How to Define the **Historic Urban Landscape** of Pretoria
Through an Understanding of its Historic Layers

Engela White
Student number 1445063
University of Pretoria, Pretoria
Degree: Master of Architecture (Research)
Department of Architecture
Faculty of Engineering, Built Environment and Information Technology
University of Pretoria
Pretoria 0002
South Africa
2018

Supervisor: Prof Roger Fisher
Declaration

In accordance with Regulation (4e) of the General Regulations (G.57), for dissertations and theses, I declare that this dissertation, which I hereby submit for the degree Masters of Architecture in the Department of Architecture in the Faculty of Engineering, Built Environment and Information Technology at the University of Pretoria, is my own work and has not previously been submitted by me for a degree at this or any other tertiary institution. I further state that no part of my dissertation has already been, or is currently being submitted for any such degree or other qualification. I further declare that this dissertation is substantially my own work. Where reference is made to the works of others, the extent to which that work has been used is indicated and fully acknowledged in the text and lists of references.

The text of this dissertation amounts to 55 807 words.

Engela White (October 2018)

Abstract

The Historic Urban Landscape (HUL) Approach was promulgated by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation in 2011. South Africa, as a member-state of UNESCO, has yet to implement this ‘soft law’ into its regulatory framework. The HUL Approach is intended to be included in the planning regulations of the third tier of government or at the local authority level. As a practicing architect and heritage consultant, I deemed it appropriate to devote this study to the definition of the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria. The administrative capital of South Africa has a richly layered history and demonstrates a vibrant and diverse community life. Many layers of cultural and tangible history await exploration by contemporaries from the administrative-, academic- and public-sectors, all of whom are receptive towards the application of the HUL Approach as a valid strategy that integrates both planning and heritage conservation. In order to fully understand how the Historic Urban Landscape must be defined, I aimed the research toward recent applications of the HUL Approach in appropriate precedents. Two precedents were selected, one of which is quoted as a pronounced success: the City of Ballarat in
Australia. The other precedent consists of the three World Heritage Sites on the Swahili Coast of East Africa: the Island of Mozambique, the Stone Town of Zanzibar and Lamu Old Town in Kenya. The latter precedent is perceived by me as an example of an incomplete application of the HUL Approach, due to the initial inconclusive definition of the historic urban landscape. The study concludes with recommendations on the diverse layers that should represent the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria. These should include but may not be limited to: site topography, geomorphology, hydrology and natural features, historic and contemporary built environments, infrastructure, open spaces and gardens, land use patterns, spatial organizations, perceptions, visual relationships, social and cultural practices, and values and economic processes. I have applied my research to the history of Pretoria to portray the richness of the layers, and have endeavoured to describe the many and varied role-players that are still represented by the diverse cultures that live as a collective community in the capital city of the New South Africa. Limitations to the study include: available literature on the implementation of the HUL Approach and the collective community’s view on the impact of the contemporary history of Pretoria. The latter is expected to emerge resolutely from the involvement of the local community during the actual implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach.

**Key Words**

- HUL: Historic Urban Landscape
- ICOMOS: International Council on Monuments and Sites
- UNESCO: United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organisation
- WHITR-AP: World Heritage Institute of Training and Research for the Asia and the Pacific Region
- HERITAGE ACT: National Heritage Resources Act 25 of 1999 of the Republic of South Africa
Acknowledgements

Prof Roger Fisher (Department of Architecture, University of Pretoria)
The late Prof Karel Bakker (Department of Architecture, University of Pretoria)
Rianie van der Linde (Librarian: Merensky Library, University of Pretoria)
Prof Chrisna du Plessis (Head of Department, Architecture, University of Pretoria)
Prof Jacques Laubscher (Head of Department of Architecture, Faculty of Engineering and the Built Environment, Tshwane University of Technology)

Gary White, for his continued encouragement and mentorship and for being an accomplished and loving husband and father.

Our children, Anderson, Mackenzie and Jamie White, for their unwavering patience, support and love.

Dedication

My late father, Jacobus Abraham Opperman, who instilled in me a fervent interest in heritage and history.
# Table of Contents

- **LIST OF FIGURES** .......................................................... 8
- **THE RESEARCHER AND HER EXPERTISE** .............................. 13
- **CHAPTER 1: BACKGROUND AND STRUCTURE** ......................... 15
  1.1 **BACKGROUND** ......................................................... 16
  1.2 The problem justifies the objective .................................. 20
  1.3 The research problem .................................................. 21
  1.4 Delimitations ............................................................. 22
  1.5 Research methodology .................................................. 23
  1.6 Relevance ..................................................................... 26
  1.7 Outline of the study ....................................................... 26
- **CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE SURVEY** .................................... 30
  2.1 Understanding that the Historic Urban Landscape approach considers both urban development and heritage conservation: ....... 34
  2.2 Understanding the integrated nature of recent planning policies and its potential compatibility with the new direction of heritage conservation: ......................................................... 36
  2.3 Understanding the relationship between the objectives set for the Historic Urban Landscape Approach versus the objectives of the latest planning policies against urban sprawl .......................... 39
  2.4 The problem in its context .............................................. 40
  2.5 Summary: .................................................................... 46
- **CHAPTER 3: A PERTINENT REVIEW OF THE UNESCO APPROACH ON THE HISTORIC URBAN LANDSCAPE** .................................................. 48
  3.1 The history of the protection of heritage resources and the development of the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL) Approach ...... 48
  3.1.1 The French Revolution: ............................................. 52
  3.1.2 Nineteenth Century Stylistic Restoration Period ................. 52
  3.1.3 Second World War and its effect on Europe ..................... 53
  3.1.4 The European Architectural Heritage Year of 1975 .......... 55
  3.1.4 The Heritage Conservation Charters ............................. 56
  3.2 There is a call for an adjusted approach towards the definition, protection and management of heritage resources in contemporary urbanization and sustainable development .......... 59
  3.3 The core considerations of the ........................................ 64
  3.4 The six-step implementation plan for the .......................... 68
  3.5 Conclusion of the pertinent review of the UNESCO Approach on the Historic Urban Landscape ................................................. 70
- **CHAPTER 4: A STUDY OF PRECEDES FOR HUL** .................... 75
  4.1 Precedent 1: Ballarat, Australia ....................................... 78
  4.1.1 Historical background of the city of Ballarat .................. 80
  4.1.2 How was the Historic Urban Landscape Approach implemented in the city of Ballarat? .................................................. 80
  4.2 Precedent 2 in the African context: East Africa’s Swahili Coast .. 96
5. STEPS TOWARDS DEFINING THE STUDY AREA .................................................. 127

5.1. UNDERSTANDING HISTORIC PRETORIA ................................................. 127

5.1.1 THE EARLY HUMAN HISTORY OF THE AREA THAT WOULD LATER ENCOMPASS PRETORIA ................................................................. 130

5.1.2 INDUSTRIAL AND COMMERCIAL HISTORY ......................................... 136

5.1.3 MUNICIPAL HISTORY ................................................................................. 140

5.1.4 MILITARY HISTORY .................................................................................. 141

5.1.5 CULTURAL AND SOCIAL HISTORY ......................................................... 144

5.1.6 THE JUDICIAL AND POLITICAL HISTORY ........................................... 147

5.1.7 THE HISTORY OF THE PRESS ................................................................. 153

5.1.8 SPORT HISTORY ......................................................................................... 156

5.1.9 EDUCATIONAL HISTORY ......................................................................... 159

5.1.10 THE HISTORY OF TOWN PLANNING AND ARCHITECTURE IN PRETORIA ................................................................. 163

5.2. UNDERSTANDING THE HISTORIC URBAN LANDSCAPE OF PRETORIA ................................................................. 173

5.2.1 THE TOPOGRAPHY ................................................................................... 174

5.2.2 THE GEOMORPHOLOGY ........................................................................... 176

5.2.3 HYDROLOGY AND NATURAL FEATURES ............................................. 177

5.2.4 THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT (HISTORIC AND CONTEMPORARY) ....... 182

5.2.5 INFRASTRUCTURE ABOVE AND BELOW GROUND................................. 188

5.2.6 OPEN SPACES, PARKS AND STREETS ................................................... 193

5.2.7 LAND-USE PATTERNS AND SPATIAL ORGANIZATION ......................... 205

5.2.8 PERCEPTIONS AND VISUAL RELATIONSHIPS ...................................... 211

5.3 SUMMARY OF THE STEPS REQUIRED FOR DEFINING THE STUDY AREA ................................................................. 220
Table of Figures

Figure 1: Artwork from the series ‘Transparent Territories’ by Gerhard Marx (Marx 2017).................................................................15
Figure 2: Artwork from the series ‘Transparent Territories’ by Gerhard Marx....15
Figure 3: Inscription in Professor Bakker’s copy of ‘The Historic Urban Landscape’ by Francesco Bandarin and Ron van Oers....................16
Figure 4: The latest publication on the Historic Urban Landscape Approach is expected in March 2019 [in press] (Springer 2018).......................19
Figure 5: Artwork from the series ‘Lessons in Looking Down’ by Gerhard Marx (Marx 2017).................................................................30
Figure 6: The historic city of Savannah, Georgia, is depicted as part of a city which was planned in the traditional mould of interconnected patterns, and has survived the 20th Century (City of Savannah, Georgia 2015)........................................38
Figure 7: A worksheet prepared by the author to understand the objectives set in the Historic Urban Landscape Approach against the objectives set in the alternative zoning policies in the urban design discipline, as explained by Emerson (the Author)........................................................................39
Figure 8: A 1996 advertisement for Pretoria, depicting twelve images of Nelson Mandela in different costumes, which respectively represent tourist attractions ..........................................................41
Figure 9: Map of Pretoria, circa 1939 (Liebenberg 2015, p. 34). The grey areas indicate the White settlements, whereas the existence of Black settlements to the west, north and south of the city are omitted. ..................43
Figure 10: Map of Pretoria, circa 1943 (Liebenberg 2015, p. 35). The grey areas indicate the White settlements, whereas the existence of Black settlements to the west, north and south of the city are omitted. ..............43
Figure 11: Paul Kruger’s statue, circa 2015 (Nkosi 2015). Barricaded ..........45
Figure 12: The statue of Cecil John Rhodes is being removed ..................45
Figure 13: Artwork from the series: Feral Map by Gerhard Marx (Marx 2017).47
Figure 14: A defaced section of The City of Edinburgh (Black 2015). ........49
Figure 15: the Ducal Palace in Urbino, Italy (1470-1475). Figure 16: the inner court of the Ducal Palace in Urbino, 50
Figure 17: The Picturesque Movement in England is represented by an image of Fountains Abbey, with its ruined twelfth-century Cistercian monastery, set in eighteenth century landscaped parkland (Rodwell 2007, p. 3). ......................51
Figure 18: The book cover of Brave New World (1932), by Aldous Huxley (Google Books 2018a)................................................................54
Figure 19: The book cover of................................................................54
Figure 20: The Royal Crescent (1767-1775), restored under the auspices of the Bath Preservation Trust during the 1970s (Royal Crescent Bath, 2011)........55
Figure 21: Grand Place, Brussels, is the central square of the city. It is........55
Figure 22: SPAB Manifesto advertisement (The SPAB Manifesto 2017)......57
Figure 23: The front cover of the Venice Charter, produced as one of the major international charters during the Second International Congress of Architects and Technicians of Historic Buildings in 1964 (The Paul Getty Trust 2004)........58
Figure 24: An image of an ancient town on the Front cover of the Washington Charter, 1987 (Sunny 2016). .........................................................59
Figure 25: Front cover of the Burra Charter, 1999 (Slide Share 2018)........59
Figure 26: Doel, Belgium - residential area (urbexsession 2018).............60
Figure 27: Doel, Belgium - residential area (urbexsession 2018).............60
Figure 28: A diagrammatic presentation of the New Urban Agenda, indicating the visionary connections between aspects of sustainable .................63
Figure 29: Collage image describing the layers of the city (Van Iersel 2013)...66
Figure 30: Collage image describing the layers of historic Pretoria by the author. .................................................................................66
Figure 31: City in a Box — Pretoria, (WITOPWIT, 2018)..........................72
Figure 32: The graphic representation of the Historic Urban Landscape as defined for the City of Ballarat (City of Ballarat 2017a)...................73
Figure 33: Artwork from the ‘Survey’ series by Gerhard Marx (Marx 2017)....75
Figure 34: The City of Ballarat in Australia (UNESCO 2018a) ...............78
Figure 35: A map of the state of Victoria, Australia, showing the location of Ballarat, represented by the red star (City of Ballarat 2016).....................79
Figure 36: A collage of the city of Ballarat’s architectural heritage features (City of Ballarat, 2016) .................................................................79
Figure 37: The informal sketch representing Ballarat’s vulnerabilities, generated through.................................................................82
Figure 38: Image that emerged from the landscape assessment representing some of the values shared by the.............................................84
Figure 39: The graphic representation of Ballarat’s historic urban landscape, Annexure L (City of Ballarat 2017a, p. 18).................................85
Figure 40: A city map of Ballarat, describing the historic district (City of Ballarat 2018a)The historic streetcapes of Ballarat were earmarked for revitalization. 84
The image to the left represents a walking tour of the historic streets of Ballarat.

Figure 41: Her Majesty’s Theatre, City of Ballarat ......................................................... 86

Left: Figure 42: Living Corridors map, prepared by the City of Ballarat in accordance with the commitment towards the re-establishment of the Urban Habitat (City of Ballarat 2018c) ................................................................. 88

Figure 43: An artist’s impression of the City of Ballarat’s characteristic skyline on approach from the west and looking eastwards .............................................. 90

Figure 44: The Miners Rest memories webpage consists of a heritage trail and a record of the memories of long term local, Mr Bill Loader, City of Ballarat (City of Ballarat 2015f) ................................................................. 91

Figure 45: The Sketchfab webpage, a digital record of the City of Ballarat (City of Ballarat 2015e) ....................................................................................... 92

Figure 46a: Cultural mapping, City of Ballarat (Spencer 2017, p 17) ....................... 95

Figure 47: Rooftopscape of Macuti Town (roof of the palm trees), Island of Mozambique, (flickr 2012) ....................................................................................... 99

Figure 48: Traditional African architecture of a street in Macuti Town, Island of Mozambique, (Assomo 2006) ................................................................. 99

Figure 49: Chapel of San Antonio, Island of Mozambique, (Watt 2018) ............... 99

Figure 50: Museum of sacred art, northern part, Island of Mozambique, (Encyclopaedia Britannica, 1998) ................................................................. 99

Figure 51: Elaborate tourist map of the Island of Mozambique that clearly indicates the divide between the northern and southern parts as well as the 100

Figure 52: Urban fabric of Stone Town, Zanzibar (Zamani 2017). The preserved urban fabric of Zanzibar: integrated in nature but diverse in composition ................................. 103

Figure 53: A streetscape in central Stone Town, Zanzibar (Pitcher 2004) .............. 104

Figure 54: The urban fabric of Stone Town, Zanzibar (Pitcher 2004) .............. 104

Figure 55: Monument in remembrance of the Slave Trade (Rachael 2017). This monument by Scandinavian artist, Clara Sönäs, was commissioned in 1997 and depicts five slave figures with features from varying tribal and ethnic origins, chained together in a pit with the original slave chains (Elliott 2017) ....... 105

Figure 56: Lamu Old Town Kenya (UNESCO 2001a). An aerial photograph showing the fine-grained urban fabric of Lamu Old Town ................................................... 108

Figure 57: Map showing the fine-grained urban fabric of Lamu Old Town, Kenya (National Museums of Kenya 2001) ................................................................. 109

Figure 58: The Lamu Old Town waterfront ................................................................. 109

Figure 59: The photogenic architecture of Lamu Old Town (Duff 2014) .......... 110

Figure 60: Artwork from the series ‘Looking Down’ by Gerhard Marx (Marx 2017) ....................................................................................................................... 126

Figure 61: Pretoria, early image (Botha 1938, p. 173) ............................................. 129

Figure 62: Ndebele people in tribal dress (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 65) ....... 131

Figure 63: A drawing of a Ndebele dwelling demonstrates its architectural quality (South African History Online 2011) ................................................................. 132

Figure 64: Decorative images on Ndebele architecture. The walls are decorated with colourful geometric patterns (South African History Online 2011) ......... 132

Figure 65: A young Northern ....................................................................................... 132

Figure 66: Traditional Sotho blankets (Aranda 2018). Traditional Sotho blankets are manufactured from pure wool. These specific blankets are referred to as The Kharetsa, named after the spiral aloe, and display the iconic Basotho hat and shield motifs ............................................................................................................. 132

Left: Figure 67: Depiction of the original church on Church Square, Pretoria Artists’ impression 1857 (Eric Bolsmann 2001; Protea Book House) ............. 134

Right: Figure 68: Depiction of the original church on Church Square, Pretoria Artists’ impression 1860 (Eric Bolsmann 2001; Protea Book House) ......... 134

Figure 69: General A.W. Pretorius (Engelbrecht et al. 1955) ......................... 134

Figure 70: The first farmer’s co-operative store, which stood on the corner of Bank Lane and Church Square in Pretoria (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 113) ........ 136

Figure 71: The first shop in Pretoria was that of T.W. Beckett & Co., located on the corner of Church and Van der Walt Streets (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 116) ................. 136

Figure 72: An image of the paper money used in South Africa (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 114) ............................................................................................................. 137

Figure 73: An artist’s image of the Union Buildings in Pretoria (Schutte 2016). The new government seat of the Union of South Africa was commissioned to Herbert Baker in 1909 ............................................................................................................. 138

Figure 74: The Volkskas Bank Building was erected in 1954. (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 124)............................................................................................................. 139

Figure 75: Pretoria as depicted by J.H. Pieterse (1886-1957), in the year of its centenary (1955) (Engelbrecht et al. 1955) ......................................................... 139

Figure 76: The State Artillery Unit in Pretoria during the time of president T.F. Burgers (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 89) ..................................................................... 141

Figure 77: The State Artillery Unit in Pretoria at practice (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 95) ............................................................................................................. 141

Figure 78: The military camp established at Pretoria during the British annexation between 1877 and 1881 (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 93) ................. 142
Figure 87: Hand written notes on walls of holding cell in Palace of Justice, including the Freedom Charter, Pretoria (Nelson Mandela Foundation 2011) 152

Figure 88: The Old Synagogue (1898) in Pretoria was consecrated in 1898. It was expropriated by the South African Government in 1952 to serve as a special supreme court, Pretoria (Victor 2000) 152

Figure 89: Hand drawn plan of the Old Synagogue (1898), Pretoria (Melvin Residence 2013) 152

Figure 90: Hand drawn elevation of the Old Synagogue (1898), Pretoria (Melvin Residence 2013) 152

Figure 91: Two covers of the ‘Government Gazette’, circa 1863 and 1902, depicting the transformation between the respective publication dates (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 334). 153

Figure 92: ‘De Volksstem’ newspaper (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 337). A depiction of the office of ‘De Volksstem’ in Church Street East, together with several title pieces and date lines from a collection of publications. 154

Figure 93: Title piece of ‘Land en Volk’ and an image of its editor, Eugene Nielen Marais (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 344). 155

Figure 94: Church Square was decorated festively to mark the re-election of President Paul Kruger (1825-1904) as State President; the honorary arch depicted above was erected at the western entry to 156

Figure 95: A sports meeting at Berea Park, where rugby was played after players prepared the surface before each match during the late 1800s (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 240). 157

Figure 96: The first school building (indicated by the red arrow) was located on the western portion of the area where the Palace of Justice was erected 158

Figure 97: Pretoria Boys’ High School (1901) (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, pp. 148-172). 159

Figure 98: Afrikaans Hoër Seunnskool (1920) (Maroela Media 2018). 160

Figure 99: The remnants of the Berlin Missionary School at the Daspoot Sewage Farm, Pretoria (Clarke 2008). 161

Figure 100: The natural features surrounding the area that would later comprise the settlement of Pretoria, consist of the topography that allows entry portals, suggesting a north-south axis, with Elandsport to the south and Wonderboompoort to the north. The diagrams above depict a progression of the urban development of Pretoria, subtly guided by the topography (Jordaan 1987). 164

Figure 101: The western, eastern and northern boundaries of the historic core of Pretoria are demarcated by rivers; the southern boundary is represented by a hill, Salokop. The diagrams above depict a progression of the urban development of Pretoria (Jordaan, 1987). 165

Figure 102: The urban-form concept of the sacred centre in a city (Lynch, 1981, p. 79). 165

Figure 103: The urban-form. 166

Figure 104: The urban-form concept of the dominance of up versus down in a city (Lynch 1981, p. 79) 167

Figure 105: The urban-form concept of the cardinal directions in a city (Lynch 1981, p. 79) 167

Figure 106: The cardinal axis of Pretoria (Vivien Allen 2007; Protea Book House; the Author). An 1859 map of Pretoria as surveyed by Andries du Toit between 1857 and 1858; the north-south axis formed by Paul Kruger, bounded by a water furrow to the east; the east-west axis is formed by Church Street. 168

Figure 107: Block map of the South eastern Quarter of historic Pretoria, showing area concentrations of heritage resources (Le Roux 1992, p. 56). 169

Figure 108: Block map of Pretoria showing area concentrations of heritage resources in the north eastern quarter (Le Roux 1992, p. 56) 170

Figure 109: Block map of Pretoria showing area concentrations of heritage resources in the north western quarter (Le Roux and Botes 1991, p. 103). 171

Figure 110: Block map of Pretoria showing area concentrations of heritage resources in the south western quarter (Le Roux and Botes 1993, p. 12). 171
Figure 111: Block map of Pretoria, showing the largest remaining concentration of heritage resources in historic Pretoria (Le Roux and Botes 1993, p. 57) .......................................................... 172
Figure 112: Pretoria’s collective community (Layton 2018) .......................................................... 173
Figure 113: Historic map of Pretoria, circa 1903 (UCT Library Digital Collections 2018): The town of Pretoria as depicted in 1903 by the Surveyor General .......................................................... 174
Figure 114: A geotechnical map of Northern Gauteng (Geocaching 2014). The map indicates areas (in blue) where dolomite occurs and the consequent sinkhole danger that prevails .......................................................... 176
Figure 115: The natural upper and lower fountains of Pretoria (Oxford University) .......................................................... 177
Press 2018a) Figure 116: A drawing, prepared by the author, indicating the position of rivers .......................................................... 177
Figure 117: Water structure historic Pretoria - pump station built by the British circa 1898 (Panagos 2003) .......................................................... 178
Figure 118: Water structure historic Pretoria - masonry funnel leading to sump at the pump chamber (Panagos 2003) .......................................................... 178
Figure 119: Water structure historic Pretoria. The structure built to protect Grootsfontein Fountain (Dippenaar 2013) .......................................................... 179
Figure 120: The Fountains Valley is located 3.2km from the city centre; it boasted lawns, a swimming pool and an open air dance floor during the 1960s. Historic Pretoria (English 1966) .......................................................... 179
Figure 121: The Wonderboom (Wonder Tree) could give shelter to a thousand people before it was damaged by a fire and parasite infestations, historic Pretoria (How South Africa’s 1000-year-old tree looked 100 years ago 2016) .......................................................... 180
Figure 122: The Jacaranda trees of historic Pretoria were introduced to the city as early as 1880 (Gopretoria 2009) .......................................................... 180
Figure 123: Map of historic Pretoria (1903), (UCT Library Digital Collections 2018). The area comprising historic Pretoria as depicted on a hand-drawn map from 1905; this area was evaluated by the author in 2012 and the adjacent evaluation legend was consequently developed and applied to a contemporary map of historic Pretoria .......................................................... 183
Figure 124: Horse-drawn tram on Church Square during the late 1800’s, historic Pretoria (Melvin Residence, 2014) .......................................................... 188
Figure 125: Two trams at Church Square with the tram station in the background (Schutte 2018) .......................................................... 188
Figure 126: The remnants of the original historic tram tracks were exposed during a construction project on Church Square; the tracks are still in a good condition, as depicted above (Melvin Residence 2014) .......................................................... 189
Figure 127: Historic map of Pretoria, showing the route of the tram tracks through Church Square in yellow, connecting Paul Kruger Street in the south with Church Street to the east (Melvin Residence 2014) .......................................................... 189
Figure 128: The trickling ponds at the Daspoort Sewage Farm are an example of excellent stone masonry, dating from the 1920s (the author) .......................................................... 191
Figure 129: The Heroes’ Acre, also known as the Church Street Cemetery, is currently in disarray and subject to vandalism, as is evident from the missing tombstone in the image above (Pretoria East Rekord 2015) .......................................................... 192
Figure 130: National animal of the Republic of South Africa, the Springbok, for which Springbok Park was named (Department Arts and Culture 2013) .......................................................... 193
Figure 131: National flower of the Republic of South Africa, the Protea, for which Protea Park was named (Department Arts and Culture, 2013) .......................................................... 193
Figure 132: An aerial photograph of historic Pretoria (2018). The original street grid is still distinguishable (2018 Google Earth 2018) .......................................................... 197
Figure 133: The area comprising historic Pretoria as depicted on a hand-drawn map from 1905 (1903) (UCT Library Digital Collections 2018) .......................................................... 197
Figure 134: Map of Marabastad - important places and stories (the author). Marabastad is an example of an area of cultural and historic significance where spaces, streets and buildings survived the forced relocations of the 20th century (Annexure F) .......................................................... 203
Figure 135: City of Tshwane in context (Perez, du Plessis and Landman 2016 p. 691). A contextual map of Tshwane within the African continent, the Republic of South Africa and Gauteng Province. .......................................................... 205
Figure 136: A spatial model of Pretoria, a segregation city, circa 1948 (Olivier and Hatting 1985, p. 49) .......................................................... 206
Figure 137: Spatial organization of Pretoria, the Apartheid city, circa 1970 (Olivier and Hatting 1985, p. 52) .......................................................... 208
Figure 138: A conceptual presentation of the cellular planning characteristics associated with the 20th century city, visual on plan (Emerson, 2007 p. 18) .......................................................... 210
Figure 139: The Paul Kruger statue defaced with green paint on Church Square (Ngcobo, 2015) .......................................................... 212
Figure 140: Titus Matiyane and artwork (Ndhlouv, 2018). Titus Matiyane is a 214
Figure 141: Titus Matiyane’s depiction of Pretoria (Ndhlouv, 2018) .......................................................... 214
Figure 142: The Voortrekker Monument illuminated in pink and purple to draw the community’s focus to the City’s rich cultural heritage (2014) .......................................................... 215
Figure 143: Cool Capital Arts Festival (Cool Capital 2016). An arts festival was held at the Open Window Art School in Centurion where the interests of the collective community of Tshwane and Pretoria were represented.

Figure 144: City-in-a-Box: Pretoria by WITOPWIT, depicting a layered heritage landscape (WITOPWIT, 2018).

Figure 145: The Hang Pretoria project by WITOPWIT, based on Church Square and Paul Kruger (WITOPWIT, 2018).

Figure 146: Women’s Day logo by I am Lezanne (I am lezanne, 2018).

Figure 147: Women’s Day.

Figure 148: Nelson Mandela’s statue in front of Union Buildings (Pretoria City of Tshwane 2008).

Figure 149: Graphic representation of Ballarat – HUL (City of Ballarat 2017a).

Annexure Li.

Figure 150: Graphic representation of historic Pretoria – HUL – Annexure Li (the Author).

Figure 151: Artwork from the series: Depths in Feet (Ripple), by Gerhard Marx (Marx, 2017).

Figure 152: Ballarat’s Historic Urban Landscape model (GOHUL 2016).

Figure 153: Cover of British Airways in-flight magazine of June 2017, which featured contemporary perceptions of Pretoria.

Figure 154: Artwork from the series ‘Transparent Territories’ by Gerhard Marx (Marx 2017).

Figure 155: Artwork from the series ‘Transparent Territories’ by Gerhard Marx (Marx 2017).
The Researcher’s Expertise

I obtained the degree in architecture (B. Arch) in 1991 from the University of the Orange Free State and consequently gained architectural experience, in both the private and public sectors, over the following 27 years.

Upon registration as a professional architect in 1992, I was employed by the housing company, Communicare, in Cape Town. I then secured experience in the private sector at Louw, ApostelEllis, Bergenthuin, Architects, in Johannesburg between 1994 and 1998. I developed the required skills and insight relating to residential design, architectural detailing, construction supervision, and contract management under the expert guidance of Louis Louw and Johan Bergenthuin during that period.

I consulted with the Department of Sport, Recreation, Arts and Culture as a junior architect and project manager regarding the planning and management of architectural projects, which included several of the heritage assets in the National Estate, during my employment with the Gauteng Department of Public Works and Transport between 1998 and 2002.

I braved the 2008 global economic recession that had a detrimental effect on the building industry in South Africa and beyond, by successfully qualifying as an arbitrator with the Association of Arbitrators (Southern Africa) during 2009 and continued my studies by doing the Association of Arbitrators’ Contract Law courses until I successfully completed the module in Construction Law in 2013.

Consequent to my employment in the public sector, WIEW Architects, an architectural firm which specialises in heritage consultation services, architectural services and arbitration, was established.

My first heritage assignment with WIEW was the restoration of the Kruger House Museum in Church Street, which is in the heart of historic Pretoria. The Kruger House Museum project led to further appointments. The researcher worked as the heritage consultant on several assignments that involved buildings that form part of the National Estate for heritage assets as a result.
During 2012 and 2013 I was involved in a research study to formulate a heritage evaluation system for historic Pretoria. The research done for said assignment was applied in this study (see 5.1 and 5.2). Admittedly, the decision to embark on enquiries into the meaning and application potential of the HUL Approach in historic Pretoria undoubtedly stems from this period of my professional career.

Engela White
6803090027088
P.O. Box 2757, BROOKLYN SQUARE, 0075
engela@wiewarchitects.com
nothing exists in isolation
all things emerge from the environment of their creation
hence all things reflect the mind of their creator
something of the thinking of the ideas and mind of their creator is embodied in the artefact
if one can decode the artefact one can access the meaning conveyed therein
in finding meaning one can reanimate the past in the present
in making that meaning explicit the past enriches and makes more meaningful
the present (Fisher 2014)

extracted from the obituary prepared by Professor Roger Fisher

Transparent Territories is a series of artworks by Gerhard Marx, which creates images that defy the two-dimensional authority of maps to portray ‘a transparent palimpsest of geography and historical time’.

The artworks are constructed from fragments of decommissioned and discarded terrestrial maps.

CHAPTER 1: Background and Structure
1.1 **Background**

1.1.1. **Inspiration**

The work and passion of two pioneering champions of the implementation of the HUL Approach, Dr Ron van Oers and Professor Karel Bakker, inspired this study regarding the definition of the historic urban landscape of Pretoria. While Dr van Oers was the author of important literature on the subject, Professor Bakker participated in the HUL Workshops on the Swahili Coast in East Africa during 2011 and 2012 (Roders 2015). Sadly, both Professor Bakker and Dr van Oers passed away during 2014 and 2015, respectively (Roders 2015). Professor Karel Bakker was the head of the Department of Architecture at the University of Pretoria. During his tenure he agreed to act as the study leader on the research and preparation of this document in 2014. He enthusiastically motivated that the definition of the historic urban landscape in historic Pretoria will be a positive contribution towards the facilitation of sustainable development in the city. This echoed his collaboration with Dr van Oers and the belief that sustainable urban developments must respect communities and enrich their heritage (Roders 2015). The passing of Professor Bakker, on 19 November 2014, affected the progress of this study and afforded me the opportunity to mature concerning my understanding of the subject during my quest for a study leader to replace Professor Bakker, who was a leading contributor to the national and international heritage realm. I was honoured that Professor Roger Fisher availed his equal expertise in the field of Heritage, Architecture and academic research.

*Figure 3: Inscription in Professor Bakker's copy of 'The Historic Urban Landscape' by Francesco Bandarin and Ron van Oers (Bandarin and Van Oers 2012)*
The personal tone of this message is a tribute to the shared values and experiences on the subject of the Historic Urban Landscape.

Professor Fisher is a contemporary of Professor Bakker’s and he understands that Professor Bakker’s work was inclined towards distilling and extracting from the historic past towards the living present, in consideration of all facets of living humanity (Fisher 2014). The term ‘ecosystemic’ was derived from the discipline of psychology and was introduced to Professor Bakker’s contemporaries during his time at the helm of the Department of Architecture at the University of Pretoria. Professor Fisher explained the meaning of the term as such:

nothing exists in isolation
all things emerge from the environment of their creation
hence all things reflect the mind of their creator
something of the thinking of the ideas and mind of their creator
is embodied in the artefact
if one can decode the artefact one can access the meaning conveyed therein
in finding meaning one can reanimate the past in the present

in making that meaning explicit the past enriches and makes more meaningful the present (Fisher 2014)

This poetic description of the understanding of the parts in order to grasp the whole, aptly resonates with the meaning and implication of the (Historic Urban) Landscape Approach: in order to understand the solution to a conservation problem, a multi-faceted understanding of the layers of a historic site is required (UNESCO 2016, p. 11).

It is, therefore, with humble gratitude for the inspiration found in the work and advice of visionaries of the Landscape Approach that I recommenced my preparation for this study early in 2016.

1.1.2. Publications on the Historic Urban Landscape and the gaps to be filled

To date, publications on the Historic Urban Landscape have mainly dealt with discussions as to why the HUL Approach was required for application, and how the HUL Approach was developed. These publications have primarily illustrated issues and challenges encountered thus far (Bandarin and Van Oers...
2012); (Van Oers and Haraguchi 2013); (Bonadei, Cisani and Viani 2017); (Fortuna De Rosa and Maria Di Palma 2013); (Julia Rey Perez & Placido Gonzalez Martinez 2018).

I have applied the information extracted from these publications in this study to:

- understand the core principles of the HUL Approach (see Chapter 3);
- understand how the HUL was defined in case studies (see Chapter 4);
- formulate a recommendation with respect to the definition of the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria (see Chapter 5 and 6).

There is a perceived gap in current publications on the HUL Approach, which relates to the development of information on the actual implementation thereof in pilot cases, the perceived outcomes and the methods adopted in varying scenarios.

A publication titled *Reshaping Urban Conservation*, has been prepared by Ana Pereira Roders and Francesco Bandarin (Editors) and is earmarked for publication in March 2019 (Springer 2018) [in Press].

