects of this are evident in Ntantala's (2009: 38) reflections, as she comments that as an adult, she refrained from "…using ordinary, clean Xhosa words…" as she was raised to consider them vulgar. In addition, the social distance between her and the red blanket family and friends was stark, as Ntantala (2009:38) describes growing isolated, as they could only play with children of other elites.

In adulthood, missionary education elevated Ntantala's class consciousness. Describing her social life at Kroonstad, Ntantala describes refraining from attending concerts and dances. This was an attitude that she and her peers at Fort Hare University adopted because, as the elite, they felt that they "…could not mix and dance with anybody..." [emphasis her own] (Ntantala 2009: 93). During such moments, Ntantala further integrated into the social networks and cultural institutions created for and by the African middle class. Years later, in exile, Ntantala (2009: 78) recounts how in London, she stood with Nandi at Westminster Bridge in the morning to recite a poem from Wordsworth. Encouraged by encounters with missionary education, this habitus and behaviours defined Ntantala class consciousness.

To further her studies, Ntantala had to travel. First to Healtdown, then Fort Hare. Education and the mobility it brought expanded her social views. The first journey from Duff to Healdtown foretold the life-altering effect that the pursuit of education and employment would have on her life. Ntantala remarks that as she lazily watched the train make its way past King William Town to Alice, she noted the sharp contrast between this part of the country and eDutywa. The homes were, according to Ntantala (2009: 48), "…badly built, haphazard, with no fences around them…[and] very few had cattle folds." Unlike the Transkei, this part of the country appeared deserted and poverty-stricken. She would receive answers on why the Ciskei was a desolate land from lessons on the Wars of Dispossession (1779-1878) and their consequences.

Teaching at the Kroonstad Bantu High School became a defining moment in Ntantala's journey to becoming a public intellectual. On arrival in Kroonstad, Ntantala (2009:90) was shocked by

© University of Pretoria

the abject poverty she witnessed. It was far worse than the poverty in rural Transkei where she came from:

> City poverty, however, is more stark than rural poverty. Here, if one does not have a cent in one's pocket, one goes without food; here, people who have no houses sleep out in the streets, under bridges, in the gutter.

Kroonstad frightened the novice teacher, and she began to question the causes of racial oppression that placed limitations on her student's aspirations. Soon this transformed into anger and pushed Ntantala to conclude that personal freedom was inconsequential until others were free:

> It was in Kroonstad, where I came to teach, that my anger was aroused…Here I learnt that, though I seemed free, there could be no freedom where others were not free and that in fact nobody in South Africa, or any other country, was free while others were not (Ntantala 2009:5).

The embers of this political awakening had been sparked at Fort Hare when she, along with her peers, questioned the curriculum and reached the conclusion that "...South African history is a lie…" (Ntantala 2009: 121). The history curriculum glorified the victors and was mute on the defeated. From history lessons with her father, Ntantala (2009: 121) had learned that the victors had "…cheated and robbed…" Africans. At Fort Hare, she and her peers were unsure what led to this robbery. The years spent in Kroonstad illuminated the causes of this robbery.

Ntantala pinpoints a singular moment as the defining point in her political consciousness. By June 1942, Ntantala was married to Jordan and had given birth to her second child, Pallo. In June, she attended a meeting where white candidates competing to be elected as representatives of Africans in parliament spoke. Jordan acted as interpreter for the candidates, but Ntantala (2009: 122) opted to attend without informing him. With her housekeeper watching over her children, she made her way to the meeting. After hearing a passionate speech by Hyman Basner, Ntantala states that she arrived at answers for some of the questions that had plagued her since Fort Hare. On this night in June, Ntantala (2009: 125) states that she identified what role she would play in South Africa:

> I knew where my place would be in the South African set up. I understood even the slight racism of places like the Cape Province, Lovedale and Fort Hare, which I had thought were free from racial attitudes. I understood some of the reasons behind promoting an elite among the African people and why the first graduates of Fort Hare were so elitist in their attitudes. Though

© University of Pretoria

> born and brought up in this milieu, I would try to shed those attitudes and involve myself in the struggles of my people.

This lone night in June was the turning point that set Ntantala along a path to becoming an educational and political activist. Although missionary education with its ideologies may have intended to dismember Ntantala from her community, she expressed a desire to align herself with the people and their struggle. In such instances, mobility granted Ntantala the opportunity to broaden her social view as she met and interacted with communities vastly different from her own. As a result, Ntantala joined the Orange Free State African Teacher's Association which militantly opposed discriminatory practices and racial oppression. In March 1943, in Bloemfontein to write exams, Ntantala (2009: 124-125) spontaneously joined her first march with the teacher's association to oppose teaching contracts.

In 1945 Ntantala's family relocated to Cape Town. Here, Ntantala's social views were further expanded as Cape Town was where she gained a "…true analysis of the South African situation" (Ntantala 2009: 128). In the initial years following the move, Ntantala became a stay-at-home mother but took part in protest action and campaigns as she was involved in Cape African Teacher's Association (CATA) from 1947. During CATA's campaign against Van Riebeek celebrations of 1952, Ntantala (2009: 155) presented her first public speech. In this speech, she adopted the campaign's theme- 'We have nothing to celebrate'- and related it to the plight of workers in cities and rural women in the reserves. Rural women would become a central focus of Ntantala's intellectual work. By 1957, Ntantala began to publish in the journal *Africa South*. The first article, "African Tragedy", depicted the devastating effects of apartheid on rural women. She published another article in 1959, "Widows of Reserve", which documented the everyday lives of rural women. This article was republished by Langston Hughes, thereby bringing Ntantala and her subject into the Black transnational community.

Missionary Education and the Contradictions in Ntantala's Intellectuals Ideas

At this juncture, it is beneficial to elaborate on the influences of missionary education and the imprint it left on Ntantala. Missionary education introduces a contradictory element in her intellectual corpus, which appears at odds with the ethos driving it. Briefly, it was elaborated on the conflicting stance that she held about the benefits and destructive nature of missionary education. Reflecting on its impact in the Eastern Cape, Ntantala (2012) states that early convents broadened their horizon and freed themselves of monarchical tyranny. Furthermore, the dawn of literacy and expansion of education in the Eastern Cape meant that the province

© University of Pretoria

would be years ahead of others: the fruits of this accidental occurrence became evident to Ntantala when the first two democratic presidents of South Africa hailed from the Eastern Cape. This can be interpreted as a nativist chauvinism, which betrays her repeated overtures to "the people" whose struggles she pledges to champion. The circle of enclosure that accommodates "the people" appears to shrink in this statement.

In another instance, her son Pallo Jordan in an undated letter- which appears to be written during apartheid and prior to Nandi's death-, critiques Ntantala's missionary indoctrination and how it limited her analysis. The letter is a response by Pallo to an article on African women and education that Ntantala had written. Pallo (n.d) admonishes Ntantala for what he regarded as a regressive stance on missionary education and its effects on African communities:

> You say that the South African women spread education and civilisation to backward areas. Now that is a very bad thing for an African of your calibre to say! The Africans were civilised long before the whites came, centuries before! Your comment suggests that it was the coming of the missionaries that brought them civilisation.

For Pallo, Africans of Ntantala's "calibre" should have distinguished between the imposition of missionary education and the different form of civilization that accompanied it. By all accounts, this civilization was not superior to indigenous African civilisations. To accept and repeat such views permitted racists to justify colonialism and apartheid. Further along in the letter, Pallo takes issue with Ntantala's characterisation of colonial conquest:

> Even your characterisation of conquest as a "revolution" is incredibly bad. The amazing thing is you don't even notice its incorrectness when immediately after you say the people were kept out of the body politics. They were kept out precisely because it was no revolution but aggression!

Ntantala internalisation of missionary dogma, at times, inhibited her analysis. As a beneficiary of missionary education, who was denied incorporation into the broader middle class, tensions arise and are not easily resolved. Furthermore, Ntantala was aware of the social distance she occupied vis-à-vis "the people" due to missionary education. How far she identified with and extended this enclosure to incorporate "the people" is in flux. At times it is expansive; however, there are instances where it shrinks along class and ethnic lines. This issue will be considered in depth in section 3.4. However, these tensions inject a contradictory element that stands at odds with the ethos driving her public intellectualism.

Exile and Black Feminism

© University of Pretoria

In 1962 Ntantala fled into exile. Ntantala (2009: 232) comments that the decision was influenced by the perception that the "…ground in which I could operate was shrinking, getting smaller and smaller. I felt it was better to carry on the struggle outside, rather than risk going to jail to rot there doing nothing." Following her husband's death in 1968, new avenues for Ntantala (2009: 230) emerged as she began to speak at meetings regularly and was invited to give seminars at universities across the U.S. on apartheid. Exile allowed Ntantala to articulate comprehensively the ideas and analytical tools that she had adopted in her previous writings and speeches. Her intellectual corpus continued to centre African women. During this period, the framework she utilised to analyse African women's subjectivity drew its direction from a political-economy approach and was grounded in Black feminist theory.

These ideas are exemplified in an article published in the ANC's official newsletter, *Sechaba*, in 1984. The article, "Black Womanhood and National Liberation", begins with a premise firmly grounded in Black feminist theory: Black women occupied a position in society which led to them being the most exploited group during apartheid. This position is defined as falling below that of an object, where subjects inhibiting it are stripped of their humanity. Ntantala (1984:14) elaborated on this position by using the troika of class, gender, and race:

> Firstly, as members of the colonized and nationally oppressed groups, they are victims of White racism, secondly as the 'second sex' in a patriarchal society, women at home and in the community at large are dominated by institutions created and controlled by men; lastly, as producers in a capitalist society, they like other workers are robbed of the value of their labour.

Ntantala (2009: 232) states that her decision to write the article was to urge the anti-apartheid movement to reorientate its approach to liberation and freedom by foregrounding Black women's experiences on what these endeavours should entail. Failure to do so would result in the movement not achieving its goals.

Ntantala analysing the nationalist problem in a framework advocating for the movement to ground its pursuit of liberation on the oppression faced by women was to enter debates raging in the ANC. During the 1980s, women in the party began to question its commitment to their concerns and whether gender equality would automatically follow once liberation arrived. Moreover, these women were agitating for the creation of a theoretical base on which women's struggles and their position in the movement would be analysed (Hassim 2004: 444-446). The lens through which Ntantala presents her arguments highlights that nationalism is formulated according to gender difference (McClintock 1991: 106). Women and men are not afforded the

© University of Pretoria

same access to the nation-state's resources. Consequently, nationalism is dependent upon and constructed around gender differences. Ntantala challenged the patriarchal order in the party and questioned its nationalist thinking, which failed to give gender conflict the same historical importance as those afforded to race and class-based conflict.

Ntantala's position can be attributed to her participation in the transnational networks she encountered in exile. This is a tentative assessment as she does not extensively elaborate on the intellectual or academic work she performed in exile. It is gleaned from Ntantala's (n.d) resume, where she lists seminars presented from 1969-1988. One seminar delivered at Spelman College in 1973 is titled "African Women South of the Sahara: Pre- and Post-Conquest". This is one of the few academic ventures Ntantala speaks about in *A Life's Mosaic*. There are silences from Ntantala on this period of her public intellectualism; however, exile can be viewed as the meeting place of various intellectual thoughts and ideas, analytical tools and frameworks that had pervaded her life.

In a speech "Black Women Intellectuals and Liberation Struggle", presented at UCT in 2006, Ntantala summarized the thrust of her intellectual corpus by arguing that Black women intellectuals had failed to "…unpack the mutually reinforcing relationship amongst landlessness, the demand of the modern capitalist economy and the status of Black women in South Africa" (Ntantala 2006:8). This spoke to her insistence on analysing the subjectivity of Black women as being fundamental to the structural requirements of racial capitalism. Ntantala demonstrated how the migrant labour system, which devalued Black labour-power, forced women in the reserves to perform what Innes and O-Meara (1979: 73) described as reproductive and subsistence labour. Ntantala entangled the domestic into the public sphere and argued that locating Black women's subjectivity required examining the relationship between race, class, and gender.

In earlier articles dating as far back 1957, Ntantala did not use the terminology we have come to view as integral to Black feminist theory but articulated fragments of it. In exile, Ntantala came to use terminology aligned with the burgeoning Black feminist scholarship of the 1970s and 1980s. However, Ntantala did not explicitly present herself as a Black feminist. Davies (2007: 31-32) argues that it is possible to identify through reassessment and qualifiers in place a feminist politics among women who may have not personally regarded themselves as feminist. Ntantala articulated the building blocks of Black feminism by arguing that women's subjectivity was constituted by the relationship between gender, class, and race. However, in

© University of Pretoria

analysing the South African situation, Ntantala (1984:11) recognized that African women did not view gender as fundamental of cleavage as class and race. Nevertheless, this troika has become widely used to understand Black women's subjectivity.

Ntantala's work is an entryway to reconsider the canonisation of Black feminist theory from a transnational lens. As far back as the 1950s, Ntantala articulated fragments of what has become the tenants of Black feminist theory. The genealogy of Black feminist theory should be expanded to include women from the Global South. As Black feminist theory emphasizes polyvocality and situatedness, this would fulfil its mandate and challenge power relations inherent in knowledge production. Furthermore, the inclusion of women from the South can add different perspectives to current debates in Black feminism about the dominance of intersectionality and its usefulness for analysing women's subjectivity.

3.4.Autobiography and Self-Representation

In the introductory chapter, we examined the literature on African women's autobiographies. Davies (1991: 278) argues that three modes of self-representation structure African women's autobiographies; the self is explained as being synonymous with the political struggle; the self is demonstrated to be in dialogue with family, friends or society; and the self is identified as resisting patriarchal or racial systems. Ntantala does not submerge herself in familial relations or collective struggle. Instead, she creates and claims an identity beyond the roles assigned to her. However, she does narrate her life in relation to others and is resists racial and patriarchal power.

Ntantala ((2009: viii) begins her autobiography by describing its style and tempo:

> This book is not a political thesis. But I have used the story of my life as a peg on which to hang life and events in South Africa and North America as I experienced them. We have here a huge canvas, depicting the mosaic that is South Africa, with all its colours, strong and subdued, its lines long and short, and the dots, large and small. In social life, it is people who make up that mosaic; it is they who make things happen. Their actions and interactions determine the course of events.

