



UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

**A DECADE OF EDUCATIONAL CHANGE: GROUNDED
NARRATIVES OF SCHOOL PRINCIPALS**

by

**RENNIE ESTHER MPAHLELE
neé MALELE**

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

In the

FACULTY OF EDUCATION MANAGEMENT, LAW AND POLICY

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

PROMOTER: DR. B MALAN

PRETORIA

2009



DECLARATION

I, RENNIE ESTHER MPHAHLELE, declare that

“A decade of educational change: Grounded narratives of school principals”

Is my own work and that all the sources I have used and quoted have been acknowledged by means of complete references.

Signed: _____ **Date:** _____

R.E. MPHAHLELE



CARE OF LANGUAGE

I, the undersigned testify that I was responsible for care of the language of the thesis: A decade of educational change: Grounded narratives of school principals.

M.W. White

Date



DEDICATION

I dedicate this thesis to:

- My beloved husband, Daniel Mphahlele and our two children, Kagiso and Katlego for their unfailing support, motivation and understanding during my years of study. They have been there for me all the time and praying for my daily strength to bring this work to an end.
- To my late parents Abram Leburu Malele and Bachipile Anna Malele for the encouragement and support they gave me to go to school. My mother has been there for me, believing in me that I will always make it. She has been a strong pillar of my life and has always valued education far above everything. Her encouraging words have led me to reach where I am today. I wish both my parents were still alive just to tell them how I appreciate to have parents like them.
- To all the children, grand children and great grand children from both families of Malele and Mphahlele. May this thesis be an encouragement and an inspiration to all of you so that you reach the level of knowing and understanding of how much significant is education.
- To all the South African school principals who are carrying the education of learners at their schools upon their shoulders to ensure that teaching and learning continue to take place. Continue doing the good work for the benefit of the South Africans.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Working on this thesis was the most difficult, challenging and exhausting journey I ever had embarked on in my life. The road was long, hard, painful and hurting. I have traveled on this long and winding road which when I look back and remember what happened, I find myself thanking God every minute of my life for the many blessings, talents, wisdom and privileged opportunities and for the prayers answered during my long journey. Without these, such a gruelling project could have never come to an end. I would also like to acknowledge the contributions of the following that helped me to realize my goals:

- My family, and in particular my husband Daniel and our two children Kagiso and Katlego, who had to cope with my absence whilst I was working on this project, deserve special thanks. I would like to thank them for their unflinching support, encouragement and prayers that made me to go on even under difficult circumstance. To them I dedicate this thesis.
- I would also like to express my sincere gratitude for the competent assistance of my supervisor, Dr. Beverly Malan, to whom I owe a huge debt for her intellectual inspiration, insights and encouragements. I have had countless meetings with her and in every of our meeting I would leave with a lot of insight and words of encouragement. I really appreciate her support through the period she stood by my side and believe that I would ultimately make it. Dr Malan, I really appreciate the support you gave me and I will never forget the inspiration you brought to my life.
- I also would like to give special thanks to my daughter, Katlego who always stood by me and told me that I will make it. Katlego did a lot of typing work in this research project. My girl, I will always be grateful for the contributions you have made to this work.



- **Ultimately, may the Honour, Glory and Majesty be unto the Lord Almighty God for giving me the everyday strength to complete this work.**

LIST OF CHAPTERS

CHAPTER 1: RESEARCH PARAMETERS

1.1	Introduction and background	1
1.2	Research problem and rationale	3
1.3	Research purpose	5
1.4	Research questions	6
1.5	Research objectives	7
1.6	Working premises	7
1.7	Conceptual framework	9
1.8	Theoretical framework	10
1.9	Knowledge claim	11
1.10	Research paradigm	12
1.11	Research methodology	13
1.12	Research design	15
1.12.1	Defining data	16
1.12.2	Sampling	16
1.12.3	Data collection	17
1.12.4	Data analysis	19
1.13	Research ethics	21
1.14	Trustworthiness	22
1.15	Limitations of the study	23
1.16	Significance of the study	24
1.17	Research programme	24
1.18	Concluding Comments.....	27



