UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

Cross-border care practices: Experiences of Zimbabwean migrant women engaged in care work in households in South Africa

Student:

Precious Baison

Student number:

13414152

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree Doctor of Philosophy (DPhil) in Sociology in the

Department of Sociology
Faculty of Humanities
University of Pretoria

Supervisor: Professor Zitha Mokomane

ABSTRACT

The aim of this study is to explore the cross-border migration of Zimbabwean women who undertake various types of care work within the domestic sector in South Africa. The study seeks to understand the female labour migration within the context of global care work. It utilises the global care chain concept, which describes the employment of women and men to provide care in wealthy countries while leaving a care gap in their own families. The specific objectives of the study were as follows:

1. To examine the reasons for care workers' migration to South Africa.
2. To investigate their work experiences in relation to duties, contractual agreements, hours worked, benefits including leave entitlements, employer-employee relations, and overall working conditions.
3. To examine the perceived macro and meso benefits and costs of the cross-border migration for care workers and the extent to which these impacts affect familial relations in Zimbabwe.
4. To explore the coping mechanisms and strategies employed by migrant care workers in navigating the challenges encountered in the course of their duties.
5. To examine women's interpretations of their work experiences in relation to their position in society (or their position as migrant care workers in society).

This study drew on two theoretical concepts: social reproduction from a feminist perspective, and transnationalism. Social reproduction places an emphasis on care and describes the activities of maintaining life daily and nurturing future generations. Transnationalism involves migrants maintaining relations in both their home country and the receiving country.

Data was collected through a qualitative research design. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with key informants from four domestic worker recruitment agencies and 26 domestic and care workers in two cities, Johannesburg and Pretoria. Both cities are located in Gauteng, one of the nine provinces in South Africa and the country's economic hub. The cities were chosen based on statistics showing that migrant inflows from outside South Africa were highest in Gauteng.

The leading findings were that Zimbabwean migrant care workers in South Africa faced exploitative working conditions as the majority of them were undocumented or irregular. They faced challenges in obtaining valid work visas due to the stringent immigration policies in South Africa. It emerged that without legal documentation, migrant care workers could not seek employment through formal channels such as recruitment agencies. They used informal channels such as social networks and the 'market'. The study highlighted that these informal channels were risky and did not offer protection and safety to either the care workers or the

employing families. Further, it emerged that migrant care workers were vulnerable to exploitation through poor working conditions that violated labour laws.

The findings highlighted that the benefit of migration for care workers was the opportunity to find employment, which enabled them to become economically active as income earners and financial providers. Through the income they earned, migrant women were able to send remittances in the form of money, groceries, and clothing to their families in Zimbabwe, reflecting transnational care practices. The study revealed that the migration of women was associated with social costs such as the emotional strain resulting from the separation of family members and the extraction of care resources by removing carers from the family.

In light of the transfer of care resources through their migration, migrant women had to make care arrangements to fill the gap. They found suitable caregivers in their extended families. They made use of the information and communication technologies of smart phones to maintain ties with their families.

The overall contribution of the study is that it gathered evidence to show that migrant care workers within the Global South are more vulnerable to exploitation largely due to unregulated migration processes when compared to South-North global care chains. This evidence supports the argument that employment conditions, migration laws and policies, as well as national labour standards can intersect to shape the status and experiences of migrant domestic workers.

Based on the findings of the study, the following recommendations for policy, practice and future research were made:

Recommendations for policy:
- Introduction of less stringent and affordable visa options for care workers.
- Strengthening of bi-lateral or multi-lateral agreements within Southern African Development Community (SADC) countries to allow both the sending and destination countries to establish safeguards to protect the employer and employees.
- Redefinition of domestic and care duties and responsibilities. This entails a distinct classification of roles and responsibilities for workers in this sector in policies and laws to ensure that employees are remunerated accordingly.
- Training of care workers to enhance their skills as well for the protection and security of care recipients and employers in general.

Recommendations for practice:
- There is need to ensure that migrant domestic workers enjoy same labour rights as other workers.

Recommendations for future research:

- Further study could explore the perceptions of employers to understand their motivations and the domestic employment relationship.
- Research that focuses on the experiences of domestic workers from other countries in the SADC region.
- Comparative study of migrant domestic workers and their local counterparts would be useful to understand whether the challenges they face are specific to the sector or are associated with their migrant status.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

DECLARATION

Full name: PRECIOUS BAISON

Student Number: 13414152

Degree/Qualification: DPHIL SOCIOLOGY

Title of thesis/dissertation/mini-dissertation: **Cross-border care practices: Experiences of Zimbabwean migrant women engaged in care work in households in South Africa**

I declare that this thesis / dissertation / mini dissertation is my own original work.   Where secondary material is used, this has been carefully acknowledged and referenced in accordance with university requirements.

I understand what plagiarism is and am aware of university policy and implications in this regard.

_____   _____
SIGNATURE   DATE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Introduction

This study explores the experiences of Zimbabwean women who migrate to South Africa to undertake various types of care work within the broader domestic work sector. The study thus draws on one of the most influential perspectives on contemporary transnational migration by women into care and domestic work – the concept of the global care chains (Bikova, 2017). The concept relates to how women from developing countries migrate to take up employment caring for children and others in families located in wealthier neighbouring, regional or international countries, while they seek help from their extended families to take over their own care-giving responsibilities (Yeates, 2005). Global care chains can thus be seen as networks that exist transnationally, and within which households transfer care work from one home to another, based on power axes like gender, ethnicity, social class, and place of origin (Orozco, 2009; 2010).

With this background, it can be argued that global care chains connect different study areas, specifically migration, globalisation, care, and various forms of inequality (Yeates, 2005; 2009). Defined by the International Labour Organisation (2018a: 6) as 'consisting of activities and relations involved in meeting the physical, psychological and emotional needs of adults and children, old and young, frail and able-bodied', care services are complex, diverse, and are provided in a range of public and private settings such as private households, hospices, nursing homes, schools and hospitals, among others (Yeates, 2005; World Health Organisation, 2017). It is noteworthy that, while by definition, care workers provide personal care services, the tasks undertaken by many migrant care workers overlap with those undertaken by domestic workers. The latter, according to the International Labour Organisation (2013), is any person performing housekeeping work such as cooking, cleaning, and the provision of laundry services for a household within an employment relationship. The situation in many migrant destination areas is that care workers and domestic workers are essentially carrying out 'housework *and* care'. That is, in addition to doing housekeeping they provide care for children, the elderly and other vulnerable people within private homes for some form of remuneration (Crozier, 2010; Cox, 2016; World Health Organisation, 2017; International Labour Organisation, 2018a). It is largely for this reason that this study will use the terms 'domestic worker' and 'care worker' interchangeably when referring to the Zimbabwean migrant care workers who form the focus of the study.

In addition to the dynamics of care, research on global care chains has highlighted how the recruitment of domestic workers from relatively poor countries enables women at the upper end of the chain in wealthier countries to take part in the public sphere as they are relieved of the burden of the 'double shift' of simultaneously doing paid and domestic work (Yeates,

2005; Orozco, 2010; Lutz, 2018). For the women employed as domestic workers, on the other hand, participation in these chains somehow liberates them 'from oppressive traditional norms and dependency from spouses' (Deshingkar and Zeitlyn, 2015: 175) as they take on roles of breadwinners and attain some form of financial independence. Overall, women gain opportunities for social and economic mobility. For example, research on migrant Filipino women engaged in domestic work abroad has shown changes in their economic and social status where they are now considered the 'new local elite' due to improvements in their way of living and standards accumulated from living abroad. Furthermore, the income earned and remitted home allows the women to improve their children's educational opportunities as well as their overall family wellbeing. Asis et al. (2004) also reference migrant women's view of their participation in global care chains as a way to fulfil personal goals such as self-discovery and the opportunity to experience a different culture.

At the same time, studies on global care chains continue to illuminate social divisions. The differences between the sending and destination countries' economic status that push women to migrate reflect the inequalities of class, income and wealth (Yeates, 2005). Furthermore, research has demonstrated that inequalities of race and ethnicity are factored in as it is women from minority groups who tend to be subcontracted for this type of work and they are often selected based on stereotypes. For example, the preference for certain groups such as Filipino and Polish women who are seen as better carers and 'warm-hearted' (Yeates, 2005; Palenga-Möllenbeck, 2013). Palenga-Möllenbeck (2013) points out that the migration status of the workers (documented or undocumented) further positions them in a social hierarchy where migrants are often found at the bottom.

While much of the available literature on global care chains emanates from studies based on migration flows from South to North (Bikova, 2017; Parreñas, 2015; Fudge, 2011; Escriva and Skinner, 2008), increasing care demands propelled by social and demographic transformations in many countries of the Global South make the concept relevant to the South-South context. The transformations include greater numbers of women entering the labour market, increased migration, and the rise in the aging population. For example, the International Labour Organisation highlights the high rate of women's participation in the labour force in developing countries including in sub-Saharan Africa due to poverty, low household incomes as well as lack of social security protection, which forces all able-bodied members of the household to seek employment (International Labour Organisation, 2018b; International Labour Organisation, 2020). While the global female labour force rate was 47% in 2019, the International Labour Organisation (2020) reports that regional variations exist with the rate in sub-Saharan African being 63%. The report also shows that this rate has been relatively stable over the past two decades: it was 65% in 2000 and 64% in 2014. With women traditionally being the primary family caregivers, their participation in the labour market is leaving a gap in care-giving responsibilities in the family and household. Care

needs have also increased as the Global South is also grappling with a rise in the aging population. The United Nations (2020) report on World Population Ageing notes that the pace of population aging has peaked in Eastern and South Eastern Asia (from 6% in 1990 to 11% in 2019) as well as in Latin America and the Caribbean where it increased from 5% to 9% in the same period. In sub-Saharan Africa, the number of persons aged 60 years and above doubled from 23 million to 46 million between 1990 and 2015 and is projected to reach 160 million in 2050 (United Nations, 2016b).

As people live longer, they become more at risk of non-communicable diseases which include cancer, diabetes, cardio-vascular diseases like heart attacks and stroke among others (Yiengprugsawan et al., 2016; Gyasi and Phillips, 2019). Along with diminished physical capacity and increased frailty that hamper the performance of daily activities, these health issues are leading to an increasing demand for the provision of care for the elderly (Esplen and Brighton Institute of Development Studies, 2009).

In many developing regions older people traditionally lived in multi-generational households where adult children, their spouses, and other family members were relied on for material as well as practical support and care (Cohen and Menken, 2006). This mode of care giving has been severely impacted by rising migration. According to the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (2018) for example, since 2000, international migration in Africa (which occurs primarily in the same African region) increased significantly by 67% from 15 million in 2000 to 25 million in 2017. Rural-urban migration is also an important component of the African social landscape (Awumbila, 2014; Awumbila, 2017). Awumbila (2017) notes that the global share of African urban dwellers is projected to rise from 11.3% in 2010 to about 20% in 2050. With regard to the provision of family care, a key implication brought about by these migration patterns is the weakening of traditional reciprocal relations between generations as household sizes decrease and family members, including potential caregivers, increasingly live in physically separate locations (Mokomane, 2013).

In sub-Saharan Africa, this situation is aggravated by public infrastructures that are ill-equipped to care for older persons' needs as well as by the broad absence of comprehensive formal social protection and social security systems (Mokomane, 2013; Aboderin and Hoffman, 2015). Aboderin and Beard (2015) note that older people in sub-Saharan African countries face barriers to accessing health care with regards to mobility issues which include absence of escorts or high cost of transport to health providers and often turn to commercial providers because of unavailability, perceived poor quality or age insensitivity of services in government facilities, which can be worsened in informal settlements as reflected in a study of older people in informal settlements in Kenya where people are underserved by the public sector in the provision of basic amenities and services (Aboderin et al., 2017). According to the International Labour Organisation (2017), compared to the global average of 67.9%, only 29.6% of older people in Africa have effective social protection coverage. In addition, only

9.0% of sub-Saharan Africans in the labour force are active contributors to old age pension schemes. Overall, as the *African Union Plan of Action on Ageing* has pointed out:

> In addition to the usual physical, mental and physiological changes associated with ageing, old people in Africa are particularly disadvantaged due to lack of social security for their everyday social and economic needs. The care and support by the family and community that was taken for granted in the past is no more because of changes in society associated with urbanisation and "development" in general. Africa, therefore, needs to intensify efforts to put in place effective mechanisms to cater for the needs of its old people (African Union and HelpAge International, 2003: 5).

With this background, a number of scholars (e.g. (Kofman and Raghuram, 2009; Raghuram, 2012; Recalde, 2015) have critiqued the lack of diversity and 'geographic insensitivity' of the current South-North focused literature on global care chains. That is, much of the research in this area has been conducted among women leaving South East Asia, Eastern and Central Europe, and the Middle East to work in the Global North or other wealthier countries in their regions. This is despite evidence showing that there is a relatively larger flow of migrants within countries in the Global South in comparison to South-North migration as shown earlier for sub-Saharan Africa. The United Nations (2016a) further showed that 87% of migrants residing in the Global South originated from other parts of the developing world.
Literature has highlighted the problematic nature 'South- North' and 'South- South' migration concepts (Izaguirre and Walsham, 2021). Studies highlight that care workers migrate from poor countries to wealthier countries and these movements occur globally from within the Global South to the Global North and regionally, from poorer countries within the Global South to wealthier ones in the same region (Leal et al., 2019; Romero, 2018). 'South – South migration' is used to highlight migration between developing countries in the Global South. In this thesis, the use of the terms of 'South-North migration' and 'South-South migration' is based on literature which highlight that majority of studies on migration have tended to focus on South to North migration. Further, studies have indicated that South-South migration flows are significant because of their 'magnitude and diversity' and have distinctive characteristics when compared to other migration flows (Izaguirre and Walsham, 2021: 6). This study, therefore, aims to contribute an African perspective to this broader subject of transnational migration and care work.

1.2   Problem statement

South Africa is considered the regional hub with regards to migration in southern Africa. According to Statistics South Africa (2015), at the time of the Census in 2011, there were around 2.1 million international migrants in the country, which translates to 4.2% of the total population. The majority (68%) of these migrants were from the Southern African

Development Community (SADC)[1] region. Of these, the highest proportion (45.5%) were from Zimbabwe followed by Mozambique (26.6%), and Lesotho (10.9%). While the statistics on gender do not give detail on specific countries, the report states that there were more women (22.5%) from the SADC region in the 15-24 years age group compared to men (19.6%), thus signifying a surge in the feminisation of migration. In terms of employment, 62.6% of the international migrants were employed in the formal sector, 17.7 % in the informal sector and 17.1% in private households. The report stated that almost three quarters (73.3%) of migrants working in private households are from SADC, with other African countries making up 8.1% (Statistics South Africa, 2015).

Recent research and media reports as well as anecdotal evidence suggests that the majority of the migrants working in private households as domestic workers are from Zimbabwe with those from Lesotho and Malawi making other notable proportions (Makoro, 2015; Kiwanuka et al., 2015; Newsday, 2010; Nqambaza, 2016; Vanyoro, 2019a; Zack et al., 2019).

Like other migrant workers, Zimbabwean women are drawn to this sector because of its informal nature and low barriers to entry (Kiwanuka et al., 2015). However, available evidence suggests that they often face challenges due to stringent regulations, their immigration status, as well as exploitation as they typically have no access to labour rights such as minimum conditions of employment and wages or trade unions (Kiwanuka et al., 2015; Nqambaza, 2016). The rising levels of migration of Zimbabwean women to South Africa in search for work also leaves a care gap or deficit in their families in Zimbabwe. While other studies on Zimbabwean migrant domestic workers have explored circumstances and intermediaries that influence decisions to enter the domestic services sector and working conditions (Nqambaza, 2016; Zack et al., 2019; Vanyoro, 2019a), this study explores the transfer of care across the borders. It seeks to explore the work that Zimbabwean women do as care workers and how they manage to care for their families across borders. Drawing from the labour geography approach propounded by Andrew Herod, (Castree, 2007) argues that geography plays an integral role to workers' employment and work practices. This approach places emphasis on the agency of workers by highlighting that workers play an active role in shaping the landscapes in which they find themselves. This study seeks to examine the employment and work conditions for Zimbabwean women migrants in South Africa. It seeks to illuminate the issues that constrain as well facilitate women's migration in this stream. While other studies have focused on the employment of Zimbabwean migrant workers in domestic work, this study seeks to further examine the migrants' lives and families in the

---

[1] SADC is an inter-governmental organisation that aims to further socio-economic cooperation and integration as well as political and security cooperation among 16 southern African countries: Angola, Botswana, Comoros, Democratic Republic of Congo, Eswatini, Lesotho, Madagascar, Malawi, Mauritius, Mozambique, Namibia, Seychelles, South Africa, Tanzania, Zambia and Zimbabwe

country of origin. As women are central to the caring roles in the family, this study seeks to examine how migrant women negotiate their gendered roles in their absence.

1.3   Objectives of the study

The aim of this study is to explore and understand cross-border migration of Zimbabwean migrant women working as care workers in South Africa. The **specific objectives** are:

1. To examine the reasons for the care workers' migration to South Africa.
2. To investigate their work experiences in relation to duties, contractual agreements, hours worked, benefits including leave entitlements, employer-employee relations, and overall working conditions.
3. To examine the perceived macro and meso benefits and costs of cross-border migration for care workers and the extent to which these impacts affect familial relations in Zimbabwe.
4. To explore the coping mechanisms and strategies employed by migrant care workers in navigating the challenges encountered in the course of their duties.
5. To examine the women's interpretations of their work experiences in relation to their position in society (or their position as migrant care workers in society).

1.4 Theoretical framework

This study is located within a feminist theory that seeks to understand the exploitation of women. It draws on feminists' debates on how work is defined, how gender shapes and defines who does what type of work and the value given to that work. In particular, the study draws from two concepts: social reproduction and transnationalism.

1.4.1 Social reproduction

A recurring element in the various definitions of the concept of social reproduction is the emphasis on the notion of care, particularly three aspects: biological reproduction of the species; the reproduction of the labour force; and the reproduction and provisioning of caring needs that may be wholly privatised within families and kinship networks or socialised to some degree through state supports (Bakker, 2007: 541). According to Laslett and Brenner (1989 cited in Luxton (2006: 35-36), for example:

> Among other things, social reproduction includes how food, clothing, and shelter are made available for immediate consumption, the ways in which care and socialisation of children are provided, the care for the infirm and elderly, and the social organisation of sexuality. Social reproduction can thus be seen to include various kinds of work – mental, manual and emotional – aimed at providing the historically and socially, as well as biologically, defined care necessary to maintain existing life and to reproduce the next generation.

By the same token, Hester and Srnicek (2018: 335) describe social reproduction or reproductive labour as:

> … activities that nurture future workers, regenerate the current work force, and maintain those who cannot work – that is, the set of tasks that together maintain and reproduce life, both daily and generationally. Social reproduction consists, broadly speaking, of caring directly for oneself and others (childcare, elder care, healthcare), maintaining physical spaces and organizing resources as part of an indirect process of care for oneself and others (cleaning, shopping, repairing), and species reproduction (bearing children). These are, in short, the everyday tasks involved in staying alive and helping others stay alive which have traditionally been performed by women for low or no wages. They are also forms of labour that tend to be neglected in contemporary debates about work. By maintaining and producing workers, reproductive labour demands to be seen as the foundation of global capitalism. As a theoretical framework, the analysis of social reproduction insists upon the intricate and intimate ways in which historically gendered caring activities are tied to the imperatives of capitalism.

The feminist approach to social reproduction gives particular attention to the notions of reproducing the next generation and nurturing of future workers (Laslett and Brenner, 1989: 383). To the extent that this brings focus to domestic work and the unpaid care work done by women within families, they argue that this work is as important as the work that goes into the production of goods. They further state that feminist scholars use this concept to "understand the perpetuation and reproduction of systems of gender inequality" (Laslett and Brenner, 1989: 383). The work of Marxist feminists is central in highlighting how this unpaid work benefitted capitalism. They highlight the gendered division of labour in the family where through ascribed gender roles women are responsible for taking care of their husbands and children, making workers more productive (Duffy, 2005; Duffy, 2007; England, 2005; Luxton, 2006; Glenn, 1992). Thus, the unpaid work undertaken by women within households was part of the capitalist mode of production as it ensured the reproduction of labour power. This analysis forms part of the domestic labour debate. According to Glenn (1992), this gendered construction of reproductive work was the source of women's oppression. Marxist feminists further argued that because this work was taking place outside the market, it remained invisible; thus the aim was to illuminate women's work within sociology and economics (Duffy, 2007). Glenn further notes that because reproductive work is mostly undertaken by women, men benefit indirectly and directly as they are freed from domestic work and able to concentrate on paid employment, allowing them to dominate in that area. The domestic labour debate brought to the fore the idea that gender is a key factor in social reproduction.

Several feminist writers have however highlighted the pitfalls of focusing only on gender in the analysis of reproductive work. Glenn (1992), for example, argues that it is critical to include the racial construction of reproductive labour as it highlights the exploitation of women through race and ethnicity. Glenn's main thesis in this regard is that race and gender are relational and interlocking systems of inequality that reinforce the differences among women and their location in relation to access to power, status and privilege, as well the interdependence among these women.

While analyses on women's reproductive work began with a focus on unpaid work within the family, it has extended to include paid work in the services sector (Glenn, 1992; Duffy, 2005, 2007). Overall, as Glenn argues, changes in the conditions of life that have been brought about through industrialisation, urbanisation and growth of the capitalist system have increased the need for reproductive activities provided through the market. She asserts that as additional members of the family become part of the labour force, they are left with less time to attend to each other's social and emotional needs, while at the same time families have been separated from their kin networks and traditional communities through urbanisation. Families are now relying on services provided through the market.

> As a result of these tendencies, an increasing range of services has been removed wholly or partially from the household and converted into paid services yielding profits. Today, activities such as preparing and serving food (in restaurants and fast-food establishments), caring for handicapped and elderly people (in nursing homes), caring for children (in child-care centres), and providing emotional support, amusement, and companionship (in counselling offices, recreation centres, and health clubs) have become part of the cash nexus (Glenn, 1992: 5-6).

It is evident, therefore, that the scope of social reproduction and care has expanded from the site of the family to the global scene with the incorporation of migrant domestic workers (Lan, 2000; Parreñas, 2000; Kofman, 2012; Kofman and Raghuram, 2015). The idea of the feminisation of migration has contributed to social reproduction being viewed as part of the global economy and links to how care has been tied to the global context. Parreñas explains how reproductive labour on an international level has been affected by processes of globalisation, commodification and increased feminisation of migration from the Global South to the North. Drawing on Sassen's (1998) concept of global cities, Parreñas explains how in developed countries there is continuing growth and demand for professionals who commit to their work outside of the home and therefore require low-wage services (domestic workers) to maintain their lifestyles. Thus, there is a demand for migrant women to take up this type of work. Parreñas argues that as globalisation has facilitated a single market economy, reproductive activities in developed countries are connected and tied to

reproductive activities in the Global South. Using a case study of Filipino domestic workers in the US and Italy, she refers to a three-tier transfer of reproductive labour among women in receiving and sending countries. That is, middle-class women in developed counties who employ migrant Filipino domestic workers and Filipino domestic workers in the Philippines who lack resources to migrate. She argues that this transfer of reproductive labour is a structural relationship among women in a global market highlighting inequalities based on class, race, gender, and citizenship. Drawing on similar arguments, Lan (2003) asserts that international division of labour should be understood through a 'structural continuum' to describe the fluidity and the different forms that reproductive labour takes in different settings as unpaid household labour as well as paid domestic work.

Fudge (2014) also draws linkages between migration and care work in her conceptualisation of social reproduction. Concurring with other scholars that social reproduction is apparent in institutions other than the family, she states that social reproduction 'involves a range of activities, of which body and care work are crucial elements and social processes that can be organised by different agents across a wide array of sites and institutions, some of which cross state borders' (Fudge, 2014: 11). Fudge argues that immigration, which is controlled by the state, is an important element in social reproduction as it is a source of labour and regulates the labour market. She notes that some activities that are within social reproduction such as child and elderly care, are provided or paid for by the state. However, in some advanced societies, states have transferred these provisions of care from public services to the market or to individual families in order to reduce costs. This has resulted in the spiralling demand for migrant care workers. Fudge and Ferguson and McNallly (2014) point out that as a result of immigration regulations, migrant workers are often incorporated into the labour market as temporary workers who have limited rights in destination countries. Fudge notes that in line with the gender division of labour in receiving countries, women migrants are often restricted to traditional occupations such as domestic and care work that are precarious – 'unstable, marked by low wages, absence of social services and poor working conditions' (Fudge, 2014: 9). Ferguson and McNallly (2014: 8-9) further argue that the use of 'hyper-precarious migrant labour' is related to the global processes of primitive accumulation as it contributes to the reproduction of capital.

Application and relevance of the theory to the study
The concept of social reproduction provides a lens through which to examine the work experiences and working conditions for Zimbabwean migrant care workers. It will bring attention to the work duties, in particular care work, performed by the workers and examine the extent to which they are able to regenerate their own lives by exploring issues related to working hours, remuneration and work-related benefits. It enables us to understand and examine the concerns that have been raised about global care chains and domestic work in general, including the exploitation of migrant women (working and living conditions as well

as remuneration).The concept will also assist in exploring the implications of the commodification of care work within the context of paid work. Further, it will assist in illuminating the inequalities experienced by migrant workers in the course of their duties.

The study will draw on the concept of social reproduction to analyse the perceived benefits and costs of migration for Zimbabwean care workers as well as their reasons for migration. The concept has been developed to capture factors and processes that influence reproductive work from a micro- to a macro-level. It offers a framework in which to understand Zimbabwean women's migration to South Africa at these various levels. For instance, at a micro-level, women might view migration as a livelihood strategy to address challenges faced at the family level as well as broader problems faced by the society such as unemployment, poverty and economic decline. Further, it allows for the understanding of inequalities at a global level. Chan (2000: 12 citing Colen, 1989) points out that both migration and domestic work have been viewed as a solution to women's problems within the world economic system. She further argues that the migration of women from poorer countries is related to the unequal development of different regions within the global economy. Thus, the concept elaborates on the interconnected and complex nature of women's reproductive work from the household to the global level.

Following from Lan's conception of reproductive labour as a structural continuity, the use of the concept allows for an understanding of Zimbabwean women's diverse identities and roles in different settings. Lan (2003) argues that women cross various boundaries and take up different identities in different spaces highlighting the idea of fluidity. A migrant worker is a domestic worker within her employer's household in the receiving country while in the country of origin, she can also be a 'madam' or employer within her household. It also helps to understand the links between gender, migration and globalisation, in particular transnational migration, which stresses embeddedness of migrant social relations between countries facilitated by developments related to globalisation discussed below.

1.4.2 Transnationalism

The concept of transnationalism, according to Schiller et al. (1992: ix), refers to the 'social process in which migrants establish social fields that cross geographical, cultural, and political fields'. It involves sustained relations that migrants are involved in both the countries of origin and settlement. Transnationalism is therefore tied to transnational migration, which Schiller et al. (1995: 48) define as the 'process by which immigrants forge and sustain multi-stranded social relations that link together their societies of origin and settlement', with emphasis on the ways in which they 'construct and reconstitute simultaneous embeddedness in more than one society'. Drawing from various scholars, Crush and McDonald (2000: 8-12) make five propositions towards the understanding of transnationalism:

i. Transnationalism is characterised by a 'high intensity of exchanges, new modes of transactions and multiplication of activities that require cross-border travel and contacts on a sustained basis'.

ii. Transnational activities are linked to the growth and internationalisation of capitalist production. To this end, transnationalism should be viewed as a product of a global capitalist system characterised by inequalities. Hence, migration needs to be examined in the context of demands for cheap labour in developed countries. This characteristic presents a new way of differentiating contemporary migration patterns from those that occurred in the past.

iii. Transnationalism offers a new way of understanding migration identities as new approaches to migration are moving away from the conception that immigrants tend to cut ties with their country of origin and try to assimilate into the country of settlement. This revised approach suggests that identity must be seen as one of hybridity, 'where migrants take on a multiplicity of identities that are a combination of home and host'.

iv. Emphasis is placed on the importance of social networks and linkages across borders that facilitate transnational migration.

v. Social ties and linkages as well as the growth of diverse migrant communities have allowed for the emergence of new forms of resistance towards the exploitation and discrimination of migrants.

Early literature on transnationalism was considered to be gender blind (Yeoh and Ramdas, 2014) and as a result, feminist scholars (e.g. (Fresnoza-Flot and Shinozaki, 2017; Pessar and Mahler, 2003; Lutz, 2010) have critiqued the male bias and invisibility of women within this concept's scholarship. Pessar and Mahler (2003: 814) for example, have argued that 'gender is a set of relations that organise immigration patterns' and that it is important to examine 'how gender relations facilitate and constrain both men and women's immigration patterns'. Similarly, reflecting on her study on Moroccan migrant women in Italy, (Salih, 2000) explains how women migrants experience transnationalism differently from their male counterparts, describing how their transnational activities can be affected by 'normative and cultural regulations based upon hegemonic interpretation of gender roles' as well as laws and regulations related to migration. Thus, she argues, transnationalism is not a 'uniform process' but a 'complex and varied terrain experienced differently according to gender and class and to their interplay with normative constraints' (Salih, 2000: 87).

To the extent that transnational migration entails the movement of family members across borders, contemporary migration studies have focused on the formation of transnational families, which Bryceson and Vuorela (2002: 3) describe as 'families that live for some time or most of the time separated from each other yet hold together and create … a feeling of collective welfare and unity, namely "familyhood" even across the borders'. Other scholars explain this idea of familyhood by noting that migration is often centred on one's responsibility to the family (Sørensen and Vammen, 2014) while Parreñas (2015) points to how migration can be viewed as a household strategy as members of transnational households share resources and maintain a sense of collective responsibility for each other's wellbeing. This further emphasises Bryceson and Vuorela (2002)'s idea that transnational families are relational in nature. These two authors argue that transnational families are often characterised by inequality among their members as there are differences in access to mobility, resources and the various types of capital. Thus, there is emphasis on interdependency and mutual support among members of the family.

Scholars have interrogated the idea of the transnational family noting that this type of family varies according to the context (Kontos and Bonifacio, 2015; Schmalzbauer, 2004). Kontos and Bonifacio (2015: 4) citing from Baldassar et al. (2007) point out that the concept of the transnational family is 'intended to capture the growing awareness that members of families retain their sense of collectivity and kinship despite being spread across multiple nations. At the same time, it is important not to underestimate the impact of distance and borders on these relationships and in the practices of care giving'. The authors argue that the transnational families of migrant domestic workers are different from other transnational families given their working and living conditions. Domestic workers migrate without their families and some working conditions, such as being a live-in employee, do not allow them to live with their families. These conditions as well as their lack of other rights including leave entitlements and low remuneration result in their inability to regularly visit their families left in the country of origin. Kontos and Bonifacio (2015: 5) state that the characteristic of transnational migration that emphasises frequent mobility between the home and destination countries does not apply to such workers, thus 'the majority of domestic workers are trapped in the immobility of transnational paid care work'.

In transnational families, the concept of caring is transformed. Baldassar et al. (2007) advocates for the concept of transnational care giving in which they argue that care giving can be extended from physical and personal care activities such as bathing, cooking, feeding and can include telephone calls, visits, advice and financial support. They define transnational care giving as the 'exchange of care and support across distances' and provide a model of care giving based on five types of providing care and mutual support (economic, accommodation, personal, practical and childcare, and emotional and moral) (Baldassar et al., 2007: 14-15). The scholars make an argument that care giving at a transnational level is

influenced by several factors such as distance and national borders, i.e. micro, meso and macro factors, which influence the ability to provide care. Care workers in the domestic sphere are particularly well positioned to provide both types of care: the proximate (physical and personal care to the households they work in), and at the same time can engage in transnational care giving.

Application and relevance of the theory to the study

Transnationalism is relevant to this study as it provides a framework in which to understand the cross-border migration of Zimbabwean women to South Africa in terms of gender and family dynamics. The concept will be used in addressing objectives 3 and 4 of the study, which examine the perceived macro and meso benefits and costs of migration for the care workers and the extent to which these impact on the family in Zimbabwe, as well as the coping strategies employed by workers to navigate the challenges they encounter. It will be useful in understanding how care workers negotiate their various identities, for instance as a worker, with family and care responsibilities despite the separation from their families.

1.5 Organisation of the thesis

This introductory chapter discussed the background, the aim and objectives as well as the theoretical framework underpinning the study. **Chapter 2** illuminates the role of the care workers within the domestic services sector in South Africa by focusing on the immigration policies and national labour laws that are significant in highlighting the extent to which migrant workers are incorporated into the labour market. The study's overall methodology is discussed in **Chapter 3**.

The study's findings are presented in three chapters with **Chapter 4** focusing on the main reasons for migration as well as the job seeking mechanisms employed by the Zimbabwean migrant women. **Chapter 5** explores the domestic workers' working conditions paying particular attention to duties, contractual agreements, working hours, remuneration as well as rest and leave arrangements. **Chapter 6** elaborates on the benefits and costs of migration and highlights the transnational caring practices that take place between Zimbabwe and South Africa. **Chapter 7** details the coping strategies employed by care workers to maintain ties with their families in Zimbabwe and to deal with work-related stress. **Chapter 8** concludes the thesis by reiterating key findings and providing recommendations for future research and policy and practice.

CHAPTER 2: CONTEXTUAL BACKGROUND

2.1   Introduction

This chapter seeks to situate this study on Zimbabwean migrant care workers by providing background information on the domestic service sector in South Africa. The chapter begins with a historical overview of the sector in the country, highlighting how migration has been its key feature. The legislative framework that regulates South Africa's contemporary domestic sector is then critically assessed, with a focus on the extent to which it facilitates migration care workers' participation in the sector.

2.2 The South African domestic sector

2.2.1 Migration and domestic work: Historical overview

The pattern of labour migration in South Africa can be traced back to the institutional segregation of population groups that prevailed during the apartheid[2] era. Describing the system eight years before the advent of democracy, Turrell (1986: 45) wrote as follows:

> Racial discrimination in South Africa is based on the migrant labour system. Unlike other South Africans, Africans are treated as foreigners outside strictly defined areas of residence, the so-called 'homelands', and their movement is controlled by the notorious system of pass laws. Typically, men contract to work in the major cities while leaving their families and political rights behind them in the 'homelands'. Migrant labour has ensured a supply of cheap wage labour to the mining sector and secondary industry…

As Turrell alludes, labour migrants were predominantly men who migrated from rural areas to work in the mines. Posel (2004) argues that this gendered pattern of migration was reinforced by 'internal structures of control' in rural communities that sought to maintain a gendered division of labour. Posel (2004: 278) argues that 'chiefs, fathers and husbands had the ability to restrict the mobility of women and thereby reinforce women's traditional roles in rural production'. As a result, women remained in the rural areas where they were expected to care for the children, the elderly and the sick (Jansen, 2019). For instance, Jansen cites the 1936 census which showed that 56% of all black women were living in the 'native

---

[2] This was a system of racial segregation enforced through legislation by the National Party government, which was the ruling party in South Africa from 1948 to 1994. Under the National Party's apartheid rules, the rights of the majority black inhabitants and other groups within the country were curtailed and white supremacy was maintained (Gallagher, M. 2002. The birth and death of apartheid. *BBC News Africa* [Online]. Available: Retrieved from http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/africa/575204.stm. Retrieved 17 August 2012 [Accessed 26 June 2020].)

reserves', 11% were living in the urban areas while the rest were in the rural areas (Jansen, 2019: 50).

Race, class, gender and migration are factors predominantly covered in the literature on the historical background of paid domestic work (Du Toit, 2016). The history of domestic work is rooted in slavery with studies showing that in the colonial period in South Africa, this type of work was performed by slaves and immigrants from other countries in the 18th and early 19th century (Jansen, 2019; Gaitskell et al., 1983; Ally, 2006). These scholars note that white immigrant women were prominent in this period with white settlers bringing their own domestic servants as well as other European women escaping the poor working conditions in their countries of origin. Ally (2006) argues that in the 1880s white servants began to be an unreliable source of labour as white women began to leave the sector as a result of social mobility. Thus, the profile of domestic work began to change to African men and then , later predominantly, black women. Scholarly literature has noted the dominance of men in the domestic service sector in the early 20th century working in white households (Kiwanuka et al., 2015; Ally, 2006; Gaitskell et al., 1983). For example, Gaitskell et al. (1983) highlighted that in 1911 men constituted 45% of all the domestic servants whilst by 1970, they were only 11%. Another reason proffered was the use of the pass system instituted during apartheid to control the movement of people. Pass books were used to record employment details and were applicable mostly to men until the 1950s, making men more accessible and reliable to employers (Jansen, 2019; Gaitskell et al., 1983).

The expanding demand for male labour in the mines and other industries opened up space for the recruitment of an alternative source of labour in the domestic services sector, which was filled by African women (Ally, 2006; Ginsburg, 2000). Most domestic workers were internal migrants moving from the rural areas to work in the cities and the ability to earn money to support their families was one of the reasons behind this decision (Ginsburg, 2000). According to Ally (2006) the migration of women to urban areas began in the 1920s and continued rapidly afterwards. One of the ways in which women were channelled into the domestic service sector was through the establishment of 'girls' hostels by churches and missionaries 'subtly' working with the state (Ally, 2006: 72-74). The hostels were used to provide training in domesticity (housework and care work) and ensured the supply of domestic workers to white households (Ally, 2006). Legislation used to control the movement of people during that time also channelled women entering the cities into the domestic sector. For instance, the Urban Areas Act of 1923, as amended in 1930, stipulated that black women had to prove that they had accommodation when entering an urban area and had to remain under the control of a husband or a father (Jansen, 2019; Ally, 2006). Thus, domestic work provided a source of accommodation for women as they could live in their employer's household, usually in the back rooms (Ginsburg, 2000).

Jansen and Ginsburg highlight the ways in which black women[3] were restricted to domestic work as a source of employment. These included a lack of education and proficiency in English or Afrikaans as well as limited experience. Gaitskell et al. (1983) points out that race and sex discrimination further restricted black women to domestic service as they were denied access to clerical, sales and factory jobs, which could be accessed by white women. She further argues that domestic work provided black women access to an income, adding that they continued to work in the sector due to the absence of alternative job opportunities. Jansen (2019: 76) notes that black women became part of the 'white South African lifestyle' and cites a 1980 study by Erasmus, which found that 31% of white households had a fulltime black domestic worker in their employment while 28% had a part-time worker. About 25% of the domestic workers lived on the employer's premises. In this case, domestic work in the apartheid era demonstrated racial and class relations of servitude and domination (Fish, 2006).

2.2.2 Role of domestic workers in contemporary South Africa

Consistent with the pattern during the apartheid era, the domestic services sector continues to play a significant role in contemporary South Africa. Data from Statistics South Africa (2019) shows that just over one million of the country's 52 million people were employed as domestic workers in the third quarter of 2019; this represents about 6% of all employed people in South Africa. It is to this end that South Africa has been cited as having the highest number of domestic workers in the southern African region (Hengeveld, 2015). Black African women represent the overwhelming majority (over 95%) of domestic workers in the country (Hengeveld, 2015; Statistics South Africa, 2019). In terms of educations status, the domestic work sector has been found to have the highest concentration of workers with an education level below Grade 12 (the final year of high school) (Gama and Willemse, 2015).

Unlike in the apartheid era when most domestic workers were internal migrants, available evidence shows an increased incorporation of regional migrants into the South African domestic service. As Table 2.1 shows, 13% of all domestic workers in South Africa are from other countries. Available literature (Griffin, 2010; Kiwanuka et al., 2015; Makoro, 2015; Peberdy and Dinat, 2005; Budlender, 2014) has consistently revealed that these are mainly neighbouring SADC countries, specifically Lesotho, Malawi and Zimbabwe.

---

[3] Four racial categories have been identified in South Africa: White, African (Black), Coloured (mixed race), Indians. Racial classification was developed as part of the system of apartheid and was formalized into law by the Population Registration Act (1950). Race was a social construct with cultural, social and economic dimensions as well as biological markers, for example see Posel, D. 2001. What's in a name? Racial categorisations under apartheid and their afterlife. *TRANSFORMATION-DURBAN-,* 50-74.
, Seekings, J. 2008. The continuing salience of race: Discrimination and diversity in South Africa. *Journal of Contemporary African Studies,* 26(1)**:** 1-25..

Table 2.1: Workers in South Africa by place of birth and occupation, 2012.

Occupation	This province	Other province	Other country	All
Manager	69%	23%	8%	100%
Professional	70%	25%	5%	100%
Technical/ associate professional	76%	21%	3%	100%
Clerk	77%	20%	2%	100%
Service or sales worker	73%	21%	6%	100%
Skilled agriculture worker	86%	14%	0%	100%
Craft and related	74%	19%	7%	100%
Operator	73%	26%	2%	100%
Elementary	74%	22%	4%	100%
Domestic worker	59%	28%	13%	100%
All	73%	22%	5%	100%

Source: Budlender, D., 2014: MiWORC Report N°5. Migration and employment in South Africa:
Statistical analysis of the migration module in the Quarterly Labour Force Survey, third quarter 2012. Page 24.

While historically employers of domestic workers were largely white, there has been a demographic shift to include the black middle class. The ability to employ a domestic worker remains a symbol of social class (Kiwanuka et al., 2015; Ally, 2010; Budlender, 2016). Using data from the 2010 South African Time Use Survey, Budlender (2016: 6) shows that African households accounted for 30% of those that employed domestic workers compared to 54% accounted for by white households.

Apart from being a source of employment for black women, domestic work is an integral part of the economy as domestic workers free their employers from domestic duties, thereby enabling them to pursue economic activities outside the home. Scholars (Du Toit, 2013; Hoobler, 2016; Du Plessis, 2018; Thobejane and Khoza, 2019) note that by performing house work and care work, domestic workers play a supporting role to workers as they assist employers to 'engage in accumulation of other forms of capital' such as career-enhancing activities, which in the long term boosts labour force participation and economic development. Thus, domestic work is a form of socially valued labour that allows for the quality of life to improve in the employer's household (Du Toit, 2013; Du Plessis, 2018). Corresponding to trends in developed countries, it has been argued that there is a growing demand for domestic workers in southern African families where both individuals in a couple work, or in single-parent households aiming to achieve a balance between work and family responsibilities.

Domestic workers also play an important role in the care regime in South Africa by providing a 'privatised' solution to care provision within families (Ally, 2010; Malherbe, 2013; Grossman, 2011). Ally and Malherbe argue that the country's policy framework on care giving reflects a public/private divide with care work being provided by the family or through private childcare centres and crèches. The latter are, however, highly classed, racialised, and

generally unavailable or not financially feasible for resource-constrained parents. By the same token, family support for childcare is increasingly becoming unavailable due to prevailing socioeconomic and demographic transformations discussed in Chapter 1. Domestic workers thus provide much needed care support (childcare and elderly care) for their employers. For instance, Du Plessis (2018) emphasises that domestic workers remain a 'popular' option as childcare providers for young children as, consistent with global trends, South African women increasing take part in the labour market. According to Statistics South Africa (2018), for example, labour force participation rate for women between 2001 and 2017 has consistently hovered around 55%.

Domestic work in South Africa is organised in different ways, mostly according to job arrangements and duties. Based on the latter, domestic workers are variously referred to by terms such as nanny, housekeeper, au pair, babysitter, house help or maid. In terms of job arrangements, they can be 'live in', 'live out', 'full time', and 'part time' (Hoobler, 2016; Ally, 2010). By definition, live-in domestic workers reside within the employer's household or premises, an arrangement that is characterised by isolation and lack of privacy. It is not uncommon, for example, for employers to restrict visitors for the domestic worker, which can extend to restrictions on communication and social life (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2001; Platt et al., 2016). While in some cases, employees might have their own room inside the employer's household or outside but within the premises, live-in domestic workers sometimes share bedrooms with the employer's family, which limits privacy. With job space and private space being blurred, live-in work is often associated with long working hours and generally oppressive relations. According to Ally (2010: 46), for example, during the apartheid era in South Africa, live-in work was characterised by 'de-individuation of the worker through their co-option into full-time servitude relations for the family'. In contemporary South Africa as in much of global care chains, live-in domestic workers tend to face high levels of verbal, physical, psychological and sexual abuse largely due to the private and isolated nature of their workspaces (International Labour Organisation, 2018a; Figueiredo et al., 2018; World Health Organisation, 2017; Anderson, 2000; Pyle, 2006; Awumbila et al., 2017b). Physical abuse in the form of slapping and hitting with different objects and verbal abuse constituting insults or threats were the most common form of abuse (International Labour Organisation, 2018a; Fernandez, 2010; Huang and Yeoh, 2007). Other forms of abuse include employers not providing sufficient food and proper accommodation, or lack of rest (Pyle, 2006; International Labour Organisation, 2018a). Despite this, the live-in arrangement is popular among newly arrived migrants without experience and knowledge of their surroundings (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2001; Ally, 2010). For those migrants without requisite documentation, this arrangement can offer a safe haven as they may be out of reach of threats from immigration officials (Griffin, 2010).

Live-out domestic workers are those that generally work for a household but, unlike live-in workers, return to their homes at the end of the working day. Live-out work, therefore, entails limited working hours, allows employees to live with their families and to continue with their family responsibilities and social interactions; thus it offers room for some personal freedom (Ally, 2010). However, Ally notes that live-out work can place additional demands on employees, such as housing and transport costs, which place additional pressure on limited resources.

Full-time workers can be both live in and live out. Their work constitutes a full working week of five to six days at a stretch. Part-time workers, on the other hand, work for a certain number of hours each day for each employer. This includes working for one employer or several employers and is generally task-oriented (Ally, 2010; Bothma and Blaauw, 2010). The ability to 'set their schedules, maximise the number of employers and increase earnings' gives the workers a sense of autonomy and control (Parreñas, 2015: 120). Further, working for multiple employers on different days gives workers some flexibility. As noted by Hondagneu-Sotelo (2001), workers are not dependant on only one employer, and if they encounter abusive situations, they can quit the job without 'jeopardising' their earnings. However, part-time work has its negatives. Ally (2010) points out that part-time work is sometimes viewed as a strategy by employers to extract and control workers' labour. This is through work intensification where employees have substantial workloads to complete within limited hours, and because they perform similar work for different employers, it entails an 'intensified work routine'. This work routine is further complicated by the need to travel to different employers every day, which can affect productivity (Nyaura and Ngugi, 2019). Ally argues that the work routine can result in isolation for employees who work a full week as they might not have time for family responsibilities given long travel times. As part-time work involves acquiring multiple jobs, Ally (2010) and Hondagneu-Sotelo (2001) argue that employees rely on their own and their employers' social networks to find jobs. Failure to obtain additional work can result in insecurity, reduced earnings and vulnerability for part-time workers. Age and experience are influential factors in part-time work; experienced workers who are often older tend to be able to negotiate live-out or part-time arrangements more successfully than new entrants (Ally, 2010: 61). Salaries are considered to be higher in part-time work (Bothma and Campher, 2003; Bothma and Blaauw, 2010; Ally, 2010). Bothma and Campher (2003) in their study of domestic workers in Bloemfontein noted that salaries for workers employed for one or two days by a specific employer were higher than those who were employed for more days and attributed this to full-workers receiving more benefits in kind. This may include accommodation and food.

2.3   Regulation of domestic and care workers in South Africa

A country's labour legislation is the main instrument for granting legal protection to all workers (International Labour Organisation, 2013: 50). In many countries, however,

domestic workers are excluded from the scope of labour legislation, which weakens their position in relation to other employment sectors. The International Labour Organisation, for example, estimates that only 10% of the world's domestic workers are covered by general labour laws in the same way as other workers, while about 30% work in countries where they are totally excluded from the scope of the national laws. Furthermore, the majority (90%) of domestic workers in the world do not have access to any form of social security (International Labour Organisation, 2018a: 193). Social security is defined as 'any programme of social protection established by legislation or any other mandatory arrangement, that provides individuals with a degree of income security when faced with the contingencies of old age, survivorship, incapacity, disability, unemployment or rearing children' (International Social Security Association, no date). The International Social Security Association categorises social security schemes into the following: old-age, disability, and survivor benefits (to compensate for the loss of income resulting from old-age or permanent retirement); sickness and maternity benefits (to deal with the risk of temporary incapacity); work injury benefits (compensation for work-related injuries and occupational illnesses); unemployment benefits (compensation for the loss of income resulting from involuntary unemployment); and family benefits (to provide additional income for families with young children to meet at least part of the added cost of their support).

Given that most domestic workers are women, their limited access to social security means, among other things, that they are excluded from maternity protection laws and that pregnancy can result in loss of income or termination of employment. In addition, it means there are no work injury benefits even though the nature of their work exposes them to a range of health issues. Moreover, taking care of the elderly, the frail and young children can be labour-intensive as well as being emotionally and physically draining (International Labour Organisation, 2016b). Physical health issues such as burns, back and leg pains, and body injuries resulting from physical abuse from employers are also common in the domestic and care work sector (Huang and Yeoh, 2007). Domestic workers' working conditions including long hours with little rest and often in isolation, have negative health impacts on migrant domestic workers and could lead to increased mental and psychological effects such as depression, emotional stress and anxiety (Fernandez, 2010; International Labour Organisation (2016b); World Health Organisation (2017).

From the colonial period and apartheid, the relationship between domestic workers and their employers has been described as a relationship of servitude characterised by social inequalities around race, class and gender and lack of regulation (Cock, 1980; Fish, 2006; Ally, 2010). Ally (2010) argues that while Cock (1980) highlighted that domestic service under apartheid existed in a 'legal vacuum', state regulation has been a 'distinctive' feature of domestic work in South Africa from the colonial period through laws such as the Master and Servant Act of 1889, while amendments in 1930 and 1937 of the Urban Areas Act of 1923

were used to control the influx of African women into urban areas through pass laws. She argues that laws were used for control rather than protection of domestic workers. Budlender (2016: 2) adds that during apartheid, employers were required to register all domestic workers with the Bantu Affairs Administration Boards in white urban areas so that they could obtain a pass for the worker. Influx control laws on which the pass-system was based were abolished in 1986. It has been argued that domestic workers under apartheid were subjected to 'ultra-exploitation': they were not accorded a 'negotiated' wage and favourable working conditions since employers had the power to determine the terms and conditions of the employment, thus creating dependency on the employer (Ally, 2010; Cock, 1980).

After the democratic elections in 1994, the South African government sought to improve labour relations in the domestic service sector through formalising the sector. This was done through a number of legislative instruments including the following:

- **The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Act 108 of 1996** together with the Bill of Rights in the Constitution makes provisions that are applicable to all employers and employees including domestic workers (du Toit and Huysamen, 2013; Kubjana, 2016). In particular, Section 23 makes provisions for fair labour practices, which extends the right to form, join and participate in the activities of a trade union to all employees as well as the right to strike, while employers have a right to form, join and participate in the activities of an employer's organisation. The Constitution further provides for 'labour rights, including the right to unionise and the right to strike'. Section 9 provides for the right to equality; right to equal protection before the law and protects against unfair discrimination, while Section 12 provides for the right 'not to be treated or punished in a cruel, inhuman and degrading manner'. du Toit and Huysamen (2013) note that the Constitution is the basis on which other legislations are enacted, including the Labour Relations Act (1995) and the Basic Conditions of Employment Act (1997).

- **The Labour Relations Act (LRA) 66 of 1995** was enacted with the purpose of providing a 'framework within which employees and their trade unions, employers and employers' organisations can collectively bargain to determine wages, terms and conditions of employment' (LRA, Chapter 1, 1c - c (i)). The Act makes provisions governing freedom of association and key stipulations relate to joining and participating freely in union activities, the right to strike, regulating the activities of trade unions, collective bargaining, regulation of unfair treatment at work and provisions for discipline and dismissal. Domestic workers were included in this Act as it sought to provide rights to all employees (du Toit and Huysamen, 2013; Budlender, 2016; Griffin, 2010). The LRA provides mechanisms for dispute resolution through the Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration. Ally (2010) and

Budlender (2016) note that the LRA was crucial to domestic workers as it allowed for recourse in relation to dismissal. Further, Kubjana (2016) notes that the LRA makes specific reference to domestic workers in Section 17, which specifies limited rights to the trade unions with regard to access to the employer's premises and disclosure of information. In line with this Act, the South African Domestic Services and Allied Workers Union (SADSAWU) was launched in 2000. However, efforts to organise the domestic sector began much earlier (Gaitskell et al., 1983).

- **The Basic Conditions of Employment Act (BCEA) was enacted in 1997** to provide protection to employees through establishing basic conditions of employment by making provisions on working hours, leave arrangements, remuneration and particulars and termination of employment. The BCEA defines a domestic worker as an 'employee who performs domestic work in the home of his/her employer and includes (a) a gardener; (b) a person employed by a household as a driver of a motor vehicle; and (c) a person who takes care of children, the aged, the sick, the frail or the disabled; but does not include a farm worker' (BCEA, Chapter 1, line 26-32). In line with this Act, in 2002, **the Sectoral Determination 7: Domestic Sector** was introduced to regulate the conditions of employment for domestic workers. The Sectoral Determination 7 is considered a landmark piece of legislation in South Africa as it sets out to formalise the domestic services sector. However, it does not apply to domestic workers working on farms. Table 1 below gives a summary of some of the key conditions in the determination such as the minimum wages, working hours, leave entitlements and termination of contracts. In terms of wages, these are adjusted annually in November/December and they are adjusted according to the areas in which the domestic workers are located where Area A refers to areas within municipalities and Area B refers to the rest of the country. In 2018-2019, the monthly rate for employees working for more than 27 hours per week for Area A was R2669.24 (US$ 157), and for Area B the rate was R2431.24 (US$143). The National Minimum Act, which was passed in 2018, stipulated that in 2020 the minimum wage for domestic workers be set at R15.57 per hour. This is lower than the rate set for other workers at R20.76.

Table 2.2: Summary of key conditions set out in Sectoral Determination 7[4]

Sections of the Act	Conditions
Part B: Clause 2-8	Wages 1. Minimum wage for domestic workers working for more than 27 hours per week. 2. Minimum wage for domestic workers who work 27 hours or less. - Annual wage increases of at least 8% to be granted to domestic workers, if over 8% to be published in a Government Gazette (Clause 3). Payment in cash, cheque or direct deposit into an account stated by the employer and a payslip must be given on each pay day. (Clause 5 and 6). - The determination deals with permissible and impermissible deductions (Clause 8).
Part C: Clause 9	Written Particulars of Employment The employer is required to supply the domestic worker with written particulars of employment, which includes the name and address of the employer, a description of work for the domestic worker and salary details among others. Both parties must agree and sign.
Part D: Clause 10-18	Working Hours 1. Ordinary hours: Maximum of 45 hours per week; 9 hours per day for a worker employed for 5 days per week or 8 hours per day for a worker employed for more than 5 days a week. 2. Overtime: Not more than 15 hours per week. Payment should be at least one and a half times the worker's regular rate. 3. Night work (18.00-06.00), if agreed in writing; to include payment of an allowance agreed between employer and domestic worker. 4. Meal intervals: One hour if the worker works continuously for more than 5 hours. 5. Rest period: Daily, at least 12 consecutive hours from knock-off to the start of work next day; weekly, at least 36 consecutive hours. 6. Payment for working on Sunday and on Public Holidays.
Part E: Clause 19-22	Leave 1. Annual leave: At least 3 weeks per year or 1 day of every 17 days / 1 hour for every 17 hours worked. 2. Sick leave: Sick leave cycle (36 months); 1 day for every 26 days worked (Clause 20: 3), an employer may require a worker to produce a medical certificate if absent for more than 2 consecutive days or more than 2 occasions during an 8-week period. 3. Family responsibility leave: 5 days per year. 4. Maternity leave: At least 4 months maternity leave (unpaid).
Part G: Clause 24-28	Termination of Employment 1. Only on notice of at least 1 week for an employee who has worked for 6 months or less, or 1 month for more than 6 months. 2. Severance Pay of at least 1 week's full pay for each completed year of service. 3. Certificate of Service to be given on termination of employment.