With this opening statement, Ntantala (2009: vii) conjured up an image of a woman whose life story is "shaped and moulded" by the confluences of life, historical events, and interactions with people. She wrote the autobiography to leave behind a record of life for her children. Nevertheless, she goes to great create and mould a story of her own. These sentiments are echoed by Lungie Goduka (2016) when reflecting on Ntantala passing; she urges us to view

© University of Pretoria

Ntantala' life as a journey "…not of a struggle to escape from poverty and obscurity but of a creative and articulate black woman's search for identity and fulfilment."

Ntantala did not fully submerge herself into familial relations and collective struggle. In terms of familial relations, her autobiography asserts an identity beyond the wife of eminent African scholar and mother to political activist. An unexpected vehicle Ntantala uses are the candid descriptions of her relationships with men. A chapter is devoted to her relationship with her father. Ntantala (2009: 48) describes George as a parent, companion, and teacher. Growing up, she sensed that her parents wished to have a boy after the deaths of their sons, and Ntantala endeavoured to be this son. Her relationship with George inspired a healthy dose of self-confidence, as he impresses upon Ntantala (2009: viii) that "…she was as good as the best black and white…." Their relationship left Ntantala feeling comfortable in the company of men and enjoying the attention they showered her. In her autobiography, Ntantala (2009:78) remarks about her time at Fort Hare:

> I was a young lady, beautiful, elegant, hotly sought after by the young men… At Fort Hare I liked the attention that so many men paid me. While I discouraged some, there were a few that I kept around me, played with them as a cat plays with a mouse, kept a leash on them, with each one of them hoping that someday he would carry home the prize.

Ntantala revels in her desirability, whereas Lewis and Salo (1993:23) argue that her self-description as an object of men's attention is an unacknowledged acquiescence to patriarchal power. Although Lewis and Salo read aspects of our protagonist as showcasing an acquiescence, it must be noted that an understanding of one's sexuality and desirability does not equate to submitting to patriarchal norms.

Another relationship Ntantala candidly describes is her marriage to A.C Jordan. She presents the marriage as a highly conflicting event, brokered traditionally as Jordan sent a formal request to discuss marriage. This paled in comparison to the passionate and romantic affair she was involved in with Halley Oyama Mgudlwa when Jordan proposed marriage. Halley was related to her stepmother. Ntantala (2009: 80) described their relationship as such:

> Halley was the man who stayed and anchored me, who taught me that life was not a game, that love was the most beautiful thing that two people can share… With him, I was happy, relaxed, secure, comfortable, as I had been with Tata.

In the build-up to her marriage, her correspondence with 'Prince Hal' as she affectionately called him, reached a fever pitch. Ntantala (2009:104) describes it as being "thick", "hot" and

© University of Pretoria

"romantic". They made plans to meet for a final rendezvous, but she called it off at the last minute. Reflecting on her decision to marry Jordan, Ntantala (2009: 77) remarked that although she never fell in love with Jordan, the marriage allowed her to mature intellectually and opened access to the world. Ntantala (2009:114) describes Jordan as such:

> He was never a lover but a husband. Because he was not demonstrative, there were very few romantic scenes between us even during the period of our engagement. He was excited in his own way, though I never experienced that romantic excitement I had known with Halley. He loved and respected me, and this grew over the years.

On the marriage, Ntantala (2009: 119) remarks that she "…was a free and emancipated woman…". However, she firmly asserts that her own efforts brought about emancipation. Ntantala (2009: 119) states that she decided to continue to work earlier on in the marriage. The decision was triggered by their irreconcilable differences in taste as Jordan was frugal. Ntantala let Jordan pay the house bills, and she brought personal items with her earnings. She did not discuss this matter with Jordan; she merely informed him. The decision allowed her to circumvent the confines of traditional marriage and attain self-emancipation. Ntantala (2009: 119) states that her decision followed in the footsteps of her red blanket aunts, who worked even as they were married men of means. This act contributed to the development of Ntantala's identity as a self-emancipated woman.

Ntantala does not present a self that is submerged to the dictates of the collective struggles. Anderton (1994: 102) reads Ntantala's autobiography to encode "conflicting personalities" that wrestle between independent public figures and traditional public self. Ntantala (2009: 196) describes herself as a "modern African woman" conscious of her position in the household and public life. She is as unrelenting in identifying and speaking out against patriarchal power as she is about racism. In such instances, she does not deviate from the narrative modes identified by Davies. Nor does she speak with what Samuelson (2012: 761) describes as "forked tongue". In her personal politics and intimate relationships, Ntantala does not fold her critique and resistance against patriarchal power within anti-apartheid discourse. An example of this is evident when she refuses to visit the Jordan family home to introduce her son, Pallo, soon after giving birth. On the visit to introduce her first-born daughter, Ntantala experienced lactation suppression induced by physical strain from fetching water and chopping wood. Ntantala (2009: 117) remarked that it was untoward that the Jordan women completed all these tasks whilst their male relatives sat idle. Unrelenting, she refused to go back because of these previous experiences. She did not buckle under pressure from her older sister, who deplored

© University of Pretoria

Ntantala's decision. This is an example of Ntantala voicing disapproval of the traditional mores that upheld patriarchal power in the household without folding it in a critique of racial oppression.

Ntantala does not grasp authorial authority by submerging herself into the collective struggle. The substance and form of selfhood that she fashioned sought independence and fulfilment outside the roles prescribed for her as mother and wife. In the preface of the autobiography, Ntantala (2009: viii) states, "Yes, this is my story", before she delves into the nature of familial relations and her contribution to the struggle. Furthermore, Ntantala does not espouse a fractured and decentred subject wrestling to understand and reunite fragments of herself scattered across colonial and apartheid South Africa and life in exile in England and the U.S. Her roots are planted eGqubeni, a place she prizes as moulding her. At times the autobiography reads like an idealistic and romanticised account of rural life and her upbringing. Ntantala's experiences with class and privilege structured how she viewed herself, her position in the world, and her approach to activism. Elitism infuses an undercurrent of arrogance that she willingly admits to. However, Ntantala does not reflect in-depth on the impact that her class and privilege had. Besides a comment in the preface, she does not consider how it structured her interactions with the women she wrote about or how exile induced a shift in her class position. At the end of *A Life's Mosaic*, the protagonist we have encountered is self-emancipated, surprisingly candid, deplores and fights against injustices, and carries a healthy dose of self-confidence.

The Subaltern and the Black Public Intellectual

This section tackles the relationship between the Black public intellectual and their public sphere(s). This is partly motivated by the lack of research examining the public intellectual and their public(s). Foucault insists that the people no longer require the public intellectual to make representations of truth on their behalf due to knowledge being inextricably tied to the production of power and intellectuals resisting being made agents of power. This raises questions on the positionality of the Black public intellectual vis-à-vis their public sphere(s) and those who inhabit them. Thus, we arrive at a juncture where we contemplate what it signifies for the Black public intellectual to align herself with and make representations on behalf of her people.

It is beneficial for this discussion to bring in a contradictory voice to Foucault that probes how his statements on theory as actional opens a new field of operation for the public intellectual.

© University of Pretoria

In framing these ideas, reference will be made to Spivak's seminal article, “Can the Subaltern Speak”. Two variations of the article will be used from 1988 and 2010. Spivak's article offered a new perspective on Foucault's statements and the prospects he opened for the intellectual to go beyond making representations to and on behalf of the subaltern. Spivak (2010: 27-28) argues that by doing so, Foucault encourages intellectuals to not reflect on the historical role that they have played. Because intellectual labour is actional, the public intellectual can equate intellectual labouring to manual labour; they are rendered transparent, merely operating as witnesses who report on the non-represented subject.

Spivak (2010: 35) argues that Foucault does not consider how the intellectual utilises Western ontological and epistemological frameworks that operate to produce the other, through critique or support, as the subject's shadow. Spivak reaches the same conclusion on intellectuals working in the third world. Their research modalities are subsumed under the same frameworks and employ a form of critique which views the subaltern in oppositional terms to their elite counterparts. Furthermore, they burden themselves with becoming acquainted with and bearing witness to the true consciousness of the subaltern (Spivak 2010: 40).

Spivak's (2010: 22-23) answer to "can the subaltern speak?" is an unequivocal "no". The subaltern cannot speak as they are subsumed under colonial discourses and western frameworks. Spivak (2010: 41) understands women as part of the subaltern to be "…deeply in shadow…" due to the andro-centric focus by intellectuals on both sides of the colonial divide. Although the subaltern is seen as being unable to speak, it does not mean that they do not. Their subjective position has rendered them void of the necessary political and economic agency to have their utterances recognised as a discourse that carries their self-interests and identities (Chattopadhyay 2017).

Ntantala aligning with rural women signalled an awareness that their speech was not recognised. To tease out this, we will briefly explore Ntantala's positionality in comparison to her subject matter against the theme of mobility. The decision to focus on mobility is motivated by Ntantala's approach to understanding the experiences of rural women by documenting their migration to the city. Furthermore, mobility is crucial to understanding Ntantala's intellectual journey. To determine Ntantala's positionality concerning these rural women, I examine the drivers and channels used to migrate.

Ntantala centres rural women in her public intellectualism. Her seminal articles demonstrated how the apartheid capitalist economy resulted in rural women being wholly dependent on their

© University of Pretoria

men yet confined to the reserves through a network of laws prohibiting their movement. These articles documented the hardship that drove rural women to venture into the city to search for their husbands and escape poverty. In "Black Womanhood and National Liberation", Ntantala (1984: 14) remarks on the drivers of rural women's migration to the city:

> We must understand the 'illegal' urban migration of African women and their families in this context. The so-called 'squatter camps' at Crossroads, Unibell etc, represent sites of heroic struggles by peasant women, who flatly refuse to be consigned to the darkness of the Bantustan, away from their husbands, away from life, deprived of even the common decencies of subsistence. They represent, on one hand, the determination of the landless peasant to become part of the urban working class, and, on the other, and Canute-like insistence of the regime that they remain peasants.

Ntantala demonstrates how women resisted being consigned to immobility and perpetual economic dependency. The opening up and confinement of mobility and migration for Black women in apartheid was deeply steeped in political and social relations that rested on the intersection of race and gender (Hyndman 2004: 181). Ntantala's middle-class status would not have shielded her from the brute force of apartheid. However, it offered some protections. Once in the city, Black women were regarded as vectors of diseases, immorality, and criminality (Sapire 2000: 56).

Undeniably, the driving factors that compelled Ntantala to migrate differed from those faced by rural women. Ntantala (1979: 69) states that rural women came to the city to "…escape the poverty, the drudgery and the loneliness of the reserves." This is reflective of the socioeconomic distance between Ntantala and rural women. In comparison, Ntantala's travels to pursue academic and experiential knowledge, which allowed her to understand how the colonial and apartheid regime operated. Boswell (2017: 417) calls this "creative re-envisioning" where an individual creates intellectual and political space to understand their oppression as well as how to attain freedom. This was not a possibility for rural women.

The channels through which Ntantala and rural women migrated varied. Ntantala secured documentation that allowed her to relocate from Fort Hare to Cape Town. She went on to apply for an exemption from the native's council to live outside the township. In comparison, rural women's movement was restricted through pass laws and influx control measures. Later in exile. Ntantala writes about her fight to gain permanent residence in the U.S after Jordan's death. The immigration authorities saw no reason for Ntantala to remain as she came to join Jordan. His death signalled the end of her stay. The authorities' rationale is comparable to the

© University of Pretoria

factors driving rural women to journey to the city to join their partners and build homes. Unlike these women, Ntantala marshalled the assistance of senators and lawyers from the University of Wisconsin to regularise her stay. The lawyer utilised her British citizenship to gain permanent residence. In her autobiography, Ntantala (2009: 229) remarks that she had given up during the process and she would not:

> …allow [her]self to play a game with Immigration in their own court, with their own men as referees, and according to their rules. It was a no-win situation, and I was not going to play it any longer. If they wanted to throw me out, let them.

Although desperate, Ntantala was willing to brave the outcome of being endorsed out. In comparison, when rural women opted to use legal channels to acquire exit permits from the reserves, this necessitated sharing reasons for travelling- a potentially humiliating experience. Those unwilling to subject themselves to this or were denied permission clandestinely made their way to the city. The channels available to rural women to migrate to cities were restrictive and dangerous. This is not to argue that Ntantala was exempt from the official processes. However, her reasons for migrating- the pursuit of employment or education- and class meant she had a significantly different experience.

On the relationship she shared with the many women she assisted working at the Institute of Race Relations (IRR) in Cape Town, Ntantala reflects (1979:10):

> I still remember their warm embraces and their hot tears falling on my face when the news was good. I must confess that locked in their warm embraces, I, too, cried, and the ability to cry with them relieved the pain in me; it made things easy for me and sealed the bonds of friendship between us.

By all accounts, Ntantala did not perceive there to be an unbridgeable chasm between her and these women. On the contrary, their mutual vulnerability led them to share in each other's pain and become friends. This vulnerability arose due to being a Black woman living in a racist and sexist regime.

The facticity of race, imposed on Ntantala (2009: 236) even in exile, as she states that Jordan's death left her in a "bad financial state". At the end of her autobiography, Ntantala (2009: 236) summarises her life as such:

> It has been a lonely life, a struggle in which sometimes I lived off the smell of an oil rag. But with the support of my children, and my friends, I have come this far and can say: I have survived.

© University of Pretoria

Collins (2000: 24-26) argues that a common experience is created from facing racial and sexual discrimination. This contributes to the formation of group consciousness among Black women. Violence is at the root of these experiences and can permeate class lines. This shared experience may have influenced Ntantala's alliance with rural women. The entryways to this group consciousness are affected by an individual's socioeconomic position and social networks. Ntantala's social networks set her to occupy a differentiated position- even in exile, where she could marshall support from senators and universities. However, their shared experiences as Black women, the vulnerability which arose from it, mediates Ntantala's relationship with them.

