Dissertation

Submitted to the Centre for Human Rights Faculty of Law, University of Pretoria
in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree Master of Philosophy (MPhil)

The Right to Landscape:

Facing climate change and a gendered political economy
through ‘pastoralist’ peacebuilding in Somalia

Name: Tamara Naidoo

Degree programme: University of Pretoria

Postal Address: P.O Box 1057, Tongaat, Kwa-Zulu Natal, South Africa 4400

E-mail Address: naitam08@gmail.com

Cell: 074 182 4289

Supervisor: Prof Karin van Marle

Date of this draft: 12 November 2015
PLAGIARISM DECLARATION

I, Tamara Naidoo, do hereby declare:

1. That I understand what plagiarism entails and am aware of the University’s policy in this regard.

2. That this assignment is my own, original work. Where someone’s work has been used (whether from a printed source, the internet or any other source) due acknowledgment has been given and reference made according to the requirements of the Faculty of Law.

3. That I did not make use of another student’s work and submit it as my own.

4. That I did not allow anyone to copy my work with the aim of presenting it as his or her own work.

SIGNATURE: ____________________________________

DATE: 
List of Abbreviations

IPCC - Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC)
AMISOM – African Union Mission in Somalia
IDP - Internally Displaced People
PBC - United Nations Peace-Building Commission
WGLL - Working Group on Lessons Learnt
UNHCR - United Nations High Commission for Refugees
UN - United Nations
Table of Contents

Chapter one: Introduction.................................................................
1.1 Research problem..................................................................05
1.2 Research questions.................................................................05
1.3 Literature review....................................................................06
1.4 Research methodology.........................................................10
1.5 Limitations of study...............................................................12
1.6 Overview of chapters.............................................................13

Chapter two: Climate Change and Human Vulnerability..................
2.1 Introduction...........................................................................13
2.2 Unravelling the concept of climate change in a global context....14
2.3 Climate change and vulnerability in Somalia.........................16
2.4 Instability and conflict follows Somali pastoralists.....................17
2.5 Conclusion.............................................................................20

Chapter three: Discovering the agentic Potential within Pastoralism..
3.1 Introduction...........................................................................21
3.2 The role of men and women in pastoralism............................22
3.3 A gendered dimension to climate change..............................24
3.4 Conclusion.............................................................................27

Chapter four: Exploring the Right to Landscape in Right-Based Approaches
4.1 Introduction...........................................................................28
4.2 An opportunity towards liberation with the Right to Landscape....28
4.3 Prevailing streams of peace-building in Somalia......................31
4.4 Engaging the Right to Landscape towards a gendered economy..35
4.5 Conclusion.............................................................................39

Chapter five: Conclusion and Recommendations...........................
5.1 Recommendations for peace-building in Somalia....................40
5.2 Conclusion.............................................................................41
5.3 Bibliography..........................................................................43
CHAPTER ONE

Introduction

1.1. Research problem

I conducted a case study of Somalia to explore the linkages between climate change and conflict using the Right to Landscape as an Afrocentric tool. The Afrocentric perspective is derived from Afrocentric methodology as advanced by Asante (1987, 1988, , and 1995). I use it to encourage the implementation of principles, methods and concepts that are derived from African cultural experience, identified in this dissertation through the Right to Landscape. As such Afrocentrism is used to develop further social science research on peace-building and centralise the empowerment of Africana people. In this dissertation I sought to conceptualise what a gendered and African-owned peace-building initiative will look like in the future and in this pursuit I highlight the value of the Right to Landscape. I argue that the main activities of the current Right-Based Approaches to peace-building are state-centric, male-biased, unsustainable and detached from the Somali people. Instead, the dissertation portrays an alternative perspective to peace-building using the Right to Landscape as a fresh addition to human rights dialogue by addressing the failings of current peace-building efforts. The pastoral communities are championed in this dissertation as a viable grouping worth assisting in Afrocentric peace-building processes where Africans, in particular the Somali woman, are argued to hold great potential in their role as an agent of change combatting climate change and simultaneously, participating in her realm of the informal economy towards a sustainable peace.

1.2. Research questions

a. By linking climate change to the conflict in Somalia, how does climate change affect the pastoral community and the gender dynamics within them?
b. What are the failures of prevailing peace-building practices in Right-Based Approaches as diagnosed by an afrocentric perspective?
c. Using the Right to Landscape as an alternative perspective to peace-building in Somalia, can it provide a sustainable peace that includes marginalised pastoral communities and the women within them?
1.3. Literature Motivation

Literature on Afrocentrism is diverse but the Afrocentric method advanced by Molefe Kete Asante (1987\(^1\), 1988\(^2\) and 1990\(^3\)) provides a comprehensive basis to research from. The conceptual framework used in the dissertation is further refined by Ruth Reviere’s work.\(^4\) I promote the methodology through the emerging Right to Landscape that I argue speaks to the absence of landscape in human rights dialogue and is described most comprehensively in one authoritative source.\(^5\) Although, the Right to Landscape is not a concept owned by Afrocentric literature I argue that the Right to Landscape is not only a well-deserving addition to the various methods used by scholars but it also adds a further dimension to an inherently African perspective. Furthermore, the Right to Landscape challenges the traditional home of the concept of climate change in the literature of natural sciences and calls for a multidisciplinary approach.\(^6\) The Right to Landscape is a new area of study within the international human rights regime and international relations and parallels can be drawn with literature on Afrocentricity, in the way that the Right to Landscape questions Eurocentric assumptions of prevailing worldviews.\(^7\) After all, the centrality of landscape to the human psychology, political and economic activity and its dependence upon the health of the ecosystem; is not addressed by the majority of scholars in peace-building. True to the multidimensional character of Afrocentric study, the Right to Landscape, allows for a focus on literature that indicates climate change as a factor exacerbating conflict in Somalia.

There is copious literature on instability and conflict in Somalia suggesting that the country has been an experiment for global peace-building discourse and practise for decades.\(^8\) Despite these

\(^1\) Refer to MK Asante The Afrocentric idea (1987)
\(^2\) Refer to MK Asante Afrocentricity (1988)
\(^3\) Refer to MK Asante Kemet, Afrocentricity and Knowledge (1990)
interventions by international and local stakeholders, a sustainable peace in Somalia is still out of reach. A prevailing criticism is that the traditional peace-keeping and peace-building based on genealogy is an oversimplified assessment of the situation in Somalia. Many academic texts recognise the continuation of a weak Somali governance and propose a “mediated state model,” in which weak states negotiate political access through existing local authorities. A number of journal articles also speak to the need to include women into peace-building process, a concern encapsulated by the United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325. Another lacuna in the literature of peace-building is the relationship between peace-building and state-building. The dissertation sought to converge literature addressing the instability, women and alternative governance in Somalia through the prospects the Right to Landscape.

A number of studies have been conducted in recent years to inquire into pastoralism, conflict, gender and climate change in Northern and Eastern Africa. Though research on Somalia specifically is not typically included in the literature, the similarities are argued to exist between these countries in some texts. In Somalia climate change and variability reduces the capability of the pastoral lifestyle to provide for the basic needs of the majority of the population. Conflict is thus exacerbated by the resource shortages and displaced individuals who sometimes resort to violent means to attain basic resources. The study by the NGO Candlelight was chosen to exemplify the situation in Somalia because there are few other comprehensive case studies available on this situation in Somalia and

---

very little environmental data in general. Therefore, I look to the problematique that climate change presence as a missing element to understanding the conflict. The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) projected that by 2020, between 75 and 250 million people in Africa will be exposed to a number of severe environmental challenges.\textsuperscript{15} I argue in this dissertation that these alarming figures suggest that instability will persevere in Somalia unless climate change is incorporated into peace-building.

In the dissertation, I recognise there is a wide range of literature on ‘peace-building’ but I use it as it first emerged in the work of Johan Galtung. Galtung asserted that peace-building structures would be able to promote sustainable peace by addressing the “root causes” of violent conflict whilst supporting indigenous capacities for peace management and conflict resolution.\textsuperscript{16} There is some literature, reflecting Afrocentric philosophy in part, that criticise prevailing peace-building efforts for the overreliance on external actors in Right-Based Approaches. Thus, indigenous capacities for peace management are undermined.\textsuperscript{17} There are also arguments available on the contentious use of liberal political and economic worldviews in peace-building that are imposed upon the Somali society.\textsuperscript{18} I refer to several lessons learnt by the United Nations Peace-Building Commission operations problematize liberal worldviews in peace-building.\textsuperscript{19} News articles suggest that the Right-Based Approaches to peace-building seem to have created a disconnection between the Somali people and interveners that has allowed for the terrorist group, Al Shabaab to take prominence.\textsuperscript{20} Furthermore, readings on the gendered political economy suggest a more comprehensive situational analysis of the interdependence between men and women in society is required in peace-building pursuits. The literature assists in the exposure of the androcentric bias of peace-building.\textsuperscript{21} Overall, I look to Butler

\textsuperscript{15} Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change Summary for Policy Makers (2007)
\textsuperscript{17} Curtis (n 12 above) ) 1–28
\textsuperscript{18} P Uvin ‘Rights-based Approaches in Post Conflict Countries: Can and Should it Be Done?’ in K Carroll, R Goldwyn, M Lagu (eds) Rights based approaches and Humanitarian Interventions in Conflict Situations 16-22
to criticise the way the world’s homogenous legal framework moulds societal space in mainstream academic discourse and affects post conflict reconstruction and development. As perceived by Uvin, the literature on peace-building suggests that there is no substantive difference between peace-building and state-building. Taking note of the dominance of a legalistic thinking in Butler’s work, I am inspired by Lefebve to inquire into space in the peace-building context as it relates to the Right to Landscape. Lefebve finds that space is supposed to be created in everyday life by a mix of social, political, economic and legal relations. I argue Lefebve’s idea of space is in practise in Somaliland and Tigray, Ethiopia. Somaliland is relatively stable and Bøas argues that decentralisation is more likely to configure local context-specific management of power. It provides for a more elastic use of legal norms that is inclusive of the pastoral element. The gap in peace-building literature I acknowledge is the right to difference. I therefore argue, preferable for the fragile situation of Somalia is an elastic extension of the legal framework sensitive to the right to difference. In acknowledging the need for the right to difference to change conversation on legalistic perceptions on space, ultimately, I believe the Right to Landscape can become a reality.