Roders and Bandarin address the integration of heritage management in the disciplines of regional and urban planning and management. In their efforts to explain how the HUL Approach must be implemented, 28 case studies have been analysed and compared. It is anticipated that this publication will serve as a practical guidebook to empower prospective champions of the implementation of the HUL Approach.
1.1.3. The decision to do this study

Recent developments have affected the delicate fabric associated with the Church Square precinct in the historic heart of Pretoria. As reported in the Heritage Portal (July 2017), city activists have expressed great concern regarding the impact on the historic urban structure of this area resulting from the rejuvenation of the Church Square location as part of the implementation of the new Bus Rapid Transit System (South African Government 2018). The shared concern is that the project will affect the look and feel of the historic buildings negatively and disturb the spatial relationship and composition of the area.

My shared life with Gary White (Pretoria News 2018), an accomplished urban designer, has sensitised me to the advantages that the latest global urban design approaches may hold for heritage conservation. The HUL Approach is a tool that combines the benefits of contemporary urban design with conservation management as an instrument to bring about change (Bandarin and Van Oers 2012, p. 188).

I therefore decided to consider the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria as a starting point to discover appropriate solutions to the challenges posed by urban heritage in the capital city of South Africa. It is anticipated that a well-managed HUL may yield valuable economic growth because capital investors, tourists and residents will be attracted to the...
area and community pride will be harnessed while links with local history will be established.

The beneficiaries of this research project are envisaged to be:
• the academic community – researchers, teachers and students of heritage, both local and regional, and heritage practitioners,
• corporate and government property developers,
• owners of heritage assets in historic Pretoria,
• the citizens, and
• the future generations of the capital city of South Africa.

1.2 The problem justifies the objective
A preliminary investigation suggests that Pretoria’s historic urban landscape is neither properly defined nor yet receptive to a healthy symbiosis between historic conservation and sustainable economic development. The application of the Recommendation on the Urban Historic Landscape is relatively new in South African practice. Factors that can contribute to its successful implementation should, therefore, be identified and kept in mind when evaluating heritage assets, particularly in the early stages of developments.

Urban development and heritage conservation are increasingly regarded as unified processes. In South Africa – and specifically in Pretoria – tunnel vision and passionate resolve involving political issues often obstruct the implementation of a holistic heritage approach. The inclusionary tools and processes of the HUL Approach are intended to be implemented in pilot programmes to address and resolve these two-dimensional attitudes to heritage conservation (WHITR-AP 2015).

An understanding of the HUL Approach and an explanation of how the historic urban landscape of Pretoria can be defined, will contribute to closing the gap in relation to the current fragmented approaches to heritage conservation and the resulting conflicts that dominate relationships between heritage champions and developers.

The objective of this study is to make recommendations with respect to the identification and definition of the historic urban landscape of Pretoria. Such an achievement will encourage corporate and government property investors, owners of
heritage buildings and future generations with respect to the sustainable development of historic Pretoria.

The objective will be achieved by critically reflecting on the core concepts of the UNESCO Approach on the Historic Urban Landscape and on a critical understanding of foregoing the application thereof in selected precedents.

The aim of this study is to link contemporary urban development and the historic urban landscape with sustainability and integrity.

1.3 The research problem
The set of hypotheses listed below represents the categorised research questions that resulted in the definition of a hierarchy of research problems.

The research problem states that an understanding of the recently developed HUL Approach is the first step towards the identification of the historic urban landscape in a particular setting. This study is aimed at identifying the historic urban landscape of Pretoria.

- Main Supposition: An understanding of the prescripts of the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape will lead to an exact definition of the historic urban landscape of historic central Pretoria.
- Supposition 1: A reading of the intentions of the prescripts contained in the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape will lead to an exact understanding of historic urban fabric.
- Supposition 2: An investigation of case studies where the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape has been applied, will allow for a distillation of commonalities for application to the historic urban landscape of central Pretoria.
- Supposition 3: An understanding of the applications of the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape elsewhere, will lead to an exact definition of the historic urban landscape of historic central Pretoria.
- The Main Problem: How can historic central Pretoria be defined through an understanding of the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape?
Supplementary Problem 1: What is the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape and how is it to be understood?

Supplementary Problem 2: What may be deduced from case studies where the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape was applied elsewhere (internationally) with regard to application to historic central Pretoria?

Supplementary Problem 3: How might the interpretation of historic central Pretoria be defined through an understanding of the applications of the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape in a different place?

1.4 Delimitations

The HUL Approach, as published by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, is the primary source of interest in this study. The precedents selected for this research are endorsed by The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization as pilot projects where the HUL is being implemented (Van Oers and Haraguchi, 2013 p. 5; City of Ballarat 2018d, p. 2).

The limitation of the study is

I have established that the current data base for research and relevant precedents is limited due the fact that the Recommendation on the HUL was accepted by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization as recently as 2011. I have also realised that urban development projects unfold across several years and that the benefits and drawbacks of such developments only become apparent during the decades following the completion of such large-scale ventures. The information on the implementation of the HUL Approach in the chosen precedents is regarded as fragmented because the recent execution of the approach in the selected cities’ full development cycles have not yet been evaluated by peers in the heritage field. Therefore, interpretations come from the most complete sets of information available for the respective selected precedents.

It has been established that information on the geomorphological aspects of the investigated area of Pretoria had not yet been sufficiently evaluated for me to assess the relevant aspects thereof for consideration in the historic urban landscape of Pretoria.
The delimitation of the study area is historic Pretoria. With respect to forming a basic understanding of the complexities of historic Pretoria, the research on the history of the city was limited to the period that represents the known early human narrative up to the period marking the centenary celebrations of Pretoria in 1955.

The principle sources that informed the study on the history of Pretoria were:
- *Pretoria 1855-1955*, a publication released by the City Council of Pretoria to mark the centenary celebrations in 1955 and
- *Plekke en Geboue van Pretoria: Volumes 1, 2, 3 & 4*, a record of the built heritage of Pretoria, representing the history dating from its establishment to the latter part of the 20th century, compiled by Schalk le Roux and Nico Botes.

One of the key tools for the implementation of the HUL Approach is the civic engagement tool (UNESCO 2011b). The HUL Approach recommends that this tool be adapted to its local context in each application thereof. The researcher, therefore, deemed the civic engagement process – as perceived by the local communities – to be an adequate measure to complement the written history of Pretoria with contemporary history as and when the Historic Landscape Approach is implemented in the city.

1.5 Research methodology
The main research problem is defined by a question starting with *how*. The word *how* was interpreted in accordance with the explanation found in the Oxford Dictionary: *how* – as an interrogative adverb means – *in what way or manner?* (Oxford University Press 2018b). This study is based on an inquiry into the application of the HUL Approach.

Steven Taylor, Robert Bogdan and Marjory de Vault collaborated on a study of the application and growing popularity of qualitative research methodologies since the 1970s. The three editors have proven their expertise on research methodologies in their publication, *Introduction to Qualitative Research Methods: A Guidebook and Resource* (Copac, 2016). The researchers describe the qualitative
research methodology as a strategy that produces descriptive data (Taylor, Bogdan and DeVault 2016, p. 7).

Dr Janice Morse is the founding and scientific director of the International Institute for Qualitative Methods, and the author of 460 articles and 21 books on qualitative research practices (The University of Utah, 2017). In her article titled ‘Verification Strategies for Establishing Reliability and Validity in Qualitative Research’, Morse states that qualitative research is a process of checking, questioning and theorising (Morse et al. 2002, p. 19) to achieve rigor (continued disciplined action) during the process of research. Morse encourages qualitative researchers to apply unwavering standards concerning the evaluation of the goal of rigor throughout the study process, rather than at the end of the study. She cautions that the evaluation of a qualitative study at the conclusion thereof cannot guide and manage the research process while it is being executed (Morse et al. 2002, p. 20). Morse further expresses concern about the recent tendency amongst qualitative researchers to focus on research outcomes rather than on demonstrating how and which verification strategies were applied during the research process, and on how these strategies formulated and guided the research project (Morse et al. 2002, p. 17). While research strategies must be formulated to ensure that the research project is relevant and useful, such research strategies must also be actively applied during the research project. Morse summarises that appropriate research strategies for qualitative research will self-correct the study process when rigorously applied (Morse et al. 2002, p. 17).

In this study a qualitative research strategy is adopted for describing the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in a variety of contexts, and to reach a reliable and valid conclusion on how to define the historic urban landscape of Pretoria. The dissertation was generated through analyses based on texts and documents, interrogating respectively:

- the HUL Approach;
- the application of the HUL Approach in selected precedents,
  and
- the manner in which the HUL Approach can be defined in historic Pretoria.
The required rigor or disciplined action was applied throughout the enquiry and during the periods of theorising involved in this study. This methodology was adopted for each aspect of the research problem, in adherence with the required processes for qualitative research, so as to arrive at a reliable and valid outcome.

In response to the definitive processes of qualitative research, the researcher executed the checking process as adopted for the obtaining an understanding of:

- the content and context of the HUL Approach in the disciplines of heritage conservation and urban development;
- the application of the HUL Approach in selected precedents, and
- the content and context of the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria.

In response to the definitive processes of qualitative research, the questioning procedure was used for interrogating:

- the intent of the HUL Approach concerning the suggested role players, beneficiaries and what the HUL typically represents;
- the way in which the historic urban landscape was perceived and defined in the selected precedents, and
- the historic development of Pretoria – in order to distil a layered proposal in relation to the definition of the historic urban landscape of the capital city.

In response to the definitive processes of qualitative research, the theorising or reasoning method was used to establish:

- that the HUL Approach is a reliable and valid source of authority on conservation management;
- that the selected precedents represent an array of success- and process levels in the application of the HUL Approach, and that reliable and valid conclusions could be formulated to guide the researcher in the application of the HUL Approach in the local context, and that
- a proposal towards the definition of the historic urban landscape of Pretoria could be formulated based on the conclusions reached by studying the historic layers of Pretoria, the HUL Approach and related precedents.
1.6 Relevance
South Africa, as a member state of UNESCO (UNESCO 2018b) has an obligation to adopt the HUL Approach, which was accepted into UNESCOs regulatory framework during 2011 (UNESCO 2011a).

Pretoria, as the capital city of South Africa, has a rich cultural and natural history with both dignified and controversial layers in its yet undefined historic urban landscape. In accordance with global urbanisation trends, the capital city of South Africa is subjected to the relentless effects of urban sprawl which, in turn, is a symptom of uncontrolled growth.

With regard to recent developments in both the disciplines of urban design and conservation management, there is concurrence on the notion of the management of change – in direct response to the negative impact of urban sprawl. The result is that the city, its historic conservation and its future development are being viewed as a landscape consisting of multiple layers. The origins of the landscape approach in urban design and heritage management, together with its intricacies, are discussed in Chapter 2 of this document – as part of the Literature Survey – where these statements are referenced and discussed.

The precedents for the application of the HUL Approach, as here investigated, make it clear in each instance that the local authorities play a principal role in the implementation process, and that the definition of the HUL is the first phase of the application procedure.

It has been concluded, therefore, that this study will serve as a valid and useful instrument to understand how the historic urban landscape of Pretoria can be defined, as and when the local authorities of the City of Tshwane adopt the HUL Approach as part of the regulatory matrix for urban planning and conservation.

1.7 Outline of the study
This research study was executed in four primary phases, preceded by a preliminary phase.
Phase 1 comprises an analysis of the UNESCO Approach on Historic Urban Landscape. The origins, intentions and strategies of the HUL Approach are extracted and the
Phase 1 of this study is represented by the literature review in Chapter 2 and the study and presentation of the HUL Approach in Chapter 3. Phase 2 comprises research into suitable precedents, whereby the application of the HUL Approach are analysed. The precedents were selected to represent relevant and reliable sources, which contain factors that demonstrate what the HUL consists of and how it is being applied as a conservation approach elsewhere. Phase 2 concludes with the compilation of a matrix of key strategies adopted in the case studies. Chapter 4 represents phase 2 of this study.

Chapter 5 represents Phase 3, in which the layers of historical development in historic Pretoria are identified. In this section, all reasonably identifiable cultural and natural values and attributes, as set out in the description of the layered historical structure of a city in the HUL Approach, are considered (UNESCO 2011a):

- topography
- geomorphology
- hydrology
- natural features
- the built environment
- infrastructure above and below ground
- open spaces and gardens
- land use patterns
- spatial organisation
- perceptions and visual relationships
- economic processes
- intangible dimension of heritage as related to diversity and identity

The description of each layer formed in history, by the unique interplay of cultural and natural values, is intended to represent a relevant and useful instrument to manage heritage conservation in the rapidly changing urban environment of historic Pretoria.

Phase 4 represents the theorising process, which progresses from an understanding of the essence of the HUL Approach towards the formulation of a conclusion and the composition of a recommendation on what the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria consists of. Chapters 6, 7 and 8 represent Phase 4 of this study.
Chapter 6 contains the understanding derived from researching the basic concepts encompassing the HUL Approach. Levels of success achieved in the application of the HUL Approach in the selected precedents are reflected upon. The accomplishments and shortcomings demonstrated during the study of the precedents enabled the researcher to describe a holistic insight into the essential nature and potential of the HUL Approach. This insight enabled the researcher to apply the knowledge gained in the definition and future application of the HUL Approach in the study area of historic Pretoria.

Chapter 7 is a summary of the conclusions reached throughout the study. This information reinforces that:

- the HUL Approach is a reliable and useful tool, recognised in the global heritage community as represented by UNESCO;
- that historic Pretoria has relevant and rich layers of cultural and natural history, which can be successfully organised into a defined historic urban landscape, and
- the definition of the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria will in itself be a useful instrument to enable the implementation of the HUL Approach.

Chapter 8 encompasses the recommendations that flow from the study. The framework for the definition of the historic urban landscape in the study area is stated in this chapter. The researcher also extracted reliable and useful next steps and precautions for safeguarding the sustainability and success of the historic urban landscape of Pretoria, once it is defined. The holistic nature of the HUL Approach prompted the researcher on how important it is to include the subsequent stages and safety measures into the official regulatory framework for urban planning for historic Pretoria and greater Tshwane. The researcher concludes that doing so will guarantee the reliability and usefulness of the defined historic urban landscape of the study area.
Table of contents and project phases:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Research Phase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>1. Background and Structure Preparatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>1.1 Background Preparatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.2 The problem justifies the objective Preparatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.3 The research problem Preparatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.4 Delimitations Preparatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.5 Research methodology Preparatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1.6 Relevance Preparatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.7 Outline of the study Preparatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>2. Literature survey Preparatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>3. A Pertinent Review of the UNESCO Approach on the Historic Urban Landscape Phase 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>3.1 The History of the protection of heritage resource and the development of the historic urban landscape approach Phase 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>3.2 There is a call for an adjusted approach towards the definition, protection and management of heritage resources in contemporary urbanization and sustainable development Phase 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.3 The core considerations of the historic urban landscape approach Phase 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>3.4 The six-step implementation plan for the Historic Urban Landscape Approach Phase 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.5 Conclusion of the pertinent review of the UNESCO Approach on the Historic Urban Landscape Phase 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>4.1 Precedent 1: Ballarat, Australia Phase 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>4.2 Precedent 2: in the African context: East Africa’s Swahili Coast Phase 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>4.3 An objective overview of the application of the historic urban landscape approach in the selected precedents Phase 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>4.4 Key strategies identified from the selected precedents Phase 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>5. Steps Towards Defining the Study Area Phase 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>5.1 Understanding historic Pretoria Phase 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>5.2 Understanding the historic urban landscape of Pretoria Phase 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>6. Rationalisation Phase 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>7. Findings Phase 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>8. Recommendation Phase 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>9. Appendices Continuous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>10. Bibliography Continuous</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
nothing exists in isolation
all things emerge from the environment of their creation
hence all things reflect the mind of their creator
something of the thinking of the ideas and mind of their creator is embodied in
the artefact
if one can decode the artefact one can access the meaning conveyed therein
in finding meaning one can reanimate the past in the present
in making that meaning explicit the past enriches and makes more meaningful
the present (Fisher 2014)

extracted from the obituary prepared by Professor Roger Fischer

These cityscapes are depopulated, as maps are, and yet they oscillate with
life. Up close the lines reveal themselves to be woven of several strands, and
y they shimmer as if they were a photograph of moving lights along night-time
streets, or the pulse of electricity pumped along a grid. From a distance, the
paper tabs that seem to be pinning down the map seem to be a swarm of ants
(Gevisser 2018)

CHAPTER 2:
Literature Survey

Figure 5: Artwork from the series ‘Lessons in Looking Down’ by Gerhard Marx (Marx 2017)
2. Literature Survey

At the onset of this study it was deemed necessary to understand the sense and viability contained in the objectives of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. HUL is an integrated and layered approach, aligned with contemporary urban planning approaches, which are geared toward defence against the disadvantages of urban sprawl. Van Oers stated that urban sprawl, or the rapid and uncontrolled urban development of the recent fifty years, has resulted in undesired ‘externalities’, such as pollution, land consumption, pressures on housing and urban services, growing income gaps, social inequalities and crime ridden fragmented societies (Van Oers and Haraguchi 2013, p. 78). These factors threaten to cause fragmentation and deterioration in historic inner cities, which are often targeted for increased investment in real estate and telecommunications if urban sprawl is being restricted (Van Oers and Haraguchi 2013, p. 79).

Chad Emerson is an Associate Professor of Law at Faulkner University’s Jones School of Law, the administrator of the Smart Code and an acknowledged author of several publications on the Smart Code (Emerson 2007 p. ix). The Smart Code is associated with one of the latest urban design approaches, called transect zone planning, which focusses on integrated planning (Emerson 2007, p. xiv). In the urban design discipline, the effects of urban sprawl are viewed by Emerson to be equally detrimental to the urban fabric of historic areas as to the larger urban context. This statement is reinforced by the fact that historic urban areas often correspond with the oldest parts of cities, which were laid out before the advent of urban sprawl (Emerson 2007, p. 17).

According to Van Oers, the diversity of the common heritage in cities adds to the dynamics of urban heritage conservation and is characterized by concepts and approaches that constantly change and evolve. During 2005, The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization developed the Recommendation on the Conservation of Historic Urban Landscape to deliver a set of standards that address the difficulties faced in reconciling conservation and development in historic cities (UNESCO 2005a). Van Oers recalls that the historic city centre often forms a balanced ensemble of heritage assets because, historically, urban development was a gradual process and interventions were guided by tradition.
The challenge however, arises when policies and frameworks have to be delivered to both protect these assets and encourage economic development (Van Oers 2006, p. 3).

One such case in point – recorded on the World Heritage List in 2001 – was found in Vienna’s historic centre, which consists of low-rise apartment blocks that range between 4 and 6 storeys in height. During 2002, Vienna’s municipal authorities adopted planning guidelines that banned high-rise construction in the protected areas, landscape areas and spaces that include important visual axes. Two zones were excluded from the land parcels earmarked for this policy, however, and a developer requested the right to develop one of these parcels, the ‘Wien-Mitte’ site, to its full potential. As this proposal was in contravention of the status quo and planning regulations concerning Vienna’s World Heritage status, all the affected parties had to engage in negotiations to resolve the conflict of interest between legal development rights and town planning policy. The development nevertheless proceeded amidst great controversy, and by the time a resolution had been reached – a refinement of the policy with reference to an adjustment to the allowable height and bulk of future developments – the controversial building, at 87m in height, was being referred to as a bad example rather than a precedent to be followed.

This case is relevant with regard to the following:

- the potential threat against World Heritage status,
- financial loss because of the City’s breach of contract with the developer, and
- increased professional fees, based on the revisitation of design principles (Van Oers 2006, p. 4)

Similar unfortunate interventions can be ascribed to the ‘Bilbao effect’, as quoted by Van Oers in his article on UNESCO’s efforts to safeguard the Historic Urban Landscape. The ‘Bilbao effect’ often serves as a motivation for cities to include iconic architectural projects in their historical districts [Foster’s ‘Gherkin’ in Central London (2003) comes to mind]. The ‘Bilbao effect’ is derived from the attention and economic growth that the Guggenheim Museum generated in Bilbao’s degraded urban industrial landscape, which was devoid of any cultural-historic significance during the late 1990s. Unenlightened city authorities often do not understand that this was a once-off novelty and not a precedent, and that its context did not own
the delicate, easily lost and uniform historic character and integrity of a unique, well preserved historic urban landscape (Van Oers 2006, p. 5).

On the other hand, Van Oers reminds us that development in St Petersburg, Russia’s cultural-historical capital and a World Heritage asset since 1986, is successfully guided under a strict policy with reference to the type and form of permissible urban development. The 2015-2025 master plan contains a clear strategy for conservation, which serves to guide public policy making (Van Oers 2006, p. 6).

Van Oers acknowledged that new approaches to urban design recently emerged and emphasised their relevance to heritage conservation by quoting the work of Joan Busquets, who rejected the one-dimensional views of the city and accepted the multiplicity of forms and dimensions of the urban scene (Van Oers and Haraguchi 2013, p. 186). Joan Busquets is a recognised authority in the discipline of urban design. He is a Spanish architect and the Professor of Urbanism at the Barcelona School of Architecture (Bandarin and Van Oers 2012, p. 186).

Interdisciplinary planning approaches, like Landscape Urbanism and Ecological Urbanism, are known to defy the limits set by traditional planning methods via addressing urban development on a large territorial scale, regarding the city as part of a broader context. Concurring with Busquets’ sentiments regarding the multiplicity of the urban scene, these planning approaches include the larger urban context in the shape of the city’s natural features, its processes of depositing layers of significance and its resources. These interdisciplinary planning approaches hinge on the conservation and development of physical spaces, and planning is executed according to sustainability principles (Bandarin and Van Oers, 2012, pp. 186–187). Emerson motivates that the ‘Form Based Transect Zoning’ approach is considered to be the contemporary antidote to urban sprawl in the urban design discipline. This approach heralds traditional town planning techniques based on interconnected patterns. The Form Based Transect Zoning approach consists of a hierarchically layered system made up of appropriate form based zones where functions are correctly allocated in corresponding form zones (Emerson, 2007 p. 12).
Van Oers stated that the new integrated urban planning approaches hold the potential for heritage conservation and urban development to be regarded as a *unitary concept and practice*. The HUL Approach is aimed at the facilitation of both urban development and heritage conservation (Bandarin and Van Oers 2012, p. 188). Heritage conservation, by means of the HUL Approach, is focused on the urban scale in an integrated manner, as will be described in this study.

2.1. Understanding that the historic urban landscape approach considers both urban development and heritage conservation

Article 19 of the Vienna Memorandum (UNESCO 2005b, p. 4) motivates ‘a deep understanding of the history, culture and architecture of place, as opposed to object buildings only, is crucial to the development of a conservation framework and single architectural commissions should be informed by urbanism and its tools for analyses of typologies and morphologies’. Article 32 of the Vienna Memorandum (UNESCO 2005b, p. 6) hints at the latest addition to the UNESCO soft regulatory framework for the protection of Historic Urban Landscapes of 2011.

The HUL Approach is an integrated layered approach, which is aimed at facilitating sustainable development (UNESCO 2016). Traditionally, and up to recently, conservation approaches have been aimed towards the identification and protection of heritage areas or resources. Dennis Rodwell is an architectural planner who resides in Scotland. He has been assigned by The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization to use his knowledge and experience on best practice strategies with regard to the management of historic cities and the conservation of historic buildings on several projects (Rodwell 2007). Rodwell is of the opinion that the traditional conservation approaches inevitably isolate heritage areas from both the tangible and intangible urban contexts, which has been proven to be unsustainable (Rodwell 2007, pp. 12–14).

The HUL Approach was developed and accepted by UNESCO in response to the devastating effects of urban sprawl or rapid and uncontrolled urbanization as a ‘soft’ and voluntary regulatory framework. The results of urban sprawl are quoted in the HUL Approach to include:

- excessive building densities,
standardized and monotonous buildings,
- loss of public space and amenities,
- inadequate infrastructure,
- debilitating poverty,
- social isolation, and
- climate related disasters (UNESCO 2011b).

The Historic Urban Landscape Approach serves as a tool for integrating policies and practices of the built environment into the wider goals of urban development in respect of the inherited values and traditions of different cultural contexts (UNESCO 2011b).

It is, therefore, understood that the facilitation of sustainable development is a principle factor in the context of heritage conservation in the HUL Approach, which promotes the following strategies concerned with conservation of heritage resources within the context of urban development:

- improved integration and inclusion of urban heritage conservation strategies within the larger goals of overall sustainable development;
- the provision of support to public and private actions aimed at preserving and enhancing the quality of the human environment;
- the provision of a landscape approach for identification, conservation and management of historic areas within their broader urban contexts, and
- consideration of the interrelationships of physical forms, spatial organizations and connections, the natural features and settings and the social, cultural and economic values of historic areas (UNESCO 2011b).

UNESCO emphasises that the HUL Approach is hinged upon the principle of conservation and facilitates sustainable development. The following conditions are associated with sustainable development:

- The preservation of existing resources,
- The active protection of urban heritage and
- The sustainable management of existing resources and urban heritage (UNESCO 2011b).
2.2. Understanding the integrated nature of recent planning policies and its potential compatibility with the new direction of heritage conservation

Emerson explains why traditional urban planning is regarded as superior to the sprawl-inducing contemporary planning techniques that have emerged since the onset of the 1920s. Globally, traditional and successful urban planning had always been based on the use of interconnected patterns for street and block design. These planning strategies rendered urban settlements sustainable and walkable. Emerson reminds us that the notion of zoning was only introduced during the 1900s and he convincingly argues that the ‘zoning’ policy was responsible for the single-use districts and buildings that exist in isolation instead of in the context of their respective settings. It is, therefore, understood that:

- most historic cities had been planned or laid out prior to the advent of zoning policies;
- the attractiveness of historic cities are believed to originate from interconnected patterns and layers that correspond to sound and sustainable urban design principles;
- contemporary urban and town planning techniques are subject to planning policies, and
- contemporary urban and town planning techniques hinge on zoning policies, which are targeted at isolating the use and location of districts and buildings.

Based on Emerson’s discussion, it can be deduced that ‘urban sprawl’ is one of the inevitable results of planning policies that promote ‘disconnect’. The resulting effects include:

- undiscovered urban densities,
- standardized and monotonous buildings left void of life during the day or night,
- eroded public spaces and amenities,
- loss of adequate infrastructure,
- social isolation, and
- poverty (Emerson, 2007 p. 17).

Emerson’s study culminates in the motivation for the implementation of an urban design approach that aims to neutralise the effects and objectives of ‘zoning’ and thereby counteracts urban sprawl. This approach is being referred to as the ‘Form Based Transect Zoning’ approach and represents one of the new integrated planning approaches, cited by Van Oers (Bandarin and Van Oers 2012, p. 187). Similar to the
traditional urban planning approach, the Form Based Transect Zoning approach is based on interconnected patterns. Emerson demonstrates that cities that were planned in the traditional mould of interconnected patterns, have survived the 20th century as sustainable entities. These cities are cited as Alexandria, Virginia and Savannah, Georgia in the United States of America (Emerson 2007, p. 17).

As summarised by Van Oers: by the conclusion of the first decade at the helm of the 21st century, urban planners and architects had partially adequate resources for the effective management of historic cities in the context of changing global economic and cultural trends. A shift from the notion of ‘conservation’ towards the ‘management of change’ had been observed in discussions on heritage management. Urban conservation is viewed as an environmentally friendly sustainable process that acknowledges the value of the inherited urban fabric as part of sustainable urban management (Bandarin and van Oers, 2012, pp. 192–193).

Van Oers was confident that investors prefer proper guidance around the general direction of urban development, contrary to the popular belief that an open-ended development climate would be more attractive to developers and economists. This belief is deemed to be the case because responsible investors view proper planning measures as safeguards to their long-term financial commitments. Van Oers viewed tourism as an unpredictable economic factor in historic cities. He explained that direct investment by government and the private sector yields more consistent benefits than tourism (Bandarin and van Oers 2012, pp. 99–105).

The World Heritage Committee found that it is not development as such but the type of development – in relation to the area of importance and construction’s form and volume – that may generate problems (UNESCO 2005b, pp. 4–5).
Figure 6: The historic city of Savannah, Georgia, is depicted as part of a city which was planned in the traditional mould of interconnected patterns, and has survived the 20th Century (City of Savannah, Georgia 2015)
2.3. Understanding the relationship between the objectives set for the Historic Urban Landscape Approach versus the objectives of the latest planning policies against urban sprawl

In the wake of the devastation of urban sprawl, the Historic Urban Landscape Approach is distinctly aimed at facilitating sustainable development in the context of heritage conservation. Form Based Transect Zoning is a new approach in the urban design discipline and was generated in reaction to urban sprawl.

The objectives and desired outcomes for both the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach and the Form Based Transect Zoning approach, are compatible. This deduction demonstrates global notions that planning and heritage conservation approaches have recently merged into integrated systems that complement each other.

Figure 7: A worksheet prepared by the author to understand the objectives set in the Historic Urban Landscape Approach against the objectives set in the alternative zoning policies in the urban design discipline, as explained by Emerson (the Author)
2.4 The problem in its context

Rodwell (2007, p. 10), maintains that we need to pay heed to the isolating effects of the monument approach – in matters concerning the management of local heritage conservation – and avoid ‘pulling the wool over our eyes’ (Collins English Dictionary 2018).

Professor Lynn Meskell and Collette Scheermeyer published an article called ‘Heritage as therapy: Set pieces from the New South Africa’ to address the state of post-conflict heritage as an arena for trauma embracing therapy. Meskell, Professor of Anthropology at Stanford University, focused her research on the constructs of natural and cultural heritage as related to empowerment with regard to the Kruger National Park in South Africa. Scheermeyer is an assistant archaeologist in the service of the South African Heritage Resources Agency (Meskell and Scheermeyer 2008, p. 174). The authors hold that the cultural historic landscape of South Africa had been dominated by the extreme politics of racism and the counter reactions thereto for more than a century. Colonial and apartheid heritage legislation demonstrated this injustice by excluding the heritage of Non-White communities (Meskell and Scheermeyer 2008, p. 157).

Today, South Africa revels in democracy and equal opportunities for all, in line with its Constitution (South Africa, South Africa and Department of Justice and Constitutional Development 2015). There is evidently a lack of discernment when it comes to the management and protection of the country’s heritage resources and the historic urban landscape, however.

Rita Barnard is a Professor of English and Comparative Literature at the University of Pennsylvania and Extraordinary Professor at the University of Stellenbosch, South Africa (Barnard 2015, p. 161). Barnard was critically inspired by a tourist marketing document from 1996, which depicted a dozen images of a congenial Nelson Mandela sporting various costumes that represented recommended tourist sites in Pretoria. Barnard conceded that this attempt at an introduction to the city’s historic genres was inadequate and represented a naïve take on the complexities and confusions associated with post-apartheid Pretoria. The publication promoted Pretoria as a window on Africa, with colourful contrasts offering a city where jazz shares the stage with opera and ballet and nature trails and game parks exist abreast bustling city life. Ultimately, according to Barnard,
these images offered no real insight into Pretoria's cultural historic reality (Barnard 2012, p. 163). Barnard goes further to equate the dozen-a-day Mandela depictions to ‘new South African kitsch’, alluding to shallowness, a two-dimensional vision and the profession of ‘myth’ (Barnard 2012 p. 163).

“We, the people of South Africa,
Recognise the injustices of our past;
Honour those who suffered for justice
And freedom in our land;
Respect those who have worked to build
And develop our country; and
Believe that South Africa belongs to all
Who live in it, united in our diversity.
We therefore, through our freely elected representatives, adopt this Constitution as the supreme law of the Republic so as to Heal the divisions of the past and establish a society based on democratic values, social justice and fundamental human rights;
Lay the foundations for a democratic and open society in which government is based on the will of the people and every citizen is equally protected by law;
Improve the quality of life of all citizens and free the potential of each person; and
Build a united and democratic South Africa able to take its rightful place as a sovereign state in the family of nations…..’
(South Africa, South Africa and Department of Justice and Constitutional Development 2015)

Figure 8: A 1996 advertisement for Pretoria, depicting twelve images of Nelson Mandela in different costumes, which respectively represent tourist attractions in the city (Barnard 2015, p. 162)
The historic centre of Pretoria bears the scars and deprivations that resulted from policies dating as far back as the colonial and apartheid eras. During the mid-20th century forced removals of cultural groups of colour, from the centre of Pretoria to the edges of the city perimeter, resulted in social isolation, poverty and a prevailing sense of struggle for the removed cultural groups. New townships lacked infrastructure and character and were intentionally void of nurturing public spaces and amenities. While the city was bleeding dry at its edges, the central core flourished under the rule of the privileged cultural groups, as was evident from the economic investment in buildings, public amenities and social and technical infrastructure.

Elri Liebenberg prepared a cartographical history of Pretoria as an employee of the Department of Geography at the University of Pretoria, South Africa (Liebenberg 2015, p. 8). In this cartographic study of Pretoria’s history, Liebenberg identified a tendency, during the mid-20th century, to omit the record of Black settlements from maps of the city. This notion aligns with the build-up to the Apartheid regime, which officially dominated the political landscape from 1948 until 1994.
Meskell and Scheermeyer, who collaborated on ‘Heritage as therapy: Set pieces in the New South Africa’, recognise that cultural heritage is being *called upon to reconcile the nation*. They come to the unfortunate conclusion that *heritage* pageantry,
based on reconciliation, justice and restitution, is practiced more often than heritage conservation (Meskell and Scheermeyer 2008, pp. 153–158). The opening ceremonies of major heritage sites are called to mind as examples: the Old Fort Museum, Constitution Hill, Walter Sisulu Square of Dedication, and Freedom Park, where pomp and ceremony was observed to overshadow the sentiments and priorities of a multi-ethnic constituency. In 2007, the impoverished community of Kliptown bitterly protested against the heritage plans and related political attitudes of the African National Congress around the new Walter Sisulu Square of Dedication. The ANC failed to recognise the history of Kliptown as that of a coloured, rather than a black community, and continued to fail at providing government services. Freedom Park is viewed as a theatre of spectacle on the theme of the African struggle and, ultimately, on the newly forged political vision by the ruling African National Congress (Meskell and Scheermeyer 2008, p. 161). Vague references towards a non-racial, non-sexist and democratic society are reflected in the motto: ‘Interpreting the past, informing the present, imagining the future.’

Protests relating to our colonial and Afrikaner roots emerged in the form of attacks on landmark monuments in Pretoria and Cape Town.