- **The Unemployment Insurance Act of 2001 and the Unemployment Insurance Contribution Act 2002.** It has been argued that these two Acts should be read together as they make provisions for the establishment of the Unemployment Insurance Fund (UIF) and for the collection of contributions to the Fund (Kubjana, 2016). The objective of the Unemployment Insurance Act is to establish the UIF to which both employees and employers make contributions to benefit employees in the event of unemployment. The Act also stipulates the employees entitled to benefits from the Fund and these are employees who have been unable to work for a certain period of time, as a result of either retrenchment, illness, maternity or adoption. The

---

[4] Adapted from the Sectoral Determination 7: Domestic Sector, 2002

Unemployment Insurance Contributions Act makes provisions for the procedures relating to the payment and collection of contributions to the Fund. Employees are expected to contribute 1% of their remuneration to the Fund while the employer is expected to make a contribution of 1% on behalf of their employees. In addition, employers are required to register all their employees with the UIF (du Toit and Huysamen, 2013; Kubjana, 2016).

- **The Occupational Health and Safety (OHS) Act 85 of 1993.** In order to ensure safe and healthy working conditions, South Africa enacted the Occupational Health and Safety Act 85 of 1993 as well as the Compensation for Occupational Injuries and Diseases Act 133 of 1993 (discussed in the next section). Section 8 of the OHS Act calls on employers to provide and maintain a safe working environment that does not pose a risk to the health of their employees. The section also appeals to employers to establish measures to eliminate potential hazards in the workplace (Section 8, 2b), as well as providing necessary information, training, instructions and supervision to ensure the health and safety of employees (Section 8, 2e). The International Labour Organisation (2016b) notes that as the workplace for domestic workers is located in private households and is often considered part of women's work, domestic work is not generally regarded as involving risk. Therefore, employees are not considered as needing protection. However, studies point out that domestic workers deserve safe and healthy working conditions given that their work exposes them to health hazards such as those that occur as a result of 'handling and inhaling toxic chemicals' and in the use of electrical appliances, which require training (International Labour Organisation, 2016b; Kubjana, 2016). Further, studies have noted that care work involves risks that are often overlooked and therefore special equipment is not put in place to support care workers. For instance, caring for the elderly and the sick may require lifting the care recipients while assisting them to go bathroom (International Labour Organisation, 2016b; World Health Organisation, 2017). The International Labour Organisation (2016) argues that migrant domestic workers are additionally affected due to language barriers as they may not be able to read and understand information regarding health and safety. Migrant domestic workers may lack access to health care and social protection (unemployment benefits, maternity protection and other types of benefits) as non-citizens or undocumented workers (International Labour Organisation, 2016b).

- **Compensation for Occupational Injuries and Diseases Act 133 of 1993 (COIDA) amended in 1997.** In relation to the OHS Act, the aim of COIDA is 'to provide for compensation for disablement caused by occupational injuries or diseases sustained or contracted by employees in the course of their employment or death resulting from such injuries' (Amended Compensation for Occupational Injuries and Diseases Act,

1997: 1). Domestic workers in private households are not covered under this Act. As noted with the OHS Act, the nature of domestic work and the related difficulties with compliance have been used as justification to explain the exclusion of domestic workers under this Act. Further, Kubjana (2016:559-560) argues that the exclusion of domestic workers suggests that these employees 'do not have any remedy except expensive and burdensome civil processes' leaving them 'more vulnerable'. However, the High Court in Pretoria made a ruling in May 2019 that the exclusion of domestic workers from the Act was unconstitutional. This ruling follows an incident in which the family of domestic worker Maria Mahlangu approached the courts after Mahlangu fell and drowned in her employers' swimming pool whilst cleaning windows in 2012. It is reported that Mahlangu's daughter was offered R5000 as compensation by the employers, which led the family to take the matter to court. Domestic worker organisations celebrated this ruling as representing a positive move towards the inclusion of domestic workers (Booysen, 2019; Saturday Citizen, 2019) under COIDA.

Measuring the South Africa labour legislation for domestic workers against the ILO's Convention 189 on Decent Work for Domestic Workers and the South African Constitution Bill of Rights, literature has shown the limitations of some sections in the foregoing legislation (du Toit and Huysamen, 2013; Kubjana, 2016). Kubjana (2016) argues that the labour law framework provides a one-size-fits-all approach without recognising the 'occupational uniqueness' of the sector. du Toit and Huysamen (2013) concur with Kubjana and argue that while domestic work should be recognised like any other work, it cannot be treated like any other work because of the intimate nature of the employment relationship. du Toit and Huysamen (2013) consider domestic work as unique based on several factors including the nature of the workplace. Domestic work takes place in a private household that does not constitute a formal workplace and creates difficulties in relation to the enforcement of regulations. It delves into the private lives of families; domestic workers have access to information about families that the family members themselves might not be willing to share with others. Thus, it entails a deeply personal relationship between the employer and the domestic worker. Some of the duties carried out in performing care work, for example, involves emotional bonding with the employer's family, further emphasising the intimate nature of the work.

Another shortcoming raised by du Toit and Huysamen (2013) and Kubjana (2016) is the disconnection between the Labour Relations Act and the nature of domestic work with regard to sections relating to freedom of association and collective bargaining. They argue that while the LRA provides for the right to organise and strike, which have been extended to domestic workers, but this has been shown to be difficult for domestic workers and is of limited value

to them. The scholars point to the obstacles faced by domestic workers to organise and strike given that they are employed individually in private households, they work in isolation, and often in close relationship with their employers, which might not allow for representation in the same way as in a formal workplace. Further, Kubjana (2016) associated the challenges in organising domestic workers with the demise of the South African Domestic Service and Allied Workers Union, highlighting the challenges in collecting subscriptions from employees who are already burdened by low wages. Thus, they question whether the law by itself is enough to transform the relations in this sector, which has been affected by other social and political factors such as the apartheid history of the country.

du Toit and Huysamen (2013) raise concern over the application of Sectoral Determination 7 and note that part-time domestic workers who work less than 24 hours a month for an employer are excluded from all provisions of the Determination except in provisions related to minimum wages. They argue that in practice, part-time domestic workers work for a certain number of hours per day for different employers and therefore may work longer hours in total; thus they find the determination 'problematic'. Kubjana (2016: 558) further argues that the Sectoral Determination has 'proved inadequate in bettering the lives of people in this sector and is regarded as a paper-protection without sense'. The author notes the lack of will in enforcing the law, supported by studies that show challenges of enforcing compliance to some sections of the Determination, such as working hours, leave arrangements, contractual agreements and termination of employment (Magwaza, 2008).

While the Unemployment Insurance Act makes provisions for employees' rights to the Unemployment Insurance Fund, this measure is dependent on the employers registering the worker with the Fund. Domestic workers registered with UIF may claim for unemployment and maternity benefits among others (Malherbe, 2013). Malherbe (2013) and Kubjana (2016) point out that few employees are registered with the UIF. Malherbe notes that a significant difficulty with the UIF is compliance on the employer's part, arguing that evidence in 2010 suggested that only 20.7% out of 869 000 workers were registered with the Fund. She further notes that domestic workers who work part time for a few days in a week may be unable to afford to contribute as required. This in turn affects the benefits they are entitled to, which may be too little to provide meaningful support.

du Toit and Huysamen (2013) further emphasise Ally (2010)'s observations that the current framework, which formalises the employment relationship between domestic workers and their employers, paradoxically empowers and at the same time disempowers the workers as it takes away their agency. Ally (2010: 19) argues that the state extended rights to domestic workers as it 'constructed domestics as too "vulnerable" to effect change themselves, and as thus requiring the benevolent state to act on their behalf. She continues to argue that this construction 'unleashed a mode of power that ignored workers' existing capacities and

practices of power, reinforced domestic workers' dependent statuses, and reflected an insensitivity to the specificities of paid domestic work as an intimate form of labor'. Grossman (2011) adds that the minimum standards set in the legislations are so low such that even if enforced, they would not constitute a meaningful change in the protection of employees in the sector. He argues that despite all the laws established to protect domestic workers, the crux lies within the employment relationship, which is privatised, individualised and favours the employer. He points out that Department of Labour officials struggle to monitor working conditions in private households as they can only enter the household with the employers' consent and thus, he argues, the laws are in favour of employers.

2.4   Employment of migrant workers in the South African domestic sector

Despite the weakness embedded in the prevailing legislative framework, South Africa is considered to be a model African country for its regulation and protection of domestic workers. Fish (2013) and Vanyoro (2019a) argue that at the same time it is noteworthy that the legislative coverage does not extend to migrant domestic workers. The employment of migrant workers is governed by the country's Immigration Act of 2002 (amended in 2014), which requires migrants who intend to stay or work to obtain a temporary or permanent residence permit. Sections 11 to 23 of the Act list the different types of temporary residents permits, which include the following:

- **Visitor's visa** is issued to a foreigner for a period that does not exceed three months and can be renewed for a further period, which does not exceed three months (Section 11 (1) (a). This type of visa can also be issued for a longer period, which may not exceed three years, to individuals who provide proof of sufficient financial resources and wish to enter the country for reasons such as academic sabbatical, research, voluntary activities or any other activities (Section 11 (1) (b). This visa may also be issued to foreigners who are spouses of citizens or permanent residents and do not qualify for other types of visa (Section 11 (6)). Holders of such visas are not allowed to conduct work unless authorised by the Director-General (Section 11 (2)).

- **Work visa.** There are three visas that can be issued under this category: general work visa, critical skill visas issued to individual with skills or qualifications deemed critical by the Minister of the Department of Labour and published in a government Gazette, and inter-company transfer visa in which the holder may conduct work only related to the specified employer (Section 19).

- **Exchange visa.** This may be issued to foreign individuals for the purpose of participating in a programme of 'cultural, economic and social exchange organised by an organ of the state or a learning institution. This visa may also be issued to individuals younger than 25 who have received an offer to work for a period not longer than a year (Section 22).

Migrant workers including domestic workers seeking employment are required to acquire a work visa. However, low skilled migrants often face challenges in acquiring this as they cannot meet the requirements (Fish, 2013; Thebe, 2017). According to Fish, applicants have to undergo a 'rigorous screening process that systematically disadvantages "unskilled" migrants' (Fish, 2013: 236). She further argues that applicants have to show proof that they have sufficient financial means to survive in South Africa. These requirements are difficult for low skilled migrants to fulfil, as they often come from poor or challenging backgrounds and are searching for employment as a survival strategy. Thus, they resort to entering the country and working without proper documentation, which leaves them without legal protection and vulnerable (Fish, 2013; Mbiyozo, 2018; Vanyoro, 2019a). It can thus be argued that South Africa's immigration laws are favourable to professional migrants with 'scarce skills' as potential employers are required to prove that they have not been able to find an equally qualified South African national for an applicant to obtain a work permit (Fish, 2013). In addition, Vanyoro (2019b: 8) argues that women from southern Africa 'are routinely denied the opportunity to acquire education and resources that would enable them to be viewed as "highly skilled" according to state definitions'. Therefore such criteria discriminate against them.

In addition to the provisions of the Immigration Act, migrant workers can also enter and work in the country through the provisions of the **Refugee Act of 1998,** which can offer asylum to anyone who can show that they have a reasonable fear of persecution that precludes return to their home country. Section 22 of the Act makes provisions for asylum seekers to be issued with an asylum seeker's permit while they are awaiting the outcome of their application. Vanyoro (2019b) points out that the asylum seeker's permit allows holders to stay in South Africa, and to work or study while the application is being processed. When asylum is granted, the individual receives a Refugee's Permit under the provisions of Section 24 of the Act. Section 27 stipulates the rights accorded to a refugee, including full legal protection, identity and travel documents, rights to seek employment, access to health and education in the same manner as a citizen of the Republic. According to Fish (2013) , this Act offers protection only to registered refugees and asylum seekers thus leaving out a large number of migrants who decide to migrate because of economic or political hardship and cannot establish refugee status. The effect is that migrants seeking domestic work in South Africa face obstacles to acquiring the legal authority to work (Fish, 2013; Vanyoro, 2019b).

Another way in which migrants have managed to stay and work in South Africa is through regularisation schemes especially in regard to Zimbabwe. Given the long history of migration between Zimbabwe and South Africa and the proximity of the two countries, in the wake of the economic and political upheavals in Zimbabwe, there has been an influx of Zimbabweans migrating to South Africa. Literature highlights that the South African government introduced the Dispensation of Zimbabweans Project (DZP) in response to the 'perceived

high levels of undocumented migration from Zimbabwe' (Moyo, 2016: 109; Mbiyozo, 2018; Vanyoro, 2019b). Mbiyozo notes that the objective of the process was to 'regularise Zimbabweans who were residing in South Africa illegally, reduce pressure on the asylum system, curb deportation and give amnesty to Zimbabweans using fake documents' (Mbiyozo, 2018: 9). In this process, the South African government waived some of the requirements for immigration permits as well as application fees and approved temporary residence permits for Zimbabweans already in the country to allow them work, conduct business and study legally (Moyo, 2016: 109). The permits that were issued were valid for four years from 2010-2014. These were later replaced by Zimbabwe Special Dispensation Permits (ZSP). Only holders of the permits under the DZP were eligible to apply for the special dispensation permits, which were valid for three years and expired in 2017. Again, these permits were replaced by the Zimbabwe Exemption Permit, which will be valid for four years until 2021.[5] While this process has been commended for regularising the stay of Zimbabweans in South Africa, these permits have conditions attached to them such as that they are non-renewable and that permit holders do not qualify for permanent residence based on their temporary residence under these permits (Moyo, 2016; Vanyoro, 2019b). Vanyoro (2019b) further argues that the application process was undermined by the lengthy processing period, which provoked negative outcomes for the migrants with banks freezing their accounts and employers threatening to fire them. Thus, Vanyoro notes that while the documentation process went some way towards improving working conditions for migrants, it also intensified the 'precarity' of migrant workers. He further points out that these permits were successfully accessed by only a small number of people, leaving many undocumented. The South African government has rolled out a similar documentation process to Lesotho nationals.[6]

The above discussion demonstrates Fish (2013) 's argument that migrant domestic workers face barriers in terms of accessing the legal right to work and leave many of them in an undocumented status. They are exposed to conditions that infringe on their rights, at risk of exploitation and abuse as well as living in fear of deportation (Fish, 2013: 240). In addition, Fish and Griffin (2010) assert further that, because of their undocumented status, migrant domestic workers are afraid of approaching government institutions for the protection of their rights. Fish highlights that while the courts provide one way in which migrant domestic

---

[5] Media statement by Minister Mkhize announcing the Zimbabwe Exemption Permit
http://www.dha.gov.za/index.php/statements-speeches/1034-statement-by-minister-mkhize-on-the-closure-of-the-zimbabwean-special-permit-zsp-and-the-opening-of-the-new-zimbabwean-exemption-permit-zep

https://www.vfsglobal.com/ZEP/SouthAfrica/zimbabwean_special_exemption.html, accessed 21 November 2019.

[6] Media statement on the opening of the Lesotho Exemption Permit https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-aaron-motsoaledi-opens-application-process-new-lesotho-exemption-permit-18-nov, accessed 21 November 2019.

workers could receive some protection, she argues that 'the wider power relations, the overarching context of unemployment and poverty and the lingering perceptions about the informal nature of this sector [create] conditions where domestic workers repeatedly state that such rights are only on paper' (Fish, 2013: 243).

2.5 Role of Recruitment agencies in transnational migration

Migrants rely on the services of recruitment agencies as they constitute a crucial way to access labour markets (Awumbila et al., 2017a; Kern and Müller-Böker, 2015). Recruitment agencies range from an individual agent to large- scale companies and can be formal where they are registered with a government department or informal. A key role played by recruitment agencies is to mediate relations between employers and domestic workers. This includes negotiating salaries, working conditions and worker's rights (Kern and Müller-Böker, 2015; Awumbila et al., 2017a; Wee et al., 2019). Kern and Müller-Böker (2015) further note that recruitment agencies also mediate through legal processes of foreign employment especially in light of frequent changes in laws. This includes assisting with the acquisition of necessary documents such as passports, visas, providing training for migrant domestic workers (Kern and Müller-Böker, 2015; Debonneville, 2021). Kern and Müller-Böker (2015: 164) also argue that recruitment agencies play a key function in transnational migration as they bridge 'spatial distances within a country and between countries'.

Other than focusing on the negative perceptions of recruitment agencies concentrating on the exploitation of migrant workers through malpractices, studies have highlighted the 'nuanced' role of recruitment agencies of balancing between profit-making and the welfare of the migrants (Debonneville, 2021; Kern and Müller-Böker, 2015). Within the transnational context, recruitment agencies play the role of shaping migration flows through their selection and hiring practices. They play the role of gate keepers and structure access to migration by determining the regions which particular workers migrate to as they 'engage in spatially selective recruitment of labour from certain places rather than others'(Findlay et al., 2012: 21; Kern and Müller-Böker, 2015; Debonneville, 2021). They use socio-demographic data in the selection process to discriminate against certain types of workers such as age, religion, marital and parenthood status (Debonneville, 2021). Thus, Debonneville argues that sociodemographic data is not " 'neutral' or 'objective' but is a social construct that defines, categorises and hierarchise workers" (Debonneville, 2021: 17). In specific reference to South Africa, Du Toit (2016) includes other aspects such as immigration status, long-term unemployment in which references are crucial, technical skills as well as personal skills and appearance. He notes that Zimbabwean women seeking employment are 'statistically discriminated' against in some house cleaning service companies where they have to present valid work permits as a prerequisite for employment as a domestic worker in the companies. Other reasons offered by the companies in Du Toit's study for not employing Zimbabwean

women included trust and theft issues, unpleasant attitude and unwillingness to work with co-workers. The implication of this gatekeeping role by recruitment agencies is to drive migrants towards other job seeking mechanisms which are unsafe and unregulated as will be discussed in Chapter 4.

2.6 Discussion and Conclusion

This chapter gives a historical overview of domestic work in South Africa that is important in understanding the role played by employees in this sector in care work in the context of global care demands. A key point revealed by the chapter is that unlike South-North care flows, which are a recent phenomenon, in many African countries where the sector expanded in post-colonial periods in the late 1960s and early 1970s, the domestic sector has been a part of the South African labour landscape for years, going back to the apartheid period. It remains the largest share of foreign worker employment (Table 2.1) and the largest domestic sector in the southern African region. The chapter further demonstrates that during the apartheid era, many of the women who entered into the domestic sector were internal migrants, from the rural areas into the cities. In contrast, in recent years, South Africa has experienced the migration of women mostly from SADC countries who are undertaking domestic work. While highlighting the different shifts in the profile of domestic workers from men to women, the chapter also makes clear that the domestic services sector is dominated by black women, largely from poor backgrounds, who have relatively low levels of education. As a result of their low skills, they have limited employment opportunities and are vulnerable to exploitation through low remuneration among other abuses. This reality is compounded by the informal nature of the employment relationship, which makes it difficult to enforce labour regulations. It further relates to the global care chain literature which emphasises that power axes of gender, ethnicity, social class, and place of origin are implicit in the characteristics of contemporary domestic workers. Studies have shown that the migrant status (documented/ undocumented), low remuneration and working conditions of live-in domestic workers highlight the inequalities faced by migrant workers (Palenga-Möllenbeck, 2013; Gurung, 2009; Raijman et al., 2003).

A key concern raised in the global care chain literature is that migrant women often suffer downward mobility in the destination countries as a result of the conditions they experience within the care sector. Their status is reduced through the work they do; qualifications may not be recognised and they are treated differently based on the country of origin (Raijman et al., 2003; Gurung, 2009). Faced with the challenges of accessing legal documents, many migrant workers in South Africa resort to domestic work because of easy entry (Kiwanuka et al., 2015), notwithstanding their educational qualifications.

Another aspect revealed in this chapter relates to work arrangements. Unlike in the North and other African countries where domestic workers are mostly live-in, full-time employees,

work conditions are wider in South Africa and include live-out and part-time arrangements. While by definition live out and part-time workers can be expected to enjoy better working conditions such as favourable working hours, more personal freedom and less isolation, these arrangements can place additional demands on employees such as housing and transport costs. Part-time workers also tend to experience higher levels of job insecurity, increased workloads where work must be completed within limited hours, and long commutes to and from work, which affects productivity at work (Ally, 2010). Furthermore, as will be discussed in Chapters 3 and 6, some of these women live in poor housing conditions and/or sharing arrangements in informal settlements.

Given the importance of the domestic services sector in the South African labour market, it emerges from the chapter that the country's post-apartheid government has put in place a comprehensive and enabling legislative framework to protect and ensure the rights of domestic workers, through provisions for minimum wages, working hours, leave arrangements and termination of employment, among others. To this end, South Africa is one of only three countries in Africa (Mauritius and Guinea being the others) that have ratified the ILO Convention 189 for domestic workers. The country's incorporation of domestic workers under UIF has also been widely been commended (International Labour Organisation, 2016a). Indeed, South Africa's labour laws pertaining to domestic workers are considered relatively more progressive than those of other African countries. For example, despite the recognition of domestic workers as a distinct category in Ghana, there is no single provision in the country's Labour Act directed specifically towards the protection of domestic workers. This means Ghanaian domestic workers are excluded from certain critical provisions such as working hours and rest periods (Tsikata, 2018: 7-8). Correspondingly, in Nigeria domestic workers are excluded from the Minimum Wage Amended Act, which makes provision for the payment of prescribed minimum wages, maternity protection provisions found in the Labour Act, and from the National Health Insurance Scheme Act (Olayiwola, 2019; Nesbitt-Ahmed, 2016).

South Africa's labour laws in relation to domestic workers furthermore stand out by comparison to some receiving countries of workers in the South-North global care chains. For example, in the United States, domestic workers have been excluded from several federal laws that protect workers (Romero, 2018; King-Dejarddin, 2019). However, in recent developments, the Domestic Workers Bill of Rights was introduced in the US Senate in July 2019 to make provisions for basic labour rights to domestic workers and guarantees a minimum wage and overtime pay as well as provision for notice of termination of employment (Campbell Fernandez, 2019). Despite being comparatively more enabling, South Africa's legislative framework has been criticised for, among other issues, including laws that represent a one-size-fits-all approach that does not take account of the unique nature of the domestic employment relationship; the lack of protection for part-time workers; the limits

to the number of employees covered by the Unemployment Insurance Fund; the reality that domestic workers continue to struggle to be compensated for work-related injuries under the Compensation for Occupational Injuries and Disease Act of 1993; as well as the challenges to the enforcement of the labour laws.

This chapter has also revealed that with domestic work considered low-skilled, migrant domestic workers face challenges in acquiring immigration documents such as work visas or refugee permits that can enable them to legally live and work in South Africa. With regard to work visas, for example, there is a preference for skilled migrants, and employers must show proof that a migrant worker meets this requirement. Refugee permits, on the other hand, protect only registered refugees and asylum seekers who can prove they need protection from their country of origin. Thus, for the most part, Zimbabwean migrant domestic workers who are typically economic migrants do not adequately meet the legal requirements to work and live in the country. Most of these migrants also fail to meet the stipulations of the regularisation schemes that were implemented from 2010 in which some of the visa requirements were relaxed. As a result, many women entering into domestic work in South Africa do so using visitor's visas and continue in their jobs after their visas expire. Thus, unlike their counterparts in the South-North flows, many Zimbabwean care workers in South Africa remain in irregular and undocumented status, which exposes them to vulnerability where they are prone to exploitation and abuse by employers because of their migrant status. Conversely, evidence suggest that in countries in the Global North, there are relatively more legal channels and visa options for migrant domestic and care workers to use to enter destination countries. According to a 2011 report by the (European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights) some EU countries have adopted different policies that target migrant domestic workers to address the rising need for care. Italy for instance has introduced quota systems for migrant domestic workers while in other countries such as Belgium and France, domestic workers' applications may be considered within general work permit schemes. The report further reveals that the au pair system is an additional legal channel of entry for migrant domestic workers, as migrants recruited through this method also provide care, although it has been considered a cultural exchange programme. Due to tight migration restrictions, many foreign- born care workers also enter destination countries such as the USA and UK through non-employment routes such as family reunification, refugee protection and asylum, student or tourist visas (King-Dejarddin, 2019) .

Migrant domestic workers' barriers to accessing legal documents have been raised in studies of other care chains in the Global South. For example, in her study of women migrating from Nicaragua to Costa Rica, Knight (2012) noted that the documentation process to migrate to Costa Rica is cumbersome and costly, and therefore many women migrate illegally as they cannot afford to pay for the passport or visa. Similarly, in Africa, Laiboni (2020) notes the migration of women from Uganda to Kenya for domestic work, where media reports have

shown that young women from Uganda lack official documents such as identity cards and passports and therefore cannot obtain visas to allow them to work in Kenya legally.[7]

It further emerges from the chapter that the employment of migrant workers in South Africa is different from that of their counterparts in South-North global care chains. In the latter, migration and employment typically involves recruitment agencies, sponsorship visas that tie workers to their employers as well as specific migrant recruitment programmes for domestic workers such as the Canadian Caregiver Programme (CCP). Considered 'best practice', the CCP was put in place to cover a shortage of caregivers willing to live-in with employers and to provide care to members of households. CCP imposed stringent requirements on employers including having sufficient income to pay workers, provide acceptable accommodation and cover all recruitment costs (Fudge, 2011; King-Dejarddin, 2019). By the same token, domestic workers migrating to Middle Eastern countries such as the United Arab Emirates are employed under the Kafala sponsorship system, which also ties the migrant to the employer (Romero, 2018; Parreñas, 2017). While the involvement of recruitment agencies in this process ensures that migrant domestic workers have employment contracts and are legally resident in the destination, concerns have been raised that sponsored visas often have stringent conditions that, for example, make it difficult to change employers if the migrant worker is unhappy about the employment conditions. The live-in requirement of many of these visas often subject domestic workers to abuse and exploitation as discussed earlier.

Thus, compared to their counterparts in the South-North flows, Zimbabwean care and domestic workers mainly find work through informal channels. Even if they were to use the services of recruitment agencies, these are limited to assisting migrant workers in the search and placement with employers following their entry into South Africa as will be discussed in Chapter 4. Furthermore, despite the enabling legislative framework, the challenges to enforcement for undocumented migrant workers are more pronounced. The overall implication, therefore, is that Zimbabwean migrant care workers coming to South Africa are more vulnerable than those in the South-North migration flows as they tend to be undocumented and find it difficult to pursue their rights due to fear of deportation as well as the withdrawal of much needed income if they are dismissed. All in all, in situating the study, this chapter demonstrates the extent to which the interconnection between employment conditions, migration laws and policies, as well as national labour standards can shape the status and experiences of migrant domestic workers.

---

[7] Documentary titled *The Hidden Lives of "Housegirls"* 2019. Directed by BBC Africa Eye. (https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=21G98xWA6qE&feature=youtu.be)., accessed 30 June 2020

CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction

Given its focus on the lived experiences of women, this study adopted a feminist approach to methodology. According to Stanley (1997: 198), this approach is not only concerned with the 'getting of knowledge', but within feminism it is also important as 'it is key to understanding and unpacking the overlap between knowledge and power'. Feminist researchers have often criticised the omission or distortion of women's experiences in mainstream social science research. Thus, feminist methodological approaches aim to correct this through giving women a 'voice to speak about social life from their perspective' (Sarantakos, 2013: 66; Doucet and Mauthner, 2008; Maynard and Purvis, 2013). Thus, as DeVault (1996) asserts, what distinguishes feminist methodology from other social science research practices is its attention to the illumination of women's lives with a focus on 'open-ended' investigation of women's experiences, claiming their plurality (Maynard and Purvis, 2013). DeVault further notes that in their research practice, feminists call for methodology that supports research that is beneficial to women and can lead to social change. It is to this end that this methodology was deemed appropriate for this study as it focuses on women working in private households who are often at the margins of society. This chapter discusses the research design and study setting as well as the sources of data and the methods of data collection and analysis. Ethical considerations are also discussed and reflections on the data collection process constitute the final section.

3.2   Research design

A qualitative research design was deemed the most appropriate for addressing the study's research objectives as it places emphasis on context and lived experiences. Babbie and Mouton (2001) state that the aim of qualitative research is to gain in-depth understanding of actions and events within a specific context. According to Creswell (2013: 44),

> qualitative research begins with assumptions and the use of interpretive/theoretical frameworks that inform the study of research problems addressing the meaning individuals or groups ascribe to a social or human problem. To study this problem, qualitative researchers use an emerging qualitative approach to inquiry, the collection of data in a natural setting sensitive to the people and places under study, and data analysis that is both inductive and deductive and establishes patterns or themes.

Some of the important characteristics of qualitative research that have been highlighted by scholars include that it allows the researcher to obtain data from the site where the participants experience the issue under study (natural setting) and focuses on the meanings

that participants attach to that issue. Thus it allows the researcher to gain multiple perspectives and varied views (Creswell, 2013). Further, Tracy (2013: 5) notes that qualitative research is rich, providing thick description and focusing on 'lived experience, placed in its context'.

The study design was guided by the interpretive paradigm. From an interpretivist perspective, knowledge is 'socially constructed through language and interaction and reality is connected and known through society's cultural and ideological categories" (Tracy, 2013: 41). Qualitative research is informed by the assumption that reality is subjective and should be understood through understanding of the research participants meaning of their lifeworld (Schurink, 2009), thus emphasis is placed on empathetic understanding placing emphasis on the word 'verstehen'. According to Tracy, verstehen "describes the first-person perspective that participants have on their personal experiences as well as on society, culture and history" (Tracy, 2013: 41). Further, importance is given to investigating the world from the participants from the participants point of view and gaining insights from multiple points of view. The interpretive paradigm fits in with the feminist approach adopted in this study which places emphasis on giving voice to women's experiences from their point of view as highlighted in the previous section. Researchers adopting the interpretive paradigm acknowledge that knowledge is 'value-laden' and thus there is need to be self-reflexive and be aware of their biases and subjectivities (Tracy, 2013).

3.3   Research setting

Seidman (2013) argues that in a study concentrating on participants' lived experience, it is important that the researcher chooses participants who are currently engaged in the experiences that are relevant to the study. As the study sought to explore the experiences of Zimbabwean women working in South Africa, attention was given to women who, at the time of the study, were working in the country's two cities (Pretoria and Johannesburg) as their 'work' settings. The two cities are located in the province of Gauteng, which has been described as the fastest growing province in South Africa and with the largest population (Statistics South Africa, 2014). As urban areas, Pretoria and Johannesburg tend to be favoured destinations for internal and foreign migrants who are drawn to these cities in anticipation of employment and economic opportunities. Indeed the 2011 census results showed that migrant inflows from outside South Africa were the highest in Gauteng (Statistics South Africa, 2014). Labour geography highlights that workers are active geographic agents and can use space to their advantage. For example, Mashayamombe (2020: 357) shows the relationship between workers' agency and space by arguing that 'workers seek to shape space to… 'secure their own social and biological reproduction on a daily and generational basis…'. Citing Massey (1993), he further argues that space is 'full of power and symbolism, a complex web of social relations of domination and subordination, solidarity and cooperation' (Mashayamombe, 2020: 359). As Gauteng is considered as the

primary and economic financial hub in South Africa (Hovhannisyan et al., 2018: 3), workers use their agency to migrate to South Africa in search of job opportunities. In order to understand the care workers experiences in Gauteng, it is necessary to take into account the social relations within this space which may include the history of domestic services in South Africa and the relations between Zimbabwe and South Africa. A study by Gama and Willemse (2015) noted a concentration of domestic workers in richer provinces such as Gauteng, Western Cape and KwaZulu Natal with higher levels of education and income further highlighting that there were more opportunities for domestic workers in these provinces. Fig 3.1 below show the local of the two cities in South Africa, where the country shares a border with Zimbabwe in the north.

Figure 3.1: Map of South Africa

Source: https://geology.com/world/south-africa-satellite-image.shtml

37

3.4 Study participants

There were two broad categories of study participants: care workers and key informants.

3.4.1 Care workers

These were women who have migrated from Zimbabwe to engage in care work in South Africa. The salient criteria for inclusion in the study were that they had to:

- Be working in domestic or private households where their responsibilities included providing care for young children up to school-going age or members of the family needing care such as older people, the frail or the sick.
- Be aged 20 years and above. Lutz (2002) argues that there has been a shift in terms of women engaged in domestic work where previously domestic workers were young and single. However, in contemporary times, domestic workers are likely to be older and often married and 'they work in order to cope with a familiar financial crisis, the provision of a family, education of their children' (Lutz, 2002: 95).
- Have school-age children or elderly parents whom they cared for back in Zimbabwe.
- Have worked as a care worker in South Africa for at least two years. This timeframe was deemed long enough to ensure that the women will have diverse work and personal experiences as well as coping mechanisms to share.

3.4.2 Key informants

Payne and Payne (2004) define key informants as those whose social positions in a research setting give them specialist knowledge about other people, processes or happenings that is more extensive, detailed, or privileged than ordinary people. In this study, these were owners or managers of domestic worker recruitment agencies in Pretoria and Johannesburg. Such agencies play the role of being the point of contact for both the employers who seek domestic help or homebased care services as well as the domestic or care workers seeking placement. The owners and managers would therefore be familiar with the specific details regarding employer-employee relationships within this sector.

Key informants were selected from four purposively selected recruitment agencies. Three were privately-owned businesses while one was a faith-based informal agency. Two of the privately-owned businesses were located in Johannesburg while one was in Pretoria. The faith-based agency was in Johannesburg.

3.5 Selection of study participants

Study participants were selected using two non-probability sampling techniques. The first, snowballing, was used to select care workers as participants in the study. Also known as chain referral sampling (Berg, 2009), snowballing entails the identification of a few initial

participants who meet the inclusion criteria who are then asked to provide the names of, or lead to, other potential participants thus opening possibilities for an expanding web of participants (Lewis-Beck et al., 2004). Snow-balling sampling is most appropriate when trying to access 'concealed' participants or groups of people that are difficult to reach and where a full list of the population is not known (Berg, 2009; Atkinson and Flint, 2001). As already noted, migrant care workers in private households represent a 'hidden' population that is invisible to the public.

The first participants were recruited through my social networks (friends, other Zimbabwean students at the University of Pretoria, and other people who said they knew people who employed domestic workers from Zimbabwe). Other areas used as recruitment sites were domestic worker recruitment agencies as well as hair salons[8] in the two cities. This recruitment process yielded a total of 26 care workers to be interviewed. To the extent that the ' "sweet spot" sample size for many qualitative research studies is 15 to 20 homogeneous interview participants' (Latham, no date), this number was deemed sufficient to provide a detailed exploration of the care workers' experiences and views. Table 3.1 below shows the basic background characteristics of the care workers.

---

[8] Studies show that hairdressing is a major employer for migrant women including Zimbabweans in South Africa, for example (Chireka, K. 2015. Migration and Body Politics: A study of migrant women workers in Bellville, Cape Town. Master's dissertation, University of the Western Cape, Bellville, Western Cape.)

Table 3.1: Background characteristics of care workers who participated in the study

Pseudonym	Age	Marital Status	Education	Place of Work	Employment status	Living arrangement (Living with employer/ live-out)	Care dependents (Number of children and age/ parents/ guardians)
Tendai	28	Not married	Form 3	Pretoria	Full time	Live-in	2 children (1 boy 7 years, 1 girl 5 years)
Rufaro	36	Separated	Form 4	Johannesburg	Full time	Live-in	2 children (1 girl 14 years, 1 boy 7years and parents
Chido	28	Single	Form 4	Pretoria	Full time	Live-in	1 child (8 years)
Grace	43	Married	Form 4	Pretoria	Full time	Live-in	4 children (3 boys aged 24, 19, 17 and a girl aged 10)
Sibongile	33	Married	Current Matric student	Johannesburg	Full time	Live out	2 children (16, 6years in South Africa and parent (mom)
Yolanda	24	Not married	Grade 6	Johannesburg	Full time	Live-in	1 child (5 years)
Lucia	44	Married	Form 4	Pretoria	Full time	Live-in	2 children, 21 in Zimbabwe, 16 in South Africa
Anna	29	Separated	Form 4	Johannesburg	Full time	Live-in	1 child, 9 years
Ratidzo	34	Separated	Grade 7	Johannesburg	Full time	Live-in	One child (2 and half years)
Tanyaradzwa	33	Widow	Form 4	Johannesburg	Full-time	Live-in	1 child, 14 years
Abigail	44	Single	Form 2	Johannesburg	Part-time	Live out	None, Caring of aunt and uncle who raised her.
Kundai	45	Separated	Grade 7	Johannesburg	Part time	Live out	One child
Buhle	32	Separated	Form 4	Johannesburg	Part time	Live out	2 children, one (8 years) in Zimbabwe, one in South Africa (one year)
Vimbai	33	Separated	Form 4	Johannesburg	Full- time	Live-in	Two children, girl 9 years, 1 boy 7 and years and parent.
Thandeka	35	Separated	Form 4	Johannesburg	Full-time	Live-in	Two children (18, 15 years)

Name	Age	Marital status	Education	City	Employment	Live-in/out	Dependents
Ruvarashe	35	Married	Form 1	Johannesburg	Full time	Live-out	Two children (17. 11 years)
Fungai	36	Separated	Form 4	Pretoria	Full- time	Live-in	Two children (14, 5 years) in SA and parent.
Tsitsi	48	Widow	Grade 7	Johannesburg	Full time	Live-in	6 children (32, 31, 26, 24, 18, 11) and parents
Sinikiwe	38	Single	A level	Johannesburg	Full time	Live-in	1 child (4 years) in SA and parent (father in Zimbabwe
Sarah	29	Single	O' level	Johannesburg	Part time	Live-out	One child (4 years)and parent (mom)
Rumbidzai	25	Married	Grade 7	Johannesburg	Full time	Live-in	One child (8 years) and parent (mom)
Sifiso	30	Married	A level	Johannesburg	Full time	Live-out	Two children (1 boy, 10 years in Zimbabwe, 1 girl, 2 years in SA)
Carol	35	Separated	Tertiary education	Johannesburg	Full time	Live-in	4 children, 14, 12, 5, 3 years)
Nokuthula	41	Divorced	Form 4	Johannesburg	Full time	Live-in	Two children (21, 12 and parent (mom)
Chiedza	22	Single	Form 4	Johannesburg	Full time	Live-in	No children, Caring of mother and siblings in Zimbabwe
Tarisai	48	Widow	Grade 7	Johannesburg	Full time	Live-in	One child

As shown in the table, there were more participants working in Johannesburg than in Pretoria. It appeared that participants from Johannesburg were more accessible, open and co-operative during the interview process. The reason could be that most migrants live in Johannesburg, they were more willing to associate with people from their home country and were not afraid to share their experiences. As I was using snow-balling sampling, there was a higher likelihood of referrals to individuals working in Johannesburg where there are more migrants. By comparison, people in Pretoria were reserved. The table additionally illustrates that there were more participants in full-time positions (22), as well as those living with their employers (19). This was reflective of the nature of their duties as care workers. Corresponding with other studies on care workers, such employees are expected to provide round-the-clock services to care recipients, thus more often than not, employers expected them to take up live-in positions. For example, one respondent pointed out that her employer requested that she return to work on Sunday evenings after her off-days so that she could be available for the children on Monday mornings, which a previous employee had not been able to do due to transport problems. Further, aligning with other studies (for example, Parreñas (2015), the participants highlighted the provision of accommodation and cutting back on costs such as transport to and from work, as some of the reasons why they chose live-in positions. Full-time participants who lived out (3) were married and were living with their spouses, hence they opted for live-out positions to be able to continue with their family responsibilities. Part-time workers did not live in the employer's household.

The age of the participants in this study ranged between 20 and 50 years. The participants fell into six categories with the highest number of participants in the age group of 31-35 years (8 participants), followed by the categories of 26-30 and 41-45 years which had five participants each. Age groups of 21-25 and 36-40 had three participants each while the age group of 45-50 years had the lowest number of participants. This may be due to the sampling criteria that required women who were in their reproductive ages with school-going children left in Zimbabwe. Further, it was also consistent with other studies which highlighted that employers preferred young women who were hard working and physically fit to be able to do household tasks and who could work for a long period of time (Du Toit, 2016; Debonneville, 2021).

With regards to the marital status and family background of the women: 17 participants were single, separated or divorced, six were married and three were widowed. 11 participants had two children , ten had one child whilst three participants had more than three children.

Only two participants did not have children but had dependants (parents or people for whose care they were responsible) back in Zimbabwe. While the majority of the participants' children remained in Zimbabwe, a few participants had children in South Africa while some were in both locations. Six participants had attained primary school education, while 16 had attained secondary school education (between Form 1- 4), three had attained high school education and one had attained tertiary education) In addition to the educational attainments shown in the table, 11 of the participants had acquired other qualifications, which included dressmaking or domestic worker training, and five had completed courses in Early Childhood Development and child-minding.

The second non-probability technique, purposive sampling, was used to select key informants. According to Neuman (2011: 268), this type of sampling is used when selecting cases 'with a specific purpose in mind', and is appropriate for specialised populations. Key informants were identified through an online search of domestic worker agencies websites. Once selected, an introductory email explaining the study and requesting an interview was sent to them and these were followed up with telephone calls. The faith-based key informant was selected following a referral from one of the key informants in Johannesburg. Coincidentally, another agency that also participated in the study mentioned the same faith-based agency, highlighting its prominence in the research site.

3.6 Data collection

Semi-structured in-depth interviews – defined by Kvale and Brinkmann (2015: 3) as conversations 'that [have] a purpose or structure … [and go] beyond the spontaneous exchange of views in everyday conversations and become a careful questioning and listening approach with the purpose of obtaining thoroughly tested knowledge' – were used to collect information from both care workers and key informants, using semi-structured interview guides. The guides for the care worker interviews (see Appendix B) were designed to solicit information on the care workers' reasons for migration, migration experiences, employment and working conditions, perceived benefits and challenges of migration, as well as perceived implications of the migration on their families back in Zimbabwe.

Fedyuk and Zentai (2018: 176) assert that interviews are flexible as they can be held at a time suitable to the participants as well as in a 'neutral territory, where the respondent feels safe to express his/her views without repercussions'. To this end, the interviews in this study were conducted at times and venues deemed convenient for the participants. Given the workers' often demanding work conditions and schedules, most interviews were held during weekends as many would be not going to work or had their 'off-days' at that time.

Data was collected in two periods from December 2017 to February 2018 for the pilot study while the rest of the data was collected from June to November 2018. The interviews were

conducted in a range of places such as parks and food-outlets. This was mainly for live-in participants who could not have interviews within their employers' households and did not have access to a place of their own. However, many of the participants who were live-in employees also had their own places of accommodation where they lived when they were not working, often located in the townships[9] where rentals were cheaper. They referred to their homes as an 'escape' from work that allowed them to socialise with others. They would invite me to come into their homes. This indicated a level of trust between me and the participants further emphasising Fedyuk et al.'s idea of neutral territory. Three interviews were held within the employer's household. This was chosen by these participants as the most convenient time and place, even though they expressed some reservation on some questions where they had to give details about their employers. Similarly, interviews with live-out workers were conducted in their homes or at the home of a friend. Interviews were conducted in both English and Shona, the Zimbabwean language that most participants spoke. With the care workers' permission, all the interviews were audio-recorded.

For key informants, the interview guides (see Appendix B) were designed to solicit information on the services they provided and the recruitment process for domestic and care workers; the overall functioning and practices in the domestic services sector with regard to terms of employment, working conditions as well as employer-employee relations; the profiles of domestic workers as well as selection criteria used by employers in recruiting employees. The interviews were conducted in English, during office hours, and at the agencies' offices. Like the care worker interviews, all the key informant interviews were audio-recorded with permission from the informants.

3.7 Data analysis

On completion of data collection, all interviews were transcribed and, where necessary, translated from Shona to English. The process of transcribing allowed me to familiarise myself with the data as I listened to the interviews and wrote down notes on important issues as they presented themselves in the data.

Following the transcription, thematic analysis was used to analyse data collected from both the care workers and key informant interviews. Thematic analysis is a method for 'systematically identifying, organising, and offering insights into patterns and meanings across a data set' (Braun and Clarke (2012: 57). Kawulich and Holland (2012) highlight that

---

[9] Townships refer to neighbourhoods located on the periphery of towns and cities that were established during apartheid. Often described as 'dormitory' suburbs, these areas were socially marginalised and economically disadvantaged with limited access to social services.
https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/southafrica/publication/the-economics-of-south-african-townships-special-focus-on-diepsloot

this method is useful when trying to understand a phenomenon through the viewpoints of several participants. Thematic analysis highlights the processes of coding data from smaller units such as words or phrases, which combine into larger elements (themes). It utilises the constant comparative method where data from each interview are compared to data coded from other interviews (Kawulich and Holland, 2012). Different types of coding may be used in thematic analysis which include open or initial, axial and selecting coding. Different authors (Kawulich and Hollard, 2012; Creswell, 2007) note that open or initial coding relates to exploring the data and developing categories of information about the topic under study, for example, the distinctive characteristics of the issue. Axial coding involves the rearranging of information from the earlier categories to examine the relationships between the various categories. Selective coding entails developing the central themes from the data through grouping the categories together.

Braun and Clarke (2012) note that thematic analysis can take two approaches: inductive or deductive (theoretical approach). The scholars note that in an inductive approach 'the codes and themes derive from the content of the data themselves – so that what is mapped by the researcher during analysis closely matches the content of the data', while in a deductive approach, coding and analysis is directed by the concepts and ideas the researcher brings into the data (Braun and Clarke, 2012: 57-60). In this study, data analysis utilised both approaches as codes were generated from the data interviews and were also guided by a theoretical framework and feminist perspective on productive/reproductive labour and the analytic framework on global care chains drawn from the literature.

Coding was done using a computer-assisted qualitative data analysis software, ATLAS ti. Codes were collapsed into broader categories to generate themes in line with the research objectives. For example, migration process was one of the broader categories in which data relating to the participant's family background, livelihood before migration and reasons for migration were included. While aspects related to obtaining visas for work and stay in South Africa could have been included in the migration process category, visa issues featured so prominently in the interviews that I chose to make this a theme on its own as it was linked to other issues such as job opportunities and finding employment. Other broader categories including working conditions, and the benefits and costs of migration were utilised in searching and generating themes. For example, under the theme of working conditions, examples of the codes included 'managing housework and care responsibilities', 'labour rights', and 'contractual agreements' among others.

3.8 Ethical considerations

Ethical concerns in qualitative research, particularly in interviews, arise through the 'complexities' related to the collection of information about the participant's private life and

the dissemination of such information in publications (Kvale, 2007). Therefore, it is important to carefully consider how to protect the welfare of participants during the research process and after the completion of the study. To ensure this, the study's proposal, as well as all data collection instruments, were submitted to the Research Ethics Committee of the Faculty of Humanities at the University of Pretoria for ethical clearance, which was granted on 26 October 2017 (see Appendix C). In the field, an information sheet with details explaining the purpose of the research and how information was to be collected, stored and safeguarded was distributed or read to the participants before the interview (Appendix A). Further, participants were asked to complete a consent form as well as consent to audio-recording of the interviews (also in Appendix A).

As highlighted in other studies researching migrants including undocumented migrants (Griffin, 2010; Vershinina and Rodionova, 2011; Markova, 2009), this study was sensitive in nature as the research participants were a 'hidden' and 'vulnerable' population. It posed elements of risk to the participants given the nature of information would disclose. Vershinina and Rodionova (2011) points out that research with migrants has the potential to be intrusive as it seeks to understand the participants migration status and channels used in the migration process. Further, as Griffin (2010) noted remaining concealed and invisible is a significant factor for migrant domestic workers. Some of the concerns raised by participants included exposure to employers or to their employers. As such, confidentiality and protecting the privacy of research participants was important in this study. Participants were assured that confidentiality of the information they shared would be maintained and that the information would be used for academic purposes only. In line with this, any information that could be linked to the identity of any participant was removed to ensure confidentiality. This included specific information on the suburbs where they lived, or they worked. As noted in earlier sections, interviews were mostly conducted during the participants' off days when they were away from work and the in the absence of employers so that participants would be free to express themselves. As stated in the information sheet, the transcripts will be stored in the Department of Sociology for a maximum of 15 years.

Pseudonyms were used in the write-up and analysis of findings as another way to increase confidentiality. Care was taken in selecting the pseudonyms in order to reflect the cultural context and ethnic diversity of the Zimbabwean population. A mix of English, Shona and Ndebele names were assigned to the participants. Studies have highlighted the need to be culturally sensitive when naming participants to avoid misrepresentation and potential harm to participants in the way they are viewed in the context of decolonisation dialogue (Lahman et al., 2015; Brear, 2018). Brear (2018: 723) highlights that in the context of cross-cultural research, not using indigenous language names might be interpreted as a "subtle form of racism and white supremacy".

Language is central in qualitative research as researchers seek the social world from the perspective of the participants. This becomes more apparent in researching migrants where English is not the first language of the participants. Van Nes et al. (2010) argue that language is central in all phases ranging from data collection to analysis as well in the dissemination of data in publications. Al-Amer et al. (2015: 1152) also assert that language is tied to culture as it 'conveys understandings and assumptions commonly held by a social group'. Thus, is it considered appropriate for researchers to collect data in the language of the participants to enable them to freely express themselves. Translation becomes a key process in data analysis in which caution should be taken as 'misrepresentation of meanings due to language or cultural difference can jeopardise the quality of the translated data' (Al-Amer et al., 2015: 1152). Some of the strategies that have been recommended to minimise the problems related to translation include the use of translators that match the participants' characteristics who are acquainted with the culture and values of the studied group to help contextualise narrations as well as using one translator to maintain consistency and enhance data analysis reliability. In this study, interviews were conducted in Shona and were translated to English. It was an advantage that I shared the same characteristics with the participants such as being a migrant and spoke the same language. Further as I had designed the interview guide for the participants and also conducted the interviews, it was easier to contextualise participants narrations during the translation process thus maintaining consistency and maximising the reliability of data. However, some of the challenges that were experienced in translation were when a Shona word carries several meaning s which can change depending on the context and when translating simplifies and reduces the impact of an experience especially with regards to emotions.

3.9 Reflection from the field

In reflecting on the data collection process, I became aware that the fieldwork I had conducted became somehow a window into the lives of migrants as a vulnerable and sensitive group. Immigrants have been described as a vulnerable, sensitive and hard to reach population as they are viewed as outsiders and the 'other' (Lahman et al., 2011). Düvell et al. (2010: 4) citing Clements, 1999) state that vulnerable people are those who are 'stigmatised, have low status … very little power and control over their lives and … live under damaging, legal, social and institutional regimes'. Further, the authors define vulnerability as a 'person's susceptibility to physical and emotional harm' (Düvell et al., 2010: 5), or to being 'exploited, mistreated, discriminated against and taken advantage of" (Thummapol et al., 2019: 2). The participants in this study were migrants and, as will be discussed in the following chapters, some of them had overstayed their visitor's visas while others were asylum seekers. Drawing from the scholars cited above, the participants' vulnerabilities can be explained through their tenuous legal status, work, and social conditions. For example, there was some hesitancy and suspicion about why the research focused on this particular group of people. Some of the reasons for these anxieties was the fear of being exposed to either their employers or the

authorities or to other public forums such as social media. For example, in one interview, the participant asked me if I was a policewoman. Some participants wondered why I was interested in their work, since they considered it to be of so little value. Indeed, notwithstanding being one of the major sources of employment, several factors, including workers' low educational levels, poor remuneration and working conditions and lack of recognition, contribute to domestic service being cast to the bottom of the employment hierarchy (Thobejane and Khoza, 2019).

The data collection process in addition underscored the precarious conditions facing migrant domestic workers. The participants were interviewed at a time and place convenient to them and therefore in some instances the opportunity arose to observe and evaluate their living conditions. With participants who worked as live-in employees, most interviews were held in public areas such as parks and food outlets. While this allowed for the participants to speak freely and openly about their working conditions, it also highlighted their lack of freedom and isolation. Some participants asserted that they were not allowed to receive visitors when they were in the employers' household. As indicated earlier, some of the live-in employees had their own places of accommodation located in the townships, where the interviews were conducted. As will be discussed in Chapter 6, participants were worried about safety in these areas. Security is a significant concern for full-time live-out employees who have to travel early in the morning on their way to work and late in the evening on their way back to their homes. Further, in some interviews, participants pointed to the insecurity they encountered through robberies, break-ins or violence at their workplace as well as while using accessible modes of public transport (commuter taxis). Another source of precarity arose from the living arrangements in their places of accommodation. While some participants rented a room individually, others shared their rooms with other people as a cost saving measure, with consequent lack of privacy and further evidence of their low remuneration.

While the interview as a method of collecting data is viewed as flexible, questions over the ability to build rapport with participants within the interview process have been associated with the positionality of the researcher as well as power relations. Scholars in migration studies link this to the insider/outsider debate. Fedyuk and Zentai (2018) and Ryan (2015) note that a researcher is considered an insider when he or she shares the same ethnic or national background with the participants. It is assumed that it would be easier to access, recruit and collect data from participants as well as that it allows researchers to obtain 'intimate or authentic knowledge' (Fedyuk and Zentai (2018: 180). As the researcher, I shared some characteristics with the participants such as national background. There were advantages to sharing the same national background with the participants. For example, there were no language barriers with the participants. Most interviews were held in Shona, which was the mother language for both the participants and myself, or a mixture of both Shona and English, which made it easier for them to express their views freely. However, scholars

criticise this 'ethno-national' view, pointing out that it misses the different positionalities that are held by researcher and participants, which come into play during the interview process. They therefore highlight the idea of multiple positionalities such as gender, race, age, parental status as well as migration experience (Ryan, 2015). While I shared the same gender with the participants, their experiences as care workers made me an outsider to their group. Furthermore, the way they perceived me and the academic study I was engaged upon relegated me to being an outsider as indicated above. There were also assumptions made by participants that I should have information about particular topics. In one interview, when I was asking questions about the migration process, the participant asked me if it was the first time that I was hearing the information she was relaying. Some participants held the assumption that I should understand the economic situation in Zimbabwe, which was cited as one of the main reasons for migration. On the other hand, some participants found it easy to share their experiences as they viewed the interviews as an opportunity to air their concerns and frustrations, especially when they could not express these views to the families back home. Others saw it as an opportunity to share their views, particularly in light of their positions within a marginalised group of people.