CHAPTER 2: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

2.1	Introduction and purpose	28
2.2	Knowledge claim	29
2.3	Research paradigm	31
2.4	Research methodology	32
2.5	Research design.....	35
2.5.1	Stories as data.....	36
2.5.2	Sampling: Identifying story-tellers.....	37
2.5.3	Deciding on data collection instruments.....	39
2.5.3.1	Conversations.....	39
2.5.3.2	Interviews.....	40
2.5.3.3	Observations.....	42
2.5.3.4	Reflective journal.....	43
2.5.4	Accessing principals' spaces.....	44
2.5.5	Collecting principals' stories	46
2.6	Interpreting principals' stories	48
2.7	Narrative Ethics	50
2.7.1	The clearing house	51
2.7.2	Protecting my sources.....	51
2.7.3	Validating my story	52
2.8	Conclusion	53

CHAPTER 3: GENERIC STORIES OF EDUCATIONAL CHANGE

3.1	Introduction and purpose	54
3.2	The macro story of educational change	55
3.2.1	Change as complex phenomenon	55
3.2.2	Sustaining educational change	57
3.2.3	Managing change at school level	61
3.3	South Africa's story of educational change	63
3.3.1	Implementing change at school level	66
3.3.1.1	Curriculum change	67
3.3.1.2	Parental involvement	68



3.3.1.3	Corporal punishment	69
3.3.1.4	Principals as change agents and managers	71
3.4	Sacred change stories	77
3.5	Concluding comments	80

CHAPTER 4: PRINCIPALS' STORIES OF EDUCATIONAL CHANGE

4.1	Introduction and purpose	82
4.2	Main characters as narrators	84
4.2.1	Character 1 – a principal in school A	84
4.2.2	Character 2 – a principal in school B	84
4.2.3	Character 3 – a principal in school C	84
4.2.4	Character 4 – a principal in school D	85
4.2.5	Character 5 – a principal in school E	85
4.3	Narrative context	85
4.4	Narrative content	87
4.5	Narrative discourse	88
4.6	Restructured narratives	89
4.6.1	Kedibone's story	89
4.6.2	Goboima's story	101
4.6.3	Rekopane's story	107
4.6.4	Somisanang's story	117
4.6.5	Kedisaletse's story	124
4.7	Emerging themes	133
4.8	Concluding remarks	137



CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1	Introduction and purpose	139
5.2	Research focus, purpose and procedures	141
5.3	Research findings	144
5.3.1	Educational change in South Africa during the period 1998 to 2008	145
5.3.2	Feeding change into schools	148
5.3.3	The effect of educational change on schools	149
5.3.4	The effect of educational change on the role of school principals	152
5.3.5	Participating principals' experiences of educational change	153
5.3.6	Sustainability of change	154
5.4	Conclusions	156
5.6	Motivated recommendations	157

REFERENCES



LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1	Research questions, premises and procedures.....	8
Table 2.1	Interview Schedule	41
Table 2.2	Data collection schedule.....	46



LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1 Holistic data analysis.....20

Figure 1.2 Research programme..... 26



LIST OF ANNEXURES

- Annexure A: Application letter to Gauteng Department of Education**
- Annexure B: Permission letter from Gauteng Department of Education**
- Annexure C: Application letters to school principals**
- Annexure D: Ethical Clearance Certificate**
- Annexure E: School principals' consent letters**
- Annexure F: Interview schedule**
- Annexure G: Transcripts of interviews**

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

CC	Curriculum change
DoE	Department of Education
HOD	Head of Department
SGB	School Governing Body
SMT	School Management Team
IQMS	Integrated Quality Management System
GDE	Gauteng Department of Education
PMDS	Performance Management Development System
SASA	South African Schools Act
NQF	National Qualification Framework
SAQA	South African Qualification Authority
LTSM	Learner Teacher Support Material
DET	Department of Education and Training



ABSTRACT

Since 1994 South Africa has changed dramatically in all spheres, not least of which in the sphere of education. Not only are all schools now open to learners of all races, cultures, religions and language groups, but class sizes have also been standardized leading to the redeployment of a number of teachers from previously advantaged schools. Many schools have also changed from being single-medium to parallel-medium or double-medium schools. Some schools have been accorded Section 21 status, which makes their school governing bodies responsible for the financial affairs of their schools while others have been altogether exempted from school fees. The State has also introduced feeding and school transport schemes and has launched a number of initiatives aimed at teacher upgrading.