News 24 reported that the University of Cape Town Senate has voted overwhelmingly in favour of the recommendation that a statue of Cecil John Rhodes be moved from its seat of prominence at the bottom of the Jameson steps on the university campus on 27 March 2015 (Hess 2015a). The upper campus of the University of Cape Town is built on land that was left to the nation by Cecil John Rhodes (1853-1902) upon his death, and the statue had been in position since circa 1930.

On 31 March 2015, News24 quoted the mayor of Tshwane, Kgosientso Ramokgopa, who stated that the statue of Paul Kruger, situated in the heart of the historic city centre, is destined for removal from Church Square (Van Zyl 2015). Citizens were interviewed to obtain their opinions whether the statue must go or stay, and conflicting reports were recorded (Ngcobo 2015).

Potential for embracing the opportunities locked into our multi-faceted communities and histories are lost when heritage
authorities adopt tunnel vision when evaluating applications for heritage conservation.

This was demonstrated when the South African Heritage Resources Agency delivered its final comments on the beautification of Church Square that is currently being implemented in Paul Kruger Street – in conjunction with the Bus Rapid Transit System – in terms of section 38 of the Heritage Act: the historical kerbs should be retained or replaced and the existing slate paving may be consolidated in important areas (Küsel 2013, pp. 70–71). No mention is made of the cultural context and sustainable protection thereof at the very heart and core of historic Pretoria.

Concluding their study, Meskell and Scheermeyer states that the time is ripe for the Government of South Africa to offer more tangible benefits for the community’s commitment to Heritage Conservation. The promotion of state pageantry with isolated heritage monuments and random name changes of streets, towns and airports are viewed as politically motivated (Meskell and Scheermeyer 2008, p. 170).

It is clear that the sentiments of the community are not considered nor valued in heritage planning and the celebration of a communal heritage for South Africa is yet to be achieved.
An understanding of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach will be applied in this study to explain how the historic urban landscape of Pretoria can be defined. This study will fill the gap in the prevailing fragmented approach towards Heritage Conservation in South Africa. It will also serve as a convincing tool in order that the local authorities may include the HUL Approach in their regulatory frameworks.

2.5 Summary

- Both the urban design and heritage conservation disciplines maintain that uncontrolled urban development or urban sprawl is eroding the structure that comprises heritage assets and areas.
- Planning- and heritage conservation approaches have recently merged into integrated systems, which complement each other, and have proven to be advantageous for sustainable development.
- Policies that strive for inter-connectedness, instead of isolated approaches, are suitable to neutralise urban sprawl and facilitate sustainable urban development.
- Contrary to the popular belief that an open-ended expansion climate would be more attractive to developers and economists, investors prefer proper guidance regarding the general direction of urban development.
- The HUL Approach is an integrated heritage conservation policy that strives towards enabling sustainable development.
- In the South African context, the historic centre of Pretoria bears the scars of planning policies that isolated indigenous cultural groups to the periphery of the city, and planning policies that still conform to zoning principles based on usage, with isolating results.
- Even though the South African political landscape has been transformed to an example of democratic political evolution during the past 3 decades, emerging evidence indicates that the voices of all the communities are still not heard and that there is a distinct need for a shared heritage.
- The HUL Approach is a tool for managing change.
- Defining the Historic Urban Landscape was the first step towards the implementation of a ‘soft law’, as accepted by UNESCO in 2011.
- The definition of Pretoria’s historic urban landscape will be a valuable and useful step towards the management of change in the urban and cultural environment.
nothing exists in isolation
all things emerge from the environment of their creation
hence all things reflect the mind of their creator
something of the thinking of the ideas and mind of their creator is embodied in the artefact
if one can decode the artefact one can access the meaning conveyed therein
in finding meaning one can reanimate the past in the present
in making that meaning explicit the past enriches and makes more meaningful the present (Fisher 2014)

extracted from the obituary prepared by Professor Roger Fischer

….not surprisingly, Marx is deeply interested in the tradition of flânerie, of wilfully losing one’s way in a city...while not finding one’s way in a city is something that anyone can do, to actually lose one’s way in a city, as one loses one’s way in a forest, requires some schooling. (Gevisser 2018)

CHAPTER 3: A Pertinent Review of the UNESCO Approach on the Historic Urban Landscape
3. A Pertinent Review of the UNESCO Approach on the Historic Urban Landscape

Supplementary Problem 1. What is the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape and how is it to be understood?

Supposition 1: A reading of the intentions of the prescripts contained in the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape leads to a particular understanding of historic urban fabric.

3.1 The history of the protection of heritage resources and the development of the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL) Approach

Van Oers eloquently defined *city* in the following manner: *social dwelling environments are dynamic and consist of organic, growing fibres;…… these environments are subject to constant change, abreast with the development of the resident societies;…… the densification of social environments, containing places of power, culture, technology and conflict, represents a significant and sophisticated human creation, named the ‘City’. (Bandarin and van Oers 2012, pp. vii–xii)

In this study a city is viewed as a collection of strata, consisting of sharp edges and deep crevices that conceal and reveal glimpses of the layers of history alongside contemporary development and imagined planning for the future. In the context of heritage conservation it is here acknowledged that indiscriminate planning and the consequent execution of urban development currently threaten the ancient and subtle dance between past, present and future. If not managed, the memory may be permanently erased from the soul of humanity. In this context, the researcher equates the Historic Urban Landscape to a dance – of the passage of time – through history and the future.
Indiscriminate development destroyed the historic urban fabric of the city, which was declared a World Heritage site in 1995.

The Historic Urban Landscape has been formally defined as: the urban area understood as the result of a historic layering of cultural and natural values and attributes, extending beyond the notion of historic centre or ensemble to include the broader urban context and its geographical setting (UNESCO 2011a, p. 2). Referencing the sources consulted and reported on in Chapter 2 of this document, it is understood that contemporary urban conservation is aimed at the preservation of the Historic Urban Landscape, which comprises the city as a library of the past, present and future – where the referencing system consists of policies and planning practices.

It has been found that the development of an awareness of history, starting with the awareness and appreciation of heritage resources and progressing towards their protection and the management thereof, can be traced back over a period of five centuries (Rodwell 2007, pp. 3–6).

The identification and conservation of heritage resources were initially administered by means of a simplistic approach: the protection of historic structures. Such structures or monuments were protected because of their historical and architectural interest. The Ducal Palace of Urbino in Italy, circa 1470-75, is an example (Rodwell 2007 p. 1).
Structured gestures towards conservation developed during the Italian Renaissance period. Classical antiquity inspired pride and a connection to the past, forming a basis for cultural identification and the continued integration thereof in artistic and architectural developments (Rodwell 2007, pp. 1–3). The eighteenth century heralded methods for assessment of authentication and record keeping by those allied to conservation societies. Romanticised paintings and engravings of ruins-in-landscape-compositions inspired the establishment of the Picturesque Movement during the same period. The visible results of this movement were the
landscaped parks, the protection and restoration of antique ruins and the construction of replicated or false ruins to complement these romantic landscapes. Contemporary notions of systems of protection and custodianship, as represented in the Word Heritage Convention, originated from this tentative approach towards the recognition of the need for the conservation of heritage resources in the eighteenth century (Rodwell 2007, pp. 1–3).

Figure 17: The Picturesque Movement in England is represented by an image of Fountains Abbey, with its ruined twelfth-century Cistercian monastery, set in eighteenth century landscaped parkland (Rodwell 2007, p. 3).
An awareness of nationalism, cultural diversity and pluralism emerged during the nineteenth century and culminated in the preservation of historic buildings and works of art, thereby acknowledging and fostering national, regional and local identity. This new awareness thrived under the auspices of education, inspiration and nostalgia throughout the decades, up to and beyond the Modern Movement. A curatorial approach toward conservation, which is still widely recognised and applied in conservation by academics, archaeologists and specialist professionals today, was eventually established. This curatorial approach is reflected in protective legislation, which is dependent upon continued interest in the conservation of architecture and art (Rodwell 2007, pp. 1–3).

The following pivotal historical points, from the eighteenth to the twentieth centuries, are identified as forces that affected the approach towards historic urban conservation:

3.1.1 The French Revolution
After the destruction of buildings, fuelled by the French Revolution, the remnants of artefacts that once belonged to the king, the aristocracy and the church were collectively acknowledged by the people to be representative of said individuals and their contributions towards the establishment of the French nation. The population collectively carried the responsibility of protecting these resources, setting the tone for the worldwide contemporary notion of state intervention regarding architectural conservation (Rodwell 2007, p. 4).

3.1.2 Nineteenth Century stylistic restoration period
Restoration conducted in England under Sir George Gilbert Scott (1811-78) and in France under Eugene Emmanuel Viollet-le-Duc (1814-79), was observed as speculative and referred to as stylistic in both countries. Eugene Emmanuel Viollet-le-Duc shockingly stated: ‘to restore a building is not to preserve it, to repair it or to rebuild it. It is to reinstate it to a condition of completeness which may never have existed at any given point in time.” The preservation of historical layers in architectural works was either opposed or ignored.
Viollet-le-Duc’s unconvincing approach resulted in a forceful anti-restoration movement, which culminated in the establishment of the Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings (SPAB) and the SPAB Manifesto of 1877. The SPAB Manifesto is often referred to as the basis for architectural conservation (Rodwell 2007, p. 4).

3.1.3 Second World War and its effect on Europe

War destroys not only life, social communities and generations but also demolishes cities and irreplaceable sections of the historic urban fabric. Such was the case with several European cities, which displayed gaping wounds where gracious cathedrals once bore pre-war testimony to craft and precious intuitive design approaches from the past. Recovery was sought through the implementation of initiatives for major re-ordering, reconstruction and redevelopment initiatives. These interventions were based on the theories of the Modern Movement and in-turn affected and threatened further destruction of the fragile remnants of the historic urban fabric. During the 1950’s, forces that countered the measured and forceful pace combined to save individual historic buildings and entire cities from the stark concrete Modernistic uniformity in which the Brave New World was clothed ((Google Books 2018a; Rodwell 2007, p. 5). A success story unfolded during the early 1970s with the ‘Save Bath’ campaign, when a traffic study by Colin Buchanan and Partners (1965) would have resulted in the demolition and reconstruction of historic buildings in Royal Crescent, Bath, in favour of a new cut-and-cover road and a new motorway. The residents of Bath formed the Bath Preservation Trust and protested this destructive project. Not only
did they terminate the implementation thereof but also lobbied for the total restoration and re-commissioning of the structure, which was successfully executed (Rodwell 2007, p. 5)

Figure 18: The book cover of *Brave New World* (1932), by Aldous Huxley (Google Books 2018a).

*Brave New World* (1932) is a dystopian novel written by Aldous Huxley featuring large scientific developments.

Figure 19: The book cover of *Brave New World Revisited* (1958), by Aldous Huxley (Google Books 2018b). *Brave New World Revisited* by Aldous Huxley (1958), follow-up to *Brave New World* (1932), in which phenomena such as overpopulation are considered.
3.1.4 The European Architectural Heritage Year of 1975
The Council of Europe initiated the European Architectural Heritage Year, which was a campaign against the destruction associated with repair initiatives, and was described in ‘Second World War and its effect on Europe’. One of the successful projects associated with The European Architectural Heritage Year of 1975, was the pedestrianisation of the Grand-Place in Brussels, Belgium, during 1971 (Rodwell 2007, pp. 5–6).

Figure 20: The Royal Crescent (1767-1775), restored under the auspices of the Bath Preservation Trust during the 1970s (Royal Crescent Bath, 2011).

Figure 21: Grand Place, Brussels, is the central square of the city. It is a pedestrianised UNESCO World Heritage Site (UNESCO 1992).
3.1.4 The Heritage Conservation Charters

After undertaking an investigation into the charters on historical and contemporary conservation, it was found that these works – though often philosophical – all strive towards the recognisable verbalisation of an ethical methodology towards conservation and the reconciliation of interests uniquely related to their connected time and place.

Scholarly research established that approaches towards urban conservation consist of a hierarchical set of primary and secondary bases (Rodwell 2007, p. ix):

- Primarily, the conservation of the architectural fabric, founded in archaeology and the historic development of architectural styles, and
- Secondarily, the conservation of the urban fabric, with a morphological and aesthetic approach towards the management of change in historic cities.

The charters discussed below illustrate the progression of changes in approach, which in turn are relevant to their respective contexts (Rodwell, 2007 pp. 10–11):

a. The SPAB Manifesto of 1877 strove to counter the renovation of historic sites so they could be 'stylistically correct', an approach prevalent in this period. The endeavour was based upon two principles: the first was to allow only minimal intervention in order to prevent decay; the second was motivated by the preservation of those old structures and/or ensembles that were no longer suitable for use and the removal of all conflicting functions so as to ensure their preservation (Rodwell 2007, p. 12)
b. In 1931, the Athens Charter was the first international document that presented scientific principles for the preservation of historic structures and/or ensembles under strict custodial protection. The approach encouraged construction methods with materials associated with the Modern Movement, continued use of historical structures, respect for how the areas surrounding monuments were treated, and pedestrianisation. It likewise emphasised the need for international co-operation. The approach opposed the replication of historic styles for new buildings in historic areas (Rodwell, 2007, p. 12).

c. In 1964, the Venice Charter formed the basis of the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). As a revision of the 1931 Athens Charter, it supported the protection of historic monuments, distinguishable and contemporary interventions, the definition of authenticity – based upon material and documentary evidence – and included urban and rural settings to the definition of historic monuments (Rodwell 2007, p. 12).
In 1975 the European Charter of the Architectural Heritage supported development integrated with social and functional diversity within historic areas. It discouraged yields in favour of the demands set by increased motor vehicle traffic and land and property speculation. Modern architecture in historic areas was considered acceptable where it responded to the existing context, proportions, forms, scales and materials. This charter acknowledged the importance of the process of preservation of heritage as part of people’s lives, and the weight it should carry within the framework of general planning policies. Urban and rural areas were included in the concept of historic monuments, not only the settings thereof as defined in the Venice Charter (Rodwell 2007, pp. 12–13).

d. **In 1987 the Washington Charter** focused on urban conservation, integrated with socio-economic development and urban and regional planning policies. The role of residents was elevated as primary stakeholders, with improved housing being a primary objective in this conservation approach. The charter compliments the ICOMOS charter, which represented the preservation of the urban grain and layout; balanced relationships between buildings and green and open spaces; relationships between historic areas or towns and the surrounding man-made and natural settings, and the diversity of functions, layered over...
both time and the exterior/interior appearance of buildings (Rodwell 2007, pp. 13–14)

![Figure 24: An image of an ancient town on the Front cover of the Washington Charter, 1987 (Sunney 2016).](image)

**The 1999 Burra Charter** was first published in 1979 and was refined over the next 20 years. This charter accepts both approaches, scientific as well as curatorial. The differentiation between old and new fabric was acknowledged, alterations were permitted if deemed temporary and reversible and continuation of historical uses was encouraged (Rodwell 2007, p. 14).

![Figure 25: Front cover of the Burra Charter, 1999 (Slide Share 2018).](image)

The above processes evolved from monumentalising specific structures to the preservation of certain areas and the protection of the zones associated with those areas.
The Burra Charter is considered to have facilitated progressive movement in urban conservation, in response to global pressure, to preserve the quality of historic city centres and facilitate global tourism. The development of conservation processes that support decision-making powers are being migrated from national to local governments and from local governments to public role players in sectors like tourism, real estate development and business. An increasing disparity has developed between urban conservators and developers of land and property, especially in emerging societies, which adds to the isolation of conservation from the management of urban processes (Bandarin and van Oers 2012, p. xiii).

UNESCO reports that traditional functions have departed from existing historic urban areas in Europe, Asia, Latin America, and the Islamic World in the wake of transformation processes. Consequently, the integrity and inherent historic, social and artistic values are at risk of being destroyed (Bandarin and Van Oers 2012, p. xiii).

In October 2005, a resolution was adopted by UNESCOs General Assembly of States Parties to the World Heritage Convention. The decree is a new international, standard-setting instrument to recognise and guide investment in and development of historic cities, concurrently honouring the
Inherited values that are integral to the related spatial and social structures (UNESCO 2005a p. 141).

In response to the 2005 UNESCO resolution, a large contingent of international experts collaborated to establish a new proposal as a non-binding ‘soft law’. This recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape was adopted by the UNESCO General Conference in November 2011 (UNESCO 2011a).

### Contrasts Between Traditional Conservation and Historic Urban Landscape Approaches

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Traditional Conservation Approaches</th>
<th>Historic Urban Landscape Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conservation policies and preservation of heritage artefacts</td>
<td>Conservation integrated with landscape level awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Material preservation</td>
<td>Intersection of the tangible and intangible aspects of cities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert/Elite led</td>
<td>Community based and engaged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narrow and singular representation</td>
<td>Multiplicity of representation and experiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Static</td>
<td>Linking the past, present and future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apolitical</td>
<td>Contested</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Place based</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(Edmonton Heritage, 2018)*
3.2 There is a call for an adjusted approach towards the definition, protection and management of heritage resources in contemporary urbanization and sustainable development

Urbanization refers to the progression of a rural settlement towards an urban settlement. It further refers to how societies adapt to changes concurrent with development. Around the turn of the 19th century, residential and industrial areas were located in close proximity to each other. As by-products from industry are often toxic to humans, this resulted in disease and illness amongst the citizens. High density living, primitive sewerage systems and debris left in the wake of animal-driven transport, worsened living conditions in the historical centres of cities (Emerson 2007, pp. 5–6). City authorities regulated uses and densities with increased severity to address this problem, whilst development went on a roller-coaster ride across the decades towards the 21st century.

Urban sprawl developed from rapid urbanization ... a blight that drained the historic urban fabric of life and character. The main street and the opportunity to reside above or behind one’s place of work, was rendered illegal under the segregating consequences of zoning rights. Since the turn of the 19th century, several approaches dictated the form into which global urbanization crystalized. The Modern and Postmodern Movements represented the forces behind the stark, man-made face of urbanization from the early 20th century onwards. In South Africa the Apartheid ideology dominated all dynamic processes and cities were seen to present ‘spatial dislocation and racial polarization’ (Jones 2000, p. 25). In his report on the relationship between transition and urbanization, Golubchikov (2016, p. 608) stated that instead of the urban form being a result of societal changes, the ‘urban’ often presents a scale at which new ideologies, interpretations and social interactions are justified or formalized by policy. He continued to say that dynamic transition presented tangible and intangible relationships that are at work on three identifiable levels: the ideological, practical and urban levels. Golubchikov found that the local ideological changes comprised the political shift from the apartheid and struggle eras to the era of freedom and
constitutionality after 1994. On the global scale, The New Urban Agenda (NUA) was adopted by the United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) on 20 October 2016. This approach regards cities as resources towards finding solutions to problems rather than the sources of problems (HABITAT III 2017, p. iv). The NUA professes that well-planned and well-managed urbanization can be a powerful tool for sustainable development in both developing and developed countries (HABITAT III 2017, p. iv).

Emerson explains the tactile form of thriving cities thus: "they are immune to urban sprawl and have the same common characteristics, namely compact, walkable, connected and complete" (Emerson 2007, p. xiii).

![Figure 28: A diagrammatic presentation of the New Urban Agenda, indicating the visionary connections between aspects of sustainable urban development (Consortium for Sustainable Urbanization 2016).](image-url)
3.3 The core considerations of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach

According to UNESCO (2018a) the promulgated objectives of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach are:

- the management of change
- the improvement of living conditions for local populations
- the creation of a virtuous cycle in urban conservation

Van Oers posits that the state of the contemporary city is increasingly subject to social and spatial policies. He argues that the historic city has potential to intelligently inform contemporary urban development by the expression of history, being a place of memory and by providing an example of good spatial quality. Van Oers views the modern concept of the historic city as an evolved entity because of:

- the layered and kinetic nature of historic cities,
- the changing nature of historic cities,
- the failing concept of public funding for conservation projects, which he motivated should be replaced with innovative resource generating models to support heritage conservation, and
- the importance of the relationship between public interest and the economy in urban conservation and urban planning.

Van Oers concluded his motivating comments on the role of the HUL Approach with the notion that, rather than providing resolute answers to the intricacies of heritage conservation in the context of urban planning, the Historic Urban Landscape Approach represents a flexible and evolving tool, positioned to support new practices and updated tools to preserve values within sustainable processes (Bandarin and van Oers 2012, pp. 188–191).

A study into the published core considerations of the HUL Approach resulted in an understanding of the following essential goals set by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation General Conference on 10 November 2011 (UNESCO 2011a):

a. To define the Historic Urban Landscape

The Historic Urban Landscape cannot be defined as a physical entity. It comprises several layers of the urban context, similar to the five senses of the human body: sight, smell, sound, taste and touch. Where historic layering of cultural and natural values and
attributes can be defined, the Historic Urban Landscape exists as a complete and interactive combination of urban ‘senses’ (UNESCO 2011a, p. 2). Unlike the five senses of the human body, the Historic Urban Landscape may consist of many more elements or layers, dependent on its context in place and time (UNESCO 2011a, p. 2):

- site topography
- geomorphology
- hydrology and natural features
- historic and contemporary built environment
- infrastructure
- open spaces and gardens
- land use patterns
- spatial organizations
- perceptions, visual relationships, social and cultural practices and values
- economic processes
- diversity and identity

The definition, as set out in the official publication by the World Heritage Centre on 10 November 2011, provides a starting point for historic conservation within a multi-layered, sustainable development framework to preserve the quality of the human environment. It presents a toolset for the integration and management of interventions and transformations in the urban context (UNESCO 2011a, p. 2).
b. To address the challenges and opportunities for the Historic Urban Landscape

Urban areas often sacrifice functionality, traditional roles and the needs of the populace to the physical influences of urbanization and globalization. Enhanced access to innovations can improve urban areas. Failure to include such innovations results in unsustainable and unviable cities. The indiscriminate application of contemporary innovations results in the destruction of heritage assets. Both cultural and natural heritage aspects must be integrated into ventures to preserve environmental resources (UNESCO 2011a p. 2).
c. **The development of existing and new policies**

Urban areas are currently protected by conservation policies. In the context of the Historic Urban Landscape, it is required that policies be written or adapted to facilitate a multi-layered context for conservation. Conservation and sustainability must be the backdrop against which policies are developed and applied, with the contemporary being interspersed between the historic fibres of the city.

Specific responsibilities are assigned to various agencies of the tiered stakeholder matrix, which includes member states, public and private stakeholders, international organizations, and national and international non-governmental organizations (UNESCO 2011a, p. 3).

d. **Defining the tools to achieve the goals**

Within the context of new development, a variety of tools have been identified to enhance the adoption of the HUL Approach. Such tools may include, but are not limited to the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Symbol</th>
<th>Tool</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="symbol" alt="Community Engagement" /></td>
<td>Community Engagement</td>
<td>Identify key values in local urban areas; develop visions; set goals; agree on actions to protect heritage; promote sustainable development; conduct intercultural dialogue on histories; and traditions, values, needs and aspirations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="symbol" alt="Knowledge and Planning" /></td>
<td>Knowledge and Planning</td>
<td>Map cultural and natural features; compile heritage; social and environmental impact assessments; support sustainability and continuity in planning and design.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="symbol" alt="Regulatory Systems" /></td>
<td>Regulatory Systems</td>
<td>Manage tangible and intangible components by means of special ordinances, acts, decrees, and traditional and customary systems.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="symbol" alt="Finance" /></td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Allocate government and global funds; promote private investment at local level; promote and develop flexible financing mechanisms in support of local enterprise; promote public-private partnerships.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The unique attributes of the HUL tools are their adaptability to respective local contexts and that they may comprise several unlimited existing or new tools. The HUL tools are dynamic because they are constantly updated and adjusted in synchronization with the evolution of the city (League of Historical Cities 2016, p. 15)

e. To strive for capacity building, research, information, and communication
   i. Communities, decision makers, professionals, and managers are deemed to be the main stakeholders in urban development schemes. These entities must be seen to engage in active collaboration towards building a capacity for implementation of the HUL Approach from its very base, individual ownership.
   ii. Academic research must be seen to be developed to arrive at an understanding of the historic layering of the urban fabric across all its tangible and intangible facets. Institutions that foster academic research must collaborate with local, national, regional, and international levels to inform and empower decision makers.
   iii. Information and communication technology should be used to reach the under-represented sectors of society and empower them with knowledge, capacity and skill to understand urban areas. (Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape n.d., p. 4)

f. To facilitate international cooperation
   UNESCOs member states, as well as official and unofficial groups, should collaborate on information development and the sharing of outcomes that enable the growth of the communal body of knowledge and experience of the HUL Approach. Ventures and methodologies that may assist must be applied across international borders, from the local authority level upwards, to support and empower the dynamic conservation of urban areas (UNESCO 2011a, p. 4)

3.4 The six-step implementation plan for the Historic Urban Landscape Approach
   The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation promotes the following steps, which are regarded as critical for the implementation of the HUL Approach and to clearly navigate the often complex environment of heritage management and urban development (UNESCO 2018a):
**Step 1:** Undertake comprehensive surveys and map the city’s natural, cultural and community resources;

**Step 2:** Strive for a reasonable degree of consensus, through the use of participatory planning and stakeholder consultations, regarding what cultural heritage values to protect for the inspiration and enjoyment of present generations as well as the transmission to future ones – then determine the attributes that carry these values;

**Step 3:** Assess the vulnerability of these valued attributes to socio-economic pressures and the impact of climate change;

**Step 4:** Integrate the agreed upon urban heritage values and their vulnerability status into a wider framework of city development, which shall provide indications of areas of heritage sensitivity that require careful attention to planning, design and implementation of development projects;

**Step 5:** Prioritize policies and actions for conservation and development;

**Step 6:** Establish the appropriate partnerships and local management frameworks for each of the identified conservation and development projects and cultivate mechanisms for the coordination of the various activities between the different actors – public, private and civic.
3.5. **Conclusion of the pertinent review of the UNESCO Approach on the Historic Urban Landscape**

The study of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach prompted me to equal the concept of the Historic Urban Landscape to a dance involving the past, the present and the future. Through this the concept of the Historic Urban Landscape is delicately balanced on the ebb and flow of time through history and the future. The importance of understanding the theory behind the development of heritage conservation is acknowledged. Where the core considerations and the forces behind each consecutive approach are now understood, the core considerations of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach have become clear.

The historical development of heritage conservation spanned a period of five centuries, starting with the awareness and appreciation of heritage resources and progressing towards the protection and management thereof. During history global forces impacted on the formulation of the approaches towards heritage conservation. Regulatory documents were assembled during the centuries to mark and describe the agreed state(s) of heritage conservation methodologies, which were deemed acceptable at the time. These regulatory documents are the results of the heritage communities’ conversations and resolutions in response to the forces of the time and are summarised as:

- The SPAB Manifesto of 1877 allowed minimal intervention to prevent decay and prescribed the preservation of old structures and the removal of all functions.
- The Athens Charter of 1931 encouraged the preservation of historic structures under scientific principles.
- The Venice Charter of 1964 continued to support the preservation of historic structures but also allowed contemporary interventions and encouraged the definition of authenticity.
- The European Charter of 1975 supported development, integrated with historic areas, and interrogated the effects of new developments that would increase vehicular traffic and encourage land and property speculation.
- The Washington Charter of 1987 focused on urban conservation integrated with socio-economic development and urban and regional planning policies.
- The Burra Charter of 1999 accepted both curatorial and scientific approaches in discerned applications.
These heritage conservation approaches increasingly consisted of primary and secondary foundations, respectively:

- the conservation of the architectural fabric and
- the conservation of the urban fabric

The Historic Urban Landscape Approach is understood to be the first approach that integrates not only the above-mentioned primary and secondary bases but also an entire landscape of aspects that are relevant to heritage conservation.

I understand, therefore, that the core consideration of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach is to manage change in the context of urbanization and heritage conservation to such a degree that urban development becomes sustainable and heritage conservation a central consideration.

A six-step implementation procedure is recommended by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) to avoid confusion in the complex genre of heritage management and urban development. The six steps are summarised as:

**Steps 1 – 2:** Define the particular Historic Urban Landscape by means of surveys, maps and reaching consensus on which heritage values and attributes to protect in future.

**Step 3:** Assess the vulnerability of the agreed heritage values and attributes to socio-economic pressures and the impacts of climate change.

**Steps 4 – 5:** Integrate the agreed heritage values and attributes into a wider framework for city development, where provision is being made for the sensitive nature thereof and projects are identified, planned and executed with corresponding care.

**Step 6:** Establish local management frameworks and appropriate partnerships for each identified project.

The objectives of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach are:

- The management of change
- The improvement of living conditions for local populations
- The creation of a virtuous cycle in urban conservation
The **definition of the Historic Urban Landscape** must be approached in acknowledgement of:

- The fact that the Historic Urban Landscape cannot be defined as a physical entity.
- That it consists of several layers of the urban context instead.
- Where historic layering of cultural and natural values and attributes intersect, the Historic Urban Landscape is definable.

UNESCO has formulated a framework whereby the layers of the historic landscape must be identified. While this framework is prescriptive it is understood not to be conclusive, leaving the opportunity for additional layers to be included where deemed appropriate.

![Figure 31: City in a Box – Pretoria](WITOPWIT, 2018).

One of the conceptual projects from the think-tank from WITOPWIT, called City in a Box – Pretoria, originated as a three-dimensional Christmas card, depicting several of the iconic places associated with Pretoria’s collective heritage.
In response to an understanding of the abovementioned UNESCO framework, The Historic Urban Landscape of Pretoria will be identified through a study of, at the very least, the following layers as defined through an understanding of the history related to each respective layer (UNESCO 2011a, p. 2):

- site topography
- geomorphology
- hydrology and natural features
- historic and contemporary built environment
- infrastructure
- open spaces and gardens
- land use patterns
- spatial organizations
- perceptions, visual relationships, social and cultural practices and values

Figure 32: The graphic representation of the Historic Urban Landscape as defined for the City of Ballarat (City of Ballarat 2017a).
The heritage conservation community views the Historic Urban Landscape Approach as a flexible and evolving tool, positioned to support new practices and updated tools towards preserving values within sustainable processes.
nothing exists in isolation
all things emerge from the environment of their creation
hence all things reflect the mind of their creator
something of the thinking of the ideas and mind of their creator is embodied in the artefact
if one can decode the artefact one can access the meaning conveyed therein
in finding meaning one can reanimate the past
in making that meaning explicit the past enriches and makes more meaningful the present

extracted from the obituary prepared by Professor Roger Fischer

… looking down is an analytical experience, while looking ahead is an emotional one. This is why we unfold maps on a table, while we hang landscapes on a wall (Gevisser 2018)

CHAPTER 4:
A Study of HUL Precedents
4. A Study of Precedents for HUL

Supplementary Problem 2: What may be deduced from case studies where the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape has been applied elsewhere and internationally for application to historic central Pretoria?

Supposition 2: An investigation of case studies where the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape has been applied, will allow for a distillation of commonalities for application to the Historic Urban Landscape of central Pretoria.

Two precedents, encompassing four cities, were investigated in this study. The precedents are discussed in two groups, based on geographical locations and referred to as:

- **Precedent 1**: In the Australian context and consisting of one city, Ballarat.
- **Precedent 2**: In the African context and consisting of three cities, declared as World Heritage Sites under UNESCO.

The Selection criteria for precedents

**Precedent 1**: The City of Ballarat in Australia was selected because it was the first municipality in the world to implement the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. The City of Ballarat is also part of the pilot studies programme for the Historic Urban Landscape with the World Heritage Institute of Training and Research (WHITR-AP 2009). WHITR-AP refers to a non-profit organisation under UNESCO, which is positioned to assist by means of training, research, provision of information resources, and building of networks in matters concerning heritage inscription, protection, conservation, and management in Asia and the Pacific region (WHITR-AP 2009).

**Precedent 2**: The World Heritage Sites on the Swahili Coast were selected because they represent Historic Urban Landscapes on the African Continent. The three African cities, Isle of Mozambique, Stone Town of Zanzibar and Lamu Old Town, have been declared as World Heritage Sites.

The implementation of the HUL Approach at these World Heritage Sites is funded by the Flemish Government under the UNESCO World Heritage Cities Programme to enable collaboration on local conservation initiatives towards reconciling conservation and new urban development (Van Oers and Haraguchi 2013, p. 11; UNESCO 2011b; Van Oers 2006, p. 1).
The Structure of the discussion on the selected precedents for the UNESCO Approach on the Historic Urban Landscape:
The extent of the application of the HUL Approach is discussed separately for each precedent in this chapter. An objective overview as to the extent to which the HUL Approach was perceived to have been implemented in each precedent is formulated at the end of the chapter. This overview is based on the following sources:

- An analysis of the state of urban heritage, development and sustainability, where Sophia Labadi and William Logan critically focus on the conflict between conservation and development goals. Sophia Labadi is a senior lecturer in Heritage and Archaeology as well as the co-director of the Centre for Heritage at the University of Kent (Labadi, 2014). William Logan is Professor Emeritus at Deakin University, fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences in Australia and a former Chair of UNESCO Heritage and Urbanism at Deakin Logan (Researchgate 2018).

- The report on the HUL workshops and field activities on the Swahili Coast in East Africa during 2011-2012, published by UNESCO and edited by Ron van Oers, author of the seminal source on this research document and Sachiko Haraguchi, project officer of UNESCO concerned with the Asia and Pacific Unit (Bandarin and van Oers 2012; UNESCO 2018c).

- The researcher's own conclusions.
4.1. Precedent 1: Ballarat, Australia

As one of Australia's fastest developing cities, Ballarat presents an excellent precedent where heritage is being protected whilst development is encouraged as part of the implementation of the HUL Approach. Ballarat is the third largest inland city in Australia and is located in the Central Highlands of the state of Victoria (WhereIs 2018).

The City of Ballarat owes its relatively recent establishment as an urban settlement to the discovery of gold during 1851. The built heritage of Ballarat is considered as being one of the best preserved architectural landscapes from the mid-19th century in Australia (City of Ballarat 2018b).
Ballarat consists of a variety of cultures. Tangible heritage is largely from the Victorian era, when the town flourished consequent to the discovery of gold in the area. The town boasts intact historic streetscapes laced with public and commercial buildings, varying scales of housing, civic spaces, and gardens and planted areas. Intangible attributes include an amenable lifestyle, significant cultural institutions and a variety of annual festivals and events (League of Historical Cities 2016, p. 21). As a regional municipality, the city of Ballarat has an urban centre consisting of a gridiron core. The eastern part displays outlying townships with an irregular layout.