Maggio and Westcott (2014) address the issue of empathy and feelings in interviews in migration studies. They argue that while interviewing is considered a suitable method of data collection for migrants as they are considered a vulnerable and sensitive group, little attention has been paid to the feelings of the researcher in their role as an interviewer or in the context of their research. They argue that there are often expectations for the researcher to perform during interviews, to be professional and maintain some distance from the participants as way of remaining critical. Thus, the scholars point out that as researchers, they felt that the standard interview format did not allow for them to express their emotions or to show empathy towards the participants. Maggio and Westcott (2014: 214) define empathy as 'an awareness and understanding of another person's emotions'. The authors felt that the empathy they felt towards their participants was unique as they shared experiences of being migrants and therefore were able to understand the loneliness and emotional impact of the migration process. This further emphasises the idea of how the researcher's social location has an impact in building rapport with the participants (Ryan, 2015). During fieldwork, feelings of empathy pervaded my encounters with the participants as my position as a woman, mother as well as a migrant permitted me to appreciate their stories of pain about being separated from children and families. I found myself moved by interviewees who were expressive about their emotions towards their migration as well as their working conditions. In some interviews, the participants would cry as they related their reasons for migration and the emotional pain they suffered from the impact of migration. Like Maggio and Westcott (2014), I found out that I was not sufficiently prepared to cope with emotional conversations with the participants. Pausing the interview and taking short breaks to allow the interviewees to compose themselves and offering reassurance to them was one way of managing emotional

encounters. I informed participants that they could notify me if they required counselling services and that I would share details of providers of such services, who could be contacted through a toll-free number at no cost, if necessary. In addition, I would make sure that participants were able to continue with the interviews and point out that they could withdraw at any time if they felt uncomfortable. Despite being emotional, participants showed agency and resilience in coping with their circumstances. I also found peer debriefing, where I was able to discuss these challenges with fellow doctoral students, to be useful in preparing for other interviews.

CHAPTER 4: THE MIGRATION AND JOB-SEEKING EXPERIENCE

4.1 Introduction

This chapter discusses the migration and job-seeking experiences of Zimbabwean care workers in private households in South Africa. It is divided into two sections. The first one highlights the motivations behind the women's migration from Zimbabwe as well as the social and economic activities they undertook before their migration. The second section explores the job-seeking mechanisms and how the migrant workers' documentation status shapes the process. The chapter brings in perspectives from the key informants to highlight the impacts of migration and labour policies on Zimbabwean care workers.

4.2 The migration experience

Women's motivations to migrate are complex and multiple, but are typically determined by their distinct economic, social, and political conditions (Gurung, 2009; Bikova, 2017). Economic reasons often include better prospects for job opportunities that would enable them to earn an income and support their families in the country of origin (Tolstokorova, 2010; Boccagni, 2012; Bikova, 2017). Another dominant economic reason is the potential to accumulate financial freedom, to be debt free as well as able to accumulate savings for the family's future financial stability (Parreñas, 2015). Economic push factors in countries of origin can include absence of employment opportunities as well as unstable economic and political conditions. For example, research on migration flows from East and West African countries such as Kenya, Ghana, Uganda and Tanzania to the Middle East highlights a lack of decent jobs, high unemployment rates and family responsibilities as key factors pushing women to migrate (Laiboni, 2020). Similarly, Schmalzbauer (2004)'s exploration of transnational family experiences of migrants from poor families in Honduras working in the United States, found that for the migrants, transnationalism was a means of survival through mobilising resources from two labour markets. On one hand, remittances were a form of supplementing families' incomes in the home country while working in the United States was a way of escaping poverty at home.

Socially, migration can also offer an escape route from oppressive socio-cultural practices and family conflict as well as a desire for personal growth and freedom (Gurung, 2009; Bikova, 2017; Anderson, 2000; Bélanger and Rahman, 2013). According to Bélanger and Rahman (2013), for example, dysfunctional relationships with partners and in-laws often result in women migrating as a way of distancing themselves from physical and/or emotional abuse. By the same token, in her analysis of the principal reasons for Filipino women's migration, Parreñas (2015) found migration was a way of escaping unequal gender relations

in the family. Furthermore, with the division of labour being prevalent in Filipino society, when women migrated for work, they often took on the role of the breadwinner especially in light of the breakdown of relations with spouses. Studies on Ethiopian women migrating to the Middle East also point to family and peer pressure as a factor that drives migration (Ketema, 2014; Fernandez, 2010). For example, daughters may be pressured by their families into migrating after they notice the benefits of migration within the surrounding community. Political reasons, on the other hand, are often linked to safety and security. De Regt (2010b), for example, highlights how many of the domestic workers in Yemen come from Ethiopia and Somalia where they escaped political instability, in addition to poverty.

In line with the foregoing, it emerged in this study that for virtually all the women, their decisions to migrate were mostly propelled by the economic and political situations in Zimbabwe. This can be best understood through an overview of the history and culture of migration in Zimbabwe as presented below.

4.2.1 An overview of the history and culture of migration in Zimbabwe

Zimbabwe has been both a migrant sending and receiving country from the colonial period (Zanamwe and Devillard, 2010), with Mlambo (2010) arguing that migration in the country dates back to precolonial times before the 1890s. However, migration became more established following the arrival of white settlers led by a pioneer named Cecil John Rhodes, who took over the territory known as Southern Rhodesia (which later became Zimbabwe) in 1890. The country's history of migration can be divided into two phases: the colonial period from the 1890s to 1980 and the post-independence period of 1980 to the present.

During the colonial period, African people were 'stripped of assets such as land, livestock and thus dispossessed of their livelihood' through measures imposed by the settler regime. These included legislative discrimination, residential segregation where African people were moved into Native Reserves that were not suitable for agriculture, as well as the physical and political coercion of African people (Moyo and Kawewe, 2002: 165-166; Potts, 2010). These policies, designed to serve the political and economic interests of the white settlers, restricted the movement and settlement of African people in urban areas (Potts, 2010). As the colonial regime expanded the agricultural and mining industries, Africans were forced to sell their labour power through the imposition of taxes (Mlambo, 2010). As a result, labour migration became a key feature of the colonial period as men were forced to work for wages and to pay tax. This led to expanding cohorts of men seeking to work in urban areas, on commercial farms and in mines, including in neighbouring South Africa (Mlambo, 2010; Moyo and Kawewe, 2002). Women, on the other hand, were expected to stay at home to take care of and support their families through small-scale farming in the rural areas. Further, as Moyo and Kawewe (2002: 168) point out, in the early days of colonialism, 'the law prohibited African women from engaging in the urban wage labour market, except as nannies' for white

people. Thus, as in the broader southern African region, migration in Zimbabwe was historically dominated by men (Crush, 2000).

Following independence from Britain in 1980, the new Zimbabwean government was faced with the task of reconstructing a nation that had been divided along the lines of race, class, gender and ethnicity, as well as addressing racial imbalances created by the colonial state (Sibanda and Makwata, 2017; Muzondidya, 2009). Thus, the government instituted policies that 'mainly focused on redistribution of wealth, expansion of rural infrastructure and redressing social and economic inequality including land reform' (Sibanda and Makwata, 2017: 4-5). The removal of restrictions on movement led to increased rural to urban migration in the 1980s (Potts, 2010).

While the 1980s were also characterised by positive social and economic developments seen through improved access to health care, education, water and sanitation, Zimbabwe continued to experience economic difficulties that deteriorated in the 1990s (Muzondidya, 2009; Sachikonye, 2002). As a result, the government launched the Economic Structural Adjustment Programme (ESAP) in 1991 to 'transform the economy from being heavily regulated to liberalisation' (Sibanda and Makwata, 2017: 11). The ESAP, however, resulted in the further deterioration of the economy and social services (Muzondidya, 2009; Sibanda and Makwata, 2017), as the measures put in place did not yield the desired results. The economy continued to perform poorly and local and foreign investment was not forthcoming as envisaged (Madebwe and Madebwe, 2017; Zinyama, 2000). For instance, according to Muzondidya (2009), unemployment continued to increase and rose from 32.2% in 1990 to 44% in 1993. There were widespread retrenchments as companies closed, with corresponding loss of household incomes. ESAP had implications for the provision of social services as the government reduced health and education subsidies. Thus these services became inaccessible to the unemployed and poor as well as to women and children (Muzondidya, 2009).

This 'multi-layered' crisis deepened in the 2000s with Raftopoulos (2009: 201) noting that its key aspect 'was the rapid decline in the economy characterised by amongst other things: steep declines in industrial and agricultural productivity, historic levels of hyperinflation, the informalisation of labour, the dollarization of economic transactions, displacements and critical erosion of livelihoods'. Hyperinflation peaked at 230 million percent by the end of 2008, the highest in recorded history. The declining economic situation was accompanied and aggravated by political instability reflected in the violence and intimidation levelled against opponents to the ruling party, as occurred during the country's major elections in 2000, 2002, 2005 and 2008. Another factor was the take-over of white farms, which had a negative effect on investor confidence and resulted in the loss of foreign currency and food shortages as agriculture was a significant contributor to the country's economy (Madebwe and Madebwe, 2017).

The challenges outlined above together with the overall deterioration in the economy meant families could no longer rely on the male breadwinner's income alone and women could no longer stay at home (Zinyama, 2000). For instance, Moyo and Kawewe (2002) point out that women in the rural areas were increasingly struggling to support their families as men or husbands returned to the rural areas after retrenchments or could not work due to illness. These women had to seek employment in the formal and informal domestic sectors. In consequence, the country witnessed emigration of skilled professionals 'frustrated by the introduction of wage restraints, deteriorating work and living conditions as well as the instability in food prices due to the removal of food subsidies' (Madebwe and Madebwe, 2017: 29). Cross-border travel to economically stable neighbouring countries such as South Africa and Botswana for informal trading also became a vital survival strategy and was dominated by women seeking to supplement the family's income (Zinyama, 2000). Women cross-border traders also travelled to Mozambique, Zambia and Tanzania to purchase second-hand clothing for resale in Zimbabwe. Moyo and Kawewe (2002) argue that cross-border trading was marked by class and racial differences where women with limited resources would purchase or produce handcrafts and other household goods to sell in the neighbouring countries while on their return they would buy goods for use in their households. Middle-class African and white women, with better financial resources, would seek short- term casual employment in the domestic work and service industries in Western countries during their holidays.

Former President Robert Mugabe resigned in November 2017 and a new president, Emmerson Mnangagwa, was elected in 2018. Media reports (e.g. (Associated Press, 2019; Reuters, 2019a; Reuters, 2019b) have shown that even with the new regime, the Zimbabwean economy has continued to deteriorate with escalating food and fuel prices and rising inflation. Accordingly, the regional and international migration and emigration of Zimbabweans continues and shows no sign of abating, at least in the near future. The increased visibility of women in migration flows is the focus of the following section.

4.2.2 Feminisation of Zimbabwean migration

According to Zanamwe and Devillard (2010: 18), citing United Nations, 2002), while women have always migrated, 'what has changed is the share of women in labour migration flows that has been increasing since the 1970s. Women do not only migrate as dependents anymore. This is the rise of autonomous female migration that is referred to as "feminization of migration".' In line with this growing global phenomenon, several studies (e.g. (Kiwanuka and Monson, 2009; Hughes, 2007; Dodson, 2000; Crush and Tevera, 2010; Crush et al., 2015; Mbiyozo, 2018) have reported an upward trend in the number of women migrating from Zimbabwe to neighbouring countries in the SADC region, with South Africa being the main destination. There is however a dearth of data on precise numbers and, at the time of

writing this thesis, the most current data were those collected by the South African Migration Project for the years 1997 to 2010. Using these data, Table 4.1 shows that there was an increase in the number of women migrating to South Africa from 39% to 44% in that period. The table also shows that there was an increase of migrants in the reproductive ages with migrants from the ages 15-24 increasing from 26% to 31% and from the ages 25-39 increasing from 50% to 59% for both men and women in the 13-year period. While the married constituted the highest proportion in 1997, the pattern was reversed by 2010, with the unmarried having the highest proportion (49%). The formerly married also exhibited an increased proportion in the period. In terms of status in the household, the pattern consistently showed children, household heads and spouses, in that order, as the main migratory categories.

Table 4.1: Demographic profile of Zimbabwean migrants, 1997-2010

Table 1. Demographic profile of Zimbabwean migrants, 1997−2010.

	1997	2005	2010
Sex (%)			
Male	61	56	56
Female	39	44	44
Age in years (%)			
15−24	26	15	31
25−39 (25−44)	(50)	56	59
>40 (>45)	(23)	24	10
Marital status (%)			
Married	66	58	41
Formerly married*	8	11	10
Unmarried	25	31	49
Status in household (%)			
Household head	34	28	28
Spouse	26	13	15
Son/daughter	20	50	43
Other family	7	9	12
Other	13	1	2

Note: *Separated/divorced/abandoned/widowed.

Source: (Crush et al., 2015)

4.2.3 Reasons for migration and livelihood before migration

The majority of women in this study reported that before migration, they undertook unskilled or low paying jobs and casual jobs in the domestic service sector, in cross-border trading, or as vendors; some were not employed. It can be argued that the women's level of education largely contributed to the jobs available to them. As shown in Chapter 3, the majority of the women who participated in the study said that they had an educational level between primary school and secondary school indicating low educational levels. For entry-level jobs and low-skilled jobs, most employers require individuals to have completed high school. Thus, there were fewer jobs available for these women. Further, the economic situation in Zimbabwe, which has been declining since about 2000, meant that they were at the bottom of the formal employment hierarchy. Thus, women had to find work in the informal sector where they resorted to difficult and strenuous jobs. For example, three participants indicated some of the jobs they did while in Zimbabwe and their reason to migrate as a 'means of survival'. One of them, Tsitsi, a 48 year-old live-in care worker in Johannesburg, explained:

After my husband died, I did odd jobs ... like crushing stones to be used in concrete for building. … I was afraid of having chest pains because the work was heavy and very strenuous. …You would use big hammers to manually crush the stones. They use cubic measurements, so one cubic is equivalent to 60 wheelbarrows of crushed stones. So one wheelbarrow at that time was US$ 2.50. That is if the person was paying a fair price but if they paid you at a lower rate, it was US$ 2.00. … I would wake up at 4 o'clock, I remember at one instance someone had said they need to purchase the stones, I filled in 40 wheelbarrows. It was a really tough job…

The participants cited many reasons that were associated with the declining economic situation in Zimbabwe as their main push factors for migration. Key among these was the lack of job opportunities in Zimbabwe, as the following excerpts illustrate:

There were no jobs in Zimbabwe that we could do, it was hard to find a job, and even when you got it, people were not being paid, so when the visa regulations were relaxed, we decided to come here, at least here in South Africa, if you get a job, any type of job, you will be receiving an income. (Abigail, 44 year old, part-time care worker, Johannesburg)

The economy, obviously … economic wise, you know our country, that things were not working out, if you try to sell this, you would not get anything out of it, and at that time people were not having money like if you sell things at the end of the day, some people do not pay, sometimes you get late payments and at the end of the day, you don't see what you were doing. (Carol, 35 year-old, live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

The poor working conditions in the domestic services sector in Zimbabwe was cited as another key push factor for many of the interviewed care workers. Yolanda's story sums up some of the women's experiences in Zimbabwe. Yolanda was a domestic worker prior to migrating to South Africa. She describes her background as 'very bad'. Yolanda's parents had separated when she was still an infant and she was raised by her mother. Her mother remarried when she was in primary school and she moved to live with the stepfather's relatives. Yolanda did not live with her mother for long periods of time as she was moved to live with different relatives from an early age. As a result of the difficult circumstances in her stepfather's household, Yolanda started working in the domestic sector with caring responsibilities at an early age. Her reasons for migrating were to search for better conditions than those offered by her previous employer:

… what made me decide to come to Johannesburg... I had been working for my employer from 2012, and when you live with people for a long time and they get used to you, they start thinking that you have settled and you have no other options. Because I had lived with them for so long, all of a sudden ... they used to pay me US$150 per month … then they could no longer afford to pay me that amount. She (employer) also always used to say other helpers were not being paid as much and that I was earning a lot of money, until she said, 'I will be paying you US$100.' On top of that, there was a lot of work to do as I was also taking care of her older daughter who was my mother's age. She had suffered a stroke, and there was no gardener, so you had to work both in the house as well as in the garden. (Yolanda, 24 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

It is against such backgrounds that what were perceived as better job opportunities and working conditions in South Africa became pull factors for most of the care workers. For example:

Here in South Africa, it is easy to get jobs, like domestic work jobs are easy to find. It is not as difficult as in other countries like Namibia. … Moreover, in South Africa, the amount of money that we get paid is a bit better. It depends on your employer but, if you look at it, the salaries that we get paid here in South Africa, are generally better. You are able to support family in Zimbabwe. (Chido, 28 year-old, live-in care worker, Pretoria)

While most of the women cited economic reasons for their migration, the desire to adequately take care of their children also emerged as an important factor. As noted in the previous chapter, most of the participants in the study were single parents. In the absence of spouses, most women noted that their move was motivated by the fact that they had to find employment to enable them to take care of their children and other family members including their parents and siblings. For example, some participants pointed out that while they might have had no interest in migrating to South Africa before, the economic challenges in Zimbabwe motivated them to migrate as a way to meet their obligations as mothers and daughters. This is consistent with the assertion by Parreñas (2015) that gender is a critical element in migration processes as migrating to support the family has different implications or meaning to men and women. She argues that in light of the gender norms in patriarchal nuclear families, migration allows women to take on different responsibilities as providers for the family. Thus, migration is a way to address unequal gender relations in the family especially for single parents facing the responsibility of taking care of and providing for the children alone. Similarly, Zack et al. (2019) contend that gendered care-giving roles may also be a push factor in the migration of women. Citing Crush and Tevera (2017), who argue that food security is a crucial reason for leaving Zimbabwe, Zack et al. note that women are

pushed to migrate so that they can provide food for their children. Thus, they argue that gender, life stage and generational aspects can shape women's decision-making in the migration process.

4.3   The migration journey

Discussing the participants' migration journey was a sensitive topic as some participants were afraid to expose the ways in which they had come into South Africa. It emerged that the migration or documentation status of the participants changed over the course of their stay in South Africa. Most of the participants (22) indicated that on their first entry into South Africa they had used passports or emergency travel documents. At the time of the interviews, the documentation status of the participants was as follows:

- One participant indicated she had acquired permanent residency.
- Six had acquired work visas through the Dispensation of Zimbabwe project, with one highlighting that the permit had expired and she was yet to renew it. I noted that the women who entered South Africa between 2004-2010 managed to apply for the work visa through the Dispensation of Zimbabweans Project, which commenced in 2010. However not all participants were able to take advantage of this process. Those with permits had entered South Africa before the documentation process started in 2010 while those coming afterwards could not be part of the process as no new applications were allowed after the deadline.
- Three had obtained asylum seekers permits.
- Fifteen indicated that they were making use of visitors' visas, and 'overstaying'. One remained undocumented.

Participants highlighted challenges they faced in obtaining the required travel documents especially in Zimbabwe, because of the economic challenges the country faced. For example, the following narrations from two participants highlighted the transitions they went through in their stay in South Africa.

> I came in 2004 and my passport expired in September 2005, but things were in bad shape in Zimbabwe that even when you had the money to apply for a passport, you were not able to obtain one during those days. So, I just stayed … up until when the special permits projects started; that's when I renewed my passport and I applied for the permit and received one. (Lucia, 44 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

> Ratidzo: When I first came, I used an ETD (emergency travel document) because at that time, it was very difficult to obtain a passport and the visas, I had acquired a (visitors') visa when I came.
> PB: *What about now? ... What about a permit?*

Ratidzo: Yes, I do … the 2010 one. … Those permits were the ones where we were told that all people from Zimbabwe, who did not have permits or passports were eligible for, so I took a chance and got it. … I applied in 2010 and got it in 2011. … At the moment, some of us went to renew but they are still being processed. So, we don't know the outcome, whether we will get them or not. (Ratidzo, 34 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

While Lucia indicated the hurdles she faced in acquiring a passport in Zimbabwe, Ratidzo noted the uncertainty and anxiety she experienced as a result of the delays in the processing of her permit.

The choice of which method to use was dependent on several factors. As already noted, special permits required the applicant to produce certain documents. As scholars have noted, some of these documents are difficult to obtain (Thebe, 2017), and migrants who arrived after 2010 are not eligible to apply. While participants and key informants suggested that the asylum permit was often disliked and avoided, it remained one of the preferred ways of maintaining one's stay in South Africa as it gave permission for holders to work and study. It was a way of securing long term employment. However, participants raised certain challenges to acquire this type of permit that discouraged other migrants to consider them, including long queues at the Department of Home Affairs offices, which meant that one had to join the queues early in the morning. A further difficulty was the requirement to submit one's passport when applying for the asylum permit. There were fears that the passports could go missing and restrict mobility. Acquiring an asylum permit limited visits back home as it was evidence that one was fleeing the country. Further, asylum permits are renewable every three to six months, which means holders must endure this process often.

Thus, other migrants resorted to the method of sending their passports to be 'processed out'. This phenomenon is believed to have been going on for some time and has been associated with spiralling rates of out-migration from Zimbabwe (Thebe, 2011; Thebe, 2017; Zack et al., 2019). Thebe (2011) discusses it in the context of the development of the 'malayisha' system as a channel for moving goods, money and smuggling people to and from South Africa through private transporters. In this study, this system is shown as also being undertaken by cross-border buses (drivers). Migrants use this method to ensure entry back into South Africa without difficulties encountered when one 'overstays'.

4.4   The job-seeking journey

In the course of the migration process, before and after arrival in the destination country, the search for a job can be a daunting experience. One participant, Sibongile, highlighted the difficulties migrants might face if they failed to secure a job in South Africa. She explained

that as people are often far away from relatives and family, there is no sense of community. Thus, having a job is the means of survival,

> … here in South Africa if you don't work, ah, I don't know how to explain it, if you don't work, it's very, very hard. Sometimes, I say my job doesn't pay well but sometimes I look at other people, they go to bed without having anything to eat because they are not working… (Sibongile, 33 year-old live-out care worker, Johannesburg)

The participants highlighted a number of ways in which they found employment, which included through agencies, the 'market' and social networks of relatives and friends who were already in South Africa.

4.4.1 Social networks

Poros (2011) describes social networks as being made up of 'individuals and organisations … which are tied together by different sorts of relationships such as friendships, economic exchange, influence and common interest'. Thompson (2009) and Hondagneu-Sotelo (1994) elaborate the interactions and exchanges within social networks, which create a sense of community. The most popular method of securing jobs for the participants in this study was through their networks of relatives and friends who are already living in South Africa, aligning with (Zack et al., 2019)'s study of female Zimbabwean migrants in the domestic sector. Participants noted that they utilised their networks in Zimbabwe and in South Africa in their search for employment. Employers also made use of these networks of Zimbabwean nationals in South Africa to solicit potential employees in Zimbabwe to come to work in South Africa. For example, Sifiso, 30 year-old live-out care worker from Johannesburg explained her decision to come to South Africa and the migration process, which was influenced by her social networks as follows:

> I chose to come to South Africa because I had relatives living here already and I asked them to search for jobs for me. My sister and other cousins are here in South Africa. One of my cousins assisted me with finding a job because I had told her that once she found a job for me, I would come ... my cousin had found a job opening for me to work in a suburb in Johannesburg. It was in December 2012, so my cousin told me about the job during the Christmas holidays and I got the contact details of the employer and I started communicating with her. I travelled after the 1st of January. I didn't face any problems; I went to my sister's place and I started work the next day.

Similarly, Yolanda was assisted by her friend to secure her current position:

> My friend got this job for me when I was in Zimbabwe … she was working for this family… she had just come to assist them because their previous helper had left after she found another job… (Yolanda, 24 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

De Regt (2010b) and Awumbila et al. (2017c) highlight several advantages of using social networks in the migration process. De Regt (2010b) notes that migrants receive information through their networks, which is useful for helping them to prepare for the new environment and life. Further, she notes that relatives and friends in the destination country will assist new migrants with settling in and adjustment through providing accommodation and information on employment opportunities as well providing support in times of trouble, such as when a job is lost abruptly. Her observations were apparent in my interviews with the care workers. Most participants noted that the reason they chose to come South Africa was because their relatives or friends were already there. Relatives provided accommodation and assisted with the search for jobs. Many of the participants noted that relatives and friends had notified them of the job openings while they were still in Zimbabwe. They, therefore, migrated to take up a position that was already available and did not have to spend any time searching for a job. Other participants noted that they had asked their relatives residing in South Africa to search for jobs on their behalf as indicated in Sifiso's quote above.

The foregoing can be related to the theorists of transnational migration who highlight the idea of 'simultaneous embeddedness' as migrants maintain social ties in the country of origin and destination. Näre (2007) also emphasises the importance of strong social networks in her study of Ukrainian and Polish domestic workers in Naples, Italy. She notes that migration was easier for Polish women as most of them already knew someone who was in Naples and they would often start working by substituting for other Polish women who were going back home on a rotational basis. This was different for Ukrainian women who had weaker social ties and often did not know anyone in Naples. Ukrainian women often had to pay large sums of money to private and illegal brokers in order to secure employment.

A central issue in the use of social networks is trust. Both employers and employees prefer to use recommendations from within their social networks as a way of finding good employers or domestic workers they can trust, which is vital in care work. Employers leave their children with domestic workers while they are at work during the day. Therefore, finding an employee who is recommended through friends is preferable. De Regt (2010b) points that for domestic workers, being employed by families recommended by social networks enhances the chances that they would be treated well.

Churches were also a significant element of the social networks as both employers and job seekers used this channel as a way of advertising in search of an employee or for a job. For

example, Rufaro indicated that she found her current job through networks from the church her sister attended:

> Haa, it's about talking to people, like my sister, she told people at the church she attends that she had a sister who was looking for job … she goes to the same church with the person that notified me of this job. This person told a mutual friend who then sent me a WhatsApp message with the details on the opening…
> (Rufaro, 36, live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

It was not only family and friends who assisted in the search for employment, but also being part of social media groups. Participants such as Tanyaradzwa explained that she found her job through a post on a social media group she was part of. She contacted the fellow domestic worker, also from Zimbabwe, who had placed the post, and they became friends from there. Thus, social networks were a resource for information on job openings.

Apart from sharing information on job seeking, social networks were important in familiarising domestic workers about the prevailing working conditions in the domestic sector. This was through the exchange of information and interactions between domestic workers. For example, one of my participants invited me to the township where she lived during her off-days to recruit other participants. I travelled to her place on one Sunday morning and she took me around the neighbourhood to meet some ladies she knew who worked '*kumakitchen*' (in the kitchens), a term used to describe domestic and care work. From this encounter, I managed to have an informal group discussion with three women (two whose work included caring responsibilities and one who does only cleaning). This group discussion gave me further insight and an appreciation of some of the issues that were of concern to care and domestic workers as they discussed aspects such as food rationing, surveillance through cameras installed by employers, remuneration, dispute resolution and use of the Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration (CCMA)[10] to resolve such matters. Remuneration was a key concern raised in this discussion with the group highlighting that R4000 (US$235) should be the average salary for live-in workers while R250/day (US$15) should be the average for part-time workers. At that time, the minimum salary for domestic workers stipulated by the government was around R2500 (US$147). Such discussions among domestic workers were an information resource that they could use when negotiating with employers for better working conditions or salary increases. Hondagneu-Sotelo (1994) makes similar observations in her study of undocumented Mexican domestic workers in the United States and argues that social interactions among domestic workers

---

[10] The Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration is a dispute resolution body that was established in terms of the Labour Relations Act of 1995. Some of its responsibilities include conciliating workplace disputes and arbitrating certain categories of disputes that remain unresolved after conciliation, among others. https://www.ccma.org.za/About-Us/What-We-Do, accessed 8 July 2020.

served to 'informally regulate pay standards' especially in a sector where salary negotiations are individualised and carried out between the employer and employee. She argues that based on information acquired through these networks, women have additional leverage in negotiating their jobs and working conditions with employers.

4.4.2 The 'market'

The other method of finding jobs was through the 'market', which the participants explained as areas where 'people go and wait, so individuals looking for people to contract, just stop there and they choose the person they want, and then you discuss, if you agree and then you go…' (Chido, Pretoria). The participants explained that there are designated areas where individuals in search of casual work congregate in the morning. In Pretoria, it is common to see people, both men and women, waiting by the roadside at major intersections or at service stations in search of casual or part-time jobs. While this seems to be a popular method for finding domestic work, it can be risky and dangerous especially in relation to human trafficking. For example, in an informal conversation after the interview in Johannesburg, Abigail pointed to an incident where two women had been picked up by the roadside while they were looking for a job, had disappeared and had later been found dead in the area where she lives. This narrative reflects only one aspect of the vulnerabilities associated with searching for casual jobs in the domestic sector. Another relates to the question of trust, where relying on the 'market' to find work posed a risk to employers who would be employing strangers without knowledge of their background or credentials. Another participant who had made use of this method to find work was Nokuthula, who pointed out how her employers tested her trustworthiness:

> I started working there on a Tuesday, the following Friday, they said they were going to Cape Town (1400 km away) and they left me there, I think they were testing me. I stayed there the whole weekend until they came back. The second week they left again for Durban (570 km away) and they found me at work. From there I have never had a problem, I do everything, I set the alarm, I do everything. They just leave me and go, I will be at work, I have never had a thought to steal from them, because they treat me well. (Nokuthula, 41 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Participants indicated that the 'market' was one way to secure part-time work as well as to find more than one employer to fill in their working week. However, this method presented limited opportunities for negotiating working conditions and remuneration for the employees, as the employers had a wide range of workers to choose from.

4.4.3 Recruitment agencies

Five of the 26 study participants had made use of recruitments agencies with one of them being assisted by an agent in Zimbabwe. Domestic worker recruitment agencies are considered to be mediators between employers and domestic workers and often play the role of matching or pairing employers and workers according to specifications set by employers (Tsikata, 2011; Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2001). For an employment agency to assist a worker to find employment, the worker must register with the agency. Four agencies were interviewed in this study as key informants, thus differences were noted in their methods of operation and the services they provided. Three agencies, in this study referred to as P1, P2, and P3, were privately owned businesses, while Agency F1 was a faith-based informal employment agency. There are advantages for both employer and employee to use recruitment agencies in contrast to the two methods discussed above. Employers have access to employees with experience and who have been vetted. The owner of Agency P3 in Johannesburg stated:

> A lot of the people who hire domestics don't bother to check references and stuff, they just hire them off the street and that's the problem … so we do all that, we do the reference checking, the interviewing, we do the preliminary work for the customers because they don't have time (or) they don't want to. …We can do police checks if they want … we can pick up whether the person there is the real person or not. … But that does not always mean to say that the previous employer is honest because if I have, you and I have a dispute and I want to fire you but I don't want to go to CCMA, I will give you a good reference, so that you go and work somewhere else and then the problem goes away, so there are dishonest players but we try and see if we can pick that up. (Owner, Agency P3, Johannesburg)

The quote above gives a sense of the role of domestic worker agencies and the services they provide. While the agencies might operate in different ways, their main task, according to the key informants, is 'to source the candidates according to the requirements of the employers' as well as to vet the prospective employees through interviewing them and checking and verifying their references before they register them. Thus, as the key informants mentioned, their clients are both job seekers and employers.

According to agency officials, the characteristics of people seeking domestic work were that they were mostly black women from South Africa and other SADC countries, specifically those regarded as relatively poor, like Zimbabwe, Malawi, Lesotho, Swaziland. In terms of age, the workers were between 20 and 60 years. The age range of the participants in this study, ranging from 20 to 50 years as discussed in Chapter 3, is consistent with agency descriptions.

Turning to employers, agency officials stated that they dealt with a wide variety. For example:

> Manager: There is no majority that I can say, it's such a vast … and things are changing now ahh, so it's difficult to say this group of people take domestic workers...
>
> Owner: It's not area specific and it's not wealth specific because people who can't afford but both parties do work in the family unit, they usually also want someone even though it's once a week. But if they can't afford even once a week, then they will come in regularly just to get someone for the day but they can't … yah or afford a contract because they don't know their financial circumstances at any given time so really there is no demographics to say that this is how people look… (Manager and Owner, P1 Agency, Pretoria)

Data from the agency officials showed that in the sourcing of prospective candidates, there were variations in terms of the requirements needed for a job seeker to be registered. The key items were a reference letter and proof of identification, while others mentioned experience. For people coming from outside of South Africa, an additional requirement was proof of authorisation to legally work in the country. For example:

> … people that are coming in our database is people whose got three years' experience, they must have a legit ID, legit passport and legit work permits and yah, and they must be from 25-60 (age) to register with us. (Owner, Agency P2, Johannesburg)

> They must have … written references, obviously the reference letter must have an address, must be signed, must say how long she worked there, etc. They must have a valid ID or passport or work permit, we don't take asylum papers. So, passport, valid work permit or ID, reference letter – current references … for at least three years… (Owner, Agency P3, Johannesburg)

The above two comments came from privately owned agencies while officials at the informal agency stated that:

> … basically the people who come here to register, they can come from anywhere, they are people looking for jobs, we check that they have an ID, if they are foreigners, they need to have a passport with a work permit or an asylum form or other documentation from Home Affairs that says they are allowed to work in South Africa and in addition, they need at least one written reference. (Manager, Agency F1, Johannesburg)

Another difference was noted in the services provided by the informal agency where the key informant pointed out that:

> … we do not check with, follow up with the references, that is the employer's responsibility, we basically introduce them to the employer, the employer will then take it forward in terms of salary, verifying references etc. So, we basically check that they have an ID and that they [have] at least one written reference and then … employers will take the process forward, if they like someone they will contact the references, they will then set-up working conditions amongst them, pay etc, we don't dictate any of that we merely introduce them and then they will take it forward. (Manager, Agency F1, Johannesburg)

One of the reasons that could have contributed to this situation is that the informal agency relies on volunteers in their operations and therefore did not have resources to invest in the process of vetting and verification checks, which is different from the privately-owned agencies.

While the three quotes above indicate differences among the agencies in terms of the requirements for registration, they also highlight requirements stated by law for foreign nationals to work in the country. This is in line with the Immigration Act of 2002, which requires foreign nationals to obtain a temporary visa or permit to stay in the country and work legally. These requirements, especially from the privately owned agencies, illustrate the efforts being made to maintain standards in accordance with the law as well as to protect their reputations. Some of the reasons cited by agency officials for not considering asylum papers were:

> The problem if they have got an asylum, it's only valid for six months … so they work for six months and they need to go and get it renewed and it gets refused because it does happen. If they don't have a passport then they need to go back to Zimbabwe to get their passport sorted out and they don't come back. So, we want to have a valid work permit and a lot of the residential estates[11] do not take asylum papers. … There is massive penalties, massive, massive … penalty for employing say for instance a Zimbabwean without a valid work permit… (Manager, Agency P1, Pretoria)

---

[11] Residential estates are upmarket gated communities that provide a variety of facilities and recreational space such as parks. https://propertyfox.co.za/residential-estate-living/
Accessed 8 July 2020.

Through drawing attention to the limitations of asylum permits, the manager at Agency P1 corroborated some of the challenges raised by the participants pertaining to acquiring these documents as discussed earlier in the chapter. The chances of being registered as someone who did not have experience or references were slim and would only be successful if certain exceptions, such as undertaking training with a particular agency, were met. After training the agencies would send the job seekers for once-off or short work periods before they were registered so that the worker could build on their references and experience. This might however exclude foreign nationals who might not have the required documents such as the reference letter or experience of working in the sector.

The work permit that was accessible to care workers was the current Zimbabwe Exemption Permit, which preceded the Zimbabwe Special Permit, which in turn had preceded the Zimbabwe Dispensation Permit (Thebe, 2017). An article on the website of a domestic worker agency noted that employers could assist their employees from Zimbabwe to acquire the permit by writing a letter of employment and provided a template for the letter.[12] The letter was a requirement, in some cases including a written contract, by the Department of Home Affairs to support an application for the permit.

Recruitment agencies went through a vetting process in which they verified the authenticity of the documents provided by job seekers. In terms of the reference letters, they would make follow-up telephone calls to the previous employers. There was further step in the vetting process for foreign nationals:

> Yah, no we check, you can instantly see, if they open their passport, you can see if it was printed on an HP printer or whether it's the official document. If it's the official, first of all, the official permit, the signature will be in pen ink so the moment that you see that it looks like has been copied, you can know that that they have copied it, photoshopped, they have taken out the old name, passport number everything like that but with the real permit it will have ink signature on it. (Manager, Agency P1, Pretoria)

The owner of Agency P2 described a further two ways to verify identity documents from prospective job seekers, which were to contact officials at the Department of Home Affairs or through a short-message-service system that could indicate if there was a duplication of documents.

---

[12] https://www.marvellousmaids.co.za/articles/23-home-affairs-zimbabwean-dispensation-project, accessed 17 April 2019.

Even after passing through the vetting process, the chances of obtaining a job through an agency was slim. The agency officials noted that there were limited chances of finding a job given the economic conditions in South Africa, in particular because of the high unemployment rate in the country. The following quote from an agency official sums up the reality of limited employment opportunities: 'We don't have enough placements for them so you know, maybe for every 30 that come through the door to register, one or two might even get to the next interview… (Owner, Agency P3, Johannesburg). In addition, officials from Agency F1 noted that domestic workers often suffered a 'knock on' effect when their employers were affected by work restructuring exercises such as company closures and retrenchments.

Furthermore, agency officials cited documentation issues as one of the major challenges faced by migrant care workers.

> I think if you don't have a special permit then obviously you have to have an asylum form but those also have to be renewed all the time … now if you want to apply for work, you have to apply for it [work visa] in Zimbabwe, you can't apply for it here, so getting all the documentation right is probably a challenge… The special permits, like, expired in December last year, so they are busy issuing new ones but they haven't issued them all, so some people are sitting in the middle with a receipt with no permit. It's difficult for us to register them because we have no way to check if receipts become permits so when you get your new permit, we will register you but you know sometimes they sit in no-man's land. (Manager, Agency F1, Johannesburg)

The Department of Home Affairs had made a provision that applicants who had applied for permits and were still waiting for outcomes could use the receipt as proof of application.[13] Ideally this would mean that it would be easier for people who are already working to renew their permits; they could use the receipt of the application as proof to their employer. However, when seeking to secure a job with a new employer, the employer would insist on seeing the actual document, which left many care workers in a difficult position. Further, only a limited number of people could access these special permits. The manager at Agency F1 indicated that about 200 000 people had been issued with permits under the dispensation project, which is a small proportion of the estimated number of people from Zimbabwe migrating to South Africa. Evidence from the agencies seems to support observations made by Thebe (2017) on the limitations of South Africa's immigration policies, particularly the

---

[13] http://www.dha.gov.za/index.php/notices/1075-advisory-zimbabwean-exemption-permit-applicants, accessed 07 December 2019

Zimbabwe Dispensation project, in relation to managing and accommodating the 'complex' migration patterns and trends of foreign nationals arriving from SADC countries.

Some agencies reported that they do not charge domestic workers for their services in securing jobs for them as the employers would pay the charges. The owner of Agency P3 explained that he had heard that some agencies were charging around R350 (US$21) to register domestic workers, which he thought was 'unfair' and 'unscrupulous'. This was confirmed by participants who said they had been asked to pay a service fee by some agencies. The levying of a fee would disadvantage women in this sector especially those who did not have funds available.

4.4.4: Documentation and access to jobs

There were mixed views about the effects of not having the required documents to legally work in South Africa. Evidence from the participants highlights that it is a complex and nuanced issue where other factors come into play, such as the relationship with the employer as well as the race of the employer. However, the majority of workers pointed to the disadvantages of not having the required documents, particularly in salary negotiations. I draw from a conversation with one of the participants, Rufaro, and her sister, to highlight the different aspects that come into play in relation to migrant status, domestic work and job opportunities.

Rufaro was 36 years old at the time of the interview and a mother of two children. She was born in a family of five, with three sisters and a brother. Two of her sisters were living in South Africa; one was a part-time domestic worker (Rufaro lives with this sister during her off days and she calls this place home), and the other works in a restaurant. Rufaro's children were in Zimbabwe and were being cared for by her mother and another sister. I interviewed Rufaro at her sister's home in the presence of her sister, who also contributed to the interview. Rufaro's sister managed to acquire the special permit but Rufaro was not able to acquire one. Rufaro is one of the several participants who migrated to South Africa using a visitor's visa and have not managed to acquire proper working documents. Rufaro explained that she was initially not interested in migrating, however her sisters convinced her to come to South Africa after the company employing her in Zimbabwe had closed. She initially came to South Africa in 2012, worked, and then went back to Zimbabwe in 2014. In Zimbabwe, she failed to find a job and was forced to return to South Africa in 2015 so that she could take care of her children. She was now working for an Indian family with four children aged 18, 14, 12 and 4 years old. I asked her if she thought she had the same opportunities as her sister who has a work visa:

> Rufaro: … do you know that with many jobs here in South Africa, you can get a
> job, like this domestic work one, working for a white employer who will be

giving you a better salary but he/she will tell you that I want someone with a permit.

Rufaro's sister: It limits their opportunities because, for example with me, I have experience of working for different employers of different races. So what employers do; for someone who does not have the work papers, it's a disadvantage, firstly, with regards to the salary; because they know you don't have the papers and if they decide to pay you R2000 (US$118), because you are desperate for the job, you will agree. I have a permit right now; I can negotiate with the employer. If they say I can pay you R250 or R300 (US$15-18) per day, I can negotiate for more money, you see. So it's disadvantage to them because they don't have the papers. … Also the areas that you find employment. There are areas where they refuse asylum papers, its either work permit or ID, you see, so it's a very big disadvantage.

Rufaro: Do you know that there are other people employed as domestic workers who are earning around R5000 (US$295). … I don't have a permit I am earning R3000 (US$177), do you see the difference, but we will be doing a similar job. They (employers) take advantage, like Indians. That's why they don't ask; many Indians don't ask for work papers because they don't want to pay... (Rufaro, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Rufaro's sister pointed out that women without the right documents also had limited access to better paying jobs in the domestic sector as some areas, such as in residential estates where rich upper middle-class people were located, did not accept job seekers with asylum seekers permits, thus further limiting the opportunity to earn higher salaries. The above excerpt highlights that a number of factors come into play, such as nationality, migrant status, race, class, and gender, which are interlinked to the disadvantage of the care worker. As Rufaro's sister relates, women without the required work documents are disadvantaged in terms of job opportunities as well as salary negotiations because of their status. Rufaro's sister's comments that migrants are viewed as desperate further highlights their vulnerable positioning in the labour market. Participants also noted the multiple disadvantages for care workers, which are further reinforced by work they do as described by Ruvarashe, '…its tough, not having all the documents and to top it off being a domestic worker' (Ruvarashe, 35 live-out care worker, Johannesburg). They are marginalised and exploited based on their legal status. Ruvarashe's quote illustrates that both migrant status and domestic work relegated women to the bottom of the hierarchy in the labour market. This relates to Gurung (2009: 388-389)'s observations from her study on Nepali migrant women working in the United States that despite their varied positions in their country of origin, migrant women are often viewed in a single category of Third World women who are 'desperate' to earn money,

making them extremely vulnerable to exploitation. Thus, she argues that race/ethnicity, class, gender, legal/citizenship status 'create multiple layers of power, privilege, marginalisation and oppression' (Gurung, 2009: 379).

Other participants pointed out that without the proper work documents, they could only access low-paying jobs such as domestic work. For instance, when Tanyaradzwa recounted her job history in South Africa, she noted, 'I have just been doing domestic work. There are no other jobs that you will find in South Africa other than domestic work. To find jobs in South Africa, you have to have a work permit, they require a lot of documents. We don't have adequate documents' (Tanyaradzwa, Johannesburg). Thus, migrant women use other strategies to counter these disadvantages. For example, Vimbai realised that she was only finding jobs where she would be paid R1 500 (US$88) and decided to approach a recruitment agency using her sister's work visa and passport. As will be illustrated in Chapter 5, finding a job through an agency can ensure a higher salary as the agency can negotiate on the care worker's behalf. Another respondent, Carol, who used a similar strategy, pointed out that care workers would sometimes confide in their employers about their migrant status, depending on whether they developed a close relationship. Thus, migrant workers found themselves dependent on their employers in order to maintain their jobs as well as protection. This emphasises how the domestic sector is extremely privatised and informalised. It links to Griffin (2011)'s study on Lesotho migrant workers as she notes that domestic workers were dependent on their employers to protect them from state officials as they feared deportation. Being dependant on their employers highlights their vulnerability to exploitation. The strategy of using other people's documents did not only have implications for the migrant care worker but also for the employer's family as it raises questions about the risk and safety of care recipients. In cases where employers did not have background information on their care workers, it would be difficult to trace the employee.

This study highlights that undocumented migrant workers are vulnerable to exploitation where employers take advantage in salary negotiations resulting lower wages and have limited access to areas in which they can earn more and other job opportunities outside the domestic sector. These findings are consistent with other studies that highlight the vulnerability of irregular migrant workers (Pande, 2013; Griffin, 2011). However, some studies have highlighted 'better outcomes' in relation to the experiences for undocumented workers. For example, Lan (2007) and Mahdavi (2013) in their studies of migrant domestic workers in the Gulf countries argue that some workers under the Kafala system who find themselves illegal after escape from exploitation and abuse from them employers, become 'free' as they become autonomous. They become 'run-away workers' and 'freelancers' who have freedom to choose their employers; to leave an employer anytime as well as being able to earn more than when they were live-in contract workers. Further, (Pande, 2013) also noted that as freelancers, migrant domestic workers are able to live on their own which allows them

privacy, mobility and control of their time. She however argues that the benefits of freelance work are 'undermined' on an everyday basis by the 'uncertainty of income, fear of incarceration and deportation' (Pande, 2013: 431-432). She notes that migrant workers have to constantly seek for new employers and work in more houses to make ends meet and that the fear of being arrested limits their mobility in their search for freelance work. Pande argues that by making a migrant domestic worker illegal after escaping from the original employer, the Kafala system 'produces a class of easily exploitable workers' highlighting their vulnerability.

However, other participants felt that the absence of work documents did not have much influence on their ability to find domestic work as employers prioritised some form of identification such as a passport. One respondent noted that the issue of work documents had not been a major concern for her as she just wanted a job to help her raise money to pursue her other goals.

4.5 Discussion and Conclusion

This chapter discussed the migration processes of Zimbabwean migrant care workers in South Africa. Key issues explored were the reasons for migration, as well as the women's documentation or migrant status on arrival in South Africa. The chapter revealed that, consistent with the global literature, the pull factors were mainly economic, specifically the prospect for jobs in South Africa that could offer better remuneration and hence enhance the women's ability to support their children and other family members back in Zimbabwe. The deterioration in the political and economic situation in Zimbabwe emerged as the major push factor.

In terms of migration process, it emerged that most of the women entered the country legally using visitors' visas. Only a few managed to subsequently acquire work visas or asylum permits. In consequence, many of the care workers stay and work in the country illegally. That the women face challenges in obtaining legal documentation due to their being unskilled or semi-skilled is consistent with the global literature regarding migrant workers (Fish, 2013; United Nations, 2015; Newland and Riester, 2018; Vanyoro, 2019a; King-Dejarddin, 2019).

The chapter also revealed that unlike in South-North global care chains where migration is facilitated either by the state through bilateral agreements or temporary labour migration programmes as well as through recruitment agencies that facilitate the processing of work visas, employment contracts and travel fees, the migration of Zimbabwean women to South Africa is 'informalised' and not regulated. The women typically make their own plans to migrate (Zack et al., 2019) and, in line with the concept of transnationalism, social networks play an important role in facilitating the process of migration.

By the same token, once in South Africa the women enter domestic sector employment informally and typically take up full-time, live-in working arrangements. This is in contrast to other migration flows such as those from Africa to the Middle East where domestic workers rely on recruitment agencies and brokers, some operated under government-provided guidelines, to obtain employment (Laiboni (2020). According to Laiboni, these guidelines often require all migrant domestic and care workers to register with the ministry responsible for labour and employment by submitting documents such as valid passports, employment contracts, visas and work permits and other documents supporting their migration. In other instances, migration processes are supported by bi-lateral agreement between the sending country and the destination country. This ensures that the migration process is more formalised and potentially assists in protecting the rights of migrant care workers. South Africa, on the other hand, does not have specific guidelines on the migration of domestic and care workers.

It is noteworthy, however, that overall migration between Zimbabwe and South Africa is guided by regional instruments such as the 2003 SADC Charter for Fundamental Social Rights, which seeks to 'promote labour policies, practices and measures which facilitate labour mobility' and 'to promote the establishment and harmonisation of social security systems'. Article 10 of the Charter also encourages member states to create an enabling environment so that every worker in the region shall have a right to adequate social protection and enjoy adequate social benefits regardless of status and type of employment. In 2013, the regional body launched the SADC Labour Migration Action Plan under which the SADC Labour Migration Policy Framework (2014) was developed. The main objective of this framework is to 'promote the sound management of intra-regional labour migration for the benefit of both the sending and receiving country'. One of the objectives of this framework is the development of national labour migration policies. Through the development of national labour migration policies, the SADC Labour Migration Policy Framework seeks to ensure that all types of migrant workers are protected against discrimination at the workplace and to promote portability of social security benefits. To meet this requirement, the South African Department of Labour was, at the time of finalising this thesis, developing a Draft National Labour Migration Policy to be implemented in 2020.

In the meantime, without legal documentation, migrant care workers cannot seek employment through formal channels such as recruitment agencies; officials of such agencies indicated they could only register migrant workers who had valid and legitimate work visas. In line with the country's immigration regulations, agency officials reported that they and prospective employers require proof of a valid work visa as there were hefty penalties for employing migrant workers without proper documentation. Further, the officials from privately owned recruitment agencies also corroborated evidence from some of the participants that employers would not accept asylum permits. As a result, it is not uncommon

for migrant workers to stay and work in the country with expired visitor's visas. This is not unique to Zimbabwean migrants; it was also noted in studies of women migrants from Lesotho (Makoro, 2015; Griffin, 2010). For these 'overstayers' as well as for women still back in Zimbabwe, using social networks, as stated above, is the most common method to find employment. While networks of relatives and friends are often invaluable in assisting with initial accommodation, information on employment opportunities, prevailing working conditions in the domestic services sector and remuneration, this method has its limitations. When aware of the migrant's illegal status, employers often have more control and discretion in terms of employment conditions as well as remuneration. Thus, compared to those found through recruitment agencies, jobs acquired through social networks do not offer protection to care workers. Agencies, for example, insist upon a written contract, which is used to regulate the employment relationship. They also play a role in salary negotiations and therefore play a key role in ensuring that care workers' rights are protected as will be discussed in Chapter 5.

The study highlighted the limited role that agencies in South Africa play in terms of their involvement in migration. This is in contrast to literature from other African countries as well as on South-North migration flows, which suggests that recruitment agencies contribute to the exploitation of migrant care workers. Agencies may charge exorbitant fees to assist migrant workers to find employment and acquire travel documents (Anderson, 2000; Romero, 2018; World Health Organisation, 2017). They can confiscate migrants' passports, deduct travel costs and other expenses from their salaries (World Health Organisation, 2017; McGregor, 2007; Romero, 2018). Thus, upon arrival in the destination country, migrants are often under pressure to find work so that they are able to pay the debt that they would have accrued in the migration process (Anderson, 2000). Studies have also noted that recruitment agencies violate the ILO Convention on Domestic Workers through practices such as agency managers justifying the pay discrimination against migrant domestic workers on the basis of nationality, as well as recommending that their clients exert strict control or use force to manage workers, or they provide false information about job opportunities in the destination country and/or offer misleading contracts written in a language difficult for domestic workers to understand (Ghaddar et al., 2018; Laiboni, 2020; De Regt, 2010b). While my interviews with recruitment agency officials did not expose the role they might play in the exploitation of domestic workers, apart from pointing out that there are agencies that charge migrant workers for registration, media reports have highlighted abuse and exploitation of migrant

women by 'illegal agencies', including one report that migrant women were being held in the backyard of a home where they were being trained and waited for prospective employers[14].

Faced with barriers to acquiring legal documentation, and with the dire economic and political situation in Zimbabwe rendering returning home almost an impossibility, many migrant workers continue to work illegally, and some acquire jobs through means that can place employers and their family members who need care in danger. For example, as discussed in this chapter, some care workers may use other people's identification documents, thus employers may not have correct information about the care worker. What this essentially means is that a sizeable number of vulnerable family members including children and the elderly in South Africa may be under the care of 'strangers'. Among other things, such workers are notorious for simply quitting without any notice when they are unhappy and dissatisfied with their work arrangements (Muasya, 2014). This leaves many employers insecure and vulnerable because they never know when the carer may leave them (Tracy, 2008, as cited by Muasya, 2014). Furthermore, as Muasya (2014: 152-153) commented on the use of house helps in Kenya:

> To the extent that they are tasked with some of the most sensitive responsibilities in any household (such as looking after very young children and household goods), and that many of them are in fact strangers to their employers, if the employment relationship sours they can – as anecdotal evidence suggests – harm the children or collude with criminals to rob the employers of their valuable belongings.

The news reports captured in Figures 4.1 and 4.2 highlight the realities outlined above as they describe the kidnapping of two infants by their nannies from Zimbabwe. The articles illustrate the emotional distress suffered by the two employers after their children had been kidnapped; not having information on their whereabouts and well-being of the children. They also draw attention to the high risk of loss and insecurity related to kidnappings where parents remain unsure if their children as well as other valuable property will be returned safely. It may create preconceived ideas which may have a negative impact on the employment of migrant workers landing weight to observations from Du Toit (2016)'s study on house cleaning services in South Africa which highlight that concerns over trust and theft issues and unpleasant attitudes are among the reasons why Zimbabwean women are sometimes not employed by the companies.

---

[14] News report on the abuse of migrant domestic workers. See (https://www.enca.com/south-africa/are-domestic-workers-new-slave-trade), accessed 12 July 2020

These articles highlight the shortcomings of using informal channels to recruit care workers. With these channels of recruitment, there are no background checks or verification of references from previous employers who can attest to employment conduct, all of which can be accomplished when using recruitment agencies that provide such services. In contrast, countries in the Global North that have migration programmes for care workers require a work visa and permit and through the application process will collect data including biometric information, residence history, employment history and a criminal record certificate, which allows authorities to track the person should the individual commit any crime. Thus, unlike in the Global North, the challenges of global care chains can extend to families in need of care.

Kidnapped city baby found after 3 days

Mom relives hell of searching for snatched baby – abductor tracked down by cellphone

NOMASWAZI NKOSI

nomswazi.nkosi@inl.co.za

THREE days of searching and a mother's valiant efforts to find her baby bore fruit when her 5-month-old daughter and the captor were found on Saturday.