It is clear, therefore, that the forces that led to political, social and economic change are now also changing school teaching, learning, leading and management. On the teaching and learning fronts schools have seen the introduction of two versions of an outcomes-based curriculum, the mainstreaming (inclusion) of learners who were previously marginalized because of mental and physical disabilities, and a new emphasis on active learning, critical thinking and group work. On the management and leadership front schools have seen the introduction of shared ownership of schools, with school governing bodies being tasked with school governance while the principal and his management team are responsible for the day to day management of schools.

The primary means used by the State to effect these changes in schools is the development of policies aimed at redressing past imbalances at schools coupled with extensive staff training, especially those staff members expected to ensure the smooth implementations of policies towards educational transformation. Since principals are responsible for the day-to-day management of schools it follows that they are the ones who represent the various departments of education at school level. They are also, however, the ones who have to ensure that the voices of the teachers, learners and parents

forming part of their school community are heard at government level. They therefore find themselves in the middle of two groups of people whose needs are often different but

both of whom they – the principals - represent. It is principals, therefore, who most often bear the brunt of change and/or are the target of criticism from above or below.

Being a principal myself I empathize with the position in which principals of South African public schools find themselves during these times of change. It was my personal experience, coupled with my exposure to other principals' experiences of change, experiences often discussed at principals' workshops and meetings, that made me decide to conduct an inquiry into principals' experiences of change. It was while I was reading up on the topic that I became convinced that the most appropriate way of investigating these experiences was through the collection and analysis of principals' first-hand accounts of change and the challenges change posed for them at a personal and professional level. I therefore opted to use narrative methodology in collecting, interpreting and presenting principals' stories of change.

Also informing my inquiry was the fact that, notwithstanding all the research that had been conducted into educational change in South Africa since the demise of apartheid, very little attention had been paid to principals' experience of change or of the real impact of change on schools and the people who worked there. I asked myself whether things had really changed or whether the changes were merely superficial. Informing my inquiry was an urgency to find out what has really been happening in schools since 1998, when policies were first implemented. Could policy makers really claim that what they had formulated translated as intended into educational practice, and would those changes be sustainable over time? What happened in the interim? What happened to school principals? What were their feelings and experiences about the educational changes that had occurred from 1998 to 2008? What are they thinking now? Have they changed as individuals? Have their performance, leadership and/or management styles changed over the years, and if so, in what ways and why? Put differently, what was new about the way they conducted themselves and/or managed their schools? Have they learnt anything during the past ten years that could assist them in managing their schools differently than they had managed them prior to 1994?

What I found was that, while the principals who participated in my study were very different in terms of culture, gender and personality, they were all challenged and are still being challenged by change and the way in which it has upset their own and their respective schools' equilibrium. Even so, none of them are entirely negative about the changes that have been effected. Rather, they all have their own ideas about how change can be sustained and utilized to improve not only the quality of education but also human and other relations in the country.

The conclusions I reached as a result of my research findings cannot be generalized across schools or made applicable to principals across the country since the study was conducted in a very specific region of the Gauteng Department of Education with a relatively small sample of schools. I am, however, of the opinion that the findings are significant in that they indicate commonalities and differences between principals that could be ascribed to race, culture, history and gender. Consequently I believe that, should the study be replicated in other contexts, it is quite possible that the same themes might emerge, thereby creating the possibility of making the kind of generalizations that could be of use to policy makers and/or educational change agents of the future.

Key words

- 1. Leadership**
- 2. Management**
- 3. Transformation**
- 4. Education management**
- 5. Curriculum change**
- 6. Communication**
- 7. School principals**
- 8. Agents of change**
- 9. Motivation**
- 10. Implementation of change**



***HOW CAN I REPAY THE LORD,
FOR HIS GOODNESS?***

PSALM 116:12