A large agricultural base meets with the forested ridges that outline the city. Two cultural and visual natural landmarks, Mount Warrenheip and Mount Buninyong, guard over the strata of tangible and intangible heritage resources.

Figure 35: A map of the state of Victoria, Australia, showing the location of Ballarat, represented by the red star (City of Ballarat 2016)

Figure 36: A collage of the city of Ballarat’s architectural heritage features (City of Ballarat, 2016)
4.1.1 Historical background of the city of Ballarat

The early human heritage of Ballarat is rooted in the early cultural inheritance from the Wadawurrung and Dja Dja Wurrung people that occupied its landscape for about 50 000 years.

The settlers that have mined this area for gold since 1851 ploughed their accumulated wealth back into the establishment of the urban settlement of Ballarat. An abundance of memories and places are still celebrated today by the multi-cultural communities of the city. These communities consist of ancestors from the United Kingdom, North America, continental Europe and China.

A railway link which connected Ballarat as a regional economic hub with its surrounding communities was established in 1862. Industrial development encompassed a wool industry, flour mills, tanneries, meat preservation works, brick-making plants and breweries since the 1870s.

The settlement expanded significantly to the west and north during the 20th century, of which the establishment of suburban neighbourhoods bear evidence. In 2018 the population was estimated as being 107 647 people, which is being predicted to grow to 144 108 by 2036 (City of Ballarat 2017b).

4.1.2 How was the Historic Urban Landscape Approach implemented in the city of Ballarat?

The local authority was the driving force behind the implementation of the HUL Approach in the city of Ballarat. Knowledge was transferred to city officials in close collaboration with research partners from local universities. Knowledge transfer was secured through internships, which were externally funded: PhD scholarships, honorary fellowships, collaboration with visiting researchers and the development of agreements. The application of the HUL Approach results, were tested on platforms such as WHITR-AP, Forum UNESCO, ICOMOS, and at two symposiums (League of Historical Cities 2016, p. 23).

In accordance with the six critical steps for the implementation of the HUL Approach, as discussed in Chapter 3 of this study, the very first step towards the implementation of HUL in Ballarat was to identify the historic urban landscape, with the identification of its vulnerable aspects as a priority. This process was referred to as a detailed landscape assessment, complemented by a
vulnerability assessment. The investigation was spearheaded by Dr Malcolm Borg, UN Global Advisor, Arts and Culture, Victoria (City of Ballarat 2017a, p. 23)

It is important to note that the evaluation of the historic urban landscape of Ballarat comprised the entire municipal area and not only the central and oldest part of the city. This strategy reflects the core spirit and essence of the intention of the HUL Approach. The result is that the respective layers to the historic urban landscape represent varying geographical boundaries.

A rough drawing, representing the result of this process, is featured in this chapter. This sketch clearly demonstrates that the following three sectors were identified as vulnerable and threatened in the wake of climate change and rapid, often uncontrolled, urban development:

The vulnerable areas in the Historic Urban Landscape of Ballarat:

- the sustainability of Ballarat’s water bodies, threatened visually, aesthetically and sustainably by climate change and inappropriate encroaching developments,
- the readability, meaning and stories of human history and prehistory are threatened by urban redevelopment, maintenance deficiency and insufficient conservation standards, and
- the cultural and spiritual landscape.
Figure 37: The informal sketch representing Ballarat’s vulnerabilities, generated through a detailed landscape assessment (Labadi and Logan 2016, p. 102)
The implementation stage of the Historic Urban Landscape initiative was kick-started, alongside the identification of the historic urban landscape, by the establishment of a strategy called ‘Today, Tomorrow, Together: The Ballarat Strategy – Our Vision for 2040’ (League of Historical Cities 2016).

This strategy comprised a living document that demonstrated planned future urban growth and the development of infrastructure in relation to the projected local population growth of Ballarat. The strategic framework towards sustainable change in this city was implemented in several stages and on several platforms, often simultaneously.

A community initiative, ‘Ballarat Imagine’, translated the HUL strategy by means of informed community consultations (League of Historical Cities 2016, p. 23). Three priority areas towards sustaining heritage were identified through consulting processes with stakeholders, citizens and local and international experts.

The three priority areas for heritage conservation identified through community consultations (City of Ballarat 2017a, p. 2):

a. regeneration
b. celebrate and inspire with Ballarat’s stories
c. managing change and safeguarding heritage
Figure 38: Image that emerged from the landscape assessment representing some of the values shared by the collective community of Ballarat (City of Ballarat 2017a, p. 13).
4.1.2 a. Priority area one - Regeneration

The City of Ballarat based the regeneration approach on the notion that the regeneration of heritage buildings and surrounding areas delivers resilience against change (City of Ballarat 2015h). To effect regeneration in the urban context, it was resolved to implement the following projects:

- The upgrade of the streetscapes in the central business district, comprising the following specific projects (City of Ballarat, 2017a, p. 31) –
  - A live, digital image bank was established on the HUL Ballarat website to share how the city changed over time and empower the citizens with an understanding of its visual heritage.
  - The existing CBD veranda study from 1989 (City of Ballarat 2013) could be effectively updated based on the information that was continuously gathered on the time capsule;
  - A section of Main Road in the CBD was earmarked for revitalization by the introduction of public art.
These artefacts represent stories that relate to the Wadawurring people’s food bowl and the intercultural stories about people that lived and worked in the street in the gold mining times.

- the establishment of targeted financial and investment packages, comprising the following specific projects (City of Ballarat 2017a, p. 33):
  - The city of Ballarat –
    - undertook to join the United Nations Global Compact Cities Programme (UNGCCP) for increased investment in heritage (RMIT University n. d.);
    - Enrolled with the Victoria Heritage Restoration Fund (VHRF) to supplement funding for the Main Street upgrade and streetscape regeneration, targeted at heritage (Victoria n. d.);
    - Secured funds through the Ballarat Heritage Restoration Fund (BHRF) towards private, not-for-profit and commercial heritage property owners (Victoria n. d.);
    - Established new city grants towards built heritage conservation projects for aspects with restricted budgets, like scaffolding and street art;

Figure 40: A city map of Ballarat, describing the historic district (City of Ballarat 2018a) The historic streetcapes of Ballarat were earmarked for revitalization. The image to the left represents a walking tour of the historic streets of Ballarat.
o Undertook to secure grants for specific conservation projects such as the Ballarat Town Hall’s dance hall, Her Majesty’s Theatre and the Ballarat Airport World War II Air Force Hut.

Figure 41: Her Majesty’s Theatre, City of Ballarat (Artsatlas 2018)

o The establishment of an urban forest was effected in Ballarat. It was a priority to re-establish the natural habitat and vegetation cover that had been depleted during the mining era, to alleviate the impact of climate change and to reconnect culture and place through the introduction of plants relevant to the heritage of the Aboriginal communities (City of Ballarat 2017a, p. 35). The urban forest comprises the following specific activities: existing living corridors as habitats for wildlife, travel and recreational pathways for people. The above were to be delivered and reinforced and new ones established:

- The 16-17% canopy cover is to be increased to a 40% canopy cover by 2040, starting with giving public areas priority and progressing to the private areas thereafter;
- An Exceptional Trees Register was established to educate citizens and visitors regarding the identification and protection of these species (City of Ballarat, 2014);
- Community and stakeholder consultations were conducted on the appropriateness of the introduction of new trees in public areas;
- It was therefore ensured that the diversity of tree species was increased during this process, the living habitats for wildlife were enriched, vibrancy
was added, and the effects of climate change were addressed;
- Plant species indigenous to Ballarat are used, and
- Natural heritage conservation principles in all principal Council Projects are adhered to.

- the celebration of cultural events: the following specific heritage celebrations are cultivated by the City of Ballarat:
  - The Ballarat Heritage Awards, an annual event since 2010 (City of Ballarat, 2015a), pays homage to the citizens that dedicated their resources towards conserving the city’s rich heritage;
  - White Night Ballarat (State Government of Victoria, 2017) an artistic festival that uses the historic urban fabric as a canvas for creative projections. This was a fantastically successful event in 2017, attracting over 40 000 attendees out of the city’s population of just above 100 000.

Left: Figure 42: Living Corridors map, prepared by the City of Ballarat in accordance with the commitment towards the re-establishment of the Urban Habitat (City of Ballarat 2018c)
The implementation of recognition programmes as well as the enlistment of the Central Victorian Goldfields as a World Heritage Asset towards regeneration:

- Ballarat’s local government has joined forces with 12 other local governments to motivate the inclusion of the Central Victorian Goldfields on the World Heritage List (City of Ballarat 2017a, p. 46).
- It is expected that UNESCO’s endorsement of the value of the mining heritage of the region will boost the area economically.
- It is further anticipated that the civic collaboration to protect heritage will enhance future partnerships, conservation regeneration, civic pride, social networks, and learning and education on the subject.
Figure 43: An artist’s impression of the City of Ballarat’s characteristic skyline on approach from the west and looking eastwards (City of Ballarat 2017a, p. 9)
4.1.2. b. Priority area two - celebrate and inspire with Ballarat’s stories

The citizens of Ballarat comprise a vast variety of cultures with as many stories to tell. The local community indicated that a need exists to tell and hear these stories and the city authorities gave heed to this requirement by implementing the following strategies:

- The creation of a digital knowledge base that gives access to memories, maps and historic and contemporary images of Ballarat (City of Ballarat 2018f);
- The enhancement of Ballarat’s story-telling capacity that simultaneously collects and communicates the diversity of the living cultural heritage. Examples of such stories in their context include the miners rest memories where a heritage trail was laid out that highlights historical places, including a verbatim account by a citizen, and a live Facebook page that accounts for all activities relating to this living legacy (City of Ballarat 2015f; Making Miners Rest 2015);
- The City of Ballarat has committed project based funding towards the enhancement of storytelling to interpret the stories, research the local knowledge regarding stories and conserve the work (City of Ballarat 2017a, p. 56).

- An example of such a funded project is the ‘Song Ways’ music mapping project, where the local community captured, shared and celebrated residents memories on music-making and its related spaces throughout the city (City of Ballarat 2015b).

Figure 44: The Miners Rest memories webpage consists of a heritage trail and a record of the memories of long term local, Mr Bill Loader, City of Ballarat (City of Ballarat 2015f)
• The City of Ballarat committed itself to the establishment of a ‘one-stop-shop’ heritage hub represented by tourist and visitor information pathways, improved access to historical collections and space for the long-term storage of historical collections (City of Ballarat 2017a, p. 58). An example that testifies to this commitment, is the city’s Sketchfab platform, which consists of a digital record of historical artefacts that describes Ballarat’s history of over the past 160 years (inaccessible to the public), stored on the upper floor of the Town Hall (City of Ballarat 2015e).
• The cultural tourism package of Ballarat’s history was revitalised by reinforcing links, opportunities and experiences within the heritage realm (City of Ballarat 2017a, p. 60). The Sovereign Hill Museum and its related initiatives testify to the implementation of this strategy (Sovereign Hill 2018).
• The concept of the ‘creative heart of Ballarat’ is being promoted through the recognition of the CBD, which dates from the founding of the city, as a community based teaching space. The city of Ballarat is committed to strengthening the position of the historic CBD via its connections with cultural institutions, its role as a creative learning space and as the heart of Ballarat’s historic environment. During 2015, students of the Arts Academy of the Federation University of Australia achieved a Heritage Innovation Award for the collaboration, education and innovation demonstrated in Ballarat’s street- and space performances that were focused on the community and interdisciplinary in nature (City of Ballarat 2015d).
4.1.2.c. Priority area three – Managing Change and Safeguarding Heritage

Similar to many other growing cities, Ballarat’s local authority is challenged by the negative effect of urban sprawl and indiscriminate high density development on the built heritage. The following strategies were undertaken for the safeguarding of heritage and as a measure for the management of change:

- Aboriginal cultural heritage planning: research, support, and represent, include and protect aspects that relate to the contemporary settlement of these peoples in the urban fabric of Ballarat.

- Plans for local communities have been developed in collaboration with said communities. These initiatives were intended to protect heritage and the inherent character of local areas. The anticipated outcomes were direct planning with appropriate approaches and codes. An example of such an implemented approach is the ‘Imagine Ballarat East’ project (City of Ballarat 2015c).

- Urban renewal projects are aimed at the alignment of community expectations with planned development that include alternative uses and increased densities. ‘The Peel Street Story’ is an example from the Ballarat development profile (City of Ballarat 2015g).

- A Planning Scheme Review was conducted to ensure the alignment of the development profile with the adopted policies towards the protection of Ballarat’s heritage. This involved a review of the then existing Ballarat Planning Scheme, the identification of a works programme and an evaluation of the efficiency of the framework of existing policies and strategies.

- A central business district planning package was developed that aims to protect the heritage fabric through an adaptive reuse framework and related support strategies (City of Ballarat 2017a, pp. 65–66).

- The involvement of the local communities was facilitated through digital decision-making engagement tools that were established to assist developers and residents to visualise how development could change, destroy, or enhance the existing heritage of the city. Ballarat had an advantage on the technical front by being represented on the UNESCO’s Board by the Chair of the Cultural Heritage and Visualisation Programme at Curtin University of Technology (Champion 2018).
application of three-dimensional models and tools were assessed in the Cultural Heritage and Visualisation Programme, whereby the City of Ballarat was empowered to include the tools in appropriate measures as part of its urban planning and protection actions (City of Ballarat 2018e).

Continuous monitoring of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach implementation strategy
The plan for the implementation of the HUL Approach in the city of Ballarat was intended to be rolled out in a staged manner and concluded in 2030. Provision was made for the bi-yearly evaluation of this process to monitor the achievement level of the agreed benchmarks for the protection and promotion of heritage (City of Ballarat 2017a, p. 72). The following performance indicators are monitored to this end:

- Evaluation of community perception;
- Evaluation of adherence to legislative responsibilities;
- Evaluation against performance indicators in accordance with the United Nations Global Compact Cities Programme Circles of Sustainability and City Scan aggregate profile, addressing the ecological, economic, cultural, and political domains;
- Evaluation against the Historic Urban Landscape Approach’s six critical steps for implementation and the recommendation framework, and
- Evaluation of adherence to agreed council strategies and policies.
Figure 46a: Cultural mapping, City of Ballarat (Spencer 2017, p 17)

Figure 48b: Cultural mapping, City of Ballarat (Spencer 2017, p 27)
4.2 Precedent 2 in the African context: East Africa’s Swahili Coast

The three cities that form the precedent on the East African Swahili Coast are ancient in their origins:

- The Island of Mozambique,
- The Stone Town of Zanzibar, United Republic of Tanzania
- and Lamu Old Town in Kenya

These port cities prospered as trade posts for many centuries. They played a significant role during the era of slave trading, which continued for hundreds of years to eventually be terminated by British decree during the 1800s. Unfortunately, these richly endowed ancient urban settlements gradually declined because of the adverse effects inflicted by man and nature in recent decades. This decline escalated to such a degree that the protection and management of the ancient urban heritage were proved to be ineffective, if not lacking.

The cities were nonetheless proclaimed as World Heritage Sites in:

- 2000 - Stone Town of Zanzibar (UNESCO 2000) and
- 2001 - Lamu Old Town

UNESCO has made provision for assisting entities that face challenges in the conservation and management of urban heritage and fall under the auspices of The World Heritage Cities.
Programme (UNESCO 2011b). UNESCO selected these three cities to feature in The World Heritage Cities Programme to arrive at an understanding of the prevailing complex relationships between conservation and development and to consider what would constitute increased development potential for such areas.

UNESCO facilitated and assisted in the execution of mapping the historic urban environments in the three cities during 2011, as part of the HUL Approach, which was promulgated during the same year. The funding for this project was bestowed by the Flemish Government in specific support of the advancement of the Historic Landscape Approach (Oers and Haraguchi 2013, p. 1).

The implementation of this initiative was executed in two phases:

- Phase 1: a theoretical evaluation and
- Phase 2: the practical implementation of suggested systems.

The expected outcome of this initiative was that the local authorities and communities would be sufficiently empowered to further the strategic use of urban heritage conservation techniques, presumably derived from the introductory Historic Urban Landscape sessions, towards the sustainable protection and management of the urban heritage realm at the conclusion thereof (UNESCO 2011b).

To this effect, the following specific results were anticipated:

- The identification of existing urban conservation strategies within the local government planning processes and encouragement of the local authorities to include the application of the HUL Approach into the existing processes,
- Increased public awareness of the HUL Approach and
- The protection of these World Heritage Sites from the destructive impact of climate change, urbanisation and unsustainable tourism (Oers and Haraguchi 2013, p. 12).

It was imperative to build the capacity of the resources involved to have the best possible chance of success in this venture. Foreign and local universities were selected to collaborate on each site, thereby reinforcing international involvement and providing:

- On-site technical aid to consider urban conservation strategies versus the requirements of the local authorities and existing policies;
- Support for continued research and a toolkit for urban conservation towards assessing the impact of development, site significance and the publication of outcomes;
- Expansion and exploration of guidelines and best practices, and
- The establishment of the World Heritage Cities Programmes as a source of information and guidance for urban heritage conservation practitioners (Oers and Haraguchi 2013, p. 12).

The characteristics and application of the elements of the historic urban landscape for each site has been individually evaluated in this document. In doing this, it has become evident that the definition of historic urban landscape and the implementation of the HUL Approach for the three sites presented similar scenarios. It is for this reason that the evaluation of the three Swahili Coast precedent cities will be discussed as one precedent at the conclusion of this chapter.
4.2.1 The Island of Mozambique World Heritage Site

Tangible and intangible characteristics of the site
The heritage fabric of this site consists of two different dwelling- and urban systems. The northern half consists of a stone and lime town, bearing evidence of Swahili, Arab and European influences. This part of the site consists of administrative and commercial building typologies dating from 1507 to 1898, when the Portuguese colonial government was in power. The southern half of the site is represented by the Macuti Town, an indigenous name which refers to it being a city of buildings with palm tree roofs. The resulting conglomerate of built typologies and fortifications form an exceptional example of urban fabric, representing the multicultural history of the site that has served as a stage for ancient interactions between the Bantu, Swahili, Arab, Persian, Indian, and European civilisations. The visually pleasing unity in the fine-grained, multi-layered urban fabric was achieved over centuries by the sustaining and consistent use of tectonic elements.

Building techniques, building materials and decorative principles remained unchanged (UNESCO 1991).

Figure 47: Roofscape of Macuti Town (roof of the palm trees), Island of Mozambique, (flickr 2012)

Figure 48: Traditional African architecture of a street in Macuti Town, Island of Mozambique, (Assomo 2006)

Figure 49: Chapel of San Antonio, Island of Mozambique, (Watt 2018)

Figure 50: Museum of sacred art, northern part, Island of Mozambique, (Encyclopaedia Britannica, 1998)
The site is under the strain of extreme overpopulation after the 16-year civil war (1976-1992), which has resulted in overcrowding, poverty, infrastructural challenges, erosion, and evident decay of buildings and infrastructure (Igreja 2008).

**Regulatory framework and state of heritage conservation**

The local bylaws, which were established in 1878, are still valid today. These regulations prohibited changes to the urban environment. In 1943, the list of Classified Historical Monuments was prepared and this inventory is being continuously updated. The entire Old Town is classified as an urban ensemble under the Mozambican Cultural Patrimony and all buildings older than 1920 are classified as national cultural
assets in the National Register. Building ownership was governed by the State under the Mozambican Constitution since Independence in 1975. In consequent decades the use and protection of the built environment and fiscal benefits, derived from building ownership, were co-ordinated by various state departments in an attempt to protect the built heritage during the tumultuous years of conflict, which ended in the early 1990s.

During 1996, attempts were made to improve infrastructure, tourism and heritage restoration under the Programme for Sustainable Human Development and Integral Conservation (UNESCO 1991). Consequent incremental reports from circa 2000, 2003, 2005, 2006, 2007 and 2010 indicated that progress towards improvement of the re-establishment and control of infrastructure had slowly but surely been made. The most urgent issues documented are (UNESCO 1991):

- a need for the co-ordination of conservation works and training to prevent the collapse of structures,
- solving water supply and sewage disposal issues,
- an emergency plan of action,
- a responsible regulatory authority, and

- the establishment of a buffer zone.

The introduction of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach

The two-phased methodology for the implementation of the HUL Approach to the Island of Mozambique was implemented in the following manner:

Phase one took place in the form of a workshop held from 11 to 15 July 2011, on the Island of Mozambique. The workshop was conducted to establish a timeline for the activities required in order to address the challenges faced in heritage resource management. The workshop was attended by forty-two people in total, of which thirty-five were Mozambican experts, professionals, community leaders and high-level government representatives. The following government officials with decision-making mandates attended the workshop:

- the President of the Municipality of Island of Mozambique,
- the Administrator of the City of Island of Mozambique, and
- the Provincial Deputy Director for Cultural Heritage of Maputo.
The balance of the attendees consisted of UNESCO staff and foreign experts (Oers and Haraguchi 2013, p. 13).

It transpired from this workshop that it was imperative to immediately establish an updated electronic data base with a cadastral map of the heritage assets. The results from previous surveys were to serve as a basis for the updated and expanded inventory.

- **Phase two** constituted the actual survey of heritage assets in the form of buildings, structures, public spaces and their uses, and the determination of population densities to compile a record of home ownership. Phase two was a collaborative venture between:
  - Eindhoven University of Technology (the Netherlands),
  - Lurio University in Nampula (Mozambique),
  - the Municipal Council of the Island of Mozambique, and
  - the Ministry of Culture in Maputo.

The results of the technical survey was transferred to an electronic data base and publicly presented to the public through community engagement.

The researcher concluded that there was a resolve to:
- record the tangible heritage assets of the Island of Mozambique,
- survey the tangible heritage assets and
- compile an electronic data base, which constituted an initial step towards the fulfilment of Step 1 of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach’s six-step implementation plan, as recommended by UNESCO (UNESCO 2018a)

### 4.2.2 Zanzibar’s Stone Town – World Heritage Site

**Tangible and intangible characteristics of the site**

UNESCO regards this settlement as an outstanding example of a Swahili trading town (UNESCO 2000). It is not only a living relic of the past but also thrives as a commercial and socio-cultural centre in Zanzibar. Arab, Indian and European influences have directed the development of the town for more than a millennium, whilst its indigenous elements remained intact. The urban fabric and townscape represents a preserved historic example, homogeneous in its nature but diverse in its composition. The building structures consist mainly of coralline rag stone and mangrove timber, encased in a thick lime mortar, with a plastered and lime-washed finish. These traditional
building methods are still in general use today. The Swahili, Indian, Arab and European influences are evident in the building forms and town layout. Two-storey houses that comprise long, narrow rooms and entrances identified by elaborate ‘Zanzibar’ doors by way of narrow corridors are arranged around open courtyards. ‘Bazaar’ streets are lined with the facades of quaint shops and delineate a common commercial space referred to as the ‘duka’.

Figure 52: Urban fabric of Stone Town, Zanzibar (Zamani 2017). The preserved urban fabric of Zanzibar: integrated in nature but diverse in composition.
The unique urban settlement of narrow winding streets, large seafront mansions and open spaces form an authentic ensemble of historic urban layering, albeit vulnerable to the threats of the inappropriate scale and designs of contemporary developments at its periphery. The intangible significance of the site is rooted in the fraught topic of the abolition of the slave trade. The history of the abolition of slavery on the Islands of Zanzibar testifies to the perceived anomalies around the improvement of the lives of enslaved persons circa 1807 and
1833, as poignantly discussed by Elliott and touchingly memorialized in the artwork below, where original slave chains are used as part of the sculptural group (Elliot 2017; UNESCO 2000).

![Monument in remembrance of the Slave Trade](Figure 55: Monument in remembrance of the Slave Trade (Rachael 2017). This monument by Scandinavian artist, Clara Sönäs, was commissioned in 1997 and depicts five slave figures with features from varying tribal and ethnic origins, chained together in a pit with the original slave chains (Elliot 2017).

**The regulatory framework and state of heritage conservation**

The regulatory framework dates back to the mid-1900s, when the Ancient Monuments Act of 1948 was instituted to protect individual monuments. Historically important houses were protected under the Town and Country Planning Act from 1955 onwards. Since 1985, Stone Town has been protected as a conservation area under the same act. The power to regulate the heritage resources is vested in the Stone Town Conservation and Development Authority (STCDA), which was established in 1985 (UNESCO 2000). Resources falter under the pressures of commercial development and there is a lack of clear policies to regulate heritage promotion, cultural tourism, sustainable development in the tourist sector, and revitalization of public spaces (UNESCO 2000).

**Introduction of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach**

The two-phased methodology for the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach to the Stone Town in Zanzibar was implemented in the following manner:
Phase one constituted a preparatory workshop, which took place in Zanzibar from 15 to 19 August 2011. The workshop was aimed at identifying the actions required to conform to Step 1 of the HUL Approach. Forty-four professionals attended the workshop, among whom were representatives from high regulatory levels:
- the Principal Secretary of the Ministry of Lands, Housing, Water, and Energy,
- the Director-General of the Stone Town Conservation and Development Authority (STCDA) and
- the Director of the Department of Urban and Rural Planning of Zanzibar.

It became clear during the workshop that a comprehensive inventory of all previous heritage surveys was required. The digitalisation and consolidation of all heritage surveys was agreed upon in a new resolution, together with the coordination and establishment of a stakeholder forum. The workshop concluded with an agreement that the rehabilitation of Zanzibar’s Botanical Garden and the development of a traffic plan were priorities. It was acknowledged that the impact of a proposed five star hotel development was being interrogated in a heritage impact assessment, which included the significant public participation processes, under the guidance of the late professor Karel Bakker, then Head of the Department of Architecture at the University of Pretoria in South Africa. Consequent thereto, The World Heritage Committee acknowledged receipt of the heritage impact assessment at the hotel complex at Mambo Msiige. The project was, however, halted by The World Heritage Committee on the basis of non-compliance with statutory conservation provisions (ICOMOS Advisory Mission 2013).

Phase two represented the authoring of three reports:
- The first report was related to the cultural mapping of the site by way of documenting the tangible and intangible heritage values.
- The second report was based upon a survey of open spaces in relation to the eventual development of a set of codes and guidelines whereby future development in the buffer zone of the World Heritage Site could be informed. This survey only included an initial representative identification of open spaces. The intention was for local resources, in the form of
students and staff who received training during the initial process, to complete the survey.

- The third report is referred to as the ‘Guideline for the future interventions at Government Boulevard’, and was intended to guide the Department of Urban and Rural Planning and the Ministry of Lands, Housing, Water, and Energy in good practice planning and development (Van Oers and Haraguchi 2013, p. 15).

The researcher concluded that the resolution to:
- compile a consolidated and digitised heritage inventory,
- rehabilitate the Zanzibar Botanical Garden,
- develop a traffic plan,
and the preparation of:
- the report on the tangible and intangible heritage values,
- the report of the initial survey of open spaces to develop a set of codes and guidelines for future development, and
- the report called the ‘Guideline for the future interventions at Government Boulevard’ – a report on good practice in planning and development – constituted an initial step towards the fulfilment of Step 1 of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach’s six-step implementation plan as recommended by UNESCO (UNESCO 2018a).
4.2.3 Lamu Old Town, Kenya – World Heritage Site
Tangible and intangible characteristics of the site

Lamu Old Town is located on the island Lamu, approximately 350 kilometres north of Mombasa and is a Swahili settlement that has been pristinely preserved for over 700 years. The core of the settlement consists of the authentic social and cultural integrities and the ancient building morphology that established the city as the primary trade, educational and technically advanced entity central to East Africa (UNESCO, 2001b).

Cultural influences can be observed in the architectural and urban fabric that originated from Bantu, Arab, Persian, Indian, and European interactions in the past. The resulting morphological characteristics are narrow streets and formidable stone buildings, with elaborate doors and interiors with painted ceilings and built-in niches that proudly display Chinese porcelain. Buildings on the seafront have arcades and open verandas that lend an attractively integrated character to the ancient, briny façade of the city. The close-knit domestic quarters of the city consist of clusters of dwellings that form wards, also referred to as ‘mitaa’, where closely related citizens from communal lineages reside (UNESCO 2001b).

Figure 56: Lamu Old Town Kenya (UNESCO 2001a). An aerial photograph showing the fine-grained urban fabric of Lamu Old Town.
The motivation for inclusion on the World Heritage List, highlights the vulnerability of the Old Town to unauthorised developments on the periphery of the 16 hectare precinct that comprises the World Heritage Site. This vulnerability relates to the need for the sustainable protection of the built and natural heritage in the form of ancient architecture and fresh water, the reinforcement of the crumbling existing infrastructure and the vision for a symbiotic relationship with the surrounding developing urban areas (UNESCO 2001b).
The photogenic architecture of Lamu Old Town (Duff 2014)

The regulatory framework and the state of heritage conservation

The prevailing regulatory framework includes the current National Museums and Heritage Act of 2006, preceded by the National Museums Act, CAP 216, of 1983.

Other supporting and relevant legislation include:
- The Local Governments Act
- the EMCA Act
- the Planning Act of 2006
- the Forest Act and
- the Water Act

Regulatory tools include a gazetted buffer zone and a conservation management plan for Lamu Old Town (UNESCO 2001b).

The introduction of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach

The application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach on this site was executed in two phases: a strategic planning phase and a field work phase, respectively.

Phase one started with a preparatory workshop in Lamu, held from 8 to 12 August 2011, where delegates concurred that a heritage inventory – based on existing data – should be established and that surveys should be executed during phase 2 (the field work procedure) of the Historic Urban Landscape application process. The data base was envisaged as being both paper based and in electronic format.

Phase 2 was executed during a two-week period in January 2012, during which international support was offered by the
University of Minnesota in order to train staff at the local authority to continue the survey of local heritage assets and understand the application options of data bases for heritage resources. The survey of the public squares of Lamu Old Town was a recent addition to the existing heritage resources data base and was executed by local staff and students, assisted by the University of Mombasa. The introduction of the public square survey process resulted in the publication of a manual for the Inventory of Public Squares in the Old Town of Lamu (Oers and Haraguchi 2013, p. 14)

It was concluded that the resolution to:

- establish a paper-based and electronic heritage inventory,
- execute the heritage survey,
- provide training on the continuation and application of heritage surveys,
- survey the public squares, and
- publish a manual for the inventory of Public Squares in the Old Town of Lamu

constituted an initial step towards the fulfilment of Step 1 of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach six-step implementation plan as recommended by UNESCO (UNESCO 2018a).
4.3 An objective overview of the application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in the selected precedents

4.3.1 The city of Ballarat

Labadi and Logan (2016) evaluated the implementation of the HUL Approach in the City of Ballarat in the publication *Urban Heritage, Development and Sustainability: International Frameworks*. Their research extracted an overview evaluation, presented below, to afford an objective view on the methodologies used and the perceived positive and negative aspects:

The City of Ballarat has demonstrated how to confront the implementation of the HUL Approach. The adoption and implementation of the HUL Approach provided a framework within which the limits of acceptable change and the management thereof were established. In Australia, the traditional approach towards protection and management of heritage resources and areas were directed by land use and development controls via the local governments. This approach resulted in heritage assets being considered as obstacles that prohibited development and planning problems being resolved on a site-by-site basis, as and when required. (Labadi and Logan, 2016 pp. 93–96).

The implementation of the HUL Approach in Ballarat afforded the city officials the opportunity to consider and adopt a values based approach as a long-term land use strategy.

The mining town of Ballarat has, since its founding in 1851, developed into a contemporary urban settlement with more than 10,000 protected heritage resources. The local authority manages all applications for any development that could potentially encroach upon these heritage assets. Planning decisions concerning heritage used to be made through adversarial processes where participants represented their causes from defensive vantage points. Heritage aspects were addressed at a relatively late stage of the planning programs and, together with the anticipation of conflict that accompanied heritage approval processes, heritage resource management was often viewed as an obstacle in the way of development rather than as a catalyst for its advancement. The City of Ballarat committed to exploring the HUL Approach so as to
proactively counter the negative traditional attitude regarding heritage management and planning in 2012.

The entire municipal area – not just the historic central area of the city within its regional setting – was earmarked for the application of HUL. As the regulatory heritage custodian, the function and mandate of the local authority had to be interrogated and reconsidered. Council officials gained access to international experts within the World Heritage Institute of Training and Research for the Asia and the Pacific Region (WHITTRAP).forum, which offered networks of knowledge and assistance to interpret UNESCO’s intentions with the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. At the beginning of the process, it was nevertheless unclear what the practical implementation of the adoption of the HUL Approach might have in store for the City of Ballarat.

The first phase of the course of action was guided by unorthodox methodologies and culminated in an overview study that mapped the historic urban landscape of Ballarat. An organic and simplified map of the area represented a visual analysis of the municipal area, demonstrating key visual elements and viewpoints, historical precincts and planning zones (see 4.1.2).

A community based cultural mapping process complemented the abovementioned visual analyses. As part of the inception phases of the implementation of the HUL Approach, a mammoth community conversation was conducted, which resulted in the following common denominators in terms of what Ballarat communities valued, imagined for the future and did not want to lose.

The viewpoints were illustrated by way of the researchers’ informal and lateral approach that entailed walking and driving through Ballarat with community representatives so as to experience and grasp the spirit of the area, understand shared sentiments, individual expressions, and preferences concerning the use of space. The themes that were extracted from the community conversations revolved around heritage, history, natural beauty, amenable lifestyle, historic streetscapes, and specific places and features that would have been overlooked in conventional planning approaches (Labadi and Logan 2016, pp. 96–103).
Several consequences of the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach are evident:

- The focus on larger, multi-dimensional areas rather than specific sites;
- As a result, ‘ordinary’ urban landscapes are now protected.
- In addition to the predictable consideration of the material and visual aspects, the protection of the ‘ordinary’ leads one to consider the intangible aspects of the urban context: by protecting the ordinary within the urban boundaries, an understanding of ‘why’ and ‘how’ areas exist, or came to exist, develops;
- The diverse consultation processes and outcomes culminated in the much coveted political support for the continued implementation of the HUL approach at governance level;
- Planning authorities agreed to regard heritage concerns as central to future planning processes rather than approaching them as a separate sector of activity.