Diverging from prevailing peace-building literature, I argue that landscape is a central consideration for sustainable peace-building efforts as inspired by the successes of the peace-building process in Somaliland and Tigray, Ethiopia. I thus adopt an Afrocentric reasoning to account for the failures of prevailing peace-building practices. Further, through the use of the Right to Landscape, I

---

22 P Uvin (n 18 above) 16-22
26 T Rinaudo (n 23 above) 5
27 MK Asante (n 2 above) 25
consider the potential of pastoralism and the gendered political economy to reconcile peace-building with Afrocentric philosophy.

1.4. Methodology

Afrocentrism is the chosen methodology to explore an alternative research paradigm of the instability in Somalia and offers an alternative approach to peace-building that is gender-sensitive and African-owned. I do not assume climate change to be the sole cause of conflict however, I believe related dynamics arising from the Afrocentric method advanced by Molefe Kete Asante (1987, 1988 and 1990) provides a more comprehensive picture that informs peace-building practice in the dissertation. The conceptual framework implemented in the research project has been derived from an adaptation of the Afrocentric methodology in Ruth Reviere’s work. I use a qualitative assessment of the Right to Landscape and its ability to provide alternative and African solutions to conflict in Somalia. As such, I use a multidisciplinary approach to address the multidimensional conundrum of climate change and conflict that falls under the Afrocentric research methodology. The Afrocentric methodology fundamentally assumes the right and responsibility of the researcher to describe reality from his or her perspective. I therefore, as an African woman challenge the traditional Eurocentric criteria of objectivity, reliability, and validity in the inquiry process. The challenge of Eurocentrism arises from the inclusion of core afrocentric principles that are intrinsic to African culture into the method. The first principle Ma’at is "the quest for justice, truth, and harmony." Nommo, the second principle, means "the productive word." It describes the creation of knowledge as a vehicle for improvement in human relations. In the dissertation I follow Ma’at and Nomma to assist in the creation of a more fair and just society for Somali people. The five canons that follow the principles have been taken from the work of Reviere to elaborate on the Afrocentric methodology. The canons allow for the proper and more complete construction and interpretation of knowledge. These five canons of ukweli, uhaki, kujitoa, ujamaa, and utulivu are presented here as the criteria against which research should be judged for the accuracy of the representativeness of the lived experiences of all

---

28 MK Asante (n 1 above)
29 MK Asante (n 2 above)
30 MK Asante (n 3 above)
31 R Reviere (n 4 above) 709-728
32 MK Asante (n 3 above) 5
33 R Reviere (n 4 above) 709
people, including black people. By employing these five Afrocentric canons, I attempt to harmonize diverse African, and other, values and experiences into a coherent and comprehensive definition of place. It is important to note that the canons are articulated in this way because there is no universal agreement on them. Ultimately, ensuing from the canons is the core belief of Afrocentrists that the research is inseparable from the researcher. In addition, the research and researcher are clearly rooted in a certain place that needs recognition in order to uncover prejudice of the arguments in the dissertation and establish Afrocentricity as a legitimate response to the human condition. The concept of place, therefore, is "a fundamental rule of Afrocentric intellectual inquiry because it’s content is a self-conscious obliteration of the subject-object duality and the enthronement of African Wholism." True to the Afrocentric methodology promoted in the research, it is necessary to disclose that I am an African women of Indian descent based in South Africa and have been educated in a time of the proclaimed African Renaissance. This has allowed for an ‘unfolding process of bringing African indigenous knowledge systems into focus as a legitimate field of academic enquiry in its own right.’ My historical, social and political experience informs the interpretation of data throughout the research as I attempt to immerse myself in perspective of the Somali pastoral community. Ultimately, by following the principles Ma’at and Nommo the research findings portrayed in the dissertation is to help create a more fair and just society in Somalia. Furthermore, this creation of knowledge is to become a vehicle for improved human relations of which form, shall be discussed as the dissertation develops.

I attempted to reflect the human experience of Somalia by using multiple data sources, methods, theories, and researchers in the dissertation in different combinations resulting in a multidisciplinary triangulation. Key elements of the African worldview include harmony and interdependency, collectivity and spirituality as well as the belief in the restoration of dignity in African cultures and identity through recovery, recollection and restoration. The primary sources used for the purpose of this research project are those on Afrocentric philosophy and the Right to Landscape framework.

---

34 R Reviere (n 4 above) 710
36 MK Asante (n 3 above) 5
Together, the primary sources inform the method of exploration of the linkages between climate change and conflict as well as their conceptual insertion into peace-building. Secondary sources include information on climate change, reported evidence on Somali pastoral life and the peace-building processes of Tigray in Ethiopia, academic writings criticising prevailing peace-building practise in addition to evidence on the link between climate change, conflict and gender in an attempt to inspire alternative peace-building possibilities.

**1.5. Limitations of the study**

In the dissertation I find that prevailing Right-Based Approaches fail to recognise the link of climate change to conflict and they fail to appreciate the differentiated way in which climate change affects gender. Nevertheless without a natural sciences background, I am limited in my quest for proof on how climate change affects Somalia and how it in turn affects women and conflict. Furthermore, in light of the complexity of Afrocentricity my assumptions that inform the chosen methodology affects how I view the problems of peace-building and the relevance of the Right to Landscape. It is also my assumptions of traditional Somali life from available online research that affects my understanding of what an inherently African peace-building initiative may be. However, I found that the Right to Landscape theoretically is an Afrocentric tool that is capable of offering a climate-sensitive and gender-considerate peace-building option. At the same time, I recognise that my assessment of the Right to Landscape is limited because academic engagement on the right is not readily available, in particular not on the subject of Afrocentric peace-building. Overall, in this dissertation I struggled with the Afrocentric methodology. Coming from a European research tradition I have been accustomed to distancing myself from the subject matter which is not possible here. As a young South African women I thus, do not believe I was able to entirely immerse myself in the position of a pastoral community member in Somalia. My experience of a European orientated education in the middle-income country of South Africa also prohibits me from identifying all Eurocentric biases of peace-building. Lastly, as a female researcher, I am limited in my acceptance of the subsidiary role of woman in society which may conflict with certain understandings of pastoral cultural norms in Somalia.
1.6. Overview of chapters

*Chapter Two* seeks to situate climate change in global developmental discourse then identify the link between conflict and climate change in contemporary Somalia. The chapter brings to the fore the importance of pastoral communities to stability in the country.

*Chapter Three* explores the agentic potential of two groups, the pastoralists and the women in those communities. By identifying the effects of climate change upon the pastoral lifestyle, I question state leadership towards the pastoral peoples.

*Chapter Four* investigates the main streams of the Right-Based Approaches. After a brief discussion on the Right to Landscape, the absence of landscape in human rights dialogue is highlighted by engagement on climate change and the gendered economy.

*Chapter Five* consists of a conclusion and recommendations

---

**CHAPTER TWO**

**Climate Change and Human Vulnerability**

2.1. Introduction

In this chapter I research the link between climate change and conflict in Somalia. Finding these links do exist, I then inquire into how climate change affects the pastoral community and the gender dynamics within them. By following *Ma’at* and *Nommo* the aim of the chapter is to seek justice, truth and provide a way towards harmony. African indigenous culture has been secondary to colonial intervention and in recent times, second to continued claims of modernity in the state-centric global governance model. Even though, researchers seek to understand African culture, there is a tendency to see culture in terms of external actor precepts, largely influenced from a Eurocentric education. Nevertheless, the depth of indigenous beliefs and ancestral opinions that continue to influence African thinking requires more adequate reference in international, regional and national dialogue. This chapter thus, following the canon, *Ukweli*, sought to determine an African perspective of the global

---

38 The first of the five canons of the Afrocentric methodology to be engaged with is *Ukweli*. It is defined as ‘the groundedness of research in the experiences of the community being researched’. Rather than the researcher as the ultimate authority, the experience of the community is more important. As a result, the cultural location prioritised over topic and the research needs to be examined from Africans as subjects and human agents instead of objects in European academic pursuits.
issue of climate change, through the nexus of conflict as perceived by pastoralists in Somalia. Therefore, the following effects of climate change upon the pastoral lifestyles will influence the interpretation of the study and it will reiterate the importance of ‘place’ or landscape in later arguments of the Right to Landscape.