Ntantala experience of being Black, woman and living under apartheid may have influenced her decision to speak about and document the lives of rural women. In some ways, Ntantala represented part of herself by echoing a reality and life that she observed growing up but found herself on the cusp of falling into later in exile. The necessity of the Black female public intellectual cannot be denied as they are select few given an opportunity to create intellectual space, reflect on oppression and utilise their voice to speak against it. As Spivak (1988: 308) argues, representation has not ended, and the role of the female public intellectual remains. Spivak adds that this should be a limited role and cannot be easily renounced. The female public intellectual's role should be limited and dependent upon their ability to reflect and engage on their positionality vis-à-vis critically their subject matter.

3.5.Conclusion

This chapter began by outlining the experiences and events that formed the thematic thread Ntantala created into the plotline of her autobiography to account for her emergence as a public intellectual. The social milieu which she was born into and lived were presented to contextualise and localise Ntantala. Missionary education and mobility were pivotal in her intellectual journey, as they reinforced Ntantala´s class consciousness and expanded her social views. Exile is when she began to articulate the ideas that had pervaded her life under a Black feminist framework. Ntantala's involvement in transnational communities may have led to this development. However, tentative conclusions can only be made due to the silences on the academic and intellectual ventures she conducted during this period.

The second issue the chapter tackled was Ntantala self-representation through her autobiography and the relationship she shared with the rural women centred in her intellectual corpus. Ntantala deviates and conforms to the narrative nodes characterising African women's

© University of Pretoria

autobiographies. The self that readers encounter is modern, confident, and self-emancipated. However, Ntantala presents an idyllic and romanticised version of her upbringing. This may be attributed to the distance between this period and when she was writing the autobiography.

Ntantala did not reflect adequately on the relationship between her and women whose lives she documented. As a middle-class woman, Ntantala was able to gain mobility and navigate oppressive apartheid laws restricting women's migration in ways that rural women could not. Furthermore, their reasons for and channels used to migrate are vastly different. However, Ntantala did not perceive there to be an unbridgeable chasm between her and these women. On the contrary, their shared vulnerability, emerging from their experiences of living as black women under apartheid, appears to be the bridge.

Ntantala's intellectual corpus will be examined in depth in the following chapter. It will be shown that her public intellectualism centred on rural women is characterised by a fluidity between the public and private spheres. The focus of this chapter was to contextualise Ntantala and lay the groundwork for how we engage with her intellectual corpus and public intellectualism. However, as it will become apparent in the next chapter, her personal politics and views on the private sphere have a significant bearing on her public intellectualism.

© University of Pretoria

Chapter Four: The Intellectual Thoughts and Contributions of Phyllis Ntantala

4.1 Introduction

This chapter outlines the themes in Ntantala's intellectual ideas and the platforms she used to express these ideas and engage with her public. Ntantala's intellectual work is vast and could take up several volumes, but three identifiable themes characterise it: 1. Black women, 2. education, 3. liberation and the post-1994 dispensation. A two-pronged strategy further characterises Ntantala's intellectual work. Firstly, she adopted a political economy approach to demonstrate that the oppression faced by Black women was rooted in the structural requirements of racial capitalism. Ntantala contextualised the experiences and position of Black women against the broader socio-political and economic order. By assuming a micro-level perspective that zoned in on Black women, she demonstrated the effects of macro-level processes on Black households. Ntantala illustrated that the domestic politics of the private sphere are entangled in the political and economic orders. The second approach offered counter-narratives to the dominant accounts controlled and expressed by the apartheid state and commanding figures or organisations in the liberation movement. Ntantala offered counter-narratives filled with personalities and organisations that are not readily acknowledged nor celebrated in nationalist history. Resultantly, Ntantala portrayed the liberation movement as a contested intellectual space with conflicting voices wrestling over how the offensive against the apartheid regime should be staged and what freedom would entail once it was attained.

Ntantala's work can be classified as falling into four categories: 1. academic/research, 2. fictional, 3. social commentary and, 4. autobiographical writings. For this study, correspondence between family and friends is also examined. Correspondence offers moments between Ntantala and the receiver where she displays emotion and expresses herself with a frankness absent in her academic writings. Including these works is informed by the perception that to write in Black women as public intellectuals, what we typically perceive as artefacts of intellectual work must be dismantled. Maintaining canonical purity by deferring only to research writings or speeches draws limitations and boundaries of exclusion which manifest

© University of Pretoria

along racial, gendered, and sexual lines (Etter-Lewis 2000: 85). Furthermore, including fictional, social commentary, autobiography, and letters encourages us to resist the urge to demand that intellectual ideas conform to an accessible and linear corpus. The intellectual artefacts chosen reveal the three themes identified as characterising Ntantala's corpus.

The chapter continues with contextualising Ntantala across the historical places and temporalities in which she lived. This is done to determine her intellectual ideas and strategies deployed to engage with her public and manoeuvre intellectual spaces. The chapter demonstrates that Ntantala´s public intellectualism is characterised by fluidity between the private and public spheres. Ntantala utilised what many characterise as private issues to inform the work she carried out in the public sphere. Issues circumscribed to the private sphere became the entryway into the public sphere. Other times, Ntantala would use opportunities to address public issues to demonstrate how these were informed by so-called private matters. When this occurred, Ntantala shows how these issues should not be restricted to the private or public sphere but are affected by socio-political and economic orders governing society.

The structure of the chapter is as follows. In the first part, Black women are examined as the subject of Ntantala's work. Ntantala engaged with Black women not as sites to extract information but as agentive and intellectual actors. To this end, she documented their lived experiences under apartheid to demonstrate how the confluence of racial capitalism and sexism regulated Black women to a state of precariousness. Part two looks at her involvement in campaigns against Bantu Education as the physical and intellectual space where Ntantala expressed her ideas. The focus is on the efforts of the Western Cape branch of the Cape African Teachers Association (CATA) fight against the roll-out of the Bantu Education Act of 1953. Ntantala contextualised CATA's campaigns against the political and ideological conflicts in the liberation movement. Part three examines Ntantala's ideas on liberation and the compromise reached in 1994. According to Ntantala, the compromises reached between the Black bourgeoisie and the Afrikaner ruling class resulted in democracy being delayed. Part five will conclude.

4.2 African Woman Under Apartheid

At the centre of Ntantala's public intellectualism are Black women. Ntantala documented their lives, experiences, and relationships living under apartheid in discussions and academic papers. She adopted a textual strategy that included Black women's bodies in the texts she wrote (Cooper 2017:11). The body she emphasised is rural and peasant. Cooper (2017: 11) argues

© University of Pretoria

that Black women in their intellectual pursuits invoked corporeality to make other women's lives and experiences knowable at times when they were marginalised from the public sphere by discriminatory and patriarchal states.

This section will begin by outlining the approach and framework that Ntantala utilised. She adopted a political economy approach that demonstrated how Black women were the most oppressed during apartheid. She supplemented this with a framework that emphasised the relationship between class, race, and gender. However, Ntantala recognised that during apartheid, many Black women subordinated gender to racial and class cleavages. Following this, we shall examine how Ntantala employed this framework when she documented the lives and everyday experiences of ordinary women. Lastly, we will explore Ntantala's study of Black women intellectuals. Ntantala argued that women's political activism should be contextualised against a longer duration and demonstrated that their intellectual ideas shifted the terrain of debate in the liberation movement.

The section will use three documents written during and after apartheid. The first of these is an anthology, *An African Tragedy: The Black Women Under Apartheid*, published in 1979. The anthology is a collection of essays written in earlier years but published collectively by Black-owned publication Agascha Production whilst Ntantala was living in Taylor, Michigan. The book holds one of her best-known essays, "Widows of the Reserve", initially published in the journal *Africa South* when she lived in Cape Town in 1957. The essay was translated into several languages and reprinted in an anthology compiled by Langston Hughes. The second document, "Black Womanhood and National Liberation", was written in 1984 for the journal *Sechaba*. Sechaba was the official mouthpiece of the African National Congress (ANC). The third document is a speech given by Ntantala in 2006 at the University of Cape Town titled "Black Women Intellectuals and Liberation Struggle". The address formed part of a lecture series that explored the relationship between the archive and constructions of identity in post-apartheid South Africa.

Ntantala's Approach and Framework to Understanding the Lives of Black Women Living Under Apartheid

Ntantala argues that to understand the realities and effects of apartheid, Black women need to become the subject of analysis. In an essay "Black Womanhood and National Liberation", Ntantala (1984:3-4) argues:

© University of Pretoria

> …the most persuasive and total oppression, the oppression of [Black] women, has been to a large extent neglected by scholars of the movement… The effects of White domination on Black people is perhaps most glaringly expressed in its treatment of African women. Not only has it debased us as members of an oppressed people but debases us to a position below that of objects.

For Ntantala, Black women's lives and daily experiences offered the greatest insight to understanding apartheid. Collins (1997: 376) elaborates on this why this is possible and argues that group-based experience can illuminate how social structures -- cultivated by racism, class, gender, sexuality and ethnicity -- are fundamental devices used to perpetuate inequality.

Ntantala utilised a political-economy approach and traced the historical events that led to Black women's precariousness in society. Ntantala (1984:6-7) argues that the modernisation of South Africa, through the introduction of capitalist consumption and modes of production, resulted in racial differentiation and class stratification in Black communities. Modernisation exemplified through the establishment of a Black peasantry prohibited from commercial farming and the imposition of a migrant labour system to service the expansion of the mining sector locked Black communities into inequality and poverty. For Ntantala, the status of Black women is institutionalised in this system through the promulgation of laws and taxation schemes – such as the Natives Land Act of 1913, Urban Areas Act of 1923, Natives Administration Act of 1927, Women's Enfranchisement Act of 1930, and poll hut tax devised to create a labour surplus. To gain an understanding of how this system functioned, Ntantala (1984: 14) offers the example of rural Black women:

> The peasant woman of the reserves and Bantustans presents the starkest picture of exploitation and degradation. Trapped in the hellholes of poverty and economic backwardness, they are forced to live as widows, though they have husbands, are impressed into being mother and father to their families, and consequently can be neither. South African capitalism has assigned them the role of producing labour units.

The precarious women on the reserves faced was caused by the confluence of racial capitalism and gendered oppression (Ntantala 1984: 11-12). Their poverty was an intended outcome of economic and socio-political engineering at the hands of the apartheid state and white capital.

Ntantala further supplements this approach with a framework that revolves around the relationship between class, race, and gender. For example, in her article in *Sechaba*, Ntantala (1984:14) writes:

© University of Pretoria

> In spite of their differing class situations, Black women in general share a number of disabilities peculiar to them as members of the oppressed nationalities and as a gender group. The interwoven steel net of colour and gender has to be seriously addressed in the definition of a strategy for women's emancipation.

Ntantala acknowledges that even though South Africa is a patriarchal state, many Black women regarded political and class cleavages as being more pressing than gender in this "interwoven steel net" (Ntantala 1984: 11-14). In their everyday lives, Black women encountered white women as an immediate and tangible source of oppression. This analysis permits Ntantala to produce a historical account of Black women's desolation. In one example, Ntantala (1984: 109 documents how changes in gender arrangements in Black communities following the installation of colonialism and apartheid facilitated the emergence of a new kind of oppression of Black women, resulting in their enslavement as legal minors under the guardianship of their male partners or relatives. Ntantala (1984:15) further argues that the oppression of Black women also rested on the traditions and mores of their own communities. In this instance, Ntantala reinforced the effects of gendered oppression on Black communities even though many Black women did not view this as a fundamental cleavage. This lends to the dynamic nature of Ntantala's framework, as Black women's subjectivity is continuously evolving and interpolated from historical events and political and socio-economic processes.

The Effects of Apartheid on Black Women

Ntantala painstakingly documented the lives and experiences of ordinary women in *An African Tragedy: The Black Women Under Apartheid*. The most well-known essay in the anthology is "Widows of the Reserve", which first appeared in the journal Africa South in 1958. The essay demonstrated how the demands of the apartheid capitalist economy, a network of laws and taxation schemes engineered to drive men into migrant labour system, resulted in Black women becoming wholly dependent on men. In 1957, Ntantala published another essay with *Africa South* which adopted a personal approach to illustrating the arguments that Ntantala made in previous articles. "African Tragedy" is based on the life of Mrs Dumani: she became the anchor point onto which readers could witness the journey that young women took from the countryside to the city in search of their husbands and to escape poverty.

Ntantala traces Mrs Dumani's travels from the reserves to the townships as she attempts to flee from poverty and reunite with her husband in Cape Town. However, the urban townships that she fled to plunged Mrs Dumani into another state of poverty. Ntantala (1979: 22-33) recounts

© University of Pretoria

how Mrs Dumani's marriage ended upon the death of her husband, who had returned to Cape Town from Transkei after failure to get a land allocation, successive droughts, and poor harvests. One of her children died before meeting their father, with another passing soon after her husband departed for Cape Town. Her last-born daughter died whilst she was in Cape Town seeking employment. Mrs Dumani could not travel to attend her husband's funeral nor return to the Transkei to bury her daughter. Ntantala (1979: 33) states that Mrs Dumani story was emblematic of many other women whose lives were characterised by constant movement between town and country.

Ntantala (2009: 168) states that her decision to record the lives of ordinary women was influenced by the fact that these were women who were considered insignificant:

> I decided to write about those other women whom nobody ever hears about, whose stories has never been told, because they are not the 'pillars' of their societies. These were some of the girls I had grown up with, now married and living the lives of widows, as their menfolk were away in the cities.

This stance by Ntantala resonates with the strategies employed by her predecessors, such as Maxeke and Jabavu. A strategy succinctly captured by Cooper (2017), who states that as public intellectuals, Ntantala and her predecessors invoked corporeality in their speech and writing to make these women knowable at a time when they forcefully tucked away in reserve.