Two international symposiums marked the completion of phases 1 and 2, namely the Symposium on the Historic Urban Landscape in Ballarat, during September 2013, and the symposium called ‘Participate, Imagine, Innovate: Revitalising Historic Cities’ in February 2015. A principal consequence was council officials’ and communities’ shift of mind set to understanding the Historic Urban Landscape in the context of change.

The implementation of the HUL Approach established a link between the shared goals of both conservation and socio-economic development. This link is perceived as a vantage point for the continued implementation of the HUL Approach. The partnership between the City of Ballarat and WHITTR-AP, is viewed as a strategic move on the part of the city council towards gaining a deeper understanding of the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach.

The implementation of the HUL Approach in Ballarat is in its inception phase and, as is usually the case with the vulnerable, certain risks need to be managed:

- Political support represents the jugular vein of the future, and continued implementation of the HUL Approach is uncertain.
- Governmental support is fickle and may change rapidly in the wake of political alignments.
Usable outcomes supporting innovative thinking were, therefore, established during the very early stages of the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach.

The HUL processes are conducted in tandem with pre-existing heritage identification and management procedures.

These visual and fabric orientated methods are embedded at State level and are challenged by the future and continued implementation of the HUL Approach.

The local authority, in the form of the City of Ballarat remain subject to the State and its policies and the resultant imbalance of political influence must be managed cautiously in future.

The focus on urban settlements as landscapes had a profound impact on the thought processes of planners, professionals and officials. The approach has culminated in the resolution that planning concepts and methods must be community-based rather than driven by practitioners.

The transition from conventional heritage practices towards the HUL system concerning the interpretation of the Burra Charter, demonstrates the malleable nature of the application of the Historic Urban Landscape approach versus the conventional approach.

The local government proved itself to be an agile and pivotal factor between the conventional planning approach and the landscape approach by boldly cooperating with WHITR-AP and UNESCO on an international level. It bears evidence that such alliances are more easily formed from the local authority upwards than from state governance level.

The City of Ballarat will develop cultural mapping and visual methods to explain interaction between people and place in the continued application of the HUL Approach.

Continued oscillation between theory, experiment and application in planning and conservation processes will be maintained (Labadi and Logan 2016, pp. 103–109).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scheduled</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Critical step no</th>
<th>HUL tools applied</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2013-2016</td>
<td>Identification of 3 priority areas through interactive forum</td>
<td>1 + 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013 – on-going</td>
<td>Best practice platform and toolkit through collaboration with universities</td>
<td>3 + 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>‘Heritage’ central to planning considerations</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016-2017</td>
<td>HUL Approach included in the CBD strategy and Ballarat Planning Scheme;</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015 – on-going</td>
<td>Local Area Plans delivered to ensure that citizens local to neighbourhoods, understand and participate in the vision for the future of their neighbourhood;</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015 – on-going</td>
<td>Assistance from the United Nations Global Compact Cities Programme (UNGCCP).</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>Preliminary heritage plan was released to test against feedback from citizens and stake holders towards informing the final heritage plan</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: The Ballarat HUL planning process demonstrated as a dynamic procedure which includes all the tools and critical steps suggested in the HUL Approach with parallel rather than consecutive actions.
4.3.2 The World Heritage Sites along the Swahili Coast

Ron van Oers perceived the historic urban landscape of the Swahili coast as being centred around ‘urbanism’. The Swahili society and civilisation are founded on the ‘urban’, and the morphology of urban settlements is characterized by coherence and continuity. The conduct of the Swahili people echoes the same solidarity as is evident in trade, commerce, assembly rituals, the importance of urban communities, and the shared Islamic belief system (Van Oers and Haraguchi 2013, p. 7). Van Oers held that the advantages of coherent urbanism are countered by the politically and militarily weak government, which is at the helm of an elaborate service economy, a people subject to a complex system of social stratification and notions of purity and uncleanness which include rituals that control and order these same systems.

According to Van Oers globalization, under the influence of the West, has had the following impact on the Swahili historic urban landscape (van Oers and Haraguchi 2013, p. 9):

• The loss of the ancient art of boat building to the predominant presence of speed boats and

• The loss of the ancient and traditional architectural forms to exclusive resorts based on contemporary building techniques, materials and architectural forms in order to conform to the demands of mass tourism.

The systematic erosion of the historic urban landscape on the Swahili coast has seen the age-old functional, organizational and traditional patterns, as laid down by urban society, being sacrificed. This loss has resulted in an urban settlement devoid of what is distinctly Swahili, as in ‘the same difference everywhere’ (Van Oers 2006, p. 6). He said the above in his explanation of the Bilbao effect at the 42nd Congress of The International Society of City and Regional Planners in September 2006, and then offers guidance for appropriate urban development. In practice, the following characteristics can be identified in living, historic cities:

a. The life cycle of these types of cities generates a constant need for adaptation and modernization. The stages of the urban life cycle progress as follows: growth, maturity, stagnation, and either regeneration or decline.
b. An expansion of stakeholder groups- and interests, resulting in the need for increased negotiation and conflict resolution skills and investments.

c. A changed concept of ‘heritage’.

According to van Van Oers, the intention of the application of the HUL Approach on the Swahili coast World Heritage Site was to unravel the complexities concerning conservation and development (Van Oers and Haraguchi 2013, pp. 6–17). It was deemed that, by demonstrating the adoption of the HUL Approach in these cities, conservation staff and site managers in peri-urban areas would be motivated to follow suit.

UNESCO refers to the HUL Approach as a possible resource towards complementing the existing heritage management system at the Swahili World Heritage Sites.

In the report on the progress achieved in the application of the HUL Approach in Stone Town, Zanzibar (Van Oers and Haraguchi 2013, pp. 64–76), reference was made to the six critical steps recommended for the implementation of the HUL Approach. However, I have concluded that the essence and spirit of the Historic Landscape Approach, in this particular instance, has unfortunately been lost in the interpretation of the six-step approach. The reliance of the HUL Approach on the collective community’s attachment to their heritage resources, and their perception of a shared heritage, has been marginalised in this precedent.

The implementation of the HUL Approach in the Old Town of Lamu mainly hinged on the identification and recording of tangible heritage assets and a commitment with respect to securing funding and developing partnerships to further heritage conservation (Van Oers and Haraguchi 2013, pp. 96–104).

While the socio-economic conditions particular to the sites on the Swahili Coast – as precedents – admittedly pose enormous challenges in the conservation of heritage resources, this researcher has found no convincing evidence that the unorthodox and layered strategy of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach was tested to its full potential at the Stone Town, Island of Mozambique and Lamu Old Town sites. For instance, where the ownership-and-use regime was researched
on the Island of Mozambique – to serve as a vantage point for an improved incentive system for the conservation of specific structures and areas – it was discovered that structural changes had been made to each and every ancient edifice, despite the strict regulations, that have been in place since 1982-85, prohibiting any constructional changes (Van Oers and Haraguchi 2013, pp. 90–91). The researcher thinks it likely that the true endorsement of the essence and spirit of the HUL Approach might have led the Island of Mozambique's implementing party to use this aspect as an opportunity for forming an understanding of the needs and sentiments of the community. The simultaneous recording of the constructional changes might have served to inform the adjustment of planning regulations and policies, thereby giving the citizens a voice in the application of the HUL Approach.

While the report on the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach on the Island of Mozambique refers to the compliance, to varying degrees, of the six-step action plan – as recommended by UNESCO – it has been concluded that this particular version of the action plan does not represent a true description of the intention of the HUL Approach. A full evaluation of the application of the six-step action plan is not, therefore, deemed relevant in this chapter.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Symbol</th>
<th>Tool</th>
<th>Attributes identified re: the Island of Mozambique as related to HUL tools</th>
<th>Attributes identified re: Stone Town of Zanzibar as related to HUL tools</th>
<th>Attributes identified re: Lamu Old Town in Kenya as related to HUL tools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>🐵</td>
<td>Community engagement</td>
<td>Extreme over population; insufficient coordination of stakeholders; insufficient human resources, and socio-economic changes</td>
<td>There is a requirement for the establishment of a stakeholder forum</td>
<td>Social and cultural integrity intact and inhabited for over 700 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>🗣️</td>
<td>Knowledge and planning</td>
<td>African city with architectural unity but insufficient technical resources; an inventory was established to show physical changes over the past 30 years; a buffer zone must be established in adherence to World Heritage status</td>
<td>African city with architectural unity; an inventory was to be coordinated and taken online; a survey of the open space network was required; the identification of the intangible heritage is required; a traffic management plan is required; a buffer zone must be established in adherence to World Heritage status</td>
<td>African city with architectural unity; a buffer zone must be established in adherence to World Heritage status; environmental and cultural impact assessments are required; a database of tangible and intangible heritage assets is required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☝️</td>
<td>Regulatory systems</td>
<td>Insufficient regulatory framework – socio economic changes impacted on ownership legislation</td>
<td>A lack of clear policies to regulate heritage promotion, cultural tourism, sustainable development in the tourist sector, and revitalisation of public spaces</td>
<td>The regulatory framework is not integrated, geared towards heritage promotion, cultural tourism or in support of sustainable development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>💼</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Insufficient infrastructure, lack of corrective measures and insufficient financial resources</td>
<td>Insufficient infrastructure, a lack of corrective measures and insufficient financial resources</td>
<td>Insufficient infrastructure, lack of corrective measures, insufficient financial resources</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: The Swahili coast cities as precedent - HUL processes. The HUL management tools applied in Swahili Coast World Heritage Sites after the conclusion of step 1 of the HUL Approach. An evaluation of the implementation of the six critical steps has been omitted since it is deemed that the interpretation thereof is not in alignment with the true intention of the HUL Approach, as prescribed by UNESCO.
In closing, it is here noted that the observations on the life cycle of living historic cities, as made by Van Oers, still need to be recognised and explored in relation to the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in the Swahili World Heritage Sites. There must be simultaneous acknowledgement of the need for an expansion of stakeholder groups, corresponding interests, appropriate negotiation and conflict resolution skills and, ultimately, a changed concept of *heritage*.

If the reality of the current state of decline in these cities is not recognised, the sites may well stagnate or perish before the Historic Urban Landscape can be properly defined and explored.

4.4. Summary and conclusions related to key strategies identified from selected precedents, and the corresponding consequences

The key strategies adopted toward the implementation of the UNESCO Approach on the Historic Urban Landscape in the selected precedents, in varying degrees comply with:

- the essential goals set by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation General Conference of 10 November 2011 (UNESCO 2011a) and
- the six basic steps for the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach (UNESCO 2018a).

The degree to which the City of Ballarat is perceived to have complied with the essential goals set by UNESCO for the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach

As the critical initial step toward the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in any given scenario, the definition of the Historic Urban Landscape must be executed correctly and in concurrence with the essence of the *landscape* concept. The fact that the definition of the Historic Urban Landscape is listed as the first goal toward the implementation of the HUL Approach cannot, therefore, be considered a coincidence (UNESCO 2011a).
Upon concluding the study into the City of Ballarat, as precedent for the application of the HUL Approach, the researcher acknowledges that notable success had been achieved in the definition of the historic urban landscape by means of the initial identification of natural and man-made heritage resources, intangible resources and the assessment of the vulnerability of these assets. The immediate identification of projects towards the preservation of the most vulnerable aspects of the historic urban landscape, is viewed as the City of Ballarat’s response to the implied mandate to address the challenges and opportunities as set out in UNESCOs second goal. To ensure that all aspects of the process were open to public involvement, community involvement platforms were established on different fronts, thereby continuously broadening the collective concept of the historic urban landscape. Citizens were also empowered by the introduction of an electronic mandate, which allowed digital voting on decisions concerning preferred outcomes in city projects and matters concerning the collective heritage. The City of Ballarat’s ventures toward financial reinforcement and capacity building, in support of research and the collection and sharing of information, convincingly emerged as a precedent during this study. Not only was international cooperation sought during the initiation phase of the project, the success of the endeavour’s progression is also being monitored by international peer groups on a bi-yearly basis. Moreover, the research determines that the simultaneous assessment of all the multi-dimensional aspects of the historic urban landscape, together with the simultaneous implementation of multiple strategies in the form of several projects, represent the core intention of the HUL Approach. All the goals set by UNESCO, as being central to the HUL Approach, were addressed within a matrix of simultaneous strategies and concurrent actions.

Table 1 in this chapter demonstrates to which extent the historic urban landscape toolkit had been implemented and that all six of the suggested steps for the implementation of the Historic Landscape had been adhered to in the City of Ballarat precedent.

The degree to which the Swahili Coast World Heritage Sites is perceived to have complied with the essential goals set for the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach by UNESCO
By recognising that the definition of the historic urban landscape is the first and most critical step towards the implementation of the HUL Approach, it was found that heritage conservation was not convincingly integrated into a level of awareness of the broader landscape in the Swahili coast precedent.

The definition of tangible heritage assets was initially the focus in moving towards the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. It became clear that the intersection of the tangible and intangible aspects of the cities were not considered in the face of the dramatic danger to ancient heritage structures. Whilst research sources recorded that the resulting data was digitalised, there is no evidence that the data was made available on public platforms to invite discourse and allow empowerment through access to information and the sharing thereof, since there is no reference available from any of the sources investigated. The absence of a dialogue with the community and the public’s exclusion from available sources concerning the comprehensive definition of the intangible aspects of the historic urban landscape, leads to the conclusion that the definition lacks the multi-faceted scope of the essence and intention of the HUL Approach in these precedents. Consequently, the projects that were identified, based on the vulnerability assessments of the heritage assets, appear to be isolated and singular in nature, with little or no reference to collective visions of the past, present and future.

The most important problem in this precedent is that there is no driver to sustain the momentum for the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO), together with the World Heritage Institute of Training and Research for the Asia and the Pacific (WHITR-AP), were the driving forces behind the decision to implement the HUL Approach in these cities. It is appreciated that the intention was to transfer knowledge and skills on the subject, expecting that the local authorities would gain inspiration and momentum therefrom to continue the implementation of the HUL Approach. It is understood that the processes that were initiated in 2011 are being slowly but surely developed and improved upon. The researcher, nevertheless, maintains the point of view that the approach toward the initial definition of the historic urban landscape might have been
more inclusive, and that the implementation of the resulting strategies and projects would consequently have reflected a more convincing landscape approach, as is the case in the Ballarat precedent.
Considering the perceived success of the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in the City of Ballarat, the following four aspects are regarded as the key strategies that unlocked this positive outcome

A. The local authority of the City of Ballarat was the driving force behind the conception, inception, execution, and verification phases of the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. As a third tier of government, the City of Ballarat owned the mandate to:
   o adopt the Historic Urban Landscape Approach into its regulatory framework,
   o make policy changes at grassroots level to align with the HUL Approach and
   o divert finances and resources to reinforce and sustain the reviewed policies.

B. During the implementation of the HUL Approach, the City of Ballarat resolved to conduct a planning scheme review to reposition heritage as a central consideration in all planning projects. This decision is considered by the researcher to be infinitely inspiring and of utmost importance to the sustainability of the HUL Approach in any given system.

C. The City of Ballarat continuously considered the intention of the HUL Approach as being a flexible and evolving tool by creating live digital platforms whereby local and global participation was and is being made possible. This venture of the City of Ballarat to employ contemporary digital technology to reach the collective community is regarded as current, relevant and representative of a tool that enables the essence of the intention of the Urban Landscape Approach.

D. The definition of the Historic Urban Landscape includes an evaluation of the area defined by the municipal boundaries of the City of Ballarat and not merely the perceived boundary of the historic central area of the City of Ballarat.
nothing exists in isolation
all things emerge from the environment of their creation
hence all things reflect the mind of their creator
something of the thinking of the ideas and mind of their creator is embodied in the artefact
if one can decode the artefact one can access the meaning conveyed therein
in finding meaning one can reanimate the past in the present
in making that meaning explicit the past enriches and makes more meaningful the present (Fisher 2014)

extracted from the obituary prepared by Professor Roger Fischer

Cities are made, usually, as people clear paths through the brush ... (Gevisser 2018)

CHAPTER 5: Steps Toward
Defining the Study Area

Figure 60: Artwork from the series ‘Looking Down’ by Gerhard Marx (Marx 2017)
5. Steps towards Defining the Study Area

5.1. Understanding Historic Pretoria

The layered history of Pretoria was researched to demonstrate the diversity and richness of its past. While the descriptions in this chapter offer several slices consisting of a layered history, the opinions may be viewed as influenced by the researcher’s own sentiments and the considerations of the cited authors. The researcher offers the following notion: if and when the Historic Urban Landscape Approach is being implemented in Pretoria, the collective community will contribute their own memories and historic attachments to further enrich and complete this description and understand the layered past.

The following sources were selected as references to compile a description of the diverse and layered history of Pretoria:

- The centenary publication by the City Council of Pretoria, called PRETORIA 1855-1955, which consists of lively descriptions of Pretoria’s history and development up to 1955 by various contributors (Engelbrecht et al. 1955);
- The 1995 research edition by the National Cultural History Museum, which contains an exploratory survey of the urbanisation patterns during the 20th century in Pretoria.
(De Jong, 1995);

- The journal for adult education, called Lantern, which contains a description of South African urbanisation patterns during the 20th century (Schauder 1954);
- The internet webpage called South African History Online (SAHO), which presents a non-partisan and democratic history of South Africa (Huffman 2010);
- A publication by the University of South Africa on the Architecture of the Transvaal, which was compiled in celebration of the Golden Jubilee of the Pretoria School of Architecture and to pay tribute to all those who had contributed to the built environment comprising Pretoria and the former Transvaal (Fisher, le Roux and Mare 1998), and

These references were selected because they offer a well-documented overview of the particular historic landscape, starting with the earliest records of human inhabitants up to, at the very least, the centenary year of 1955.
In order to define the historic urban landscape, the intersection between the tangible heritage and the cultural heritage of a place must be searched for, celebrated and sustained. It is, therefore, expected that the extracts from Pretoria’s history in this chapter may serve as vantage points to commence conversations with Pretoria’s, and The City of Tshwane’s, collective community in order to arrive at intersections include the various tangible, historically relevant and current cultural heritage assets. It may well be that such intersections are charged with conflict and strife as illustrated by the recent protests against colonial heritage statues, as discussed in chapter 3 of this document. Nevertheless, in order to realise the intention of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach, it must be acknowledged that even conflict and strife may be regarded as a layer of the communal heritage of a people, and as a part of the historic urban landscape of a place.

As a flexible and organic tool, the HUL Approach must be considered in all its unorthodox splendour to unify the many and often contrasting layers of Pretoria’s (and the City of Tshwane’s) history into a relevant, current and useful historic urban landscape.
5.1.1 The early human history of the area that would later encompass Pretoria

Henri-Alexandre Junod was a missionary and renowned expert and writer on the natural sciences and anthropology. He contributed an article on the early human history of the area which comprises Pretoria to the centenary celebration publication of 1955 (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, pp. 61–85). I have extracted information from this article to describe the role-players in Pretoria’s initial history.

Junod reminisces about the local nurturing enfoldment of the landscape while gazing upon the natural setting of Pretoria from the mound of the Voortrekker Monument, and imagining prehistoric humans quenching their thirst from the clear springs in the green Apies Valley through the misty veil of the past (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 61). He further quotes Maria Bronkhorst on the Pretoria region in about 1844 (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 75):

... But the river and the rise to the left where Burgers Park now lies, was at the time a veritable lions’ den. So bad and dangerous were these and other ferocious wild creatures, that the men of our little settlement got into the habit of making a joint hunt along the river every Wednesday and Saturday. The river lower down, near the present Lion Bridge, was densely covered with reeds and bushes, making a safe lair for lions, jackals and hyenas, whose roars and cries resounded nightly along the mountains.

Tools from the stone age, estimated to be approximately a million years old, have been found on the quartzite ridge above the National Zoological Gardens and in excavations for the Zambezi Drive toll gate (Huffman 2010).

The earliest evidence of metalworking in the Pretoria region was found at Broederstroom, which lies to the west of Pretoria. Archaeologists identified several stratified villages, deemed to date back to between AD 550 and AD 700, complete with evidence of iron forging (Huffman 2010). According to Junod, the earliest known human inhabitants of the Apies Valley, were the Manala and Mabhena people, collectively referred to as the Mapoch people (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 66). This culture is now referred to as the ‘Pretoria Ndebele’, who resided in the Pretoria region under the reign of Chief Msi or Musi around 300
to 400 years before the centenary celebration of the capital of Pretoria in 1955 (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, pp. 64-65). It is believed that the name, Tshwane, is derived from a legendary Manala chief (Huffman 2010). Junod states that the Ndebele name for the Apies River is ‘Mbibana’ and the Sotho equivalent is ‘Tshwane’ (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 75). The Ndebele erected stonewalled settlements on the hilltops and along the slopes of the Apies Valley, emphasising a front-back axis.

Franco Frescura (1946), who was an expert on the self-built architecture of South Africa, recommends that references to form, building technology and decoration be sought via research in order to define the indigenous dwelling typologies of South Africa. Such references, as quoted by Frescura, are often to be found in the records of past travellers who explored the Southern African landscape (Fisher, Le Roux and Mare 1998, p. 17). The evidence proves that specimens of indigenous settlements in the area encompassing Pretoria, date back to the mid-17th century (Huffman 2010).

According to Junod, the ethnic population of Pretoria was composed of the Ndebele, the Sotho, the Tsonga and the Venda during the progression of the 20th century, with the North-Sotho people dominating the statistics. He states that Ndebele and Tsonga women where still seen wearing tribal clothing in Pretoria during the mid-20th century, while the men sported European dress. Ndebele architecture is quoted as visually pleasing, displaying colourful geometric designs not unlike the patterns and colours found on the traditional blankets of the Sotho people (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 66).

Figure 62: Ndbele people in tribal dress (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 65)
Figure 63: A drawing of a Ndebele dwelling demonstrates its architectural quality (South African History Online 2011)

Figure 64: Decorative images on Ndebele architecture. The walls are decorated with colourful geometric patterns (South African History Online 2011)

Figure 65: A young Northern Sotho woman in tribal dress (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 69)

Figure 66: Traditional Sotho blankets (Aranda 2018). Traditional Sotho blankets are manufactured from pure wool. These specific blankets are referred to as The Kharetsa, named after the spiral aloe, and display the iconic Basotho hat and shield motifs.
Junod lyrically paints the esoteric attributes of the different early cultures of Pretoria in this way:

- the Nguni as the ‘soldier’ of the Southern People,
- the Sotho is the ‘thinker’,
- the Tsonga is the speech artist,
- the Chopi (part of the Tsonga) the incomparable musician (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 68).

Considerable conflict existed between the black communities in Southern Africa between 1820 and 1832. This period is referred to as the ‘Mfecane’ or ‘Difeqane’. The settlement patterns and ethnic structures of the African people north of the Vaal River were altered as a consequence of tribal conflict during this period (Huffman 2010).

Mzilikazi, a general who fled from King Shaka’s army, orchestrated the destruction of the Bakwena and Ba-Hurutsi tribes. Mzilikazi settled in the area currently known as Pretoria, on the southern side of Meintjieskop. He erected two military kraals along the Apies River. One kraal was located north-west of Pretoria – on the road currently going to Hartebeespoort Dam – and the other on the Daspoort hills. During 1836, Mzilikazi was made aware of the thousands of White people approaching his land. Two attacks on the Voortrekkers, who were led by General Hendrik Potgieter, followed. Livestock was stolen from the Voortrekkers and a number of lives were taken during these confrontations. General Potgieter retaliated in 1837 and succeeded to send Mzilikazi fleeing across the Limpopo River (Huffman 2010). In 1835, some of the Voortrekkers eventually settled near the strong natural fountain at the site of present-day Fountains Valley. The first house was built in this area in 1840, with other houses appearing around 1848.
A parish was established in 1854 and a church erected on the square that evolved into Church Square, as we know it today.

In 1855, approval was obtained from the Volksraad to establish a town. Pretoria was named after General Andries Pretorius (1798–1853).

The Pretoria settlement of the early days was reminiscent of a close family living comfortably in a place of abundance, with running water that laced the gridiron of dusty streets.

In 1877, Harriet Roche gave the following description:

... the erection of the first small church in the position of the plane which was to become Church square, was the result of the volunteered efforts of stone-masons and citizens that laboured to prepare bricks, timber beams, mortar and cut grass and arranged transport of the materials (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 33).
Roche further reminisced that the weekly mail arrival was announced by a runner from Potchefstroom via Rustenburg during the 1850s. A kudu horn was blown, upon which all penned news was announced out loud on Church Square for all to hear, sharing the fortune and failure of the recipient (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 33). Townsmen conducted and bet on boat races along the water furrows. The boats were represented by pointed pieces of wood, which were marked for ease of identification.
5.1.2 Industrial and commercial history
The following information was obtained from the Pretoria Chamber of Commerce report for the centenary celebration publication, Pretoria 1855-1955 (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, pp. 111–125).

The existence of Pretoria is rooted in the fact that it was declared as a ‘Kerkplaats’ (church farm) and later on as the seat of Government. Church services were held on the Elandspoort farm, which drew traders and farmers from the district to sell their wares to congregants. After 1854, a church was erected on the square that evolved into what is referred to as Church Square today. The open space south of the church served as a marketplace.

The barter system was popular among the traders, with cattle and ivory as the main ‘currencies’. The first permanent trade structures or shops where erected on the periphery of Church Square, with the first shop where the Post Office was to be constructed later on.
The government’s introduction of the paper currency in 1868 was regarded with trepidation by the citizens, who continued to rely on the barter system for trade. The use of paper money was finally economically secured by 1872.

The British annexation of the Transvaal in 1877 brought about an influx of commercial consumers and boosted the humble economic settlement tremendously. Several banks were established including the Standard Bank, the Nederlansche Bank and later the Nationale Bank der Zuid-Afrikaanse Republiek Beperkt. The structure of the village evolved. Whereas trade had initially been centered on Church Square, a commercial corridor developed along Church Street – towards the new location of the market – east of Van der Walt Street.

The population gradually increased, bolstered by the influx of civil servants after 1880. Small shops replaced old residences in the area around Church Square and merchandising included a piano and organ business, hardware and timber stores, general dealers, ladies’ and gents’ outfitters, coffee rooms, bakeries, theatres, bar lounges, and boarding houses.

While the onset of the Anglo-Boer War in 1899 placed a damper on commerce, the consequent British occupation of Pretoria generated a financial boom, fuelled by the resultant military expenditure.

After the Anglo-Boer War, employees of the Netherlands Railway Company were out of work and had to start their own businesses, which further complemented the growing economic landscape of Pretoria.
As a garrison town, the seat of the government of the Transvaal and the railway centre for the Northern Transvaal, Pretoria continued to grow into a well-planned distribution centre, despite having to support an impoverished farming population after the cessation of the Anglo-Boer War and the Depression of 1905 – 1908.

The 31st of May 1910 witnessed the inception of the Union of South Africa, a decade after the ratification of the Treaty of Vereeniging, which ended the Anglo-Boer War. Pretoria was declared the administrative capital of the Union whilst Cape Town became the seat of parliament and Bloemfontein was pronounced the judicial capital.

The popular British architect, Herber Baker (1862-1946), had been employed by several British colonials of the time to design their residences in Pretoria. In addition, Baker was commissioned to design the Union of South Africa's new government buildings on Meintjeskop, a disused quarry, in 1909 (Schutte 2016).

Trade patterns evolved at the onset of the First World War (1914-1918):

- secondary industries were established due to importation difficulties and the 1920 economic slump caused a distribution revolution;
- chain stores, bazaars and department stores were established, and
- the small grocers and general dealers run by individuals, suffered a decline in numbers (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 124).
At the time of the centenary celebrations, the skyline of Pretoria boasted multi-storey buildings, housing a multitude of banks, banking headquarters and insurance institutions.

exhuberant than in other cities and that this trend is level with ‘Pretoria’s tradition of service’ (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 125).

The Pretoria Chamber of Commerce concludes its centenary review of the commercial progress in the city stating that Pretoria’s commercial development had been *dignified and less*
5.1.3 Municipal history

Professor E.F.W. Gey van Pittius from the University of Pretoria, who is the author of several publications on political and trade matters, prepared an article on the municipal history of Pretoria, from which the researcher extracted the information most relevant to this document (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, pp. 43–60).

A Mr A.F. du Toit was appointed as Pretoria’s first Landdrost (magistrate) in 1857. In addition to his duties as landdrost, he was responsible for the setting out of erven (stands), the management of sanitary issues, proper drainage of public areas, the procurement of water furroughs, and a dam.

The municipal management of the village of Pretoria was allegedly an unenviable task. Du Toit’s administrative agenda was ridden with difficulties, amongst which the lack of resources and funds were principal stumbling blocks. Taxes were imposed on market produce and erven, but not on the use of water. All taxes were payable to the Landdrost, but all expenditure had to be authorised by the government’s Executive Board. Du Toit eventually succumbed to despair and resigned as Landdrost on 31 December 1859.

Because of the fear of a consequential increase in taxes on land and goods, the citizens of Pretoria were reluctant to endorse their own elected town-council. The state of limited resources and funds continued under the tenure of the first mayor of Pretoria, P.J. Potgieter, who was appointed on 29 December 1898. One of the main problems was the supply of fresh water to the citizens of Pretoria.

The system was improved by the promulgation of the provision for an elected town council within a ward system during 1903. The period from 1902 to 1910 represented an era of great improvement in Pretoria’s municipal service delivery sector. The problems that had prevailed for decades were resolved by:

- channeling fresh water from the Fountains Valley,
- the establishment of an abattoir and a cattle market,
- neatened streets,
- the construction of new streets, and
- the planting of trees.

These interventions were funded with the taxes raised from the citizens and expenditure authorized by the City Council.
5.1.4 Military history

Professor F.J. Du T. Spies, a celebrated author on South African Defence Force maneuvers, had prepared an article which appeared in the Pretoria centenary celebration publication on the military history of the city (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, pp. 86–110). The researcher has included information from this article that was deemed to be of relevance to the description of a layered history of Pretoria.

The first military organisation since the arrival of the Voortrekkers in the area now known as Pretoria, was established during 1865, in correspondence with a requirement for civil protection in countless towns all over the country. The military unit, which performed regular routine military practices on Church Square, was referred to as the Pretoria Rifle Corps.

The artillery corps was established during the tenure of President T.F. Burgers, who ordered the erection of a fort in Pretoria. The artillery corps' headquarters and parade grounds were located behind the post office on the corner of Paleis and Vermeulen Streets.

Figure 76: The State Artillery unit in Pretoria during the time of president T.F. Burgers (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 89)

Figure 77: The State Artillery Unit in Pretoria at practice (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 95)
Military camps were established on the slopes of the hills south west of Pretoria during the British annexation between 1877 and 1881.

Figure 78: The military camp established at Pretoria during the British annexation between 1877 and 1881 (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 93)

The British forces built several forts on the hills south of Pretoria, but demolished these after the annexation of Pretoria (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 93).

By the end of the British annexation, the artillary corps was revived and the headquarters of the 'Transvaalsche Rijdende Artillerie' was established in Potgieter Street, at the previous location of the British military camp. This site was later developed into the military headquarters and new buildings were planned and erected from 1898 onwards.

In reaction to the Jameson Raid of 1895, four forts were erected on the hills around Pretoria by the South African Republic (Saks 2003). Two of the forts, those located on the Klapperkop and Skanskop Hills respectively, are well-preserved. The other two forts, Fort Wonderboompoort and Fort Daspoortrand, have succumbed to neglect and only ruins are identifiable.

Figure 79: Fort Skanskop is one of two well-preserved forts built on the hills that surround Pretoria (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 99)
After the end of the Anglo-Boer War, Pretoria served as the British Headquarters from 1900 to 1902 (Baker 1998). During this period, Lord Roberts initiated the establishment of extended military facilities on an elevated area to the south west of Pretoria, referred to as Roberts Heights. This complex was later developed into the Military College.
5.1.5 Cultural and social history
An article prepared by K. Roodt-Coetzee, a much published author of literature on social history, was studied in preparation of this section. Extracts from this article were composed by the researcher to contribute towards a description of the layered history of Pretoria (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, pp. 126–147).

Based on available records, it is widely accepted that the Bronkhorst family was the first ‘Voortrekkers’ to reside in the vicinity of Pretoria. It is estimated that they arrived on the banks of the Apies River during 1840.

After the Bronkhorsts, several other families halted for ‘outspan’ in the approximate vicinity of Burgerspark. These explorers soon assembled humble clay and lath adobes near the crystal clear fountain and lush vegetation of what is now known as the Fountains Valley, and along the Apies River. The area was regarded as habitable and without threat, regardless of the king of beasts that shared a preference for the shaded and bountiful habitats of what was to become Pretoria. Hunting was ‘n profitable business in those days, and hunting parties travelled through Pretoria towards Soutpansberg in pursuit of trophies and to trade in skins and ivory from afar.

Figure 81: The ruin of the first house built by Lucas, C Bronkhorst (1840) at Fountains (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 126)

In 1858, the landdrost, Andries F. du Toit, recorded that the citizens of Pretoria migrate northwards to the Bushveld during the winter months, leaving a desolate Pretoria. The hospitable people enjoyed each others’ company and often reinforced their alliances with marriages. Parties and gatherings were jovial and open for all locals to attend. Rood-Coetzee states that when
such functions were deemed to not be well attended, several volleys of gunfire were launched to encourage neighbours to join in the conviviality.

As the years strung along into decades, the basic lifestyle of the people of Pretoria evolved to embrace cultural joys. Singing, dancing, musical, and drama performances increasingly provided much entertainment and enrichment in their lives. Such pursuits were encouraged by Mrs Burgers, the Scottish spouse of President T.F. Burgers, who was the president of the South African Republic at the time.

The youth enjoyed participating in friendly games of cricket, football and croquet on the generous town garden lawns.

Figure 82: A programme from 1897, advertising an Operetta performed by the Pretoria Amateur Dramatic Society (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 144)

During 1860-1870, the cultural landscape of Pretoria was mainly populated by Afrikaners from the Cape and Germans, British and
Dutch people. The Afrikaner boer people visited the town on communion Sundays and in 1877 the presence of the British Commissioner attracted an especially large congregation. Gradually, the architecture of the town developed into elegant typologies, in response to the increased investment in culture.

Important events were celebrated by a visual display of honorary arches in foliage and flags and excited and dignified gatherings on the balconies of the government building on Church Square (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 146).