2.2. Unravelling the concept of Climate Change in a global context

Scientists concede that global warming is a phenomenon caused by the burning of fossil fuels which sends heat-trapping gases, such as carbon dioxide, into the air, changing the climate. Conceptually, the natural sciences have long owned the concept of climate change. However, as climate change is increasingly felt by people, the concept has come to stand in the spotlight of political debate; most notably in the current conversations of the Post-2015 Developmental Framework. The catchphrase ‘transformation’ in the United Nations Secretary-General’s Synthesis Report of the Post-2015 Developmental Framework processes indicates a fundamental shift in international negotiations on development following the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). In the report’s inclusion of the Sustainable Developmental Goals (SDGs) and the other post-2015 processes feeding into it, they illustrate the highly consultative process that has emerged from the post-2015 dialogue to provide a fertile ground for multilevel negotiations between civil societies across the world, their national governments; and a conversation on the global regime of human right norms and values. This human rights orientated post-2015 process, the consultation of key marginalised groups has brought the global problem of climate change onto the agenda, highlighting a further challenge to the prospects of poverty reduction and peace in the globe. At the same time, peace and stable societies is increasingly a prerequisite to developmental goals, as envisioned in Goal 16. I argue thus, climate change is an issue that requires urgent attention and action at global, national and local levels.

---

39 Q Mkabela (n 38 above) 180
40 R Reviere (n 4 above) 713
42 United Nations General Assembly The road to dignity by 2030: ending poverty, transforming all lives and protecting the planet. Synthesis report of the Secretary-General on the post-2015 sustainable development agenda (2014) Article I (21)
change and conflict add new dimensions to the concept of justice and its execution in peace-building initiatives. Afrocentric methodology is a suitable pursuit to research the effects of climate change due to its assertion of the ‘complementary and multilateral nature of human history’ 45 that can reconcile the global-scale expression of climate change with the individual scale of a Somali citizen. As such, Poe states ‘Afrocentric scholarship recognizes the hermeneutic factor of historical presentation and harmonizes it with introspection and multidisciplinary triangulation’.46

Environmental injustice 47 is a particular problem for Africa where the continent’s poor and marginalised contend with disproportionate and increasing impacts of environmental change and resource insecurity; ultimately threatening the limited socioeconomic rights available to the poor in a state such as Somalia.48 The concept ‘climate change’ provides therefore, a multilevel and multi-sectoral dynamic to engage within developmental and related peace-building dialogue.49 Reflecting the multidimensional character of Afrocentric research, climate change is an issue of depth that requires unpacking. On one hand climate change is a universal concept affecting the globe and the high level human rights regime. As such the detrimental effects of climate change challenges human rights discourse to find a way to reconcile socioeconomic rights including the right to clean food and water, the right to a decent livelihood, the fair treatment of individuals with the developmental aspirations of the state. On the other hand, climate change is a concept capable of considering the specificities of a citizenry’s ecological footprint. Climate change is a concept sensitive to inequality between developed and underdeveloped societies in terms of their respective ecological footprints but more so; the concept is sensitive to inequality within a society be it income, race or gender and its


46 Z Poe (n above 46) 731
47 See definition: The South African Environmental Justice Networking Forum asserts: “Environmental justice is about social transformation directed towards meeting basic human needs and enhancing our quality of life – economic quality, health care, housing, human rights, environmental protection, and democracy. In linking environmental and social justice issues the environmental justice approach seeks to challenge the abuse of power which results in poor people having to suffer the effects of environmental damage caused by the greed of others.” Available online: http://www.ejolt.org/2013/02/environmental-injustice/ (last accessed 10 April 2015)
49 J Fröhlich and J Knieling ‘Conceptualising Climate Change Governance’ in (eds) J Knieling and W Leal Filho Climate Change Governance (eds) Berlin: Springer Verlag (2013) 11
effect in terms of an individual’s ecological footprint.\textsuperscript{50} Still, even low-income countries have a high ecological footprint from the activities high and middle-income countries drive within them. Thus global dialogue and the hesitance to commit to sustainable development indicate a serious ethical problematique facing the globe today.

2.3. Climate change and vulnerability in Somalia

I find that climate change is difficult to prove with measurement facilities and statistics still causing immense argument. Nevertheless, the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) report has projected a dim future for the African continent, scientifically arguing that by 2020, between 75 and 250 million people in Africa are projected to be exposed to increased water stress due to climate change.\textsuperscript{51} In addition, the yields from rain-fed agriculture could be reduced by up to 50\% in the continent and that low lying areas with large populations will be affected by erratic weather conditions amongst other consequences. In terms of current evidence for climate change, the Britain’s Meteorological Office in East Africa, noted precipitation known as the short rains failed in 2010 because of the natural effects of the weather pattern La Nina but the lack of the long rains in early 2011 was an effect of the systematic warming due to influence on greenhouse gas concentrations.\textsuperscript{52} The British government estimated that between 50,000 and 100,000 people died from the climate-change induced famine. Moreover the research recognized that climate change is linked to a number of other human security issues in Somalia.\textsuperscript{53}

With Kenya, Ethiopia and Somalia facing the same bout of drought, reports have found that Somalia was most affected.\textsuperscript{54} Following more than 20 years of civil unrest, there is little environmental information and monitoring on for instance the rapid deforestation and biodiversity loss in southern Somalia by Al Shabaab charcoal endeavours. I assume that deforestation trends and the lack of

\begin{itemize}
\item R Sanders (n 49 above) 13
\item J Straziuso (n 42 above)
\item J Straziuso (n 42 above)
\item T Rinaudo (n 23 above) Rinaudo finds that severe deforestation due to poverty, war and lack of law enforcement in Ethiopia led to severe droughts and worsened socioeconomic conditions from biodiversity loss. Since 1991 in Tigray however, efforts to regreen the region have significantly improved life.
\end{itemize}
government control makes Somali people more vulnerable to extreme weather patterns than other countries in the region.\textsuperscript{55} Western journalists also reported that unlike Kenya and Ethiopia, aid agencies were less able to reach all parts of war-ravaged Somalia during the drought.\textsuperscript{56} I find the most convincing evidence on climate change and human security in the key findings of the United Nations High Commission of Refugees (UNHCR) report on displaced people of the East and Horn of Africa. The report indicates that refugees have personally noticed discernible shifts in weather that affected farming and livestock husbandry in their homelands over the past 15 years.\textsuperscript{57} The refugees did not attribute climate variability as a cause for violent conflict, but they did recognize resource shortages caused by weather conditions as fuel to pre-existing conflicts. Those interviewed, who had pointed out climate variability for their movement away from their homelands, said that this had been a last resort after they had failed to adapt their methods. Moreover, the report refers to Somalia and confirms that the ability of the Somali people to adapt to extreme weather was severely impeded by violent conflicts and state failure in turn, encouraging them to take up militant means to secure their own needs. In recognition of the fact that climate change promotes the migration of people who are capable of causing social and physical conflict, Senait Gebregziabher - the Somalia country director for the aid group Oxfam - stated that climate change is increasing humanitarian needs.\textsuperscript{58}

\textbf{2.4. Instability and conflict follows Somali pastoralists}

In Somalia, the World Bank suggests that up to 60 per cent of the population is dependent upon the pastoralism\textsuperscript{59} and the United Nations Development Programme reports that livestock contributes to 40 per cent of the GDP in addition to 50 per cent of the export earnings for the country.\textsuperscript{60} Pastoralism


\textsuperscript{56} J Straziuso (n 42 above)

\textsuperscript{57} T Afifi, R Govil, P Sakdapolrak & K Warner ‘Climate Change, Vulnerability and Human Mobility: Perspectives of Refugees from the East and Horn of Africa. Institute for Environment and Human Security’ \textit{United Nations University} (2012) 12

\textsuperscript{58} J Straziuso (n 42 above)


\textsuperscript{60} United Nations Development Programme \textit{Empowering Pastoralist Communities to Manage Climate Change}. (2015) \url{http://www.so.undp.org/content/somalia/en/home/ourwork/hiv_aids/successstories/climate.html} (last accessed 5 January 2015)
is therefore, not only an essential informal activity in which the majority of the population, which is also the most vulnerable, engage in but it is also highly sensitive to climate change. To gage the effects of climate change upon pastoralists the Somali NGO Candlelight provides a representative study on pastoralist communities and their landscape in Somaliland. The success of pastoralism in Somalia resonates with Candlelight’s definition of pastoralism. Pastoralism is ‘a traditional land management and production system which mimics wildlife in its basic principles. Through its dynamic, flexible and complex structures it has proved to be mostly adapted to the erratic climate and non-equilibrium natural conditions of drylands by providing and conserving a large array of ecosystem services in semi-arid to arid areas.’\(^{61}\) Pastoralism can defend itself against climate change and the prospects of less rainfall and hotter weather because it is accustomed to irregular rainfall and drought. Pastoralists use sparse vegetation and according to Candlelight and other studies, pastoralists maintain the precarious health of ecosystems in semi-arid areas. Notably, pastoralism encapsulates a form of governance equipped to provide social protection to pastoral communities in times of difficulty.\(^{62}\) As the dominant mode of production, Somali pastoralists and their livestock historically follow seasonal migration patterns, and move between the north and south. Candlelight reported that the movement of Somaliland pastoralists has in the past 30 years been severely affected by the dramatic change of wet and dry season grazing patterns, the loss of the natural bio-diversity and recurring droughts. In addition, commercial activities have taken up pastoral lands as a result of the political marginalization of pastoralism in Somalia.\(^{63}\)