The baby disappeared from the Orchards complex where the family lives early on Wednesday morning, taken by the nanny the mother had hired the previous evening.

Thandi Baloyi, 32, said she had determined from the onset that she would not give up until her daughter was safely in her arms.

Baby Nhluto Baloyi was found safely. Her captor was arrested on Saturday afternoon.

Baloyi said that a few months ago she had met a woman named "More Blessings" who was looking for a job.

"I met her at the beginning of March when I was walking to Spar. She told me she was struggling. We exchanged numbers so I could help her look for a job," Baloyi said.

The woman kept calling Baloyi to see if she had found her a job.

When Baloyi's maternity leave came to an end she found herself in a predicament as she had no one to leave her baby with because her only nanny had not arrived for work.

She contemplated taking her daughter to daycare but her aunt dissuaded her, saying the child was too young and a nanny would be best. "She (the alleged kidnapper) was the first person I thought of so I contacted her and told her I was stranded. I called her late, maybe after 5pm, but she agreed to come immediately."

Baloyi said she believed that the woman's intentions had always been to steal her baby because the very day she arrived she tried to abduct the baby.

"She tried to get the complex exit code from one of the residents, but did not succeed." However, the following morning the same woman eventually agreed and gave her the code.

Baloyi only realised her baby was missing when she got back from work. The frantic search began.

She went to the police station where she opened a missing person's report, but was told by police that she would have to wait until Monday to get documents from court that would allow for the alleged kidnapper's cellphone to be used to trace her.

She also took to Facebook and Twitter to raise awareness for her missing baby.

In a stroke of luck, the woman had also stolen Baloyi's son's cellphone, through which she was tracked.

The cellphone led them to Soshanguve and Ga-Rankuwa. Baloyi and her family split up to search for the baby.

"Can you believe this woman apparently told her boyfriend that she had a child. She even went to the South African Social Security Agency to register for a child grant."

While Baloyi was in Soshanguve Block JJ, where the woman apparently lives, other members of her family were in Ga-Rankuwa Zone 20 where the baby and the nanny were found.

It is believed the woman - who is from Zimbabwe may have stolen the baby to prove to her boyfriend she had been pregnant and had given birth.

"Apparently when she was caught she said she was a triplet and that she did not steal the baby," Baloyi said.

The mother said now that her child was back home she was over the moon but the three days of searching had taken its toll on her.

"At least now I can sleep. I was very strong because of the support I got every day but when I had to sleep I was very stressed because that's when reality set in."

After the baby was found Baloyi took her to the clinic to be checked as she said her child had been fed pap and soup, which was not healthy for a 5-month-old.

"She didn't even have nappies for my daughter. She used a shirt," the mother said.

She advised all mothers to be careful and use this as a lesson.

"I used to see this on TV. Little did I know that one day it would be me."

She said that she would never again look for a nanny and would instead take her daughter to her cousin's day care where she knows she will be safe.

Figure 4.2: Newspaper report from The Star, 07.02.2012

Mom pleads for baby's life after nanny takes him

GRAEME HOSKEN

"DON'T hurt my baby. Please don't hurt my baby."

This was the emotional appeal from a Pretoria nurse to her infant son's nanny, who allegedly kidnapped the six-month-old baby boy while she lay asleep next to his cot.

Standing outside her modest home yesterday, Mita Marobe, 33, fought back tears as she described finding her only child, Kgosietsile, missing.

The kidnapping, thought to be over a wage dispute, is believed to have been carefully orchestrated, with the nanny apparently spending weeks planning the crime.

It is believed the the 21-year-old Zimbabwean woman erased photographs and videos of herself with Kgosietsile from the family's cellphones and a laptop computer, taking back copies of her asylum documents from the Marobe family on the pretence of having to update them, and destroying documents which could lead the police to her.

It also saw the woman, who has worked for the family since November, telling Kgosietsile's niece on Sunday night that she was going to kidnap the boy. The suspect is believed to have turned off Marobe's alarm before locking her and other family members in the house.

Hours after the kidnapping, Kgosietsile's nanny, who also allegedly stole R5 000, Marobe's cellphone and her bank cards, sent a text message demanding R45 000 in cash and the PIN to her bank cards, and ordered her not to involve the police if she wanted to see her son alive.

"I will not let her get away with this," said Kgosietsile's father, Jacob Gavua, a Ghanaian national.

Marobe said: "She took nothing for him. No food, no extra clothes, nothing except what he was wearing. She has money, but now she says she desperately needs the PIN for my bank cards so she can buy him food.

"I believe she wants us to think she still has him to get us to give her more money, but I am petrified that she has already dumped him and left him for dead," said Marobe.

Marobe, who teaches at the Pretoria Nursing College, said they were not rich.

"I am a nurse and my husband is a hairstylist. We don't have this money. If I had it I would give it. I would give her anything just to get my baby back," she said.

When Marobe awoke and found her son missing, she began screaming.

In an emotional message to her son and his nanny, Marobe pleaded for his safe return.

"I love you, my little one. I love you so much. You will soon be back home."

Asked about the wage allegations, Marobe said they met the nanny through a domestic worker agency and claimed to have paid her on Friday.

"She went home for the weekend and came back on Sunday. She never said anything about being unhappy before she left or when she came back. I never thought she could do this. She was part of the family. Kgosietsile loves her and I always thought she loved him."

Police spokeswoman Warrant Officer Annerie Robinson said a case of kidnapping and extortion had been opened.

She said they were following various leads and that they were looking for a Linette Moyo who could assist them with their investigation.

Anyone with information can contact Crime Stop on 08600 10111.

> **She took nothing for him. No food, no extra clothes.**

78

CHAPTER 5: WORKING EXPERIENCE

5.1   Introduction

This chapter explores the working conditions of Zimbabwean migrant care workers in South Africa in relation to their main duties, contractual agreements, working hours, rest and leave arrangements, remuneration as well as employers' adherence to labour laws. Such an exploration is important because of the key distinctive feature of domestic work is the workplace – the employer's home. Being different from traditional workplaces, private households are difficult to regulate (Kontos and Bonifacio, 2015; Masterson and Hoobler, 2019; International Labour Organisation, 2018a). Overall, the quality of the working conditions in these spaces is left up to individual employers and, as a result, there is high potential for exploitation of employees. For example, as noted earlier, isolation and lack of privacy especially with regard to live-in domestic workers, are characteristic of private households.

An exploration of domestic workers' working conditions is also important as this sector in many developing countries is generally characterised by informal relations that can exacerbate exploitation of the workers. In general, there is a power imbalance as the quality of working conditions is left to the discretion of employers who have control over the hiring as well as working conditions such as working hours, remuneration and other employment decisions (Gurung, 2009). Other labour abuses suffered by migrant domestic workers – often due to their work being informal or undeclared – include non-payment as well as underpayment of wages, non-payment of overtime and breach of contractual agreements (Figueiredo et al., 2018).

Migrant care workers also face different forms of discrimination and disadvantages based on factors such as gender, class, nationality, legal status, among others (Pyle, 2006; Gurung, 2009; Figueiredo et al., 2018). For example, in an analysis of employment policies and working conditions in Singapore, Hong Kong and Taiwan, (Wang et al., 2018) found that compared to their migrant counterparts, local domestic workers had better working conditions such as more clearly defined job descriptions, higher daily wages, better leave arrangements, and freedom to change employers. Gurung (2009) posits that this extent of abuse and exploitation, which in some instances is also racist, is largely based on views of migrants being at the bottom of the social hierarchy and having no agency to insist on better labour conditions.

5.2 Working conditions of Zimbabwean care workers in South Africa

5.2.1 Main duties

The typical work for the majority of care workers included balancing everyday housework and childcare responsibilities. One of the participants argued that she was, in essence, doing the work of two employees, that is, as a cleaner and a 'nanny', as childcare responsibilities increased the workload. Another respondent, commenting on her previous work experience, highlighted that,

> I was looking after three children … a six-year-old, a four-year-old and a one year, six-month-old baby. So, cooking for the children, bathing them … and looking after three growing children is not joke, plus the house was big… (Anna, 29 year-old, live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Thus, participants noted that they had to juggle domestic work and childcare, which increased pressure on them. In addition, others raised concerns over having to do additional work, which was not part of the agreed job description, including pet care and other duties assigned by the employers; hence their work was unstructured. This extra workload was not in tandem with the remuneration. Abigail, who had moved from being a live-in employee to part time, noted that in her live-in experiences she had carried out work related to her employer's work, such as helping to sew curtains for her employer who was an interior decorator, or assisting in their farming business. She pointed out, 'So, you note that you don't have time to rest and you still have to do your daily housework, as well as taking care of the baby and these other jobs' (Abigail, Johannesburg). As Abigail noted, an expanded workload would result in employees not having adequate time to rest. This confirms observations raised by Cox (2016) that households in the Global South usually employ a domestic worker who does care work together with other household tasks. As care work is a central issue in this study the discussion will focus on caring responsibilities and the perceptions that care workers held over the work they did in regard to emotional labour. Scholars associate care work with emotional labour, which refers to controlling or using emotions in a way that is beneficial to the activities that one is involved in. It is the management of emotions where it can mean showing or hiding negative emotions (Näre, 2009; Bikova, 2017). These two scholars highlight that care involves different forms of emotional labour as care workers may develop emotional bonds with their care recipients.

When asked about their caring responsibilities, care workers in this study highlighted a number of tasks they undertook during the day that included waking up early to help the children prepare for school, cooking for them, bathing them, washing their clothes, taking them to and from school and at times assisting the children with their homework, as well

playing with them. The participants pointed out that the workload increased depending on the age of the children as well as the number of children they were caring for, as highlighted in the quote from Anna earlier. Caring for children was associated with long hours as care workers were expected to be working during the night. Another significant task related to monitoring the children. As a result, care workers considered their work to be challenging and stressful.

Participants compared the differences between general cleaning and care work to show that care work required more attention from them. For example, Sibongile had worked as a domestic worker for a number of years and had undertaken training as an au pair. At the time of the interviews, she was looking after a two-year-old girl and her caring responsibilities included undertaking educational activities with her. She noted:

> Cleaning is easy, not stressful, looking after the child is very stressful, you see, and you have to drive the child around, anything can happen, you can get involved in an accident; things like that, there are so many risks and so many challenges, I will say. It's not like as easy as cleaning because cleaning, you just go in, iron whatever you iron and go; yah, I will say no questions asked. So, at the end of the day, I have to tell my employer, what have we done, if we have done any activities, how did I come up with this plan, what do I think the child learnt…
> (Sibongile, 33 year-old, live-out care-worker, Johannesburg)

Sibongile contends that there is a lot of supervision that comes with care work as she must account to her employer about the activities she had done with the child. This relates to another important task noted by the care workers, which was monitoring and taking care of the child's wellbeing. Care workers had to monitor the children in everything they did, including playing. Another participant, Sifiso, noted that while care work might be considered light and not strenuous as it included playing, it was challenging because care workers were expected to monitor the children constantly and to follow strict instructions from the employer:

> Its only that with children, the work is not strenuous but caring for children is tough, because of the regulations when you are taking care of children are challenging. The children are not supposed to get hurt, because you are expected to be monitoring them. For example, where I used to work, you were expected to ensure they finish all their food during meals, the children were supposed to sleep, it's a must, whether they like it or not, and you have to ensure that they sleep. So in taking care of children, its better because you will be not be doing a lot of work, just playing with the children, doing simple work but in reality, it's

not simple to take care of a child. (Sifiso, 30 year-old, live-out care worker, Johannesburg)

Following strict instructions from the parents of children made care work exceptionally stressful for the participants. As care workers are expected to provide round the clock service, participants associated care work with a lack of sleep, confinement, and isolation. Two quotes illustrate these challenges faced by care workers:

> What made me leave the job was because I would not sleep, the child was very fussy that after every two hours, you had to wake up to prepare his bottle of milk, carry him on your back and change diapers. So after every two hours I had to wake up and I was not sleeping well … I only concentrated on the child but the work was painful because you would not sleep – when you about to sleep, the baby would wake up, after you put him to sleep, before you fell asleep, the two hours would be up and he would wake up. So I was not getting enough rest. (Thandeka, 35 year-old, live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

> The biggest challenge is the baby is 'dumped' on you, you are always with the baby and your mind ends up not coping, you feel like you are boxed in and you become unaware of issues that are taking place in the outside world. … You are always indoors with the child 24/7, all you know is stuff related to the child… (Abigail, 44 year old part-time care worker, Johannesburg)

Abigail believed that parents in South Africa were not keen on spending time with their children and therefore often took advantage of care workers by shifting their responsibilities to them. She argued that sharing the responsibilities between the parents and the care worker would make her work easier.

Several participants became attached to the children they were looking after. In some cases, participants were expected to build relationships with the employer's children. For example, Yolanda said that she enjoyed the time she played with the children and emphasised that the parents encouraged her to have a relationship with their children as they wanted her to be 'open' to the children and the children to be 'open' to her. Ratidzo noted that her care responsibilities included '(to) also give them happiness. The employer is not around most of the time so usually I prefer to befriend the child so that the child does not think about her mom too much and also so that she gets used to me and not be afraid of me' (Ratidzo, 34 year old live-in care worker, Johannesburg). For others, an emotional investment resulting from the time they spent with the children could end in an experience of loss. Rumbizai had been looking after two children and when I met her, she had recently been unfairly dismissed from

her job. She pointed out that even after she had been dismissed, she still loved one of the children she had taken care of since he was born:

> I am not sure what happens with children, I loved the child … I don't know, if the child cried … the parents would have disagreements often so most of the time, I would be with the child. They would break up and separate and I would stay at home with the child when the parents would desert their house, then I would be left in the house with the child. They would resolve their issues and come back. (Rumbidzai, 25 year-old, live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Näre (2009) argues that building relationships with care recipients was part of emotional labour as care workers became emotionally attached to them. She further argues that emotional attachment is vital for 'good care'. The concept of emotional labour is defined as the 'the management of feeling to create a publicly observable facial and bodily display; emotional labour is sold for a wage and therefore had exchange value (Hochschild, 2012: 29). She argues that emotional labour requires a worker to 'induce or suppress' feelings in a way that will benefit another person. Thus, with emotional labour, the employer not only purchases the physical labour but also the emotions of the worker. According the Hochschild, employees may be trained on how to feel towards something. With care work, employers expect the workers to be show care and love towards their children. As the participants pointed, they were also expected to build relationships with their employer's children and ensure that they were happy in the absence of the parents. As Rumbidzai pointed out, she developed a strong bond with the child as she considered him her child. Building a relationship and forming emotional attachments with employers' children could be advantageous to care workers as employers preferred them to focus on the children and were therefore willing to overlook other job responsibilities such as cleaning. For example, Vimbai explained;

> But in terms of all the other work, she (employer) is that person who is not concerned about a lot of things, her main focus is on her children, for instance, if one of her children gets hurt and you do not tell her, she will be cross with you. If she comes and the house is a bit messy, she doesn't mind about the house things, but her children. … So I can say, the work is not very demanding. (Vimbai, 33 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Hondagneu-Sotelo (2001) contends that both parents and care workers could use care work to their benefit, thus emotional attachment was vital for the labour process as it allowed for trade- offs where parents would allow care workers to concentrate on care work and less on house work. However, it could also be a disadvantage as participants felt they were giving more attention to their employer's children than their own. In their responsibilities, care

workers reported that one of the major challenges they faced was in relation to disciplining the children. In most cases, they found it difficult to discipline the employer's children as they were not allowed to by the parents.

The interview with Ruvarashe highlighted a striking case of the extra workload that domestic workers may be presented with. Ruvarashe was a live-out employee working in a household with four children – two aged 14, a five-year-old and a two-year-old. Her focus was on taking care of the two youngest children. Apart from caring for her employer's children, she was simultaneously providing a baby-sitting service for children from three-month-old infants and above in her employer's household as part of her duties. At the time of the interview, she was looking after four children as part of the baby-sitting service. Ruvarashe was juggling looking after her employer's children as well those from the baby-sitting service. Her duties included cleaning, as well as the daily routine of feeding the children at 8am and 12 noon, potty-training them, changing diapers and training the children to follow a routine that included play time and sleeping time. Ruvarashe pointed out that she had taken an online course on caring for young children. The charges for the baby sitting were between R350 and R700 depending on the number of times they came per week and the age of the child. This case raised questions about the health and safety of the children as she was taking care of them in her employer's lounge. In a context of the high cost of formal and private day care centres, the baby-sitting service offered a cheaper alternative.

5.2.2 Contractual agreements

The Basic Conditions of Employment Act regulates working hours, payment of overtime, leave arrangements including annual leave, sick leave, family responsibility leave and maternity leave, and termination of employment. The Sectoral Determination 7 makes provision for an employer to issue a domestic worker with 'written particulars of employment', which contain details of the terms of employment. (Van der Westhuizen and Murray, 2015) provide a template for a contract adapted from the Act. According to Van der Westhuizen and Murray (2015: 18), an employee may not be required to work for more than 45 hours per week, which can be divided as nine hours a day for a five-day week and eight hours a day for a six-day week. In terms of remuneration, the Sectoral Determination makes provisions for the minimum wage for domestic workers which is amended every year. It emerged that contractual agreements depended largely on whether workers found their jobs through an agency or other means.

In upholding the regulations provided for by the legislation, officials at recruitment agencies emphasised a written contract. After the vetting and registration of prospective employees and matching them to the requirements of the employers, another task of agencies was to facilitate contractual agreements between employer and employee:

There should be a contract, that's very key because very often what will happen is, at the interview, I tell you things and you ask questions, you think I said this, I think I said that and there is nothing in writing so then when a problem comes up, it becomes a big problem. … Yah it must be a written and signed contract, signed by both parties and it's a very basic one, I mean, basically it tells you your responsibilities, what you can do, what you can't do, your working hours and your pay because some people will say I am not going to pay overtime, its included in the money, we say by law you have to. Also, the working hours is a problem because, a lot of people want more than what is stipulated in the Labour Act and they will say no initially but once you get there then they make the domestic work longer hours etc, so the contract is key. (Owner, Agency P3, Johannesburg)

Similarly:

… we see that everything according to the Basic Conditions of Employment Act is all there before we place a worker with a client. … We help them with the contracts, payslips, we work out the leave for them, if there is any issues, disciplinary actions and everything, we do that… (Manager, Agency P1, Pretoria)

Notwithstanding the foregoing, the agencies noted the difficulties in enforcing written contracts, further emphasising the private relationship that employers and employees have in this sector. The owner of Agency P2 revealed that while the agency preferred the contracts to be signed in their presence, in some cases employers were not willing to do so, highlighting the challenges in making employers commit to written contracts:

… we mostly prefer that when they sign, they must be here so that when she says something we do not understand, because sometimes the lady will be shy or not wanting to question the client. But there are those that you see, they do not want us to be there. Most of the time when we say to them, 'We can do the contract', they will say, 'Let me take the contract with me and then I will look at it at home and, when I need something from you, I will let you know.' Sometimes it very hard to keep on pressing … so most of the times, we leave them to do that and then when something happens, we say you can bring both your contracts, so that we can go through the contracts where we find out there was no contract that was signed… (Owner, Agency P2, Johannesburg)

This challenge was also raised by Tsikata (2011) who argued that recruitment agencies in the domestic sector are not practically involved in the employment relationship and often leave the terms of conditions to be negotiated by the employer and the employee. The relationship

between the agency and the employer might be limited to three months when the agency might remain fully involved, as formal agencies give a three-month guarantee or trial period during which time the employee may be replaced if the employer is not happy.

Notwithstanding assertions from the agencies about the importance of written contracts, only two participants had signed a written contract in their current employment while the majority had verbal agreements. Two participants, Vimbai and Lucia, had also experienced changes in the form of the contractual agreements they had with their employers, with Vimbai moving from written to verbal and Lucia moving from a verbal to a written contract, highlighting some important factors that come into play in contractual agreements. While some participants said they were happy with verbal agreements, there were mixed views about both types of contractual agreements. Participants highlighted the advantages and disadvantages of both written and verbal contracts based on their experience. Some of the advantages highlighted for the verbal contracts were that they were flexible, and employees were not bound to the contract. The major challenge with this type of agreement was in the failure to comply with the agreement by employers. Participants highlighted discrepancies between the duties that had been prescribed in the agreement and the ongoing situation in practice, as well as lack of transparency. Thus, verbal contracts gave room for exploitation as they gave control to the employer.

Participants noted a general reluctance by employers to draw up written contracts for them. Lucia initially had a verbal agreement, which later became a written contract. She was 44 years old and worked for a family with two children aged 10 and 5 years. Commenting on the agreement she had with her employer, she said:

> It was a verbal agreement, initially she said, 'Should I draft a contract, or we are helping each other?' Then I asked her what she thought. Then she said, 'Ahh, because of the money I am paying you (that is the amount that she started paying when I started working for her), if we check the amount that is stipulated by the law, its lower than what I am offering you. I asked her what she wanted to do and then she said, 'So let me just consider as we are helping each other, then I worked for three years. After that, she later said she had decided to draft a contract and she drafted a contract which was in favour of her, then I said no… (Lucia, 44 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

The interaction between Lucia and her employer highlights that it is an employer's discretion whether an employee should have a contract or not, and that the employer can decide at will the details of the contract and when it can be signed. This, in a way, is in line with the argument by Gurung (2009), that domestic work is considered part of the informal labour as employers recruit employees through relatives and friends and word of mouth. Employment

and hiring practices carried out in this way ensure that the employer has 'autonomy in hiring and deciding the wages, working conditions and work-related policies and decisions' (Gurung, 2009: 385). Gurung further notes that the employer has the power to change the rules and policies at any time without consulting the employee, emphasising the unequal power relations. Lucia's conversation with her employer points to an intersection of gender and class relations, which works to disadvantage the domestic worker. Lucia's employer diminishes the value of domestic work as real work by considering it to be 'helping each other', and not as work that needs to be adequately remunerated. This corroborates Romero (2018)'s argument that domestic work is viewed as non-work as it seen as part of women's reproductive labour, which is generally done for free and remains invisible in the minds of those it is done for. 'Helping each other' in Lucia's context allowed her employer to meet her social reproduction responsibilities through her employee.

According to participants, the race of the employer had a strong influence on the type of agreement that was used. They believed black employers were more reluctant to have written agreements. For example, Abigail pointed out that:

> … in most cases, employers who prefer written contracts are white. Black people don't do written contracts, its mostly verbal and if we agree, then it's a done deal. [This is] because when they employ you, they will tell you the work you need to do, because I have done part-time jobs, even part time or full time, when you get there, they will give you a description of the job, details on the salary and the off days, they will ask you if you have any queries, if you are happy then you sign an agreement. That's what they do, black employers do not want to sign contracts. (Abigail, 44 year-old part time care worker, Johannesburg)

One participant linked verbal agreements to the fact that she was not registered for UIF. The participant contrasted it with her previous employer who was white and had registered her for UIF. Only two participants stated that they had been registered for UIF with their previous employers. Griffin (2010) discusses the lack of written contracts for migrant domestic workers from Lesotho working in South Africa in the context of 'illegality' where they did not have adequate work documents. While this could be one of the possible reasons to attribute to the situation of Zimbabwean migrants, other factors are relevant as some of the women with work visas and asylum papers allowing them to be employed in South Africa also did not have written contracts.

The reason given by care workers for their preference for verbal contracts was because of flexibility. The participants perceived that verbal agreements gave room for interaction between the employer and employee to resolve issues. However, this was dependent on the

relationship between the employer and the employee. For example, two quotes highlight this perception:

> … because you know whenever there is a contract, you know the bosses are very strict because at times you end up signing a contract whereby, you are not allowed to talk to neighbours you are not allowed to … but since there is no contract, we talk, whenever I do something they don't like, or even if they do something I don't like, we sit down and we talk. (Carol, 35 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

> For me, since she is a good 'right' person, I just said its ok, but may be if she was that kind of person who is 'rough-rough', I would have said let's have a written contract for future's sake. But because she is a good person, I agreed. (Chido, 28 year-old live in care-worker, Pretoria)

Carol believes that a written contract regulates the relationship between the employer and the employee and formalises the employment relationship, hence it limits chances of a more personal relationship. This further highlights the unique nature of domestic work as it involves intimate relations between employer and employee. She also believes there are more stringent rules when there is a written contract. To add to this, another participant, Rufaro, noted that employers tend to take some matters lightly when there is a verbal agreement, which could be different if there was written contract, citing damages that could be deducted from the employee's salary. However, as both Carol and Chido make clear, this is dependent on the attitude and understanding of the employer.

As noted earlier, verbal agreements leave room for exploitation mostly in relation to prescribed duties, workload and working hours, as these could change at any time (to be discussed in detail in the next section). Several participants noted discrepancies in the work they had agreed to initially and what they were doing later, which was to their disadvantage. For example, Fungai, lamented:

> … now I am realising that I made a mistake, I should have asked for a written contract. It was a verbal agreement. So I think she was taking advantage as she had a problem and needed help… (Fungai, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

Thus, participants noted that a written contract is preferable as it gives employees a voice to query unfair practices. Written contracts were seen as a form of protection from exploitation by the care workers.

I think a written one is important, because if you have a written contract, once they deviate you can always refer back to the contract, sit down and discuss. But if its verbal, it's difficult, the employer may say we discussed this when you did not. So a written contract is necessary where you state the working conditions, working hours and salary. (Thandeka, 35 year old, live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Based on the care workers narratives on the preference of written contracts and their experiences with verbal contracts; in the absence of written contracts, workers did not have the protection that the document offered adding another layer of vulnerability. Ntisa and Selesho (2014) argue that an employment contract has a huge impact on job security as it a facilitator for job security. They stress that to have a sense of job security, workers need to believe that employers will not make 'unfair and arbitrary decisions' about their employment. In their study of domestic workers in Vanderbijlpark in South Africa, the authors found that 53% of the workers in their study did not written contracts which they argue constitutes a lack of job security. Without the employment contracts which give details the rights and obligations of the domestic worker, the employers are not under pressure to follow the labour standards as set by the law. Ntisa and Selesho (2014) further argue that a contract plays an important role in clarifying what is to be expected from each party and conclude that,

"Thus, no matter how widely domestic workers are covered by labour laws in the New South Africa, and no matter the efficiency of South African labour legislation, domestic workers will continue to suffer the perception and recognition in the minds of domestic employers if they continue to form employment relationships with their employers in the absence of valid contracts of employment" (Ntisa and Selesho, 2014: 226).

Without a written contract, care workers did not have a basis on which to contest unfair labour practices. This is further compounded by the care workers' documentation status. Thus, the workers were not protected and lacked job security. This is also consistent with Griffin (2011) observations that without the ability to seek legal recourse, migrant workers experience dependency and exploitability because their circumstances depend on a particular employer and the relationship they have with them.

5.2.3 Working hours

While some care workers were happy with the flexible conditions and working hours they enjoyed in their place of work, the majority of live-in workers were concerned that their work was characterised by long hours with no fixed times as well as being expected to carry out tasks other than what they were initially employed to do. Concerns about long working hours were voiced by live-in employees, whose typical day lasted from 5am to 7pm (about 14

hours), although the work time tended to stretch out to 11 or 12 at night. Live-out and part-time employees tended to work from 8am to 5pm. Several factors were attributed to the long working hours, which included the lack of written contracts as well as migrant status.

According to a Sample of Written Particulars extracted from the Basic Conditions of Employment Act provided by the manager at Agency P1, a domestic worker should not be made to work for more than 45 hours a week, should work not more nine than hours a day for a five-day work week and not more than eight hours a day for a six-day week. An employee is entitled to be paid for working outside normal hours and the Act proposed that a 'domestic worker should not work for more than 12 hours on any day including overtime'. The manager pointed that employers should ensure that their live-in employees had rest-time during the day or were paid for over-time to avoid exploitation.

> I do know that if they do sleep in, say if … the employer wants them to come in after supper at 7pm and clean and help with the babies and bathing from 7pm to 9pm, then they work a bit in the morning and (have a break) and the bigger part of the day they will rest and they will come in those hours. (Manager, Agency P1, Pretoria)

Despite this measure, the participants highlighted that:

> Haa, like, with this job that we do, I don't want to lie, to say that there is an exact timetable that says this the time we knock off … it just depends… (Chido, 28 year old, live -in care worker, Pretoria)

> …. no, they are no specific hours. …With some employers, you have your own room where you sleep so you know by 7pm or 6.30pm you will be leaving your employer's house to go to your room. But in this case, because I live in the same household as them, so if they ask me to do something for them, even when I am resting, I will just go and do it. (Rufaro, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Long working hours were especially associated with childcare, as illustrated by Lucia:

> … it's like, first of all, I start work at 5.30am, her (employer) work is flexible, she is supposed to work five hours per day … she can come home anytime but she says I have to wait until she comes back, sometimes she can go out to a party … I would have started work at 5.30am, maybe I will sleep late because I will be waiting for her maybe until 12 midnight. How many hours will be left before I start work the next day. I will have to wake up and bath before 5am, maybe

around 4.45am so that I can start work on time. (Lucia, 44 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

Participants highlighted that working without fixed hours disadvantaged them in regard to payment of overtime. For example, Yolanda noted that:

With the disadvantages right, let say you discuss (with your employer) the start and knock off time, when you work beyond those times, this is overtime, it becomes overtime, you have to be paid for those hours but that is not happening to me. I just receive my normal salary, so that's the disadvantage of not having a written contract. It's fine because most employers require working documents and I do not have the required documents, but these people allowed me to work without the documents, so I am fine with that. (Yolanda, 24 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Yolanda is a live-in employee and during the interview pointed out that she was happy with her work as it had flexible conditions. Yolanda indicated that she did not have fixed working times; she starts work around 5am and at times, she finishes her work around 8pm. She does note that when everyone had left the house, both the parents and the children she takes care of who are school-going age, she has the opportunity to go back and sleep and then resume work around 9am. However, she highlights the number of ways in which she is disadvantaged in her work. She maintains that since she had a verbal agreement with her employer where the exact working hours were not clearly stated, she cannot request to be paid for overtime. Further, she relates this to her migrant status, noting that she has accepted these working conditions because she has an opportunity to be employed without the right documents. Griffin (2010), in her study of Basotho women working in South Africa, argues that a key feature of 'illegal' migrant domestic workers predicament is their 'exploitability', referring to the potential to be exploited. This is apparent in Yolanda's case where she is concerned about her long working hours, which are not being compensated, but accepts the situation because of her circumstances. This also relates to observations by Gurung (2009) discussed earlier about the informal nature of the domestic work environment where decisions about work related rules and policies are determined by the employer without consultation with the employee. Further, the care workers in this study linked working hours to their migrant status and nationality in comparison to the contexts for their local counterparts:

… I think they (employers) take advantage because we are Zimbabweans and we are not aware of the laws in South Africa because South Africans know the laws and they know they have rights. … They know that a person works eight hours – you start work at 8am and knock off at 4pm. With the eight hours, there is one

hour for lunch and 30 mins break. We do not do that, if your employer tells you… We were told that we would go for lunch once, and the lunch break was 30 mins – you would go from 1pm to 1: 30pm, you are back at work. There was no break, and I started work at 6am to 6pm. South Africans would not agree to work from 6am to 6pm, which is 12 hours, and if lunch is excluded it will be 13 hours and that would be overtime. (Rumbidzai, 25 year old, live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

As noted earlier migrant care worker duties involved managing house work and care responsibilities. For Rumbidzai, her daily duties included performing housework tasks such as cleaning, laundry and ironing when the children were at school and caring for the children on their return. Rumbidzai's quote further confirms Gurung (2009: 391)'s argument that some employers seek migrant workers who they believe are exploitable as they are not aware of their rights; workers who they can control and will accept poor working conditions.

With care work, most of the participants were full-time workers to enable employers to balance work and family commitments. Working hours for part-time workers differed from full-time participants – working for different employers mostly from 7am to 5 pm, working from one or more days. Some participants who were working part-time jobs had moved from being full-time live in jobs. Their work duties mostly involved indirect care work – washing and cooking for the dependents in the household, playing with kids, looking after the children after school or when they are not feeling well and monitoring the children. Some of them provided support to live-in workers on busy days, particularly in middle-class families. Abigail was a part-time worker and commented on her duties and working hours:

So currently, I have (two) part-time jobs, I work two days per week, I work for different employers. … For one of them, I just go to iron and once I am done, I leave unless if there is something else they want me to do. The work is not a lot. On the other day, I go to assist another domestic worker, especially on Mondays. I work on Mondays, you know how weekends are, she does not work over the weekends and, there are children there. On Mondays there is lot of work, so she needs help. So I am looking for the other part-time jobs to fill in my week. … The duties that I do that relate to the children is cooking, making sure that their clothes and uniforms have been washed and assisting them with the homework, and that they have a certain time that you take them to the park and play and do sport, there are people hired to train them, like playing rugby and others, then we come back home with them. (Abigail, 44 year-old part-time care worker, Johannesburg)

The narrations by the participants in the part-time work-arrangement describing the specific tasks they do confirms Ally (2010) argument about the difference between full-time and part-time work. She argues that in full-time work, it is the worker's time that is purchased and thus the worker is required to do whatever task is given to them by the employer. However, in part-time work, the worker is employed to perform specific tasks and know what they have to do when they go to work thereby giving the worker 'autonomy and control' (Ally, 2010: 55).

Data from part-time workers highlighted the precarious nature of this work arrangement. Part-time work was considered transitional work undertaken while looking for a permanent position or another job. Challenges with part-time work included difficulties in filling the week with different employers. Sarah described her work arrangements in a way that highlighted the precarious nature of part-time work.

> I started working there last year in November, I worked two days a week (Tuesday and Friday). … I used to work three days and then she said she can no longer afford to pay me so now I work for one day. From May, she started paying me half of my salary, so she said it's unfair to her to be paying in bits as she knew that I have a family in Zimbabwe. At one point, she said I should not come at all and then later we agreed one day a week. I now work on Thursdays. (Sarah, 29 year-old part-time care worker, Johannesburg)

Later in the interview, Sarah spoke of the financial difficulties she was facing as a result of working only one day a week and explained that she had to find other ways of generating income such as buying and reselling kitchenware.

> The biggest challenge is you don't get a job, there is no other way of surviving, you have to find something to do so that you can support your family. Like now, the way I am surviving is very difficult. I want to go home on the 1st of November but I don't have bus fare. My mom said she will give me the return fare; I have to pay rent before I leave. I want to go and visit because I could not go last year. I want to go for a month so that I can come back and look for a job in December. (Sarah, 29 year-old part-time care worker, Johannesburg)

Sarah's story highlights how the drop in her income following the reduction in the number of days worked impacts on her role as a provider for her family. Sarah noted that this not only affects her ability to send remittances but also the quality of her life as she is not able to meet the demands for everyday sustenance such as buying adequate food and paying for accommodation at the end of the month. This confirms observations by Ally (2010) that

failure to find additional employment can result in insecurity, reduced earnings and vulnerability for part-time workers.

Three participants worked full time but did not live in their employer's household and these participants were married. They cited family responsibilities as one of the reasons they opted to live out. The live-out employment arrangement allowed the employees to come to work in the morning and to return to their homes in the evening. They worked between 7am and 5pm. As noted by Ally (2010), this work arrangement allowed them to live with their families and continue with their care responsibilities, which the participants also highlighted. For example, Sifiso worked as a full-time, live-out employee, working from Monday to Friday from 8am to 5pm. She was married and lived with her youngest child and husband while her eldest son, aged 10, was in Zimbabwe. Sifiso stated that she opted for this arrangement 'for the sake of my child and my family'. Similarly, Ruvarashe explained her move from being a live-in employee to live out.

> I used to stay-in, Monday to Friday, but when I got married, my husband suggested that I should quit being a live in. So we sat down again with my employer and we agreed that I should be a live out. So now I travel to work to and from work every day. (Ruvarashe, 35 year-old, live-out care worker, Johannesburg)

While some participants who were live-in workers indicated a flexibility with regard to working conditions and working hours as being dependant on the employer, Sifiso, a 30 year-old live-out care worker from Johannesburg highlighted the workload as one of the challenges she faced as a live-out employee.

> When I am talking about exploitation, I focus on the salary – working hours; you work from morning to evening but the money is very little and they tell you, 'Take it or leave it.' So you will be working but you know that you are being exploited, you know what happening is not right. Even the working conditions, for others once you finish your duties for the day you can leave, but for me, when I am done with my duties, more work will be added. For some people, if you start work at 8am and if you are done by two, they are allowed to leave. So you start comparing with how others are working and you realise that you are being exploited.

Sifiso highlights her perception of live-out work as 'task-oriented'. However, her experience with the current employer was different. She was working longer hours even when the tasks she was allocated for the day would be completed, thus she felt she was being exploited. For Sifiso, she had limited time to rest when she was at work as she was instructed to do more

work. She also noted that her lunch break was short as she was only allowed a 30-minute break. Sifiso's concerns resemble observations by Ally (2010) about how employers extract and control workers' labour. Ally relates this to part-time workers who work for a limited number of hours but are expected to complete huge workloads. Similarly, Sifiso highlights how her employer extracts her labour through the workload and the low remuneration, which she has no opportunity to negotiate. Despite these challenges, live-out work gave the participants opportunities to take up part-time domestic work jobs particularly during the weekend when they were not at work. The participants in this study who were live-out employees were undertaking other income-generating activities during the weekend to supplement their salaries, which included domestic work and vending.

5.2.4 Rest and leave arrangements

As already shown with the verbal agreements, the employer has the power to set the conditions of employment and could change them at will. This was the same with days off. Days off was also a concern for care workers especially live-in workers, who sometimes depended on the employer to provide accommodation. While the Sectoral Determination 7 set out rest periods, a daily rest period of at least 12 consecutive hours or weekly rest of at least 36 consecutive hours for care workers (Van der Westhuizen and Murray, 2015: 133), there were variations over the off-days set out by employers. Some employees were allowed to go 'off' every weekend, while some were only allowed to go every fortnight and others once a month. Thus, off-days were a concern for care workers as short amounts of time away from work resulted in confinement, lack of rest and social life, which affected the migrant's well-being. Denial of off -days was one of the main reasons why care workers would leave their jobs. They complained that their off days were not fixed as employers could change these at any time. The main contention with days off was that they were short and therefore did not allow them the opportunity to rest adequately as they had many other errands to do when they were away from work. For example, Thandeka pointed out:

> I think they should just allow domestic workers to work Monday to Friday because on Saturdays they (employers) will be at home with their children. …
> Then I will be able to rest on Saturday and be able to go about doing my business and then I devote Sunday for church. But now, Saturday I work half day, you will also be tired and then I have plans to do other things after you leave the workplace. At the same time, you need to rest, so there will not be enough time thus sometimes you find that you can't attend church on Sunday because you still want to do other things. So, time is a big issue. Further, where I work, I start work at 5.30am, I spend the whole day in their household until around 7 or 8 pm. I start work when they are sleeping and at times, I finish work when they are asleep again. (Thandeka, 35 year-old, live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Thandeka emphasises the long hours that care workers put in during the week including Saturdays and therefore they have limited time to rest and run other errands when they are off duty. As the care workers were mothers, most of the errands they undertook when not at work was shopping for goods and groceries to send to their families back in Zimbabwe as well as travelling to the bus stations to send these items. This was the case mostly on weekends especially after they had received their salaries. According to Thandeka, this left her with no time for socialising with other people. For others, the concern was that when they come back on Sunday evening, they still did not have time to rest as they started work as soon as they arrived at the workplace. This led to feelings of confinement and dissatisfaction. Another participant, Vimbai, commented, 'I think the issue of off-days is the main concern, living in the same place, I feel so lonely, you start thinking if there was something else I could do, I could leave the job' (Vimbai, 33 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg).

Another issue surrounding off-days was the abuse of this time by employers, particularly for those care workers who did not have their own accommodation when they were off duty. Migrant women often chose live-in opportunities as these meant that they would be provided with accommodation and other provisions such as food. However, many of the participants pointed out that employers took advantage of this when employees spent their off-days in the employer's household. For example, Sarah highlighted:

> I was not used to this type of living of working Monday to Sunday because I didn't have anywhere to go during the off days … so I had to live in that household throughout. The moment you spend your day there then you continue working. There was no rest. (Sarah, 29 year-old part-time care worker Johannesburg)

As a way of countering this situation, several participants rented shared rooms in the townships, which allowed them to 'escape' from the workplace. In a conversation after the interview, Chido pointed that it was important for care workers to have separate accommodation, asserting that employers took advantage and did not respect off days if one did not leave the household. She believed that South African employers did not like employees who took their off days as they enjoyed having access to their employees around the clock. This further underscored why employers preferred to employ live-in domestic workers who were migrants. At an extra cost, migrant women chose to protect themselves from this form of exploitation by making other accommodation arrangements.

There were further variations in relation to annual leave. Van der Westhuizen and Murray (2015) note that according to Sectoral Determination 7, employers are expected to grant their employees at least three weeks annual leave in a 12-month cycle. Domestic workers are often allowed to take their annual leave in December and in this study, it ranged from two weeks to

a month. Some could take their leave twice a year. The foremost concern about leave days was when the leave was granted as well as the number of days granted at a stretch. For example, Vimbai pointed out that:

> in December, they really cheat us … it's really painful. … Last time, they said I could go for two weeks and that she would allow me to go again in April. My uncle passed away and then she gave me a week's leave, so I think she combined with the two weeks that I went in December and believes it's enough. I think she also follows what happens in her work place, because like last time, I came back just after New Year's Day, you would have spent the night celebrating the beginning of a new year with your children and then the next day you are already leaving them because she said I should be back by the 3rd. (Vimbai, 33 year- old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

As Vimbai points out, her employer decides on the number of days to grant the employee and does not take into consideration of other types of leave arrangements applicable to care workers, such as family responsibility leave, which makes provision for workers to take time off to resolve family matters. For Vimbai, she feels she is being denied the opportunity to spend time with her children as the employer requires her to return to work early after the holidays and different categories of leave are lumped together leaving her with fewer days to spend with her family. One participant, Rumbidzai, complained that she is granted fewer leave days than her counterpart in the same household, as she is expected to return and accompany her employer on their holiday travels with the children. Thus, she too did not have enough time to spend with her own child in Zimbabwe in December. Thus, participants felt that they were devoting more of their time to their employer's children than their own, creating feelings of guilt.

5.2.5 Remuneration

Participants cited low remuneration as a major challenge and one of the main reasons they would leave a job. They observed that the low rates of remuneration showed that care work is undervalued. For example, Sibongile, a 33 year-old live-out care worker from Johannesburg noted that 'being a nanny does not pay much', pointing to the low status and under valuation of care work. While the participants noted that they were aware of the minimum wage stated by the government [around R2500 (US$148) in 2018], some of them were not aware of the actual figures; they believed the average was R3500 (US$207). The salary range for care work varied from below R2000 to R4000 (US$118-236). They pointed out that salaries did not take into consideration the workload, working hours, work experience or number of years in employment, or increases in the cost of living. Participants pointed out that salary increases were determined by the employer, who was often not willing to negotiate. They mentioned that they were disadvantaged through nationality and legal permission to work.

> … like I mentioned before, not everyone is treated well … some might treat you as an outsider because they know you are foreigner, so they treat you badly. Others, you might agree on a certain amount of remuneration but the end of the month, the employer might change and not want to pay you the amount you agreed on and they know that you will not report it to anyone. So you find that people look for other jobs and just leave. Sometimes, you might even go and leave without the money that you worked for, you have no power to go back and how would you go back to claim your money… (Chido, 28 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

> … some employers, they are still paying that wage of (minimum wage) … they are just underpaid like you find someone saying I am being paid R1500 (US$89) because most of those people don't have ah … or permits … it's an advantage if you have right papers. (Sibongile, 33 year-old live-out care worker, Johannesburg)

The two quotes above emphasise the notion of a cheap and disposable labour force where employers take advantage of the migrant status of workers to offer low wages and at times are not willing to pay the workers after they have worked. Employers prefer to hire undocumented workers who are in a vulnerable position as they can be exploited easily. The employers take advantage that these workers may not report them due to fear of deportation.

Agencies play a role in salary negotiations. While they cannot specify the amount to be paid to domestic workers, they work with market-related rates. The Department of Labour annually announces the minimum wages for domestic workers. For the period in 2018 when fieldwork was conducted the minimum monthly wage gazetted by the Department of Labour was R2545.22 (US$150) in municipal areas. Officials at agencies noted that the starting salary for a full-time employee should range from R3500 (US$207):

> … our government says people must be paid R2500. Government talks about people who don't know how to clean, who have never been a domestic worker before. People that are on our books, their experience starts from five years, they have skills, they have certificates. … So I as an agency, that is why I am staying between them with the negotiation of the salaries because you know people are not being paid well. (Owner, Agency P2, Johannesburg)

As pointed out in the above quote, agencies play a role in protecting the interests of domestic workers who might not be aware of the prevailing range of remuneration. Agencies reiterated

their efforts to protect domestic workers from unfair practices. The manager at Agency P1, pointed out that:

> … we do not just place the ladies with anyone. We really do look after the ladies' interests as well. They can at any point phone me and say you know what, I am not working for this client, even if it's one day, 10 years, if they phone me to say … I do not want to work here, then I say it's fine, we will find other work for you… (Manager, Agency P1, Pretoria)

5.2.6 Employer/employee relationship and labour rights

While there were variations in the relationships between the migrant care workers and their employers, inequalities based on class, race and nationality were evident. Several participants noted that they were being treated fairly by their employers citing flexible working conditions where there was no strict control and regulation of the work and a lighter workload. These workers described their employers as 'good', 'nice', and 'loving'. For example, Chido described her relationship with her employer as resembling that of 'sisters', commenting that:

> … my work is not strenuous to the extent that if someone comes, and the employer does not tell you that I am working, you would never know, you would never know. … For me, so far, the employer I am working for now is a nice person, I do not want to lie, I haven't had a problem since I started working for her, she treats me well… (Chido, 28 year-old, live -in care worker, Pretoria)

Being treated as part of the family was a key indicator of a productive relationship between employers and care workers. This was illustrated through sharing meals together, eating similar food and sharing the same spaces within the household. Hope illustrated this idea in the following statement:

> I love that they do not neglect me, they love me, and they take me as one of them, there is nothing I despise about them. They are not repulsed by things I touch. For example, where I worked before, they say there is a cup for the maid and a plate for the maid, but with them I use everything theirs. I bath in the same tub with them, in some households that is not allowed. If they have guests, they use my bed and I sleep with their daughter, she likes sleeping in my room or she will ask me to come and sleep in her room. They don't mind… (Nokuthula, 41 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Nokuthula demonstrates that her employers treat her as an equal in the household and that her employer's family does not discriminate against her.

In contrast, other participants noted a clear distinction between them and their employers as they cited ill-treatment and abuse. Major concerns were verbal abuse, discrimination, being looked down upon, food rationing, lack of trust and disrespect of care workers. Two of the participants described their working conditions in their employers' households as being 'in prison' as they felt that they were restricted and controlled. Denti (2015) associates this with live-in conditions where migrant workers are prone to severe exploitation. Participants reported that verbal abuse was common and found it demeaning and cause for emotional stress. Commenting on a previous employer, Ruvarashe observed that:

> She would yell to such an extent that you would fail to eat or that you would think that you are not a mother and the age difference between us was about 6 to 7 years. She was older than me but she was shouting, it was like she was talking to a child who is in Grade 5. (Ruvarashe, 35 year old live-out care worker, Johannesburg)

Ruvarashe notes that by yelling at her, her employer belittled her and treated her as a child. Inadequate food was also a major concern for live-in domestic workers who pointed out that some employers could not provide their staple food or that they were given food with low nutrition, or that they were not allowed to eat certain foods within the household. Scholars such as (Archer, 2011; Cock, 1980) highlight that food provision exposes the hierarchical relationship that pertains between the employer and domestic workers, with Cock arguing that food rationing conveys a 'message of inferiority' to the domestic worker at the same time as it emphasises the dependence of the employee on the employer. Thus, food provision within households highlighted class relations.

Participants further associated their ill-treatment with their nationality and race. They pointed out that they were being ill-treated because they were from Zimbabwe, a country characterised by poverty and economic decline. For example, Tsitsi noted:

> … because they think you are struggling and for me in particular, she says, 'Your husband passed away so why do you want go back to Zimbabwe where there is suffering and poverty?' That's what she says, she is rough, that there is poverty in Zimbabwe, especially when they listen to the news, even if I am in my room, she will call me and to show me. During the election period in Zimbabwe, she would call me every day and ask if I would go back to Zimbabwe if the situation improves. She was becoming scared that I would leave. (Tsitsi, 48 year-old live-in care-worker, Johannesburg)

Other participants explicitly pointed out that they do not want to work for black people as Nokuthula observed, 'especially black people, they are cruel. I never want to work for a black

person' (Nokuthula, 41 year-old live-in care worker). There were also racist perceptions against Indian people such as that they overwork their employees, they were verbally abusive and in terms of food, that they offered their employees stale food. The care worker experiences highlighted above endorse Gurung (2009)'s argument that the intersections of race, nationality, class and gender result in multiple layers of inequalities and marginalisation. Participants were aware of the social distance between them and their employers with care workers feeling that their employers did not care about their well-being or that of their families back in Zimbabwe.

The excerpts given above highlighting the interactions of migrant care workers and their employers reflect maternalism in the employer/employee relationship. In describing the concept of maternalism, several scholars underscore the asymmetrical relationship between domestic workers and their employers (King, 2007; Moras, 2013; Marchetti, 2016). For King (2007: 13-14), maternalism which parallels paternalism to a certain extent, is characterised by the 'maintenance of the servant in a role of perpetual child', recognition of an emotional dynamic between the employer and employee and where the employer reaffirms her superior position in relation to the employee. Drawing from Hondagnue- Sotelo (2001), Moras (2013: 248) describes maternalism as "the unilateral positioning of the employer as a benefactor who receives personal thanks, recognition, validation of self from the domestic worker'. Further, (Marchetti, 2016: 150) argues that 'maternalistic employers, are those who, albeit unconsciously, at the same time as helping and protecting the employee, confirm their inferiority and by extension, that of all people belong to their social group (migrant, black, poor etc". Marchetti links maternalism to migrant domestic workers as 'partial citizens' with limited rights, for example undocumented workers, who depend on their employers to assist them with issues of migration and their stay in the destination country.

Participants' narrations of how employers treated them as children through verbal abuse relate to the maternalistic attitude of maintaining the employee in the position of a child. Tsitsi's quote highlights her employer's benevolent attitude where she thinks she is helping her through offering her an employment opportunity in light of Zimbabwe's economic problems, while at the same time ill-treating her. By drawing attention to Tsitsi's desperate situation where she has no support from her husband and the poverty in Zimbabwe, her employer is affirming her superior position in terms of her race, socio-economic status as well as her country's national wealth. This is consistent with Moras' observation that 'employers construct themselves as providing opportunities for domestic workers, opportunities that would not be found in countries of origin. These opportunities may be constructed as economic or services of cultural assimilation" (Moras, 2013: 254). Further, the employment of undocumented workers can also be viewed in this context where employers provide migrant care workers with an opportunity to work despite them not having legal requirements to do so. Similarly, in the context of verbal contractual agreements, employer's

maternalistic attitudes could disadvantage the workers. This is reflected in the interactions between Lucia and her employer negotiating contractual agreements and the employer referred to 'helping each other' as discussed in an earlier section.

Scholars have debated domestic workers' labour rights in the South African context (Ally, 2006; Fish, 2006; Du Toit, 2013) with Ally acknowledging an improvement in the working conditions as workers had state protection against abuses through access to institutions such as the CCMA. According to Ally, domestic workers' rights were recognised through the BCEA and Sectoral Determination 7, which formalised the relationship between the employer and employee. Further, Griffin (2010) and Fish (2013) argue that these labour laws have also extended some protection to migrant domestic workers. However, they note that in practice, these rights are disregarded to a significant extent in the domestic sector. Similar to the Basotho women in Griffin (2010)'s study, who perceived that they had no rights in South Africa, the Zimbabwean care workers perceived that they were treated differently in comparison to local domestic workers as they could not access labour rights. Participants believed that employers took advantage of them because they were not aware of their rights and there was a lack of recourse particularly for those who did not have the required permits to work:

> They are different in that South Africans have rights, they know their rights. They can voice their dislikes and concerns. Most of the time the employers are South Africans, they are also afraid that if the employee says I don't like this (I will not tolerate this), they know their rights so they do not want them. Further, they take advantage that you are Zimbabwean, from Lesotho or from elsewhere. (Rumbidzai, 25 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

Participants noted that their local counterparts who were South African citizens could use the laws to their advantage in terms of negotiating remuneration and working conditions including working hours. They added that South African domestic workers were much freer and flexible as they could quit their jobs at any time. The care workers pointed out that as Zimbabweans they did not have such privileges as they had few opportunities available to them and would persevere in difficult situations due to the circumstances that led to their migration. Their desperation for employment made them vulnerable to exploitation. Thus, participants were considered as docile and subservient.

> They treat us differently in that South Africans are local and we are from Zimbabwe, you strive to get an income to make things work but for South Africans, they can choose to leave their job at any time. But for us, they know that we will put up with anything because we need the job and therefore will take

advantage knowing that we will not do anything because we have to work…
(Fungai, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

The quotes above highlight the ways in which Zimbabwean care workers had an advantage over the local workers based on their work ethic, which was also a disadvantage to them as it could lead to exploitation. Participants indicated that employers preferred them for being hard-working, resilient and compliant. The disadvantage was that they could be exploited easily. Preference for Zimbabwean workers has been noted in other industries in South Africa such as the hospitality industry where their characteristics have been found beneficial for their employment (Silubonde, 2014; Hungwe, 2020). Some of the characteristics highlighted in these studies included that Zimbabwean migrants are 'hardworking, intelligent, could speak fluent English, respectful', reliable as they 'maintained consistency in terms of coming to work and executing the tasks' (Hungwe, 2020: 63). Such preferences in hiring practices often led to 'occupational niches' where a certain group of workers would dominate the industry. Hungwe (2020) ties together the dominance of Zimbabwean migrants in different sectors in South Africa to recruitment practices, working conditions and migrant status. The author notes that migrants in her study were employed in private organisations that did not strictly require identity documents and recruitment was often through referrals from other migrants. This allowed employers to 'avoid costs in recruitment and selection' as migrants would refer counterparts of 'good standing'(Hungwe, 2020: 68). Hungwe further notes that Zimbabwean migrants mostly dominated in jobs at the lower end of the services sector and these jobs were characterised by lack of rights and benefits emphasising the workers' precariousness. Hungwe's observations were apparent in this study where majority of the participants did not have the required documents and suffered violation of their labour rights.

Sibongile emphasised the exploitation of undocumented care workers by highlighting some of the advantages or leverage that employees with work visas had.