Figure 83: Church Square was decorated festively to mark the re-election of President Paul Kruger (1825-1904) as State President; the honorary arch depicted above was erected at the western entry to Church Square (Creare, 1973, p. 86)
5.1.6 The judicial and political history

Advocate A. Adrian Roberts (1890-1964) contributed a chapter on the judicial history of Pretoria in the centenary celebration publication (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, pp. 173–194). The researcher has used extracts from this article, together with relevant information from the internet sources listed in the introduction to Chapter 5, to describe the judicial and political history of Pretoria. It was decided to group these two topics together because political strategies are often reinforced by the promulgation of accompanying laws, as was the case in the tumultuous 20th century history of South Africa, with Pretoria as the administrative capital. The proclamation of laws in South Africa was also directly associated with the form and development of urbanisation during the 20th century. It is for this reason that the essay contributed to the research document published by the National Cultural History Museum in 1995, which was written by Dr R.C. de Jong, a specialist in Cultural History, was used as a reference for the history of Pretoria’s urbanisation in this chapter (De Jong 1995, pp. 17–80).

Based on the historic development of the urbanisation of Pretoria, five development phases can be identified. As the administrative capital of South Africa, Pretoria has been associated with the promulgation of the legislation required for the development of urban policies, which in turn affected the urbanisation process.

The first phase – from the 1830s to 1923 – constituted the permanent settlement of mainly White European farmers in the area. Then there followed a perceived increase and concentrated influx of Non-Europeans, who were under pressure due to the post-war economic depression and, later on, as a result of economic growth during the First World War (De Jong, 1995, pp. 22–32).

The second phase – from 1923 to 1950 – generated uncoordinated attempts at total residential segregation, which were regulated by the Natives Urban Areas Act, under which Marabastad was defined as a location. Forced removals to newly established locations where gradually implemented.

The onset of the third phase – from 1948 to 1959 – marked the coming to power of the National Party. Urban areas were subdivided on the basis of population classification, under new
legislation that was in accordance with the policies that won the National Party their majority vote. A policy of the forced removal of Non-European urban residents was rolled out in the form of massive resettlement projects and the destruction of old and established townships.

The fourth phase of urbanisation – from 1959 to 1976 – focused on the bantustans. A bantustan policy was developed in order to secure the European majority vote in the developed urban areas. The country, with Pretoria as the capital, acquired a bad reputation internationally. The city was rife with political unrest and also suffered under international boycotts preventing foreign investment (De Jong 1995, p. 44).


South Africa’s judicial system was constructed on the Westminster model (Mellet, Scott and van Warmelo 1982, p. 105). President Burgers amended the constitution of the South African Republic on 7 March 1877, to make provision for a high court where the administration of justice would be mandated (Ellis 2010, p. 48). The Supreme Court of Transvaal was seated in Pretoria’s landmark building, the Palace of Justice, and has been described as the strongest provincial Bench in the history of South Africa (Ellis 2010, p. 48). The first court building in Pretoria was established in an old school building and was referred to as the ‘Goewermentsgebou’ (Ellis 2010, p. 48).

![Figure 84: The Palace of Justice, early Pretoria 1900 (Ellis 2010, p. 48)](image)
The Palace of Justice was erected as the first official court building in 1897, on the corner of Andries Street and Bureau Lane (Ellis 2010, p. 48).

Pretoria developed into an urban settlement where many cultures thrived. From early on, racial and class segregation prevailed, but European, African, Indian and Coloured communities lived in relatively close proximity to the town centre and each other. The Non-European communities served European households and industries.

The area called Lady Selbourne came into existence in 1905 and was a racially mixed residential area where Africans were allowed to own land. The neighbourhood was included in the Pretoria municipality during 1949. Schoolplaats (1866), Old Marabastad (1880s) and New Marabastad (1900) also housed Non-European groups in townships with poorly constructed dwellings and virtually no services and no options for land ownership (De Jong, 1995, pp. 17–54).

The resettlement of the Marabastad citizens followed the City Council’s decision to establish a new sewage farm to the east of Old Marabastad in 1907. The City Council obtained authorisation from the colonial government to demolish the old location and relocate the citizens to the new location, much further away from the town centre and places of work (De Jong 1995, p. 56). Further removals from Lady Selbourne and Claremont followed during the 1960s. The ejections took place in favour of urban development and the segregation of living quarters (De Jong 1995 p. 64).

The following townships, with some establishment dates indicated, are known to have disappeared during the relocation process (De Jong 1995, p. 74):

- Schoolplaats,
- portions of Marabastad,
- the Cape Location (1892-1893),
- Lady Selborne and Claremont (1903-1905),
- Riverside and Eersterust (1905-1906),
- Eastwood (1905),
- Newlands (1905-1906),
- Bantule (1912),
- Highlands (1930),
- Kilnerton (1886),
The rise of Apartheid from 1948 onwards systematically implemented the idea of separate development towards securing White supremacy. The National Party won the 1948 elections and advocated a policy that supported Apartheid. Segregated Non-White residential areas were demarcated outside town boundaries, controlling racial interaction and limiting it to employer–employee relations. The policy was implemented with a series of laws that included the following and affected the urban landscape of Pretoria:

- the Prohibition of Mixed Marriages Act (1949),
- the Immorality Act (1950),
- the Population Registration Act (1950), and
- the Group Areas Act (1950).

The latter formed the foundation for an era of segregated development in Pretoria, and eventually led to political mobilisation during the 1970s and 1980s. The Separate Amenities Act (1953) and the Bantu Education Act (1953) followed upon the Group Areas Act in order to reserve amenities like parks, restaurants, etc., in towns for Whites only and limit Non-White people’s education levels.

The evidence of segregation is attested to by the townships around Pretoria (De Jong 1995, pp. 50–74):

- Atteridgeville (1939),
- Saulsville (1940),
- Hammanskraal (late 1950s),
- Mamelodi (1951),
- Mabopane,
- Laudium,
- Eersterus, and
- Garankuwa.

The built environment manifested evidence of the government’s lack of financial investment in the township infrastructure. Above and beyond the lack of proper roads, railways, parks, pavements, schools, etc., the most important element of neglect was housing. The conflict over the built environment caused mobilisation and uprisings that materialised in strikes, boycotts, illegal squatting, and violent protests.

Nelson Mandela (1918 – 2013), member of the African National Congress, headed a defiance campaign from 1952 onwards. He engrossed himself in the protest actions against unjust laws and was arrested and tried several times (Nelson Mandela Foundation 2018). Nelson Mandela, amongst several others, was charged for high treason on 2 December 1952. The trial started at the Old Synagogue in Pretoria, which was then owned by the government and used as a courtroom (South African History online 2012).

The historic Rivonia Trial of 1964 took place at the Palace of Justice on Church Square. The walls of the holding cells bear written testament to the convictions of several freedom fighters and trialists. Nelson Mandela made his historic speech while standing in the dock inside this building, condemning racial segregation and thereby memorialising the proceedings as ‘the trial that changed South Africa’ (Rivonia Trial 1963 -1964; South African History Online 2011). The Freedom Charter can also be seen on these walls (Nelson Mandela Foundation 2011).

Figure 86: Nelson Mandela in 1961 (Trials and prisons chronology – Nelson Mandela Foundation 2018)
After conquering the road to freedom, Nelson Mandela was inaugurated as South Africa's first democratically elected President on 10 May 1994. He resided in Bryntirion Estate in Pretoria and served as the head of government in the Union Buildings, where he also laid in state for three days before his funeral in 2013.
5.1.7 The history of the press

H.P.H. Behrens, who had been the editor of the Pretoria News and an official in the City Council of Pretoria, contributed an article on the history of the press in Pretoria to the centenary celebration publication of 1955 (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, pp. 332–360). The researcher has used extracts from this article to describe the layered history of Pretoria with reference to the development of the published word in the city.

The first regular publication in the Transvaal, the Staats Courant der Zuid-Afrikaansche Republiek, was issued in Pretoria on 18 August 1863.

The Republikein was Pretoria’s first newspaper and appeared in May 1864 for the first time. There was, however, a yearning for a more patriotic newspaper in the Transvaal. Contributions were made by high-level citizens to make this possible and the editorship was offered to Jan Francois Celliers, then part of the editorial staff of Het Volksblad in Cape Town. Celliers accepted the offer and established the new voice of the Transvaal under the name De Volksstem, which first appeared on 8 August 1873.

De Volksstem flourished to such an extent that the Staats Courant could eventually also be printed in Cellier’s works.

Figure 91: Two covers of the ‘Government Gazette’, circa 1863 and 1902, depicting the transformation between the respective publication dates (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 334)
De Volksstem was initially printed weekly in Dutch. Even though Celliers introduced an English version alongside the Dutch, an anti-British undertone remained intact up to and during the British annexation of Pretoria. Celliers expanded his press empire by obtaining the contract for the Staats Courant. Another weekly paper, Land en Volk, appeared for the first time on 10 October 1888. In contrast to the patriotic De Volksstem, this publication offered lively criticism of the government. Well-known Arikaans poet, Eugene Marais made regular contributions to Land en Volk under the name ‘Apteker’ (Barnard 2012). ‘Apteker’ often targeted Sytze Wierda, then chief of ‘Department Publieke Werken’, with satirical attacks on the fruits of his service. The controversial Marais later owned Land en Volk and continued to heckle both citizens and government with his weekly revelations and literary attacks on the press (Barnard 2012).

Figure 92: ‘De Volksstem’ newspaper (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 337). A depiction of the office of ‘De Volksstem’ in Church Street East, together with several title pieces and date lines from a collection of publications.
Other newspapers printed during the developing years of Pretoria, were:

- *News of the Camp* (1880);
- *The Transvaal Advertiser* (1882 - 1907);
- *De Pers* (1889);
- *The Press* (1889);
- *The Weekly Press*, and
- *The Mercantile Advertiser* (1880).

Leo Weinthal established the *Pretoria News* after he left the Press Group in 1897. The *Pretoria News* is the only 19th century newspaper that is still in publication today. Newspapers printed during the 20th century in Pretoria, up to the centenary year, include:

- *The Pretoria Chronicle* (1908);
- *The Transvaal Chronicle* (1908-1912);
- *The Transvaal Independent*;
- *De Oude Emigrant* (1938);
- *The African Advocate* (1947);
- *White Africa* (1948);
- *De Week* (1912), and
- *Het Volk* (1913).

The last publication of *De Volksstem* was on 30 March 1951. According to H.P.H Behrens, it had been one of the oldest Dutch or Afrikaans newspapers in the country (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 357).
5.1.8 Sport history

J.C. Vlok prepared an article on the history of sport in Pretoria, which was included in the centenary celebration issue of 1955 (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, pp. 231–243). Vlok was hailed as an expert on the history of sport in Pretoria and served on both the boards of the Pretoria Rugby- and Pretoria Cricket Clubs. The researcher included extracts from his article to further describe the layered nature of the history of Pretoria.

Horse racing, rugby and cricket were among the first organised sports recorded in the city. Horse racing was recorded as a sport in Pretoria as far back as 28 February 1873, when the Pretoria Turf Club was established. Rugby was regarded as the country’s national sport later on and the first games, dating back to 1873, took place on Church Square. The Pretoria Rugby Club was formed in 1873.

The Pretoria Cricket Club was established in 1873 with F.C. Rex as secretary. Cricket was played on Church Square, with a ball made of rawhide, corks and twine, sewn into a permanent sphere by a Hottentot shoemaker.

R.L.O. (Loftus) Versfeld founded the Pretoria Rugby and Football club in 1888. He also acted as coach and administrator for the club and consistently applied his efforts to improve the playing conditions in Pretoria. As the town developed, it became increasingly difficult to play on Church Square. Burgers Park proved inadequate to facilitate the growing interest in sport participation since croquet and tennis were also popular at the time. General Nicolaas Smit secured the lease of an area which later became Berea Park. This area and the Caledonian Sport Grounds served as a venue for rugby matches. The players had to prepare the field surfaces before every match until Loftus
Versfeld succeeded in planting a strip of kikuyu grass on the present Loftus Versveld stadium, as an experiment towards improving playing conditions. The experiment succeeded and the turfing of football and rugby fields was applied throughout the Transvaal as a result.

The early Pretorians also participated in athletics and swimming. It is recalled that Henry Nourse, a versatile sportsman and renowned athlete at the time, was once challenged by a British soldier to jump over a buck wagon. His successful completion of this challenge preceded the first athletics meeting during the British occupation up to 1881. The first swimming gala was held in the Apies River. Later on, a swimming pool situated above the Sunny Side tram bridge facilitated galas.

Bowls was initially played at the residence of J.C. Poynton, across from Burgers Park. The Pretoria City Club was
established at the Caledonian Sports Grounds later on, where the first bowling green was laid out in 1907.

Cycling became popular during the late 1880s. A cycling club, of which General Piet Joubert was reportedly the honorary president, was established. During 1890 the Caledonian Sports Grounds were reserved as a cycling track.

More types of sport followed in consequent years and playing fields and clubs were founded in the town and what later became the city. The sports included hockey, baseball, basketball, netball, softball, badminton, jukskei, squash, and tennis.
5.1.9 Educational history

Dr Jan Ploege (1913-1994) was a renowned author on the subject of Education in South Africa. He prepared an article on the history of education in Pretoria, which was included in the centenary celebration publication of 1955 (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, pp. 195–230). The researcher has included extracts from this article to conclude the description of the layered history of Pretoria.

During the era from 1852 to 1900, the education of young Pretorians was a combined effort between church organisations and private individuals. The first government school building was erected on erf 288, bought in 1860 and comprising the western side of the land on which the Palace of Justice was built in later years. The school consisted of 2 sections, representing subjects in Dutch and English.

Figure 96: The first school building (indicated by the red arrow), was located on the western portion of the area where the Palace of Justice was erected and still stands today, Pretoria (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 198)
By 1882, government support for the establishment of schools increased under a new Education Law. The law explicitly made provision for the improvement of the education of European citizens (Mentz et al. 1976, p. 18).

In the education report of 1882, it is mentioned that the amount of government subsidised schools in the Republic amounted to 9 and the amount of pupils to 206 during January of that year. By the end of 1882, the same figures had prospered to 43 and 872, respectively. Eight of these schools were in Pretoria, one in the centre of town and seven in peripheral areas.

In accordance with the new Education Law, provision had to be made for places of higher education. Consequently, Wessel Louis started a learning institution in a residence on the corner of Prinsloo and Church Streets, introducing admission examinations on 6 January 1883.

The establishment of several more Pretoria schools followed consequent to 1883:

- The Staats Model School was established in 1893;
- The State Girls School, later Hamilton Primary School, and State Gymnasium were established in 1894;
- The Staats Meisjes Skool was erected between 1898 and 1899 (South African History Online 2015);
- Oosteind School, founded in 1897 (South African History Online 2011) and erected in 1903, is one of the oldest surviving primary schools in Pretoria;
- The establishment of the Afrikaans Hoër Seunsskool, and Afrikaans Hoër Meisieskool can be traced back to 1920, when it was started in a residence in Visagie Street;
- The inception of the Pretoria Boys’ High School, and
- The Pretoria High School for Girls can be traced back to 1901 and 1902, respectively.
Schools under specific religious denominations were also established. The oldest faith-based schools were:
- Loreto School and Christian Brother College (Catholic) and
- Mirriam Marks School (Jewish)

Tertiary educational institutions were established post-1900, of which –
- The Normaal College (1902),
- The Transvaal University College (1910),
- The University of Pretoria (1930),
- The University of South Africa's Transvaal quarters (1953) and
- The Pretoria Technical College (1925)
represent several of the institutions for further learning that are still in use today.

Before Apartheid, many black pupils attended missionary schools where a classic curriculum consisting of religious studies
and languages (for example, Latin) was followed. In later years, many missionary schools were closed, rather than supporting the laws and regulations of the Apartheid system (African Studies Centre 1994). In Pretoria, the Berlin Missionary Society played a large role in the provision of humanitarian services, including education. Remnants of this complex are situated on what is currently demarcated as the Daspoort Sewage farm. The former church, together with a prior school structure to its west (not depicted), are the only remnants of the part of Marabastad that had been demolished by 1920. Black people received a comparatively good education at such religious settlements before the onset of Apartheid. While it is not known which denomination operated this complex, Clarke (2008) surmises that it may have been part of the Berlin Missionary Society at Schoolplaats.
5.1.10. The history of town planning and architecture in Pretoria: The transformation of a settlement into a structured city in and over time

Professor A.L. Meiring, Head of the Department of Architecture at the University of Pretoria during 1943, prepared an article on the town planning trends and architecture of historic Pretoria for the centenary celebration publication of 1955 (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, pp. 148–172). The researcher has used extracts from this article, together with information from the publications by Professor Schalk le Roux, called *Plekke en Geboue*, volumes 1, 2 and 3 (Le Roux and Botes 1991; Le Roux and Botes 1992; Le Roux and Botes 1993) to describe the tactile-built-heritage layers as a vantage point for considering the historic urban landscape of Pretoria. Professor Schalk le Roux is an acclaimed author on the subjects of architecture and heritage conservation.

Regardless of the remnants of the layered cultural expansion of more than 150 years, the most pronounced features of Pretoria remain its natural qualities. The natural features are presented by the topography and include the valleys, hills and rivers that embrace the boundaries of the original town and today's vibrant city core.

Once upon a time, during the centuries and decades that preceded the arrival of the Voortrekkers, the wild and untamed setting of today's Pretoria teemed with human and animal life in and around the then clear Apies River. A hunter, Cornwallis Harris, testified to his astonishment at observing this landscape – abundant with wildlife – from a raised vantage point in approximately the 1830s. Archaeological evidence, found in the Sunnyside area, indicate that this receded zone in the landscape had been a marsh, approximately one-hundred-and-sixty years ago, and that primitive hunters had ambushed animals for slaughter and consumption.

In later decades, suburbs developed along the indentations of the natural contours. This topography to the north and south of the locale we now know as Church Square, elegantly creates natural entry portals that suggest a north-south axis of which -

- the southern entry is gained through Elandspoort and
- the northern entry is gained through Wonderboompoort,

where the zoological gardens were later established.
Figure 100: The natural features surrounding the area that would later comprise the settlement of Pretoria, consist of the topography that allows entry portals, suggesting a north-south axis, with Elandsport to the south and Wonderboomport to the north. The diagrams above depict a progression of the urban development of Pretoria, subtly guided by the topography (Jordaan 1987).

Figure 101: The western, eastern and northern boundaries of the historic core of Pretoria are demarcated by rivers; the southern boundary is represented by a hill, Salvokop. The diagrams above depict a progression of the urban development of Pretoria (Jordaan, 1987).

The urban plan of Pretoria corresponds to the traditional urban layouts of ancient Roman towns, which were designed according to regular patterns similar to the layout of their military camps. These regular layouts consisted of parallel streets. The Decumanus Maximus formed the main artery and was intersected by the Cardo Maximus at right angles, dividing the town into four quadrants. The place where the Decumanus Maximus and the Cardo Maximus intersected, typically formed
the centre of the town and was also the location of the main town square, such as in Pretoria where:

- Paul Kruger street is equalled to the Decumanus Maximus,

- Church Street is equalled to the Cardo Maximus with Church Square at its intersection

According to Lynch (1981), the organisation of regular patterns in the ancient world also concurred with notions of:

- the sacred centre,
- the axial line of procession and approach,
- the dominance of up versus down, and
- the diverse meanings of the cardinal directions due to their relative positions to the sun and the seasons.

Therefore, it follows that the organisation of the Cardo and Decumanus, relative to the positions of the sun and the seasonal conditions in Pretoria, indicated that:

- North represents warmth,
- South represents cold,
- East represents birth or beginning, and
- West represents death or decline.
Nestled in the folds of a valley, the north-south axis is reinforced by the straight line of Paul Kruger Street (formerly named Markt Street), which is central to the historic city and parallel with the Apies River and Steenhoven Spruit. A water furrow originating at the Fountains was located on the east of Paul Kruger Street. The water was reportedly crystal clear, suitable for household consumption and abundant enough to irrigate domestic crops.

Church Street crosses Paul Kruger Street in an east to west direction, celebrated by Church Square at the resultant intersection. The intersection of the two main streets at Church Square dynamically generates four quadrants on the city grid, each characterised by its own contributions of heritage characteristics, which will be discussed later in this chapter.

The western, eastern and northern boundaries of the historic core of Pretoria are still demarcated by the rivers. Church Square, as the crossing point of Paul Kruger and Church Streets, is the most prominent and symbolically significant open space on the city grid. In addition, it presents cultural, historical and architectural heritage qualities of national significance. Apart from the ruins of the original Bronkhorst settlement at the Fountains, the area comprising the city blocks around Church Square is perceived to be the oldest part of Pretoria and contains a rich and varied collection of buildings, of which the oldest are in excess of a hundred years. This area is properly defined by Schalk Le Roux as the area bounded by (Le Roux 1992, p. 4):
(Bosman) Lilian Ngoyi and
(Potgieter) Kgosi Mampuru Streets to the west;
Salvokop to the south;
Nelson Mandela Street to the east, and
Boom Street and the National Zoological Gardens to the north.

Open spaces secondary to Church Square were established during the development of the old city:
- Burgers Park,
- Pretorius Square in front of the City Hall,
- Station Square,
- Sammy Marks Square, and
- Strijdom Square.

Less formally defined open areas include the locations around religious buildings:
- Kruger Church,
- Groote Church,
- Du Toit Street Church,
- St Alban's Church,
- Cathedral of the Sacred Heart, and
- The Old Synagogue.

Important streets include:
- the southern part of Paul Kruger Street (because of its strong built-up enclosure of worthy heritage resources),
- Minnaar Street, and
- Boom Street (because of their tree-lined edges).

These streets are regarded as benchmarks for the further identification of streets with equal heritage significance.
Four distinct quadrants radiate from Church Square at the centre of the city grid. The character of each quadrant is formed by its shape and state of preservation, as will be illustrated in the discussion below.

**The south eastern quadrant** refers to the area of historic Pretoria that is situated to the south of Church Square and east of Paul Kruger Street. This site offers the heritage elements that are best conserved and are being renovated and re-used, rather than demolished and replaced. Its dense urban grain is nurtured by its lively neighbour, Sunnyside. This quarter offers promising hints towards regeneration suggested by a prevailing variety of building types and uses, crisply defined open spaces and strong entry portals.

*Figure 107: Block map of the South eastern Quarter of historic Pretoria, showing area concentrations of heritage resources (Le Roux 1992, p. 56)*
The north eastern quarter refers to the area of historic Pretoria that is positioned to the north of Church Square and east of Paul Kruger Street. This area contains strong built elements that contribute significantly to the urban environment. Whether or not historical or architectural values prevail, the buildings represent measured cultural values in time and space. The urban grain of this area is less dense than its neighbouring equal to the south of Church Street because of the cultural, political and economic engagements over time. Open spaces are unsatisfactorily defined and much of it is unappreciated and unused. Slow progress in regeneration of the loosely knit urban fabric in this quarter is the cause of the steady decay of the existing heritage integrity of the urban fabric.

Figure 108: Block map of Pretoria showing area concentrations of heritage resources in the north eastern quarter (Le Roux 1992, p. 56)
The north western quarter contains buildings that represent Pretoria’s development through all the decades, since its establishment. These heritage resources are dispersed loosely amid openings left on the city grid in the wake of political decisions. Much heritage- and economic value is generated by the vibrancy of Marabastad on the northern side. Natural elements in combination with the remnants of the fine urban grain of Marabastad provide great heritage potential in this quarter.

Figure 109: Block map of Pretoria showing area concentrations of heritage resources in the north western quarter (Le Roux and Botes 1991, p. 103)
The south western quarter offers the least coherence in texture within the city grid, which has a detrimental effect on the heritage value of this part of historic Pretoria. Streets are not strongly articulated architecturally, urban and architectural entrance portals are weakened by indiscriminate development that disregards hierarchy and heritage. Open spaces are left undeveloped and without the political struggle status of their northern counterparts.

Figure 110: Block map of Pretoria showing area concentrations of heritage resources in the south western quarter (Le Roux and Botes 1993, p. 12)
In summary, according to Le Roux (1993):

Areas with large collections of tangible heritage resource remnants in Historic Pretoria

1. On and around Church Square

2. Between Pretorius Square and Burgers Park in the southern quarter

3. Around the Pretoria Station

Figure 111: Block map of Pretoria, showing the largest remaining concentration of heritage resources in historic Pretoria (Le Roux and Botes 1993, p. 57)
5.2. Understanding the Historic Urban Landscape of Pretoria

Supported by the overview of Pretoria’s history, it follows that a rich layering of tangible and intangible components exist. An assessment of the perceptions of local community members – past, present and future – concerning the historical strata of the Capital City of South Africa, will lead towards a definition of the historic urban landscape of not only Pretoria but the greater City of Tshwane.

The definition of the Historic Urban Landscape must involve an understanding of the historic layering of cultural and natural values as perceived by the collective community.

The research into the Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape Approach and related precedents has led to the recognition that the definition of the historic urban landscape must involve an understanding of the historic layering of the cultural and natural values and attributes of a particular place, as perceived by the collective community. As outlined in UNESCOs (2011a, p. 2) HUL Approach, such layers must be identified in accordance with the following categories:

The categories of identification towards the definition of the historic urban landscape of a particular place, as recommended by UNESCO:

1. The Geomorphology
2. The Topography
3. The Hydrology and Natural Features
4. The Built Environment
5. Infrastructure above and below ground
6. Open Spaces and Gardens
7. Land-use Patterns and Spatial Organisation
8. Perceptions and Visual Relations
5.2.1 The topography

Pretoria is nestled in the Eastern Magaliesberg Mountains and features the following pronounced hills: Bronberg, Cable Hill, Daspoortrand, Diamond Hill, Klapperkop, Kwaggasrand, Langeberge, Meintjeskop, Pyramid Koppies, Skanskop, Skurweberg, Thaba Tshwane or Voortrekkerhoogte, and Waterberg.

Figure 113: Historic map of Pretoria, circa 1903 (UCT Library Digital Collections 2018) The town of Pretoria as depicted in 1903 by the Surveyor General. The contours clearly show the gentle and protected topography of Pretoria, allowing access through Wonderboompoort to the north and Elandspoort to the south. The positions of the forts are highlighted on the map and accentuate the importance of the hills surrounding the Administrative Capital of South Africa: Wonderboom Fort, West Fort, Schanskop Fort, and Klapperkop Fort.
Natural and manmade thoroughfares were identified and established during Pretoria’s years of development. These are commonly referred to as a ‘poort’ or ‘nek’ (pass or mountain pass). The names of these points of access to the city suggest that some early Voortrekkers and farmers deliberated and laboured on these features: Baviaanspoort, Derdepoort, Hornsnek, Ondersteapoort, Pienaarspoort, Saartiesnek, Silikaantsnek, Swawelpoort, T.F. Martinspoort and Wapadsnek.

The City of Pretoria’s settlement within the hilly landscape of the eastern Magaliesberg Mountains contributes several significant aspects to the historic urban landscape. The study of the history of Pretoria developed the researcher’s understanding of certain significant topographical aspects that influenced the past local communities’ perceptions. These perceptions manifested in their reactions to the natural topography of the site where Pretoria was started.

The further development of these already established aspects will be of cardinal importance regarding where the Historic Urban Landscape Approach will be implemented in future.

The topography of Pretoria contributes the following aspects to the HUL:

1. Natural thoroughfares through the hilly outcrops enabled a protected urban setting.

2. Natural thoroughfares through the hilly outcrops allowed the bi-axial layout of the classical urban plan, with the Cardo and Decumanus crossing at the centre, where the town square originated.

3. Natural topography allowed for the easy channelling of crystal clear water from the Fountains Valley to the centre of Pretoria at Church Square.

4. Natural topography formed vantage points on the hills from where the urban settlement could be protected, and enabled the establishment of the following forts: Wonderboom Fort, West Fort, Fort Schanskop, and Fort Klapperkop.

5. Natural topography was celebrated as ceremonial places of significance and marked by monuments such as the Voortrekker Monument (1937) on Monument Hill and Freedom Park (2000) on the ridge of Salvokop.
5.2.2 The geomorphology

Geomorphology refers to the study of the physical features of the surface of the earth and their relation to its geological structures (Oxford University Press 2018a). The researcher considers the lack of available research on the geomorphology, specifically of the areas comprising the historic centre of Pretoria, as a limitation to this study. The following geological features justify an in-depth study regarding the geomorphology of historic Pretoria to obtain a holistic definition of the historic urban landscape:

- The presence of sinkholes in areas to the south, due to the presence of dolomite, and
- The existence of abundant water below the surface in and around Pretoria, and
- The hills and streams that delineate the edges of historic Pretoria.

Upon the future implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach, investigation of the significance of the Pretoria area’s geomorphological aspects will be of cardinal importance.
5.2.3 **Hydrology and natural features**

The prevalence of groundwater, rivers and streams played a principal role in the establishment and development of the City of Pretoria. The Bronkhorst settlement (1840) was situated next to the life giving natural fountain, around which the town and the city eventually developed.

Up to the 1930s, Pretoria’s water supply was drawn from the natural ‘Upper’ and ‘Lower’ fountains as indicated on the adjacent image. It was during the 1930s, that the first man-made feature, the Rietvlei Dam, was added to the water network of Pretoria.

---

*Figure 115: The natural upper and lower fountains of Pretoria (Oxford University Press 2018a)*

*Figure 116: A drawing, prepared by the author, indicating the position of rivers in relation to historic Pretoria (Annexure A)*
Several historic features relating to the management and celebration of water in the city remain to be visited and admired today. These include, but are not limited to, pump houses, remnants of the water furrows, water retaining structures, structures built to protect the fountains, the water fountain donated by Sammy Marks – which was moved from Church Square to the National Zoological Gardens – and the water feature at the Fountains Circle entrance to Pretoria.

Figure 117: Water structure historic Pretoria - pump station built by the British circa 1898 (Panagos 2003)

Figure 118: Water structure historic Pretoria - masonry funnel leading to sump at the pump chamber (Panagos 2003)

Figure 119: Water structure, historic Pretoria. The structure built to protect Grootfontein Fountain (Dippenaar 2013)
A very informative publication that represents a hydrological heritage overview of Pretoria’s fountains was recently launched by the Water Research Commission in collaboration with the University of Pretoria. (Adams 2013). This publication, together with an audio-visual presentation, empower the citizens of Pretoria on the heritage and life giving importance of the groundwater system (Water Research Commission 2013).

Parks and nature reserves that were established around the natural hydrological features of Pretoria testify to the natural wilderness as described by Maria Bronkhorst in the early years. (Engelbrecht et al. 1955, p. 75).

These parks are:
- Burgers Park,
- Magnolia Dell,
- Jan Celliers Park,
- Venning Park,
- Austin Roberts Bird Sanctuary,
- The Fountains Valley, and
- The National Zoological Gardens

The Groenkloof and Rietvlei nature reserves form part of a groundwater protection strategy (Adams 2013).

One of the prominent natural features of Pretoria is the ‘Wonderboom’, a 1000-year old fig tree situated to the north of the Magaliesberg Mountain. The tree was discovered in 1836 by Voortrekkers who named it. The name can be translated as ‘Wonder Tree’, in reference to its sheer size and mythical appearance. The tree is over 25 metres in height and the trunk is in excess of 55 metres wide. It was declared a national

Figure 120: The Fountains Valley is located 3.2km from the city centre; it boasted lawns, a swimming pool and an open air dance floor during the 1960s. Historic Pretoria (English 1966)
monument and the area around it was set aside as a nature reserve, offering respite from the bustling city streets.

**Figure 121:** The Wonderboom (Wonder Tree) could give shelter to a thousand people before it was damaged by a fire and parasite infestations, historic Pretoria (How South Africa’s 1000-year old tree looked 100 years ago 2016)

**Figure 122:** The Jacaranda trees of historic Pretoria were introduced to the city as early as 1880 (Gopretoria 2009)

Full-grown Jacaranda trees are regarded as a natural feature associated with the City of Pretoria. Jacaranda trees, which are indigenous to South America, were introduced to Pretoria during 1888. Since it had been planted in abundance on the city’s pavements by the local authority, the month of October in Pretoria has always been tinged with a luminous purple hue. Today it is estimated that between 40 000 and 70 000 Jacaranda Trees decorate the streets of Pretoria, affording it the name ‘Jacaranda City’. Due to its exotic status no new Jacaranda trees may be planted but existing adult trees may be retained. Upon the future implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach, the further development of these established hydrological aspects and the natural features of the landscape will be of cardinal importance.
Identified hydrological and natural features that justify an in-depth study so as to contribute to the definition of Pretoria’s historic urban landscape

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A</th>
<th>Hydrological Features:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Sub-surface ground water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Rivers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Man-made structures associated with the management and celebration of water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Parks that include water bodies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>B</th>
<th>Natural Features:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The Wonderboom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The Jacaranda Trees</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.2.4. The built environment (historic and contemporary)
As directed by the Heritage Resources Act of 1999, the researcher prepared an evaluation of the heritage assets in historic Pretoria during 2012 in order to refine the existing heritage grading system (Republic of South Africa 1999). The evaluation involved desktop studies, site inspections and research into the available resources on the subject of the built environment of historic Pretoria.

The result of the evaluation is judged to be appropriate for inclusion in this document, albeit in summary format, to demonstrate the quality and extent of the coherence, or lack thereof, of the heritage fabric made up of the built environment in historic Pretoria.

A legend had been developed to translate the heritage importance of varying levels of assets in the historic centre of Pretoria, into groups that respectively represent:

- Existing heritage status,
- Recommended heritage status and
- Level of intervention required and/or recommended.

The considered assets include the built fabric and open spaces and streets, varying from elements listed as grade I, II and III (Republic of South Africa 1999). Elements categorised into a new system developed by the researcher and identified as grades A – C; grades a - c and, lastly, assets resorting under prioritised interventions for the most urgent cases of deterioration or threat of deterioration.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Heritage Resources – Conservation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>listed buildings SAHRA grade I: documented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>listed areas SAHRA grade I: documented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>buildings recommended for listing as grade A and older than 60 years to be listed for their individual qualities under the Act; to be equal to grade I when listed, important to conserve building as a whole</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>areas recommended for listing as grade A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>buildings recommended for listing as grade A less than 60 years old to be listed for their individual qualities under the Act; to be equal to grade I when listed, important to conserve building as a whole</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Heritage Resources - Open for Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>buildings recommended for listing as grade B older than 60 years to be listed for their individual qualities under the Act; to be equal to grade I when listed, important to conserve building as a whole</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>areas recommended for listing as grade B</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 123: Map of historic Pretoria (1903), (UCT Library Digital Collections 2018). The area comprising historic Pretoria as depicted on a hand-drawn map from 1905; this area was evaluated by the author in 2012 and the adjacent evaluation legend was consequently developed and applied to a contemporary map of historic Pretoria.