4.3 Black Women's Political and Intellectual Contributions to the Anti-Apartheid Movement.

Ntantala places Black women at the centre of her intellectual corpus because she views them as agentive and forceful political actors. This section will shift the chronological focus from apartheid to the post-apartheid state. The document used here is a speech that Ntantala delivered at a public lecture series held at UCT in 2006. The speech, "Black Women Intellectuals and Liberation Struggle", documents Black women's political activism and intellectual ideas. The lecture series questioned the construction of identities based on self-contained and entrenched archives (Archive and Public Culture 2006). Archives are items or bodies of knowledge from the past. These serve as sources that can be tapped into and shape our thinking about the present.

Throughout the speech, Ntantala questions the construction of archives restricted to select time frames in our national history. Events and characters are cherry-picked and cast within a contained narrative with a definitive beginning and end. For Ntantala, this equates to the

© University of Pretoria

erasure and marginalisation of Black women's work in the liberation movement. In this address, Ntantala emphasises two points. Firstly, since the imposition of colonialism and apartheid, Black women were an integral component of the struggle, and their efforts should be contextualised to showcase this. Secondly, she argues that although there was evidence of these efforts, Black women's political activism and intellectual ideas are scarcely engaged with. Ntantala (2006:7) stresses that women's political and ideological standpoint- expressed through the political organisation they were affiliated with or joined serves as an entryway to engage with their intellectual ideas. She uses this approach due to the lack of writing that women left behind.

Ntantala begins the address by recounting how Black women were integral to the struggle, with their involvement stretching back to the Wars of Dispossession (1779-1878). She states that women's resistance should be contextualised against a longer time frame in our national history. The much-lauded 1956 pass march, according to Ntantala (2006:2), must be viewed as one moment that rests on the efforts of women's political activism. Ntantala argues that the victory of 1956 lay in its symbolic value. However, women marched against passes as far back as 1913 and 1919. She recounts how women in the Orange Free State (OFS) rallied and burnt their passes at the provincial capital in 1913. In 1919 the women of the OFS rallied once again, this time joined by Charlotte Maxeke, to fight against passes. According to Ntantala (2006:2), these campaigns demonstrate the critical role that women played in the liberation movement since its inception and their ability to undertake independent action.

Ntantala (2006: 5-6) then charts the trajectory of women's intellectual ideas and how these contributed to the liberation movement from colonialism to apartheid. Speaking on Leftist activist intellectuals operating during apartheid, Ntantala (2006: 9-12) profiles women such as Clare Goodlatte, Zainuissa Gool, Epaninette Mbeki, Ray Simons and Janub Gool to argue that their membership or affiliation with the Communist Party of South Africa (CPSA) infused a radical stance into nationalist politics. Following their participation, the CPSA stopped collaborating with the apartheid government and transformed its class character to align with peasants and farm workers.

Furthermore, their involvement in the CPSA injected a new perspective on the native question as it was now linked to landlessness. Ntantala (2009: 11) further argues that these women's positionality on ideological contestations in the labour and liberation movement led many to break away from established parties or workgroups. For example, she recounts how Epaninette

© University of Pretoria

Mbeki joined the CPSA when her intended, Govan Mbeki, was dabbling in the politics of the Bhunga council in the Transkei. Ntantala (2009: 12) reads this as a tacit recognition by Epaninette Mbeki that the inclusion of the Black bourgeoisie in governance structures was merely a plot to placate them. According to Ntantala, Epaninette Mbeki viewed the council as incompatible with liberation. These actions served as an expression of women's intellectual ideas and signalled a definitive move to challenge and shape the liberation movement's ideological direction.

4.4 Ntantala on Bantu Education

Ntantala's work against Bantu Education is perhaps the most celebrated component of her political activism. In 1960, Ntantala published an article *in Africa South* speaking out against the implementation of Bantu Education, which has become synonymous with her political activism. In 1961, Ntantala published a more extended variation of this essay in the journal *Fighting Talk*. The journal was edited by Ruth First and distributed across Southern Africa. Ntantala's writing on education focused on the years between 1955-1960 when the Bantu Education Act of 1953 was implemented.

For this section, we shall look at Ntantala's detailed essay "Bantu Education 1955-1960: A Survey by Phyllis Ntantala", published in *Fighting Talk*. An exhaustive study where Ntantala views on Bantu Education, as an instrument in the state´s legal apparatus, are discernible. We shall also use Ntantala's autobiography, *A Life's Mosaic* and a personal letter to Velile Mqota commenting on his book about Bantu Education. The autobiography was published in 2009, and correspondence with Mqota took place in 2008. This selection of documents moves chronologically from apartheid to post-apartheid South Africa.

Ntantala's essay in *Fighting Talk* goes into extensive detail, recounting the instability and chaos caused by the implementation of Bantu Education. The copy used here is the unedited version of the essay with the accompanying note sent to the editor. Ntantala acknowledged in the note that the essay was too long for a journal like Fighting Talk, and she preferred to publish it as a series. In "Bantu Education 1955-1960: A Survey by Phyllis Ntantala", she focuses on four areas that were affected: schools, syllabus, teacher training and school governance. Ntantala (1961) first comments on the chaos that ensued when the system was launched on 12 April 1954:

> Teachers worked for months without receiving their pay… teachers never received any replies to urgent correspondence sent to the department, without any regulations governing the

© University of Pretoria

> conditions of service being drawn up and promulgated, teachers were made to enter into contracts with their employers, the [Bantu Education Department] BAD, schools were dis-established to be re-established. All of this chaos took the BAD about two years to sort out…

Prior to this, education was managed by the churches and communities. Schools were underfunded, inadequately equipped, and overcrowded with a shortage of teachers. However, Ntantala (1961) claims that children fared well due to the devotion of teachers and cooperation between the missionaries and communities who funded the construction of schools. With the implementation of Bantu Education, teachers were dismissed for their opposition to the Act and subsequently, the system buckled. Ntantala (1961) states that the implementation of Bantu Education aimed to destroy Black communities by limiting the kind of jobs that their children could access. She illustrates this point by focusing on the changes made to the syllabus. Prior to the implementation of the Bantu Education Act, the syllabus was drawn up by the provincial government, with schools free to choose the syllabi they wished to follow. Some regarded the new syllabus as an improvement due to its similarities with that of the Cape Province. However, Ntantala (1961) disagrees because Bantu Education imposed mother-tongue as a medium of instruction. Black children were colonial subjects, the imposition of mother tongue would result in them not being able to access the job market:

> What use is the mother-tongue to colonial subjects who have to compete for jobs in a market where the avenues of knowledge are not in the mother-tongue? …The mother-tongue not only limits the horizon of the students but also limits their scope of development. The Bantu languages as media of instruction are not at all suitable for the simple reason that they have not yet evolved terms to express concepts in science and mathematics and even teaching of history and geography through mother-tongue is almost impossible.

Ntantala (1961:13) views on Bantu Education are clear; it was a coercive instrument to control Black communities. Their education would ensure that they never occupied the same jobs as their white counterparts. By presenting the rationale for Bantu Education, Ntantala contextualised it against the racist ideology which guided the apartheid state. Bantu Education worked in concert with several laws designed to consign Black children to slavery and turn them into cheap labour.

Ntantala's activism against Bantu education is the most celebrated aspect of her political activism. However, we have not contextualised her work against the existing scholarship on Bantu Education. It is important that we write Ntantala's intellectual ideas into the public sphere and academy as she lectured and presented seminars. Ntantala's views of Bantu

© University of Pretoria

Education made a decisive break with existing scholarship, which concerned itself with elucidating the reproductive role of education or how the Act reflected clashes between opposing white groups. Focusing on the reproductive role of education led to the foregrounding of class analysis to argue that racism may not have been the only or overriding motivation for Bantu Education (Rose 1965; Christie & Collins 1982). In these analyses, the driving force was the demand for the reproduction of cheap Black labour. Schools became a component of the apartheid state's legal apparatus to ensure social control and produce an adequately trained labour force willing to participate in capitalist relations of exchange. Other studies examined the implementation of Bantu Education as reflective of power struggles within the apartheid regime (Hyslop 1988; Giliomee 2009). Race as the ideology underpinning Bantu Education took on secondary importance. These studies focused on how several changes following the implementation of the policy- such as the shift towards the usage of Afrikaans as a medium of instruction -were reflective of struggles in the National Party.

Ntantala's decisive break is to speak about the facticity of Bantu Education and emphasise the racist ideology that was driving it. She went beyond these debates, which turned the lens inward to whiteness and neglected to record the tangible and everyday effects of Bantu Education. Ntantala detailed the effects of the Act on the character of Black education and communities. This is certainly stepped ahead of liberals who occupied themselves with understanding how education policies during apartheid inhabited capitalist economic development. Furthermore, Ntantala went further than Marxists, who argued that education policies were created to meet the demands of capital and consolidate the position of dominant political groups. Ntantala agreed with scholars who focused on the reproductive role of education, but emphasised the importance of racism as the ideology propelling these developments. Most importantly, Ntantala placed Black children and their communities at the centre of her analysis of the Act.

In later years Ntantala's writings on Bantu Education reflected on how teachers, parents, students, and organisations fought against its implementation. She concentrated on her involvement in CATA and parents' responses to the boycott campaign launched by the ANC. Ntantala discusses personalities and organisations which do not feature prominently in nationalist history. In these writings, Ntantala emphasised the ideological disagreements and strategic differences among parties in the liberation movement. She presented the strategies pursued by CATA as offering a counter-narrative to those proposed by the ANC. Consequently, Ntantala represented the liberation movement as a counterpublic characterised by patriarchal dominance and intellectual contestations. This was the space where Ntantala shared her

© University of Pretoria

intellectual ideas whilst encouraging other women to do the same. *A Life's Mosaic* and correspondence with Velile Mqota contain extensive information on these efforts and will be referenced.

CATA's protest against Bantu Education began in 1949 at an annual conference where delegates rejected the premise of the Eiselen Commission on Native Education and argued that education should be guided by the principle of equality among its citizens regardless of race, class and gender (Ntantala 2009: 152). Once the law was implemented, CATA convened a parent-teacher meeting in Cape Town in May of 1953. On the agenda was the resolution reached by the ANC in 1952 in anticipation of the Act. The resolution called for parents to boycott and withdraw their children enrolled in Sub A through to Standard Five. Learners above these grades would remain in school. According to Ntantala (2009: 159), when Johnson Ngwevela, an ANC supporter, presented this, the response from delegates was resounding disapproval:

> Three women got up to speak on this resolution. One was a young woman, Francina Mamfanya, a mother of three. Francina said: 'What I would like to know is: Whose children must be doomed to no education while other people's get an education?'… You see me standing here, my first-born is due to go to school only this coming year. I want her also to go to Fort Hare someday. Why should my children be condemned to ignorance while other peoples are not?

This was emblematic of teachers and parents across the country. Parents saw this as an unethical stance by the leadership of the ANC. Ntantala (2008), in correspondence with Velile Mqota, states that the children of Mandela and Sisulu were given scholarships to study in Swaziland once Bantu Education was enforced. In December 1953, CATA convened a national conference inviting teachers and parents from all four provinces. Unfortunately, the Act passed months earlier, and CATA had to formulate its resolution. Ntantala (2009:160) argues that CATA teachers resolved to remain at their posts and would urge parents to not withdraw their children from school as a means of boycotting. CATA parents would send their children to school but vowed not to cooperate with the state and refuse to become part of school boards.

In comparison to this pragmatic and measured reaction from CATA, Ntantala describes the ANC's resolution as elitist, detached from the aspirations and realities of parents as well as teachers in the country. In her autobiography Ntantala (2009:166) explains:

> The school boycotts! Could it have succeeded? No. Because as one observer wrote in the Cape Times: 'This could never have been a decision of the African parents, who were so keen on

© University of Pretoria

> educating their children and would go to any lengths to achieve that. This was a rash decision of the elite who purported to speak for them, a publicity stunt, so as to appear tough'.

This was fuelled by a lack of effort on the ANC's part to educate the people about why the boycott was necessary. Ntantala (2009: 166) argues that the ANC did not fully comprehend that the Act was a pretext for creating cheap labour and would become part of the state's oppressive legal apparatus. In comparison, the strategies adopted by CATA is characterised by Ntantala (2008) as:

> …mature, serious and responsible, knowing their limits did what was practical. They would send their children to school even Bantu Education Schools, for a child who can read and write is better than one who cannot…

This contrasts the ANC's stance that Ntantala perceives as reactionary and a publicity stunt. These contrasting responses point to diverging opinions on the role of education. For Ntantala and CATA, education was fundamental to lifting Black communities out of poverty as any form of education was better than nothing. In comparison, the ANC's decision to boycott then later establish grassroots initiatives to provide basic schooling and cultural clubs, according to Ntantala, indicted their view on education as a means of social control. Goodhew (2000:258) makes the same assessment of the rationale driving the establishment of cultural clubs. The clubs provided basic education and acted to control children from juvenile delinquency rather than to educate them.

Ntantala's reflections on the ideological disagreements and strategic differences between organisations in the liberation movement allow us to view it as a counterpublic characterised by intellectual contestations. This was a space where Ntantala shared her intellectual ideas and encouraged other women to do the same. In her autobiography, Ntantala (2009: 155) recounts how CATA's involvement in organising the boycott of the Van Riebeck Celebration of 1952 led to her first public speech. The theme of the campaign was "We Have Nothing to Celebrate". On 4 April 1952, the organising committee, comprised of several organisations, held their final political rally to encourage residents of Cape Town to boycott. The organising committee wanted a Black woman to make a speech and requested that Ntantala do so. Ntantala (2009: 155) was reluctant at first, but through the urging of other women, she delivered a speech linking the theme of the boycott "…to the position of Black women, the exploited workers in the cities and widows of the reserve…". This opportunity came through her involvement with CATA. In her speech, Ntantala demonstrated the fluidity which informed her public

© University of Pretoria

intellectualism. Ntantala used this opportunity to address a public matter, the political boycott against the Van Riebeck celebration -regarded as a critical historical moment for the Nationalist Party- and related it to seemingly private matters such as the Black women left behind in the reserves and their men entrapped in a migrant labour system.