Climate change affects the entire globe but the effect is disproportionate for the poor in developing countries and in particular, the sensitive semi-arid ecological zones, as is the case in Somalia.\(^{64}\) Although Candlelight’s study has proof of climate change experiences in Somaliland, the people themselves are not aware of climate change as a concept. The predominant belief is that the climatic changes they experience are due to “God’s punishment” for the “sins and transgressions” of humankind. Thus, these communities struggle to adapt without information and knowledge systems available on the matter. It is true that droughts have been part and parcel of the climatic conditions in Somalia, however, the occurrences of those cyclic droughts during the past 30 years have become

\(^{61}\) I Hartmann & A.J. Sugulle (n 14 above) 
\(^{62}\) I Hartmann & A.J. Sugulle (n 14 above) 
\(^{63}\) I Hartmann & A.J. Sugulle (n 14 above) 
\(^{64}\) I Hartmann & A.J. Sugulle (n 14 above)
more frequent and more hard-hitting than ever before. Locals in Candlelight’s project area ‘said that the only years with good rainfalls were between 2004 and 2006 with the worst drought between 2007 and 2008, said to still be felt in some areas. The case study found the following findings:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Species</th>
<th>Normal’ threshold herd size for family of 7 persons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single Species</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Camel</td>
<td>40 Heads</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small Ruminants</td>
<td>400 Heads</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cattle</td>
<td>50 Heads</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burden Animals</td>
<td>2 camels or 3 donkeys</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2a. Table depicts the livelihood and ‘normal’ threshold herd size (in accordance with the target groups)66

In comparison to the focus group understanding of a ‘normal’ threshold herd size, the current livestock holding for over 80% of the pastoral households within the study area remain at least 40% below the figures indicated in the above table. Traditional coping mechanisms in the pastoral communities are thus overstretched. In addition, pasture material is reported to have a low recovery rate. With a lack of alternative livelihoods in Somalia; tension has risen in Candlelight’s study area as the only means to escape the fate of becoming an environmental internally displaced persons (IDP) in urban centres.

Pastoralism based on non-formal settlements, is believed to be an archaic practise by the Somali government. The Somali government subsequently is able to take over the ‘no-man’s lands’ pastoralists roam upon. The consistent undervaluing of the pastoralist economy has led governments to allocate pastoralist rangelands for alternative uses and promote private land-holding in an attempt to increase productivity. Agricultural biases on the part of national planners have in turn promoted the expansion of settled crop cultivation in pastoralist regions, despite its incompatibility

65 I Hartmann & A.J. Sugulle (n 14 above)
66 I Hartmann & A.J. Sugulle (n 14 above) Section 6 Table 1 ‘Livlihood ‘normal’ threshold size’
with arid and semi-arid lands. An example of the frustrations at crop failure is provided for by the al-Shabaab. Abdurahman Ayub Abu Zakariye, an al-Shabaab official in the Bal’ad district, in 2011 told the Somali Report that the al-Shabaab were seizing farms owned by the collapsed central government of 1991 and private holdings to improve agriculture.

‘If Al-shabaab controls most of the farms, we can reduce famine and other crisis.’

In light of the poor progress in large-scale agricultural endeavours in Somalia’s recent history, pastoralists are under more pressure to be self-sufficient and survival more at stake due to trends to breakdown common user rights and the establishment of enclosures. The problem of enclosures is the restricted access to permanent sources of water, this restriction exacerbates the dry period plains and valleys and heightens insecurity and conflict. Drought cycles often result in pastoralists trespassing the enclosed area or grabbing land, thus sparking tensions. Charcoal production, another contested issue in the study area, has become an important coping mechanisms for poor pastoral households, whose pastoral livelihoods have been affected by the effects of recurring droughts and vegetation loss. As competition for resources increase, equally conflicts arise among herders, charcoal producers and wildlife.

In view of the prevailing belief that the inability to adapt to the Somali landscape is due to ‘God’s punishment’ the prominence of a religious grouping to address the situation has appeal. Furthermore, the need to violently attain resources in the failed state of Somalia is evidence of the link between conflict and climate change.

2.5. Conclusion

Although there is debate by academics into whether climate change can cause conflict and other academics challenge the very existence of climate change, it is apparent from academic research and personal accounts that climatic conditions have changed in Somalia. Economically, the informal market of pastoralism is an essential activity for Somalia and further climatic disturbances can have

69 I Hartmann & AJ. Sugulle (n 14 above)
disastrous effects for the dignity of the few self-sufficient Somali communities. The Afrocentric perspective on climate change has tied it closely to human security, instability and conflict particularly, in underdeveloped states where communities rely greatly on the natural environment for resources. The reduction of these climate-sensitive resources from unsustainable global economic practises in addition to the state’s absence in promoting knowledge on adaption mechanisms is an instance of environmental injustice to the people of Somalia.

The pastoral lifestyle is the manifestation of its cultural location and the threat of climate change is a direct threat to the African subjects of this study. In preview of the discussion of peace-building initiatives to follow, pastoralism is a micro-level dimension of Somalia that will be forced to contend with macro-level norms and subsequent peace-building initiatives. Their cultural location and the threat of climate change will require address if a sustainable peace is to be upheld. In a better understanding of the African phenomenon of pastoralism, further exploration of the cultural and social aspects of the pastoral communities will follow to discover the agentic potential of the people.

CHAPTER 3

Discovering the agentic Potential within Pastoralism

3.1. Introduction

In this chapter, I look into further dynamics outside of climate change contributing towards the failures of prevailing peace-building practices in Right-Based Approaches from the viewpoint of a Somali pastoralist. It becomes evident in the chapter that I, arriving from a South African perspective, recognise the multicultural realities of the African continent. Afrocentrism argues for ‘pluralism in philosophical views without hierarchy’ that stands on the centeredness of culture, not colour’.70 The location of pastoralism in Africa in the study is a display of one kind of centeredness in the African continent but so too, is the location of gender relations within pastoralism. In this chapter I investigate the cultural role of men and women in pastoral communities and find that climate change affects pastoral women and men differently. Engaging with the community that the pastoral men and women are a part, echoes two inseparable canons of Ujamaa and Uhaki. In identifying climate change in the previous chapter as a factor interfering with freedom, I promote a new line of inquiry into peace-

70 Z Poe (n above 46) 733
building. By using these canons in the context of climate change, I attempt to unleash the agentic potential of women in Somali communities. Both myself as the researcher and the pastoralists emerge from this chapter as agents with gender specific roles, intent to regain freedom for pastoralists.

3.2. The role of men and women in pastoralism

In Somalia, there is an interesting correlation between the 50-60 per cent of the population that is believed to be run by female-headed households\(^\text{71}\) and the 60 per cent of the population engaged in pastoralism.\(^\text{72}\) Even though such statistics risk inaccuracy, representative case studies in parts of Somalia still indicate women are increasingly taking charge of their families by undertaking multiple income generating activities to provide food and non-food resources. Yet, they are politically excluded and socially marginalized both as pastoralist and in their role as women.\(^\text{73}\) The rise of women is an interesting phenomenon as pastoralism is steadily reduced over the decades to an economic resource and ignored for its ability to contribute to peace with the various indigenous mechanisms that assist in times of environmental distress and social disruptions.\(^\text{74}\)

Whilst a Somali woman may receive recognition and respect at a certain stage in her life where for instance she may engage in community leadership forums predominantly run by men, women are still not recognized for their centrality to herd management.\(^\text{75}\) According to the findings of the Minority Rights Group, ‘pastoralist men own and control livestock; dominate politics and decision-making; are the heads of households, lineages and clans; and see themselves as ‘real pastoralists’.\(^\text{76}\) The society rules that women are to play a supportive role in livestock production and in their inability to own land or participate in decision-making, they live subordinate to the men in their communities. Although the picture painted of the pastoral life of women is not a uniform experience and can be argued to be an oversimplification of the social dynamics, it is still a picture that prevails in many

---


\(^{72}\) H Welzer *Climate Wars: Why People will be Killed in the 21st Century* (2012) 4-6


\(^{74}\) I Ahmed *Understanding Conflict in Somalia and Somaliland in Comprehending and Mastering African Conflict in A Adefeji (ed) The search for sustainable peace and good governance* (1999) 236

\(^{75}\) Kipuri N & Ridgewell A (n 68 above) 6

\(^{76}\) Kipuri N & Ridgewell A (n 68 above) 6
cases across the country. The trends prevail despite the growing body of legislation enacted in Somalia to protect women’s rights, under the guidance of state-building ventures. Nevertheless in terms of pastoralist production, it is highly dependent upon the complementary role of men and women.\textsuperscript{77} To illustrate, women’s tasks may involve activities such as constructing houses, milking, managing sheep and goats, small-scale trading, producing butter, cheese and ghee. Until recently, men’s roles have tended to remain much more restricted to livestock production and often include caring for and migrating with herds, managing grazing and water resources, collecting water, livestock trading, controlling predators and ensuring security. In recent years men’s labour has shifted to urban areas, with their growing involvement in non-pastoralist activities such as security guard positions.\textsuperscript{78}