Right: Legend informing the evaluation study applied, suggesting specific types of proposed intervention for most urgent cases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Heritage Resources - Prioritized Intervention</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>buildings in most need of regeneration: cosmetic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>buildings in most need of regeneration: restoration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>buildings in most need of regeneration: change of use</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend suggesting specific types of proposed development for most urgent cases

- buildings recommended for listing as grade B less than 60 years old to be listed for their individual qualities under the Act; to be equal to grade I when listed, important to conserve building as a whole
- buildings recommended for listing as grade C older than 60 years to be listed for their individual qualities under the Act; to be equal to grade I when listed, important to conserve building as a whole
- areas recommended for listing as grade C
- buildings recommended for listing as grade C older than 60 years to be listed for their individual qualities under the Act; to be equal to grade I when listed, important to conserve building as a whole
- street recommended as heritage asset: protect trees
- street recommended as heritage asset: protect vista
- street recommended as heritage asset: protect specific building line / vertical facade(s)
- street recommended as heritage asset: original footprint of the city centre, aged 150 years +
- river / stream recommended as heritage asset

Legend suggesting specific types of proposed development for most urgent cases

- buildings in most need of regeneration: cosmetic
- buildings in most need of regeneration: restoration
- buildings in most need of regeneration: change of use
Figure 126: This heritage evaluation study, prepared by the author, demonstrates assets worthy of conservation (which are marked according to the legend), within the built environment in the historic centre of Pretoria (Annexure I).
It is clear from Figure 126 (Annexure I), that a rich layering exists in the built environment of historic Pretoria. These layers represent and witness the city’s progress from a hamlet next to a fountain to the administrative capital of South Africa.

The heritage evaluation study for the built environment (Annexure I) demonstrates the shortcomings of the official heritage resource data base (Republic of South Africa 1999):

- The current database representing respectively Grades I, II and III of the Heritage Act is not regarded by the researcher to be comprehensively representative of heritage assets of national, provincial or local importance;
- The existing regulatory system under the Heritage Act does not make provision for the evaluation of assets which are not older than 60 years but worthy of preservation and conservation.

The additional evaluation criteria suggested by the researcher have been developed to demonstrate consideration of both these shortcomings:

The incomprehensive existing heritage database is being complemented by additional heritage assets worthy of conservation and identified by the researcher. These assets have been categorised in accordance with the provisions made for buildings worthy of protection, varying in historic relevance and age, relative to the 60 year benchmark referred to in the Heritage Act. The additional criteria are being referred to as ‘Grades A, B and C.

Category A generally equates to the highest ranking level of importance, which calls for restoration and the absolute minimum amount of intervention.

Categories B and C generally equal levels of conservation that allow for intervention and adaptive reuse.

In all three categories – A, B and C – provision had been made for differentiation between buildings worthy of conservation older than 60 years and not older than 60 years (Republic of South Africa 1999).
Figure 127: The heritage evaluation study, prepared by the author, demonstrates the built environment in the historic centre of Pretoria and the most vulnerable assets that require urgent restorative intervention (Annexure C).
Figure 127 demonstrates that some of the oldest and once dignified buildings in historic Pretoria are at risk of deterioration. It is clear from the heritage evaluation study executed by the researcher during 2012, that the urban fabric around the neglected structures is fragmented and unresponsive. The buildings, therefore, not only require urgent regulatory protection, repairs and regular maintenance but also the application of revived usage and functionality within the historic urban landscape or Pretoria.

The researcher has therefore developed additional evaluation criteria to represent differentiation in the perceived state of heritage assets in the built environment, which have been subject to neglect and/or vandalism.

The additional criteria are being referred to as three levels of controlled intervention that represent prioritised intervention and are differentiated in grey, red and black colour codes.

Investigation of the significance of the following aspects of the built environment of the Pretoria area will be of cardinal importance concerning the future implementation of the HUL Approach:

| Identified heritage aspects in the built environment that justify an in-depth study so as to contribute to the definition of the historic urban landscape of Pretoria |
| 1. An evaluation of the built environment of historic Pretoria has proved that rich potential exists for the establishment of heritage conservation as a central governing approach to sustainable development, which is a core consideration of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. |
| 2. The heritage protection system represented in the National Heritage Resources Act is deemed to be an incompetent tool for the identification and protection of heritage resources worthy of conservation. |
| 3. Ample opportunity exists for the development of a more sophisticated heritage classification system, as demonstrated in the researcher’s heritage evaluation investigation executed in historic Pretoria in 2012. |
| 4. Several heritage resources in the built environment of historic Pretoria are at risk of permanent deterioration, as identified in Annexure C. |
5.2.5 Infrastructure above and below ground: railways, tramways, roads and water

President Paul Kruger was set on the establishment of a railroad connection between Pretoria and the coast after the victory of the British at the battle of Majuba in 1881. Consequently, the Netherlands South Africa Railway Company (NZASM) was established in 1887 to construct a railway line between Pretoria and Lorenzo Marques (Maputo) (Old Pretoria Society 1996 pp. 3–9). Several relics from the NZASM period have survived the modernisation of the railway services in Pretoria, including the Salvokop precinct, railway tracks and stations, culverts, bridges and buildings built by the NZASM. Detailed information about the surviving structures is obtainable from a recent report called ‘NZASM Footsteps along the tracks’ (Clarke, Fisher and Simelane 2016)

Horse-drawn trams provided public transport as from 1897. During the early 1900s electricity replaced horse-power in the tram business.

Figure 124: Horse-drawn tram on Church Square during the late 1800’s, historic Pretoria (Melvin Residence, 2014)

Figure 125: Two trams at Church Square with the tram station in the background (Schutte 2018)
The Tram Shed (1912), on the corner of Van der Walt and Schoeman streets, and a few tram halt structures, are surviving landmarks of the tramway systems. Remnants of the original tram tracks were exposed on Church Square recently, during the precinct ‘upgrade’ to accommodate the A Re Yeng rapid transport bus system (Schutte 2018).

Figure 126: The remnants of the original historic tram tracks were exposed during a construction project on Church Square; the tracks are still in a good condition, as depicted above (Melvin Residence 2014)

Figure 127: Historic map of Pretoria, showing the route of the tram tracks through Church Square (in yellow), connecting Paul Kruger Street in the south with Church Street to the east (Melvin Residence 2014)

The heritage evaluation study prepared by the researcher during 2012, demonstrates that the existing road network is still intact in central historic Pretoria, as illustrated in Annexure J. Vehicular traffic, however, increased during the 20th century. The water furrow system that the landdrost and surveyor, A.F. Du Toit, established during the late 1800s, consisted of skilfully built shale channels on the shoulders of the roads. An excavated sample of such a water furrow is on display in front of the State Theatre within central historic Pretoria.
The existing railway lines, which are indicated in green on Annexure J, are located along the periphery of central historic Pretoria, with stations within walking distance thereof.

Figure 132: Transport routes of historic Pretoria (the Author). The existing road network is still intact in central historic Pretoria. Traffic flow around Church Square isolates the most important of the urban spaces. The existing railway lines are indicated in green and are located along the periphery of central historic Pretoria, with stations within walking distance thereof (Annexure J).
The addition of the high-speed Gautrain service and the A Re Yeng Rapid Bus Transit System, represent a big step by the provincial and local authorities towards the improvement of public transport in Pretoria. Concerns regarding the undiscerning and inappropriate approaches taken in the implementation of these systems in historic Pretoria have been raised within the heritage fraternity. Some, for example, have posted complaints on The Heritage Portal about the fact that traffic, in the form of public transport, is allowed to flow around Church Square, which isolates the most important of Pretoria’s urban spaces from pedestrian access, activities and the surrounding urban fabric (The Heritage Portal 2017). Further concerns regarding the scale, safety and obtrusiveness of architectural interventions on Church Square were also noted on The Heritage Portal in the same discussion.

**Electricity and sewer services**

Electricity was introduced to Pretoria in 1892 by a company called Siemens and Halske (ESKOM 2018).

Remnants of trickling ponds at the Daspoort Sewage farm are an example of excellent stone masonry.

![Figure 128: The trickling ponds at the Daspoort Sewage Farm are an example of excellent stone masonry, dating from the 1920s (the Author)](image)

**Cemeteries:**

The Church Street Cemetery was established in 1867 and is also referred to as ‘Heroes’ Acre’. Many prominent historical figures, such as both British and Boer soldiers who fought in the Anglo-Boer War and several former state presidents, have been buried in this historic cemetery (City of Tshwane 2018). Unfortunately, this significant heritage area, in close proximity to Church Square, has suffered significant neglect and vandalism in recent years. The Pretoria East Rekord reported
in 2015 that the Heroes’ Acre had become home to vagrants and subject to vandalism (Pretoria East Rekord 2015).

Figure 129: The Heroes’ Acre, also known as the Church Street Cemetery, is currently in disarray and subject to vandalism, as is evident from the missing tombstone in the image above (Pretoria East Rekord 2015)

Investigation into the significance of the following aspects involving the infrastructure above and below the ground of the Pretoria area, will be of cardinal importance concerning the future implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach.

Aspects of the infrastructure that justify further study to define Pretoria’s historic urban landscape

1. The infrastructure, as related to transport, is a significant aspect of the historic urban landscape. Original heritage artefacts, amongst which the original tramlines buried below road surfaces, the Tram Shed, the original NZASM structures, and the footprint of the original road and railway network, have remained intact. Current investment into and the expansion of the public transport infrastructure often has a detrimental impact on the existing tangible heritage resources related to transport.

2. The stone sewer trickling ponds dating from the early 20th century at the Daspoort Sewage Farm, present unique and significant heritage values related to the tangible and intangible aspects of heritage conservation.

3. The Church Street Cemetery or Heroes’ Acre is of great significance in the tangible and intangible heritage conservation realms. This heritage area is currently under threat of destruction due to a lack of security, management and maintenance.
5.2.6 Open spaces, parks and streets

Historic Pretoria is associated with several urban parks, which still flourish today. As a city with exceptionally good weather and a community predisposed to the outdoors, the open spaces and parks play a significant and relevant role in the city. In order to understand the perceptions of past, present and future members of the local communities as regards the role and importance of open spaces in Pretoria, the researcher has identified some of the prominent open areas and gardens that represent tangible and intangible heritage significance as well as technical refinement.

Parks

The Pretoria National Botanical Garden was established to the far east of the city in 1946, and replaced the previous botanical gardens, Burgers Park, which was founded in the 1870s. An avenue of Wisteria along Cussonia Avenue is one of its striking features (Esterhuyse, von Breitenbach and Sohnge 2001, p. 35). The Pretoria National Botanical Garden proudly boasts international benchmark features in the form of the National Herbarium, which is the fourth largest herbarium in the Southern Hemisphere and the International Peace Garden (1997) (Esterhuyse, von Breitenbach and Sohnge 2001, p. 36).

The indigenous themes of Springbok Park (1905) and Jan Cilliers Park (1962) bloom patriotically. Springbok Park, named after South Africa’s national animal, is distinguished by the White Stinkwood trees that were planted in groups of three during 1930 and the fact that it was also declared a National Monument in 1979. Jan Cilliers Park is also known as Protea Park in reference to the abundance of this species, which is also South Africa’s national flower (Esterhuyse, von Breitenbach and Sohnge 2001, p. 36).
Austin Roberts Bird Sanctuary not only embraces the hydrological heritage of Pretoria in the form of the wetland system around which it is featured, the park also provides shelter and a breeding habitat for thousands of birds, antelope and small veld animals in the heart of the city. Austin Roberts Bird Sanctuary was declared a National Monument in 1980 and boasts in excess of 170 bird species (Esterhuysen, von Breitenbach and Sohne 2001, p. 37).

Burgers Park and Melrose House (1886) are regarded as an important ensemble from the late Victorian era. Burgers Park was declared a National Monument in 1979. The Canary Palms, which were planted in 1910, bristle like pointy crowns in the hot Pretoria breezes and are as much admired by tree specialists as the Moreton Bay fig trees, planted in 1913 (Esterhuysen, von Breitenbach and Sohne 2001, p. 38). Several trees were planted during the late 1800s and 1900s to mark special occasions, like the Orange Tree in honour of Queen Wilhelmina (1898), an English Oak (1906) as a symbol of the British Empire and a White Stinkwood (1932) on the anniversary of the birth of George Washington (Esterhuysen, von Breitenbach and Sohne, 2001 p. 38).

Pretoria is affectionately known as the Jacaranda City, named after the 40 000 to 70 000 Jacarandas that lace the street grid of the city. This exotic tree has grown popular since it was imported from Argentina in 1880. Today, the Jacaranda is entrenched in the culture of Pretoria: a local radio station was named ‘Jacaranda FM’ and a legend among the students from the University of Pretoria holds that ‘if a Jacaranda blossom lands on your head, you will pass all your year-end examinations’ (The Jacaranda City, 2009)

Additional important historical parks in Pretoria include:
- Venning Park;
- Magnolia Dell;
- Rietondale Park;
- The Voortrekker Monument and surrounding natural park;
- The Union Buildings and surrounding park;
- Freedom Park and surrounding natural park, and
- Groenkloof Nature Reserve.

Urban Squares
As discussed in chapter 5.1.10 of this document it follows that:
Church Square is the most important historical urban square in Pretoria.

The following open spaces or urban squares are regarded as secondary in importance to Church Square:

- Burgers Park;
- Pretorius Square in front of the City Hall;
- Station Square;
- Sammy Marks Square, and
- Strijdom Square.

The following open or urban spaces are regarded as less formally defined and mostly represent the areas around religious buildings:

- Kruger Church;
- Groote Church;
- Du Toit Street Church;
- St Alban's Church;
- Cathedral of the Sacred Heart, and
- The Old Synagogue.

Important streets include:

- The southern part of Paul Kruger Street (due to its enclosure of worthy heritage resources),
- Minnaar Street and
- Boom Street (due to their tree-lined roadsides).
Streets
Four factors have been considered in the identification of streets to be discussed as examples of areas where tangible and intangible heritage significance can be pointed out:

- the original street grid of Pretoria, exceeding 150 years since its establishment in 1855;
- streets with well-defined roadsides consisting of mature trees;
- streets with well-defined peripheries consisting of good typological buildings, and
- streets that frame important vistas.

The original city grid is still distinguishable as the four quadrants around Church Square. The street grid of old Pretoria terminated to the east of Church Square at the Apies River. Historical entry points into the city were at the Caledonian Sport grounds over Lion Bridge and at Rissik Street. The historic city grid included Burgers Park to the south. In the 1857 survey, the south western quadrant ended on the corner of Paul Kruger Street (the Market street) and Visagie Street, where Pretorius Square is today. The south eastern quadrant stopped in Scheiding Street, between Andries (Thabo Sehume) and Du Toit (Lilian Ngoyi) Streets (Le Roux and Botes 1993).

The significance of the 150-year old street pattern is revealed in the surviving elements that can still be identified:

- the importance of Church Square as central to the city grid;
- the importance of the river and the intersection of the waterway with the urban grid, which includes Lion Bridge and the Caledonian sports grounds;
- the importance of Pretorius Square in the hierarchy of the urban grid main axis along Paul Kruger street;
- the termination-point of Paul Kruger Street at Scheiding Street;
- the crossing of Paul Kruger Street over Proes (Johannes Ramokhoase) Street, and
- the Schubart Street section from Visagie to Proes (Johannes Ramokhoase) Street.
Streets with well-defined edges consisting of mature trees

The most prominent tree-lined streets are located in the east-west direction on the urban grid. The types of trees that define the street verges vary between Jacaranda and Plane trees:
Boom Street: Jacaranda and Plane trees
Proes (Johannes Ramokhose) Street: Jacaranda trees
Visagie Street: Jacaranda trees
Minnaar Street: lined with mature Jacaranda trees to the west of Burgers Park and with mature Plane trees to the east of Burgers Park

The tree canopies that protect the sidewalks are characteristic of Pretoria and the blossoming Jacaranda trees gave Pretoria its reputation as the Jacaranda City.

**Streets with well-defined edges consisting of valuable typological buildings**
The defined quality of street edges has been systematically eroded during historic Pretoria’s evolution from a late 1800s settlement to a contemporary 21st century city dominated by vehicular traffic. It was attempted, therefore, to identify the best typologies to serve as generators of a beneficial definition along certain important streets. These definition generators vary from high-quality typological examples of period architecture to demure structures that simply honour a constant building line along the street front.

The oldest parts of Church and Paul Kruger Streets – in close proximity to Church Square – display well defined street borders, in which instances the building typologies are well preserved.

The following streets are perceived to possess potential for improved definition:
- Boom Street
- Visagie Street to the north of Pretorius Square
- Gerhard Moerdyk Street
- Read Avenue
- Tuleken and Loop Streets
- The current street grid in the Salvokop precinct

**Streets with important vistas**
Street vistas are mainly focused on important natural settings or architectural elements. The Witwaters Mountain or Daspoort Rand to the north of the city form a focal point which is visible from all south to north streets westward of Church Square, especially from 7th Street and Jerusalem Street in Marabastad and Potgieter and Bosman Streets. Panoramas in the southern
direction, from Potgieter and Bosman Streets, focus on Salvokop.

Views onto architectural elements include the Union Buildings (Struben and Proes or Johannes Ramokhoase Streets), the old Natural Cultural History Museum in Boom Street (Thabo Sehume Street), the Station Building and Paul Kruger's monument (Paul Kruger Street). The Sammy Marks fountain, currently located in the National Zoological Gardens, offers potential value as a street vista, if relocated to an appropriate position on the city grid.
Figure 139: The Heritage evaluation study, prepared by the author, demonstrates the spaces and historically significant tree lined streets of Pretoria (Annexure D).
Areas
Several clusters of heritage structures that were originally associated with specific areas or movements remain intact in the urban landscape of Pretoria. The cohesion of the typologies of such areas reinforces the motivation for heritage conservation. During the 2012 heritage assessment of historic Pretoria the researcher identified a collection of such clusters in special areas. These areas are listed below to serve as a vantage point for further assessment towards the definition of the historic urban landscape of Pretoria.

The Pretoria Show Grounds
This area in Pretoria West was demarcated as an open area dedicated to recreation, as testified by the earliest maps:

- in 1929 it was labelled as a race course,
- in 1950 it was labelled as sport grounds.

Today Pilditch stadium and its amenities occupy the south-western corner of the district, which spans four city blocks in the east-west direction and three in the north-south direction. This area is significant as a large-scale open space for recreation and celebration and contains significant typologies worthy of conservation.

Overzicht Village
This cluster comprises Gerhard Moerdyk Street from the Kotze Street intersection southwards, towards the intersection with Walker Street. It is known as The Overzicht Arts Village and consists of a cluster of old cottages, which were built at approximately the turn of the 19th century. The village boasts theatres, craft shops, restaurants and an education museum. The historic Memorable Order of the Tin Hats (MOTH).Club Hall (1948) is in the vicinity.

The houses are mostly in a good condition and still radiate the intimacy of a fine-grained mixed use residential neighbourhood.

The National Zoological Gardens (1899)
This precinct, also known as the Pretoria Zoo, was established in 1899. The Apies River flows through the National Zoological Gardens and is crossed by two bridges. Pathways of approximately six kilometres in total meander through the grounds and a cable car links the top of the hill to an area close to the entrance. It is regarded as one of the largest zoological gardens in the world. A collection of the
original structures is still nestled amongst the folds of the zoo. Many of these buildings are currently in disuse and at risk of deterioration.

Aslan’s Village (1920s)
The quaint residential area to the east of the National Zoological Gardens consists of two north-south streets, laced with almost completely preserved rows of houses, circa 1920s. The houses are not all in a good condition but still radiate the intimacy of a fine-grained residential neighbourhood.

Marabastad (1880s)
The urban texture of Marabastad has gradually been eroded through the coordinated township-removal-and-segregation-legislation, which resulted in the destruction of previously inter-cultural urban settlements. Several historic resources and stories of cultural significance survived the 20th century relocations and the passage of time. These surviving elements include important zones, streets and buildings that represent events in history and are described in Annexure F.

The city infrastructure, in the form of vehicular routes, service delivery and access control, isolates Marabastad and nearby spaces from the vibrant urban fabric that surrounds it. As evident from the study of the built environment, deterioration of the historic fabric has accelerated because the places surrounding those resources are either in disuse or alienated from the city fabric. These locations, including the existing built structures, require urgent regulatory protection, repair, regular maintenance, and the application of revived use and functionality within the historic urban landscape of Pretoria.

The Westfort Village (1927)
Salvokop NZASM Village (1892-1898)
Figure 134: Map of Marabastad - important places and stories (the author). Marabastad is an example of an area of cultural and historic significance where spaces, streets and buildings survived the forced relocations of the 20th century (Annexure F).

Investigation into the significance of the following aspects involving the open spaces, parks, streets and areas of Pretoria will be of cardinal importance where the Historic Urban Landscape Approach is being implemented in future.
## Aspects of the open spaces, parks, streets and areas that justify further study to define the historic urban landscape of Pretoria

1. As a city with exceptionally good weather and a community predisposed to the outdoors, the open spaces and parks play a significant and relevant role in Pretoria.

2. Several parks of national significance exist in Pretoria. These parks date from the establishment of Pretoria in the 1800s to the middle of the 20th century. Several trees with symbolic and heritage significance have been preserved in these parks.

3. A hierarchy of formal urban squares exist in historic Pretoria, with Church Square regarded as the most prominent and important urban square.

4. Several less formally defined urban squares or spaces exist in historic Pretoria, mostly around religious buildings.

5. Streets within the original historic urban footprint of Pretoria are categorised with reference to their proximity to Church Square, the definition of its urban edges by means of natural or man-made elements and the vistas focused upon.

6. Several areas with clusters of heritage resources have been identified as remnants of historic Pretoria. The cohesion of the typologies of such areas and the memory of stories related to these areas reinforce the motivation for heritage conservation.
5.2.7 Land-use patterns and spatial organization

Historic Pretoria is incorporated into the City of Tshwane metropolitan municipality, which in turn is located in Gauteng, the smallest but most densely populated province of the Republic of South Africa.

The growth and development of Pretoria has been closely linked to spatio-political ideology and decision-making (Hatting and Horn 1991). The spatial organisation was, therefore, dictated by post-colonial, segregation and Apartheid planning phases (Lemon 1991a)

The latter influence prevailed for more than forty years. During this period the city flourished economically and expanded significantly. It was, however, also under the Apartheid regime that the culmination of urban segregation into urban separation left a very specific mark on the footprint and collective memory of the city. The land-use patterns and spatial organisation of Pretoria and the City of Tshwane testify to the damaging history of segregation, which was formalised under the Apartheid regime.

A brief overview of the development and shaping of urban spaces in Pretoria is given below, supplemented by explanatory diagrammatic representations of the spatial organisation and land-use patterns that contribute to the historic urban landscape.
The following urban structures emerged during the history of urbanisation in South Africa:

i. The colonial urban structure (1855 – 1910)
ii. The urban structure of segregation (1910 – 1948)
iii. The urban structure of separation or the Apartheid Stad

i. The colonial urban structure (1855 – 1910)
The early urban settlement of Pretoria consisted of a densely populated urban core with substantial structure and form. Residential areas were settled along the periphery of the urban centre but were notably fragmented, void of structure and culturally segregated under colonial influences. The tendency was for people with the same cultural backgrounds and living patterns to group together spontaneously and reside in physically separate and haphazardly organized quarters of the city, with the European groups favourably positioned in relation to the economic core.

ii. The urban structure of segregation (1910 – 1948)
During the era after 1920 and up to 1948, it was evident that the urban structure of South African cities became increasingly segregated. This tendency resulted from:

a. The presence of diverse ethnic groups that immigrated from Europe,
b. The rapid urbanization of local ethnic groups and
c. The absence of administrative policies at the local authority level to direct urban development (Olivier and Hatting 1985).

Figure 136: A spatial model of Pretoria, a segregation city, circa 1948 (Olivier and Hatting 1985, p. 49)
By 1948, Pretoria notably presented a segregated urban structure that consisted of the following spatial patterns:

- Fragmented albeit definitively stratified residential areas which were populated by Europeans;
- Separate residential areas, which were populated by local ethnic groups;
- Areas where shacks or rooms were inhabited by single members of indigenous ethnic groups, with or without their families, in the residential areas established by Europeans, and
- Urban areas (squatter camps) where informal residential structures were populated by families from native ethnic communities.

### iii. The urban structure of separation – the Apartheid city (1948 -1994)

The onset of Apartheid started with the Group Areas Acts of 1950 and 1966 (later on), as administered by the newly elected National Party Government. The Acts had a far-reaching effect on the urban structure of Pretoria and, consequently, the spatial pattern of the urban environment. Urban planning was governed by the ideological concept of the forced physical and geographical separation of cultural and ethnic population groups. Pretoria rapidly conformed to the spatial prescripts of the Apartheid city in the following observable instances:

- A central business district, which was dominated by the European cultural groups;
- Separate areas dedicated to industries, which simultaneously formed buffer zones between residential areas allotted to different cultural groups;
- Strongly segregated residential areas, which were separated by buffer zones;
- Consolidation of residential areas populated by Europeans, and
- Concentration and marginalisation of residential areas for Non-European ethnic or cultural groups along the periphery of the urban spaces.
The motive behind this separation model was the prevention of full proletarianisation and to hinder the rise of radical consciousness. This ideology became manifest by keeping the different ethnic groups confined to partially self-governing Bantustans or homelands assigned to the different indigenous groups – under the governance of their traditional leaders, chiefs or kings – according to a codified form of customary law. An intricate network of influx control, whereby Africans came to the cities temporarily to work on fixed-term contracts, at the end of which they had to go back to their ethnic homelands, complemented this model (Hickel 2012).

v. The postmodern city or multiple city system (1994 to date)

The following changes occurred in Pretoria during the 20th century: large-scale migration from rural areas, increased urbanisation, separate development, extensive suburbanisation, and peripheral growth (du Plessis and Landman 2002, p. 2).

South African cities were organised in concurrence with the Apartheid separation policies, as well as modern Euclidean
planning principles that led to singular zoning and private vehicle-dominant urban environments. These are recognisable in the land-use patterns and spatial organisation of urban nodes. Three categories have been identified by Prof Dave Dewar, namely (Dewar, 1992 pp. 243–245; Myers 2010):

- low-density sprawl
- fragmentation and
- separation

The first spatial characteristic, low-density sprawl, is represented by three respective processes referred to as:

- Speculative sprawl – formalised as isolated entities on the city grid that include privatised amenities for wealthy people. This consumer bracket became a target group for developers with country estates on offer;
- Low-cost housing schemes – which were established on the urban fringes and
- Illegal squatting – which represented the housing solutions devised by people who were unable to legally reside in a designated housing area or who sought to reside in close proximity to their workplaces or family members.

Fragmentation is the second spatial characteristic and is represented by the coarse-grained and fragmented urban pattern, which developed in accordance with a subtle cell-forming formula. Simplified movement hierarchies were developed, mainly consisting of freeways and main roads that link these isolated neighbourhoods.

Separation is the third spatial characteristic and encompasses the separation of land usage, racial- and income groups. This characteristic represents single-use zoning, which was referred to in Chapter 2 of this document.

The application of the single-use zone planning approach resulted in cities with all the tell-tale characteristics of the enemy of sustainability: urban sprawl. The development method led to isolated residential, educational, industrial and commercial neighbourhoods, excessive crime in urban areas, vast travel distances, congested roads, and ineffective or inconsistent services. The above concerns are all prevalent in South African cities, to varying degrees. Historic Pretoria and the Tshwane Metropolitan urban system is no exception.
According to Myers (2010), post-colonial regimes often improved upon the strategies of Colonial (Apartheid) administrations, thereby becoming even more exclusivist, authoritarian and segmented.

One could, alternatively, reflect with Saunders (1988) that in South Africa, as elsewhere, arguments about the past have often reflected hope for the future.

Hickel (2012) suggests that structural transformations generated by the State’s social engineering programme opened the door for new forms of consciousness ... The researcher concurs with Anthony Lemon (1991b): ... that Colonial formal segregation and especially Apartheid practices have moulded distinctive city forms which are currently experiencing great pressures ... which may soon be open to the imprint of quite different urban management practices that will hopefully include the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach.
5.2.8 Perceptions and visual relationships
This last section of the study into the definition of the historic urban landscape of Pretoria is applicable to a harmonious intersection of the intangible and tangible aspects of the layered historic urban landscape.

The researcher has identified the title of this subsection as a cohesive entity, understanding that where perceptions refer to the respective ways in which something is regarded, understood or interpreted, visual relationships represent the tangible demonstration of such perceptions.

As an architect, the researcher understands that a balanced and harmonious design project is expected to demonstrate balanced and harmonious visual relationships. In an instance where visual relationships depend upon perceptions, it follows that it is of cardinal importance to commence the processes required to attain the desired well-proportioned and congruent heritage conservation outcome, at the combined perceptions of the collective community.

The author understands that the Historic Urban Landscape Approach can only succeed where and when the intersection of the tangible and intangible heritage aspects of a place have been convincingly considered, grasped and usefully applied. Such an intersection is realised where perceptions and visual relationships that represent the intangible and tangible aspects of the layered historic urban landscape are agreed upon or when, at the very least, equilibrium concerning contrasting perceptions had been reached. It follows, therefore, that the collective community’s perceptions of a layered heritage representing past, present and future, will guide the ultimate definition of the historic urban landscape in Pretoria.
This section illustrates some of the current perceptions on aspects of heritage conservation in Pretoria, as observed by the researcher.

Van der Klashorst (2013, pp. 17–18) expresses a strongly negative viewpoint when stating that Pretoria radiates a geography of power that emanates from its status as South Africa’s capital city and the imprint of the Apartheid era (1948 – 1994), which admittedly remained in the nation’s and the world’s collective memory. Pretoria has remained at the zenith of the state’s bureaucratic infrastructure through the passage of time until today.

Van der Klashorst’s statement can be regarded as credible when the recent vandalism of heritage resources in the historic centre of Pretoria is considered. Church Square and the immediately adjacent city blocks predominantly resulted from the building efforts of British colonialists and Afrikaner pioneers. Citizens of the ‘Rainbow Nation’ now seek to establish another layer to the identity of this precinct at the heart of historic Pretoria, namely the core of an African city. In this instance, the 21st century citizens of Pretoria have expressed their opinions in support of the removal of Paul Kruger’s statue from Church Square (Ngcobo 2015). This occurred in sympathy with the successful drive to remove the statue of Cecil John Rhodes at the University of Cape Town (Hess 2015a).

*Figure 139: The Paul Kruger statue defaced with green paint on Church Square (Ngcobo, 2015)*
In contrast with the Church Square vandalism, Titus Matiyane, artist from Phupo Street in Atteridgeville, perceives the circumstances he grew up in as a catalyst for creative action. He states that: *poverty made me brilliant, because I know the struggle. I did everything myself, with my mind, my hands and hard work.* This steady resolve and positive attitude regarding the circumstances – from a man that was born during the Apartheid era – led him to create his first painted panorama of the township of Atteridgeville in 1992. The consequent panoramic painting of Pretoria and Tshwane radiates colourful life and optimistic promise. Titus’s artworks are internationally acclaimed and he states that he sells most of his works to municipalities, governments and universities abroad. He further states that he has, unfortunately, not yet received the support of the Department of Arts and Culture in South Africa. Nevertheless, Titus has teamed up with Cool Capital in ventures to enliven art in the city of Pretoria (Ndhlovu, 2018).

Echoing Titus’s admirable approach in a difficult set of circumstances, the larger than life statue of Nelson Mandela at the Union Buildings graciously symbolises the rising buoyancy engendered by reconciliation.
Figure 140: Titus Matiyane and artwork (Ndlovu, 2018). Titus Matiyane is a self-taught panoramic artist from the Apartheid era township of Atteridgeville.

Figure 141: Titus Matiyane’s depiction of Pretoria (Ndlovu, 2018). A section of his panoramic artwork of Pretoria/Tshwane.
Cool Captial is a non-governmental initiative based in Pretoria, which involves partners from the public, private and academic realms to effect positive change as regards local and national perceptions of the administrative capital of the Republic of South Africa. The desired change is effected through a multitude of small projects with significant impact, such as:

Figure 142: The Voortrekker Monument illuminated in pink and purple to draw the community’s focus to the City’s rich cultural heritage (2014) (Cool Capital 2016)

Figure 143: Cool Capital Arts Festival (Cool Capital 2016). An arts festival was held at the Open Window Art School in Centurion where the interests of the collective community of Tshwane and Pretoria were represented.
WitOpWit (WOW) is a concept factory that operates under the auspices of Cool Capital. WOW focuses on the production of ideas inspired by urbanism and South African cities, which culminate in décor products, stationery and themed events. WOW is committed to eliciting conversations via the urban heritage products they offer. One of the products in the range, developed for the City of Pretoria, depicts Pretoria as a three-dimensional undulating landscape of heritage concepts. The project was called City-in-a-Box: Pretoria and displayed several of Pretoria’s main heritage assets against the surrounding hills in the background. The Voortrekker Monument, the whale skeleton located at the entrance to the Ditsong National Cultural Historical Museum, the statue of Paul Kruger on Church Square, and the Telkom Tower on Lukasrand are included in City-in-a-Box (WITOPWIT, 2018).

Other projects included:
Square in Pretoria: a hand-drawn map of the historic centre of Pretoria was transferred onto rigid cardboard and divided into nine blocks of equal size, which could serve as coasters or artworks.

Hang Pretoria: a jewellery range based on visual images of Church Square and Paul Kruger.
Re-imagine Pretoria: the city was depicted in the form of wooden building blocks that represent actual buildings extrapolated from the map of the historic inner city.
Local designer and illustrator ‘I am Lezanne’, uses her perceptions of the collective community or ‘Rainbow Nation’ of South Africa to illustrate celebratory messages on Heritage Day (24 September) and Women’s Day (9 August), which are posted on social media.