CATA convening in December 1953 offered another opportunity for Ntantala to speak. Young people in attendance urged Ntantala to make an address hoping that it would inspire other women in attendance to speak up. Although women were in attendance, many were reluctant to speak as they saw the meeting and the issues discussed as the affairs of men (Ntantala 2009: 163). In her autobiography, Ntantala (2009: 163) includes an extract of that speech:

> A flock without lambs is doomed. A herd without calves has no future. A people whose children are doomed to ignorance has no future. It is our children who are, by this Act, condemned to a world of darkness and ignorance who will never fit in anywhere in the world after being shut away from the rest of humanity by Bantu Education. If we all realise that, we cannot, no matter what the odds, stand idly by and let that happen. Where are the mothers in this hall who will say: 'Never! Not to my child!'? Where are the women of this nation who will say: 'Never, not to our children!'?... Let us take a lesson from those mothers in Hitler's concentration camps, who, in a desperate situation, tried to save their children. We will do the same too. We will tell Verwoerd that over our dead bodies will he condemn our children to ignorance. We will tell him: Never, not to our children.

It is telling that Ntantala addresses the women in attendance, appealing to their roles as mothers and equating Bantu Education to the Holocaust to drive home the message that the Act would destroy communities and enslave their children, locking them out of the economy and humanity. These speeches can be viewed as Ntantala physically inserting herself and other women into the liberation movement. In her autobiography, Ntantala recounts only statements given by Black women during CATA meetings and political rallies. Ntantala (2009: 163) goes on to explain further that "…the fight against Bantu Education was a fight for the mothers of the nation. If they stood firm, we could defeat the ends of this measure". This further demonstrates the fluidity that characterised Ntantala public intellectualism. As a private role, motherhood informed the work she carried out in public. Motherhood became an entryway to tackling a public issue. Through this fluidity, Ntantala inserted herself and other women into the intellectual terrain.

In chapter two, counterpublics in South Africa were described as emerging in response to the bifurcated nature of the colonial/apartheid state. During apartheid, counterpublics engaged in

© University of Pretoria

a conflictual relationship with the hegemonic public that was racialised and exclusionary. Ngcobozi (2020: 53) presents counterpublics as providing platforms to pursue emancipation from the apartheid regime. The liberation movement can be viewed as a counterpublic during apartheid. As an organisation opposed to the apartheid regime, CATA became part of this counterpublic. As early as 1948, the year before Ntantala became a member of the Western Cape branch, CATA proclaimed that their fight for equal pay with white teachers was to demand equality between all South Africans. CATA envisioned their struggle for equal pay as being inextricably linked to the struggles of Black labourers (Ntantala 2009: 151). Through this declaration, CATA became part of the counterpublic.

Ntantala's entryway into this counterpublic was CATA. Her membership granted her opportunities to engage with this counterpublic, and she encouraged other women to speak, take up space and exert influence. The parents and teachers who made up CATA were Ntantala's primary audience within this counterpublic. She engaged with a broader audience when she spoke at the rallies calling for the boycott of the Van Riebeck Celebration. However, it is important to note that this opportunity arose through her membership in CATA. Ntantala situates herself and CATA as ideologically and strategically diverging from the ANC. She offered her intellectual ideas on Bantu Education and those of the Black women whose lives she documented as a counter-narrative to accounts that have dominated our understanding of the campaigns against the Act. Through these retrospective reflections, Ntantala continued to showcase how the liberation movement, as a counterpublic, was an intellectually contested space.

4.5 Questions of Freedom: The Failure of 1994

Ntantala's writings after 1994 focused on questioning what freedom and liberation entailed for South Africans. She viewed the negotiated settlement reached in 1994 as failing to dismantle the institutional mechanisms and structures that underpin apartheid. According to Ntantala, the settlement reached at the Congress for a Democratic South Africa (CODESA) was a compromise among the bourgeois classes for their Black counterparts to be included in the economic and political system. For Ntantala, the arrangements made at CODESA may have been temporary, but it became a defining moment. The rationale and ethos surrounding CODESA - to ensure the continuation of apartheid mechanisms and structures - would shape and influence pivotal events and moments in the country's history. The spirit of CODESA can be read as informing two moments: firstly, the adoption of proportional representation; and

© University of Pretoria

secondly, decisions by the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) to constrain itself to examine crimes that occurred between 1960-1994. Ntantala viewed these moments as furthering the marginalisation of the Black majority.

For this section, the documents will be personal correspondence, a speech, and an unpublished essay. Chronologically these documents will move us from 1993 to the early 2000s. The recipient of these letters is Ncebsie. From their correspondence, it seems that Ntantala was fond of Ncebsie, and perhaps they were related, as she signed her letter with "Love, Mama". There are two letters: the first was sent in May of 1993, and the last is dated 20 February 2001. The letters are Ntantala's responses to Ncebsie's request for advice and articles that the pair shared. The correspondence took place whilst Ntantala was living in Taylor, Michigan. The speech was given in Washington DC on the eve of South Africa's first democratic elections. Ntantala titled this speech 'Perspective on the South African Elections'. The last document is an unpublished essay. The essay, "Coming Home"' is not dated but chronicles Ntantala's return to South Africa after three decades in exile. From its content, it is appropriate to catalogue this essay as being written after 1994, as Ntantala references the speech she delivered in Washington, DC, and quotes from a book "Unfinished Business: South Africa, Apartheid and Truth" by Terry Bell and Dumisa Ntsebeza, which was published in 2003.

The Delay of Democracy and Unification of the Bourgeoisie at CODESA

In a letter to Ncebsie dated 6 May 1993, Ntantala advised the recipient to structure a speech he would present to an international audience on South Africa's first democratic elections. Ntantala (1993) is firm in her guidance, urging Ncebsie to make the presentation political and educational, focusing on the audience. She further instructs Ncebsie to structure the presentation by defining what a post-apartheid South Africa would be. Ntantala (1993) gives an assessment of this and states that it would entail the total eradication of the structures and mechanisms that apartheid rested on:

> …the struggle is about destroying totally the present, not to reform it, for it cannot be reformed, and in its place create a new democratic South Africa of equals with none of the vestiges of the past against which the people have shed their blood and fought for so long.

By 1993, Ntantala was aware that her vision of liberation and freedom would not be attained. The negotiations at CODESA confirmed this. Ntantala calls CODESA and the negotiations that occurred "the Talks". In the unpublished essay 'Coming Home', Ntantala (n.d) explains why she views CODESA as forestalling the arrival of liberation: all the organisations that took

© University of Pretoria

part in CODESA were representatives of governance structures that operated during apartheid. With the exclusion of the liberation movement, CODESA included the leaders of Bantustans, representatives of the tricameral parliament and the National Party (NP) led by FW de Klerk:

> For CODESA was a FRAUD., just as the T[r]i-camerals and the Bantustans were Frauds; just as the Native Representatives in the South African Parliament and the Native Representative Councils, were Frauds. They were just gimmicks to delay the dawn of freedom in South Africa. [emphasis own]

The composition of representatives at CODESA for Ntantala symbolises the continuation of apartheid-era governance structures and mechanisms.

On 25 April 1994, Ntantala delivered a speech on the eve of the first democratic elections in Washington, DC titled 'Perspective on the South African Elections'. In this speech, Ntantala (1994) tried to answer how the ANC and NP, parties with seemingly differing ideological positions, arrived at a point of agreement. According to Ntantala (1994), the parties' class interests coincided, allowing them to reach a compromise. Ntantala regarded the NP and ANC as representing the white and Black bourgeoisie. For Ntantala (1994), the ANC was intrinsically bourgeois in orientation from its inception:

> …it must be pointed out that the ANC never sought to overthrow the existing bourgeois order in South Africa. It sought to join it. It is in this sense that it cannot be called revolutionary. Its formation can be viewed as an attempt by the Black petit-bourgeois to be included in the ruling class structure that was created in 1910: a structure whose primary aim was to more efficiently exploit Black labour. It was the petit-bourgeois knocking at the door, saying "Let us in. We belong, too." This is not to say that there were never revolutionary elements in the ANC; their position was never dominant.

The delay of democracy was caused by the bourgeois finally uniting. This accounts for the transportation of apartheid governance structures and mechanisms to the post-apartheid state. Ntantala elaborates on this in her essay “Coming Home” and argues that the retention of the Natives Land Act of 1913-the backbone of South Africa's labour policy- was indicative of agreement reached by these two groups. The Natives Land Act lay facilitated Black economic marginalisation as it was key in the cluster of laws that created the migrant labour system. CODESA, according to Ntantala, spelt the unification of the bourgeois and the delay of liberation as apartheid governance structures and mechanisms were carried into the "democratic" order.

© University of Pretoria

The Spirit of CODESA in the Post-Apartheid State

Ntantala is resolute in her opinion that CODESA signalled the delay of democracy. Ntantala read the adoption of proportional representation and the decisions taken by the TRC to constrain itself to examine crimes that occurred between 1960-1994 as being influenced by the spirit of CODESA. It is important to note that Ntantala retrospectively made this assessment. This view is contained in letters and essays Ntantala wrote several years after 1994. With the advantage of hindsight, Ntantala crafted a narrative to understand and explain the compromises made after 1994. Ntantala frequently quoted Winnie Madikizela Mandela to substantiate her assessments. It is beneficial to include this observation and textual interactions between Madikizela and Ntantala as it assists in locating the latter in the post-apartheid political order.

The formation of the interim government meant that the people would not elect the delegates who would draft the transitional constitution. The transitional constitution served as a bridge between apartheid and the anticipated democratic state. Representatives agreed upon this bridge at CODESA in 1993, and it allowed for the continued governance of South Africa with elections scheduled for 1994. The interim government and transitional constitutional were temporary agreements. However, for Ntantala, this was another indication that the ANC would not destroy the structures and mechanisms underpinning apartheid. Inevitably, the drafting of the transitional constitution included political parties and organisations that formed part of the apartheid regime and the liberation movement. In a speech Ntantala (1994) delivered in Washington, DC, she notes that even those who participated in CODESA as representatives of the Black majority were not elected as they "… simply took it upon themselves to attend the negotiations and to 'speak' for the African people". In 'Coming Home' Ntantala (n.d) questioned the legitimacy of the interim government and transitional constitution because the people did not elect these representatives:

> …the ANC and the [apartheid] government were considering an 'elected Interim Government as a mechanism for a Constituent Assembly rather than voting for the constitution-making body'. But the question was: 'Who was going to elect this Interim Government?'… Would it not be a government elected by the National Party and its puppets- the Bantustans and the Tricamerals, with the ANC, helping as midwife to give the semblance that the people accepted this structure?... Under which laws was this interim government going to operate? The same South African laws that were oppressive? Who would accept that?

CODESA took on greater significance for Ntantala after the temporary arrangements expired. It signified the continuation of the mechanisms and structures that underpin apartheid. This

© University of Pretoria

was, after all the rationale and ethos driving the creation of CODESA. This ethos reverberated to shape and define other key moments in the country's history.

Ntantala identifies adopting a proportional representation system and temporal constraints self-imposed by the TRC as one of these key moments. The adoption of proportional representation resulted in voters electing a party over an individual. Ntantala viewed this as continuing the marginalisation of the Black majority. Voters are denied the opportunity to elect and recall their representatives. According to Ntantala, this was another example of the transportation of apartheid governance mechanisms. Writing to Ncebsie in February 2001, in response to an article sent to her, she quotes Winnie Madikizela at length to substantiate this view:

> …when a government structure that had been set up for our domination and exploitation was taken in-toto, including the very personnel who ran it for the Herrenvolk government and them, under the Joe Slovo' Sunset Clause'… Astute Winne had remarked about all this at a meeting at Wits on 7 January 1993 when she said:
>
> 'The looming disaster in this country will result from the distortion of a noble goal in favour of a short-cut route to parliament by a handful of individuals… The system of proportional representation, a feature of our constitution, takes away an important right from the electorate, the right to elect their own representatives to parliament… We have inherited a parliament processed by our White dominators. We have to date not (even paused) had the time to consider whether this parliamentary structure is one that answers our needs; whether it is expressive of our ethos'"

Ntantala read the adoption of proportional representation as a continuation of the historical processes that facilitated political marginalisation and exclusion. Madikizela's thoughts resonate with Ntantala. For them, the electoral system adopted would result in the liberation movement inheriting a system crafted by their oppressors and used to continue their bidding. In many ways, Madikizela came to symbolise the revolutionary elements within the ANC whose position was never dominant. The letter was written seven years after the first democratic elections. As a retrospective reflection, Ntantala may have been textually inserting herself into the political terrain by aligning with Madikizela.

In the same letter to Ncebsie, Ntantala touches on the establishment of the TRC and characterises the time constraints that the commission self-imposed as a continuation of Black marginalisation. Ntantala describes the TRC as a "hoax", "public relations stunt", and our version of the Nuremberg trials. The limiting of crimes under consideration from 1960-1994 according to Ntantala, missed an opportunity to survey the cause of Africans' dispossession.

© University of Pretoria

This time frame would not allow the commission to examine colonial crimes. Ntantala advocated for the historicisation of Black South Africans' dispossession along a longer time frame. The TRC placed the burden of reconciliation on the bereaved:

> What did we get out of it? NOTHING! Not even the compensation that was promised. Young Phumla Gobodo, writing in one of the South African papers, calls it a 'betrayal'. Those murderers, thieves and thugs who killed so many of our people got off scotfree, for they confessed their sins and asked for amnesty. The burden to have them pay for what they did rests with the families of the bereaved.

Ntantala's critique of the failure of 1994 to secure freedom and liberation - envisioned here as granting the people the right to recall, substantive political and economic participation - is best understood if we recognise that Ntantala viewed CODESA as a continuation of the processes that contributed to the marginalisation of Black South Africans. The failure of the ANC to overthrow an oppressive system, choosing to operate within it, has not resulted in dismantling the legislative framework, institutions and political culture that underpin it. At the time, Ntantala, like Madikizela, went against the grain. This was a refusal to accept the terms of the transition and the negotiated settlement. Ntantala and Madikizela questioned and probed the ethos that would underpin the democratic state. Their dissent and questioning placed them in opposition to the ANC.

These letters can be read as Ntantala injecting herself into the public sphere after 1994, as she had chosen to remain in the United States. This insertion takes on a more distant and less present form than when she spoke at CATA meetings and platforms. It occurs through writings and speeches given in the U.S, and this can be read as a textual insertion to the public sphere. Unlike her predecessors, who did not leave behind written work, this opens the possibility of including Ntantala's work in the political debates and discussions on issues that plague post-apartheid South Africa. Moreover, through successive generations of South African researchers and readers unearthing her intellectual work, it could lead to her insertion into the intellectual genealogy of the country.

4.2 Conclusion

Ntantala's intellectual work focuses on Black women and their lived experiences. By foregrounding their experiences, Ntantala demonstrates the devastating effects of apartheid. Ntantala adopts a political-economy approach that contextualises their experiences within the broader socio-political and economic order to understand and explain Black women's position.

© University of Pretoria

She would supplement this with a framework that framed analysis using the troika of class, gender, and race. However, Ntantala was aware that many Black women did not view gender as a fundamental cleavage, opting to subordinate it to class and race. By zoning in on Black women, Ntantala demonstrates the effects of macro-level processes on Black households and communities. This approach would shape her thinking about other themes that characterised her intellectual corpus: Bantu Education and post-apartheid South Africa. Ntantala regarded Bantu Education as a coercive instrument engineered to enslave Africans and restrict their children's job market access. The temporary arrangements reached at CODESA were motivated by an ethos that sought to carry over the governance mechanisms and structures that perpetuated Black marginalisation.

This chapter has presented Ntantala's public intellectualism, the public she engaged with and the strategies she employed to manoeuvre intellectual spaces. Ntantala's public intellectualism was informed by a fluidity between the private and public spheres. The liberation movement became the counterpublic that Ntantala would operate in. However, within this counterpublic, CATA was her primary audience. CATA offered platforms and opportunities to share her intellectual ideas. Ntantala would use private issues to inform her work in the public sphere. We witness this when Ntantala presents the fight against Bantu Education as a battle for mothers. Motherhood, a so-called private identity and role, informed the work Ntantala carried out, fighting against Bantu Education in public. At other times, Ntantala used the platforms offered by CATA to address public issues and demonstrated how these were informed by issues circumscribed to private matters. This is discernible when Ntantala spoke at the Boycott Van Riebeck rallies, where she tied the campaign's theme to the position of African women in the reserves. Ntantala was traversing and breaking the barriers erected around the public and private sphere.

This chapter has characterised Ntantala as an interlocutor who travelled between and blended her intellectual activity between the public and private spheres. She grounds her intellectual corpus in a framework that views social life from the vantage point of rural women and introduces an angle of vision often missed in studies on public intellectuals. Ntantala demonstrates how the existence of a private sphere and an intellectual's position in it significantly impacts their understanding of political issues. The organic or native intellectuals partially analysed these questions when they denied linkages to the private sphere. This is most discernible in her critique of the ANC's failure to fully comprehend the state's intention behind the implementation of Bantu Education. However, Ntantala, acutely aware of her positionality-

© University of Pretoria

and that of Black women- in the private sphere, went to extrapolate the effects of racial capitalism not only on the counterpublic but the Black household as well.

The fluidity characterising Ntantala's public intellectualism does not resolve the tension identified in critiques offered by Foucault, Gramsci, Fanon or Said. It is not the balm that presents a synthesis; rather, it is a new angle of vision that urges to consider new ways of thinking about the public intellectual, what counts as intellectual activity, and the appropriate arena for it.

© University of Pretoria

Chapter Five: Conclusion

5.1 Introduction

The chapter presents the conclusion to the study and is structured in four parts. Firstly, a summary of the study and the gap identified to justify the study's necessity is reiterated. Examining Ntantala's public intellectualism was the channel to tackle the gap and offer new angles of vision for how we think about and engage with the public intellectual. The second part is the chapter summaries. Part three will outline the questions posed at the beginning of the study and how these were answered. The final part presents implications for future research and recommendations.

5.2 Thesis Summary

When this study began, the conundrum faced was understanding how Phyllis Ntantala is not regarded as a public intellectual despite evidence that she is. She and many other Black women are missing in accounts of public intellectuals in South Africa. To say that Ntantala has been erased is the first (obvious) step. In surveying the literature on public intellectuals, the conclusion reached is that this erasure and marginalisation is not haphazard. These studies curtail intellectual activity to the public sphere, determining who is recognised as carrying out intellectual work. The privileging of male figures as referential subjects in the scholarship has led to the belief that being a public intellectual is an occupation conducted by a specific body, in a particular manner and only in the public sphere.

The cause of this has been attributed to the under theorisation of the "public". It is taken for granted that the public intellectual will engage with the public. However, in all these accounts, the public is never viewed as having linkages with or in relation to the private sphere. Resultantly, how these studies conceptualise the public sphere- as a metaphorical and physical space-, has occurred without much consideration given to the private sphere. To interject Phyllis Ntantala and study her intellectual ideas was to tackle this gap.

The study began from the premise that Phyllis Ntantala is a public intellectual. The denial of her public intellectualism is a curious case. Ntantala's public intellectualism is characterised by fluidity between the public and private spheres. She utilises issues confined to the private sphere to inform her work in the public sphere. By doing so, Ntantala questions how and why we categorise such issues as being strictly private or public matters. Ntantala demonstrates that these issues are interrelated and constituted by the broader socio-political or economic orders governing society.

© University of Pretoria

The study rests on the shoulders of studies conducted in the past two decades to correct women's marginalisation and erasure in academic and public discussion on public intellectuals in South Africa. These scholars have recovered women's intellectual ideas and contributions to inject them into genealogical accounts of public intellectuals. As many of these existing studies fall under History, Sociology and Anthropology, this study's contribution is to provide a public intellectual who offers political perspectives on socioeconomic issues and discussions.

5.3 Chapter Summaries

Chapter one contextualised the study by introducing the topic and existing studies that have imposed an influential approach to defining the public intellectual. Thereafter, the strategy of inquiry used was introduced, which blends narrative analysis and close reading of the autobiography. The study's aims influenced this; to examine Ntantala writings, including personal correspondence and autobiography. Narrative analysis was necessary to focus on the protagonists and understand their experiences, intellectual ideas, and political contributions. Narrative analysis allowed us to formulate a thematic thread filled with experiences and events that coalesced into a plotline. The plotline allowed us to explain the emergence and development of Ntantala's public intellectualism. Furthermore, the plotline was used to tease out the self that we encounter in her autobiography, *A Life's Mosaic*. Lastly, narrative analysis and autobiography allowed us to further contextualisation Ntantala in the historical and political moments in which she narrated her life. The study has been guided by Black feminist theory. This was influenced by Ntantala's research writings and intellectual corpus as well as the angles of vision that Black feminist theory offers for analysing the public intellectual.

Chapter two examined critiques of definitional schemas that derive their logic from the Dreyfus Affair and the normative ideals this event imposed. The use of this schema is an act of labelling, neatly packaging and demarcating boundaries of who the public intellectual is and where intellectual activity occurs. The consequence- unintended or otherwise- is the exclusion of all those who do not fit into these labels. Nevertheless, the wide-ranging studies presented here dispel the applicability of such definitional schema and the contradictions which arise by firmly grounding the intellectual to their people or class and caging them to their field of specialisation. Furthermore, studies on African/Black public intellectuals describe the redemptive journey that the intellectual must undertake as beginning in the interstices of western intellectual tradition. Again, this calls into question the applicability of such definitional schema if it induces decay in some public intellectuals. However, the silence about

© University of Pretoria

the private sphere rings loudly in these studies. These silences were elucidated by examining the various definitions of the public sphere. Lastly, the chapter examined studies on Black women's public intellectualism.

Chapter three traced the influences and development of Ntantala's intellectual trajectory. Experiences and events forming the thematic thread, weaved by Ntantala to account for her intellectual journey. Furthermore, the social milieu in which Ntantala was born and lived was outlined. Missionary education was shown to be pivotal to Ntantala's emergence as a public intellectual. Education created opportunities for Ntantala to expand her social view and elevate her class consciousness. Missionary education set Ntantala apart from her red blanket associates and encouraged a lens to view the world, which left a significant imprint on her intellectual corpus. The enclosure she draws to define "her people" is tenuous and contradictory. Ntantala class consciousness is evident as she did not shy away from acknowledging its influence. She prided herself in being part of the elite; however, she does not reflect on how this impacted her relationship with the rural women she dedicated herself to documenting. Although they occupied differing social classes, from Ntantala's perspective, she does not foresee an unbridgeable divide existing between them. As we unravel the thematic thread, the protagonist we encounter is candid, confident, and self-emancipated.

Chapter four outlined Ntantala's intellectual corpus through identifying three themes which characterized it: (1) Black women, (2) education, liberation and (3) the post-1994 dispensation. Ntantala's corpus is further defined by the usage of two strategies. Firstly, she adopted a political economy approach which highlighted that the oppression faced by Black women was rooted in the structural requirements of racial capitalism. To this end, she argued that their subjectivity is interpolated by the relationship between class, race and gender. Nevertheless, she recognized that many Black women in the South African context subordinated gender to racial and class dimensions. Secondly, she offered counter-narratives to dispute the dominant accounts that were controlled, expressed by the apartheid state and organizations in the liberation movement. Through this strategy, Ntantala was able to demonstrate that the liberation movement was counterpublic and an intellectual contested space. Ntantala was able to physically insert herself - and other women- into these spaces and articulate her intellectual ideas. By speaking at rallies and conferences, Ntantala utilizes what has been confined to private issues and demonstrate their linkages to public matters. It is this fluidity and which characterizes her public intellectualism. When living in exile and upon her decision not to

© University of Pretoria

return to South Africa after democracy, Ntantala continued to insert herself through textual interventions as she disputed dominant narratives concerning CODESA and the TRC.

5.4 Research Questions and Significant Themes.

The aim of the study was to give an account of Ntantala's public intellectualism. This led to the primary question: how does Ntantala pursue enact and pursue being a public intellectual? The answer proposed that her public intellectualism is defined by fluidity between the public and private sphere. Taking issues from the private sphere to inform the intellectual work and political activism she conducted in the public sphere. This act calls into question the silences of existing studies on the private sphere, their neglect of the intellectual´s positionality in the private sphere and the intellectual´s perception on how these sphere´s interact.

To demonstrate this, we looked at Ntantala's involvement in CATA and their campaigns against the Van Riebeck celebrations as well as Bantu Education Act. CATA can be viewed as part of the counterpublic during apartheid. It became the platform that Ntantala utilized to engage with this counterpublic. The earliest manifestation of this occurred at the Van Riebeck rally, where she spoke and linked the theme of the boycott to the women she centred in her intellectual corpus. As a public matter and crucial historical moment for the Nationalist Party, she related it to the private matters affecting widowers of the reserve. This fluidity was demonstrated in other instances when Ntantala used opportunities to address CATA delegates but chose to direct her speeches at women. Ntantala aimed her messages at women in attendance at the meetings. The significance of this cannot be underestimated as women in attendance were reluctant to speak and viewed the matters being discussed as men's affairs. In a meeting convened by CATA in December 1953, Ntantala appealed to these women's role as mothers to present a different perspective on the roll-out of Bantu Education. She impressed upon them that the defeat of Bantu Education rested on their engagements and resistance as mothers. Again, we witness Ntantala bringing an issue that was regarded as a public matter and relating it to the politics of the private realm.

This fluidity leads us to the second question of determining Ntantala´s intellectual contributions. Ntantala´s intellectual contribution is to give a political analysis of the causes of racial oppression through the centring of rural women. The adoption of a political economy approach to demonstrate that the oppression women faced was rooted in the structural requirements of capitalism is to provide a link between macro and micro-level processes. By zoning in on Black women and their households, Ntantala demonstrated the effects that macro-

© University of Pretoria

level processes had on Black households and communities. For example, in shifting the angle of analysis and placing rural women at the centre, Ntantala demonstrates that racial capitalism depended on Black women's integration into the capitalist economy as producers of reproductive and subsistence labour. Black women were enslaved to racial capitalism in a dual sense.

In answering these questions, we are led to the significance of the research. The aim was to showcase the public intellectualism of Ntantala. Several themes arose with the most salient being the importance of missionary education and social class for the emergence of Black women as public intellectuals during colonization and apartheid. It was difficult to draw the contours of Ntantala's class as it is attenuated by racism and sexism. Whether understood as status or class, the stratification induced by education became a significant point to contend with. This was not reserved for Ntantala as Maxeke, Tshabalala, and Jabavu were educated members of the middle class. As minimal research has been conducted to determine these women's self-conceptualization of what being middle class entailed, it becomes difficult to determine the extent to which their social class influenced their intellectual corpus and activities. Ntantala is silent- save for a mention towards the end of her autobiography- on her class positionality whilst living in exile. These changes in financial stability indicate fluctuations in class. Arguably, this had significance for Ntantala's ability to engage or pursue intellectual work. Class and the opportunities it affords Black women arises as a significant factor that deserves attention.

5.5 Implications for Future Research and Recommendations

There remains considerable ground to cover in examining Black women's public intellectualism and political contributions. The genealogy of public intellectuals in South Africa remains the domain of men. This has been interrogated, and the next step is to engage with women's intellectual ideas. Ntantala's ideas demonstrate a complexity that leads us to several questions about nationalist history and post-apartheid state. Her ideas concerning the roll-out of Bantu Education demonstrate that narratives filled with big names and organizations do not reveal the full picture. Ntantala's desire to document the ordinary women at the CATA meetings, to go as far as putting down their words in her own autobiography and essays, showcases a different but forgotten aspect of our nationalist history. Furthermore, her ideas on the post-apartheid state compel us to reconsider whose voices determined what freedom would entail. Like so many other women, erased and marginalized, Ntantala's intellectual corpus

© University of Pretoria

offers a new vista to approach and understand the fundamental questions that lie at the nationalist history and the post-apartheid state.