… it's kind of different, I will say, yah … for example, if someone is working, they are some people who don't have papers or who are here illegally, their working conditions would be terrible…Some of them they don't know, 'if my employer does this, where can I go, where do I start, things like that'. If they (employers) know that, they really take an advantage of that. … People are different, some people, they believe that if you are coming from outside the country, you don't have rights, but I practice my rights…If I don't like, if we don't get along with the employer, I will decide to quit and look for another job, and, because I know what I am doing. It's not hard for me to get another job, I will say that, but for some people, it's hard to just leave the employer, they will

continue being abused. I will say when I came here to South Africa, I was like, uhmm, my mom was a domestic worker but I felt like she was abused because she was staying with her employer but we were not allowed to visit her, we were just meeting at the park – it wasn't nice because her employers were staying with their family, their friends were just allowed to go in the yard but we were not allowed to visit my mom, even for 30 minutes, but I know my rights and I won't allow that… (Sibongile, 33 year-old live-out care worker, Johannesburg)

Sibongile indicated that she had acquired permanent residence and earlier in the interview highlighted a combination of factors that made a difference to migrant worker's work experiences. She stressed that access to jobs was a challenge without the required documents pointing out that it was 'easy' for her to find jobs as she had the right work documents coupled with experience after working in the industry for a long time; good references as well providing her car for her service. She highlighted improved chances to access jobs as she had registered with two different employment agencies. Further, in the above quote Sibongile makes a comparison with her mother who was also employed as a migrant domestic worker but could not pursue her right to family life as a live-in employee as she was not allowed to have visitors. She points out that she would not tolerate that as she is aware of her rights and if she was not happy with her working conditions, she would quit the job.

As Näre (2007) and De Regt (2010b) argue, migrant women are not passive victims; they exercise agency in their situations. Näre (2007) highlights that the Ukrainian and Polish care workers she studied quit their jobs when faced with bad working conditions. Similarly, most of the Zimbabwean care workers' narrations of their job histories demonstrated that they too would quit when faced with unfair working practices such as low remuneration, or when they were denied adequate rest days or suffered verbal abuse. Further, in informal conversations, two women had highlighted how they took action against unfair dismissals by reporting their cases to the CCMA, while the other involved the police to ensure that she was paid her outstanding salaries.

5.3 Discussion and Conclusion

Consistent with the definition of migrant care workers discussed in Chapter 1, it emerged in this chapter that duties carried out by migrant women in this study involved balancing domestic work, care work and additional duties from employers which led to a heavy workload and put pressure on the care workers. This corresponds with findings in other studies in African countries such as Ghana, (Awumbila et al., 2017b; Laiboni, 2020). Migrant domestic workers working in Africa-Middle East migration flows also indicated that their duties were heavy and varied as they included childcare and elder care as well as domestic work. While literature shows that in South-North migration streams the trend of balancing

domestic and care work persists (Denti, 2015; Näre, 2009), increasingly migrants are able to focus exclusively on care work (McGregor, 2007; Puppa, 2012).

Participants also pointed out that they found care work was challenging and stressful as it required greater attention from them in comparison to general cleaning. This may be attributed to a lack of formal training in care work. As described in Chapter 3, most of the participants had low levels of education and only a few of them had undertaken formal training in childcare. This is consistent with findings by Thobejane and Khoza (2019) who noted that domestic work in South Africa is regarded as an occupation for low-skilled people and dismissed as reproductive work that did not deserve fair remuneration. This has implications for the quality of care provided by migrant care workers and the value placed on this type of care. It can also be related to job seeking mechanisms. Some recruitment agencies provided training, particularly for childcare, but, as discussed in Chapter 4, only a few migrant care workers had made use of these services. By comparison, some countries in the Global North, such as Canada, require training as well as a high level of education and English language proficiency as part of visa application requirements for care workers.[15]

The findings in this chapter revealed that the care work done by Zimbabwean migrant workers tended to concentrate on childcare rather than elder care. This is consistent with the challenges raised in previous chapters such as the high cost of childcare centres as well as more women entering the labour market, thus leaving a care gap in their families. While studies have shown the rising need for elder care in Africa and the sub-Saharan Africa, the family is still considered the primary source of care for the elderly, and there are few formal systems available (Schatz and Seeley, 2015; Adamek et al., 2020; Van der Geest, 2016). Further, in southern Africa, older persons continue to take up a significant role as primary caregivers of children (Schatz and Seeley, 2015). This is further compounded by the living patterns of the elderly. For example, in South Africa, statistics from the 2011 Census show that most elderly people could be classified as poor and lived in rural areas (Statistics South Africa, 2014). Thus, they tended to rely on family members for care. The report also shows that there is an upward trend in the employment patterns of the elderly with women being predominantly involved in informal activities such as caring for household members and household chores. In contrast, the literature on global care chains indicates that duties assigned to migrant care workers in the North involves taking care of elderly people (Escriva and Skinner, 2008). A report by the Institute for Women's Policy Research analysed the employment trends in the US care industry and found that between 2005 and 2015 there was

---

[15] Immigration consultants provide information about the different immigration programmes available for caregivers and corresponding visa requirements. See https://canadianvisa.org/canada-immigration/temporary-visa/caregiver-visa
Accessed 20 July 2020

a greater escalation in the need for adult care workers in the home than childcare workers. The study also reported an increasing number of foreign-born care workers concentrated in home-based care. Families preferred to hire a live-in care worker given the high cost of placing elderly people in care facilities.

Further confirming the importance of formal training, elder care in the Global North often involves caring for dependent individuals and administering medicine. Thus, some qualified health workers seek employment in elder care (McGregor, 2007; Parreñas, 2015). Through their migration, care workers face a decline in their occupational status referred to as 'contradictory class mobility' (Parreñas, 2015) or downward mobility (Raijman et al., 2003; McGregor, 2007; Gurung, 2009). Further, in her study of Filipina migrant domestic workers in Rome and Los Angeles, Parreñas (2015) observed that migrant women, through their migration, experienced both upward and downward mobility where there was decline in their occupational status while access to domestic work in the destination country improved their earnings and their financial status. They experienced domestic work as a deskilling process as they were not making use of their qualifications and the decline in status was compounded by the stigma associated with domestic and care work. Parreñas (2015: 119-120) argues that the experience of downward mobility was 'a concrete effect of the larger structural forces of globalization. It emerges from the unequal development of regions, including the nation-based hierarchy of educational qualifications, the devalued accreditation of degrees from the Third World, and the limit of mobility in the Philippines.'

It was revealed in this chapter that the labour laws pertaining to domestic workers in South Africa made provision that employers should provide their workers with 'written particulars of employment', which details the terms of employment (Sectoral Determination 7 under the Basic Conditions of Employment Act). In line with this requirement, officials at recruitment agencies also emphasised that written contracts are key in the domestic employment relationship and part of their service was to facilitate the drafting of contracts. However, the majority of the participants indicated that they had verbal agreements with their employers, which was the major source of the exploitation they faced as a result of non-compliance by their employers. They highlighted discrepancies between the agreed conditions and what they were experiencing with particular emphasis on duties and working hours. Verbal contracts highlighted the informal nature of the employment relationship between employers and migrant domestic workers. Participants alluded to race as an influencing factor in contractual agreements where they pointed out that black employers were reluctant to draw up written contracts for their employees. Written contracts were viewed as a form of protection against exploitation and that privately-owned recruitment agencies insisted on these documents demonstrated the role such agencies play in the protection of domestic workers. However, given that only a few migrants were able to make use of the services of recruitment agencies, only a limited number of people were able to access such protection.

The above finding on contractual agreements highlights a difference with migration flows in other African countries and the South-North care chains. As with the migration process, recruitment agencies facilitate the signing of contracts between employers and migrant domestic workers. Yet, while this process might seem ideal, studies have highlighted the shortcomings in contractual agreements organised through agencies, which tend to leave migrants at a disadvantage (De Regt, 2010b; Laiboni, 2020). For example, in a study examining the migration of women from Ghana and Kenya to the Middle East, participants highlighted that work contracts were not discussed with them and in some instances, agency officials signed the contracts on their behalf. Participants in this study also noted that they were offered their contracts just before their departure to the destination country with others pointing out that they had been promised different types of employment and ended up in domestic work (Laiboni, 2020). Thus, issues of deception, compliance and enforcement of contractual agreements remains a key concern.

The inability to secure written contacts by Zimbabwean migrants underscores the fragile and informal nature of the migration process and subsequent pitfalls as discussed in Chapter 4. Without proper documentation, migrant care workers secured their jobs through personal networks and the 'market'. Thus, they found it difficult to request written contracts, further highlighting their vulnerability to exploitation. In contrast, South-North migration flows are regulated, and this level of oversight filters down to the contractual agreements. For example, for care workers migrating to the Middle East, who migrate through a sponsored visa system (Kafala), their immigration and legal residency is tied to an individual sponsor throughout the contract period, which is usually two years. Under this system, the employee cannot easily change employers without the permission of the employer. This leaves the employee dependant on the employer and therefore limits her labour rights (Parreñas, 2017; Romero, 2018; King-Dejarddin, 2019). A key argument that scholars make is illustrated by Romero (2018: 1186), who argues that 'immigration regulations of receiving countries vary and restrict time limits, type of employment, regulations governing workers' family life and frequently stipulate level of training and education'. Parreñas (2017) further argues that some countries that allow for the incorporation of migrant domestic and care workers do so under policies and regulations that limit the incoming worker's full participation in the receiving country's labour market. Similar sponsorship visas for migrant domestic workers have been noted in Singapore (Anjara et al., 2017; King-Dejarddin, 2019).

Participants associated care work with long working hours as care workers tend to provide round-the-clock services with no fixed time for ending the working day, especially for live-in employees. Working hours differed for live-in workers in comparison to the live-out and part-time workers. Live-in workers are expected to start work at 5am and continue working till 7pm, but their shifts could be stretched to 11pm or later; live-out workers worked from

about 7am to 5pm. While some live-in workers highlighted flexibility in their working hours, live-out carers pointed to excessive workloads being crammed into their stipulated working hours. The challenge faced by part-time workers was the ability to have a full working week, as failure to secure this would lead to reduced earnings and vulnerability. There were similarities in the working conditions experienced by migrant domestic workers in this study and studies from other countries, which were characterised by violation of labour rights and labour abuses. This study further confirmed an argument by Anderson (2000) that the work arrangements (live-in and live-out) together with the relationship to the employer and whether the employees were documented or undocumented, contributed significantly to the conditions faced by domestic workers. Live-in care work has been considered to be the most oppressive form of employment and has often been described as a prison where workers are on call day and night (Denti, 2015; Parreñas, 2015). Internationally, studies have pointed out that live-in domestic workers have less control over their work schedules and live in isolation. Further, live-in workers tend to do more work as their work duties included both care work and household duties.

Similarly, violation of labour rights was found in the present study in relation to rest and leave arrangements and remuneration. Long working hours imposed on live-in domestic workers did not comply with the rest periods stipulated by the law. Further, participants noted the variations in respect of off-days, which was also in violation of labour regulations. Participants illustrated that as migrant workers, they were offered limited opportunities and were prone to accepting poor conditions that local care workers might not be willing to accept. Corresponding violations were noted in South-North migration flows. Romero (2018) and Parreñas (2017) relate the violation of labour rights to migrant domestic workers not being covered by the destination country's labour laws thus leading to low standards of employment. However, in the context of this study, violation of labour rights is associated with lack of documentation and migrant status, both of which limit opportunities for recourse. Regarding remuneration, as discussed in Chapter 4, participants revealed that because of their vulnerable documentation status, they received low salaries as they could not negotiate with their employers. This is not the case with recruitment agencies where officials revealed that they tried to negotiate higher salaries for the domestic workers registered with them, supporting the idea that agencies to some extent could protect the rights of their clients.

The tenuous working and living conditions experienced by migrant care workers had implications for their health. This included fatigue suffered as a result of long hours and lack of rest, work-related stress and social isolation as well as physical injuries and burns as they pursued their duties. This is consistent with global literature, as, for example, the World Health Organisation (2017) and International Labour Organisation (2016b) note the mental and psychological effects of care work related to emotional stress and anxiety suffered from strenuous living and working conditions and separation from the family. In her study of

Ethiopian women working in the Middle East, Fernandez (2010) highlighted that one of her participants suffered a mental breakdown as a result of physical exhaustion and lack of rest. Some studies have noted that migrant domestic workers face mental health challenges, which they believe stemmed from their immigration status, fear of authorities and being trapped in poor economic conditions in destination countries (Anderson, 2000).

Participants in this study revealed being treated differently when compared to their local counterparts, highlighting social divisions based on class, race, and nationality. They argued that employers were cognisant that South African workers had knowledge of the country's labour regulations and their rights in the workplace, and consequently preferred to employ migrant workers where they could take advantage of their desperate circumstances. This level of exploitation was further exacerbated by migrants' undocumented status. Migrant workers experiences of social divisions were are also illustrated in the South- North literature (Gurung, 2009; Denti, 2015; Puppa, 2012), with Gurung highlighting that this results in multiple layers of inequality and marginalisation. Further, participants explained that living conditions and treatment varied from one employment setting to another. While some participants were happy with their living conditions and relationship with their employers, other care workers experienced discrimination and verbal abuse. Poor living conditions characterised by different forms of abuse (mostly verbal in the form of insults) were consistent with the global literature on migrant domestic workers in other countries, as in the case of women migrating to the Middle East (Ketema, 2014; Laiboni, 2020), Asia (Huang and Yeoh, 2007) as well as in other African countries such as Ghana and Kenya (Awumbila et al., 2017b; BBC Africa Eye, 2019). The key findings discussed above highlight the marginalisation of Zimbabwean migrant domestic and care workers in the South African domestic sector.

The concept of social reproduction has been used to understand the exploitation of women of colour in the domestic sector with a focus on race, class, and gender. Through the lens of social reproduction, this study gives further evidence on how migrant women in South-South migration flows are disadvantaged and marginalised through their migrant status. While domestic work remains dominated by local South Africans, evidence from the participants emphasised that migrant women were at the bottom of their hierarchy in the sector as they could not access labour rights. Participants highlighted that they were exploited by employers who were aware of their circumstances as women in need of jobs who had limited choices and opportunities. The study reflected nationality as another factor that contributed to the exploitation of women. Structural factors such as high unemployment and economic decline in Zimbabwe were given as justification for the exploitation of migrant women who were treated as cheap and disposable labour. The incorporation of international migrant women in care work in South Africa represented continuities in respect of the deployment of migrants in the domestic sector. Literature on domestic work in South Africa argues that internal

migrants have dominated the sector since apartheid and illustrates their experiences of exploitation and oppression under their employers. In similar ways, international migrants continue to experience such challenges where they face labour abuses and lack of protection of their labour rights. The historical context of the domestic work sector in South Africa continues to shape experiences of international migrants who continue to face exploitation through nationality, race, class, and gender inequalities.

South Africa is considered a model in the provision of a comprehensive legislative framework for the protection of domestic workers. However, this chapter indicates that there remains a gap in relation to the protection of migrant domestic workers with the majority being undocumented. Despite evidence highlighting the importance of social security for domestic workers as a whole as their work is characterised by job insecurity, only two participants in the study indicated that they were registered for the Unemployment Insurance Fund.

The writing of this thesis was underway during the time of the global COVID-19 pandemic, which has highlighted the vulnerability of migrant domestic workers across the globe as well as in South Africa where these workers are not benefitting from social relief measures provided by the state, further emphasising that migrant domestic workers are not adequately covered in state policies. International media reports highlight that migrant domestic workers were most affected following the lockdown measures implemented by several countries, as they could not continue to work, or their employment was terminated (Davidovic, 2020). This was further compounded by the failure on the part of employers to offer financial assistance. In South Africa, media reports noted that many domestic workers were placed on unpaid leave. Most employees in the sector are not registered for UIF, more so for undocumented migrant workers. This situation of precarity has been magnified through the pandemic, as illustrated in the Daily News article below (Figure 5.1), which reports on the difficulties faced by domestic workers in South Africa to access support from worker relief schemes put in place by the government during this time (Tekie and Khunou, 2020; Wicks, 2020). Domestic workers suffered the knock-on effect from their employers, some who were not receiving full salaries and were at home. This resulted in job losses affecting the workers' livelihoods. Media reports noted that the domestic services sector was the most affected by the lockdown measures as about an estimated 250 000 workers lost their jobs in an industry with above a million workers in the industry (Sokanyile, 2020). For those who were still employed they also faced further restrictions in movements as they were not allowed to visit their families as employers tried to prevent the spread of the virus (Ndaba, 2021).

Figure 5.1: Newspaper report on UIF for domestic workers Daily News 14 May 2020

Plea for UIF relief to ease plight of domestic workers

ZELDA VENTER

ONE of the sectors which suffers the most under the lockdown provisions are domestic workers who cannot report for work unless they are living on the premises of their employers.

It is thus vital that they can benefit from UIF, says Pinky Mashiane, president of United Domestic Workers of South Africa.

Mashiane yesterday reminded employers that all domestic workers who work more than 24 hours a month must be registered for UIF, as prescribed by the law.

"Even if a domestic worker works more than 24 hours a week for different employers, those employers are obliged to register with different UIF reference numbers for the one specific worker," she said.

The South African Domestic Service and Allied Workers' Union, represented by the Socio-Economic Rights Institute, made recommendations to the National Command Council, Minister of Employment and Labour and the UIF commissioner seeking a declaration of domestic workers as UIF contributors.

This is so that they can access income protection during the state of disaster. These recommendations were endorsed by the United Domestic Workers' of SA and Izwi Domestic Workers' Alliance.

They said the Covid-19 pandemic and lockdown has had a devastating impact on the lives of domestic workers and their families across the country.

A mere 20% of domestic workers are registered for UIF. This means that the majority of workers cannot access the Department of Employment and Labour's Covid-19 Temporary Employer/Employee Relief Scheme.

This is because domestic employers did not fulfil their legal obligation to register them, while some registered domestic workers report that their applications for the scheme have been declined.

The Socio-Economic Rights Institute said the Unemployment Insurance Act enables the minister, UIF commissioner and board to deem individuals or a class of persons as contributors for the purposes of the act.

The institute, on behalf of the United Domestic Workers' of SA, rec-ommended that the minister and UIF board declare domestic workers, as a class of persons and UIF contributors for the purpose of the act, specifically for the duration of the pandemic.

The letter also recommended that the department create a mechanism for domestic workers to access the relief scheme directly from the department, as individuals or collectively through their unions.

The unions said they take note that employers who had not yet registered their employees for UIF, can now register them in order to benefit from the relief scheme, if the employers undertake to pay the debt owing to the UIF when they are able to do so.

They say that while this solution might aid employers and workers in other sectors, it is likely some domestic employers would rather dismiss their employees unfairly than pay their debt. In the case of vulnerable sectors like domestic work, the department needs to find creative solutions to support workers while holding employers accountable.

According to the unions, the department has neglected to directly address the 1 million domestic workers and their employers during the lockdown, leaving this vulnerable sector without clear direction.

Mashiane said desperate times call for desperate measures, and is calling on the department to urgently grant amnesty to domestic workers' employers to register their workers. "The aim is to promote compliance."

111

CHAPTER 6: TRANSNATIONAL CARE PRACTICES: BENEFITS AND COSTS

6.1 Introduction

This chapter examines the impact of cross-border migration on Zimbabwean women migrants under study, and their families, by focusing on the benefits and costs of this migration. The first section discusses the benefits accrued to the migrants themselves while the second section elaborates on the flow of transnational caring practices across nations. The focus of the third section is on the challenges that migrant women face in the wake of their migration to South Africa.

6.2 Benefits of migration

Previous studies have highlighted the economic and social benefits of migration to both the sending country as well as the destination country. From a broad perspective, Ratha et al. (2011: 11) argue that receiving countries benefit from migration as it increases productivity by allowing the local workforce to move into higher productivity occupations. It has been noted that migrant domestic workers contribute to the economies of destination countries by allowing more women to enter the labour market. For example, a report by Experian and Enrich (2019) highlights the impact of migrant domestic workers in some Asian countries, and points out that in Hong Kong, the estimated female labour force participation rate in 2013 increased to 78% for women with children who employed migrant domestic workers, thereby increasing dual incomes in households, whereas the rate for women who did not was 49%. Further, the World Health Organisation (2017) notes that migration assists in reducing unemployment, particularly in countries that encourage labour migration such as the Philippines.

At the micro level, relatively better income in destination countries is one of the main benefits of migration (Knight, 2012; World Health Organisation, 2017), which, among other things, enables migrant women to become financial providers in their families. Alluding to the phenomenon of contradictory class mobility, Parreñas (2015), for example, notes that women working as domestic workers typically report a decline in their occupational status but at the same time are able to improve their financial status. Migrant women in her study indicated that while they remained in the Philippines, their income was inadequate and did not provide enough for them to be able to accumulate savings. Conversely, in destination countries where they were employed in low status jobs, they were able to save some of their income for investments and other projects. Gurung (2009)'s study of Nepali women in the United States concurred, with participants adding that the income they earned was higher, more so in light of the exchange rate with Nepali rupees.

Global care chains are associated with enhanced agency, resilience and empowerment among women opting to participate. Kontos and Bonifacio (2015) note that while earlier literature has portrayed migrant domestic workers as victims, recent literature tends to focus on the extent to which they become income earners in their transnational families. They argue further that when women are income-earners, they have more control on decision making in the family, which highlights a shift in gender and power relations. The World Health Organisation (2017) adds that migrant women have asserted that they gain a sense of autonomy through their decision-making powers and freedom of movement as they can choose the destination countries they move to. For instance, scholars have highlighted how migration enables women to progress upwards as they move to different countries in search of better working conditions and salaries, thus displaying resilience (Parreñas, 2015). Furthermore, through their employment as care workers, migrant women are able to learn new skills, which contributes to their empowerment (World Health Organisation, 2017).

The ability to send remittances to families in the country of origin has been one of the significant economic benefits for migrant domestic workers (Basa et al., 2011; Orozco, 2010). These funds are typically used to improve the family's lifestyle and living conditions, funding children's education as well as enhancing social standing and facilitating investments in property and business (Knight, 2012; Ratha et al., 2011). Remittances can be used to reduce 'the depth and severity' of poverty (Ratha et al., 2011; World Health Organisation, 2017). Remittances are associated with mothering as they have been found to allow migrant women to fulfil their maternal obligations as providers in the families securing their children's needs and education (Fresnoza-Flot, 2009; Basa et al., 2011). Through funding children's education, Ratha et al. (2011) contend that remittances contribute to the development of human capital as migrant parents are able to send their children to good schools and to provide additional resources towards their children's education. Further, Fresnoza-Flot (2009) argues that mothers prioritise education as a step towards social mobility. The World Health Organisation (2017: 47) also notes that remittances allow members of transnational families to access health care especially in the case of the parents of the migrant workers, citing Bangladesh as an example where 'older people with migrant children were nearly one third more likely to enjoy lower morbidity and mortality than those whose children remained in their communities'. Orozco (2010) noted the gendered nature of remittances, suggesting that women send remittances frequently and consistently and send a larger share of their salaries than do men.

Moreover, remittances have the potential to improve family relations (Knight, 2012; McKay, 2007; Schmalzbauer, 2004). In her study of Filipino migrant workers in Hong Kong, (McKay, 2007) argues that remittances enable the strengthening of intimacy and relations between family members as well as within the extended family. Drawing on the experiences of her participants' pre-migration and after, for families that were in poverty before

migration, remittances from migrant parents enhance intimate care, which involves 'certain material security and minimal levels of provisioning that both enables and conveys expressions of emotions' (McKay, 2007: 187). For participants in the study, sending money to members of their extended family was a way of sharing emotions. The money transfers to the extended family are associated with expectations of reciprocation in the future as well as being a sign of the participants' reciprocity to those who had been generous to them. McKay adds that the ongoing communication between members of the transnational family about the money transfers provided a way of building and sustaining relationships. The author demonstrates that meanings attached to remittances are context-specific. In addition, Fouratt (2017) argues that remittances are associated with love as they are a strategy to maintain social ties. In her study of migrant workers travelling from Nicaragua to Costa Rica, remittances were used to construct houses, which she argues is an indication of the attainment of stability and continuity, notwithstanding migration representing movement and instability.

In this study, it emerged that, from the perspective of care workers, the positive impacts of migration can be at two levels: for the migrants themselves on one level, and on the other, for their transnational families who are in the country of origin. It is worth recalling at this point that the migrant care workers who participated in the study belonged to different forms of families. Sixteen participants had left their children in Zimbabwe, one had children in another country who were living with their father, four participants had some of their children living in Zimbabwe and others in South Africa, three participants had all their children in South Africa, of which two had returned after remaining in Zimbabwe for some time. Two participants did not have children. These last five took part in the study as they had parents and guardians they were caring for in Zimbabwe.

6.2.1 Benefits for the migrant women

Source of employment

The benefits explained by the migrant women were in relation to their main reasons for migration. For the majority, who had migrated for economic reasons, the ability to find employment was a major benefit. Thus, they became economically active by becoming income earners and financial providers. For participants who were vendors and traders, whose businesses had been affected by financial insecurities given the economic situation in Zimbabwe, being employed full-time improved their circumstances as they could earn reliable and steady incomes. Other participants had pointed out that they were undertaking casual and odd jobs in order to be able to sustain their families back home. For them, domestic work was a better option as it was lighter than the work they were doing in Zimbabwe. For example, Nokuthula explained that before migrating to South Africa, she had earned money through moulding and selling bricks as well as growing vegetables for resale.

She summarised the benefits of migrating to South Africa for herself and her family as she had become the financial provider in her family:

> We can't say coming to South Africa is a good thing but that it has helped us through tough times, we have become better people when we were once looked down upon. For me, I am a single mom, the marriage did not work out, so some were happy and laughed at me because I got separated from my husband. But for me it has changed my life … I am the breadwinner for my mom, she looks up to me. She is on medication. She has high blood pressure and she needs to take medication every day. After every three months, she needs transport to take her to the hospital for a check-up. I have to facilitate that. She is an older person who needs to eat good food. I do that. (Nokuthula, 41 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Through her migration, Nokuthula found a job that could assist her in caring for her elderly mother and children. She pointed out how her social status in the family and community had improved since becoming a breadwinner. Sibongile, a married woman from Johannesburg, pointed out that 'I will say, now I have got a job, my husband is not the only breadwinner, we have improved a lot' (Sibongile, Johannesburg). She pointed out that since she was employed, she had also become an income earner, and this had increased the income for the whole household.

Stable income

Linked to migration as a source of employment, participants highlighted that they now had a source of stable income.

> I was busy looking for a job in Zimbabwe, jobs are difficult to find. I got stressed and I lost a lot of weight because I was thinking of other means of survival. But now… I am no longer stressed; I am not stressed. If I decide to go back to Zimbabwe, but not working, you might not be able to recognise me, because of the weight loss, because I won't have any money as I won't have an income, you become stressed if you do not have a source of income. So, it's better. (Rufaro, 36 year old, live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Rufaro summed up the sentiments of most of the participants and highlighted the health implications of her lack of employment in Zimbabwe, which had been alleviated since she migrated to South Africa. Another respondent, Yolanda, argued that while she was employed in Zimbabwe as a domestic worker, she had been paid her salary intermittently and therefore was unable to plan and save. This was in contrast to when she was employed in South Africa,

where she received her salary on time every month allowing her to plan and budget carefully without any 'mistakes'.

Autonomy and independence

The ability to earn an income empowered the migrant women and allowed them financial independence to plan and save for various types of investments. They appreciated that they were no longer dependent on their partners or other relatives for support. For example:

> What changed is that now I earn my own money and I can do what I want, which I could not do when I was in Zimbabwe. If I want to buy anything, I can because I have my own money. So far everything is fine, the only challenge I have is freedom. In Zimbabwe, I was free, but I didn't have any money, I had to wait for someone to provide me with the finances, so it was difficult, it was like you were worshipping someone. (Thandeka, 35 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Thandeka notes that despite the challenges she faces at work due to restrictions in movement and social life thus she feels that she has no freedom, she is financially independent to make her own decisions. Another respondent, Sifiso, acknowledged that her family was happy that she was working after the father of her child had left her, leaving her dependent on the family for support. She noted that 'I think they have seen now that I have weaned myself from them and they are happy with it' (Sifiso, Johannesburg). As noted by other scholars, domestic employment offers a form of paid work and a source of income as well as independence and agency (De Regt, 2010a; Deshingkar and Zeitlyn, 2015; Knight, 2012). Parreñas (2015) discusses how migration allows migrants to mediate the unequal levels of economic development between sending and receiving countries. Despite receiving low remuneration, migrants are able to secure employment and tap into the stable economy in South Africa.

Improvements in health and well-being

The participants also asserted that they had noted personal growth and improvement in themselves after they were employed. Perceptions of personal improvement included improved health and well-being as well as English language proficiency and learning to use electrical appliances thereby improving their skills on the job. As illustrated in Rufaro's quote earlier on losing weight, many participants noted that their appearance had improved as they could take care of themselves in contrast to when they were in Zimbabwe. Further, Nokuthula stated that, 'I have changed, I am looking good, my health is right … I am able to help myself; if I get sick, I can go to the doctor. If I was in Zimbabwe, I would not be able to so that.' Participants' comments on improved health were related to access to finances and better health care facilities. Peberdy and Dinat (2005)'s study on the migrant and health

experiences of domestic workers in Johannesburg noted that women in this sector made use of health services when they needed them. A majority of them visited the clinic and state hospitals. However, only a few women were members of a medical aid scheme, which would allow access to private medical services. The study also noted that very few employers assisted with medical treatment. Further, Tshabalala and Van Der Heever (2015) indicated that migrant domestic workers in South Africa may face barriers to accessing treatment in clinics and hospitals because of their citizenship status and language barriers. In line with global literature, Peberdy and Dinat point out that domestic workers face significant health problems related to their work such as joint, back and limb problems among others (International Labour Organisation, 2016b; World Health Organisation, 2017). Thandeka further explained that her proficiency in spoken English had improved as she had to communicate in English with her employer and her employer's children.

6.2.2 Benefits for the families in Zimbabwe

Remittances

As discussed earlier in the chapter, the provision of material support to family members is an important form of care giving done through remittances. For the women in this study, the monthly remittances to Zimbabwe are typically used to pay for children's education and their everyday needs, assisting other family members such as parents and siblings, as well as buying properties or building a home and other assets (cattle). These are discussed separately in the following section.

Education and provisioning for children: transnational mothering

Sending remittances allowed the migrant parents to continue with their parenting responsibilities even when they were far away from their families. Providing for children's education and other needs was cited as a major benefit by the women who participated in the study. They expressed a sense of responsibility for their children especially in the absence of fathers thus underscoring how women were able to take on the role of financial providers. They pointed out that the main reason they undertook such jobs was so that they would be able to raise their children while stating the negative emotions they felt before migration when they could not provide for their children's needs. The migrant women emphasised that when they were in Zimbabwe, they had failed to fulfil their roles as parents as they could not financially provide for their children, as highlighted in the following quotes:

> If my child requests something, I am also able to provide for them because now I have the money to do so. Of which when I was in Zimbabwe, I was not doing anything, I was not working. It was difficult, if my child asked for something, I would feel bad … when I didn't have money… (Rufaro, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

… when I was in Zimbabwe, even for my son who is 21. I would ask for permission from the school for late payment. I would divide the payment into three per term or pay later in the term. But now, I can pay school fees even for two terms. My daughter also goes for civvies, my mom stays out of the location (residential area), it's (their home) not very far from the location but my daughter goes to school in the location. People actually think she is coming from town because she is looking smart, she does not wear a torn uniform, she has nice shoes, Toughees, and a nice bag and looks presentable. I can afford all those things. Even when its civvies, she dresses well like all the children from the town, things I could not do when I was in Zimbabwe. (Nokuthula, 41 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Women were able to reshape their roles as transnational mothers. Parreñas (2010: 1827) describes transnational mothering as the 'organisational reconstitution of motherhood that accommodates the temporal and spatial separation forced by migration'. She explains that migration results in changes in gender roles as it removes mothers from the home and redefines traditional understandings of mothering, which is considered to mean 'nurturing in close proximity'. For married women, Sibongile explained that as she and husband were working in the same industry characterised by low remuneration – her husband works as gardener – her employment allowed them to earn additional income, which benefitted her children as they could afford to send them to better schools.

… our jobs are not paying that much but if we combine our salary, it makes a difference, I would say, we have improved a lot together. … My kids are going to a good school, even if we take almost half of our salary paying school fees but I think it's an advantage and I think my kids will have a better future because, we have managed to provide a good education for them. (Sibongile, 33 year-old live-out care worker, Johannesburg)

These statements from the participants showing how their employment enabled them to provide material support were further demonstrated through several encounters with them during the fieldwork. I met one of the participants, Vimbai, at the main bus station in Johannesburg on a Sunday morning on one of her weekends off. As it was almost the end of the month, Vimbai was coming to the bus station to send some packages of goods to her children in Zimbabwe. The interview was conducted at a fast food outlet at the bus station after she had dispatched the packages, as she had to return to work before the end of the day. Vimbai has two children being taken care of by her sisters. She lamented how it was becoming increasingly expensive to send packages to Zimbabwe through the cross-border bus operators since bus drivers were charging exorbitant fees to transport goods to

Zimbabwe. This had a destructive effect on her finances as she pointed out that she was broke after sending the package. Parcels of goods sent to Zimbabwe – especially groceries – were precious commodities back home given food shortages and spiralling food prices in the country. This was noted by another participant, Nokuthula, who explained that during a time when there was a severe shortage of cooking oil in Zimbabwe, her family was not affected as they were well-stocked by the groceries she sent to them. Thus, bus drivers could profiteer from this exercise by escalating their charges. In another instance, Ruvarashe referred me to one of her friends, Tsitsi. I interviewed Tsitsi at Ruvarashe's rented accommodation during a weekend at the beginning of the month. At the time of the interview, Tsitsi was a live-in worker and often visited her friend on weekends to spend her off-days. She explained that she could not afford to rent her own place due to her low remuneration. Before the start of the interview, Ruvarashe was assisting Tsitsi to send money to her children in Zimbabwe through an 'agent' that Ruvarashe knew, and they were communicating with the person over the phone. During the interview, Tsitsi made reference to this incident as an act representing how she was caring for her children. She has six children aged 32, 31, 26, 24, 18 and the youngest was 11. Tsitsi, expressed that, '… yes, I take care of my children, I will never forget my children … you heard the phone calls about sending money home. I am sending it to my son (the eldest) and he will then distribute it' (Tsitsi, 48 year old live in care worker, Johannesburg). Tsitsi was sending almost half of the monthly salary to her children and by using this 'agent', it would ensure that her children received the money within a short time and in their preferred currency, South African rand, which would be more valuable in Zimbabwe. The above instances highlight how the migration of migrant mothers had assisted in mitigating some of the macro-economic factors experienced in Zimbabwe such as currency and food shortages as well as the lack of employment. This relates to Näre (2009)'s observations in her study on migrant women in Naples as she argues that transnational caring practices are not easy 'flows' but are 'bumpy' as they can be affected by other elements.

The notion of migrant mothers not forgetting their children was in addition related to being able to make sacrifices for the children. For example, Sarah declared:

> … I told her (my mother) that I am going back to South Africa because I want us to help each other to look after my daughter and for her to go to school. But if you put together my child and another one whose parents are both present, it's very different because I am striving and sacrificing for my child to go to school and dress well. (Sarah, 29 year-old part-time care worker Johannesburg)

In the above quote, Sarah makes a distinction between local families and transnational families and emphasises the sacrifices that migrant mothers make firstly by choosing to be separated from their children and therefore are not able to provide personal care for their children. The second sacrifice that mothers make is highlighted by Lucia who points out that

mothers often continue their employment as domestic and care workers even where the working conditions are harsh, so that they are able to raise their children. Parreñas (2015) argues that domestic work can be described as the labour of love as well as the labour of sorrow as the main reason for seeking domestic work is so that mothers are able to work and earn stable incomes and care for their children. However, this also results in separation from their children. Remittances were a sign of love and care from the parents as the migrant women related it to sacrificing for their children.

Caring for parents and siblings

Along with caring for their children, the ability to assist other members of their families (parents and siblings) was another important task for migrant women. They did this through sending groceries and well as money. Several participants pointed out that they had joined 'stokvels'[16] in which they would contribute money every month for a full year and then at the end of year, the money would be used to buy groceries in bulk for sending to their families in Zimbabwe. They felt a sense of responsibility especially for their parents, noting that there were cultural expectations related to caring for parents, and thus extended the breadwinning role to other members of their families. For example, in a quote highlighted earlier, Nokuthula explained that her mother depended on her to meet the costs of her medical treatment. She underscored sentiments expressed by several other women that they were caring for their parents, especially their widowed mothers, also pointing out how their parents' status had improved in their communities, as shown by Ratidzo:

> … it changed a lot; it has changed a lot in such a way that people can see that the family has a relative who is working abroad. Living conditions have changed. … Mostly for my mother, things have changed for her, being a widow, life was difficult for her, but I am able to support her in such a way that she is better off than most widows, even her dressing. (Ratidzo, 34 year-old live-in care workers, Johannesburg)

> … like when I came here, it was 2016, my step-father was very ill then, so my mom could not find time to go and plough the fields (she was the caregiver to the step-father) so I was helping my mom by providing for her needs. Even now, my step father passed away in January, so even now she needs my help… (Yolanda, 24 year-old live- in care-worker, Johannesburg)

---

[16] Stokvels in South Africa have been defined as 'saving schemes organized around structured gatherings of small groups of people, who would meet regularly at the house of a member to socialize and make payment into a rotating fund." Lindiwe, N. & Joseph, C. 2018. Success Factors and Gender Participation of Stokvels in South Africa. *Acta Universitatis Danubius: Oeconomica* [Online], 14. Page 219

Ratidzo emphasises recognition of the family's improved status by the community through her migration. In her study, Parreñas emphasises how single women face more pressure to take care of their parents than do married women. This was also apparent in my study. Married women highlighted that they would send material support for their parents occasionally as their focus was on their families.

In their study of migrant children and their parents, Baldassar et al. (2007: 78) argue that 'care giving between family members is not a straightforward product of fixed rules of obligation, but the result of longstanding processes of negotiation based on a combination of normative guidelines and negotiated commitments'. They contend that a sense of obligation is much stronger between migrant children and parents than between the migrants and their siblings. The authors further observed that transnational care giving was context-specific. In this case they pointed out the difference between the forms of care giving given by migrants and that by refugees. Baldassar et al. (2007) observed that material support in form of remittances was the most important form of care giving for refugees compared to migrants' parents who had better standards of living and therefore did not need ongoing material support. In contrast, families of refugees needed more support as they had moved from their countries and were living in transit countries in difficult economic circumstances. As has already been indicated throughout the chapter, many parents in Zimbabwe were living in difficult economic circumstances and thus required material support from their migrant children. For example, Rufaro highlighted that she and two sisters working in South Africa sent money to their parents to support them:

> … we send money to them to assist in addressing their needs, they need money for farming and for food. So, we are caring for them … my father works but you know the situation in Zimbabwe is tough, sometimes they don't get paid … so we have to assist them because we left our children with them (they are caring for them). (Rufaro, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

On the same point, Ratidzo explained that her family was happy that she was working in South Africa:

> They are happy because I am helping change things in their life so they are happy … when I say I am changing things in their life I mean … like I said before that if someone falls ill and they do not have money, I am able to send them money. If I was not here in South Africa, we would not be able to assist each other because we would all be facing the cash shortages in Zimbabwe. But because I am here, I am able to support them when they need the help. (Ratidzo, 34 year-old, live in care worker, Johannesburg)

Rufaro and Ratidzo's comments elaborate not only the idea of obligation but also that of negotiated commitment. Citing Finch and Mason (1993), (Baldassar et al.) explain that negotiated commitment is when migrants give support to family members not because it is the proper thing to do morally, but on the basis of working it out (Baldassar et al., 2007: 15). Rufaro points out that they give financial support to their parents as children ought to but also because their parents are in turn assisting in caring for their children while they are away. Both Rufaro and Ratidzo highlight a key issue raised by Baldassar and others on reciprocity. (Baldassar et al.) argue that transnational care giving is not only a one-way process but also involves non-migrants who are both care receivers and givers. Ratidzo also makes the assertion that members in her family assist each other in times of need, in this case with remittances to alleviate cash shortages in Zimbabwe. Baldassar et al. (2007) also point out that other forms of care giving that can be given by non-migrants includes providing emotional support to migrants (to be discussed in the next chapter).

Acquisition of investments and assets in Zimbabwe

Migrant women declared that through their income as care workers, they had managed to purchase assets in Zimbabwe such as land (stands) and building material to be used to construct the houses as well as household items such as beds, couches, TVs, fridges and other non-household assets such as cows. The assets were a sign of how migration had improved the living conditions of their families and households in Zimbabwe. They pointed out that despite the low remuneration, the steady income facilitated completing large projects. For example, Abigail from Johannesburg observed that, 'The little money that I earn can accomplish major things … like in Zimbabwe, there are stands for sale, you can buy your stand and build…'. Vimbai pointed out that she channelled most of her salary towards remodelling her mother's house.

> … the situation in my family has changed because we are building a house, we are extending my mother's house, it's a seven roomed house so I have noticed that I have managed to assist in lot of things with regards to the house we are building… I channel most of my money towards building, I managed to buy my TV, flat screen 50 inch I think, I managed to buy a bed and couches, I have also managed to get the house painted and a fridge … I have tried to build our home … in our family we don't have a brother, our dad passed away, we only had one brother, and the wife passed away. (Vimbai, 33 year-old, live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

In her study of migrant workers in Naples, Näre (2009: 232) argues that building a house or buying property was preparing and securing one's future as this was a 'tangible and permanent investment that retains its value over time better in economic downturns'. This aligns with the perspectives of the migrant women interviewed in this study as they viewed

buying assets as a sign of personal growth and improved status that could be recognised in the family as well as in the community. Vimbai's quote demonstrates the changing roles of women in light of migration. She contends that she has taken on the role of the provider and the backbone of the family in making efforts to build a home for the family in the absence of a male figure after her father and her only brother had passed away. Investments and assets in Zimbabwe were a benefit for both migrants as well as their families.

Remittances sent by the migrant women contributed to the improvement of living conditions for families in Zimbabwe as they did not only contribute money but also food, clothing, and building materials among other items of great value particularly in light of the economic decline in Zimbabwe. Ratha et al. (2011) argues that remittances have implications at household level as well as at the macro-economic level, highlighting that it 'reduces the depth and severity of poverty'. He further argues that remittances allow for the accumulation of assets and contribute to the development of human capital. This has been illustrated by the narratives of the migrant women detailing how they channel their finances towards the purchase of stands as well as the education of their children. Turning to social impacts, Ratha et al. (2011) stresses that migration contributes to the breakdown in family structures and relationships due to family separation while in the destination countries migrants face challenges of intolerance from the locals.

6.2.3 Ambivalences on the benefits of migration

I met Anna on a Sunday morning in June in a park in Johannesburg. At the time of the interview, she was 28, separated from her husband and her daughter was being cared for by her mom. She explained that she had not been able to go home since the previous year as things were not going well for her. She changed jobs several times because of low remuneration and bad relationships with her employers. When I asked her about how her migration had changed the circumstances in her family in Zimbabwe and the benefits she had gained, she was ambivalent, arguing that there were no major transformations in her and family's life in Zimbabwe.

> Anna: So far, I don't (laughs). There is nothing. … Because so far, if you look closely at the money I earn … when you get paid, you put all the money on the table, you realise, you cannot save anything, it's not enough, you see? You send money home; in my case, I have to buy toiletries on my own, you also need to take care of yourself, maybe I need clothes – it's not working – you just get paid and pass on the money. At the end of the day, you also need to go home to Zimbabwe, there might be a problem that requires you to go there, where do you start? So ...
>
> PB: *What about your family? In what ways would you say your migration has changed the situation or circumstances in your family back in Zimbabwe?*

Anna: It changed a little bit, because, if they tell me they have a problem, I am able to tell them to wait until I get paid or if I have just been paid, I am able to send them money. The way they were living. … *BUT* it's not like a lot has changed because when I was in Zimbabwe I used to work. … On money matters … the aspects that I have to do monthly (for my family), like to pay rent, buy food, clothe my child among others, I was able to do it when I was in Zimbabwe. I am still doing the same things when I am here. I expected that the income would be more, and I can save, if I wanted to continue with my education, I would be able to do so or do something but, it's has not been possible. So… (Anna, 29 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Anna raised several issues that were echoed by other participants expressing their bleak perception of their migration to South Africa. She pointed out that there had not been much transformation in her and her family's life because of the low remuneration she was receiving. She was only able to cover basic costs such as rent, food and clothes and therefore there was no room to save for bigger projects such as pursuing her education. She is also not able to save enough money so that she is able to visit her child and family in Zimbabwe. Kontos and Bonifacio (2015) assert that migrant domestic workers are different from other transnational migrants as their work conditions do not allow them to visit home often. In this case, Anna's remuneration does not allow her to visit home. Baldassar et al. (2007) argues that being able to visit home is one form of transnational care giving that Anna has been failing to fulfil, which can result in sadness, anxiety and stress, as will be discussed in the next section on the costs of migration.

6.3   Costs of migration

Notwithstanding its many macro and micro benefits, migration in relation to global care chains also imposes a number of costs on the women involved and their families. For example, a number of studies (Basa et al., 2011; McKay, 2007; Fresnoza-Flot, 2009) have highlighted the negative consequences related to remittances especially if not properly managed. Basa et al. argue that when demands for remittances are high, it puts pressure on migrant women such that they often take loans to meet the demands, thereby resulting in accumulation of debt. Consequently, the women are forced to continue working for a longer period than they initially envisioned. Thus women remain 'locked' into the global care chain. Further, Tolstokorova (2010) argues that when women become breadwinners, it raises their family obligations, which does not entail empowerment but exposes women to multiple levels of exploitation. Deshingkar and Zeitlyn (2015) contend that remittances build a culture of dependency.

The migration of women has also been questioned as it has been viewed as extracting care resources in the family where women are considered to be nurturers and primary caregivers

(Parreñas, 2010; Bonizzoni and Boccagni, 2013; Lutz and Palenga-Möllenbeck, 2012; Kontos and Bonifacio, 2015). Concerns are that migration destabilises and leads to a loss of intimacy within the family and has resulted in the transformation of households into transnational families (Parreñas, 2010; Kontos and Bonifacio, 2015). Bonizzoni and Boccagni (2013) point out that migration of fathers has been considered unproblematic as it is regarded as a 'natural' extension of the father's breadwinning role. However, female migration challenges the expectations of traditional or conventional motherhood, which is often associated with mother-child face to face interaction as well as 'nurturing in close proximity', highlighting the gender dimensions of migration. Scholars have noted the negative implications associated with migration in the public discourse (media, communities) where female migration has been associated with a 'moral panic' in response to children left behind, such that migrant mothers are accused of abandoning their children and leaving them vulnerable to abuse and moral deterioration (Parreñas, 2010; Bonizzoni and Boccagni, 2013; Lutz and Palenga-Möllenbeck, 2012; Tolstokorova, 2010; Fedyuk, 2015; Bastia, 2009; Bernhard et al., 2005). This is further associated with the perception that care provided by caregivers in the absence of migrant parents is 'qualitatively inferior and suspect' (Bonizzoni and Boccagni, 2013: 3). This results in the stigmatisation of migrant mothers where women are accused of neglecting their care giving roles in the family (Pyle, 2006). Pyle (2006) also highlights the guilt and pain suffered by migrant mothers associated with taking care of and providing love to the employer's children. However, other scholars have shown how migrant mothers can use the care they provide to their wards to extract advantages from the employing families (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2001).

Parreñas (2015) and Asis et al. (2004) highlight the emotional suffering family separation inflicts on both the migrant mothers and the children left behind. For migrant mothers, they report a sense of loss and helplessness as they have to accept their situation in order to be able to provide for their children. They miss out on the development and growth of their children and daily face to face interaction with their families. This may result in feelings of loneliness for the migrant mothers (Parreñas, 2015). Concerning children, Parreñas (2015) shows that children can experience anxiety, a sense of abandonment and insecurity. Moran-Taylor (2008) and Bernhard et al. (2005) also point to the growing feelings of distance in relationships between parents and their children when their separation is prolonged. In their study of Filipina women migrating to Singapore, Asis et al. (2004) found that migrant women's experience of family separation was characterised by a sense of dislocation and uncertainty expressed by being neither 'here nor there'. The scholars further highlight that while some women were able to build relationships with their employers' family, they were not fully incorporated into the family due to the conditions of employment, thereby perpetuating a 'sense of transnationality – forever in between families and never quite embedded in one set of family relations or the other' (Asis et al., 2004: 211). Tolstokorova (2010) argues that when mothers migrate, they experience 'parental cultural shock' where

they experience changes in attitude from their children. She argues that left-behind children may develop relationships with their caregivers and thus migrant mothers experience pain from a loss of intimacy between them and their children. She further contends that on their return, migrant mothers may face reverse cultural shock as they face challenges such as communication problems, misunderstanding and estrangement as they work to rebuild their relationships with their children. Pyle (2006) notes that the migration of women is associated with a loss of morals where left behind spouses view women as 'corrupted by the new lives' and as a cause of the spread of HIV/AIDS through working as part-time sex workers.

The World Health Organisation (2017) and Moran-Taylor (2008) argue that migrant parents may face long periods of separation from their families due to immigration regulations and other factors such as income, travel expenses and work conditions. The World Health Organisation report notes that immigration regulations in destination countries determine whether parents can reunite with their children or their ability to travel freely back home to visit their children. As some of the migrant domestic workers are undocumented or have overstayed their tourist visas, the implication is that they are not able to make visits to their children or family members and have to rely on regular communication in order to maintain contact with their families.

Some literature indicates that some fathers and spouses left behind in the country of origin take over the care of the children and that migrant mothers have to find ways to negotiate such that the fathers do not feel threatened by the breadwinning role the women have taken (Peng and Wong, 2016; Lan Anh and Brenda, 2011; Lam and Yeoh, 2018). However, some literature has pointed out that left behind fathers and husbands are not willing to take up caring responsibilities as this is viewed as a threat to masculinity, which can be compounded by limited chances of employment (Parreñas, 2010). Parreñas (2010) argues that the migration of women has not resulted in the reconstitution of the gender division of labour within the family as there is resistance both by men and the society, specifically in the Filipina society. She argues that fathers did not contribute much to child- care and housework in the absence of the migrant mothers. This has resulted in female kin (strong preference for maternal grandmothers, aunts, older female siblings) taking up the role of caregivers thereby intensifying the burden women face following an increase in household responsibilities. According to Parreñas (2010: 1848) this extension of work (overwork) for women 'reinforces the assertion that the international division of reproductive labour is indeed a relationship of inequality among women'. Knight (2012) further adds that the redistribution of care work to other women reinforces existing gender roles.

In this study, the costs of migration on care workers includes the emotional and psychological impacts of family separation, loss of care resources, limited visits to family and communication challenges. These and others ae discussed in the sub-sections below.

Emotional and psychological impact of family separation

The care workers, most of whom were mothers, used words as 'heart-breaking', 'painful', 'not easy', difficult', to describe their feelings and emotions towards their prolonged separation from their children, pointing out that they missed their children. Anxiety over the separation of families stemmed from social expectations related to motherhood. The women expressed the sentiments of ideal mothering, which they were failing to meet. For them, the ideal way of mothering was being co-present and being able to see their children growing every day. For example, Ruvarashe, a care worker in Johannesburg, highlighted that one of the greatest challenges she faced as a result of migration was that, 'You will be here in South Africa, but you will be thinking of your children in Zimbabwe'. Later on, during the interview, Ruvarashe noted that the separation from her children was 'heart-breaking … It's painful to live apart from your children, it does not make sense. You don't feel like you are a proper mother.' Participants said they yearned for the situation in Zimbabwe to improve so that they could go back and live with their children. Rufaro expressed that:

> … I am praying for the situation in Zimbabwe to improve, so that I can go back. The issue of staying far from your children is difficult. … I long for things to be better so that I can go back to Zimbabwe and take my child and live with him, waking up every day and preparing for him to go to school while I go to work. Yes! … The main issue is you miss your children, otherwise, you know that at the end of the month, you have money to send them. (Rufaro, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

The above quotes narrate the struggles faced by mothers to reconcile their roles as transnational mothers and the psychosocial stress related to it. Corresponding with observations made by Boccagni (2012), Ruvarashe demonstrates that migrant women are often faced with the challenge of 'double belonging', where they are separated from their children but their hearts are constantly with their children. She also questions her ability to fulfil her role as a mother as a result of the distance between her and children. Boccagni (2012) argues that physical distance is a major constraint in practicing motherhood, thus mothers often comfort themselves through the fact that they are able to be present in the children's lives through remittances. Further, the participants expressed a sense of helplessness as they pointed to the lack of alternatives. For example, Sinikiwe noted:

> Eish, it's tough when you are a parent but you realise that there is nothing you can do, because if I decide to sit at home and be with her, then she would not be able to go to pre-school, who will buy clothes for her (no one will provide for her). (Sinikiwe, 38 year-old live in care worker, Johannesburg)

As Sinikiwe illustrated, mothers are often motivated to migrate to seek employment so that they can provide for their children. They have limited options with regard to employment opportunities and domestic work is the only available option, which has stringent requirements particularly on the care worker's time. Mothering from a distance was an emotional and stressful experience. This situation was further compounded as both parents and children in the home country would also say that they missed their migrant mothers.

Impact on relationships with children and family

Distance impedes the ability of mothers to form strong bonds with their children. This is compounded by the working conditions of migrant women where they are unable to visit their families frequently. Even when they visit, they are not able to spend much time with their children as they had limited time before they had to return to work. This resulted in distant relationships. For example, Tendai pointed out:

> It also affects bonding with the children because we spend a lot of time apart and only get to be with them for very short periods of time. So, they grow up without a proper relationship with their parent. (Tendai, 28 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

In another example, Yolanda highlighted that:

> With the challenges, it's like since, I have not lived with my son for a long period of time, it's like my relationship with my child is not good, yes, because he is used to living with his grandmother, he only knows that I am his mother but to say he is aware of his mother's love, he doesn't know. He only knows that he lives with his grandmother, who has become a mother to him, something like that, so it's hard when you are living apart from your child because it hurts not to have a close relationship with your child. Sometimes, the child will start to wonder and ask the granny whether he does not have parents, something like that … sometimes when I call home, I am told he has gone to play but when he is around, we don't talk that much, you know having a relationship with someone who is not around is difficult. (Yolanda, 24 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Yolanda has been a care worker even before her migration. Thus, her son has lived with her mother for a long time given the working conditions. She laments that she cannot have a close relationship with her son who has now become more attached to his grandmother, acknowledging that it is difficult to maintain a close relationship when she is not physically present. It was painful for transnational mothers to see that their children had developed stronger bonds with their caregivers, and they referred to the caregivers as their mothers. As

indicated earlier in the chapter, there were different forms of transnational families where some children from one family lived in different households – some living in Zimbabwe and others living in South Africa. For example, Sifiso had one child, a ten-year-old boy in Zimbabwe living with her sister, while she was living with her younger child who was two years old at the time of the interview.

> My main concern is that as a mother, you want to be with your children. But in my case, I have one here and the other is in Zimbabwe, being separated from your family is challenging. … It's painful, I want to live with them, it hurts me because I want my children to live together in the same place because my son will start thinking that I don't love him. When I go home to see him, he is happy to see me for a short while, but you notice that his mom (my sister) whom he is living with now, is more important to him than me. (Sifiso, 30 year-old, live-out care worker, Johannesburg)

Loss of care resources

The migration of women represents the extraction of care resources from the families in the sending countries. Concerns raised by the participants about their failure to adhere to the social expectations of motherhood (co-presence) as highlighted in the previous two sections, demonstrates the loss of maternal care from the primary caregivers. For example, participants like Ratidzo expressed the pain of being separated from her child when she was still an infant to indicate the care gap she left when she migrated. Ratidzo gave birth to her child when she had already migrated to South Africa. When she was living with her husband and daughter, she worked as a live-out employee. However, she was separated from her husband and moved back into her employer's household. She had to send her child back home to live with her mother when she turned two.

> It's painful but I don't have a choice because leaving an infant is difficult. A child needs to be close to their mother so that they can be free in the way they live. Even now when I go home, my child no longer calls me mom, she calls me Aunty, its painful but I have no choice. (Ratidzo, 34 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

The care drain was further emphasised by the migrant mothers' anxiety over the care that their children were receiving in their absence. For example, Tendai was concerned that her children were not receiving the food and clothing that she was sending through the caregiver, which raised questions about the quality of care that her children were receiving.

… sometimes I send goodies (food and clothing) home but my children don't receive these things which hurts me because I am supposed to live with my family, partaking the same food with them. … So, when you send stuff through the (substitute) caregiver, most of the time, when you ask the children if they receive them; you find that they have not received them… (Tendai, 28 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

Of course, you have to think about your children but what comforts me is the fact that he is with my mother or with my sister, so it's better. If the paternal grandparents were to take him when I sometimes don't have money to buy airtime to call, you start wondering, thinking whether he is facing any abuse or did not sleep at home. You know children can face that kind of abuse. (Rufaro, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Other participants, Fungai and Tarisai, also highlighted their experiences with caregivers who abused remittances at the expense of their children.

Limited visits to family

Also linked with distance, and the living and working conditions of care workers, are the barriers presented by national borders. As discussed in the previous chapter, the majority of participants had entered South Africa on visitors' visas, and had overstayed, so their mobility was limited by immigration regulations. Chido explained that:

… it's difficult, it's not easy living far away from your family but you have to persevere but it's not easy. Especially for the child, you are here, you spend the whole year without going to Zimbabwe, it's difficult but there is nothing you can do. (Chido, 28 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

In another example, Nokuthula highlighted that:

I can say, living apart from your child its tough. Although I can talk to her on the phone, I go home only once a year, I am not able to go more than once because of the passport issues, it requires a lot of money. I won't manage or afford, so I just send stuff every month, then go home at the end of the year… (Nokuthula, 41 year old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

With a visitors' visa, a person entering South Africa may be allowed a maximum of 90 days per visit. However, for migrants to work, they require more days than allocated and are

forced to explore other avenues to continue living and working. They resort to sending their passports with the bus so that they can be processed out as indicated by Nokuthula. She noted the high costs involved in this process, which takes a substantial chunk out of their salaries. Migration impacts on other forms of transnational care giving such as visits, at the same time strengthening others, that is material support as well as communication with family members through phone calls and other social media platforms. Kontos and Bonifacio (2015) argue that the living and working conditions of live-in migrant domestic and care workers result in a different type of transnational family as visits home are infrequent. Travel costs tend to diminish the money that is meant for remittances and 'the priority of care needs of the employer and the risk of losing the job if they are absent for any substantial length of time' takes precedence over the employee's ability to take time off to travel. The authors note that in contrast to frequent mobility characteristic of transnational migration, care workers are immobile. Participants in this study highlighted similar challenges, which had an impact on their ability to maintain strong ties with their families. Some participants explained that they would send for their children to visit them. Rumbidzai explained that even when her daughter visited her, she was not able to spend enough time with her because she was a live-in employee.

Consequences of absence of parents

Participants raised fears about the perceived consequences of their absence on the upbringing and socialisation of children. They spoke of issues such as different parenting styles and discipline as well as anxiety over how caregivers would look after their children. For example, Tendai commented that:

> … I don't have time to discipline them, to teach them my own rules, they are being socialised by their caregiver. In the end it will affect me when I eventually live with them, I will have to teach them my expectations which can result in confusion for my children. (Tendai, 28 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

Tendai points out that because of the distance and the limited time that she is able to spend with her children is not enough to instil discipline in her children in her own way. She argues that when she eventually has the chance to do so, there is a possibility that this might be confusing to her children brought up in a different way than she might prefer. Tendai's comments relate to Parreñas (2015)'s notion of moral care. Parreñas (2015: 86) states that there are three forms of care needed in the reproduction of the family, which are moral care (related to the provision of discipline and socialisation of individuals into good citizens), emotional care (emotional security expressed through feelings of affection), and material care (related the provision of the needs of dependants such food, clothing among others). Tendai

notes that she is not able to fulfil her role as a parent as she faces difficulties in contributing to the upbringing of her children through providing moral care and, at times, she is also not able to provide material care as some of the items she buys for her children are not delivered to them. Similarly, Ruvarashe was not happy with the way her children were being raised. She explained that when she migrated to South Africa, the paternal grandparents took her children away from their caregiver. At the time of the interview, they were living with paternal grandparents in the rural areas.

> For me, when I was in Zimbabwe I used to stay at my father's house in the urban areas and my children had never experienced rural life. So, when I came here, my previous husband's parents knew I had left, and they came to fetch the children. My children were living at my father's home with one of my sister's children. So, they took the children to the rural areas. I am not used to the rural life, and its hurts me every day that my children are living that life. I think that life spells poverty but for those people used to it, its ok. I loathe that life. (Ruvarashe, 35 year-old, live-out care worker, Johannesburg)

Ruvarashe's quote highlights the challenges faced by migrant mothers as they have no control over decisions and actions taken in their absence.

Communication challenges

While some participants noted that they could communicate with their families through phone calls to provide advice and emotional support to their children and family members, or through WhatsApp where they could communicate through audio, video and images, they still pointed out the pain of not being physically present for their children. Participants enumerated challenges posed by the different communication channels, which hampered easy access to communication. WhatsApp was an affordable mode of communication for the participants. However not everyone including some of the migrants as well as their families had access to this platform, which required advanced and expensive smartphones (discussed in detail in next chapter). Another challenge was the accessibility of this platform especially in rural areas where the mobile network signal is poor. This was compounded if they did not have support from family in Zimbabwe, as is illustrated in Vimbai's case. Vimbai had two children, a nine-year-old girl and a seven-year-old boy being cared for by her two sisters – the children live with one sister, who is not married but is employed. Her other sister, who also lives in the same area, assists by caring for the children after school. During the interview, Vimbai spoke of the challenges she was facing in communicating with her children.

I used to communicate with my children when my sister (A) had a phone with WhatsApp but now she does not have that phone. So, communicating with my children is a challenge. That is one of the things that I have complained about, because they … I have another sister (B), who I mentioned that the husband passed away, lives in the same area. She has WhatsApp but her phone is also not working properly. They do not … like now when you send goods for the children, maybe you bought the kids something for winter … they don't send me pictures of my children wearing the things. So, my sister (B) later told me (as a way of comforting) that she (A) does not know how to do it and that it's not within her (she does not understand the importance or the value of this aspect). She does not know that I want to see the pictures of my children, she can go for five months, without sending photos of the children so that you know what's happening. So, my sister (B) said as long as she tells you that the children are well and not sick, then its fine … but I miss my children and would like to see them and to know how the clothes that I sent look on them. They don't do that, but I also can't put pressure on them, it's difficult. But when my sister had a phone, every Sunday I was able to talk to my children. (Vimbai, 33 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

While the family supports her by caring for the children when she is away, she highlights some of the challenges of managing relationships with the caregivers, which intensifies how much she misses her children. Vimbai describes the anxiety felt by transnational mothers about missing out on the development of their children. Other participants were emotional about missing important events in their children's lives. Vimbai laments that she is not well informed about what happening in her children's lives and the communication challenges can have an impact on the relationship between her and her children.

6.4   Challenges for migrant women in South Africa

In addition to the challenges of being migrants in general, the women in this study highlighted challenges related to South Africa in particular, being the destination country. Key among these was South Africa's notably high rate of violent crime including regular outbreaks of xenophobic violence (see, for example, (Neocosmos, 2010; Nyamnjoh, 2014), and rising incidences of gender-based violence (GBV). Indeed, during a national address in June 2020 the country's president referred to GBV in South Africa as the 'second pandemic' after Covid-19 (Ellis, 2020). As a result of these high rates of crime and gender-based violence, women live in constant fear. Thus, as noted in the previous chapter, several participants pointed out that they had not been interested in migrating to South Africa because of media reports of crime and xenophobia. For example, Chido explained that she chose to work as a care worker because of its advantages with regard to safety.

> For me, especially here in South Africa, I fear for my life, because I am scared. For example, when I worked at a supermarket, I would start work from 6am and knock off at 8pm. I am afraid of moving around at night, so walking around at night, with what you hear from other people, so I thought if I looked for a job as domestic worker, I thought it would be safe, because I will be safe. (Chido, 28 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

Chido illustrates that she chose a low status job in the domestic services sector because of the advantages it offers to her in terms of protection. Her job allows her to remain in the confines of the private household thus she does not have to walk around at night as her previous job required. However, while Chido felt domestic work provided her a safe haven, other participants highlighted safety concerns related to this job. For example, Abigail pointed out that she did not feel free and safe when searching for jobs because 'you get called for an interview and you just go but you don't have enough information about the person you are going to meet … like what type of person they are, are they genuine, are they not criminals so it's not safe' (Abigail, Johannesburg). Two participants related how they had witnessed robberies within the households where they worked, which contributed to their sense of insecurity. Further, Sifiso's quote below sums up the challenges faced by migrant women in their everyday experience of going to and from work. She points out perceptions held by the locals over migrants, which are part of the public discourse in South Africa.

> Also, when you are here, you are not that free when you are being called a foreigner, because of the disturbances that occasionally occur. Even when you are in the queue for transport on your way to work, you often hear people say we are taking their jobs here in South Africa. When there is a strike, you are told that everyone should not go to work, but you want to go to work because your employer says you must come to work. Sometimes they say foreigners have done this or that … you live in fear and you are afraid if you go out, with your passport, when you have overstayed maybe you will run into the police. Such things … you do not feel that free. (Sifiso, 30 year-old live-out care worker, Johannesburg)

Because of their fears of crime and xenophobia, participants noted that they did not feel a sense of belonging in South Africa, highlighting that they were not 'comfortable' and that one had to constantly 'watch your back'. These fears were further reinforced by the fact that most participants lived in areas characterised by service delivery problems and poverty, hence crime was high. Media reports also indicate the high rate of crime in townships, which

were described in Chapter 3 as neighbourhoods located on the periphery of cities and towns that are characterised by limited access to social services.

> … even for us here in South Africa, you know, if you are not in your country, you have to always watch your back especially when you go to … here in Pretoria we are free, if you go to Joburg, when you are walking, you feel your hair standing on the end. … Even if you are approached by the police, you are not sure whether they are proper or bogus police. So, you see, when the county you are in is not your country, it's not yours. In our country, you feel free to walk at any time, can you walk in this country at night? It's not possible ... we don't feel like we at the home… (Lucia, 44 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

The above sentiments align with those raised by women in Knight (2012)'s study on transnational migration from Nicaragua to Costa Rica where she argues that women's fears and insecurities are worsened because of their status as 'illegal' migrants.

Similarly, Thandeka highlighted her concern over her lack of freedom because of the working conditions at her workplace, which are associated with live-in work. This had a negative impact on her social life.

> … what hurts me is that there is no freedom. You are not free. If you think that you are living in someone else's house, whatever you want to do, you have to ask first, you just can't do what you want. … (Later during the interview) … Do you know, just living in somebody's else house, where they tell you what to do, it's tough but if you are in your own household, I can wake up anytime I want, I can go anywhere but now you … today is a Sunday, once you enter the gate, you don't have an opportunity to go out until the next weekend. And for you to have a visitor, to come and see you by the gate, they start asking you questions about the identity of your visitor. So you try and avoid having visitors. (Thandeka, 35 year old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

The above quote illustrates how migrant domestic workers live in isolation and are denied a social life through the living conditions in their workplace where their employers place restrictions on visitors.

Orozco (2010) has noted that while studies have focused on the transnational households and employers' households in global care chains, not much attention has been given to the migrant households in the destination countries and their quality of life. In this study, most participants, even those that were live-in workers, maintained a household in South Africa, which they retired to on their off-days and on the weekends. Given their remuneration, I

asked them how they managed to sustain two households, that is both the transnational family and their weekend homes in South Africa. Participants indicated that they were sharing their accommodation in order to cut down on the cost of rentals. While this may imply lack of privacy, it was also a source of social support as migrant women shared accommodation with fellow Zimbabweans who were either friends or relatives. For instance, Tendai noted:

> The little you earn, you have to share it to cover both households, because most of the time during weekends … where I stay, there are three of us sharing one room … and most weekends on Sunday, I have a part-time job so the money I get from that job I use it to pay for rent and buy food. (Tendai, 28 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

In an informal conversation, Tendai highlighted that rentals in the area where she lived were around R800 (US$47) a room. Another participant, Nokuthula, related similar experiences of sharing accommodation and costs of rentals.

> When I came here, I came with a friend … she lived with me and I was working part-time jobs. I got a job in a complex where I was getting paid R800 (US$47) per week I think, then I could afford to pay my rent and I moved out and started living alone. I was sharing with another lady, we were paying R1400 (US$83) and we would pay R700 (US$41) each … Then I also called my sister's child who was in Zimbabwe and was also struggling, to come and look for a job since I was a stay-in and only came home on weekends so that she could look for a job while she was living in my room. But the other lady was not happy about this arrangement, that's when I moved to this place. I have been living in this place since 2015. I started living in a smaller room but when the owner built other rooms, I decided to move into a bigger room. I pay R900 (US$53). (Nokuthula, 41 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg).

For participants who were living with their children in South Africa, they had additional expenses for childcare to think about. For example, Sinikiwe demonstrated the financial challenges she faced.

> … the remuneration is little because right now I am earning R3000 (US$177) it's too little because my daughter's pre-school is R1000. How much will I be left with? How about me? I have to pay rent where I live, then the money is finished. (Sinikiwe, 38 year old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Another participant, Sifiso, had one child in Zimbabwe and was living in South Africa with her second child, a two-year-old girl, together with her husband. She took her child to a day

care centre on her way to work and on weekends when she went to her part-time job; she paid the day care centre R50 (US$3) a day for child-care services over weekends. If employers were paying an average of R200 (US$12) a day for part-time work, for Sifiso, a quarter of that amount was spent on child-care services. However, those day care fees were comparatively more affordable, as other day care centres in other areas were charging around R150 (US$9) a day on weekends. Sifiso's case highlights some of the challenges faced by migrant care workers in balancing their work and family care responsibilities, which had an impact on their quality of life. Working part-time jobs on weekends also meant that they had very little time to spend with their families further reinforcing the guilt they had for caring for their employers' children while they did not have enough time to spend with their own children.

6.5 Discussion and Conclusion

This chapter explored the benefits and costs of migration on Zimbabwean migrant care workers in South Africa as well as their families in Zimbabwe. The chapter investigated the flows of transnational care practices among families situated in Zimbabwe and South Africa. Women who were employed as domestic and care workers indicated that the major benefits they had noted following their migration to South Africa was the opportunity to find employment, which enabled them to become economically active as income earners and financial providers. In this job, they were earning a stable income, which had been difficult for them to accomplish when they were in Zimbabwe. As income earners, the participants became financially independent and were able to make their own decisions to further alleviate the psychological challenges they had faced previously, such as stress and loss of weight as a result of lack of means of survival. These benefits have been highlighted in other migration flows such as the South-North stream (Knight, 2012; World Health Organisation, 2017; Bikova, 2017). The migration of Zimbabwean women to take up care jobs in the domestic sector in South Africa illustrates the productive and reproductive labour that women do to ensure the survival of their children and families, which is described by (Schmalzbauer, 2004) as 'motherwork' referring to the strategies poor women employ to gain income and provide for their children. This migration stream is similar to the South-North migration flows where women migrate in order to be able to work and provide for their children (Fresnoza-Flot, 2009). The migration of women to be employed in the domestic sector highlights their productive roles as they become economically active income earners, which further allows them to continue with their reproductive roles of caring for their families. Scholars of South-North global care chains point out that migration is a gendered activity in which women even in their absence are expected to continue to perform care work for the family and to maintain intimate and emotional relations (Fresnoza-Flot, 2009).

Through the income they earned, the participants in this study were able to engage in transnational care practices reflected in the flows of remittances in the form of money,

groceries, and clothing to their families in Zimbabwe. An interesting aspect that was revealed in the chapter was the importance of remittances in the form of consumption goods (food and groceries). Food remittances are important for food security and were consistent with the participants' reasons for migration. This emphasised the increased volumes of transnational activities between Zimbabwe and South Africa. It has been argued that remittances of in-kind goods, which are often done through informal channels, has been largely ignored when this type of remitting is a significant component of the overall remittance flows within SADC countries (Crush and Caesar, 2016). The scholars argue that goods remittances were most important in Zimbabwe, Mozambique, and Lesotho. The remittances sent by the mothers were able to mitigate against the economic difficulties being experienced in Zimbabwe such as currency and food shortages as well as increases in food prices, thus averting hunger and poverty in their families. This aligns with observations by Ratha et al. (2011) who argue that remittances have implications at household level as well as at the macro-economic level, where they argue that it 'reduces the depth and severity of poverty'. These scholars further argue that remittances allow for the accumulation of assets and contribute to the development of human capital in both receiving and sending countries.

Goods remittances remained crucial even during the lockdown put in place in South Africa from March 2020 to reduce the spread of the COVID 19 virus. The lockdown measures restricted the movements of goods through informal channels and therefore present a challenge for transnational households in Zimbabwe. A mobile application that facilitates the payment of goods between migrants in South Africa and the recipients in Zimbabwe who are able to collect their items at a designated point, has become a popular way of transferring goods between South Africa and Zimbabwe (Mathe, 2019). This application assists migrants to circumvent the challenges related to using informal channels, which include the high costs charged by cross-border operators and a potential loss of goods (Nzima, 2017). The movement of food across borders was also noted in migration flows from Nicaragua to Costa Rica (Knight, 2012). Because of the long distances in the South-North migration, the movement of large volumes of goods is costly; studies have in addition indicated that the movement of gifts makes up a substantial portion of cross-border remittances (Fresnoza-Flot, 2009).

Through the provision of material support for their children's education and well-being, the women in this study were able to show their love and caring for their children. Migrant mothers took up the role of transnational mothers, indicating how their roles have been redefined to take into account the distance and absence from their families. As participants indicated, the steady income aided in the completion of bigger projects such as construction of houses and buying stands, which were tangible investments and signs of social mobility and improved status in the community. The literature on South-North flows has noted the importance of remittances in the survival of families and communities (Basa et al., 2011;

Fresnoza-Flot, 2009; Schmalzbauer, 2004). For example, Schmalzbauer (2004) in her study of Honduran migrants in the United States observed that remittances were a source of income for migrants' families in Honduras and were used to buy food and medical supplies, to pay for school fees as well housing materials and to support informal businesses. This observation was substantiated in this study where remittances were used to sustain the families' needs and for children's education. Other goods covered by remittances included land, houses, and building material, all deemed important for raising the socio-economic status of the family in the community. Similarly, remittances were perceived as a way to express caring and maternal love. The concept of transnational mothering, which is highlighted in South-North migration flows, was apparent in this study too, as women continued to fulfil their caring roles through financial and in-kind remittances.

Further, similarities were seen in the use of remittances to maintain relationships with extended members of the family. In this study, other than providing for their immediate families, that is their children, the migrant women also assisted the families of their siblings and elderly parents who were involved in caring for their children in their absence. This was observed in studies by (Parreñas, 2015; McKay, 2007) as a sign of reciprocity and maintenance of kin relationships. Single parents highlighted caring for their parents with married women focusing on their immediate families and assisting parents when they could. This seemed to confirm Parreñas' observations that among Filipina, single women were expected to care for their elderly parents.

In addition, this chapter also revealed the costs of migration by highlighting the challenges faced by migrant women following their migration to South Africa. The challenges included emotional strain suffered as a result of being separated from their children and other family members, which in turn instilled feelings of having failed to perform the role of mother and a sense of hopelessness. The extraction of care resources was illustrated when mothers bemoaned being separated from their young children who still required maternal care. Mothers could not continue their own social reproductive roles in the family such as participating in the upbringing and socialisation of their children and instilling their preferred regimes of discipline, which required their presence. Migrant mothers had limited opportunities to visit their families often due to working conditions and other factors such as travel costs and their migrant status. This sometimes had an impact on their relationships with their children, which were characterised by weak bonds and estrangement. They could not spend enough time with them to cultivate meaningful relationships. Thus, migrant care workers made use of other transnational care practices such as providing material as well as emotional support through communication, which will be discussed further in the next chapter. The benefits and the costs of migration highlighted by the participants indicate the different transnational care practices available to migrant workers, specifying those they employ and those they face constraints in taking up. Through the framework of the theory of

transnationalism, this study highlights the transnational care practices that are employed by migrant domestic workers aligning with other studies discussed in the literature in South-North migration (McKay, 2007; World Health Organisation, 2017; Baldassar et al., 2007).

Some participants were sceptical of the benefits of migration given the low remuneration they were receiving in South Africa. Salary variations for care workers in South-South migration in comparison to South-North show the range of benefits that may be accrued in the different migration flows. A global wage comparison provided by WageIndicator 2020[17] shows that domestic workers in South Africa earned less than their counterparts in Denmark, the Netherlands and the UK. Thus, while the remuneration they earned was better than what they could earn in Zimbabwe, it was less than what was available to care workers in the South-North flow. Zimbabwean migrants in South Africa were therefore limited in their ability to afford improvements in personal growth and other investments in the sending countries.

When highlighting the benefits and costs of migration on households within the global care chains, Orozco (2010) and Parreñas (2015) points to the 'contradictory impact' on different households (families) within the care chain. They highlight that economic gains do not necessarily erase the emotional challenges of family separation. Parreñas discusses the pain that transnational mothers face due to being separated from their families, noting the contradiction that parents are separated from their families through migration, however they are forced to accept the situation as they are dependent on the income they earn for the survival of their families. She states that the pain of family separation is intensified when women have to perform care work for their employers while they are not able to provide the same caring responsibilities to their own families. Parreñas (2008) highlights another element of contradiction with regard to transnational families. She argues that the maintenance of transnational families transcends national borders, however the formation of transnational families emphasises the enforcement of national borders, which affects the migrant women. In this study, participants lamented their infrequent visits to their families as immigrations regulations limited their mobility. As this study shows, the majority of participants had 'overstayed' their visitor's visas and therefore were not able to maintain ties with their families through regular visits. Yeoh and Ramdas (2014:1198) contend that a key argument that has come out from the literature on transnational migration and gender is that 'mobility across borders is not necessarily empowering, while immobility is not necessarily disempowering'. This argument is relevant in this study as cross-border migration is seen as both empowering and disempowering. The benefits gained by migrant women through their employment underscores the empowerment of women as income earners and financial providers. However, the challenges faced by women in relation to family separation and loss

---

of care resources 'creates an immense sense of ambivalence for migrant women' (Yeoh and Ramdas, 2014: 1200).

Apart from the abuses and discrimination faced by migrant workers within the workplace as discussed in Chapter 4, the study revealed that migrant care workers in South Africa are faced with gender-based violence and xenophobia. Participants expressed that they lived in fear as they were aware of outbreaks of xenophobic violence. Mlilo and Misago (2019: 2) report on xenophobic attacks from 1994-2018, noting that while widespread attacks on migrants were recorded in 2008, the trend has continued over the years emphasising that 'hostility is pervasive and is a serious threat to outsiders and local community lives and livelihoods'. The report also points out that violence regularly occurs in major cities, towns, townships, informal settlements[18] and rural areas across the country. Scholars such as (Jürgens et al., 2013; Nyamnjoh, 2014), have pointed out that townships are most seriously affected. Migrants from African countries have been targeted as they are viewed as competitors for jobs and accused of draining South Africa's resources such as housing (Dube, 2019). As noted in this chapter, many migrant domestic workers live in townships and therefore may be subject to violence in their job searches or as they make their commute to and from work. Media reports have shown that the during xenophobic attacks migrants are often displaced from the areas where they live or are forced to go into hiding. While the level of gender-based violence against women generally high in the country, xenophobic violence further compounds the situation leaving migrant women especially vulnerable as they can become victims of sexual assault and violence during such attacks (African News Agency, 2019; Ajiambo, 2019). This further emphasises the multiple layers of exploitation and marginalisation that migrant care workers are exposed to through gender and nationality. Further, as illegal migrants, they may choose not to report such cases to the police out of fear of being deported. As a result of their undocumented status, migrant care workers tend to receive lower wages, as discussed in Chapters 4 and 5. In comparison to other migration flows, the level of hostility in South Africa is high as it includes the potential threat of sexual and physical violence against migrants. For example, Kenyan women migrating to the Middle East noted harassment from their employers and their friends and relatives, which included insults aimed at the migrant workers' race and religious beliefs (Laiboni, 2020). Similarly, Jureidini (2005) highlights three forms of xenophobic practice against migrant domestic workers from Sri Lanka, the Philippines, and Ethiopia working in the Middle East

---

[18] The Housing Development Agency (2012: 6) citing the 2001 census, defines an informal settlement as an 'unplanned settlement on land which has not been surveyed or proclaimed as residential, consisting mainly of informal dwellings (shacks)' where an informal dwelling is also defined as a 'makeshift structure not erected according to approved architectural plans' (The Housing Development Agency. 2012. *South Africa: Informal settlement status*. Johannesburg: The Housing Development Agency.)

countries, which includes a preference for temporary contract labour that excludes possibilities for citizenship, preferential treatment for local nationals in relation to foreign workers and attitudes of disdain towards those who are perceived as different, some of which have been discussed in Chapter 4.

CHAPTER 7: CARE ARRANGEMENTS AND COPING STRATEGIES

7.1   Introduction

The previous chapter discussed the benefits and costs of migration for the migrant women and their families. This chapter discusses the care arrangements made by migrant mothers for their children in their absence as well coping mechanisms they employed as they carried out their duties. The chapter begins by discussing how migrant care workers reorganise their care in the countries of origin. Issues of transnational communication are then discussed; this is followed by an overview of personal and coping strategies before the chapter concludes.

7.2   Caregivers and the reorganisation of care

Migration results in the reorganisation of care as some members of the family must take up extra care duties while some are relieved of theirs (Bikova, 2017). According to Peng and Wong (2016), gender relations shape care arrangements in this regard as in most societies the gendered division of labour in families ensures that women are responsible for most of the caring tasks. To this end, the migration of mothers often leaves a care gap that is filled by female kin. The impact of the absence of migrant women is not only seen on children but also in the care of the elderly who are the parents or guardians of the migrant women. It is often assumed that the younger generation will take care of the elderly particularly their children. As noted earlier, female kin is the preferred caregivers for left-behind children and a woman's ability to migrate is often reliant on finding a caregiver for her children. This demonstrates the role of caregivers in transnational migration, where Moran-Taylor (2008) emphasises that care takers are central to the maintenance of transnational migration and should be acknowledged for their role in the social reproduction of the next generation.

For care workers in this study, most of whom live with their employers, their working conditions often did not allow them to bring their children along and therefore their children were left behind in Zimbabwe. As a way to resolve the care gap left through their migration as well to reduce the psychological stress of being away from their children, the women had to find suitable substitute caregivers to take over their caring responsibilities. Strong family networks are important for the operation and maintenance of transnational families (Parreñas, 2008; Fresnoza-Flot, 2009; Moran-Taylor, 2008). Fresnoza-Flot (2009) argues that the extended family plays an important role in migration through the care of children. She adds that for migrants, finding a caregiver from their family to care for their children in their absence was a valuable strategy of indirect mothering. Analysis of the care arrangements made by the participants in this study demonstrated that migrants who had strong family support or wider family networks had a wider choice in terms of choosing suitable caregivers.

7.2.1 Female kin

Corroborating other studies (Peng and Wong, 2016; Pantea, 2012; Parreñas, 2010), this study found that migrant mothers preferred grandparents particularly maternal grandmothers as caregivers. This was followed by the migrant mother's sisters (children's aunts). The literature on transnational families has referred to these women as 'other mothers' (Fresnoza-Flot, 2009; Schmalzbauer, 2004). Participants emphasised their relationship with them and the trust they had in the caregiver's ability to provide care to their children. The choice of caregiver helped to reduce anxiety about whether the left-behind children were receiving adequate care in the absence of their parents. For example, the three quotes below illustrate the preference for maternal grandmothers.

> I don't have a problem because she (her mother) is the one person that I trust like among all the people around me in my family, in the world, where, everywhere, she is my number one… (Anna, 29 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

> I am happy that my mother is taking good care of my child because my child takes her as her mother more than me, otherwise, if she was being ill-treated, she would not do that. (Ratidzo, 34 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

> … I am happy and I am grateful because there are other people whose parents have passed on, they don't have anyone to take care of their children if they decide to leave and come to South Africa, especially this youngest one. So, if he is with my mother, I am happy and my heart is content because I know whatever food my mother is having, he will also eat the same food. Yes, so I am very happy. It's the same with the one that lives with my sister, my heart is content because there is no way she can mistreat her, she treats her like her own child. (Rufaro, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

The quotes highlighted above indicate the close relationship the migrant women have with the caregivers. As Rufaro stresses in her comment, she is assured of the care that her mother will provide to her son as her parents raised her and her siblings. This confirms observations by Lutz and Palenga-Möllenbeck (2012) that grandmothers were seen as 'devoted carers and most reliable'. Peng and Wong (2016) make similar observations when discussing the criteria that migrant mothers employ in choosing a suitable caregiver. They argue that the three criteria that migrant mothers use when searching for primary caregivers are reliability, feasibility, and availability. On the question of reliability, the indicators include 'love for left-behind children, childrearing experience, and their relationship with the migrant mother' (Peng and Wong, 2016: 2027). Further, as pointed out by Pantea (2012), when mothers migrate, grandmothers often have to cope with challenging situations that might include difficult economic circumstances or other family conflict. In our interview, Rufaro explained

that her close relationship with her parents reduces her worry even when she cannot afford to make calls to her family all the time, because she is assured that her children are in good care. The quote from Rufaro highlights the importance of substitute caregivers in supporting the transnational migration of women. Rufaro mentioned that she was able to continue with her migration as she had caregivers to take over her family care responsibilities. The caregivers enable the continuation of the social reproductive roles played by women as they fill in the care gap left by the physical absence of women in the country of origin. Rufaro was able to support the caregivers through the remittances she sent and the regular communication with her family back home.

Further, migrant mothers expressed the maternal care provided by the caregivers who they referred to as the mothers of their children. They pointed out that the caregivers were caring for their children as their own. For example, Rufaro elaborated that her sister cared for her daughter like her own child.

> (My daughter) living with my sister; she is living with her mother, although I sent money for school fees and school provisions (shoes, books, socks); she is also assisting me with other things as she is working … she is helping me a lot … because if I tell her that I do not have money, she will tell me not to worry, she will buy (the required stuff). She treats (her) like her own child. (Rufaro, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Rufaro highlights the reciprocal nature of the relationship between herself and her sister as they support each other in raising her daughter. She considers the support from her sister of providing for her daughter's needs as showing love and maternal care towards her daughter.

Interview data highlighted that children left behind by migrant mothers were sometimes living in different households. Migrant mothers enlisted the help of various members within the wider family network in order to meet the children's care needs depending on the circumstances at the time. Migrant mothers born in larger households had more caregivers available highlighting that family dynamics were a factor in care arrangements. This shows that migrant mothers had to negotiate with their extended family over care arrangements. Participants pointed out that detailed planning and careful consideration goes into selecting a suitable caregiver. Decisions about care giving involved not only the migrant mothers, but the entire family.

Several factors were considered in relation to finding a suitable caregiver, such as availability, the ability of the caregiver to provide care, as well as the migrant's relationship to the caregiver. Two cases illustrate the decision-making processes entailed in transnational care. Rufaro had two children from different fathers. At the time of the interview, her first

child, a girl in the second year of secondary (high) school in Form Two (around 14 years of age) was living with one of her sisters, and her son in primary school in Grade 3 (around 8 years), was under the care of the maternal grandmother. Rufaro was born in a family of five, but she and her two sisters were living in South Africa. Following Rufaro's migration, her mother became the primary caregiver of her children. However, when her daughter began secondary school, Rufaro had to make changes to this arrangement. The father of the child had requested to take over the care of the child and wanted her to live with him in a different town. Rufaro explained that one issue that had influenced this decision was proximity to the high school that the daughter was going to attend. The school in the grandmother's area was far away and children had to walk long distances to and from school. However, the father passed on during the daughter's first year of secondary school and Rufaro's family did not give consent for the paternal family to continue caring for the daughter because Rufaro and the husband were separated. Therefore, this arrangement had to change again. Rufaro preferred for her daughter to live with her brother in the urban areas. However the schools in the area where the brother lived were expensive, and the daughter eventually went to live with Rufaro's sister in another town. The sister was married and was caring for two other children, her own child with her husband and her husband's child from his previous marriage. Rufaro's sister was also previously married and had a child from her first marriage who was under the care of the grandmother. Thus, Rufaro's mother was caring for three grandchildren, two of which were the children of migrant mothers. Rufaro's case highlights the various decisions she and her family had to make in regard to caring arrangements as well as the alternative caregivers available to her. Her narrative further highlights the nuanced family dynamics that influence caring decisions. The case confirms assertions by Bikova (2017) that migration reorganises care in such a way that some family members receive extra care duties while relieving others of theirs. Following her absence, the care arrangements for Rufaro's children changed from one caregiver to another, relieving some caregivers while others took up these responsibilities.

In the second case, Vimbai had two children, a daughter aged 9 and a boy aged 7. Vimbai was born in a family of seven children with six girls and one boy. At the time of the interview, Vimbai told me that her father, brother and one of her sisters had passed away. Three of her sisters are married and one is not. One of her sisters lived in South Africa with her family. Like Rufaro, Vimbai's children have different fathers. With the consent of her mother, Vimbai left her children in the care of her two sisters who assist each other in caring for them. Vimbai's sister who is not yet married, is the primary caregiver and the children live with her. She runs her own business in town and therefore is at work during the day. When she is at work, Vimbai's other sister who lives in the same area assists with taking care of the children when they come home from school until their primary caregiver returns from work.

When caregivers have their own families, taking up extra care responsibilities may be a challenge for them. This can be seen in Vimbai's case when she raised concerns that indicated she understood the burden placed on caregivers despite pointing out that she was happy with how her sisters were taking care of her children. She related an incident regarding her daughter's educational activities where she had made arrangements for her daughter in Grade 4 to receive extra lessons. However, in one of her communications with the child's teacher, the teacher advised her not to continue paying for the lessons as the daughter was no longer attending. I asked her if she was told the reason why her daughter was not attending the lessons and she made the comment below:

> Because … the problem is that my sister who is looking after them, has her table (vending stall) in town, so she leaves in the morning and she returns home around 8-9 at night, my other sister, also has her vending spot, and the moment she is stressed, her husband died and she also has her own children, five boys, so she already has her own stressful issues, so for her to monitor whether my child is going for extra lessons is difficult. So, you hear that your child is not going for the lessons… (Vimbai, 33 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

She added that her mother who is in her 70s and suffers from memory loss could not assist as she could not keep track of the children's activities.

While migrant mothers appreciated the care provided by the caregivers, they were anxious about the emotional attachment that grew between caregivers and their children. They expressed a sense of loss and felt they were missing out on their children's lives. They also felt estranged from their children further highlighting the cost of migration on mothers. Other participants went further to express fears over the consequences of the strong bonds developing between their children and their caregivers in the medium to long-term future. For example, Tsitsi pointed out:

> … its painful, it feels like I am no longer her mother. Her grandmother is now her mother. When she grows, she won't even care about me because she will say she was raised her grandmother. During the first days, she would say, I had been unfair to her because all her other siblings went to school in Harare (urban area) while she had to learn in my home area's school. … I told her that she must understand the problem that her father passed away and it's not possible for the other siblings to look after her, she needs someone who is mature to look after her. So, she must live with her grandmother because she able to provide her with what she needs. If she lives with the younger siblings, there will be problems. That's when she understood and agreed to go with her grandmother and go to school. (Tsitsi, 48 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Tsitsi's comments reveal the social expectations of parent-child relationship. She highlights expectations of reciprocity in the relationship where parents care for their children when they are young and in turn, children are expected to care for their parents in their old age. Tsitsi feels that due to her absence, she has not been able to provide everyday care to her daughter and therefore her daughter might not be willing to reciprocate as she was raised by her grandmother. Thus, Tsitsi highlights a perceived future care gap as a result of her migration, which has disrupted the strong ties binding the mother-daughter relationship. Tsitsi also highlights concerns that her daughter has raised following her migration. Her daughter feels that she did not enjoy the same opportunities as her older brothers and sisters who learnt in schools in urban areas. The daughter has had to attend a peri-urban school, which are often associated with low quality education and lack of resources. Tsitsi has older children who have their own families; however, she chose her mother to be the primary caregiver as she can provide maternal care to her child. In another example, Rumbidzai's fears are not in the distant future as she is planning to re-unite with her daughter. Her daughter was living with her grandmother in Zimbabwe and often visited during the school holidays. Rumbidzai pointed out that she did not have many opportunities to spend time with her daughter when she came to visit as she was a live-in worker. At the time of the interview, she shared her plans to bring her daughter to live with her in South Africa. She shared her anxieties:

> … I am actually scared of living with her because of the difference of the way my mom and I treat her, maybe I talk too much because there are times when she says – she usually comes during the holidays and she says if we have a disagreement or I send her to do some chores – she says her granny does not do that or she asks what time the bus leaves so she can return to her grandmother. So, I am scared of living with her, maybe I will be spoiling her because I am always wary that she might get angry and say she wants to go to her granny. I understand that it's because of the circumstances but staying far away from your children is not right, because you will not know what your child wants or dislikes. Like now we are planning that she comes to live with us but I am very sceptical because I don't know where to begin… (Rumbidzai, 25 year old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Rumbidzai expresses the challenge of the different parenting styles between herself and her mother. The concern of reinforcing discipline has been raised in literature (Peng and Wong, 2016; Moran-Taylor, 2008; Bernhard et al., 2005; Pantea, 2012) where grandparents are seen to spoil the children and other female kin are viewed as lacking authority.

Another concern raised by migrant mothers on caregivers was that they did not fully inform them about what was happening in their children's lives. While in some literature this is seen

as a way of providing emotional support by keeping away information that might cause distress to the migrant (Baldassar et al., 2007), migrant women pointed out that the caregiver would not communicate certain information to them especially related to illness, to ease the burden on their parents.

7.2.2 Local care chains: lack of family support

Other women failed to secure suitable caregivers in Zimbabwe or did not have options in regard to the availability of caregivers as illustrated in the above cases. They did not receive enough support from their extended family network. Migrant mothers who work as live-out care workers are at an advantage as they can negotiate their family care responsibilities with the help of day care services. This was the case with some mothers who had given birth to their children in South Africa and had not sent their children back to Zimbabwe. Live-in workers were at a disadvantage as shown in Fungai's story. Fungai had two daughters, a 14-year-old, and a 4-year-old. Fungai was born in a family of three girls, but one of them had passed on and her other sister had also migrated to South Africa. Her parents were still alive, but Fungai did not consider them suitable caregivers. Her mother had hearing and speech impairments and was separated from her father. At the time of the interview, Fungai indicated that her mother was living with her own parents in their rural home. Her father had remarried, and Fungai felt that it would be difficult for her father and stepmother to care for her children as they had failed to adequately care for her. Further, Fungai stated that her grandparents were not willing to look after her children as they had raised Fungai and her siblings and as a result, she had brought her children to South Africa. In answering a question on how migration had changed the circumstances for her family back in Zimbabwe, she gave further evidence of her 'care crisis'.

> What I can say has changed in my children's life is that my eldest (daughter), when she was in Zimbabwe, she was living with my sister. But my sister and her husband would fight over my daughter especially when he was drunk, so she went to live with my aunt. Then I found out that my aunt was abusing her, I would buy all the food, but she wasn't getting enough … she told her helper that she was not her child, so she was being abused. But now, that I brought her here, I have noticed a change that she is now free because she knows I am with my mother and is free to tell me what she needs such as school requirements. (Fungai, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

However, while Fungai was happy that she was living close to her children, her working conditions did not allow her enough time to be able to provide daily care for them. She was a live-in care worker and her off-days were not consistent; thus, her children were living alone with the eldest daughter providing daily care to the youngest. She must wake her sister up and help her prepare for pre-school before going to school herself, and later pick up her

younger sister on her return from school. Fungai's eldest daughter had become the primary caregiver for her younger sister. Esplen and Brighton Institute of Development Studies (2009) note the caring burden that is placed on siblings in the absence of their mother, which can have ripple effects on the family if it affects the children's educational opportunities and performance. This situation raises concerns about the vulnerability, safety and well-being of the children, particularly in a township where migrants are viewed as the 'other' and in townships generally riddled with crime. I probed Fungai about these concerns. She asserted that she was worried about leaving her children alone,

> … but you have to pray, and you have to tell God the situation because there is no choice. What I like about my daughter is that she has not changed, she understands our situation and the struggles. Even if I leave money for them when I am going to work, she will still have it when I come back. She knows how to save in case I come back broke, which sometimes happens that I came back without any money and we use the funds that she has for other expenses. (Fungai, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

She noted that she had faced challenges with her childcare situation with some people in the neighbourhood threatening to raise the alarm with social workers that she was leaving her children without supervision. When Fungai is away, her children receive assistance and support from other people who share accommodation with them, who are also from Zimbabwe. They assist the children with homework and caring for them when they fall ill. This relates to Lausch (2015)'s observation that migrant workers often receive support from people with the same nationality as them. Fungai's case highlights that job arrangements can influence family responsibilities. She was having difficulties meeting her family responsibilities as a live-in worker and was considering quitting the job to search for a live-out position, which would enable her to meet her own responsibilities. This relates to observations by Hoobler (2016) that live-in domestic workers 'sacrifice home and family time with their own families' while their work enables their employers to balance their work and family commitments. She argues that this highlights a care deficit where 'commoditised care is provided in the homes of domestic employers but at the expense of care in the employees' own homes' (Hoobler, 2016: 10). For Hoobler, this highlights how the work-family conflict trickles down to domestic workers, especially migrant domestic workers who spend long periods separated from their families.

7.2.3 Care arrangements for the elderly
Migrant women do not only worry about finding a caregiver for their children but also for their aging parents. Some indicated that their parents were living alone with the migrant's children while others highlighted ailments that their parents were suffering from exposing the care gap, which they had to make arrangements to fill. They explained the different

arrangements they had made to ensure that their parents had someone to meet their care needs. These included hiring domestic workers in Zimbabwe or other female kin to assist. For example, Nokuthula explained that her mother was 75 years old and was the primary caregiver for her child. However, she suffered from high blood pressure for which she was receiving medication. Thus, Nokuthula hired a domestic worker who would come to help with the housework. Another participant, Vimbai, also highlighted the caring needs of her mother, who was 79 years old and suffered from memory loss. She pointed out that her family had decided not to hire someone as one of her sisters was available to assist in caring for their mom by washing her clothes and seeing to her other needs on weekends when she was not at work. These two cases highlight that grandmothers are both receivers and givers of care, as observed by Bastia (2009). Leinaweaver (2010) asserts that ensuring that elderly relatives are cared for is a concern for migrants cross-culturally. This is also shown by McGregor (2007) in her study of Zimbabwean care workers in the United Kingdom. She highlights the sentiments of black Zimbabwean people as indicated by the carers who felt that the care for the elderly should be a family matter and was part of a duty that children had towards their parents. In light of these sentiments, migrant women made arrangements to ensure that the caring needs of their parents were met.

7.3   Transnational communication

Information communication technologies (ICTs), particularly mobile phones, are considered to be one of the strategies of relieving the challenges associated with family separation as they allow migrants to maintain regular contact with their families (Parreñas, 2005; Platt et al., 2016; Chib et al., 2014; Lausch, 2015). Chib et al. (2014: 76) note that through ICTs, transnational families 'construct a virtual connectedness, transcending temporal and spatial barriers, to compensate for the migrant's physical absence from the family'. In this case, studies have highlighted how migrant mothers use ICTs to continue with their care giving responsibilities through intensive mothering (Chib et al., 2014; Parreñas, 2005; Madianou and Miller, 2011; Fresnoza-Flot, 2009). These scholars argue that mobile phones allow migrant mothers to be in constant communication with their children and to monitor their activities closely and provide emotional care to them. Mobile communication also allowed migrants to maintain relations with the caregivers so that they could know about the wellbeing of their children. Platt et al. (2016) further note that ICTs provide a way of 'overcoming social isolation' for domestic workers and the use of ICTs by migrant mothers enhances their agency through maintaining contact with their families.

In line with the foregoing, regular communication with family in Zimbabwe enabled by the development in ICTs was a key survival and coping mechanism for migrant women, which allowed them to continue with their nurturing and caring duties. Consistent with the literature on transnational communication, migrant women in this study expressed how transnational communication helped to bridge the distance between them and their children. As noted by

Madianou and Miller (2011), mobile communication is considered to be one means of alleviating the challenges brought about by family separation as it allows migrant workers to sustain relations with family in the sending countries. Data from the participants showed that communication in transnational families had improved especially with the use of social media applications particularly WhatsApp, which allowed for communication at little or no cost. Participants demonstrated that the use of WhatsApp had enabled more frequent communication with family members. They could communicate with members of their family almost daily. Participants highlighted the benefits of using WhatsApp as it allowed real time communication through video calls, voice calls and audio messages. Below is an excerpt from an interview with Chido, in which she highlighted the different modes of communication she uses to maintain regular contact with her family in Zimbabwe.

PB: *How do you communicate with members of your family?*

Chido: Like every day, because of the social media like WhatsApp, we communicate every day.

PB: *Do you think through using WhatsApp, you are able to maintain the bond with your family? How does social media enable you to have a relationship especially with your child?*

Chido: It helps because for example today, I will talk to them later on, and I talk to my child it allows me to know what's going on at that time and it helps in bridging the distance as I won't feel like my child is too far away from me. Its feels like she is close to me, I will not be too worried because I know that at the end of the day, I have information on my child's wellbeing. … On WhatsApp, we communicate through audio messages (voice notes) and texting. If I want to call, I have to go out, like I have done today, that's when I get the chance to call and talk to them properly but when I am at work, we communicate through WhatsApp. … I don't make regular calls home that often because I will be at work, so I don't get the time to go out and buy airtime. That's why we communicate on WhatsApp through audio messages. So when I am off, I usually buy airtime for R100 (US$6) for 10 minutes. When I call, I talk to my sister, then after that I talk to my child. So, when I go out, I sacrifice and buy airtime and make a normal call. (Chido, 28 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

Chido echoes sentiments shared by many participants on how the mobile smart phone had allowed for better communication with their families. She explains that while she has fewer opportunities to talk to her family through regular international calls that she is able to make during her off-days every fortnight, social media applications enable them to be in constant communication with their families every day. Corroborating observations by Platt et al. (2016), it emerges that communication through WhatsApp has allowed migrant care workers to maintain close communication with their families despite the limitations of their working

conditions. As Chido explains, live-in care workers live in isolation and are often not allowed to leave the employer's household during working hours. Thus, they are not able to go out to buy airtime required to make international calls to their families. Regular international calls are expensive as illustrated by Chido that she needs R100 (US$6) to make a ten-minute call. Platt et al. (2016: 2211) point out that the smart phone has brought about an 'always on lifestyle' way of life because of its portability. The smart phone allows an online presence throughout the day, which is a significant advantage to foreign domestic workers. Citing Thompson (2009), the scholars argue that 'ICTs, particularly the mobile phone, is a key way of fostering a sense of connection and overcoming social isolation for domestic workers' (Platt et al., 2016: 2217). They further note that the low cost of social media has facilitated regular communication between mothers and their children. Chido emphasises the idea of time-space compression brought about by the mobile phone. She notes that as she is able to communicate with her family every day, she feels much closer to her daughter and she is always abreast of what's happening in her daughter's everyday life. This further confirms literature that points to how ICTs have enabled mothers to be more involved in their children's lives and to provide maternal care and emotional support to their children, thereby allowing them to continue to fulfil their mothering role (Madianou and Miller, 2011; Chib et al., 2014)

Chido also highlighted the sentiments from other participants on how mobile communication enhanced emotional ties among transnational family members through voice communication. For participants, the transmission of voice messages was important to confirm the health and well-being of family back in Zimbabwe. For example, Ratidzo, whose daughter was two-and-a-half, explained that:

> … I will be talking to my mom who gives the child the phone so that I can hear her voice, even though she cannot speak properly yet but if I hear her voice that she is well, my heart becomes settled. (Ratidzo, 34 year old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Another participant, Sarah concurred, saying:

> What is important is for me to hear my daughter's voice and for her to hear mine as well. But I sometimes ask my mom, whether my daughter will not forget me, if I continue living in South Africa. (Sarah, 29 year-old part-time care worker, Johannesburg)

Being able to communicate frequently assisted to suppress the anxieties arising from being separated from their children. However, other anxieties brought about by the separation continue to linger, as expressed by Sarah, who worries whether her child will forget her if her

stay in South Africa is prolonged. In another example, Tsitsi's oldest son was involved in an accident and she explained how mobile communication was important in monitoring the health of her son while he was in hospital in Zimbabwe. When explaining further about the incident, Tsitsi pointed out that her son had instructed relatives to keep her in the dark about the severity of his injuries. She only became aware of the extent of the injuries when she managed to go home for a visit almost two months after the accident occurred. She explained that when the son was in hospital, she

> … would call every day, during every visiting hour, three times a day … I just wanted to hear if he had awoken. If he answered that he was up, I would feel better, but there were days that I could hear from his voice that he was not ok. (Tsitsi, 48 year-old live - in care worker, Johannesburg)

Supporting observations by Madianou and Miller (2011), it is clear that voice communication enabled the migrant women to monitor their children from afar and could to some extent allay their fears over the well-being of their children.

However, while the migrant women highlighted the constant communication with their families, they were at the same time worried about the quality and depth of the conversations and whether this was enough to maintain a strong bond with their children. For instance, Anna explained that she usually communicated with her daughter and mother on weekends as it was cheaper to make calls during the weekend; she felt that it was not enough to strengthen the bond between them.

> I don't think it will help, you just call to ask how they are and stick to the important issues. There is no depth in the conversations, I don't get to know and understand issues that she (her daughter) faces every day, because there is no way that she will feel free and be open to discuss everything over the phone. (Anna, 29 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Participants felt that communicating through ICTs was not the same as being present for their children as there was always the possibility that family members might filter out information on 'mundane' and everyday life events, which were important to the mothers in assessing the well-being of their children and allowed them to be part of their children's lives.

For mothers with young children, their communication was mediated through caregivers. Migrant mothers had mixed feelings of caregivers being intermediaries of their relationships with their children. They communicated to their children through the caregivers' phones. Some women felt that this triangular relationship did not leave enough room to bond with

their children. Concerns about their children having access to mobile phones were raised as they were associated with wayward behaviour. For example, Ruvarashe noted:-

> I call them on the paternal grandmother's phone because I bought phones for my children, but the granny does not want them to use the phones. I bought a phone for them so I that I would be able to communicate with them, but the caregivers do not want...they think they will become wayward (Ruvarashe, 35 year-old live-out care worker, Johannesburg).

> …because the issue of staying far from your children is difficult. You can only talk to them on the phone and you cannot call every day because its expensive. You make calls here and there, and most of the time, when I can call I only speak to my mom, for me to then speak to my child, that airtime is already used up. The one who stays with my sister, I can communicate with her on WhatsApp, we send each other voice messages, while I talk to her, its better. But with my mother, it's difficult, I long for things to be better so that I can go back to Zimbabwe and take my child and live with him, waking up every day and preparing for him to go to school while I go to work… (Rufaro, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

The two comments above highlight barriers to the effective communication between migrant mothers and their children. As Rufaro points out she is only able to make a limited number of international calls because of the high costs involved. Thus, mothers have to rely on caregivers to relay information about well-being of their children. This becomes a barrier to the mothers as they are not able hear the voices of their children, which as highlighted earlier is crucial to enable mothers to monitor their children. Poeze et al. (2017) and (Chib et al., 2014) highlight that transnational communication is also carefully managed by the migrant mothers in this triangular relationship in order to build trust. Thus, Poeze et al. (2017) note that mothers might use various strategies as a way of managing the relationship including withholding information. They argue that migrant parents might not fully express their concerns and anxieties about the care being provided to their children as a way of avoiding conflict between them and the caregivers.

However, while the use of smart phones had increased the frequency of communication between migrant women and their families in Zimbabwe, a number of factors related to the 'unevenness of access, buying power and media literacy' hindered the migrant women's communication practices (Platt et al., 2016). Not all of them had access to a smart phone where they could make use of applications such as WhatsApp, and thus did not communicate frequently with their family. Some participants had phones that were not compatible with social media applications. Smart phones that allow the use of various applications remain

expensive and may be out of reach for domestic workers given that their remuneration is low. One of the significant communication barriers highlighted by participants was the high tariffs as they pointed out that it was expensive to make international calls. Similarly, the availability of smart phones to family members in Zimbabwe as well as poor infrastructural development in that country was another barrier to easily accessible communication particularly for families in rural areas. For example, Tsitsi pointed on how the cost of communication intensified the emotional stress of being separated from her children:

> Tsitsi: Living far away from my children stresses me a lot because I start thinking that if my husband was alive, I would still be living together with my children. At the moment, my daughter turned 18 (in the past two weeks) I cried, I didn't even have airtime to call her and say happy birthday.
> PB: *How often do you communicate with your children?*
> Tsitsi: Sometimes I fail to communicate with them because I won't have money to buy airtime. My 18-year-old normally communicates with her mom (referring to her friend), she communicates with her because I am not on WhatsApp. She communicates with my friend who then calls me to tell me what she said. I am afraid of communicating with the youngest one because she starts crying. (Tsitsi, 48 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Tsitsi illustrates the multiple disadvantages she is facing as a result of her migration. She explains that following the death of her husband, she had to migrate to able to provide for her children. Further, she laments that she does not have money to purchase airtime and therefore she misses out on communicating with her children on special occasions such as birthdays. At the time of the interview, Tsitsi had a basic phone that only allows regular phone calls and SMSs and has no access to WhatsApp. As noted in previous chapters, Tsitsi is a live-in worker and spends her off-days at friends or relatives' homes as she cannot afford to rent her own place. Her friend Ruvarashe assists in her communication with her children. Thus, she highlights a triangular relationship in communicating with her daughter. Ruvarashe is able to communicate with Tsitsi's daughter using WhatsApp and then passes on the messages to Tsitsi through local calls, which are much cheaper than international calls. While Tsitsi is not able to have a strong one-on-one relationship with her daughter, the positive side is that she has other ways of being in contact with her daughter through her friend. In another example, Fungai pointed to the barriers to communicating with her mother who lives in the rural areas. She explains the challenges of purchasing airtime in the rural areas where it was not readily available, in comparison to urban areas where there are many ways to purchase airtime. Added to this was the poor signal from network providers, which made communication a challenge in rural areas. Analysis of the data from the participants confirms Parreñas' argument that:

The experience of transnational communication can be distinguished by one's social location in the intersecting and multiple axes of social inequalities (gender, class, rural versus urban families, and so on) (Glenn, 2002; Lowe, 1997). For instance, transnational communication requires access to capital and its frequency depends on the resources of individuals (Parreñas, 2005: 318).

Parreñas posits that a number of factors determine the flow of communication between migrant mothers and their families in the country of origin, and these include the type of occupation held by the migrant, the country of destination and conditions of employment, which determine the resources available to the migrant and the flexibility in which to communicate. She further mentions the level of development of the areas in which the families are located in the country of origin, which relates to the infrastructure needed for transnational communication. The challenges raised by participants pertaining to communicating with their families in Zimbabwe, which demonstrated limited access to resources in this study confirms the literature, which has shown that transnational communication is characterised by social and economic inequality (Madianou and Miller, 2011; Parreñas, 2005; Chib et al., 2014; Platt et al., 2016).

7.4 Personal and internal coping strategies

While finding a good caregiver for their children and being able to communicate with family members in Zimbabwe regularly gave migrant women some peace of mind, they also employed other strategies to deal with the stresses arising from the difficulties they encountered as they continued with their duties. Participants highlighted the anxiety they felt from living apart from their families, the frustrations they faced as a result of their working conditions (isolation, confinement, employer/employee relations), as well as the challenges of living in South Africa such as safety, fear of the police and deportation. Coping strategies employed by migrant women included endurance and acceptance, avoidance, religion and support from informal networks.

Repression of emotions

Women in this study emphasised their lack of alternative options. Participants revealed that one way of dealing with worry and emotional stress was to avoid thinking about the things that troubled them. This corresponds to a coping mechanism highlighted by migrant women in the United States and Italy, referred to as 'repression of emotional strain' (Parreñas (2015: 93). In this study, some participants explained that they 'bottle' up their frustrations and avoided sharing with other people. This was illustrated in the following quotes:

> It's difficult, it's not easy living far away from your family but you have to persevere but it's not easy. Especially for the child, you are here, you spend the whole year without going to Zimbabwe, it's difficult but there is nothing you can

do. It's painful sometimes, these are issues that you end up setting aside, tell yourself that you should not think about them. If you try to think about them, you will be stressed and lose weight. You tell yourself that she is fine and you strengthen yourself in the belief that she is fine and if I call and hear that she is fine then I feel better but it's not easy. (Chido, 28 year-old, live-in care worker, Pretoria)

Ignorance, is the best … you just ignore, if you want to consider everything in your mind, you will die, blood pressure, I am telling you, you have to ignore things. (Tanyaradzwa, 33 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

At work, challenges at work? I just keep them and bury them in my heart because there is nothing I can do, because I am at work, I am not able to voice my concerns because it's her house. (Fungai, 36 year-old live-in care worker, Pretoria)

Chido expressed the emotional stress that she faced as her work conditions limit her rights to family life where she is not able to make frequent visits to see her child. She explains that her way of dealing with those difficulties is to not focus on the issues and she finds comfort in communicating with her child to ensure her well-being. Van Bortel et al. (2019) observed similar strategies in their study of migrant domestic workers in Singapore and refer to them as 'managing their thoughts'. Fungai narrates another method of managing her frustrations through bottling them up. Like Chido, she highlights her lack of alternatives and further mentions the power relations between her and her employer. Van der Ham et al. (2015) discuss the stress and coping mechanisms employed by migrant women from the Philippines in different migration phases and argue that during migration, emotion-focused ways of coping were dominant. They argue that while such a strategy is passive, it can be attributed to 'lack of control, resulting from women's isolated position and dependency on their employers' (Van der Ham et al., 2015: 18). Fungai's quote highlights her disadvantaged position as a live-in worker where she depends on her employer for the accommodation, other provisions as well as her job and income; therefore, she cannot voice her concerns.

Endurance, perseverance and acceptance

Another coping mechanism that was linked to managing their thoughts and repression of emotions was perseverance or endurance as well as accepting their circumstances. They used self-motivation and justification as reasons to endure the difficult circumstances.

… it's tough, you have to persevere, I told myself that I came to work so I focus on the goal of raising the money that I want. (Thandeka, 35 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

> … I just told myself that I came here to work, and this job is benefitting me in that at least I can do something for my family. I came from a poor background and I don't want my child to live the kind of life that I grew up in. So, I make sure that I provide for my mom and my child's needs and educational provisions. (Yolanda, 24 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

The idea that you have to 'persevere' came up in several conversations as the migrant women agreed that they had to endure in order to achieve their goals and realise the benefits of their migration. Parreñas (2015) and Lausch (2015) similarly found justification as one of the coping strategies used by migrant women in their studies and argue that through their migration, they are able to send remittances to their family, which becomes a symbol of care for their family. Parreñas (2015) further explains that parents often consider the benefits of migration to outweigh the emotional challenges that arise from being separated from their families. Earlier in the interview before Yolanda made the comments noted above, she explained that because of her poor background, she had started doing domestic and care work at an early age. Her job in South Africa allows her to provide for her child and afford him better life chances than she experienced. Further, participants highlighted that because of their limited choices, they had to accept their situation and survive within those circumstances as reflected in the comment from Anna on how she deals with the pain of being separated from her daughter, that 'it's painful but at times, you just end up finding comfort in that you need to do it to survive' (Anna, 29 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg).

Religion

Studies note that religion is seen as a coping mechanism in dealing with the emotional pain of separation and well as the working conditions. Religion is viewed as a source of strength (Van der Ham et al., 2014). Nakonz and Shik (2009) highlight three ways in which religion was central to helping migrant domestic workers survive their 'burdens'. The first was the religious appraisal of hardships, which related to how participants gave religious significance to problems they faced. The second was seeking divine intervention through praying to God to intervene in difficult situations indicating how the Divine is seen as a 'source of spiritual support in the problem-solving process', especially in cases where migrant workers felt that they had limited influence. The third strategy relates to the church being seen as a form of social support. Religious groups and communities gave migrants a chance to share problems and exchange advice. Pande (2012) adds that religious communities allow migrant domestic workers to meet and be in contact with other fellow women. The church is also a place where migrants could find referrals to employment opportunities. Nakonz and Shik (2009) argue that religious coping strategies were used by participants to assist them to adjust emotionally

to the difficult situations they faced rather than working actively to change the situation, highlighting the role played by religion in teaching patience.

Underscoring the above, religion emerged as another way that many Zimbabwean care workers in South Africa cope with work-related stress. Religious acts that were highlighted by the participants included praying as well as committing everything to God. This was reflected by several participants. For example, Tsitsi asserted that one of the challenges she faced was the treatment from her employer who yells and insults her.

> Tsitsi: But what puzzles me is that she doesn't want me to leave, because she says I understand her and her attitude. She says when she is yelling at me, I just laugh at her. Yes, I do laugh when she is yelling, but I do think about it when I go back to my room. When she is yelling, most of the time I am praying for her.
> PB: Do *you think it helps?*
> Tsitsi: Yes, it does help me, because I don't get stressed at that moment and plus, she also quickly thinks about her actions, because she follows me and tries to conciliate through her words or offering me gifts. … When she yells, I sometimes also get angry, I just go to my room and pray for God's intervention, then I calm down. (Tsitsi, 48 year-old live-in care worker, Johannesburg)

Another respondent, Chido from Pretoria, stated that, 'It's just that I have just told myself that God is the protector, so I have just committed everything to God.' Nakonz and Shik (2009) contend that religion plays multiple roles as a coping mechanism where it can used be as a way of dealing emotionally with stressful situations, as a source of strength and spiritual support and as a way to self-discipline and pacify as it is associated with teaching patience. The excerpt above resonates with Nakonz and Shik (2009) as Tsitsi explains that praying for God's intervention helps her to calm down and avoid a confrontation with her employer.

Support from informal networks

Previous studies have highlighted the different forms of social networks from which migrant domestic workers find support. Pande (2012) and Lan (2003) give instances where migrant domestic workers are able to communicate with their counterparts in places such as balconies and garbage collection points or times. They argue that these are ways of 'forming communities and finding broader support structures', particularly for migrants who live in isolation. Lausch (2015) in her study of Filipina migrant domestic workers in Dubai, discusses the 'quasi-familial networks' that migrants establish in the destination country. These include social sisterhoods where friendships between women develop into familial bonds. Migrant domestic workers often meet fellow women during their days-off at the park or at the malls, giving them opportunities to form friendships and sisterhoods. In compatriot relationships, Lausch highlights how women from the Philippines also rely on their fellow

countrywomen and other domestic workers for support and guidance, even when they do not know each other. However, 'the collectivist identity between Filipinos is a vital means of support' (Lausch, 2015:181). Further, Lausch shows how relationships with employers can be a form of support to domestic workers especially when they are treated as 'part of the family'.

Participants in this study also highlighted different social support systems they relied on. These included family members both in Zimbabwe and South Africa as well as friends with whom they shared their frustrations or received advice and encouragement from. Apart from family and friends, the church was cited as a social support structure particularly for those who did not have relatives to rely on in South Africa. For example, Sarah noted that while she had relatives in South Africa, she did not communicate with them very often and she only shared her problems with the pastor's wife. Rumbidzai explained that she had received support from members of the church she attends after she had been robbed and stressed that,

> I also think if you are in South Africa you should not be self-centred, because you may receive assistance from people that are not your relatives. So if you are far, you need to form a community with other people from your country and join with others because these people may be able to help you if you have a problem. (Rumbidzai, 25 year old live-in care worker, Johannesburg).

Data from the participants confirm observations from other studies that religious groups allow workers to interact with other people in whom they can build trust and potentially confide in. They also provide migrant workers with a platform to be in contact with fellow women or people with the same nationality who can assist in times of distress (Nakonz and Shik, 2009; Pande, 2012). Further, during my fieldwork, I observed that sharing accommodation, particularly in the townships, enabled migrant domestic workers to build a community with fellow women from Zimbabwe. As indicated earlier, in one of my trips at the beginning of my fieldwork, one of the participants took me around her neighbourhood to recruit participants for the study. At one point we managed to have a group discussion with other women who were also domestic workers, where they discussed their work and strategies of addressing challenges at work. Some participants lived in houses or rooms, which they shared with people from Zimbabwe who were also able to provide support.

7.5 Discussion and Conclusion

The previous chapters elaborated on the challenges faced by migrant care workers that were associated with their migration, which their documentation status, working conditions and distance and family separation, limited visits to the home country, making daily care for their family members impossible. This chapter explored how care was reorganised in transnational

families of the migrant care workers. The care arrangements made by the migrant care workers emphasised two points, that they relied on extended family support and that care is mostly provided by female kin. A key argument raised by the literature on transnational parenting is that the reorganisation of care is largely dependent on the family structures and norms in the sending countries. For example, in the South-South migration flow between Nicaragua and Costa Rica, Fouratt (2019) explains that children are often left in the care of other women, usually grandmothers, emphasising the historical importance of extended households. She argues that prior to migration, grandmothers have always been providing care for grandchildren, protecting them from different forms of parental absence and instability. The author notes that in some families, children of migrants were already sharing a home with their grandparents prior to their parents' migration. In another example of the migration flow from Cape Verde to Italy, Åkesson et al. (2012) note that child fostering (where children are cared for by people other than their biological parents) was widespread and thus children being raised by different care takers was considered part of the normal socialisation process and not a source of stigmatisation. Child fostering has been noted to be prevalent in some African countries such as Ghana and Congo Brazzaville (Whitehouse, 2009; Poeze et al., 2017). Kufakurinani et al. (2014) point out that in African contexts, the strength of the extended family and fostering arrangements have been used to challenge Western notions of the nuclear family and the effects of physical separation. In this study, data collected from the participants reflected seven different types of arrangements for the provision of daily care:

i. The most common type of arrangement that migrant mothers employed was leaving their children in the care of their own mothers, the children's maternal grandmothers. These arrangements were reported by eight of the study participants.

ii. In cases where the maternal grandmother was not available, migrant women resorted to their sisters as highlighted in six cases.

iii. In four cases, children left behind had lived with or were living with their paternal grandparents.

iv. In line with some literature that highlight men's limited participation in childcare responsibilities, fathers were mentioned as caregivers in three cases with the help of other women (stepmothers).

v. Three participants utilised local domestic workers in the caring arrangements in the presence of other family members or to assist elderly grandparents in providing everyday care for their grandchildren.

vi. In the absence of female kin as an alternative or in cases where children were born in South Africa, some migrant women would live with their children in South Africa, making use of day care centres or siblings looking after each other.

vii. Only one participant mentioned making caring arrangements with a non-relative who was not hired help.

The different care arrangements highlighted the reliance on wider family networks. This was similar to other studies in African countries (Poeze et al., 2017; Kufakurinani et al., 2014; Mazzucato et al., 2017). Participants in this study also relied on grandparents, confirming studies that point to elderly people as both receivers and providers of a substantial part of Africa's informal care (Schatz and Seeley, 2015). The analysis of the arrangements made by migrant mothers in their absence for the provision of daily care for their children underscored the important role played by substitute care givers, giving mothers an opportunity to make the decision to migrate. Failure to find a suitable caregiver placed a burden on migrant women as well as their children who had to take care of each other as illustrated in Fungai's case. In addition, the different care arrangements made by the participants demonstrated strong extended family networks, which can be utilised to provide care work in the event of migration. Most women in the study relied on family members to provide care for their left-behind children. Further, this chapter highlighted the preference of maternal family members for the provision of care such as maternal grandmothers and migrants' sisters, which was consistent with studies in other migration streams (Fresnoza-Flot, 2009; Moran-Taylor, 2008; Schmalzbauer, 2004; Peng and Wong, 2016). These were trusted to provide good maternal care.

Another key point revealed by the care arrangements outlined in this chapter is the gendered nature of care work as it was mostly women who took over the caring responsibilities. Care was provided by grandmothers, aunts, female siblings in the case of caring for elderly parents, as well as domestic workers, demonstrating that women still do more care work than men. This highlighted gender inequalities in the division of labour within families. It has been argued that gender relations are central to care arrangements (Peng and Wong, 2016; Lutz and Palenga-Möllenbeck, 2012; Parreñas, 2010). Peng and Wong (2016: 2023) point out that in most societies 'childcare is women's work and mothers are the primary caregivers'. Care arrangements also follow this norm and caregivers tend to be women (Carling et al., 2012; Fouratt, 2019). While some literature points to the advantages of care work done by elderly women such as expectations of reciprocity, sense of purpose and fulfilling obligations (Schatz and Seeley, 2015), these women may face heavy caring burdens. In relation to grandmothers as caregivers, Fouratt (2019) argues that they may face additional burdens as they also have to mediate between children and state institutions such as schools and clinics. This may be an added burden given their age and that they may also need care. In this study, grandparents were caring for school going children, which meant that they had to maintain a relationship with school authorities. Kufakurinani et al. (2014) highlight challenges faced by grandparents especially in taking care of younger children who require intensive care. In light of the above examples, migrant women may have to make extra arrangements for the provision of care through hiring domestic workers. Similar care burdens were highlighted in this chapter, in the case of Vimbai, who explained that her sisters had other responsibilities

and could not pay attention to her child's extra classes. Further, migrant women were expected to continue to provide emotional and other forms of care even in their absence. Literature has shown that migrant women are more involved in maintaining relations with their parents in the home country and providing support through frequent communication when compared to migrant males (Fan and Parreñas, 2018).

Some studies have highlighted the increasing involvement of fathers left-behind in sending countries in the care of children, seen as indicating a shift towards flexible care arrangements in the absence on the migrant mothers (Lam and Yeoh, 2018; Peng and Wong, 2016). This has been noted in Asia with Lam and Yeoh (2018) citing fathers from Bangladesh, Indonesia, Philippines, Sri Lanka and Vietnam assuming caring responsibilities attributed to the increased demand of female labour in other countries. Lam and Yeoh (2018: 114) argues that despite these changes, 'there is no clear evidence to indicate revolutionary transformation in gender ideologies around parenthood and childcare'.

This chapter demonstrated how the use of ICTs, particularly the smart phone, had increased the frequency of communication between migrant care workers in South Africa and their families in Zimbabwe. Evidence on migrant workers' use of ICTs highlighted that transnational communication was part of the reorganisation of care as it enabled mothers to continue with transnational mothering and allowed women to continue caring for family members across distance. The use of smart phones enabled migrant care workers to bridge the distance between themselves and their families and to exchange information on the well-being of family members in Zimbabwe. This exchange of information allowed the women to be involved in their children's lives and to keep track of their well-being. Further, participants indicated the use of social media applications particularly WhatsApp, which allowed for instant communication through messaging, voice and video calls and audio messages, at low cost. Participants indicated audio messages were important in confirming the health and well-being of family members, as well as maintaining intimacy and emotional ties. Further, use of smart phones and social media applications gave migrant workers more freedom to communicate with their families even when they were at work, overcoming the barriers imposed on them through working conditions such as social isolation and limited visits back home. Transnational communication illustrated the concept of transnationalism as evidence from the participants highlighted the exchange of information across national borders, which demonstrated the 'simultaneous embeddedness' of migrants. It further emphasised the idea of transnational care giving as migrant women continued to provide care and emotional support to their families.

While the use of ICTs for communication between families in this study echoes findings applicable to South-North migration flows, differences were noted in regard to access to resources. Not everyone in this study had access to a smart phone, nor did their family

members in Zimbabwe. This highlighted Parreñas (2005)'s observations about infrastructural inequalities experienced through migration, related to uneven development across the region. The development of ICT infrastructure affects how people communicate. This study underscores the popularity of smart phones. However, studies in North-South migration streams point to the growing use of computer-aided technologies such as laptops, web cameras and software applications such as Skype, which has changed the nature of communication between family members. For example, Francisco (2015) in her study of migrant women from the Philippines in New York, argues that visual communication, which allows family members to maintain an online presence, allows for an exchange of a different type of care work and intimacy. It allows women to be more involved in their families lives where they are able to follow the daily activities of their families back home, and where mothers can assist their children with homework via Skype as illustrated by Lutz and Palenga-Möllenbeck (2012) on Ukraine/Poland/Germany migration flows.

Personal coping strategies employed by Zimbabwean migrant care workers in this study echoed those employed by women in South-North migration flows. As with observations reported by Nisrane et al. (2020) in their study on Ethiopian women who had returned from domestic work jobs in the Middle East, participants in this study employed 'emotion-focused' coping strategies, which assisted in easing the pain suffered from the challenges of working in a foreign country, separated from their families as well as tough working conditions. These included firstly, repression of emotions where participants consciously managed their thoughts and avoided thinking about issues they were anxious about. The second strategy involved perseverance and accepting their circumstances. In this case, participants motivated themselves by focusing on the reasons prompting their migration, which was to work and support themselves and their families. This highlighted the resilience shown by migrant care workers. Religious acts such as praying and committing everything to God was the third strategy employed by the care workers. These acts were a source of strength and self-discipline. Fourthly, participants noted that they relied on support from their networks, which included friends and family, church members and other Zimbabwean counterparts with whom they shared accommodation or the same neighbourhood.

CHAPTER 8: SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

8.1 Introduction

This study explored the cross-border migration of Zimbabwean women to South Africa and their employment in the domestic services sector as care workers. It interrogated the female labour migration through the concept of the global care chain, which describes the phenomenon where women migrate to other countries, often wealthier countries, to care for children, the elderly and the frail. This leaves a gap in their own caring responsibilities for which they seek help from their extended family or others in order to meet these care needs (Yeates, 2005; Lutz and Palenga-Möllenbeck, 2012). The specific objectives were as follows:

1. To examine the reasons for care workers' migration to South Africa.
2. To investigate their work experiences in relation to duties, contractual agreements, hours worked, benefits including leave entitlements, employer-employee relations, and overall working conditions.
3. To examine the perceived macro and meso benefits and costs of the cross-border migration for care workers and the extent to which these impacts affect familial relations in Zimbabwe.
4. To explore the coping mechanisms and strategies employed by migrant care workers in navigating the challenges encountered in the course of their duties.
5. To examine their interpretations of their duties in relation to women's position in society (or their position as migrant care workers in society).

This chapter gives a summary of the key findings and suggests recommendations for policy and future research.

8.2 Summary of findings in relation to objectives

Objective 1: To examine the reasons for care workers' migration to South Africa.

The study found that while participants indicated several reasons for migration, the main push factor was economic following the deterioration in the political and economic situation in Zimbabwe. The women migrated to South Africa in search for jobs that could offer better remuneration and working conditions. Their reasons for migration were further motivated by the need to support their children and other members of their families, thus women's care giving roles were an important factor. This highlighted that the migration of women was gendered and confirmed observations in other studies that gender is a critical element in the migration process where gender and life stage can shape women's decisions to migrate. Most

of the women who participated in this study were single parents and faced increased responsibility to provide for their families in Zimbabwe. Their reasons to migrate were consistent with the feminisation of migration, which highlights the independent movement of women who often take up work that is considered as female occupations such as domestic work.

Objective 2: To investigate their work experiences, that is, their working conditions in relation to duties, contractual agreements, hours worked, benefits including leave entitlements, employer-employee relations.

One of the key findings in this study was that migrant care workers in South-South global care chains face more exploitative conditions when compared to those in South-North migration flows, because they come from poorer countries. Evidence from the study indicated the migrant care workers were mistreated, treated differently in comparison to their local counterparts and faced labour abuses. It emerged that a majority of the care workers were undocumented and thus, they were excluded from formal migration processes and national labour standards. This was illustrated in the discussions in Chapters 2, 4 and 5.

Given the presence of migrant women employed in this sector, the findings of this study pointed to a mismatch with immigration laws, which show a strong preference for skilled workers. It was revealed that the migration process for women entering into the domestic and care work sector was informalised and unregulated when compared to other migration flows, which are largely facilitated by recruitment agencies and labour migration programmes. Women from Zimbabwe migrating to South Africa to take up jobs as care workers were low or semi-skilled workers and most of them had entered the country on visitors' visas, which they had 'overstayed' after expiry. Only a few had managed to acquire valid work visas or asylum permits.

It was highlighted that as a result of their undocumented status, the channels they utilised in search for employment were risky and insecure and also had an impact on working conditions. Three methods of job-seeking were utilised by migrant domestic workers in the study, namely recruitment agencies, social networks and the 'market'. Recruitment agencies represented a formal channel and required valid passports and visas for registration. Agencies offered protection to employees who made use of their services through facilitating the drafting of contracts and negotiating salaries. Migrants who did not have the requisite documents, employed the two other methods, social networks and the 'market', where no formal rules were followed and gave more authority to the employers in the employment relationships. These channels were risky as no necessary precautions were taken by both the employer and the care workers to guarantee professional conduct and the safety of care dependants.

The findings pointed to poor working conditions for migrant workers that violated labour regulations under the Basic Conditions of Employment Act and Sectoral Determination Act. While the law made provisions for written contracts, the findings revealed that most of the care workers had not signed written contracts but had verbal agreements with their employers. Challenges of compliance and enforcement of terms of employment under these agreements were highlighted. The study revealed that the work duties of care workers included both care work and housework, which resulted in increased workload. Unlike in the countries in the Global North where migrant workers provide elder care, care work in this study mostly involved childcare. Violations of labour regulations were noted in the working hours for live-in workers who were expected to provide round the clock services. This was also reflected in the leave and rest arrangements, which were often not recognised with regard to live-in workers who had no accommodation of their own. The study revealed that migrant domestic workers received low wages, as they faced difficulties in negotiating higher salaries because of their migrant status. This was different with recruitment agencies where agency officials noted that they negotiated for salaries that were above the government's stipulated rate. The findings also revealed that there was a lack of employment benefits.

The findings of this study highlighted that migrant care workers are not fully protected with regard to social security. This became explicit during the COVID-19 pandemic illustrating the vulnerability of care workers and the precarity of their working conditions. The government of South Africa imposed a national lockdown in which workers including domestic workers could not continue working, leading to a loss of income. The government put in place a number of mitigation measures to assist workers, such as the Temporary Employer/Employee Scheme (COVID-19 TERS) under the UIF, which sought to provide assistance to workers suffering the effects of the lockdown where employers were unable to pay their salaries. Further, the government also introduced a means-tested social relief grant meant for those who were unemployed and were not receiving any other grant or UIF payments, to which only South African citizens, permanent residents, legal migrants and asylum seekers could apply. Media reports during this period highlighted that only a small number of domestic workers in the country has been registered with UIF, thus most domestic workers including migrant care workers could not benefit from the COVID-19 TERS programme. Further, as many migrant care workers were undocumented, they could also not benefit from the social relief grant at a time where they could not work due to the national lock-down, thus leaving many care workers and their families in a dire situation.

Objective 3: To examine the perceived macro and meso benefits and costs of the cross-border migration for care workers and the extent to which these impacts affect familial relations in Zimbabwe.

Despite the challenges of their undocumented status and working conditions that were below the minimum standards, benefits of migration included a source of employment and income in effect reducing unemployment in Zimbabwe. The ability to send remittances (financial and in-kind) back home was another key benefit of migration in this study. An interesting aspect that emerged was that food remittances were a significant component of remittance flows, averting challenges that were experienced in Zimbabwe such as food shortages and spiralling food prices. Remittances were used to improve children's education and well-being as well for purchasing property (land) and building materials. Corresponding with findings in the South-North global care chains literature, the findings highlighted that remittances are key to continuing with obligations to children, parents and siblings through maintaining ties with family members.

The costs of migration included the separation of migrant women from their families. This resulted in emotional strain and distant relationships. Further, a care gap was revealed as mothers left their young children who still required maternal love and care. Due to the physical separation and limited visits home to their families, mothers bemoaned they could not cultivate strong relationships with their children. Further, the low salaries earned by migrant workers were considered as a cost of migration as they did not allow for the desired improvements to personal growth.

A key challenge faced by migrant women in South Africa was high levels of crime, gender-based violence and xenophobia. It was noted that violence against migrants has continued over the years and foreign nationals including care workers are targeted as they are viewed as competitors for jobs and other resources.

Objective 4: To explore the coping mechanisms and strategies employed by migrant care workers in navigating the challenges encountered in the course of their duties.

Under coping strategies, three topics were discussed to highlight how migrant women were dealing with challenges they faced including the reorganisation of care, transnational communications, and personal coping strategies. Extended family networks are utilised in the face of migration of women as migrants could choose a suitable caregiver among them, which lessened the emotional struggles of separation from family. Findings showed a strong preference of caregivers from the maternal family as many participants were single mothers further highlighting the different forms of family, varied care needs as well as care sources available to them. This demonstrated the gendered nature of care work. In relation to transnational communication, the study findings illustrate the popularity of mobile and smart phones, which increased the frequency of contact between the care workers and their families. Transnational communication was part of the reorganisation of care, which allowed migrants to continue caring for their families across borders. Personal coping strategies

pointed to the emotion-focused mechanisms employed by care workers to ease their suffering in South Africa. These included repression of emotions, perseverance and endurance, religious acts and informal networks.

Objective 5: To examine their interpretations of their duties in relation to women's position in society or their position as migrant care workers in society.

This study highlighted the positioning of migrant women in the labour market. Data from the participants emphasised that migrant caregivers were marginalised and were at the bottom of the hierarchy, especially the undocumented workers. As indicated earlier, participants noted that domestic jobs were the only jobs that were available to them. They also pointed to the low status of the job, recognising that remuneration was low. Their limited ability to access protection from labour rights abuses also reflected their marginal position. This may be attributed to fear of approaching institutions that may offer representation as migrant workers think that this may result in deportation. As already noted above, their vulnerability to gender-based violence also reflected their already marginal position based on their gender and migrant status.

Following their migration, the participants noted an improvement in their status in the family and community back home. Participants noted that as income earners and breadwinners, they had gained recognition in the family and the community as family members in Zimbabwe could rely on their assistance. Further, the value of their remittances was visible to their community, through changes in living conditions as well as the houses and stands that could be acquired through the remittances. Migrant women were able to continue caring for their families from afar as transnational mothers. However, they also highlighted the constraints of being separated from their families.

8.3 Theoretical reflections

This study drew from two theoretical concepts, social reproduction from a feminist perspective, and transnationalism. Social reproduction places emphasis on care and describes the activities of maintaining daily life and nurturing future generations. It highlights the role of women as the work of caring has traditionally been done within the household. Feminist scholars have highlighted inequalities based on gender, race and class, which are imbedded in social reproduction. The outsourcing of migrant women to provide care in wealthier countries reflects the expansion of the social reproduction and care from the family to the global scene, linking it with processes of globalisation such as feminisation of migration. In this study, the concept of social reproduction was relevant in the analysis of employment of migrant women from Zimbabwe in South Africa within the South-South migration stream (Global South). Key issues that were apparent in this study through the use of this concept is that the history

of South Africa and its socio-economic context shapes how care is performed and valued. Further, it emphasised the important role played by women in providing care, pointing to the gendered nature of care work.

South Africa, as well as other African countries, has a particular history that has shaped conditions within the domestic work sector. Despite key changes aimed at better regulation of the sector, the sector continues to have challenges of low standards. As shown in Chapter 2, domestic workers in South Africa have always been part of the care-work industry, which was racialised during apartheid where domestic workers were mostly providing care for white families. During apartheid, domestic workers faced oppression from gender, class, and racial inequalities as a result of apartheid legislation. As shown in Chapter 2, the sector was characterised by 'ultra-exploitation' with slavery-like conditions of work (Cock, 1980). Studies have shown that even after the formalisation of the sector post-apartheid, domestic workers continue to face oppressive conditions such as low remuneration, differential treatment, unequal relationships between employers and workers, and different forms of abuse, lack of social security, living in under-resourced communities highlighting inequalities in the South African context.

Thus, using this lens was relevant as the findings in this study demonstrate that while all domestic workers experience these challenges, migrant women are in much more vulnerable situations as they experience conditions that are adverse when compared to those of their local counterparts. This is evident across all the findings. Chapter 4 and 5 highlight that migrant women work in precarious conditions due to their migrant status. Chapter 6 further highlights that migrant women continue with their social reproductive activities through transnational care giving by remittances. The study further highlighted the key role played by women in the survival of their families. As indicated in Chapter 7, migrant women rely on both paid and unpaid care work of other women in Zimbabwe who also help them to fulfil their social reproductive roles.

In relation to transnational migration and transnationalism, this study expands knowledge in studies that challenge the male bias (migrant as male and the breadwinner or provider in the family). Feminist scholars have pointed out that gender relations have an effect on migration as they can facilitate and constrain both men's and women's immigration patterns. In this study, the findings highlighted that women's gender and gendered roles shaped their migration experiences.

While their reasons for migration were mainly economic, their gendered roles as mothers were also an important factor in their migration to South Africa as the women needed to find ways to provide for their children in the context of a lack of employment in Zimbabwe. The jobs they undertook when they arrived in South Africa as care workers is work that is

considered to be women's work. Their work experiences were further shaped by their gender as discussed above. The findings also illustrated their vulnerability to gendered violence and crime in the process of searching for work and in the workplace as participants highlighted instances of kidnapping and robberies and their fears of abuse related to xenophobia.

Chapter 6 examining the benefits and costs of migration highlights how women are able to defy the traditional conception of women as caregivers in the domestic sphere. However, at the same time, social expectations related to their gender roles as mothers also constrains them as highlighted by the emotional struggles they suffer from being physically separated from their children and unable to play a role in their socialisation. However, they were able to negotiate these challenges through transnational mothering where they show their love and care for their children through remittances as well as regular communication with their families, which allowed them to be involved in their children's lives from a distance.

The findings of the study highlight the sustained relations between the migrants and their families as their activities fulfilled some of the propositions put forward under transnationalism. While the cross-border travel for migrant care workers was limited due to undocumented status and other reasons, other transactions were prevalent such as remittances and transnational communication. Remittances, both financial and in-kind, were often transferred through informal channels further highlighting social networks and linkages across borders. Further, social networks were crucial in the search for jobs, providing accommodation and well as support as a coping strategy.

8.4 Limitations of the study

The analysis of the impact of female migration in this study was done through the perspective of the migrant care workers in the destination country as they are the people who are central to understanding global care chains. Thus, the perspectives and experiences of the caregivers and the members of the families left behind in the country of origin or the perspectives of employers were not within the scope of the study. Studies utilising the global care chain framework could benefit from multi-sited research that collects data from both the destination and home countries in order to have a balanced and holistic picture of the impact of migration on the family, community and society at large. One way would be to draw from the simultaneous matched sample methodology used by (Mazzucato et al., 2017; Poeze et al., 2017), in their studies of the migration of Ghanaian nationals to the Netherlands. This methodology enables researchers to study 'phenomena occurring in multiple sites simultaneously'. In this method, a 'team of researchers are located in different sites at the same time' to enable them to capture transactions and exchanges that affect people's relationships in a transnational setting, which are collated to ensure in-depth analysis. (Mazzucato et al., 2017: 273). Similarly, while there have been studies that have highlighted

the effects of remittances from the Zimbabwe-South Africa migration flow, particularly on rural communities, these have often been small-scale qualitative studies. There is a need for the continuation of larger research projects such as the Southern African Migration Programme as well as the Migration Out of Poverty Research Consortium (which ended in December 2019), which make use of mixed methods and are able to produce quantitative data on the changing trends of migration within the Zimbabwe-South Africa migration flow.

This study was a qualitative study; thus the sample size was relatively small. It focused on migrant care workers in Gauteng, one of the nine provinces in South Africa, and only on those working in urban areas. Thus it is not representative of South Africa as a whole. Some migrants prefer to move away from the busy life of Gauteng, which can be read as fear of the authorities, in favour of smaller towns. Further, the study participants were working in private households, which meant that they could not be accessed easily, hence the use of snow-balling sampling. As indicated in Chapter 3 on the data collection process, there was some hesitancy related to participating the study.

8.5 Recommendations

Key concerns that were revealed in this study that need to be addressed include the documentation of migrant care workers, compliance and enforcement of labour laws, poor working conditions and lack of protection of migrant domestic workers, separation from children as well as limited opportunities to visit family in the home country. The discussion that follows highlights recommendations for policy, practice and for future research.

Recommendations for policy

1. *Introduction of visa option for care workers*

This study has highlighted that South Africa's strict migration policy, which continues to focus on skilled labour, is not comprehensive enough to cover all types of labour migrants. As shown in this study, there is a high risk to both the care workers and the employers when employing undocumented migrants. There is a need to develop a visa category for low to semi-skilled migrants in particular care workers that is affordable and has less stringent requirements, which employers can assist their workers to acquire. Consistent with other studies on migrant domestic workers in South Africa, this study has shown that this particular group of workers is filling an important care gap. Further, studies have shown that care workers are migrating from several countries. While South Africa might have a large pool of low and semi-skilled workers, evidence shows that migrant workers play a significant role in the domestic services sector. Such a change in the migration policy will not only address the issue of undocumented workers already in the country but also assist those intending to move

to South Africa in search of employment. While the regularisation schemes for nationals from Zimbabwe and Lesotho have been implemented and are commendable, a visa category for care workers will also open up opportunities for workers from other countries such as Malawi and Swaziland who are most likely to face similar challenges. The visa system should be flexible and allow employees to be able to change employers, which is crucial when faced with exploitation. Proper documentation is important to protect the rights of the care workers as they will be able to negotiate better working conditions and remuneration. With a work visa, employees will also be able to search for jobs in a formal and secure manner. Further, as noted in the conclusion in Chapter 4, with legal documentation, it would be easier for employers to trace their workers, which will ensure the security and protection of South African employers and care recipients such as children. Challenges have been highlighted with the regularisation schemes implemented in South Africa, such as lengthy processing times and that only a few migrants could access them, leaving a high incidence of undocumented workers. Further, there is uncertainty about what will happen to employees once the special permits expire and cannot be renewed. The recommended visa category would be in line with the proposed measures in the White Paper on International Migration, which acknowledges migration flows in sectors such mining, agriculture, hospitality, construction and domestic work. The White Paper recommends the introduction of new visa options to accommodate economic migration from SADC countries. Further, with legal permission to work and remain in South Africa, migrant women with children will find it much easier to travel between countries freely and maintain regular contact with their families.

2. *Strengthening of bi-lateral or multi-lateral agreements within SADC countries.*

The introduction of the proposed work visa for care workers should be within the context of the regional framework led by SADC. This will require measures to allow both the sending and destination countries to establish safeguards to protect both employer and employees. Formalised agreements will benefit both countries. For instance, with legal documentation, care workers will start sending remittances through official channels benefiting both countries. As pointed out in the study, migrant domestic workers use informal channels to send remittances, which is difficult for both countries to account for.

The Zimbabwean government needs to be proactive in introducing policies to protect migrants abroad. In line with the recommendation to introduce a new visa for care workers as suggested above, the Zimbabwean government needs to introduce measures such as pre-migration awareness programmes, which would prepare prospective migrants for what to expect in destination countries, including, for example, informing them about South Africa's labour regulations as well as dispute resolution mechanisms prior to departure. Zimbabwe has developed a National Labour Policy as well as a National Diaspora Policy, which are meant

to protect Zimbabwean migrants. However there is need for tailored policies for specific sectors. Studies have shown it is important for sending countries to also make efforts to protect the rights of their citizens abroad. For example, Uganda has policies that provide guidelines on the recruitment and placement of its citizens abroad. The regulations, for instance, require workers to undergo a pre-departure orientation and to be issued with employment contracts prior to their departure.

3. *Redefinition of domestic and care duties and responsibilities*

One of the key findings of this study was that migrant care workers have to balance care work, housework and additional tasks as instructed by their employers, which results in excessive workloads for employees. This challenge can be traced back to the definition of a domestic worker in the Basic Conditions of Employment Act. In the Act, workers performing different tasks such gardener, driver, care worker and a person who does general cleaning, fall within the same category and are mostly likely to receive similar salaries. Apart from the workload, the remuneration for workers who carry out both care work and housework in most cases does not take into account these separate responsibilities. Thus, the significance of care work is not fully recognised. Therefore there is a need for a distinct classification of roles and responsibilities for workers in this sector, with regards to policies and laws in place to ensure that employees are remunerated accordingly. It was noted in this study that one of the reasons why domestic workers were a preferred option as providers of care is that they can do both care work and housework. Officials at recruitment agencies indicated that domestic workers that provide care work should be paid more. A clear classification of these within the labour laws will ensure that not only employees who find jobs with recruitment agencies will benefit, but also that employers are aware and do not continue to exploit care workers. Such classification of roles has been undertaken in other countries such as Italy where domestic workers are divided into categories that recognise the level of skills required in each section in light of the 'growing presence of specialised care workers' (Castagnone et al., 2013).

4. *Training of care workers*

In addition to the clear definition of care duties, proper training of care workers both local and migrants, is needed to enhance their skills as well for the protection of the care dependants. This will further improve the chances of migrant workers to acquire work visas based on their training and increase their opportunities in the job market. Currently, evidence from the participants and key informants in this study, recruitment agencies provide training only to care workers registering with their agencies. However, there is a need to provide training for all care workers as a way to professionalise the sector.

Recommendations for practice

5. There is also a need to ensure that migrant domestic workers enjoy the same labour rights as other workers. This can be done through the effective implementation and enforcement of labour laws and regulations.

Recommendations for future research

6. As noted earlier, this study focused only on the experiences of migrant care workers in the context of global care chains. Further studies could explore the perceptions of employers to understand their motivations and the domestic employment relationship from their view. This would be useful for drafting policies related to compliance and enforcement of labour laws.
7. While research has focused on migrant domestic workers from Zimbabwe and Lesotho, there is an increasing number of workers with other nationalities from SADC countries such as Malawi who are entering the domestic services sector. There is a need to look at other nationalities and to understand their experiences in this sector.
8. Further, comparative studies between migrant domestic workers and their local counterparts would be useful in understanding whether the challenges they face are specific to the sector or are associated with their migrant status.
9. This study on migrant care workers and domestic service sector as a whole, point to a gap in the provision of child care and elder care by the state. Future studies that focus on the role of the state in providing services including care work would be useful.

8.6 Conclusion

This study explored the cross-border migration of care workers in the Zimbabwe-South Africa stream to contribute to knowledge on South-South migration flows. The study makes *empirical* contributions to the fields of care and domestic work, gender, migration and family studies. It adds to the body of knowledge by providing empirical data in the growing field of care and domestic work. It interrogated the application of the concept of the global care chains in the Global South specifically in the Southern African region. It contributes to the literature on gendered migration flows where recent literature has focused on movement of female migrants from East African countries to the Middle East and South East Asian countries. This study makes comparisons of the Zimbabwe- South African migration flow (South -South migration to other trends i.e. South to North migration flows as well as other regional flows within the Global South. Chapter 2, which gave an overview of the South African domestic services sector, contextualised the challenges faced by migrant workers and set the tone for further investigation in this sector. The key findings highlight that while

South African legislative framework stands out in terms of protecting and ensuring the rights of domestic and care workers, there are still gaps in the protection of migrant care workers as illustrated in Chapter 4 and 5. Thus the findings provide evidence of the vulnerability of Zimbabwean migrant care workers.

Findings in this study demonstrated major differences between the South-North global care chains and South-South migration with regard to the migration process. Migration to countries in the North is largely facilitated through labour migration programmes or recruitment agencies. This represented a formal and regulated channel of acquiring work visas, employment contracts and travel to the destination countries. However, this study revealed that most of the migrant care workers in South Africa were undocumented or irregular, further pointing out their migration was an individual and informal process. Most of the care workers had entered into the country using the visitor's visa, which they had 'overstayed'; only a few had managed to acquire valid work documents such as work visas or asylum permits. Migrant care workers had faced challenges in acquiring the requisite documents largely due to South Africa's stringent immigration policy, which favours skilled labour.

It emerged that without legal documentation, migrant care workers could not seek employment through formal channels such as recruitment agencies. They used informal channels such as through social networks and the 'market'. This study highlighted that these informal channels were risky and did not offer protection and safety to either the care workers or the employing families. Evidence from this study suggests the limited role played by domestic recruitment agencies in South Africa in terms of facilitating transnational migration. They do not actively participate in the migration processes such as assisting in the acquisition of necessary documents, although they do act as gate keepers by ensuring that they recruit prospective workers with valid passports and work visas. In this process they shape who gets employed which is consistent with scholars that highlights the selection and discrimination of certain types of workers where immigration status plays a key role (Du Toit, 2016).

The findings of this study highlight the key features in the circulation of care in the Zimbabwe- South Africa migration stream. Significant characteristics of the duties of migrant care workers revealed in this study were that they had to balance both housework and care work and that their duties mostly involved childcare. It was noted that care work within private homes in South Africa has for the most part been provided by migrant women. In the apartheid years, black women migrating from rural areas provided paid care in white middle-class families. In contemporary South Africa, black women including international migrants from the country's neighbours provide care for both black and white families. Consistent with studies of workers in the domestic services sector, this study contributes to the fields of

gender studies through an analysis of the gender inequalities within families. The study highlights that caring remains the responsibility of women in households where they are paid care workers or as employers who outsource the workers to perform their care responsibilities. The multiple inequalities associated with care work with regard to gender, nationality and class were consistent with the literature on South-North global care chains.

Another major difference that emerged from this study was how work in the domestic service sector is arranged in South Africa. While most migrant workers in the South-North care chains worked as full-time, live-in care workers, in South Africa they had options to work as full-time live-in or full-time live-out workers or as part-time employees. Live-in workers were faced with the challenges of working long hours with little control over work schedules, while live-out and part-time workers suffered from excessive workloads. They also had to contend with long hours spent commuting to and from work, which negatively impacted on productivity at work as well in managing work and family responsibilities.

This study also contributes to knowledge on transnational families. Through highlighting the benefits and the cost of migration, the study gives evidence of transnational family relations which are strengthened through transnational care giving that comes in different forms. The findings highlight that despite their physical absence from their families in Zimbabwe, migrant women continued their care giving roles through remittances and regular communication. Through their migration, Zimbabwean care workers found employment that enabled them to contribute significantly to their children's education and well-being and to support their parents and siblings. The study also revealed the social cost of migration by highlighting the emotional strain suffered by migrant women as result of their separation from their families and loss of care resources for families left in Zimbabwe. Further, the study draw attention the challenges faced by migrant care workers in South Africa of gender-based violence and xenophobia in the context of high levels of violent crime including outbreaks of xenophobic violence.

Lastly, the findings demonstrate the impact of migration on the families of the migrants reflected by the re-organisation of care. The study found that women including the elderly, play a key role in caring for left-behind family members thereby highlighting the gendered-nature of care work. The migration of women left a care gap as families lost primary carers, which called for the reorganisation of care within the family unit. In this study, other women such as maternal grandmothers and aunts took up the role of caregivers further highlighting the ways in which the burden of caregiving within families falls on women.

Through recommendations discussed in this chapter, the study makes ***practical*** contributions to society. Chapter four highlights and illustrates the possible impact on care recipients of employing undocumented workers thus recommendations discussed in this chapter such the

introduction of the visa option for care workers and training of care workers will go a long way in protecting both the migrants as well as the employing families. Further, the study highlighted the slow implementation of policies by the SADC region. It was noted that migration between Zimbabwe and South Africa was guided by regional instruments such as the SADC labour framework launched in 2013 with the objective of promoting the management of intra-regional labour migration through the development of national labour migration labour policies. At the time of writing of this thesis, South Africa was still in the process of implementing the policies. Further, as noted in the recommendations, Zimbabwe is also urged to be more proactive in protecting its citizens abroad including migrant care workers who are contributing to the survival of their families back home as well as the economy.

REFERENCES

Aboderin, I. & Hoffman, J. 2015. Families, intergenerational bonds, and aging in Sub-Saharan Africa. *Canadian Journal on Aging/La Revue canadienne du vieillissement,* 34(3)**:** 282-289.

Aboderin, I., Kano, M. & Owii, H. A. 2017. Toward "age-friendly slums"? Health challenges of older slum dwellers in Nairobi and the applicability of the age-friendly city approach. *International journal of environmental research and public health,* 14(10)**:** 1259.

Aboderin, I. A. & Beard, J. R. 2015. Older people's health in sub-Saharan Africa. *The Lancet,* 385(9968)**:** e9-e11.

Adamek, M. E., Chane, S. & Kotecho, M. G. 2020. Family and kin care of elders in sub-Saharan Africa. *In:* Maharaj, P. (ed.) *Health and Care in Old Age in Africa.* Oxon & New York: Routledge.

African News Agency. 2019. Grappling with issues faced by migrants. *Cape Argus*, 17 May 2019.

African Union & HelpAge International. 2003. *AU Policy Framework and Plan of Action on Ageing*. Nairobi HelpAge International Africa Regional Development Centre.

Ajiambo, D. 2019. South African sisters address violence against migrant women. *Global Sisters Report* [Online]. Available: https://www.globalsistersreport.org/news/people/news/news/south-african-sisters-address-violence-against-migrant-women [Accessed 22 July 2020].

Åkesson, L., Carling, J. & Drotbohm, H. 2012. Mobility, moralities and motherhood: Navigating the contingencies of Cape Verdean lives. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies,* 38(2)**:** 237-260.

Ally, S. 2010. *From Servants to Workers: South African domestic workers and the democratic state*. Scottsville: University of Kwazulu Natal Press.

Ally, S. A. 2006. *" Maid" with Rights: The contradictory citizenship of domestic workers in post-apartheid South Africa.* Doctor of Philosophy, University of Wisconsin--Madison.

Anderson, B. 2000. *Doing the dirty work?: The global politics of domestic labour*. London & New York: Zed Books.

Anjara, S. G., Nellums, L. B., Bonetto, C. & Van Bortel, T. 2017. Stress, health and quality of life of female migrant domestic workers in Singapore: A cross-sectional study. *BMC Women's Health,* 17(1)**:** 1-13.

Archer, S. 2011. 'Buying the maid Ricoffy': Domestic workers, employers and food. *South African Review of Sociology,* 42(2)**:** 66-82.

Asis, M. M. B., Huang, S. & Yeoh, B. S. 2004. When the light of the home is abroad: Unskilled female migration and the Filipino family. *Singapore Journal of Tropical Geography,* 25(2)**:** 198-215.

Associated Press. 2019. Zim on knife-edge as fuel prices double. *Cape Times*, 14 January 2019.

Atkinson, R. & Flint, J. 2001. Accessing hidden and hard-to-reach populations: Snowball research strategies. *Social research update,* 33(1)**:** 1-4.

Awumbila, M. 2014. *Linkages between Urbanization, Rural-Urban Migration and Poverty, Outcomes in Africa. World Migration Report, 2015. Migrants and Cities: New Partnerships to Manage Mobility, Background Paper*. International Organisation for Migration

Awumbila, M. 2017. Drivers of migration and urbanization in Africa: Key trends and issues. *UN Expert Group Meeting on Sustainable Cities, Human Mobility and International Migration*. New York: United Nations.

Awumbila, M., Teye, J. K., Kandilige, L. & Chambel, M. 2017a. Understanding recruitment agencies in migrant domestic work in Ghana: Exploiters or facilitators?

Awumbila, M., Teye, J. K. & Yaro, J. A. 2017b. Of silent maids, skilled gardeners and careful madams: Gendered dynamics and strategies of migrant domestic workers in Accra, Ghana. *GeoJournal,* 82(5)**:** 957-970.

Awumbila, M., Teye, J. K. & Yaro, J. A. 2017c. Social networks, migration trajectories and livelihood strategies of migrant domestic and construction workers in Accra, Ghana. *Journal of Asian and African Studies,* 52(7)**:** 982-996.

Babbie, E. R. & Mouton, J. 2001. *The Practice of Social Research*. South African ed., Cape Town: Oxford University Press Southern Africa.

Bakker, I. 2007. Social reproduction and the constitution of a gendered political economy. *New Political Economy,* 12(4)**:** 541-556.

Baldassar, L., Baldock, C. V. & Wilding, R. 2007. *Families Caring across Borders: Migration, ageing and transnational caregiving*. Basingstoke & New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Basa, C., Harcourt, W. & Zarro, A. 2011. Remittances and transnational families in Italy and the Philippines: Breaking the global care chain. *Gender & Development,* 19(1)**:** 11-22.

Bastia, T. 2009. Women's migration and the crisis of care: Grandmothers caring for grandchildren in urban Bolivia. *Gender & Development,* 17(3)**:** 389-401.

The Hidden Lives of "Housegirls" 2019. Directed by BBC Africa Eye.

Bélanger, D. & Rahman, M. 2013. Migrating against all the odds: International labour migration of Bangladeshi women. *Current Sociology,* 61(3)**:** 356-373.

Berg, B. L. 2009. *Qualitative research methods for the social sciences*. 7th ed., Boston: Allyn & Bacon.

Bernhard, J. K., Landolt, P. & Goldring, L. 2005. *Transnational, Multi-local Motherhood: Experiences of Separation and Reunification among Latin American families in Canada*. Toronto: Joint Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Settlement.

Bikova, M. 2017. *The Egalitarian Heart. Global Care Chains in the Filipino Au Pair Migration to Norway.* PhD, University of Bergen.

Boccagni, P. 2012. Practising Motherhood at a Distance: Retention and Loss in Ecuadorian Transnational Families. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies,* 38(2)**:** 261-277.

Bonizzoni, P. & Boccagni, P. 2013. Care (and) circulation revisited: A conceptual map of diversity in transnational parenting. *Transnational Families, Migration and the*

Circulation of Care: Understanding mobility and absence in family life. New York: Routledge

Booysen, C. 2019. Inclusion of domestic workers hailed. *Cape Times*, 27 May 2019

Bothma, L. & Campher, C. 2003. Minimum wages for domestic workers: A comprehensive analysis. *Acta Academica,* 35(1)**:** 190-205.

Bothma, L. J. & Blaauw, P. F. 2010. The impact of minimum wages for domestic workers in Bloemfontein, South Africa : original research. *SA Journal of Human Resource Management,* 8(1)**:** 1-7.

Braun, V. & Clarke, V. 2012. Thematic Analysis. *In:* Cooper, H., Camic, P. M., Long, D. L., Panter, A. T., Rindskopf, D. & Sher, K. J. (eds.) *APA Handbook of Research Methods in Psychology, Vol. 2: Research Designs: Quantitative, qualitative, nuepsychological, and biological.* Washington DC: American Psychological Association.

Bryceson, D. F. & Vuorela, U. 2002. Transnational Families in the Twenty-first Century. *In:* Bryceson, D. & Vuorela, U. (eds.) *The Transnational Family : New European Frontiers and Global Networks.* 1 ed. London: Bloomsbury Academic.

Budlender, D. 2014. *MiWORC Report N° 5. Migration and Employment in South Africa: Statistical analysis of the migration module in the Quarterly Labour Force Survey, third quarter 2012.* Johannesburg: African Centre for Migration & Society, University of the Witwatersrand.

Budlender, D. 2016. *The introduction of a minimum wage for domestic workers in South Africa.* Conditions of Work and Employment Series : No. 72. Geneva: International Labour Office.

Campbell Fernandez, A. 2019. Kamala Harris just introduced a bill to give housekeepers overtime pay and meal break. *Vox* [Online]. Available: https://www.vox.com/2019/7/15/20694610/kamala-harris-domestic-workers-bill-of-rights-act [Accessed 30 June 2020].

Carling, J., Menjivar, C. & Schmalzbauer, L. 2012. Central Themes in the Study of Transnational Parenthood. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies,* 38(2)**:** 191-217.

Castagnone, E., Salis, E. & Premazzi, V. 2013. *Promoting intergration for mingrant domestic workers in Italy.* Geneva: International Labour Office.

Castree, N. 2007. Labour geography: A work in progress. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research,* 31(4)**:** 853-862.

Chib, A., Malik, S., Aricat, R. G. & Kadir, S. Z. 2014. Migrant mothering and mobile phones: Negotiations of transnational identity. *Mobile Media & Communication,* 2(1)**:** 73-93.

Chireka, K. 2015. *Migration and Body Politics: A study of migrant women workers in Bellville, Cape Town.* Master's dissertation, University of the Western Cape, Bellville, Western Cape.

Cock, J. 1980. *Maids and Madams: A study in the politics of exploitation*. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Cohen, B. & Menken, J. 2006. Aging in Sub-Saharan Africa: Recommendations for furthering research. Washington, DC: National Academies Press.

Cox, R. 2016. Migrant domestic workers and the globalization of childcare. *In:* Ansell, N., Klocker, N. & Skelton, T. (eds.) *Geographies of Global issues: Change and Threat.* Singapore: Springer Science+Business Media Singapore

Creswell, J. W. 2013. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing among five approaches*. 3rd ed., Los Angeles: Sage Publications.

Crozier, G. K. 2010. Careworkers in the global market: Appraising applications of feminist care ethics. *IJFAB: International Journal of Feminist Approaches to Bioethics,* 3(1)**:** 113-137.

Crush, J. 2000. Migrations Past: An Historical overview of cross-border movement in southern Africa. *In:* D.A., M. (ed.) *On Borders: Perspectives on International Migration in Southern Africa.* Ontario & New York: Southern African Migration Project &St. Martin's Press

Crush, J. & Caesar, M. 2016. Food remittances : Migration and food security in Africa. Waterloo, Ontario: Southern African Migration Programme.

Crush, J., Chikanda, A. & Tawodzera, G. 2015. The third wave: Mixed migration from Zimbabwe to South Africa. *Canadian Journal of African Studies/Revue canadienne des études africaines,* 49(2)**:** 363-382.

Crush, J. & McDonald, D. A. 2000. Transnationalism, African immigration, and new migrant spaces in South Africa: An introduction. *Canadian Journal of African Studies/La Revue canadienne des études africaines,* 34(1)**:** 1-19.

Crush, J. & Tevera, D. S. 2010. *Zimbabwe's exodus: Crisis, migration, survival*. Cape Town & Otawa: Southen African Migration Programme (SAMP) & International Development Reserch Centre (IDRC).

Davidovic, I. 2020. Coronavirus: "If I can't work, I can't feed my family'. *BBC News* [Online]. Available: https://www.bbc.com/news/business-52388835 [Accessed 24 May 2020].

De Regt, M. 2010a. Refugee, woman and domestic worker: Somali women dealing with dependencies in Yemen. *African and Black Diaspora: An International Journal,* 3(1)**:** 109-121.

De Regt, M. 2010b. Ways to come, ways to leave: Gender, mobility, and il/legality among Ethiopian domestic workers in Yemen. *Gender & Society,* 24(2)**:** 237-260.

Debonneville, J. 2021. An organizational approach to the Philippine migration industry: recruiting, matching and tailoring migrant domestic workers. *Comparative Migration Studies,* 9(1)**:** 1-20.

Denti, G. P. 2015. Invisibility, Exploitation, and Paternalism: Migrant Latina Domestic Workers and Rights to Family Life in Barcelona, Spain. *In:* Kontos, M. & Bonifacio, G. T. (eds.) *Migrant Domestic Workers and Family Life: international Perspectives* London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Deshingkar, P. & Zeitlyn, B. 2015. South-South Migration for Domestic Work and Poverty. *Geography Compass,* 9(4)**:** 169-179.

DeVault, M. L. 1996. Talking back to sociology: Distinctive contributions of feminist methodology. *Annual review of sociology,* 22(1)**:** 29-50.

Dodson, B. 2000. Women on the move: Gender and cross-border migration to South Africa from Lesotho, Mozambique and Zimbabwe. *In:* McDonald, D. A. (ed.) *On Borders : Perspectives on International Migration in Southern Africa.* Ontario & New York: Southern African Migration Project (SAMP) & St. Martin's Press.

Doucet, A. & Mauthner, N. 2008. Qualitative interviewing and feminist research. *In:* Alasuutari, P., Bickman, L. & Brannen, J. (eds.) *The Sage Handbook of Social Research Methods.* London: Sage

Du Plessis, A. 2018. *The role of Domestic Workers, as child carers, in the Stimulation of Motor Development of preschool children in Bloemfontein, South Africa.* Master's dissertation, University of the Free State.

Du Toit, D. 2013. *Exploited, Undervalued and Essential: Domestic workers and the Realisation of their Rights*. Pretoria: Pretoria University Law Press.

Du Toit, D. 2016. " We cannot discriminate against someone without an eye or a leg... But I do look at obesity": statistical discrimination and employers' recruitment strategies at housecleaning service companies in Johannesburg. *South African Journal of Labour Relations,* 40(1)**:** 25-41.

du Toit, D. & Huysamen, E. 2013. Implementing domestic workers' labour rights in a framework of transformative constitutionalism. *In:* Du Toit, D. (ed.) *Exloited, Undervaluated and Essential: Domestic Workers and the Realisation of their Rights.* Pretoria: Pretoria University Law Press.

Dube, G. 2019. Black South Africans' attitudes toward African immigrants between 2008 and 2016. *Nationalism and Ethnic Politics,* 25(2)**:** 191-210.

Duffy, M. 2005. Reproducing labor inequalities: Challenges for feminists conceptualizing care at the intersections of gender, race, and class. *Gender & Society,* 19(1)**:** 66-82.

Duffy, M. 2007. Doing the dirty work: Gender, race, and reproductive labor in historical perspective. *Gender & Society,* 21(3)**:** 313-336.

Düvell, F., Triandafyllidou, A. & Vollmer, B. 2010. Ethical issues in irregular migration research in Europe. *Population, Space and Place,* 16(3)**:** 227-239.

Ellis, E. 2020. Gender-based violence is South Africa's second pandemic, says Ramaphosa. *Daily Maverick* [Online]. Available: https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2020-06-18-gender-based-violence-is-south-africas-second-pandemic-says-ramaphosa/#gsc.tab=0 [Accessed 21 July 2020].

England, P. 2005. Emerging theories of care work. *Annual Review of Sociology,* 31(381-399.

Escriva, A. & Skinner, E. 2008. Domestic work and transnational care chains in Spain. *In:* Lutz, H. (ed.) *Migration and Domestic Work: A European Perspective on a Global Theme.* Hampshire: Ashgate

Esplen, E. & Brighton Institute of Development Studies 2009. *Gender and Care: Overview Report.* Brighton: Institute of Development Studies.

European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. 2011. *Migrants in an Irregular Situation employed in Domestic Work: Fundamental rights challenges for the European Union and its Member States.* Luxembourg: Publication Office of the European Union.

Experian & Enrich. 2019. *The Value of Care: Key Contributions of Migrant Domestic Workers to Economic Growth and Family Well-Being in Asia* [Online]. Experian Asia Pacific & Enrich Available: https://enrichhk.org/sites/default/files/2019-09/Final_The-Value-of-Care_Full-Report.pdf [Accessed 21 August 2020.

Fan, Y.-K. & Parreñas, R. S. 2018. Who cares for the children and the elderly? Gender and transnational families. *In:* Ducu, V., Nedelcu, M. & Telegdi-Csetri, A. (eds.) *Childhood and parenting in Transnational Settings.* Cham, Switzerland: Springer.

Fedyuk, O. 2015. Growing up with Migration: Shifting roles and responsibilities of Transnational Families of Ukrainian Care Workers in Italy. *In:* Kontos, M. & Bonifacio, G. T. (eds.) *Migrant Domestic Workers and Family Life.* London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Fedyuk, O. & Zentai, V. 2018. The Interview in Migration Studies: A step towards a dialogue and knowledge co-production? *In:* Zapata-Barrero, R. & Yalaz, E. (eds.) *Qualitative Research in European Migration Studies.* Cham, Switzerland: Springer.

Ferguson, S. & McNallly, D. 2014. Precarious migrants: Gender, race and the social reproduction of a global working class. *Socialist Register,* 51(51)**:** 1-23.

Fernandez, B. 2010. Cheap and disposable? The impact of the global economic crisis on the migration of Ethiopian women domestic workers to the Gulf. *Gender & Development,* 18(2)**:** 249-262.

Figueiredo, M. D. C., Suleman, F. & Botelho, M. D. C. 2018. Workplace abuse and harassment: The vulnerability of informal and migrant domestic workers in Portugal. *Social Policy and Society,* 17(1)**:** 65-85.

Findlay, A., McCollum, D., Shubin, S., Apsite, E. & Kisjane, Z. 2012. Imagining and producing the'good'migrant: the role of recruitment agencies in shaping bodily goodness.

Fish, J. N. 2006. Engendering democracy: Domestic labour and coalition-building in South Africa. *Journal of Southern African Studies,* 32(1)**:** 107-127.

Fish, J. N. 2013. Rights across borders: Policies, protections and practices for migrant domestic workers in South Africa. *In:* Du Toit, D. (ed.) *Exploited, Undervalued– and Essential: Domestic Workers and the Realisation of their Rights.* Pretoria: Pretoria University Law Press

Fouratt, C. E. 2017. Love for the Land: Remittances and care in a Nicaraguan Transnational Community. *Latin American Research Review,* 52(5)**:** 792-806.

Fouratt, C. E. 2019. *Transnational families, care Arrangements and the state in Costa Rica and Nicaragua.* For Progress of the World's Women 2019-2020: Families in a Changing World. New York: UN Women.

Francisco, V. 2015. 'The internet is magic': Technology, intimacy and transnational families. *Critical Sociology,* 41(1)**:** 173-190.

Fresnoza-Flot, A. & Shinozaki, K. 2017. Transnational perspectives on intersecting experiences: Gender, social class and generation among Southeast Asian migrants and their families. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies,* 43(6)**:** 867-884.

Fresnoza-Flot, A. 2009. Migration status and transnational mothering: The case of Filipino migrants in France. *Global Networks,* 9(2)**:** 252-270.

Fudge, J. 2011. Global care chains, employment agencies, and the conundrum of jurisdiction: Decent work for domestic workers in Canada. *Canadian Journal of Women and the Law,* 23(1)**:** 235-264.

Fudge, J. 2014. Feminist reflections on the scope of labour law: Domestic work, social reproduction, and jurisdiction. *Feminist Legal Studies,* 22(1)**:** 1-23.

Gaitskell, D., Kimble, J., Maconachie, M. & Unterhalter, E. 1983. Class, race and gender: Domestic workers in South Africa. *Review of African Political Economy,* 10(27-28)**:** 86-108.

Gallagher, M. 2002. The birth and death of apartheid. *BBC News Africa* [Online]. Available: Retrieved from http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/africa/575204.stm. Retrieved 17 August 2012 [Accessed 26 June 2020].

Gama, N. & Willemse, L. 2015. A Descriptive overview of the education and income levels of domestic workers in post-apartheid South Africa. *GeoJournal,* 80(5)**:** 721-741.

Ghaddar, A., Khandaqji, S. & Ghattas, J. 2018. Justifying abuse of women migrant domestic workers in Lebanon: the opinion of recruitment agencies. *Gaceta sanitaria,* In Press(

Ginsburg, R. 2000. 'Come in the Dark': Domestic Workers and their rooms in apartheid-era Johannesburg, South Africa. *Perspectives in Vernacular Architecture,* 8(83-100.

Glenn, E. N. 1992. From servitude to service work: Historical continuities in the racial division of paid reproductive labor. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society,* 18(1)**:** 1-43.

Griffin, L. 2010. *Borderwork:'Illegality', un-bounded labour and the lives of Basotho migrant domestic workers.* Phd, The University of Melbourne.

Griffin, L. 2011. Unravelling rights: 'Illegal' migrant domestic workers in South Africa. *South African Review of Sociology,* 42(2)**:** 83-101.

Grossman, J. 2011. Venturing beyond: Domestic work as essential public service. *South African Review of Sociology,* 42(2)**:** 134-141.

Gurung, S. H. 2009. Nepali female migrants and informalization of domestic care work: service or servitude? *Journal of Workplace Rights,* 14(3)**:** 375-396.

Gyasi, R. M. & Phillips, D. R. 2019. Aging and the rising burden of noncommunicable diseases in sub-Saharan Africa and other low- and middle- income countries: A call for holistic action. *The Gerontologist,* XX(XX)**:** 1-6.

Hengeveld, M. 2015. *South Africa's Domestic Workers: Invisible labor in plain sight* [Online]. Available: https://africasacountry.com/2015/03/south-africas-domestic-workers-bonded-labor-in-plain-sight [Accessed 29 June 2020.

Hester, H. & Srnicek, N. 2018. The Crisis of Social Reproduction and the End of Work. *In:* Einstein, A. (ed.) *The Age of Perplexity: Rethinking the World we Knew.* Barcelona: Fundacion BBVA.

Hochschild, A. R. 2012. The managed heart : commercialization of human feeling. Updated, with a new preface. ed. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Hondagneu-Sotelo, P. 1994. Regulating the unregulated?: Domestic workers' social networks. *Social Problems,* 41(1)**:** 50-64.

Hondagneu-Sotelo, P. 2001. *Doméstica: Immigrant workers cleaning and caring in the shadows affluence*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Hoobler, J. M. 2016. Domestic employment relationships and trickle-down work–family conflict: The South African context. *Africa Journal of Management,* 2(1)**:** 31-49.

Hovhannisyan, S., Baum, C. F., Ogude, H. R. A. & Sarkar, A. 2018. *Mixed Migration, Forced Displacement and Job OUtcomes in South Africa*. Group, T. W. B. Washington, DC: World Bank Group.

Huang, S. & Yeoh, B. S. A. 2007. Emotional labour and transnational domestic work: The moving geographies of 'maid abuse'in Singapore. *Mobilities,* 2(2)**:** 195-217.

Hughes, T. 2007. *Gender, Migration and Remittances in selected SADC countries: Preliminary findings*. Geneva: United Nations International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women (UN-INSTRAW).

Hungwe, C. 2020. Hanging in there: Zimbabwean migrant workers in Johannesburg. *Jurnalul Practicilor Comunitare Pozitive,* 20(3)**:** 54-76.

International Labour Organisation 2013. *Domestic Workers across the World: Global and regional statistics and the extent of legal protection*. Geneva: International Labour Office.

International Labour Organisation. 2016a. *Ensuring Protection and Rights for Domestic Workers in Africa* [Online]. Available: https://www.ilo.org/africa/media-centre/pr/WCMS_459465/lang--en/index.htm [Accessed 25 June 2020.

International Labour Organisation. 2016b. *Migrant Domestic Workers: Promoting Occupational Safety and Health*. Global Action Programme on Migrant Domestic Workers and their families. Geneva: International Labour Organisation.

International Labour Organisation. 2017. *World Social Protection Report 2017: Universal social protection to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals.* Geneva: International Labour Office.

International Labour Organisation. 2018a. *Care Work and Care Jobs for the future of Decent Work.* Geneva: International Labour Office.

International Labour Organisation. 2018b. *World Employment and Social Outlook: Trends for Women 2018 – Global snapshot.* Geneva: International Labour Office.

International Labour Organisation. 2020. *World Employment and Social Outlook: Trends 2020.* Geneva International Labour Office.

International Social Security Association. no date. *Social security: A fundamental human right* [Online]. Available: https://ww1.issa.int/Understanding%20social%20security [Accessed 25 June 2020.

Izaguirre, L. & Walsham, M. 2021. *South-South migration from a gender and intersectional perspective: An overview*. Migration for Development and Equality Working Paper.

Jansen, E. 2019. *Like family: Domestic workers in South African history and literature.* Johannesburg: Wits University Press.

Jureidini, R. 2005. Migrant workers and xenophobia in the Middle East. *In:* Bangura, Y. & Stavenhagen, R. (eds.) *Racism and public policy.* London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Jürgens, U., Donaldson, R., Rule, S. & Bähr, J. r. 2013. Townships in South African cities: Literature review and research perspectives. *Habitat International,* 39(256-260.

Kawulich, B. B. & Holland, L. 2012. Qualitative Data Analysis. *In:* Wagner, C., Kawulich, B., Garner, M. & Botha, A. (eds.) *Doing social research: A global context.* New York: London: McGraw-Hill.

Kern, A. & Müller-Böker, U. 2015. The middle space of migration: A case study on brokerage and recruitment agencies in Nepal. *Geoforum,* 65(158-169.

Ketema, N. B. 2014. *Female Ethiopian Migrant Domestic Workers: An Analysis of Migration, Return- Migration and Reintegration Experiences.* Master's disseration, University of Oregon.

King, A. J. 2007. Domestic service in post-apartheid South Africa : deference and disdain. Aldershot, England ;: Ashgate Pub. Co.

King-Dejarddin, A. 2019. *The social construction of migrant care work: At the intersection of care, migration and gender.* Geneva: International Labour Organisation.

Kiwanuka, M., Jinnah, Z. & Hartman-Pickerill, B. 2015. *Getting the house in order: Foreign migrant workers in the domestic work sector in South Africa.* MiWORC Report No 10. Johannesburg: African Centre of Migration and Society, University of Witwatersrand.

Kiwanuka, N. & Monson, T. 2009. *Zimbabwean migration into Southern Africa: New trends and responses.* Johannesburg: Forced Migration Studies Programme, University of Witwatersrand.

Knight, J. M. 2012. *Women's Transnational Migration and the Global Care Chains: The Impact of Nicaraguan Women's Migration to Costa Rica on their Families and Communities of Origin.* Master of Arts in International Development Studies Saint Mary's University, Halifax, Nova Scotia.

Kofman, E. 2012. Rethinking care through social reproduction: Articulating circuits of migration. *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society,* 19(1)**:** 142-162.

Kofman, E. & Raghuram, P. 2009. *The implications of migration for gender and care regimes in the South.* Geneva: United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.

Kofman, E. & Raghuram, P. 2015. *Gendered migrations and global social reproduction.* London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Kontos, M. & Bonifacio, G. T. 2015. Introduction: Domestic and Care Work of Migrant Women and the Right to Family Life. *In:* Kontos, M. & Bonifacio, G. T. (eds.) *Migrant Domestic Workers and Family Life: International Perspectives.* London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Kubjana, L. L. 2016. The Legal Protection of Domestic Workers in South Africa: a square peg it is (Into a Round Hole). *Obiter,* 37(3)**:** 549-561.

Kufakurinani, U., Pasura, D. & McGregor, J. 2014. Transnational Parenting and the Emergence of 'Diaspora Orphans' in Zimbabwe. *African Diaspora,* 7(1)**:** 114-138.

Kvale, S. & Brinkmann, S. 2015. *InterViews: Learning the craft of qualitative research interviewing*. Third edition., Los Angeles: Sage Publications.

Lahman, M. K. E., Mendoza, B. M., Rodriguez, K. L. & Schwartz, J. L. 2011. Undocumented research participants: Ethics and protection in a time of fear. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences,* 33(3)**:** 304-322.

Laiboni, N. 2020. *'A Job at Any Cost': Experiences of African Women Migrant Domestic Workers in the Middle East*. Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women & International Domestic Workers Federation.

Lam, T. & Yeoh, B. S. 2018. Migrant mothers, left-behind fathers: the negotiation of gender subjectivities in Indonesia and the Philippines. *Gender, Place & Culture,* 25(1)**:** 104-117.

Lan Anh, H. & Brenda, S. A. Y. 2011. Breadwinning Wives and "Left-Behind" Husbands : Men and Masculinities in the Vietnamese Transnational Family. *Gender & Society,* 25(6)**:** 717-739.

Lan, P.-C. 2000. *Global Divisions, Local Identities: Filipina migrant domestic workers and Taiwanese employers.* Phd, Chicago: Northwestern University.

Lan, P.-C. 2007. Legal servitude and free illegality: Migrant 'guest'workers in Taiwan. *In:* Parreñas, R., S, & Siu, L. C. D. (eds.) *Asian diasporas: New formations, new conceptions.* Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Lan, P. C. 2003. Political and Social geography of marginal insiders: Migrant domestic workers in Taiwan. *Asian and Pacific Migration Journal,* 12(1-2)**:** 99-125.

Laslett, B. & Brenner, J. 1989. Gender and social reproduction: Historical perspectives. *Annual review of sociology,* 15(1)**:** 381-404.

Latham, J. no date. *Qualitative Sample Size – How Many Participants is Enough?* [Online]. Available: https://www.drjohnlatham.com/many-participants-enough/ [Accessed 27 June 2020.

Lausch, J. 2015. Reinventing Intimacy and Identity: Filipina Domestic Workers' strategies for coping with family separation in Dubai. *In:* Kontos, M. & Bonifacio, G. T. (eds.) *Migrant Domestic Workers and Family Life: Internatiional Perspectives* London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Leal, D. F., Malhotra, R. S. & Misra, J. 2019. Visualizing Feminized International Migration Flows in the 1990s. *Socius,* 5(2378023118819940.

Leinaweaver, J. B. 2010. Outsourcing care: How Peruvian migrants meet transnational family obligations. *Latin American Perspectives,* 37(5)**:** 67-87.

Lewis-Beck, M., Bryman, E. P. A., Bryman, A. E. & Liao, T. F. 2004. *The Sage Encyclopedia of Social Science Research Methods.* Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.

Lindiwe, N. & Joseph, C. 2018. Success Factors and Gender Participation of Stokvels in South Africa. *Acta Universitatis Danubius: Oeconomica* [Online], 14.

Lutz, H. 2002. At your service madam! The globalization of domestic service. *Feminist Review,* 70(1)**:** 89-104.

Lutz, H. 2010. Gender in the migratory process. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies,* 36(10)**:** 1647-1663.

Lutz, H. 2018. Care migration: The connectivity between care chains, care circulation and transnational social inequality. *Current Sociology,* 66(4)**:** 577-589.

Lutz, H. & Palenga-Möllenbeck, E. 2012. Care workers, care drain, and care chains: Reflections on care, migration, and citizenship. *Social Politics,* 19(1)**:** 15-37.

Luxton, M. 2006. Feminist political economy in Canada and the politics of social reproduction. *In:* Bezanson, K. & Luxton, M. (eds.) *Social reproduction: Feminist political economy challenges neo-liberalism.* Montreal & Kingston, London: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Madebwe, C. & Madebwe, V. 2017. Contextual background to the rapid increase in migration from Zimbabwe since 1990. *Inkanyiso: Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences,* 9(1)**:** 27-36.

Madianou, M. & Miller, D. 2011. Mobile phone parenting: Reconfiguring relationships between Filipina migrant mothers and their left-behind children. *New media & society,* 13(3)**:** 457-470.

Maggio, M. L. V. & Westcott, H. 2014. Researchers' reflections of empathy following interviews with migrants. *Qualitative Research Journal,* 14(3)**:** 214-227.

Magwaza, T. 2008. Effects of Domestic Workers Act in South Africa: A steep road to recognition. *Agenda,* 22(78)**:** 79-92.

Mahdavi, P. 2013. Gender, labour and the law: the nexus of domestic work, human trafficking and the informal economy in the United Arab Emirates. *Global Networks,* 13(4)**:** 425-440.

Makoro, M. 2015. *The Construction of Illegality: Basotho migrant domestic workers' experiences.* Master's dissertation, University of Witwatersrand.

Malherbe, K. 2013. Implementing domestic workers' social security rights in a framework of transformative constitutionalism'in Du Toit D. *In:* Du Toit, D. (ed.) *Exploited, Undervalued– and Essential: Domestic Workers and the Realisation of their Rights.* Pretoria: Pretoria University Law Press.

Marchetti, S. 2016. Citizenship and Maternalism in Migrant Domestic Labour: Filipina Workers and Their Employers in Amsterdam and Rome. *Paid Migrant Domestic Labour in a Changing Europe.* Springer.

Mashayamombe, J. 2020. Evaluation of Labor Agency Strategy: The Case of a Strike at a South African Opencast Mine in 2012. *Labor Studies Journal,* 45(4)**:** 351-369.

Masterson, C. R. & Hoobler, J. M. 2019. Domestic Employment: Making Visible an Invisible Relationship. *Journal of Management Inquiry,* 28(3)**:** 354-358.

Mathe, T. 2019. Malaicha trade goes digital *Mail & Guardian*, 8 November 2019.

Maynard, M. & Purvis, J. 2013. *Researching women's lives from a feminist perspective.* Oxon & New York: Francis & Taylor.

Mazzucato, V., Dankyi, E. & Poeze, M. 2017. Mapping Transnational Networks of Care from a Multi-actor and Multi-sited Perspective. *In:* Bolzman, C., Bernardi, L. & Le

Goff, J.-M. (eds.) *Situating Children of Migrants across Borders and Origins: A Methodological Overview.* Dordrecht: Springer Netherlands.

Mbiyozo, A.-N. 2018. Gender and migration in South Africa: Talking to women migrants. *ISS Southern Africa Report,* 2018(16)**:** 1-36.

McGregor, J. 2007. 'Joining the BBC (British Bottom Cleaners)': Zimbabwean migrants and the UK care industry. *Journal of ethnic and migration studies,* 33(5)**:** 801-824.

McKay, D. 2007. 'Sending dollars shows feeling': Emotions and economies in Filipino migration. *Mobilities,* 2(2)**:** 175-194.

Mlambo, A. S. 2010. A History of Zimbabwean Migration to 1990. *In:* Crush, J. & Tevera, D. (eds.) *Zimbabwe's Exodus: Crisis, Migration and Survival.* Cape Town & Ottawa: Southen African Migration Programme (SAMP) & International Development Research Centre (IDRC).

Mlilo, S. & Misago, J. P. 2019. *Xenowatch :Xenophobic Violence in South Africa: 1991-2018: An overview.* Johannesburg: Afican Centre for Migration and Society.

Mokomane, Z. 2013. Social protection as a mechanism for family protection in sub-Saharan Africa 1. *International Journal of Social Welfare,* 22(3)**:** 248-259.

Moran-Taylor, M. J. 2008. When mothers and fathers migrate north: Caretakers, children, and child rearing in Guatemala. *Latin American Perspectives,* 35(4)**:** 79-95.

Moras, A. 2013. The role of maternalism in contemporary paid domestic work. *Sociology Mind,* 3(03)**:** 248.

Moyo, I. 2016. Changing migration status and shifting vulnerabilities: A research note on Zimbabwean migrants in South Africa. *Journal of Trafficking, Organized Crime and Security,* 2(2)**:** 108-112.

Moyo, O. N. & Kawewe, S. M. 2002. The Dynamics of a Racialized, Gendered, Ethnicized, and Economically Stratified Society: Understanding the Socio-Economic Status of Women in Zimbabwe. *Feminist Economics,* 8(2)**:** 163-181.

Muasya, G. 2014. The role of House Helps in Work- Family Balance of Women Employed in the Formal Sector in Kenya. *In:* Mokomane, Z. (ed.) *Work- Family Interface in sub-Saharan Africa: Challenges and Responses.* Cham, Switzerland: Springer.

Muzondidya, J. 2009. From buoyancy to crisis, 1980-1997. *In:* Raftopoulos, B. & Mlambo, A. (eds.) *Becoming Zimbabwe. A History from the Pre-colonial Period to 2008.* Harare: Weaver Press.

Nakonz, J. & Shik, A. W. Y. 2009. And all your problems are gone: Religious coping strategies among Philippine migrant workers in Hong Kong. *Mental Health, Religion & Culture,* 12(1)**:** 25-38.

Näre, L. 2007. Ukrainian and Polish domestic workers in Naples–A case of East-South migration. *Migration Online,* 5(1-14.

Näre, L. M. 2009. *Managing households, making homes: A moral economy of migrant domestic and care work in Naples.* DPhil, University of Sussex.

Ndaba, B. 2021. Domestic workers worst victims of Covid-19 pandemmic. *Pretoria News*, 08 March 2021.

Neocosmos, M. 2010. *From 'foreign Natives' to 'native Foreigners' : Explaining Xenophobia in post-apartheid South Africa: Citizenship and Nationalism, Identity and Politics.* Dakar: Codesria.

Nesbitt-Ahmed, Z. D. 2016. *The same, but different: The everyday lives of female and male domestic workers in Lagos, Nigeria.* Phd, The London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE).

Neuman, W. L. 2011. *Social research methods: Qualitative and quantitative approaches.* 7. ed., international ed., Boston: Pearson.

Newland, K. & Riester, A. 2018. *Welcome to work?: Legal migration pathways for low-skilled workers.* Washington DC: Migration Policy Institute.

Newsday. 2010. "SA's immigrant maids a desperate tribe". *Newsday* [Online]. Available: https://www.newsday.co.zw/2010/09/2010-09-16-sas-immigrant-maids-a-desperate-tribe/ [Accessed 15 February 2017].

Nisrane, B. L., Ossewaarde, R. & Need, A. 2020. The exploitation narratives and coping strategies of Ethiopian women return migrants from the Arabian Gulf. *Gender, Place & Culture: A Journal of Feminist Geography,* 27(4)**:** 568-586.

Nqambaza, P. R. 2016. *"Quintessential intersectional subjects": The case of Zimbabwean domestic workers.* Master's dissertation, University of Johannesburg.

Ntisa, A. & Selesho, J. 2014. Determining the impact of contract of employment: a case of low income earners. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences,* 5(2)**:** 221.

Nyamnjoh, F. B. 2014. Exorcising the demons within: Xenophobia, violence and statecraft in contemporary South Africa. *Journal of Contemporary African Studies,* 32(3)**:** 397-401.

Nyaura, J. E. & Ngugi, M. N. 2019. The plight of house-helps (domestic workers) in selected estates in Eastlands area, Nairobi Country, Kenya. *People: International Journal of Social Sciences,* 5(2)**:** 778-800.

Nzima, D. 2017. Channelling Migrant Remittances from South Africa to Zimbabwe: Opportunities and Obstacles. *Alternation Journal,* 24(1)**:** 294-313.

Olayiwola, P. 2019. ILO's Decent Work Agenda and Domestic Workers in Nigeria: Challenges and complexities. *Labour, Capital and Society : Special Issue: New forms of labour: Precarious, informal and migrant* 49(1)**:** 161-186.

Orozco, A. P. 2009. *Global Care Chains*. Gender, Migration and Development Series: Working Paper 2. Santo Domingo: United Nations International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women (UN-INSTRAW).

Orozco, A. P. 2010. *Global Care Chains: Toward a Rights-based Global Care Regime?* Santo Domingo: United Nations International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women (UN-INSTRAW).

Palenga-Möllenbeck, E. 2013. Care chains in Eastern and Central Europe: Male and female domestic Work at the intersections of gender, class, and ethnicity. *Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies,* 11(4)**:** 364-383.

Pande, A. 2012. From 'balcony talk' and 'practical prayers' to illegal collectives: Migrant domestic workers and meso-level resistances in Lebanon. *Gender & Society,* 26(3)**:** 382-405.

Pande, A. 2013. "The Paper that You Have in Your Hand is My Freedom": Migrant Domestic Work and the Sponsorship (Kafala) System in Lebanon. *The International Migration Review,* 47(2)**:** 414-441.

Pantea, M.-C. 2012. Grandmothers as main caregivers in the context of parental migration: Bunicile ca îngrijitoare in contextul migratiei parintilor. *European Journal of Social Work,* 15(1)**:** 63-80.

Parreñas, R. S. 2000. Migrant Filipina domestic workers and the international division of reproductive labor. *Gender & Society,* 14(4)**:** 560-580.

Parreñas, R. S. 2005. Long distance intimacy: Class, gender and intergenerational relations between mothers and children in Filipino transnational families. *Global networks,* 5(4)**:** 317-336.

Parreñas, R. S. 2008. Perpetually foreign: Filipina migrant domestic workers in Rome. *In:* Lutz, H. (ed.) *Migration and Domestic Work: A European Perspective on a Global Theme.* London: Ashgate Publishing

Parreñas, R. S. 2010. Transnational Mothering: A Source of Gender Conflicts in the Family. *North Carolina Law Review,* 88(5)**:** 1825-1855.

Parreñas, R. S. 2015. *Servants of Globalization: Migration and domestic work.* Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.

Parreñas, R. S. 2017. The indenture of migrant domestic workers. *Women's Studies Quarterly,* 113-127.

Payne, G. & Payne, J. 2004. Key concepts in social research. London: Sage Publications.

Peberdy, S. & Dinat, N. 2005. *Migration and Domestic Work in South Africa: Worlds of Work, Health and Mobility in Johannesburg.* Migration Policy Series No. 40. Cape Town : Kingston: Southern African Migration Project & Southern African Research Centre.

Peng, Y. & Wong, O. M. 2016. Who takes care of my left-behind children? Migrant mothers and caregivers in transnational child care. *Journal of Family Issues,* 37(14)**:** 2021-2044.

Pessar, P. R. & Mahler, S. J. 2003. Transnational migration: Bringing gender in. *International Migration Review,* 37(3)**:** 812-846.

Platt, M., Yeoh, B. S., Acedera, K. A., Yen, K. C., Baey, G. & Lam, T. 2016. Renegotiating migration experiences: Indonesian domestic workers in Singapore and use of information communication technologies. *New Media & Society,* 18(10)**:** 2207-2223.

Poeze, M., Dankyi, E. K. & Mazzucato, V. 2017. Navigating transnational childcare relationships: Migrant parents and their children's caregivers in the origin country. *Global Networks,* 17(1)**:** 111-129.

Poros, M. 2011. Migrant social networks: Vehicles for migration, integration, and development. *Migration Information Source, Migration Policy Institute* [Online]. Available: https://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/migrant-social-networks-vehicles-migration-integration-and-development [Accessed 29 May 2019].

Posel, D. 2001. What's in a name? Racial categorisations under apartheid and their afterlife. *TRANSFORMATION-DURBAN-,* 50-74.

Posel, D. 2004. Have migration patterns in post-apartheid South Africa changed? *Journal of Interdisciplinary Economics,* 15(3-4)**:** 277-292.

Potts, D. 2010. Internal migration in Zimbabwe: The impact of livelihood destruction in Rural and urban areas. *In:* Crush, J. & Tevera, D. (eds.) *Zimbabwe's Exodus: Crisis, Migration, Survival.* Cape Town & Canada: Southern African Migration Project.

Puppa, F. D. 2012. Being part of the family: Social and working conditions of female migrant care workers in Italy. *NORA-Nordic Journal of Feminist and Gender Research,* 20(3)**:** 182-198.

Pyle, J. L. 2006. Globalization and the increase in transnational care work: The flip side. *Globalizations,* 3(3)**:** 297-315.

Raftopoulos, B. 2009. The crisis in Zimbabwe, 1998-2008. *In:* Raftopoulos, B. & Mlambo, A. (eds.) *Becoming Zimbabwe. A History from the Pre-colonial Period to 2008 : A History from the Pre-colonial Period to 2008.* Harare: Weaver Press.

Raghuram, P. 2012. Global care, local configurations: Challenges to conceptualizations of care. *Global Networks,* 12(2)**:** 155-174.

Raijman, R., Schammah-Gesser, S. & Kemp, A. 2003. International migration, domestic work, and care work undocumented Latina migrants in Israel. *Gender & Society,* 17(5)**:** 727-749.

Ratha, D., Mohapatra, S. & Scheja, E. 2011. *Impact of migration on economic and social development: A review of evidence and emerging issues*. Policy Research Working Paper No 5558. The World Bank.

Recalde, A. 2015. Renegotiating Family and Work Arrangements while Caring Abroad: Paraguayan and Peruvian Women in Argentina. *In:* Kontos, M. & Bonifacio, G. T. (eds.) *Migrant Domestic Workers and Family Life: International Perspectives.* London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Reuters. 2019a. Zim economy 'in bad shape'. *Witness*, 16 July 2019.

Reuters. 2019b. Zim's inflation rate spirals to dizzy levels. *Sowetan*, 16 July 2019.

Romero, M. 2018. Reflections on Globalized Care Chains and Migrant Women Workers. *Critical Sociology,* 44(7-8)**:** 1179-1189.

Ryan, L. 2015. 'Inside' and 'Outside' of What or Where? Researching Migration Through Multi-Positionalities. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research,* 16(2)**:** 1-17.

Sachikonye, L. M. 2002. Whither Zimbabwe? Crisis & democratisation. *Review of African Political Economy,* 29(91)**:** 13-20.

Salih, R. 2000. Towards an understanding of gender and transnationalism: Moroccan migrant women's movements across the Mediterranean. *Anthropological Journal on European Cultures,* 9(2)**:** 75-91.

Sarantakos, S. 2013. *Social research*. 4th edition., New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Saturday Citizen. 2019. Court win for family of domestic. *Saturday Citizen*, 25 May 2019.

Schatz, E. & Seeley, J. 2015. Gender, ageing and carework in East and Southern Africa: A review. *Global Public Health,* 10(10)**:** 1185-1200.

Schiller, N. G., Basch, L. & Blanc, C. S. 1995. From immigrant to transmigrant: Theorizing transnational migration. *Anthropological quarterly,* 48-63.

Schiller, N. G., Basch, L. & Blanc-Szanton, C. 1992. Transnationalism: A new analytic framework for understanding migration. *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences,* 645(1)**:** 1-24.

Schmalzbauer, L. 2004. Searching for wages and mothering from afar: The case of Honduran transnational families. *Journal of marriage and family,* 66(5)**:** 1317-1331.

Schurink, E. 2009. Qualitative research design as tool for trustworthy research. *Journal of Public Administration,* 44(si-2)**:** 803-823.

Seekings, J. 2008. The continuing salience of race: Discrimination and diversity in South Africa. *Journal of Contemporary African Studies,* 26(1)**:** 1-25.

Seidman, I. 2013. *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences*. 4th ed., New York: Teachers College Press.

Sibanda, V. & Makwata, R. 2017. *Zimbabwe Post Independence Economic Policies: A Critical Review*. Saarbrücken: LAP Lambert Academic Publshing

Silubonde, T. R. 2014. *Migrants access to the labour market and ethnic niching: case study of Zimbabweans employed in the Cape Town restaurant industry.* Master of Social Science in Global Studies, University of Cape Town.

Sokanyile, A. 2020. Domestic workers hit hard by Covid-19, job losses. *Saturday Argus*, 17 October 2020.

Sørensen, N. N. & Vammen, I. M. 2014. Who cares? Transnational families in debates on migration and development. *New Diversities,* 16(2)**:** 89-108.

Stanley, L. 1997. Methodology matters! *In:* Robinson, V. & Richardson, D. (eds.) *Introducing Women's Studies: Feminist Theory and Practice.* 2nd ed. Basingstoke: Macmillan.

Statistics South Africa. 2014. *Census 2011: Profile of older persons in South Africa*. Pretoria: Statistics South Africa.

Statistics South Africa. 2014 *Census 2011 Provincial Profile: Gauteng.* Pretoria: Statistics South Africa.

Statistics South Africa. 2015. *Census 2011: Migration Dynamics in South Africa*. Pretoria: Statistics South Africa.

Statistics South Africa. 2018. *Gender Series Volume IV: Economic Empowerment, 2001-2017.* Pretoria: Statistics South Africa.

Statistics South Africa. 2019. *Quarterly Labour Force Survey Quarter 3: 2019.* Pretoria: Statistic South Africa.

Tekie, A. & Khunou, K. 2020. Domestic workers hung out to dry during lockdown. *Business Day*, 29 April 2020.

The Housing Development Agency. 2012. *South Africa: Informal settlement status*. Johannesburg: The Housing Development Agency.

Thebe, V. 2011. From South Africa with love: The malayisha system and Ndebele households' quest for livelihood reconstruction in south-western Zimbabwe. *The Journal of Modern African Studies,* 49(4)**:** 647-670.

Thebe, V. 2017. 'Two Steps Forward, One Step Back': Zimbabwean Migration and South Africa's Regularising Programme (the ZDP). *Journal of International Migration and Integration,* 18(2)**:** 613-622.

Thobejane, T. D. & Khoza, S. 2019. Becoming a Domestic Worker: The Case of Mpumalanga Province, South Africa. *OIDA International Journal of Sustainable Development,* 12(03)**:** 27-38.

Thompson, E. C. 2009. Mobile phones, communities and social networks among foreign workers in Singapore. *Global Networks,* 9(3)**:** 359-380.

Thummapol, O., Park, T., Jackson, M. & Barton, S. 2019. Methodological Challenges Faced in Doing Research With Vulnerable Women: Reflections From Fieldwork Experiences. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods,* 18(1-11.

Tolstokorova, A. V. 2010. Where have all the mothers gone? The gendered effect of labour migration and transnationalism on the institution of parenthood in Ukraine. *Anthropology of East Europe Review,* 28(1)**:** 184-214.

Tracy, S. J. 2013. *Qualitative research methods: Collecting evidence, crafting analysis, communicating impact*. Chichester, West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell.

Tshabalala, M. M. & Van Der Heever, H. 2015. Health seeking behaviours of migrant domestic workers in Centurion, South Africa: Utilization of primary health care

services. *African Journal for Physical Health Education, Recreation and Dance,* 21(Supplement 2)**:** 275-286.

Tsikata, D. 2011. Employment agencies and the regulation of domestic workers in Ghana: Institutionalizing informality? *Canadian Journal of Women and the Law,* 23(1)**:** 213-234.

Tsikata, D. 2018. *Promoting change in domestic work conditions from outside the State in a context of regulatory inertia: The case of Ghana.* Working Paper Series, Working Paper #9. Quebec: The Labour Law and Development Research Laboratory.

Turrell, R. 1986. Diamonds and migrant labour in South Africa, 1869-1910. *History Today,* 36(5)**:** 45-49.

United Nations. 2015. *Behind closed doors: Protecting and promoting the human rights of migrant domestic workers in an irregular situation.* New York & Geneva: United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner.

United Nations. 2016a. *International Migration Report 2015.* New York: United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affiars Population Division.

United Nations. 2016b. *Population Facts: Sub-Saharan's growing population of older persons.* New York: United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs Population Division.

United Nations. 2020. *World Population Ageing 2019* New York: United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs Population Division.

United Nations Conference on Trade and Development. 2018. *Economic Development in Africa: Migration for Structural Transformation.* Geneva: United Nations Conference on Trade and Development.

Van Bortel, T., Martin, S., Anjara, S. & Nellums, L. B. 2019. Perceived stressors and coping mechanisms of female migrant domestic workers in Singapore. *PloS one,* 14(3)**:** 1-15.

Van der Geest, S. 2016. Will families in Ghana continue to care for older people? Logic and contradiction in policy. *In:* Hoffman, J. & Pype, K. (eds.) *Ageing in Sub-Saharan Africa: Spaces and practices of care.* Bristol: Policy Press.

Van der Ham, A. J., Ujano-Batangan, M. T., Ignacio, R. & Wolffers, I. 2014. Toward healthy migration: An exploratory study on the resilience of migrant domestic workers from the Philippines. *Transcultural psychiatry,* 51(4)**:** 545-568.

Van der Ham, A. J., Ujano-Batangan, M. T., Ignacio, R. & Wolffers, I. 2015. The dynamics of migration-related stress and coping of female domestic workers from the Philippines: an exploratory study. *Community mental health journal,* 51(1)**:** 14-20.

Van der Westhuizen, E. & Murray, C. 2015. *The Ultimate Domestic Workers Guide.* Johannesburg: Patridge Africa.

Vanyoro, K. P. 2019a. *Regularising Labour Migration of Zimbabwean Domestic Workers in South Africa.* Johannesburg: African Centre for Migration & Society, University of the Witwatersrand.

Vanyoro, K. P. 2019b. *Zimbabwean migrant domestic worker activism in South Africa.* Migrating Out of Poverty Research Programme Consortium. Brighton: University of Sussex.

Wang, C.-H., Chung, C.-P., Hwang, J.-T. & Ning, C.-y. 2018. The Foreign Domestic Workers in Singapore, Hong Kong, and Taiwan: Should Minimum Wage Apply to Foreign Domestic Workers? *The Chinese Economy,* 51(2)**:** 154-174.

Wee, K., Goh, C. & Yeoh, B. S. 2019. Chutes-and-ladders: the migration industry, conditionality, and the production of precarity among migrant domestic workers in Singapore. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies,* 45(14)**:** 2672-2688.

Whitehouse, B. 2009. Transnational childrearing and the preservation of transnational identity in Brazzaville, Congo. *Global networks (Oxford, England),* 9(1)**:** 82-99.

Wicks, B. 2020. Domestic workers pay high price for employers' noncompliance. *The Citizen*, 04 May 2020.

World Health Organisation. 2017. *Women on the move: Migration, care work and health.* Geneva: World Health Organization.

Yeates, N. 2005. *Global Care Chains: A critical introduction.* Global Migration Perspectives. Geneva: Global Commission on International Migration.

Yeates, N. 2009. *Globalizing care economies and migrant workers: Explorations in global care chains*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Yeoh, B. S. & Ramdas, K. 2014. Gender, migration, mobility and transnationalism. *Gender, Place & Culture,* 21(10)**:** 1197-1213.

Yiengprugsawan, V., Healy, J. & Kendig, H. 2016. *Health system responses to population ageing and noncommunicable diseases in Asia*. Comparative Country Studies Vol 2 (2). New Delhi: World Health Organisation.

Zack, T., Matshaka, S., Moyo, K. & Vanyoro, K. P. 2019. *My way? The circumstances and intermediaries that influence the migration decision-making of female Zimbabwean domestic workers in Johannesburg*. Migrating Out of Poverty Research Programme Consortium Working Paper 57. Brighton: Migrating Out of Poverty Research Programme Consortium, University of Sussex.

Zanamwe, L. & Devillard, A. 2010. *Migration in Zimbabwe: Country Profile_2009*. Harare: Zimbabwe National Statistical Agency (ZIMSTAT) &International Organisation for Migration (IOM).

Zinyama, L. 2000. Who, what, when and why: Cross-border movement from Zimbabwe to South Africa *In:* McDonald, D. A. (ed.) *On Borders : Perspectives on International Migration in Southern Africa.* Ontario &New York: Southern African Migration Project & St. Martin's Press.

APPENDICES

Appendix A: Information sheet and consent form

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

<u>INFORMATION SHEET AND CONSENT FORM</u>

My name is Precious Baison and I am at doctoral student in the Department of Sociology at the University of Pretoria. I am conducting research on the cross-border migration of Zimbabwean women employed as care workers in private households in South Africa. The research project is titled: *Cross-border care practices: Experiences of Zimbabwean migrant women engaged in care work in households in South Africa.* The study seeks to investigate the experiences of Zimbabwean women working as care workers in private households in South Africa and implications of cross border migration on the families of these migrant women. It seeks to understand the work they are doing in the domestic service sector as well as how they are managing family relations in their absence.

As part of the study I am requesting your permission to conduct an interview to assist me in gathering the information described above. In addition, I would be grateful for your permission to audio tape the interview. The interviews should be about an hour long and will be scheduled at a time and place suitable for you. Please note that your participation in this study is completely voluntary and you may choose to withdraw at any time during the interview. If at any point in the interview you feel uncomfortable with a question asked, you are not forced to answer it and have an option to decline to respond to the question.

All data collected in the interviews will be treated with strict confidentiality. The details of your identity will remain confidential throughout the study as all transcripts will be coded such that your identity can not be linked to the transcripts. Pseudonyms will be used to protect your identity in reports and publications on the research. All information collected from you will be stored at the Department of Sociology for a maximum of 15 years.

Your participation in this study will not lead to any direct benefits, but will add to the knowledge on understanding on the effects of migration on care work and care-giving practices within families. There are no anticipated risks attached to participating in this study. However, if you feel distressed in any way at any point during the interview or after, please let me know and I will share with you details of the local Lifeline or the South African Anxiety and Depression Group. These organisations will offer you debriefing and counselling services at no cost.

It is of crucial importance that before you agree to participate in this study you fully comprehend what is involved and are satisfied with your participation within the study. If you agree to participate in the study, please sign the consent form available.

If you have questions or concerns before or after the study, please contact me on:
Cell number: 00 27 81 045 2193
Email: preciouszhou@gmail.com

Consent

I hereby consent to participant in the research on the experiences of cross- border migration of Zimbabwean women working as care workers in the domestic service sector in South Africa. I understand that I am participating freely and without being forced in any way to do so. I also understand that I can stop this interview at any time should I not want to continue and this decision will not in any way affect me negatively.

 I understand that this is an academic research project.

 I understand that my answers will remain confidential.

…………………………………

Signature of participant

………………………….

Date

I am willing for the interview to be audio taped.

……………………………..

Signature of participant

……………………………….

Date

Interviewer's signature: ………………………….

Date:……………………………

Appendix B: Interview guide for Zimbabwean women in the domestic service sector in South Africa

1. **Background information**

This section aims to obtain detailed information on the participant's background and includes details on:

- Age
- Marital status
- Highest level of education
- Any other qualifications/skills

2. **Family situation in Zimbabwe**

- Number of children and their ages and schooling details i.e pre, primary or secondary school, grades

    Probes:
    -Who is looking after the children?
    -Where are the children living (are they living in the migrant's household or have they moved into the care giver's home)?
    -Do the caregivers have children of their own? Are the caregivers employed?
- Parents and parents-in-law
- Extended family, (number of dependants that you may be supporting)
- Family livelihood

    Probes:
    Economic activities and income in the family i.e. vending, remittances from other family members etc?

3. **Reasons for migration to South Africa**

    3.1. When did you first come to South Africa to work?

    3.2. Please explain the social and economic activities you were undertaking in Zimbabwe two years before you migrated to South Africa.

    Probes:
    - *What other social roles did they play in Zimbabwe?*

3.3. What made you decide to move to South Africa?
Probes:
- *Main reasons for migration?*

- *Why did you choose South Africa in particular?*

4. Migration Experiences
4.1. May you please describe your move to South Africa for work?

Probes:
- *What visa or permit did you come with? What visa are you on now? How did you qualify for it?*
- *If not on any visa or permit, what are the implications: how did you get the current job, how do you feel your current status impacts you in terms of negotiating working conditions?*
- *Job history since arriving in South Africa: type of jobs; which industry; why they left; how they found the jobs? Was it through social networks or recruitment agencies); why the care sector?*

5. Current employment
5.1.   What type of work are you currently doing?

Probes:
- *Full-time or part-time, live-in or live-out and why?*

5.2.   May you tell me more about your employer?

Probes:
- *Race? Occupation? Did you choose your employer and why?*
- *Details of the household: size, number of children, adults etc?*

5.3.   Please describe to me your typical workday?

Probes:
- *What are your main care responsibilities: what do you enjoy about this aspect? What do you enjoy the least? What do you think are the main challenges? In your view, what would make your job easier?*

6. Working conditions
6.1. Please may you explain the terms of employment with your current employer?

Probes:
- *Contractual agreements:*

- *Written? What does the contract state? Advantages and disadvantages?*
- *Verbal? What are the implications in terms of enforcing the terms of the contract?*
- *Which one is better? What do you think of the tenets of the contract? Are you happy with it?*
- *Working hours: what happens when you work overtime? Are you remunerated?*
- *Leave arrangements?*
- *Remuneration: is it at par, below or above minimum wage? Are there other forms of remuneration?*
- *Other benefits: medical insurance, UIF etc?*

6.2. Please explain your living conditions in your employer's household.
Probes:
- *Sleeping arrangements?*
- *Eating together, preparing the same meals, quality and quantity of meals allocated to the domestic worker?*
- *Do you share the same spaces with the members of the household?*
- *Do you feel like you are part of the family?*

6.3. Briefly explain how you feel about the overall working conditions of your job.

Probes:
- *What are your feelings towards your employer?*
- *Do you feel free to discuss problems or personal problems with your employer? If you have a misunderstanding, how do you address it?*
- *Other concerns you would like to share: abuse and discrimination?*

6.4. Do you think your working conditions differ from South African care workers?

Probes:
- *How and to what extent do they differ?*

7. Benefits of migrating
7.1. In what ways would you say your migration has changed the situation or circumstances for your family back in Zimbabwe?

Probes:

- *For yourself? Why do you say so?*
- *For your family? Why do you say so?*

7.2. What other benefits do you think your migration has had?
- *On yourself?*
- *On your family?*

8. Challenges of migration

8.1. What challenges do you think you are facing as a result of migrating to South Africa?

Probes:
- *For yourself? Financial, psychosocial, social factors?*
- *For your family? Caregiving responsibilities, relations with care givers etc?*

8.2. How would you describe communication between you and your family since you migrated to South Africa for work?

Probes:
- *Communication channels: in what ways do you communicate with:*
  -Your children and how often? How would you describe your feelings towards being separated from children?
  -Family members and how often? What does your family say and think about your working in South Africa?
- *How would you describe your relations with the caregivers? Do you offer remuneration to them and in what ways?*

8.3. How do you deal with the challenges you are facing in South Africa and Zimbabwe (coping strategies)?

8.4. Is there anything else that you wish to talk about that we have not discussed?

Thank you for your time.

Appendix B: Interview Guide for key informants

1. Characteristics of the recruitment agency

1.1. Background detail on your agency.

Probes:
- *General information on the agency: type of agency: formal or informal?*
- *Type of services provided?*
- *Industries serviced?*
- *Advertising of services: how do prospective clients get in touch with you (both domestic workers and employers)?*

2. Prospective employers and employees' needs

2.1. Who are the typical employers?

Probes:
- *Characteristics: race, occupation, gender, household characteristics (single parent or couples)?*
- *Employers' preferences: what are typical characteristics that employers require in a domestic worker or care worker: part time/ full time, race, nationality, gender, care work experience? Why do you think this is the case?*

2.2. Who are the typical employees?

Probes:
- *Characteristics: age, race, nationality and why do you think so?*

3. Recruitment Process

3.1. What are requirements for accepting individuals you have on your database (demographics, age, education, skills, permit/visa status etc)?

3.2. Please explain the recruitment process.

Probes:
- *How do you get people on your database?*
- *How do you place them?*
- *Who pays you (employer/employee) etc?*

3.3. What are the key issues that an employer of a domestic worker should consider?

Probes:
- *Legislative requirements such as registration of domestic workers and general employment practices?*

3.4. Do you prescribe any working conditions for the employers? Please explain.

Probes:
- *Working hours, remuneration etc?*
- *Differences between the services they offer and those offered by informal agents or agencies?*

3.5. What are the legal tools that guide you on conditions of employing foreign domestic workers (visa, UIF registration)?

Probes:
- *Level of compliance?*
- *Are there any measures to address if there is failure to meet these requirements?*

4. Feedback and complaints process
4.1. Do you ever receive complaints from the employers?

Probes:
- *What are the main complaints?*
- *How do you address them?*

4.2. Do you ever receive complaints from the domestic workers?

Probes:
- *What are the main complaints?*
- *How do you address them?*

4.3. Do you think working conditions for foreign domestic workers whose major responsibility is caring work, in particular Zimbabweans, differs from those of their South African counterparts?

Probes:

- *How and to what extent do they differ?*

4.4. From your experiences working with domestic workers, what are the challenges that foreign domestic workers specifically from Zimbabwe have raised?

4.5. Do you have a continuous relationship with:
- Employers?
- Domestic workers?

   (Is it a once-off mediatory relationship or is a continuous one?)

4.6. Is there anything else you wish to talk about that we have not discussed?

Thank you for your time.

Appendix C : Ethics Approval Letter

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

Faculty of Humanities
Research Ethics Committee

26 October 2017

Dear Ms Baison

Project:	**Cross-border care practices: experiences of Zimbabwean migrant women engaged in care work in households in South Africa**
Researcher:	**P Baison**
Supervisor:	**Prof Z Mokomane**
Department:	**Sociology**
Reference number:	**13414152 (GW20171033HS)**

Thank you for the application that was submitted for ethical consideration.

I am pleased to inform you that the above application was **approved** by the **Research Ethics Committee** at an ad hoc meeting held on 26 October 2017. Data collection may therefore commence.

Please note that this approval is based on the assumption that the research will be carried out along the lines laid out in the proposal. Should the actual research depart significantly from the proposed research, it will be necessary to apply for a new research approval and ethical clearance.

We wish you success with the project.

Sincerely

Prof Maxi Schoeman
Deputy Dean: Postgraduate Studies and Ethics
Faculty of Humanities
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
e-mail:tracey.andrew@up.ac.za

CC: Prof Z Mokomane (Supervisor)

Prof D Bonnin (HoD)