In light of the evidence on the discrimination of women and the complementarity of gender roles, I intend to emphasise a comprehensive community picture under the canons of \textit{Ujamaa} and \textit{Uhaki}. This is because \textit{Ujamaa} requires recognition of the community in research unlike the European tradition that favours a European tradition of individuality.\textsuperscript{79} This concept of community promotes the spirit communalism, rather than individual separation.\textsuperscript{80} The ultimate authority, as defined by Afrocentrism, must be the experiences of the community member and even though there is emphasis on community, Afrocentrism does not intend to marginalise other groups. \textit{Uhaki} requires research to produce fair outcomes for the welfare of all participants.\textsuperscript{81} Therefore, while many texts would maintain that women in Somali communities have a subsidiary role I feel perhaps it is necessary to be careful not to completely disregard the impact of women in their cultural specific role. The collective ethic of the Somali pastoralists is of fundamental importance to the study and it is these harmonious relations that is often ignored or misunderstood especially, with regards to the role of women. Following the collective ethic, the survival of the community depends upon the strength of this interrelated and essentially egalitarian system.\textsuperscript{82} The effects of climate change upon the social fabric of the pastoral communities in addition to other factors including state-building, has caused disharmony within the pastoral communities evident through the observable disruptions in the role

\begin{thebibliography}{99}
\bibitem{77} Kipuri N & Ridgewell A (n 68 above) 7
\bibitem{78} Kipuri N & Ridgewell A (n 68 above) 7
\bibitem{79} R Reviere (n 4 above) 719
\bibitem{80} R Reviere (n 4 above) 720
\bibitem{81} R Reviere (n 4 above) 720
\bibitem{82} Q Mkabela (n 38 above) 185
\end{thebibliography}
between men and women. These disruptions have also caused disharmony between other groups as competition increases within the state of Somalia. Peace-building initiatives will need to address the climate change dynamics in addition to the gender role dynamics.

3.3. A gendered dimension to climate change

The dwindling relevance of herding, arguably due to climate change and other factors mentioned in chapter two has started a trend of agro-pastoralism, affecting the social organization of traditional pastoralism. By affecting the male economy, climate change has indisputably affected the women’s economy in the following ways. Primarily, agro-pastoralism has challenged the status of men as this diversified pastoralist economy includes small-scale trading, handicraft production and firewood collection which are believed by men to be ‘women’s work’. Therefore, female labour within the pastoralist economy is in such demand that girls are removed from school either temporarily or permanently and even more so, women are unable to contribute to decision-making social occasions on issues concerning the whole community. In light of this evidence, it is safe to state that pastoralist households have become highly dependent on the labour of women and girls who work to provide for their families’ immediate needs.

The lives of pastoral women have been affected by climate change in terms of their livelihoods, coping strategies and their social position. Firstly, the loss of income from pastoralism is compensated with women’s coping strategies that place more pressure on the social and natural environment. However, the reduction of natural resources from climate change and unsustainable practises force women to work longer and harder to retrieve resources for the household. In turn, women’s coping mechanisms including the sharing and trading of goods are overstretched from their original intention to serve temporary conditions to a permanent way of life. Secondly, the reduction in resources also leads to the disruption of families. On one hand Candlelight found that part of the income is increasingly used for men’s consumption of Qat, which helps men to overcome the

---

83 Kipuri N & Ridgewell A (n 68 above) 15
84 J Markakis Pastoralism on the Margin (2004) 9
85 I Hartmann & AJ. Sugulle (n 14 above)
86 The charcoal and chat economy is an example where women have to work longer to retrieve materials from the environment
87 Qat is a stimulant drug that is native to East Africa and southern Arabia
psychological depression they are exposed to due to the desperate future of pastoralism. On the other hand, families are disrupted when men migrate to towns and women are left behind to look after the remaining livestock and children. While some women will find themselves having to live in unfamiliar communities with altered social positions in order to secure some resources, other women are forced to return to their parents’ families in this situation. In terms of migration, it is true that increased mobility is the traditional response to declining resources however, decreased mobility has resulted in recent times from the loss of the livestock. According to Candlelight, decreased mobility is frequently caused by an attitude of resignation or at best, the access to water sources in the area.

Pastoral women are more than ever central to the stability of the family unit as well as the communities within which they live but despite a de facto leadership status, women do not have sufficient social capital and so are unable to hold an independent economic status. Many NGOs in Kenya have discovered the link between women and economic development or at least food security and have assisted them to form savings and credit groups as well as legally recognized cooperatives. This indicates a trend to strengthen and support the pastoralist economy however, a critical block is the prevailing view among governments in the region that pastoralism represents an archaic production system that needs to be changed. A world renowned example of agro-pastoralism lies in Tigray, Ethiopia. Tigray was a place of severe deforestation and social relationships were strained from Ethiopia’s civil war and resource shortages. In Abreha Atsbeha over the past 15 years farmers began to recognize the multiple benefits of sowing seedlings. Communities like Abreha Atsbeha took up the responsibility to protect the environment without the full rights to benefit from them and have steadily re-greened their surroundings resulting in food and flowing water. The success of Tigray was made possible by the local communities because they believe in the process and put it into effect through their own organization. The Institute for Sustainable Development and the Bureau of Agriculture and Natural Resources assisted the communities by formulating by-laws to govern their

---

88 I Hartmann & A.J. Sugulle (n 14 above)  
89 I Hartmann & A.J. Sugulle (n 14 above)  
90 Kipuri N & Ridgewell A (n 68 above) 25  
91 See the discussions contained in Hatfield, R. and Davies, J. 2006. *Global Review of the Economics of Pastoralism*, Nairobi, International Union for Conservation and Nature,  
92 See the discussions contained in Hatfield, R. and Davies, J. 2006. *Global Review of the Economics of Pastoralism*, Nairobi, International Union for Conservation and Nature,  
93 T Rinaudo (n 23 above) 8
activities as well as training and awareness programmes for sustainable management.\textsuperscript{94} For instance, to reduce the tensions between pastoralists and agro-pastoralists, pastoralists are required to tie their animals to certain spaces. The positive example from Tigray has academics pondering about the use of similar strategies in other countries to enhance the effectiveness of compliant communities while attracting non-compliant communities to abandon destructive habits and adopt more sustainable ones.\textsuperscript{95}

While the example of Tigray does not have studies specifically on women as yet, except for the fact that men and women partake in the same tasks for the same hours; the addition of Somali women into the analysis of climate change in other NGO activities has proven other benefits. This is illustrated by the small-scale NGO activity of Xoojinta Nabada (strengthening peace) in Somalia and others\textsuperscript{96} where women identified for their knowledge in adaptation strategies for food security are proving to be successful and sustainable resource managers directly addressing some of the root causes of conflict – resource-shortage and climate change.\textsuperscript{97} Although, the government of Somalia has recognized climate change as a threat to the people and a cause of internal displacement, evident from the preliminary ratification of the African Union’s Kampala Declaration for instance,\textsuperscript{98} the female role in the pastoral community and her intrinsic knowledge of the environmental coping mechanisms is not included in state-led drought mitigation measures. Such silences expose the climate change problem of women’s political, economic and social exclusion.\textsuperscript{99}

\textsuperscript{94} T Rinaudo (n 23 above) 8
\textsuperscript{95} T Rinaudo (n 23 above) 8
\textsuperscript{96} More examples of successful pastoralist projects are located in Sudan and acknowledge the precarious relationship between environmental and human stresses that pastoralists can uniquely balance. Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity. 2009. Connecting Biodiversity and Climate Change Mitigation and Adaption:Report of the Second Ad Hoc Technical Expert Group on Biodiversity and Climate Change. CBD Technical Series No. 41 8-71
\textsuperscript{99} Kipuri N & Ridgewell A (n 68 above) 24
3.4. Conclusion

The Somali government and the Eurocentric research tradition have embedded assumptions about the cultural practises of the pastoral lifestyle that has promoted practises to stifle the prosperity of pastoralists. Though the NGO work referenced seems to only reach academics and the local communities surrounding pastoralists, NGO staff is key to facilitate the reach of pastoral voices in policy advocacy. By ignoring the concerns of pastoral communities, the government and development partners do not seem to acknowledge the participation of all political constituencies - as such the pastoralists are marginalised peoples. Research has indicated that pastoral people are in a weaker position when it comes to law-making and guidelines established by the Somali government and development partners. ‘Indigenous communities do not have the power to establish the rules of the game which anyone who chooses to do research in their communities will have to play by.’\textsuperscript{100} Therefore, I as a researcher become an agent in unveiling the biases constraining the freedom of pastoralists in Somalia. In following an afrocentric perspective, the dissertation appreciates the complementarity of the role between men and women in the pastoral community. Moreover, the dissertation is able to recognise the disjuncture climate change has contributed towards the social fabric. The consequence has been for increased and unfair pressure upon women to provide for the families. At the same time, the role of men and traditional pastoral governance mechanisms is reduced. Despite shifting roles, socially the space has not transformed to acknowledge the role of women in public life and so the message on climate change and possible indigenous adaptation mechanism are lost. In spite of this, within the pastoral communities women are in a strategic position to assist finding solutions to a sustainable peace in Somalia.

\textsuperscript{100} Q Mkabela (n 38 above) 184
CHAPTER 4
Exploring the Right to Landscape in Right-Based Approaches

4.1. Introduction

In this chapter I investigated the alternative peace-building that the Right to Landscape provides for Somalia. My key concerns were whether the Right to Landscape is sustainable and includes the interests of marginalised pastoral communities and the women within them. In the spirit of Kujitoo, the fourth canon that I use to build the crux of the argument of the dissertation, I wish to reemphasise that I do not attempt to be unbiased but rather fair or reasonable in my agenda to promote the needs of the pastoral community. In this quest to be fair I sought to uncover hidden biases of the human rights regime in order to research what binds the agentic potential of the African people in this study. The final canon I use is utulivu, which refers to justice. It is only through achieving a sense of justice that harmonious relationships are created between and within Somali groups. My finding is that the human rights regime in its current form unable to embrace Afrocentric values. Drawn from Afrocentric methodology, the Right to Landscape is a multifaceted conceptual tool able to stand up not only to the rigour of Afrocentricity, but is also a phenomenal tool to critique Right-Based Approaches of peace-building and provide justice for the Africana subjects of Somalia.

4.2. An opportunity towards liberation with the Right to Landscape

The application of the Right to Landscape in this Afrocentric inquiry is novel to the Somali problematique because it enables peace-builders to identify climate change in Somalia as a possible root cause of newer patterns of conflict. The Right to Landscape, only emerging in recent years is based on a continuously refined landscape approach that has moved from a conservation-orientation to human security goals. The term ‘landscape’ is difficult to define and the wide range of uses.

---

101 R Reviere (n 4 above) 716
102 R Reviere (n 4 above) 717
‘Landscape’ is different from the confines spatiality is awarded in the legal framework. The world’s legal framework is homogenous and portrays landscape in the one-dimensional concept of land and economic ownership. However, this narrow conception of space is challenged by landscape as described in the diagram a. below. Landscape represents a universal human experience that is open to individual interpretation. On the one hand, human beings perceive landscape to be a tangible product that has been shaped by an individual as much as the community in which it is situated. On the other hand, landscape is part of an intangible process of human beings making sense of the world through shared meanings and values. The Right to Landscape takes the natural and societal setting of the landscape approach to the political realm, providing an alternative lens to review peace-building in Somalia.

All human beings have a relationship with landscape and so all human beings, including individuals, communities, nations, the politically powerless and indigenous people are expected to hold certain

---

105 C Butler (n 148 above) 314
106 Egoz, S Makhzoumi, J and Pungetti, G (n 5 above) 20
107 Egoz, S Makhzoumi, J and Pungetti, G (n 5 above) 13
108 Egoz, S Makhzoumi, J and Pungetti, G (n 5 above) 6
109 Egoz, S Makhzoumi, J and Pungetti, G (n 5 above) 6
values when it comes to their relationship to landscape. In other words, as an Afrocentric tool the Right to Landscape places Africana cultures, histories, experiences, and perceptions as the central axis for the ultimate goal of Africana existence on Africana terms. The relationship with landscape is a universal experience however the expectations from the relationship is dependent upon the experience of the individual or community. I thus believe the Right to Landscape is applicable within Afrocentric philosophy. The Right to Landscape as a conceptual tool is open to the degrees of universality or a plurality of realities stemming from for instance, the experience of pastoralists and the unique experiences of the women within them; requiring equal attention within peace-building. It thus challenges the perception that the human rights regime is capable of being of standardised or universal applicability in peace-building.

When landscape is understood as a fundamental component to physical and cultural human life, it can be used in the empowerment of Somali pastoralists in order to prevent them from their current fate of becoming IDPs and cyclical refugees. Landscape is firstly essential to human life when its natural setting is healthy. As such I argue recognising the Right to Landscape safeguards natural processes against climate change and secures the eco-system health essential for pastoralism. In addition, through the Right to Landscape peace-builders are required to promote the sustainable management of natural resources, a central issue to the current situation of resource shortages. Secondly, in terms of the intangible processes of the cultural realm, landscape appeals to the physical, spiritual and economic wellbeing of human life because of the specific expectations attached to it. In the case of pastoralists, landscape is therefore not just an economic asset but it is critical in their spiritual practises and their political powers; this despite the fact that traditionally pastoralists do not own land in the legalistic sense of ownership. In this regard, landscape is a central component that anchors an individual/community and allows him/her/them the numerous human rights presented in the United Nations Universal Declaration for Human Rights (UDHR).

---

111 MK Asante (n 7 above) 25
112 United Nations Universal Declaration for Human Rights (1948)
4.3. Prevailing streams of peace-building in Somalia

The term ‘peace-building’ is difficult to define but it emerged in the work of Johan Galtung who believed that peace-building structures would be able to promote sustainable peace by addressing the “root causes” of violent conflict whilst supporting indigenous capacities for peace management and conflict resolution.113 The end of the Cold War heavily influenced the norms related to ‘peace-building’, adding a desire for globalization to the concept as well as assumptions that in order to be peaceful a state requires political and economic liberalism. The United Nations (UN) became a flag runner in the peace-building endeavours of the word aptly captured in the 1992 *Agenda for peace* in which UN Secretary-General Boutros Boutros-Ghali called on the UN to become a central instrument in the prevention and resolution of conflicts and to stand ready to assist in peace-building.114 Currently, the United Nations as a multilateral organization provides central theoretical, physical and financial assistance to states with 9 out of 16 missions located in Africa. In the case of Somalia the United Nations has a Country-Specific Configuration, the United Nations Political Office for Somalia.115 Although, there is a proliferation of foreign actors involved with the peace-building process in Somalia, it suffices for the dissertation to recognise the conventional activities and attempt to categorise them under the theory of Right Based Approaches to peace-building in order to apply the Right to Landscape and determine an Afrocentric alternative to peace-building.

The conventional peace-building activities in Somalia have been observed by the Centre on International Cooperation (2014) to consist of three streams: national peace-building frameworks, sub-national peace-building frameworks and security frameworks.116 The first, national peace-building frameworks consist of a donor effort to align aid to Somalia’s New Deal Compact for the fortification a Somali government.117 Even though a stronger Somali government could assist with

---

113 J Galtung (n 16 above) 297
117 S Hearn and T Zimmerman (n 118 above) 8
poverty alleviation, such aspirations are still far off with Somalia still categorised as a ‘failed state’.\textsuperscript{118} This is due to the fragility of the Federal Government of Somalia, established in Mogadishu and their dependence on external actor support. To illustrate the dependence upon aid, John Ging, the director of U.N. humanitarian operations, has expressed concern for Somalia in that only US$232 million out of the needed US$933 million is available to the United Nations’ disposal.\textsuperscript{119} Furthermore, as a result of the complicated historical background of the colonial period, the nation has been virtually divided into three parts, with Somaliland in the northwest declaring independence and Puntland in the northeast also claiming autonomy, essentially reducing the sovereign claims of the government.\textsuperscript{120}

With regards to the sporadic conflict in the southern and central parts of Somalia, the security framework is the second stream of peace-building in action. These certainly are relevant to the immediate reduction of conflict and violence in Somalia. The international community’s optimism has been underpinned by the security gains of the international security actors against the Al-Shabaab insurgency.\textsuperscript{121} Despite successes in quelling violence, the stream does not address stability in terms of the 1, 55 million internally displaced persons (IDP)\textsuperscript{122} and the 1, 1 million refugees in the region, the 875,000 that are in acute need of food and the 2 million “classified as stressed.”\textsuperscript{123} It is with such a phenomenal number of individuals and communities’ facing a daily challenge of vast human security issues that pastoralism may assist as a stabilising force in the third stream of the subnational peace-building framework.

In the long-term, the prospect of a sustainable peace lies in the sub-national frameworks. The current practises concern mainly external actors of diplomatic, donor, military and regional missions with the aim to build a sense of the Somali state’s legitimacy using sub-national entities and “bottom-up”

\textsuperscript{121} S Hearn and T Zimmerman (n 118 above) 5
\textsuperscript{123} Horseed Media (n 121 above)
approaches. These efforts include mediation between federal states and Mogadishu and donor support for civil society activities that focus on reconciliation and building the capacities of institutions for peace. In addition, organizations are encouraging collaboration between communities to enable them to advocate for their interests at the regional and federal level through the externally driven institutions. The local capacity-building of institutions addresses a critical lesson that years of international peace-building and communication with Somali leaders has provided.\textsuperscript{124} The sub-national framework speaks to the need to ‘identify confidence-building measures that start to rebuild trust and dialogue’ among Somalis, with a grassroots orientation.\textsuperscript{125} The sub-national framework provides an opportunity to critically engage the Right to Landscape with the Right-Based Approaches. After all, echoing fundamental lessons from the Right-Based Approaches peace-building practise, the United Nations Peace-Building Commission Working Group on Lessons Learnt (WGLL) has conveyed its belief that the sub-national framework forms the path towards sustainable peace.

The 2014 report by the UNPBC made several reflections in line with the Right to Landscape. In the 2014 report, the crucial phase found is when the peace-building commissions withdraw from the state of location. The phase challenges sustainable peace because upon the withdrawal of the United Nations Security Council-mandated UN missions, there has been evidence of economically destabilizing effects. The problem arises from the fact that often in countries in transition, activities from the UN missions do not shift to the local economy in the time allocated. As a result, a sudden and fierce financial burden disrupts the country and is believed to cause further destabilisation.\textsuperscript{126} At the same time, the withdrawal of a mission decreases the attention given by donors and partners, as well as funding for the UN entities on the ground. This decreased attention takes place at a stage when the country requires targeted financial and technical support for re-building critical institutions. The WGLL believes however, the “financial cliff” caused by the drawdown of UN missions can be offset by early focus on building the capacity of the country concerned to mobilize domestic resources and to create an environment conducive to private sector growth and investment. Seeing as a large part of the population depends on informal economy activities as found in Chapter Two, I argue that though the WGLL’s capacity-building is helpful, the successes will take a long time to trickle down to the

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item\textsuperscript{124}SHearn and T Zimmerman (n 118 above) 5
\item\textsuperscript{125}S Hearn and T Zimmerman (n 118 above) 7
\item\textsuperscript{126}Peacebuilding Commission’s Working Group on Lessons Learned (n above 19) 2
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
ordinary people and risks destabilisation. Pastoralism, can therefore be a considerable force in economic stabilisation with immediate effects that can in its most minimal form exist alongside mainstream economic endeavours. In another reflection, the report found that the other UN agencies such as United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), are needed in the stabilisation of political processes so as to assist states in the transition from conflict after the commission’s mandate ends.\footnote{Peacebuilding Commission’s Working Group on Lessons Learned (n above 19) 3} Such a UN presence would be able to sustain the focus on outstanding and continuing democratic processes in the countries concerned. These processes include national reconciliation, transitional justice and the processes building effective mechanisms and institutions that ensure and successfully manage inclusive dialogue among the various actors in the country. The WGLL recognised in the report UNDP as a possible entity.\footnote{Peacebuilding Commission’s Working Group on Lessons Learned (n above 19) 3} With UNDP, UNEP and other UN institutions recognising the positive role of pastoralism in parts of the world, the explicit engagement of other UN agencies throughout peace-building may provide a sustainable peace.\footnote{World Initiative on Sustainable Pastoralism (2011) Available online: http://www.undp.org/content/kenya/en/home/operations/projects/environment_and_energy/world_initiative.html (last accessed 26 February 2015)}

Drawing from the lessons learnt, peace-building initiatives could gain substantially from the inclusion of pastoralism into the programmes available. The omission of the pastoralist grouping and the women within this group indicates that a truly Somali social and economic context is not appreciated by international actors. An example of the disconnect between Somali people and international peace-building is provided for by the move of Al-Shabaab in November 2011, when they banned foreign NGOs from areas it controlled, accusing some of the organisations of "illicit activities and misconduct".\footnote{H Mohamed (n 20 above) 34} Since then a 2014 article in Aljazeera has noted that Al Shabaab has invested $2m on a canal-building project for the Lower Shabelle province. The Lower Shabelle was formerly the breadbasket of the country but hit by famine in 2011, more than 250,000 people were killed with survivors becoming internally displaced persons. But the canal has changed this hopeless picture by providing water for farmers. Mohamed Sheikh Abdi, the chairman of the Bulo Mareer Farmers Union believes the new-found prosperity in the region "\textit{is because of the NGO ban}. "\textit{They [the international NGOs] always brought food to the town weeks before the harvest... They bought their food from abroad and never bought from us local farmers. They killed every incentive to farm. We were hostage...}
Regardless of the motives for investing in the canal, a value chain of farming produce is empowering Somali people and farmers and restaurant owners have welcomed the tax incentives and other developments stemming from the Al-Shabaab project.

The Bulo Mereer Farmers Union is a clear example of the distortion caused by external invention and impending alienation of the local population. In the quest for justice, a peace-building process that relies on the Right to Landscape may be less tempted to bend to the distortions of external methods and more sincerely, provide an opportunity for the liberation of pastoral people in Somalia.

4.4. Engaging the Right to Landscape towards a gendered economy

The practitioners of the Rights-Based Approaches used in conflict analysis struggle to reconcile their agendas with Afrocentric values and the Right to Landscape. The trend in peace-building is to be reactive rather than pre-emptive towards conflict. Therefore, from the start of a peace-builders’ analysis it seems practitioners of the Right-Based Approaches identify the greatest human rights violation to be war and violence. This explains the prominence of the security framework.132 In comparison to the Right-Based Approaches, the Right to Landscape in an Afrocentric sense of holism maintains that the ecosystem health and management of natural resources in Somalia is also directly linked to the health and physical wellbeing of a person, community and nation.133 This implies, environmental justice is a critical concern for social transformation in peace-building and this includes the interests of individuals as well as the collective. It is however, difficult for Right Based Approaches to acknowledge the dynamics between individuals and collectives because of its original intension for individual rights. The social attachment to landscape, to call a place a ‘home’ in whatever way that is understood by the local is another critical dimension to peace-building in order to ensure local buy-in into development opportunities and prevent migration.134

Of course, the Right Based Approaches do recognise other elements than violence, though national frameworks are secondary. The problem is that while UNDHR is considered to be universal with

131 H Mohamed (n 20 above)
132 P Uvin (n 18 above) 17
133 A Mazama The Afrocentric Paradigm (2003)
134 A Mazama (n 135 above)
values such as the equality of rights, in practise Right-Based Approaches are inherently political. For instance, external interveners weigh the positive and negative impacts of a peace-building programme in the post-conflict state in order to create a corrective standard to improve the outcomes of the programme. The problem is that the corrective standard that emerges from the Right-Based Approaches depends on which human rights out of the vast list have been prioritised. Thus, even though the Right-Based Approaches is accepted by peace-builders to address human rights violations and reduce conflict, the prioritisation of certain human rights affects which institutions are built to what goal and exposes the complex ethical and practical choices that international actors make. It is thus necessary to realise that in the post-conflict context, the human rights language is unavoidably used for political reasons, often to further liberal political and economic values of global trends.

In Somalia state-building is a necessary process of globalisation which in itself represents a gendered process that reflects both continuity and change. Globalisation, its presence felt by international peace-builders working on Somalia, disrupts gendered patterns by altering conventional beliefs, roles, livelihoods and political practices worldwide. A trend in the global system is to devalue women’s work as unskilled and often unpaid. As such, international peace-building tends to devalorises the role of female pastoral community members and relegate them to non-formal private spheres of political, social and economic activity. Still at least, informal work is a survival strategy for women to ensure their own and their family’s wellbeing. In comparison, men especially those who are economically and ethnically privileged, continue to dominate institutions of authority and power and masculinist thinking continues to dominate economic theorising and policy-making. The character of peace-building is therefore that it is top-down, failing to consider the role of pastoral communities and their women in peace-building. It is also non-holistic, unable to include climate change and the gender dynamic due to its reliance on quantifiable indicators which fail to illustrate all factors that contribute to peace as encapsulated in the Right to Landscape. Consequently, peace-building tends to follow formulaic policy endeavours and is over-reliant on economic growth rather than provisioning for human wellbeing and sustainability. Furthermore, the way in which the Somali society is

---

135 P Uvin (n 18 above) 17
136 P Uvin (n 18 above) 19
137 S Peterson (n 21 above) 500
138 S Peterson (n 21 above) 500
engineered under foreign intervention comes to reflect internationally acceptable controls of violence. However, these controls do not include the landscape-sensitive controls of local origin such as those of the pastoral communities. For example, in Somalia the international economic intervention of structural adjustment programmes and those of more recent trends, transfer power from the pastoral groups to biased political structures. As a result, pastoralism is reduced to an economic resource and ignored for its ability to contribute to peace with the various indigenous mechanisms that assist in times of environmental distress and social disruptions. In reflection of the African experience on the ground, climate change, resource shortages and the dynamic of pastoralism should not be held as inferior in the human rights prioritization. It seems from the standpoint of Somali pastoralists that the lack of engagement by international interveners with the unmeasurable, the apparent disconnect with foreign intervention together with the degradation of the landscape in Somalia; these factors affects social relationships reducing peace-building efficiency.

Using the Right to Landscape, I unveil the state and androcentric bias in peace-building approaches over sub-national framework because of the imposition of a modern political economy within which most Somali people do not live or barely survive. Aligning state-building with peace-building overburdens the Somali state, as the location of violence and instability, to carry the responsibility to address violence and instability. ‘In a worldview where there is no conception of how peace can exist without states, the maintenance of order trumps other values’, exposing a deep sense of western subjectivity imposed upon the Somali people. The convergence between state-building and peace-building, has allowed conventional law to hijack Right-Based Approaches of peace-building. Through the Right to Landscape, I have identified the failure of conventional property law to recognise the complex relationship between pastoralists and their landscape. This exposes the monopoly of the international legal paradigm used by the Somali state and international actors to marginalise pastoralists in peace-building, despite their reliance on the Right Based Approaches. The convergence of law on societal space highlights the homogeneity of the legal mainstream academic

139 P Uvin (n 18 above) 21
140 I Ahmed (n 75 above) 236
141 A Mazama (n 135 above)
142 A Mazama (n 135 above)
143 P Uvin (n 18 above) 21
145 L Hutton (n 116 above) 1-10
discourse and the ‘impoverished’ understanding of space in peace-building. The integration of both peace- and state-building processes is problematic because firstly, the culture of law for peace/state-building produces homogenization and standardization not necessarily natural or applicable to the current Somali society. Secondly, the current form of legal equality does not guarantee complete recognition of all participants in social life because it excludes pastoralists and with that local or indigenous governance structures. Thirdly, the standardisation of law has turned space or landscape into a political instrument with power relations that do not favour pastoralists.

Preferable for the fragile situation of Somalia is an elastic extension of the legal framework sensitive to the right to difference. Without the pressures to build a state from the capital outwards to the rural areas, the need to enter the punitive global economic system is reduced and post-conflict reconstruction and development can occur gradually. The relative stability of Tigray and most related to Somalia, the case of Somaliland shows that decentralisation is more likely to configure local context-specific management of power. It provides for a more elastic use of legal norms that is inclusive of the pastoral element. Employing an Afrocentric methodology in the exploratory research of climate change, the Right to Landscape tool has shown me that landscape is shaped by human perception. Thus to the 60 per cent of the population that is engaged in pastoralism and the strong female element in the households, landscape is central to their lifestyle, livelihood and identity. In contrast, national development objectives and policies conceived by national-level officials and processes, are not consistent with the views, wishes, and interests of pastoral communities affected by them. Some policies have had severe impacts on pastoral lives, including culture loss and alienation of the pastoral people. Around the world indigenous communities are increasingly suspicious of external actors and this jeopardises any nation-building project. In contrast, the Right to Landscape in its multidimensional approach, respects the community of pastoralism and in theory would allow pastoral communities to make decisions for their locality that ensures sustainable outcomes for and by the community. External actors may find their assistance more readily

146 C Butler ‘Critical Legal Studies and the Politics of Space’ Social and Legal Studies (2009) 18(3) 315
147 ECB Bittar (n 25 above)
148 C Butler (n 148 above) 315
149 M Boås (n 24 above) 443
150 Q Mkabela (n 38 above) 184
151 Q Mkabela (n 38 above) 185
152 Q Mkabela (n 38 above) 185
accepted if it supports the community to express itself in indigenous institutions. Moreover, advice on the health of the landscape and sharing best practices for resource shortages, can promote mutual trust between researchers, peace-builders and the community. Though conflict is inherent to new relationships among researchers, peace-builders and pastoral people; if the project is collaborative the researcher or peace-builder and the indigenous communities will be equal and conflicts can be dealt with fairly. In practise, peace-builders would be required to consult with a local committee in local methods. The active involvement and/or training of indigenous people is essential to correct misinformation and the identification of underlying ethnocratic biases in the project. Overall, the compatible goals of peace and human security through landscape, encourages a sense of openness in the dialogue and removes ‘fears of or desires for, deception and appropriation of indigenous African knowledge, practices, and culture by well-intentioned, well-meaning researchers’ and peace-builders.

In line with Afrocentricity, peace-building through the Right to Landscape can promote feelings of ownership that motivate members to invest time and energy, to help shape the nature and quality of the peace-building projects as opposed to being merely involved in foreign democratic manifestations of the human rights regime under Right-Based Approaches. The study of traditional knowledge as a component of African culture has direct implications for the future development of generations of researchers in this continent. The emergence of an Afrocentric method is ‘to re-examine and complement any thinking that attributes undue Western superiority at the expense of neglecting African thought.’ In the same vein, the spirit of Afrocentricity urges responsible actors on the African continent to identify adaptable African method that will constitute the ground frame for all peace-building projects aspiring to be indigenous and with this I present, the Right to Landscape.

4.5. Conclusion

Right-Based Approaches are fundamentally unable to prioritise the treatment of environmental injustice a direct and everlasting threat to peace and security in Somalia and possibly the world. The Right to Landscape is a novel approach to peace-building for its ability to recognise climate change

---

153 Q Mkabela (n 38 above) 186
154 Q Mkabela (n 38 above) 187
155 Q Mkabela (n 38 above) 187
as a threat unlike the conventional streams of the Right-Based Approaches. Furthermore, it appreciates on one hand the universality of landscape but is also sensitive to the nuanced relationships based on more than economic and political meaning. From the Right to Landscape’s acknowledgement of the link between landscape, climate change and conflict to human wellbeing; an alternative peace-building process that includes a gendered political economy creates a more comprehensive situational analysis to protect women and pastoralism from the systematic exclusion of peace-building initiatives. As such the analysis of intra-household labour and resource allocation in a gendered policy economy looks further than quantitative growth indicators to improve measurements of human wellbeing and document the value of ‘women’s work’ and its centrality to ‘development’. Furthermore as presented in chapter 3, women in Somalia are well able to demonstrate the importance of local and indigenous people’s agency in identifying problems and negotiating remedies of the climate change and conflict conundrum. Thus, making women empirically visible is an indispensable project in the current disjuncture within the social fabric of Somalia. Ultimately, Right-Based Approaches cannot live up to its universal claims of peace. This is because it fails to provide for the basic principles of Afrocentrism Ma’at and Nommo. The human rights regime is a deeply Eurocentric framework that fails to allow honest critical engagement with indigenous people when it comes to peace-building. This is due to the male-centric and state-orientated direction of Right-Based Approaches that cannot provide a just and fair society for all Somali people.

CHAPTER 5
Recommendations and Conclusion

5.1. Recommendations for peace-building in Somalia

The journey of Afrocentric methodology experienced in the dissertation is a helpful guideline to understand the multidisciplinary triangulation of climate change, conflict and pastoralism in Somalia. Afrocentrism places great responsibility on researchers to engage emphatically with the African

---

156 S Peterson (n 21 above) 512
157 S Peterson (n 21 above) 517
158 L Hutton (n 116 above) 4
subject through a process of repetitive introspection and retrospection in order to promote outcomes
the pastoral people seem to desire. Such a critical shift in thinking means that the Afrocentric
perspective provides new insights and dimensions in the understanding of African indigenous culture,
in a multicultural context. More vigorous engagement is required between Afrocentric methodology
and the Right to Landscape to truly establish a practical tool for research that will ground future
generations of African scholars in peace-building.

In this dissertation I sought to argue for a refreshed approach to peace-building in Somalia. Climate
change is a formidable threat to pastoralism in Somalia and it creates a considerable opportunity for
women to come to the fore of peace-building initiatives. After all, pastoralists constitute a significant
stabilising force worth directing assistance to in order to promote the economic, social and
environmental health of the country. To this end, I used the Right to Landscape tool to question the
stagnation of human rights and call for a renewed sense of ethics to be instilled in the male-biased
and state-orientated Rights-Based Approaches to peace-building.

5.2. Conclusion

In this dissertation, I decided to explore the five canons of the Afrocentric methodology to address
conflict and stability in Somalia. Removing the lens of objectivity I attempted to speak to issues not
directly related to the instability in Somalia but equally relevant in peace-building. With regards to
cultural specificity, my own judgements and perceptions of the situation affected my ability to evoke
the interests and concerns of the Africana people. By linking climate change to the conflict in Somalia
and researching the consequences for the pastoral community and the gender dynamics within them;
I found that the Afrocentric paradigm I used led me to challenge the dominant world-view of Right-
Based Approaches to peace-building. In particular, I gained insight into the gaps of conventional
peace-building activities and the human rights regime that governs the norm-creating institutions of
the global arena. This was because I was able to avoid a mode of technocratic rationality and embrace
a multidisciplinary methodology. International law and norms represent an asymmetry of power that
exists between the economic interests of large organizations and those individuals and communities
who depend on natural resources for subsistence. Researching the failures of prevailing peace-
building practices in Right-Based Approaches, I looked to the daily struggles faced by Somali
pastoralists to understand more intimately the challenges of peace-building. I therefore, found new duties relating to climate change and new duty-bearers, those being Somali women and pastoralists at large. Through this research the gendered political economy arose to me as the most suitable way forward to address the gaps in current peace-building. I recognise the use of the Right to Landscape is complicated in the peace-building process as it allows subjective interference and it is loaded with societal baggage. However, I do believe a sustainable peace will only be possible through the use of a multidimensional peace-building tool and decentralised consultations to ensure all marginalised actors are included in the dialogue and peace processes. I have used the Right to Landscape to the reframe human rights and invigorate a sense of global justice, an ethical dimension that is no longer entirely represented by the politicised UDHR. Hence I introduce with the Right to Landscape a fresh discourse that can include the informal economy as an African-owned economic and social context of pastoralism in which human beings and their landscape provide resources for a sustainable peace. Moving the emphasis away from external funding, the Right to Landscape assisted me to recognize the possibility for the Somali people to use local economic activities already in process, local technology and local knowledge of the land towards better social relations. Localizing adaptation mechanisms for climate change with the assistance of external bodies stands in contrast to the top-down or external-internal approach that is promoted by the human right regime. From my analysis of the landscape in Somalia I have come to the conclusion that the introduction of the African women as an agent of change, is capable of reducing the effects of climate change and through her centrality in the gendered political economy, the Right to Landscape describes a flexible path towards a sustainable peace.
5.3. Bibliography


Asante, MK Afrocentricity (Africa World Press: Trenton 1988)


Babbie, E The Practice of Social Research (Cenage Learning: Canada 2009)


Butler, C ‘Critical Legal Studies and the Politics of Space (2009) 18(3) Social and Legal Studies 313–332


Curtis, D ‘Introduction’ in D Curtis (ed) *Peacebuilding, power and politics in Africa* (Centre for African Studies: Cambridge 2012)


Fröhlich J & J Knieling ‘Conceptualising Climate Change Governance’ in J. Knieling and W. Leal Filho Climate Change Governance (eds) (Berlin: Springer Verlag 2013)


Tamara Naidoo, 2015

cqf3YHJAhUFRg8KHQcTDg4&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.un.org%2Fdisabilities%2Fdocuments%2Freports%2FSG_Synthesis_Report_Road_to_Dignity_by_2030.pdf&usg=AFQjCNENlwkCJn7laJLLp3Hjoly7Yhjre3pQ&sig2=0pF27J7YOqQXVWvD4xExw (last accessed: 5 June 2015)


Welzer, H Climate Wars: Why People will be Killed in the 21st Century (U.K: Polity 2012)