For future research, there are many women whose intellectual ideas need to be engaged with past celebratory mentions around Women´s Day. Researchers have made significant strides in and out of the academy to recover these women's intellectual ideas. Books, chapters, and monographs have mushroomed in recent years. It seems as if more of us are on the path to recovering those forgotten and silenced women. However, there has been a valorisation of select few women. Resultantly, this has led to the unintended "burying" of other women. Future researchers need to broaden their scope and survey the landscape to avoid zoning in on select few individuals. In this study, a few are mentioned, but Thandiswa Jabavu, and Cecilia Tshabalala stand out as potential research subjects. Jabavu's life should be examined not only as the wife or daughter of imminent scholars and politicians but for what Ntantala hints at as her intellectual depth. Jabavu´s daughter, Noni Jabavu, was the subject of Masola (2020) doctoral thesis. Plans are underway for Masola and Makhosazana Xaba to republish a select few of Noni Jabavu´s columns written in the Eastern Cape newspaper, *Daily Dispatch*. On the other hand, Tshabalala has been the subject of noteworthy studies by Healy-Clancy (2012; 2014) and Curry (2018). These studies have focused on Tshabalala´s ideas or ideologies. However, Tshabalala´s intellectual might and how these ideas challenge or alter the (counter)public has not been engaged with. Tshabalala´s intellectual corpus has not been represented as part of the genealogy of public intellectualism in the country.

Another issue that arises for future research, is the need to put Black women in conversation with each other. This includes across borders and historical periods. Masola has started with this through her work on Maxeke, Mgqwetho, Jabavu and Msimang. If we are to engage in recovering the intellectual ideas and contributions of Black women, they cannot only be contextualized against their male counterparts. Black women were a part of a broader intellectual community and interacted with their peers. In this study, Ntantala involvement in transnational networks whilst living in the U.S. presented an opportunity to put her into conversation with other women. Due to silences on her part about her time in the U.S, it was difficult to embed Ntantala in these transnational networks. Furthermore, this made it difficult to put her in conversation with women she may have forged connections with. This could have provided crucial information to understand her use of an analytical framework grounded in Black feminist theory.

© University of Pretoria

Dr. Tiffany Caesar has indicated that she will be conducting interviews with Ntantala's counterparts in Detroit, Michigan. Information from these interviews will be pivotal to contextualizing and localizing Ntantala in the U.S. This holds the potential to place her in conversation with other women. The drive to place women in conversation will help chart the intellectual field in which they were speaking, writing, and identifying other actors working within this field. Intellectual fields are sources used to contextualize the intellectual. By determining Black women´s involvement in these fields, we can deduce how their activities and ideas interacted, diverged, or aligned with others. Furthermore, we can determine their contributions to debates taking place within this field. Resultantly, our understanding of intellectual debates and disagreements that have been fundamental to the formation of our present realities would be enhanced.

© University of Pretoria

Bibliography

Allen, B. 1998. Black Womanhood and Feminist Standpoints. *Management Communication Quarterly,* 11(4): 575-586.

Ally, S. 2005. Oppositional Intellectualism as Reflection, not Rejection of Power: Wits Sociology, 1975-1989. *Transformation: Critical Perspectives on Southern Africa,* 59: 66-97.

Almquist, E. 1975. Untangling the effects of race and sex: The disadvantaged status of Black women. *Social Science Quarterly,* 56(1): 129-142.

Amadiume, I. 1987. *Male Daughter, Female Husbands: Gender and Sex in an African Society.* London: Zed Books Ltd.

Anderton, M. 1994. *A Life's Mosaic*: The Autobiography of Phyllis Ntantala. *Feminist Review,* 46: 101–103.

Anfara, V. A and Mertz, N.T 2015. Setting the Stage. In: *Theoretical Frameworks in Qualitative Research,* (eds) Anfara, V. A and Mertz, N.T . London: SAGE Publications.

April, T. 2012. *Theorizing Women: The Intellectual Contributions of Charlotte Maxeke to the Struggle for Liberation in South Africa.* PhD Thesis. University of Western Cape.

Archive and Public Culture. 2006. *Identity and the Archive: Public Series Lecture.* Internet: http://www.apc.uct.ac.za/sites/default/files/image_tool/images/183/public_life/pp3-9.pdf Date of Access:1 November 2020

Arendt, S. 1958. *The Human Condition.* Chicago: University of Chicago University Press.

Babbie, E. 2012. *The Basics of Social Research.* 6th ed. New York: Wadsworth Publishing Co.

Baert, P and Isaac, J. 2012. Intellectuals and Society: Sociological and Historical Perspectives. In: *Routledge International Handbook of Contemporary Social and Political Theory,* (eds) Delanty, and Turner, S.P. New York: Routledge.

Baert, P and Booth, J. 2012. Tensions within the Public Intellectual: Political Interventions from Dreyfus to the New Social Media. *International Journal of Politics, Culture, and Society,* 25: 111-126.

Bailey, J. 2002. From Public to Private: The Development of the Concept of the Private. *Social Research,* 69(1): 15-31.

© University of Pretoria

Banks, W.M and Jewell, J. 1995. Intellectuals and the Persisting Significance of Race. *The Journal of Negro Education,* 64(1): 44-64.

Bauman, Z. 1989. *Legislators and Interpreters: On Modernity, Post-modernity and Intellectuals.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Beal, F. [1970] 2008. Double Jeopardy: To be Black and Female. *Meridians,* 8(2): 166-176.

Benda, J. 1927 [1980]. *The Treason of the Intellectuals.* London: Transaction Publishers.

Benstock, S. 1991. The Female Self Engendered: Autobiographical Writing and Theories of Selfhood. *Women's Studies,* 20(1): 5-14.

Biko, S. [1987] 2005. *Steve Biko 1946-77: I Write What I Like.* Oxford: Heinemann.

Boswell, B. 2017. Overcoming the 'Daily Bludgeoning by Apartheid': Black South African Women Writers, Agency and Space. *African Identities,* 15(4): 414-427.

Bourdieu, P. 1991. Fourth Lecture. Universal Corporatism; The Role of Intellectuals in the Modern World. *Poetics Today,* 12(4): 655-669.

Brewer, R. 1999. Theorizing Race, Class and Gender: The New Scholarship of Black feminist Intellectuals and Black Women's Labour Power. *Race, Gender & Class,* 6(2): 29-47.

Brouwer, D.C and Squires, C.R. 2003. Public Intellectuals, Public Life and the University. *Argumentation and Advocacy,* 39(Winter): 201-213.

Burck, C. 2005. Comparing Qualitative Research Methodologies for Systematic Research: The Use of Grounded Theory, Discourse Analysis and Narrative Analysis. *Journal of Family Therapy,* 27(3): 237-262.

Camic, C and Gross, N. 2004. The New Sociology of Ideas. In: *The Blackwell Companion to Sociology,* (ed) Blau, J. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Charman., A, de Swardt., C & Simons., M. 1991. The Politics of Gender: Negotiating Liberation. *TRANSFORMATION*, 15: 40-62.

Chattopadhyay, S., 2017. *Youtube.* Internet: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8nxjtmeoBz0 Date of Access: 28 May 2021

Christie, P and Collins, C. 1982. Bantu Education: Apartheid Ideology or Labour Reproduction? *Comparative Education,* 18(1): 59-75.

© University of Pretoria

Clandinin, J.D and Rosiek, J. 2007. Mapping a Landscape of Narrative Inquiry. In: *Handbook of Narrative Inquiry: Mapping a Methodology,(eds)* Clandinin, J. London: SAGE Publications.

Clandinin, J., Caine, V., Lessard, S., and Huber J. 2016. *Engaging in Narrative Inquiries with Children and Youth.* New York: Routledge.

Combahee River Collective. [1977] 2017. The Combahee River Collective Statement. In: *How We Got Free: Black Feminism and the Combahee River Collective,* (eds) Taylor, K. Chicago: Haymarket Books.

Collini, S. 2006. *Absent Minds: Intellectuals in Britain.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Collins, C.S and Stockton, C.M. 2018. The Central Role of Theory in Qualitative Research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods,* 17: 1-10.

Collins, P.H. 2000. *Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness, and the Politics of Empowerment.* 2nd ed. New York: Routledge.

Collins, P.H. 2002. Black Feminist Epistemology. In: Contemporary Sociological Theory, (eds) Calhoun., C, Gerteis., J, Moody., J, Pfaff., S and Virk., I. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd

Connelly, F.M, and Clandinin, D.J. 2006. Narrative Inquiry. In: *Handbook of Complementary Methods in Education Research,* (eds) Green., J, Camilli., G, Elmore., P, Skukauskaiti., A and Grace., E . Washington, D.C: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers.

Coole, D. 2000. Cartographic Convulsions. *Political Theory,* 28(3): 337-354.

Cooper, B. 2017. *Beyond Respectability: The Intellectual Thought of Race Women.* Chicago: University of Illinois Press.

Crenshaw, K. 1989. Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Anti-Discrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist politics. *University of Chicago Legal Forum,* 1:138-167.

Creswell, J. 2007. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Designs: Choosing Among Five Approaches.* London: SAGE Publications.

Creswell, J. 2009. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches.* 3rd ed. London: SAGE Publications.

© University of Pretoria

Curry, D. 2018. “What is it that We Call the Nation”: Cecilia Lillian Tshabalala’s Definition, Diagnosis, and Prognosis of the Nation in a Segregated South Africa. *Safundi*, 19 (1): 55-76

Davies, C. 1991. Private Selves and Public Spheres: Autobiography and the African Woman Writer. *CLA Journal,* 34(3): 267-289.

Davies, C. 2007. *Left of Karl Marx: The Political Life of Black Communist Claudia Jones.* Durham: Duke University Press.

Davis, A. 1974. *Angela Davis: An Autobiography.* New York: International Publishers.

Dietz, M. 1985. Citizenship with a Feminist Face: The Problem with Maternal Thinking. *Political Theory*, 13(1): 19-37

Dawson, M. 1994. A Black Counterpublic? Economic Earthquakes, Racial Agenda(s) and Black Politics. *Public Culture,* 7: 195-223.

Daymond, MJ., Driver, D., Meintjes, S., Molema, L., Musengenzi, C., Orford., M and Rasebotsa., N. 2003. Introduction. In: *Women Writing Africa: The Southern Region,* (eds) Daymond, MJ., Driver, D., Meintjes, S., Molema, L., Musengenzi, C., Orford., M and Rasebotsa., N. Feminist Press at the City University of New York.

Ekeh, P. 1975. Colonialism and the Two Publics In Africa: A Theoretical Statement. *Comparative Studies in Society and History,* 17(1): 91-112.

Eley, G. 1989. *Nations, Publics, and Political Cultures: Placing Habermas in the Nineteenth Century.* Durham, University of North Caroline.

Etter-Lewis, G. 2000. Spellbound: Audience, Identity and Self in Black Women's Narrative Discourse. In: *Feminism and Autobiography: Texts, Theories and Methods, (eds)* Cosslett, T., Lury, C., and Summerfield, P . New York: Routledge.

Ezitoni, A. 2006. Are Public Intellectuals an Endangered Species. In: *Public Intellectuals: An Endangered Species?*, (eds) Ezitoni, A and Bowditch, A. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.

Fanon, F. 2001. *The Wretched of the Earth.* New York: Penguin Books.

Fatsis, L. 2018. Becoming Public Characters, not Public Intellectuals: Notes Towards and Alternative Conception of Public Intellectual Life. *European Journal of Social Theory,* 21(3): 267-87.

© University of Pretoria

Finaly, A. 2010. Making Space: The Counterpublics of Post-apartheid Independent Literary Publishing Activities (1994-2004). *Social Dynamics,* 36(1): 166-178.

Fleck, C., Hess, A and Lyon, E. 2009. Introduction. In: *Intellectuals and their Publics: Perspectives from the Social Sciences, (eds)* Fleck, C., Hess, A and Lyon, E. Burlington: Ashgate Publishing Company.

Foucault, M. 1977. *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice: Selected Essays and Interviews.* Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Fraser, N. 1990. Rethinking the Public Sphere: A Contribution to the Critique of Actually Existing Democracy. *Social Text,* 25/26: 56-80.

Freeman, M. 2015. Narrative as a Mode of Understanding: Method, Theory and Praxis. In: *The Handbook of Narrative Analysis,(eds)* De Fina., A and Georgakopoulou., A. Oxford: Wiley Blackwell.

Gaitskell, D. 1983. Housewives, Maids or Mothers: Some Contradictions of Domesticity for Christian Women in Johannesburg 1903-39*. *Journal of African History,* 24: 241-56.

Gasa, N. 2007. Feminisms, Motherisms, Patriarchies and Women's Voices in the 1950's. In: *Women in South African History: Basus'iimbokodo, Bawel'imilambo / They Remove Boulders and Cross Rivers*, (eds) Gasa, N. Johannesburg: HSRC Press

Giliomee, H. 2009. A Note on Bantu Education, 1953 to 1970. *South African Journal of Economics,* 77(1): 190-198.

Goduka, N. I. 2016. *Cress Funeral and Cremation Services.* Internet: https://www.cressfuneralservice.com/obituary/Dr-Ntantala-Jordan. Date of Access: 25 April 2021

Goodhew, D. 2000. Working-Class Respectability: The Example of the Western Areas of Johannesburg, 1930-55. *Journal of African History,* 41: 241-266.

Gooze, M. 1992. The Definitions of Self and Form in Feminist Autobiography. *Women's Studies,* 5(2): 277-291.

Gouldner, A. 1979. *The Future of Intellectuals and the Rise of the New Class.* London: The MacMillan Press.

© University of Pretoria

Gramsci, A. 1971. *Selections from the Prison Notebooks.* London: The Electric Book Company Ltd.

Gumede, W and Dikeni, L. 2011. Introduction by William Gumede and Leslie Dikeni. In: *The Poverty of Ideas: South African Democracy and the Retreat of Intellectuals, (eds)* Gumede, W and Dikeni, L. Johannesburg: Jacana Media (Pty) Ltd.

Gusdorf, G. 1980. Conditions and Limits of the Autobiography. In: *Autobiography: Essays Theoretical and Critical, (ed)* Olney, J. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Habermas, J. 1981 [1991]. *The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into a Category of Bourgeois Society.* Cambridge: MIT Press.

Hancock, A-M. 2007. When Multiplication doesn't Equal Quick Addition: Examining Intersectionality as a Research Paradigm. *Perspectives on Politics,* 5(1): 63-79

Haraway, D. 1988. Situated Knowledges: The Science Question in Feminism and the Privilege of Partial Perspective. *Feminist Studies,* 14(3): 575-599.

Harries, P. 2010. Missionaries, Marxists and Magic: Power and the Politics of Literacy in South-East Africa. *Journal of Southern African Studies,* 27(3): 405-427.

Hassim, S. 1991. Gender, Social Location and Feminist Politics in South Africa. *TRANSFORMATION,* 15: 65-82.

Hassim, S. 2004. Nationalism, Feminism and Autonomy: The ANC in Exile and the Question of Women. *Journal of Southern African Studies,* 30(3): 433-456.

Hassim, S. 2009. Gender and Policy-Making: Terms of Engagement. In: *Poverty of Ideas: South African Democracy and the Retreat of Intellectuals,* (eds*)* Gumede, W and Dikeni, L . Johannesburg: Jacana Media (Pty) Ltd.

Healy-Clancy, M. 2012. Women and the Problem of Family in Early African Nationalist History and Histography. *South African Historical Journal,* 64(3): 450-471.

Healy-Clancy, M. 2014. The Daughters of Africa and Transatlantic Racial Kinship: Cecilia Lilian Tshabalala and the Women's Club Movement, 1912-1943. *American Studies,* 59(4): 486-481.

Higginbotham, E. 1992. African-American Women's History and the Metalanguage of Race. *Signs,* 17(2): 251-274.

© University of Pretoria

Hokkanen, M and Mangan., J.A. 2006. Further Variations on a Theme: The Games Ethic Further Adapted- Scottish Moral Missionaries and Muscular Christians in Malawi. *The International Journal of the History of Sport,* 23(8): 1257-1274.

hooks, b. 1991. Black Women Intellectuals. In: *Breaking Bread: Insurgent Black Intellectual Life,* (eds) hooks, b and West, C. Boston: South End Press

Howe, I. 1984. Intellectuals, Dissent and Bureaucrats. *Dissent,* 31(3): 43-50.

Hyndman, J. 2004. The (Geo)Politics of Gendered Mobility. In: *Mapping Women, Making Politics: Feminist Perspectives on Political Geography, (eds)* Staeheli, L., Kofman, E and Peake, L.J. New York: Routledge

Hyslop, J. 1988. State Education Policy and the Social Reproduction of the Urban African Working Class: The Case of Southern Transvaal 1955-1976. *Journal of Southern African Studies,* 14(3): 446-476.

Innes, D and O'Meara, D. 1976. Class Formation and Ideology: The Transkei Region. *Review of African Political Economy,* 7: 69-86.

Jabavu, F. [1928] 2003. Bantu Home. In: *Women Writing Africa: the Southern Region,* (eds) Daymond, MJ., Driver, D., Meintjes S., Molema L., Musengezi, C., Orford, M and Rasebotsa N. Johannesburg: WITS University Press.

Jacoby, R. 1987. *The Last Intellectuals: American Culture in the Age of Academe.* New York: Basic Books.

Jordan, P. n.d. *Letter from Pallo Jordan to Phyllis Ntantala.* London.

Kaarsholm, P. 2009. Public Spheres, Hidden Politics and Struggles Over Space: Boundaries of Public Engagement in Post-Apartheid South Africa. *Social Dynamics,* 35(2): 411-422.

Karabel, J. 1996. Towards A Theory of Intellectuals and Politics. *Theory and Society,* 25(2): 205-233.

King, D. 1988. Multiple Jeopardy, Multiple Consciousness: The Context of a Black Feminist Ideology. *Signs,* 14(1): 42-72.

Leach, F. 2008. African Girls, Nineteenth-Century Mission Education and the Patriarchal Imperative. *Gender and Education,* 20(4): 335-347.

© University of Pretoria

Lewis, D and Salo, E. 1993. Writing Women: Desiree Lewis and Elaine Salo Compare Two Exile Works Which Reflect Different Senses of Identity and Cultural Allegiance. *Southern African Review of Books*, July/August: 22-23.

Mabandla, N. 2015. Rethinking Bundy: Land and the Black Middle Class-Accumulation Beyond Peasantry. *Development Southern Africa,* 32(1): 76-89.

MacKenzie, J. 2008. "Making Black Scotsmen and Scotswomen?"Scottish Missionaries and the Eastern Cape Colony in the Nineteenth Century. In: *Empires of Religion,* (ed) Carey, H. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Magaziner, D. 2011. Pieces of a (Wo)man: Feminism, Gender and Adulthood in Black Consciousness. *Journal of Southern African Studies,* 37(1): 45-61.

Maldonado-Torres, N. 2005. Frantz Fanon and C.L.R James on Intellectualism and Enlightened Rationality. *Caribbean Studies,* 33(2): 149-194.

Mamdani, M. 1996. *Citizen and Subject: Contemporary Africa and the Legacy of Late Colonialism.* Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Mannheim, K. 1936. *Ideology and Utopia: An Introduction to the Sociology of Knowledge.* London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Masola, A. 2019. The Politics of the 1920s Black Press: Charlotte Maxeke and Nontsizi Mgqwetho's Critique of Congress. *International Journal of African Renaissance Studies-Multi-, Inter and Transdisciplinarity,* 13(2): 59-76.

Masola, A. 2020. *Journeying Home, Exile and Transnationalism in Noni Jabavu and Sisonke Msimang's Memoirs*. PhD Thesis. Rhodes University.

Mazrui, A. 2005. Pan-Africanism and the Intellectuals: Rise, Decline and Revival. In: *African Intellectuals: Rethinking Politics, Language, Gender and Development, (eds)* Mkandawire, T. New York: Zed Books.

McCall, L. 2005. The Complexity of Intersectionality. *Signs*, 30(3): 1771-1880.

McClintock, A. 1991. "No Longer in a Future Heaven": Women and Nationalism in South Africa. *Transition*, 51: 104-123

McClintock, A. 1993. Family, Feuds: Gender, Nationalism and the Family. *Feminist Review,* 44 (Nationalisms and National Identities): 61-80.

© University of Pretoria

McLaren, A., Fischman, G., Serra., S and Antelo, E. 1998. The Spectres of Gramsci: Revolutionary Praxis and the Committed Intellectual. *Journal of Thought,* 33(3): 9-41.

Merriam, S.B and Tisdell, E.J. 2016. *Qualitative Research: A Guide to Design and Implementation.* 4th ed. San Franciso: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Mills, C. W. 1963. *Power. Politics and People: The Collected Essays of C. Wright Mills.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Mkandawire, T. 2005. African Intellectuals and Nationalism. In: *African Intellectuals: Rethinking Politics, Language, Gender and Development,* (ed) Mkandawire, T. New York: Zed Books.

Moore-Gilbert., B. 2011. A Concern Peculiar to Western Man? Postcolonial Reconsiderations of Autobiography as Genre. In: *Postcolonial Poetics: Genre and Form, (eds)* Crowly, P and Hiddlesont, J. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press.

Nash, J. 2011. 'Home Truths' on Intersectionality. *Yale Journal of Law & Feminism,* 23(2): 445-470.

Ndletyana, M. 2008. *African Intellectuals in the 19th and 20th century: South Africa.* Cape Town: HSRC Press.

Ndlovu-Gatsheni, S. 2008. Black Republican Tradition, Nativism and Populist Politics in South Africa. *Transformation,* 68: 53-86.

Neogy, R. 1970 [2017]. On Being an African Intellectual. *Transition,* 123: 44-61.

Ngcobozi, L. 2020. *Mothers of the Nation: Manyano Women in South Africa.* Cape Town: Tafelberg.

Ntantala, P. 1961. *Bantu Education 1955-1960.* Johannesburg.

Ntantala, P. 1979. *An African Tragedy: The Black Women Under Apartheid.* Detroit: Agascha Productions.

Ntantala, P. 1984. Black Womanhood and National Liberation. *Sechaba*, December: 3-15.

Ntantala, P., 1993. *Letter to Ncebsie.* Taylor, Michigan.

Ntantala, P. 1994. *Perspective on the South African Elections.* New York City.

Ntantala, P. 2001. *Letter to Ncebsie.* Taylor.

© University of Pretoria

Ntantala, P. 2006. *Black Women Intellectuals and the Liberation Struggle.* Johannesburg.

Ntantala, P. 2008. *Re: Education and Democracy- A View From Soweto.* Taylor.

Ntantala, P. 2009. *A Life's Mosaic: An Autobiography of Phyllis Ntantala.* Johannesburg: Jacana Media (Pty) Ltd.

Ntantala, P. n.d. *Coming Home.* Taylor.

Ntuli, P and Smit, J.A. 1999. Speaking Truth to Power: A Challenge to South African Intellectuals. *Alternation,* 6(1): 1-20.

Nyquist, T. 1983. *African Middle-Class Elite,* Grahamstown: Institute of Social and Economic Research- Rhodes University.

Oyewumi, O. 2005. Visualizing the Body: Western Theories and African Subjects. In: *African Gender Studies- A Reader,* (ed) Oyewumi, O. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Pels, D. 1995. Knowledge Politics and Anti-Politics: Towards a Critical Appraisal of Bourdieu's Concept of Intellectual Autonomy. *Theory and Society,* 24(1): 79-104.

Perkins, M. 2000. *Autobiography as Activism: Three Black Women of the Sixties.* Jackson: The University Press of Mississippi.

Polkinghorne, D. 1995. Narrative Configuration in Qualitative Analysis. In: *Life history and Narrative,* (eds) Hatch., J.A and Wisniewski., *R.* London: The Palmer Press.

Posner, R. 2001. *Public Intellectuals: A Study of Decline.* London: Harvard University Press.

Record, W. 1954. Intellectuals in Social and Racial Movements. *Phylon: The Atlanta University Review,* 15(3): 231-242.

Said, E. 1996. *Representation of the Intellectual: The 1993 Reith Lectures.* New York: Vintage.

Samuelson, M. 2012. Writing Women. In: *The Cambridge History of South African Literature, (eds)* Attwell, D. and Attridge, D. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Sanders, M. 2002. *Complicities: The Intellectual and Apartheid.* Pietmartizburg: University of Natal Press.

Sapire, H. 2000. Engendering Segregation: 'Black Women's Work' in the Urban American South and South Africa in the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries. *South African Historical Journal,* 43(1): 39-80.

© University of Pretoria

Schneck, S. 1987. Michael Foucault on Power/Discourse, Theory and Practice. *Human Studies,* 10(1): 15-33.

Seekings, J. 2009. The Rise and Fall of the Weberian Analysis of Class in South Africa between 1949 and 1970*. *Journal of Southern African Studies,* 35(4): 865-881.

Shacklock, G and Thorp, L 2005. Life History and Narrative Approaches. In: *Research Methods in the Social Sciences,* (eds) Somekh, B and Lewin, C. London: SAGE Publications.

Shils, E. 1958. The Intellectuals and the Powers: Some Perspectives for Comparative Analysis. *Comparative Studies in Society and History,* 1(1): 25-48.

Simek, N. 2016. This Death which is Not One: The Postcolonial Author as Public Intellectual. In: *The New Public Intellectual: Politics, Theory, and the Public Sphere.* (eds) Di Leo, J.R and Hitchcock, P. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Simien, E.M. 2008. Black Feminist Theory. *Women & Politics*, 26(2): 81-93

Sithole, T. 2012. *Fanon and the Positionality of Seepe, Mangcu and Mngxitama as Black Public Intellectuals in the Post-1994 South Africa.* Masters Dissertation. Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Smith, L. 1999. *Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous People.* London: Zed Books Ltd.

Sono, T. 1994. *Dilemmas of African Intellectuals in South Africa: Political and Cultural Constraints.* Pretoria: Sigma Press.

Southall, R. 2014. The African Middle Class in South Africa 1910-1994. *Economic History of Developing Regions,* 29(2): 287-310.

Spivak, G. 1988. Can the Subaltern Speak?. In: *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture,* (eds) Nelson, C and Grossberg, L. London: Macmillan Education.

Spivak, G. 2010. Can the Subaltern Speak?. In: *Can the Subaltern Speak?: Reflection on the History of an Idea,* (ed) Morris, R. New York: Columbia University Press.

Squires, C. 2002. Rethinking the Black Publics Sphere: An Alternative Vocabulary for Multiple Public Spheres. *Communication Theory,* 12(4): 446-468.

© University of Pretoria

Suttner, R. 2005. The Character and Formation of Intellectuals within the ANC-led South African Liberation Movement. In: *African Intellectuals: Rethinking Politics, Language, Gender and Development,* (ed) Mkandawire, T. London: Zed Books.

Tendi, M.-B. 2008. Patriotic History and Public Intellectuals Critical of Power. *Journal of Southern African Studies,* 34(2): 379-396.

Thomas, L. 2006. The Modern Girl and Racial Respectability in the 1930s South Africa. *The Journal of African History,* 47(3): 461-490.

Tonono, S. 2020. "Let Us Make Men In Our Own Image": The Mission Station as a Site of Black Emasculation in Nineteen-Century South Africa. *Journal of Asia-Pacific Pop Culture,* 5(2): 171-190.

Untehalter, E. 2000. The Work of the Nation: Heroic Masculinity in South African Autobiographical Writing of the Anti-Apartheid Struggle. *The European Journal of Development Research,* 12: 157–178.

Walker, C. 1990. Women and Gender in Southern Africa to 1945: An Overview. In: *Women and Gender in South Africa to 1945*. Cape Town: David Phillips.

Wells, J. 1991. Rise and Fall of Motherism as a Force in Black Women's Resistance Movement. *Women and Gender in Southern Africa Conference Pape*r. Durban.

Weintraub, J. 1997. The Theory and Politics of the Public/Private Distinction. In: *Public and Private in Thought and Practice: Perspectives on a Grand Dichotomy, (eds)* Weintraub, J and Kumar, K. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

West, C. 1985. The Dilemma of the Black Intellectual. *Cultural Critique,* 1: 109-124.

© University of Pretoria