The gigantic statue of Nelson Mandela in front of the Union Buildings is balanced on the symmetry of his jovial and all-encompassing gesture, so typical of Mandela, against the stark and symmetrical backdrop of the building. The visual composition of the two contrasting elements translate Apartheid’s tense political heritage to the current perception of inclusion rather than separation.
Investigation into the significance of the following aspects involving perceptions and visual relationships will be of cardinal importance regarding the future implementation of the historic urban landscape in Pretoria:

### Aspects concerning perceptions and visual relationships that justify further study to define the historic urban landscape of Pretoria

1. The concepts of *perceptions* and visual *relationships* were dealt with by the author as a cohesive entity in this documented section.

2. It is understood that *perceptions* and visual *relationships* affect each other: either positively or negatively.

3. The collective community of Pretoria includes citizens that are rebellious and negative and residents that are positive and inspired by their perceptions of the relevance of the city’s heritage resources and the history it represents.

4. Both groups act on their convictions and demonstrate their perceptions visually. This is where the tangible and intangible heritage aspects of Pretoria intersect.

5. The intersection of the tangible and intangible heritage aspects of Pretoria is identifiable and this documented section serves to illustrate how similar intersections, where community participation is required, can be identified to settle heritage conservation concerns. It follows that this aspect is applicable to the definition of each of the layers of the historic urban landscape.

6. In order to properly prepare for the potential implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in Pretoria, this intersection of the tangible and intangible heritage aspects must be convincingly considered, grasped and usefully taken forward. The onus is on Pretoria’s local authority to gain momentum towards considering the perceptions and visual relationships held by the collective community and to properly define the historic urban landscape of Pretoria, in order to implement the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in future.
Diagrammatic representation of the Historic Urban Landscape of Ballarat, Australia

Diagrammatic representation of the Historic Urban Landscape of Pretoria, South Africa

Final comments on the refinement of the Historic Urban Landscape diagram for historic Pretoria

A diagrammatic representation of the anticipated historic urban landscape of Pretoria was generated at the conclusion of this study. In acknowledgement of the resolution reached on the importance of the perceptions and visual relationships layer, this layer was illustrated as an all-encompassing three-dimensional aspect of the historic urban landscape instead of a two-dimensional plane in the diagram. The hierarchy of the layers was refined by placing the most vulnerable aspects of the Historic Urban Landscape at the apex of the diagram.

Figure 149: Graphic representation of Ballarat – HUL (City of Ballarat 2017a) Annexure Li.

Figure 150: Graphic representation of historic Pretoria – HUL – Annexure Lii (the Author)
5.3 Summary of the steps required for defining the study area

A study into a wide variety of sources proved that Pretoria has a rich and layered history.

For the purpose of this research project, the history of Pretoria was categorized into sections corresponding with the sections included in the Centenary Celebration Publication published by the City of Pretoria in 1955. By doing so a structural framework was established for the research. This enabled the author to consider as many aspects as possible with regard to the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria.

The following table indicates how the study into the layered history of Pretoria, a framework of which was obtained from the content of Pretoria in 1955, informed the definitions and conclusions reached in the study in order to define the historic urban landscape of Pretoria.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HUL category</th>
<th>Pretoria in 1955 category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 The Topography</td>
<td>4 Military history</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 The Geomorphology</td>
<td>6 Other sources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Hydrology and natural features</td>
<td>1 Early human history</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 The built environment</td>
<td>3 Municipal history</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Infrastructure above and below ground</td>
<td>2 Industrial and commercial history</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Open spaces, parks, streets, and areas</td>
<td>3 Municipal history</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Land-use patterns and spatial organization</td>
<td>6 Judicial and political history</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10 History of town planning and architecture</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
After concluding the study into the history of Pretoria, the researcher was able to structure an understanding of the potential substance of each layer of Pretoria’s historic urban landscape. A set of conclusions on each layer category for the historic urban landscape was arrived at, in accordance with the UNESCO HUL categories. Core statements that represent the perceived substance and potential for further definition of each layer in the Historic Urban Landscape were formulated.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Layer</th>
<th>Perceived substance and potential for further exploration:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Topography</td>
<td>The topography of Pretoria is perceived as a pivotal aspect to its establishment and sustenance through the centuries. The particular topography of the area afforded Pretoria controlled access to the urban settlement, inspired the classical cardo-decumanus urban layout, allowed access to fresh water, and facilitated protection of the urban settlement during warfare. Ceremonial places and significant monuments are celebrated on the hills of Pretoria. Each aspect of the topography is still relevant today and presents rich potential for further exploration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Geomorphology</td>
<td>It is concluded that the geomorphology of Pretoria does not make a significant contribution to the historic urban landscape, other than for reasons of precaution. Nevertheless, it is recommended that further study into the historic relevance of the geomorphology of Pretoria be executed and tested against the intangible concerns of the historic urban landscape.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusions on the understanding of the layers of the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria

3. Hydrology and natural features

The hydrological aspects of Pretoria’s historic landscape is considered to be pivotal to its establishment and continued celebration of natural features. Groundwater, freshwater fountains, rivers, and man-made structures associated with the management and celebration thereof, present an opportunity for further research to define this HUL layer. The natural features identified include significant trees: the Wonderboom and the surviving Jacaranda trees that visually define the city in springtime with hues of purple.

4. The built environment

The built environment of Pretoria includes historic and contemporary structures. For the purpose of this study, all built resources considered worthy of conservation are referred to as historic. The National Heritage Act does not make provision for the sufficient identification and protection of the historic built environment. Many heritage resources identified within the historic built environment of Pretoria have been neglected over the years and are currently at risk of deterioration. Further research into the refinement of the Heritage Act to identify and protect all heritage resources, even contemporary structures, is required. The implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach will afford the buildings at risk of deterioration a new lease on life.

5. Infrastructure above and below ground

The transport systems in Pretoria are relevant to its historic layering and the contemporary development of the city. A considerable amount of resources are currently invested into these systems, to the detriment of some heritage resources. This aspect of the historic urban landscape is nevertheless one of the most promising in the historic urban landscape because of the government’s investment into improved public transport. Historic remnants concerned with infrastructure, such as the trickle ponds with exceptional stonework at the Daspoort Sewage Farm and the neglected and vandalised Church Street Cemetery or Heroes’ Acre, are often overlooked. Further research is however required into the correct merging of new systems into the existing heritage fabric. The Historic Urban Landscape Approach is considered as the most suitable tool towards a happy merger.
# Conclusions on the understanding of the layers of the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria

## 6 Open spaces, parks, streets and areas

Pretoria presides over a large number of parks with historical significance and National heritage status. The citizens of Pretoria are predisposed to the outdoors because of the city's exceptionally pleasant weather conditions. As a result, all parks are popular for leisurely activities, exercise and outdoor gatherings. Church Square is the most important formal urban space. Its is complemented by a hierarchy of formal urban spaces that are located within the historic urban footprint of Pretoria. Informal urban spaces occur around religious buildings and significant streets have been identified in the historic centre of Pretoria.

Several areas with historic cohesion that include groups of similar historic typologies have been identified in historic Pretoria. The historic areas which have been identified are at risk of deterioration. Further research into the sustainable preservation of these areas is, therefore, required. The conclusions in this document are considered to be a merely representative selection and further research to identify similar areas is recommended.

The aspect concerning urban parks is considered one of the most promising in the historic urban landscape because of the popularity of the urban parks. It follows that the historic formal and informal spaces and streets may be regarded with equal eagerness once the significance and potential thereof is realised through the application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. It is expected that research into the application of the HUL Approach with regard to the future development of open spaces, parks, streets and areas of Pretoria will be most fruitful.

## 7 Landuse patterns and spatial organisation

The racial segregation policies of the Colonial period and mid-20th century affected the spatial organisation of the City of Pretoria and the greater metropolitan region of Tshwane. This, together with single use zoning patterns, caused the historic centre of Pretoria to become alienated from sustainable city life. As a result, heritage areas and resources are in disuse or subject to vandalism. Based on the City of Tshwane's commitment to encourage high density and mixed
**Conclusions on the understanding of the layers of the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria**

Use developments, it is perceived that this aspect of the historic urban landscape of Pretoria has potential for the successful implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. Further research is recommended into the historic development of landuse patterns, spatial organisation and suitable precedents where the detrimental effects of segregated planning have been resolved.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>8. Perceptions and visual relationships</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions and visual relationships are considered interdependant in the context of the historic urban landscape. It is regarded as the intersection between the tangible and intangible heritage aspects of HUL and it follows that this feature is applicable to the definition of each of its layers. It is considered of cardinal importance that this facet of the historic urban landscape is convincingly considered, grasped and usefully taken forward. The onus is on Pretoria’s local authorities to establish the momentum towards considering the perceptions and visual relationships held by the collective community – to properly define the historic urban landscape of Pretoria in order to be able to implement the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in future.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
nothing exists in isolation
all things emerge from the environment of their creation
hence all things reflect the mind of their creator
something of the thinking of the ideas and mind of their creator is embodied in the artefact
if one can decode the artefact one can access the meaning conveyed therein
in finding meaning one can reanimate the past in the present
in making that meaning explicit the past enriches and makes more meaningful the present
(Fisher 2014)

extracted from the obituary prepared by Professor Roger Fischer

Marx’s work in this exhibition turns on a pun of his own ... it is about rooting as much as it is about routing...
(Gevisser 2018)

CHAPTER 6: Rationalisation
6. Rationalisation
Supplementary Problem 3: How to define the historic urban landscape of historic central Pretoria through an understanding of the applications of the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape elsewhere?
Supposition 3: An understanding of the applications of the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape elsewhere, will lead to a specific definition of the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria.

Grounded in the study conducted into the application of the historic urban landscape it has been proven that the global perception of historical cultural heritage is of a dynamic evolution of interpretations and appropriations of history by the culture to which it belongs. UNESCO has reinforced this vantage point by the promulgation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in 2011 (Bonadei, Cisani and Viani 2017, pp. 77–78).

An understanding of the HUL Approach can now be distilled into a single concept: to mobilise ‘heritage’ from being a single planning consideration on the sidelines of a project matrix towards a principal consideration which is central to a project matrix.

6.1. The rationale on the Ballarat precedent
The concepts extracted from the Ballarat precedent concerning the application of the HUL Approach enabled the researcher to understand the practical application of a dynamic and multifaceted approach:

- The City Council of Ballarat was the first local government in the world to tackle the gigantic task of implementing the Historic Urban Landscape Approach.

- The City of Ballarat’s motivation was to empower themselves with the capacity to develop their city whilst safeguarding the collective heritage.

- The six critical steps of the HUL Approach were followed in a series of simultaneous actions, rolled out in parallel activities over a period of three years, with some strategies implemented as on-going processes.
Ballarat's HUL model

![Ballarat's Historic Urban Landscape model](image)

**Figure 152: Ballarat's Historic Urban Landscape model (GOHUL 2016).** Ballarat's HUL model with community & stakeholder participation central to a dynamic interactive flow of processes involving Ballarat's distinctive Identity, the provision of inspiration and frameworks and the delivery of vibrant and sustainable change.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The six critical steps of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Survey and map the natural, cultural and human resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Work with local people to shape the future of their city</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Assess the vulnerability to socio-economic and climate stresses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Integrate into a wider city development framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Prioritise actions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Establish partnerships and local management frameworks</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 3: The six critical steps for the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach.*

6.2. Rationale on the Swahili Coast World Heritage Sites precedent

This study established that the implementation of the HUL Approach in the Swahili Coast World Heritage Sites was intended...
to demonstrate its application in the hope that conservation staff and site managers in peri-urban areas would be motivated to follow suit (Van Oers and Haraguchi 2013, pp. 6–17).

While it was recognised in the Ballarat precedent that the implementation of the historic urban landscape had been administered through research, training and the development of pilot projects, the precedent comprising the Swahili Coast World Heritage Sites only achieved research and training towards demonstrating these isolated actions. Perez and Martinez (2018, p. 107) state that the involvement of local governments and academic institutions, with differing degrees of leadership, is paramount to the successful application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach.

It is the researcher’s view that the involvement of expert consultants was too brief to mobilise the local authorities to implement the HUL Approach on their own. Contemporary discussions on the implementation of the historic urban landscape are evolving around a paradigm shift from a technical definition of planning to political and social planning (Perez and Martinez 2018, p. 112).

In hindsight, it would have been prudent to focus on the transfer of skills towards planning in the social and political realms in the case of the Swahili Coast World Heritage sites instead. This would have served to mobilise the local authorities in reviving regulatory planning priorities, with ‘heritage’ at the core.

6.3 Understanding how to define the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria

The study into the physical and cultural layers of historic Pretoria has led the author to understand that an active and equal partnership must be established between conservation and development to safeguard the survival of Pretoria’s layering of heritage assets (Van Oers 2006). The application of the HUL Approach is deemed to be a suitable solution to establish such an equal partnership.

Based on the insight gained by studying the HUL precedents, the researcher understands that the following factors must be considered whilst implementing the HUL Approach in historic Pretoria:
The local authorities are the best strategically positioned administrative and regulatory entities to act as the driving force behind the application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. This is the case because the higher tiers of government are bound by the constrictions of the formal regulatory framework formed by written Acts. Many of the laws concerning development planning and heritage allow the local authorities to apply discretion in the development of a regulatory framework within which the laws of the land can be applied.

A study of the physical and cultural heritage layers of historic Pretoria will describe the respective boundaries of relevant layers in different geographical areas. For instance, the layers consisting of the built environment and the legislative and political heritage will not have identical boundaries.

It follows, therefore, that the physical boundaries of the layers of the historic urban landscape will vary.

During implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach, the driving entities must accomplish processes through different parallel activities, not in isolation and technically orientated as transpired with the Swahili Coast precedents.

Expert collaborators must be based locally and committed to long-term and on-going involvement – not on a selective short-term basis.

The close proximity of historic Pretoria to the University of Pretoria, the University of South Africa, Tshwane University of Technology, and the tertiary institutions in Johannesburg makes long-term involvement of local expert collaborators viable.

Input from collaborators representing UNESCO and related entities will be on a short-term basis whereby the local expert collaborators will be empowered to continue the implementation of HUL.

Stakeholders must be identified to participate in the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach and their respective hierarchies of yielding forces must be established.

Stakeholders may typically include: citizens, professionals, tourists, private companies, and administrative bodies.
The author further understands that by defining the following definitive but not conclusive sets of tangible and intangible historical layers of historic Pretoria, an understanding of the Historic Urban Landscape of Pretoria will follow:

Table 4: The layers of the Historic Urban Landscape.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>The layers of history which must be defined in order to arrive at an understanding of the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i</td>
<td>The topography of historic central Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii</td>
<td>The geomorphology of historic central Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii</td>
<td>The hydrology and natural features of historic central Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv</td>
<td>The built environment of historic central Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>The infrastructure of historic central Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vi</td>
<td>The open spaces and gardens of historic central Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vii</td>
<td>The land-use patterns and spatial organization of historic central Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>viii</td>
<td>The perceptions and visual relationships of historic central Pretoria</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The researcher concludes with an understanding that the following steps are required to implement the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in historic Pretoria:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The steps required to implement the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in historic Pretoria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>D</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>E</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>F</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>G</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.4 Summary

The purpose of the application of The Historic Urban Landscape Approach is to mobilise heritage to become a principle planning consideration central to the project matrix.

The Ballarat precedent for the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach comprised research, training and the implementation of pilot projects. The Swahili Coast World Heritage Sites precedent for the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach comprised research and planning only.

The six critical steps of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach were followed in the Ballarat precedent to an identifiable and verifiable extent. The six critical steps of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach were not followed through in The Swahili Coast World Heritage Sites precedent.

In the Ballarat precedent the local authority acted as the driving force behind the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. In the Swahili Coast World Heritage Sites precedent UNESCO acted as an implementing agent through WHITR-AP in the hope that a local driving force would emerge.

It is therefore concluded that the Ballarat precedent convincingly demonstrated how heritage had been mobilised to become a principle planning consideration central to the project matrix.

It is evident from research into expert opinions on the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach that political and social planning should take precedence over technical planning to ensure a sustainable driving force behind the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach.

It was concluded that an active and equal partnership must be established between conservation and development to safeguard heritage conservation in historic Pretoria in the context of dynamic urban growth. The application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach is deemed to represent such an equal partnership.
The following aspects must be considered upon the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in historic Pretoria

i. The Local Authority must be the driving force behind the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach.

ii. A study into the physical and cultural heritage layers of historic Pretoria will enable the definition of the historic urban landscape.

iii. The physical boundaries of the layers of the historic urban landscape will vary.

iv. The implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach must be conducted with different parallel actions and not in isolation.

v. Expert collaborators must be locally based and committed to long term and on-going involvement.

vi. Stakeholders in the form of citizens, professionals, tourists, private companies and administrative bodies must be identified to participate in the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach.

The following steps must be followed to implement the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in historic Pretoria

a. Identify priority areas for heritage conservation.

b. Conduct consultations with communities and stakeholders with the assistance of experts.

c. Strive towards the establishment of ‘heritage’ as a central planning factor.

d. Include the Historic Landscape Approach into the urban planning framework as entitled by the regulatory framework for local authorities.

e. Provide visual proposals of future development plans for comment by the community and stakeholders.

f. Enlist the assistance of the United Nations Global Compact Cities Programme to tackle the most vulnerable areas – the areas indicated in annexure C would be a good starting point.

g. Arrive at a preliminary heritage plan to be presented to stakeholders for input and adjustment in order to arrive at the final heritage plan.
nothing exists in isolation
all things emerge from the environment of their creation
hence all things reflect the mind of their creator
something of the thinking of the ideas and mind of their creator is embodied in the artefact
if one can decode the artefact one can access the meaning conveyed therein
in finding meaning one can reanimate the past in the present
in making that meaning explicit the past enriches and makes more meaningful the present
(Fisher 2014)

extracted from the obituary prepared by Professor Roger Fisher

‘Transparent Territories’ is a series of artworks by Gerhard Marx, which create images that defy the two-dimensional authority of maps to portray ‘a transparent palimpsest of geography and historical time’.

The artworks are constructed from fragments of decommissioned and discarded terrestrial maps (Marx 2017)

CHAPTER 7:
Findings
7.1 Findings

The main problem that initiated this study was formulated followings:

How can historic Pretoria be defined through an understanding of the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape?

Initial response to the problem
Supplementary problems 1, 2 and 3 were developed to formulate a response to the main research problem:
First: the prescripts of the Historic Urban Landscape needed to be understood in terms of its particular approach regarding the definition of historic urban fabric.

Second: the application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in its entirety needed to be understood in order to enable the researcher to come to a conclusion about how the historic urban landscape had been defined in each precedent, whether it had in fact been successfully defined and the potential for commonalities to be applied in historic Pretoria to understand the definition of its historic urban landscape. The researcher deemed it necessary to establish an overview of the layered nature of Pretoria's history in preparing to address the third and last supplementary problem.

Third: the layered history of Pretoria and conclusive statements from the precedent studies were superimposed on the UNESCO framework to demonstrate the definition of the historic urban landscape in Pretoria, thereby formulating an answer to the main research problem.

As a prelude to the response to the main problem the author found it necessary to be convinced that the Historic Urban Landscape Approach can be considered appropriate for application in historic Pretoria. Consequently, Chapter 2 was dedicated to an investigation into the nature of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach and how it originated by undertaking a literature study of publications by acknowledged experts on the subject of the historic urban landscape and urbanism. This preliminary investigation was concluded by understanding that planning and heritage conservation approaches have recently merged into integrated systems which complement each other and have proven advantageous.
for sustainable urban development. It was established that the Historic Urban Landscape Approach is a tool to be applied to manage change and that the method had been developed to counter the effects of urban sprawl, which is an acknowledged urban condition in the City of Pretoria and Tshwane. Chapter 2 was concluded with the finding that the state of heritage conservation, in the context of Pretoria’s urban quality, is susceptible to the application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. The aforementioned supposition convinced the researcher that the main research question is relevant and that a useful conclusion could reasonably be reached.

Supplementary problem 1 was formulated as followings:

**What is the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape and how is it to be understood?**

**The response to the problem**

Chapter 3 was dedicated to an understanding of the origin, purpose and application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. It was identified that heritage conservation approaches historically represented methodologies that increasingly consisted of primary and secondary foundations:

- the conservation of the architectural fabric and
- the conservation of the urban fabric, respectively.

The study of the intentions and prescripts of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach proved that the core consideration is to integrate not only the abovementioned primary and secondary foundations but the entire terrain of aspects relevant to heritage conservation.

For the purpose of this study Chapter 3 was concluded in acknowledgement of the framework proposed by UNESCO, whereby the historic urban landscape of Pretoria will be identified through a study of – at the very least – the following layers defined through an understanding of the history related to each respective layer:

- site topography
- geomorphology
- hydrology and natural features
- historic and contemporary built environment
- infrastructure
• open spaces and gardens
• land use patterns
• spatial organizations
• perceptions and visual relationships.

Supplementary problem 2 was formulated as followings:

What may be deduced from case studies where the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape was applied elsewhere (internationally) with regard to application to historic central Pretoria?

The response to the problem
Chapter 4 was dedicated to an investigation of the precedents for the application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach. The researcher found that the application of the HUL Approach in Ballarat had been comprehensively accomplished, which was not the case at the Swahili Coast World Heritage Sites.

After investigating the methodologies followed and the driving forces behind the HUL implementation in the two precedents, it was concluded that the definition of the Historic Urban Landscape had been comprehensively achieved in the Ballarat precedent. This was achieved because of an intangible element: the golden thread that ran through each and every step of the implementation process was the perceptions of the community and the desired visual relationships.

The investigation was focused on more factors that may have contributed to the successful implementation of the HUL Approach in Ballarat. In the conclusion of the study of the HUL precedents, all the elements that contributed to the success of the implementation of the HUL Approach in Ballarat were acknowledged and extracted to assist in the distillation of the principles to be applied in the definition of the historic urban landscape in Pretoria:
• The local authorities in the City of Ballarat were ideally positioned to drive the process.
• As the third tier of government the local authorities were authorised to adopt the HUL Approach into its regulatory planning frameworks,
• redirect municipal funds to support the implementation thereof and
thereby position heritage at the centre of all planning projects.
- Contemporary digital technology was employed whereby on-going local and global participation was made possible.
- The area defined by the municipal boundaries of the City of Ballarat comprised the source of the historic urban landscape and not merely the perceived boundary of the historic central area of the City of Ballarat.

Chapter 5 of this study presents a brief but comprehensive overview of the aspects of the history of Pretoria, which will represent the respective layers of the historic urban landscape in a cumulative landscape form. The research into the history of Pretoria is by no means deemed to be comprehensive to the extent that the entire scope of history has been presented, but rather in the sense that the UNESCO framework for the definition of the historic urban landscape had been followed in the organisation of the available historic information. This information may serve as a starting point in discussions with the collective community to achieve the actual intersection of the tangible and intangible aspects of each layer. For this reason, Chapter 5 is concluded in acknowledgement of the cardinal importance of the continuous acknowledgement of the intangible elements involved in the definition of each layer that contributes to the historic urban landscape.

Supplementary Problem 3 was formulated as follows:

*How might the interpretation of historic central Pretoria be defined through an understanding of the applications of the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape in a different place?*

**The response to the problem**

It was concluded in Chapter 6 that, in addition to the exploration and definition of the physical and cultural layers that contribute to the historic urban landscape, strategic methodologies must be followed to successfully and sustainably define the historic urban landscape of Pretoria.

- It was resolved that, in order to mobilise heritage to become a principle planning consideration central to the project planning matrix in Pretoria, both political support and authority are required at the regulatory and
administrative levels of power, in this case the City of Tshwane.

- In addition thereto it was deduced that social planning must take precedence over technical planning and it was, therefore, acknowledged that the collective community of Tshwane must be identified and included in heritage planning processes in order to define the historic urban landscape of Pretoria. The author was inspired and reassured by the potential discovered in the community’s capacity to manage change in a positive and creative spirit, as demonstrated by the discussions on non-governmental strategies which currently drive initiatives toward a changed vision of Pretoria and Tshwane’s heritage.

- It must be anticipated that the physical boundaries of each layer to the historic urban landscape may vary in accordance with the nature of the particular heritage features involved.

- The definition of the historic urban landscape is, by virtue of its character, perceived as a dynamic process and not as a procedure that can be executed as a set of actions conducted in serial hierarchy. The many preparations required to develop a sustainable heritage management system, such as gaining political support and administering social planning, must accompany and support the drive to define the historic urban landscape of Pretoria.

The main research question is answered as follows:

The conclusive response to the problem

The historic urban landscape, which is a collection of physical and cultural heritage layers, is regarded as an appropriate tool to define historic Pretoria as a viable possibility for the implementation of an integrated and sustainable conservation policy, designed to address and manage the adverse effects of uncontrolled urban development.

The definition of the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria will comprise the identification of its physical and cultural heritage layers, collected from history and the perceptions of the collective community. The historic urban landscape is defined at the intersection of the identified and discerned physical and cultural layers.
In acknowledgement to global approaches on the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach, it is imperative that sustainable heritage conservation is managed via political and social planning and administered in conjunction with the process to define the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria.
7.2 Statement of Significance

The Historic Urban Landscape Approach was published by UNESCO for integration into existing regulatory frameworks of member states and is considered of importance because:

i. as a soft law it includes methodologies which place heritage conservation at the centre of planning processes in order to manage change and facilitate sustainable urban development in the context of rapid and often uncontrolled urbanisation;

ii. the HUL Approach is the first heritage conservation framework that represents an integrated approach toward heritage conservation;

iii. it forms a baseline for the rectification of the consequences of current and past mismanagement of heritage resources;

iv. it forms a criterion for the planning and implementation of new projects, allowing heritage resources to survive change;

v. it is considered to be a sustainable approach toward heritage conservation because the concerns and priorities of the collective community is integral to the layered and historically representative substance thereof.

7.3 Contributions

This study makes the following contributions:

i. It serves as a tool towards understanding:
   a. the intention of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach;
   b. the application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach;
   c. the methodology required to define a particular historic urban landscape.

ii. It provides a framework for the definition of the historic urban landscape of Pretoria.

iii. It provides information about the most vulnerable aspects of the historic built environment and open spaces layers of the historic urban landscape of Pretoria.

iv. It provides the current global perspective on the appropriate point of commencement for the application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach
nothing exists in isolation
all things emerge from the environment of their creation
hence all things reflect the mind of their creator
something of the thinking of the ideas and mind of their creator is embodied in the artefact
if one can decode the artefact one can access the meaning conveyed therein
in finding meaning one can reanimate the past in the present
in making that meaning explicit the past enriches and makes more meaningful the present

(Fisher 2014)

extracted from the obituary prepared by Professor Roger Fisher
8. Recommendation

In order to define the Historic Urban Landscape of historic Pretoria the Historic Urban Landscape Approach will have to be adopted into the regulatory urban-planning framework by the City of Tshwane. This is the case because of the vast amount of information that will have to be generated by experts from varying fields and the involvement of stakeholders from varying sectors of the community of contemporary Pretoria and the City of Tshwane.

Whilst committed to the definition of the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria, the stakeholders and driving forces behind this process must be cautious to have the actual implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in mind and not merely the definition of the landscape. This will involve a paradigm shift in the approach to urban planning, political and social will and an awareness of needs must precede technical planning.

The process of the definition of the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria can run parallel with a drive to attain paradigm shifts with regard to political and social planning, as demonstrated in the successful application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in the City of Ballarat.

The historic urban landscape of the historic centre of Pretoria must be defined through a study and the evaluation of a multi-layered transect of the history of Pretoria, including but not necessarily limited to:

i. the topography of historic central Pretoria
ii. the geomorphology of historic central Pretoria
iii. the hydrology and natural features of historic central Pretoria
iv. the built environment of historic central Pretoria
v. the infrastructure of historic central Pretoria
vi. the open spaces and gardens of historic central Pretoria
vii. the land-use patterns and spatial organisation of historic central Pretoria
viii. the perceptions and visual relationships of historic central Pretoria

A diagrammatic representation of the historic urban landscape of Pretoria was developed as part of this study. The significance of the information contained in this diagram must be assimilated into the implementation of the historic urban landscape of Pretoria. While the diagram was based on the corresponding diagram for the City of Ballarat, it was refined in acknowledgement of:

- The importance of the intangible aspects of the historic urban landscape and the layer comprising perceptions and visual relationships. This all-encompassing layer was represented as a three-dimensional aspect enveloping the entire layered system, to communicate the recognition that community representation is required at the defining stage of each layer in order to purposefully define the historic urban landscape.
- The layers of the HUL – Pretoria diagram were organised in a hierarchy representing a progression of the perceived states of vulnerability, with the most vulnerable aspect at the top and the least vulnerable at the bottom.
8.1 Future Research:

The all-encompassing significance of the perceptions of the collective community on heritage and conservation inspired the researcher to imagine how the element of social planning must be conducted in order to gain political momentum and establish an approachable, digital and useful platform for the involvement of the collective community in the planning of heritage conservation.

Moreover, the aspects discussed in this document in relation to the Infrastructure above and below ground, and the open spaces, parks, streets, and areas layers of the historic urban landscape of Pretoria, led to a belief in the potential vested in the constructive application of the HUL Approach in the administrative capital of the Republic of South Africa. Such aspects refer to the current planning and resource investments made toward the upgrade of public transport in the City of Tshwane and the popularity of the city’s many open spaces amongst its collective community.

It can, consequently, be confidently asserted that suitable pilot projects can be identified within these layers of the historic urban landscape of historic Pretoria as and when the Historic Urban Landscape Approach is adopted into the planning framework of the City of Pretoria.

Future research into the potential application of the Historic Urban Landscape Approach in historic Pretoria is, therefore, contemplated to include the following questions:

i. How can the collective community in the City of Tshwane be empowered with a vision for the conservation of historic Pretoria and its place at the centre of future urban planning ventures?

ii. Which pilot projects concerning the Historic Urban Landscape of historic Pretoria can be identified in reaction to the City of Tshwane’s commitment to include the Historic Urban Landscape Approach into its regulatory framework?
nothing exists in isolation
all things emerge from the environment of their creation
hence all things reflect the mind of their creator
something of the thinking of the ideas and mind of their creator is embodied in the artefact
if one can decode the artefact one can access the meaning conveyed therein
in finding meaning one can reanimate the past in the present
in making that meaning explicit the past enriches and makes more meaningful the present

(Fisher 2014)

extracted from the obituary prepared by Professor Roger Fisher

Transparent Territories is a series of artworks by Gerhard Marx, which creates images that defy the two-dimensional authority of maps to portray 'a transparent palimpsest of geography and historical time'.

The artworks are constructed from fragments of decommissioned and discarded terrestrial maps (Marx 2017).

CHAPTER 9: Appendices
Appendices:
All figures which refer to the nature and essence of the subject matter in this document resulted from large scale drawings and maps. The format of this document poses a constraint to clear and robust presentation within the body thereof. Consequently, these documents are attached as annexures 01 to 05 and A – M, for ease of reference.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Annexure 01</th>
<th>The birth of Pretoria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Annexure 02</td>
<td>The original Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure 04</td>
<td>Relevant buildings in and around Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure 05</td>
<td>Colonial Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure A</td>
<td>Rivers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure B</td>
<td>The built environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure C</td>
<td>Restorative interventions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure D</td>
<td>Tree-lined streets and open spaces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure E</td>
<td>Relevant spaces in and around Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure F</td>
<td>Marabastad – stories layout</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure G</td>
<td>1905 Map of Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure I</td>
<td>The built environment according to the heritage grading system in this study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure J</td>
<td>Railway and road system in historic Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure K</td>
<td>The layers of the historic urban landscape – Pretoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure Li</td>
<td>Graphic presentation of Ballarat’s HUL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure Lii</td>
<td>Graphic presentation of historic Pretoria’s HUL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexure M</td>
<td>Location of townships and suburban areas in historic Pretoria</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
nothing exists in isolation
all things emerge from the environment of their creation
hence all things reflect the mind of their creator
something of the thinking of the ideas and mind of their creator is embodied in the artefact
if one can decode the artefact one can access the meaning conveyed therein
in finding meaning one can reanimate the past in the present
in making that meaning explicit the past enriches and makes more meaningful the present
(Fisher 2014)

extracted from the obituary prepared by Professor Roger Fisher

Transparent Territories is a series of artworks by Gerhard Marx, which creates images that defy the two-dimensional authority of maps to portray ‘a transparent palimpsest of geography and historical time’.

The artworks are constructed from fragments of decommissioned and discarded terrestrial maps (Marx 2017)
Bibliography:


City of Ballarat (2018c). ‘Living Corridors’.

City of Ballarat (2018d). ‘Summary Paper Understanding the HUL Approach In our people, culture and place: A plan to sustain Ballarat’s Heritage 2017-2030’. City of Ballarat.


Copac (2016). *Introduction to qualitative research methods : a guidebook and resource *. Available at:


Melvin Residence (2014). *Melvin Residence: A piece of history unearthed in Church Square.* Available at: http://melvinresidence.blogspot.com/2014/07/a-piece-


https://www.researchgate.net/publication/242205479_Heritage_as_Therapy_Set_Pieces_from_the_New_South_Africa


RMIT University (no date). UN Global Compact – Cities Programme. Available at: https://citiesprogramme.org/ (Accessed: 26 April 2018).


259


Slide Share (2018). Burra Charter. Available at:


South African History Online (2011). Oost-Eind Primary School, 70 Meintjes Street, Trevenna, Pretoria | South African History Online. Available at:

South African History online (2012). Nelson Mandela’s treason trial starts in the Old Synagogue in Pretoria. He was captured near Howick on 5 August 1962. | South African History Online. Available at:


Sovereign Hill (2018). Sovereign Hill / Ballarat Attraction, Museum. Available at:


State Government of Victoria (2017). Ballarat - White Night, White night Ballarat. Available at:


The Heritage Portal (2017). Concerns about insensitive alterations to Church Square Pretoria | The Heritage Portal. Available at:

The Jacaranda City (2009). Go Pretoria. Available at:


The University of Utah (2017). *Janice Morse RN, PhD, FAAN - Home - Faculty Profile - The University of Utah.* Available at: https://faculty.utah.edu/u0556920-Janice_Morse_RN,_PhD,_FAAN/hm/index.html (Accessed: 28 September 2018).


‘World Heritage Centre - Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape’ (no date). Available at:
