

CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES

LIST OF TABLES

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

ABSTRACT

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

**COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN
NATURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT:**

**THE CASE OF THE MAKULEKE COMMUNITY BASED NATURAL
RESOURCE MANAGEMENT INITIATIVE**

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

1.2 Community Based Natural Resource Management

1.3 The Research Problem **Barbara Nompumelelo Tapela**

9830815

1.2.1 THE RESEARCH PROBLEM

1.2.2 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

1.4 The Research Methodology

1.5 Methodology of the Study

1.5.1 THE RESEARCH DESIGN

1.5.2 THE RESEARCH INSTRUMENTS

1.5.3 THE RESEARCH PROCEDURES

1.6 Significance of the Study

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the Degree MA in the Faculty of Humanities,
University of Pretoria, Pretoria

CHAPTER TWO: INTRODUCTION

2.1 Definition of Key Concepts

2.1.1 NATURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

2.1.2 PROTECTED AREAS

2.1.3 PARTICIPATORY APPROACH

2.1.4 COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION **Department of Geography & Geoinformatics**

October 2001

2.1.5 LUMP SUM INITIATIVES

2.1.6 SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT



CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES	7
LIST OF TABLES	8
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	9
ABSTRACT	10
ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	12
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	14
1.1 Background	14
1.2 CBNRM in the South African Context	17
1.3 The Research Problem	19
1.3.1 THE QUESTION OF POWER AND CONTROL	19
1.3.2 A QUESTION OF GENDER	20
1.4 The Research Aim and Objectives	20
1.5 Methodology of the Study	21
1.5.1 THE RESEARCH FRAMEWORK	21
1.5.2 METHODS OF DATA COLLECTION	21
1.5.3 METHODS OF DATA ANALYSIS	23
1.6 Scope of the Study	24
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	25
2.1 Definition of Key Concepts	25
2.1.1 NATURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT	25
2.1.2 PROTECTED AREAS	26
2.1.3 PARTICIPATORY APPROACHES	26
2.1.4 COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION	27
2.1.5 CBNRM INITIATIVES	30
2.1.6 SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT	30

2.2	Origins and Conceptual Foundations of Community Based Natural Resource Management	31
2.2.1	PRELUDE TO COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION: INDUSTRIALISM AND THE TOP-DOWN PROTECTIONIST APPROACHES	32
2.2.1.1	Salient Features of the Classical Protectionist Approaches	32
2.2.1.2	Conceptual Foundations of the Top-Down Protectionist Approaches	33
2.2.1.3	Historical Development of Protected Areas and Implications on Local Communities in Africa	34
2.2.2	TOWARDS COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION: SHIFTING APPROACHES IN CONVENTIONAL DEVELOPMENT AND CONSERVATION PRACTICE	35
2.2.3	HISTORICAL CONTEXT OF THE SHIFTS TOWARDS PARTICIPATORY APPROACHES	38
2.2.3.1	The Poor People's Critique of Industrial Development	39
2.2.3.2	The Socialist Critique of Industrial Development	39
2.2.3.3	The Environmentalist Critique of Industrial Development	40
2.2.4	EMERGENCE OF THE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT DOCTRINE	41
2.3	The Unfolding Field of Community-Based Natural Resource Management (CBNRM)	43
2.3.1	THE PURPOSE OF CBNRM	44
2.3.2	SALIENT FEATURES OF CBNRM	44
2.3.2.1	Decentralisation: A Gradual Process	45
2.3.2.2	Modes of CBNRM Initiation	45
2.3.2.3	Archetypal CBNRM Approaches	45
2.4	Key Issues and Critical Elements in the Articulation of CBNRM	46
2.4.1	OUTLINE OF IDENTIFIED KEY ISSUES AND ELEMENTS	46
2.4.2	POLICY AND POLITICS	47
2.4.3	LEGISLATIVE SUPPORT AND SECURITY OF TENURE	48
2.4.4	INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK	50
2.4.5	LOCAL CAPACITY AND CAPACITY-BUILDING	51
2.4.6	ECONOMIC BENEFITS AND MARKETS	52
2.4.7	DEFINITION OF THE CBNRM PROBLEM	53
2.4.8	IDENTIFICATION OF STAKEHOLDERS	54
2.4.9	COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN PROGRAMME DESIGN, IMPLEMENTATION AND EVALUATION	55
2.5	Conceptual Framework	56
2.5.1	COMMUNITY CONTROL IN CBNRM	56
2.5.2	GENDER ISSUES IN CBNRM	59

CHAPTER THREE: CASE STUDY OF THE MAKULEKE COMMUNITY-BASED NATURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT INITIATIVE	60
3.1 Location	60
3.1.1 SITUATION	60
3.1.2 SITE	60
3.2 Socio-economic Setting	62
3.2.1 SOCIAL AND POLITICAL ORGANISATION	62
3.2.2 SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT	64
3.2.3 LAND USE AND TENURE	68
3.2.4 GENDER PERCEPTIONS ON COMMUNITY NEEDS	69
3.3 Historical Background: Forced Removal	71
3.4 Broader Policy and Political Context	73
3.5 Toward Active Community Participation: The Makuleke Land Claim	74
3.5.1 FACTORS LEADING TO THE LODGING OF THE LAND CLAIM	75
3.5.2 DELINEATION OF THE CLAIM AREA	77
3.5.3 LAND CLAIM SETTLEMENT PROCESS	77
3.5.3.1 Prelude to the Lodging of the Land Claim: Seeking Consensus through Negotiation	79
3.5.3.2 Early Phase of the Land Claim Process: Active Consultation	79
3.5.3.3 Intermediary Phase: Seeking Consensus through Negotiation and Functional Participation	80
3.5.3.4 Final Phase of the Land Claim Process: Settlement Agreement and Sharing of Authority	83
3.6 Makuleke Conservation and Tourism Programme (MCTP)	85
3.6.1 PROGRAMME AIM AND OBJECTIVES	85
3.6.2 PROGRAMME PRINCIPLES	85
3.6.3 NATURE OF THE RESOURCE BASE	86
3.6.3.1 Spatial Distribution of the Resource Base	86
3.6.3.2 Human Population Demand-Resource Ratio	86
3.6.4 MCTP ORGANISATIONAL STRUCTURE	87
3.6.5 INSTITUTIONAL ACTORS AT THE PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION LEVEL	88
3.6.6 GENDER PARTICIPATION IN POLITICAL DECISION MAKING	89
3.6.7 GENDER ACCESS TO CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT	92

3.6.8	LINKS WITH OTHER SIMILAR INITIATIVES	92
3.6.9	MAJOR PLANNED ACTIVITIES	94
3.7	Emerging Issues in the Makuleke CBNRM Initiative	95

CHAPTER FOUR: ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS 96

4.1	Community Control in the Makuleke CBNRM Initiative	96
4.1.1	ANALYSIS OF IMPLICATIONS OF THE NATIONAL POLICY ENVIRONMENT ON THE DECENTRALISATION OF AUTHORITY OVER NATURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT	96
4.1.2	ANALYSIS OF COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN THE MCTP FORMULATION PROCESS	97
4.1.3	ANALYSIS OF COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN THE INITIATION OF THE MCTP	99
4.1.4	ANALYSIS OF COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN THE PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS	101
4.2	Gender Issues in the Makuleke CBNRM INITIATIVE	102
4.2.1	ANALYSIS OF GENDER ACCESS TO POLITICAL DECISION MAKING IN THE MCTP	102

CHAPTER FIVE: POTENTIAL AND EFFECTIVENESS OF THE MAKULEKE INITIATIVE: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION 104

5.1	Evaluation of the Strengths and Weaknesses of the MCTP	105
5.1.1	ENABLING POLIC ENVIRONMENT	105
5.1.2	LEGISLATIVE SUPPORT	106
5.1.3	INSTITUTIONAL CONTEXT	107
5.1.4	DIVERSE NATURE OF THE RESOURCE BASE	107
5.1.5	MCTP PRINCIPLES OF EQUITY AND ACCOUNTABILITY	108
5.1.6	ADAPTIVE MANAGEMENT APPROACH	109
5.1.7	COMMUNITY COHESION	109
5.1.8	VERTICAL AND HORIZONTAL INTEGRATION	109
5.2	Opportunities for Strengthening the MCTP Instruments	110
5.2.1	BALANCING DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES AND INCOME REQUIREMENTS WITH LIVELIHOOD NEEDS	110
5.2.2	BALANCING NATURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT FOCUS ON THE MAKULEKE REGION AND THE MAKULEKE AREA	111

5.2.3	SHARING KNOWLEDGE AND CONTROL THROUGH HORIZONTAL INTEGRATION	112
5.3	Potential Threats to the Makuleke CBNRM Initiative	112
5.3.1	QUESTION OF THE POTENTIAL OF THE MCTP TO ACHIEVE REDUCTIONS IN POVERTY AND INSECURITY	112
5.3.2	LEGITIMACY OF THE MCPA EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE	114
5.4	Conclusion	115

REFERENCES CITED	119
------------------	-----

APPENDIX 1:	Map showing the Maputo Sub-corridor IEMF, Northern Province, South Africa	128
-------------	---	-----

APPENDIX 2:	Map showing the Ivory Route Tourism Development Initiative, Northern Province, South Africa	129
-------------	---	-----

LIST OF FIGURES

1.1	LOCATION MAP OF STUDY AREA	19
1.2	THE RESEARCH FRAMEWORK	22
2.1	MODES OF PARTICIPATION	29
2.2	THE WEB OF RESPONSIBLE WELL-BEING	37
2.3	LINKING COMMUNITY LEVEL CONTROL IN CBNRM TO POLICY AND PROGRAMME INSTRUMENTS	57
3.1	MAKULEKE AREA: SITUATION	61
3.2	MAKULEKE AREA: POPULATION DISTRIBUTION, 1995	63
3.3	MAKULEKE COMMUNITY: DISTRIBUTION OF EMPLOYED HEADS OF HOUSEHOLDS BY MEAN MONTHLY INCOME, 1997	65
3.4	MAKULEKE COMMUNITY: OCCUPATIONAL STATUS OF PRODUCTIVE POPULATION BY GENDER, 1995	65
3.5	MAKULEKE AREA: SOCIAL SERVICES, 2000	66
3.6	MAKULEKE AREA: INFRASTRUCTURE AND DWELLING UNITS, 2000	67
3.7	MAKULEKE AREA: LAND USE - 1970, 1987 & 1994	69
3.8	MAKULEKE COMMUNITY: GENDER PERCEPTIONS ON THE MOST IMPORTANT COMMUNITY NEEDS, 1998	70
3.9	MAKULEKE COMMUNITY: GENDER PERCEPTIONS ON SECONDARY COMMUNITY NEEDS, 1998	71
3.10	MAKULEKE LAND CLAIM: DELINEATION OF THE CLAIM AREA, 1997	77
3.11	SUMMARY OF THE KEY TERMS OF THE SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT THAT HAVE IMPLICATIONS ON THE MCTP, 1998	84
3.12	MAKULEKE COMMUNITY: PARTICIPATION IN DECISION MAKING BY GENDER, 1998	89
3.13	MAKULEKE COMMUNITY: MODE OF PARTICIPATION IN DECISION MAKING BY GENDER, 1998	92
3.14	THE MCTP IN THE HIERARCHICAL NESTING OF INSTITUTIONALISED NATURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT	94
4.1	PRECONDITIONS FOR COMMUNITY LEVEL CONTROL IN CBNRM: A SUMMARY	96
4.2	A CONCEPTUALISATION OF THE PROCESS OF DECENTRALISATION OF RESOURCE MANAGEMENT RESPONSIBILITY TO THE MAKULEKE COMMUNITY	98

LIST OF TABLES

2.1	PROTECTED AREA CATEGORIES AND MANAGEMENT OBJECTIVES	26
2.2	A TYPOLOGY OF PARTICIPATION	28
2.3	TWO PARADIGMS: THINGS AND PEOPLE	36
2.4	ARCHETYPAL APPROACHES TO CBNRM	45
2.5	CRITICAL ELEMENTS FOR SUCCESS OF CBNRM: AN OUTLINE	47
3.1	MAKULEKE COMMUNITY: PAIRWISE RANKING BY GENDER OF THE COMMUNITY NEEDS PERCEIVED AS MOST IMPORTANT, 1998	70
3.2	STAKEHOLDERS INVOLVED IN THE MAKULEKE LAND CLAIM, 1998	81
3.3	PROJECTS WITHIN THE MCTP FRAMEWORK, 1997 TO 1998	90
5.1	A SUMMARY OF THE MCTP STRENGTHS, WEAKNESSES, OPPORTUNITIES AND THREATS, 1998 TO 2000	104

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

During the preparation of this dissertation, various individuals and institutions gave me considerable assistance and encouragement. Only a few are mentioned herein. I express my sincere gratitude to the Makuleke people, Chief Makuleke, the MCPA Executive Committee and the MCTP staff allowing and helping me to carry out research within their community. I am particularly grateful to Lamson Maluleke, the Programme Implementation Officer and Community Co-ordinator for the Northern Province Biodiversity Forum, for giving me as much assistance as I required in this study. My thanks also go to Anthony Hlongwane, Edward Maluleke and Enos Mgonezulu for assisting in the carrying out of the in-depth interviews.

The Centre for Science Development (CSD) provided funds for my research capacity development and collection of field data on gender issues through a collaborative project between the University of Pretoria and the University of Venda. This assistance is greatly valued particularly as I had no other secure source of funding for the study.

I also thank Conrad Steenkamp, the MCTP Facilitation Officer, for sharing views and concerns about the Makuleke CBNRM process. My appreciation also goes to Hector Magome, the SANP General Manager for Park Planning and Development, and to Dr. James Murombedzi, the Programme Officer for the Ford Foundation, for their considerable assistance during the research.

I am particularly indebted to my study leader, Professor Deon Wilson, for his tireless guidance throughout the preparation of this dissertation and for his contribution to my scholarly growth. I also thank the Head of the Geography Department, Professor Keith Beavon; the ex-Head of Department, Professor Flip Hattingh; members of staff and my fellow students for their generous assistance. My sincere thanks are also due to Ingrid Booysen for assisting with the cartographic, graphic and technical editing of the dissertation.

Last but not least, I am grateful to my husband, Tjeni, for believing in me and making it possible for me to carry out and complete this study. I also thank my son, Mbongeni, for trying his best to understand my need for undisturbed time to prepare this dissertation. These two have been a very important support crew throughout this study.

ABSTRACT

TITLE OF DISSERTATION : Community Participation in Natural Resource Management:
The case of the Makuluke Community Based Natural
Resource Management Initiative

By

Barbara N. Tapela

STUDY LEADER : Prof. G. D. H. Wilson

DEPARTMENT : Geography & Geoinformatics

DEGREE : Magister Artium in Geography

Rural communities living in the neighbourhoods of protected areas are among the least developed communities in the LDCs. In the global quest for sustainable development and democracy, participation in natural resource management by these communities has become an important component in rural development and biodiversity conservation programmes. The proliferation of CBNRM initiatives in the LDCs, however, has so far not yielded any fundamental reductions in poverty and insecurity in the targeted communities. This has raised questions about the viability of CBNRM as a strategy for articulating the development objectives of local communities. Questions have also been raised about the ideological bases of CBNRM.

This dissertation presents an analysis of participation in a CBNRM initiative by the Makuleke community of South Africa. Focus is on the issues of community control and gender in the CBNRM process. Findings by the study show that the preconditions for community-level control have largely been met and the Makuleke CBO structure has been constituted as a representative and legally accountable entity. However, there apparently subsists a view that indigenous rural communities like the Makuleke cannot be fully entrusted with leadership roles in CBNRM. The study also finds that despite the securing of gender rights of access to bases of social power and productive wealth through legislative instruments, some social structures and attitudes that favour male dominance remain entrenched in the Makuleke community. These militate against the strategic participation by women in environmental governance and in the benefits stream emanating from CBNRM.

The dissertation argues that the success of the CBNRM initiatives such as the Makuleke's will depend on a more complex interplay of variables than solely on the empowerment of the community through strengthening of CBO structures, securing resource rights, entry into the benefits stream and developing of capacities. Success will largely depend on the ability of CBNRM programmes to achieve fundamental reductions in poverty and insecurity. Since there are multiple jurisdictions in CBNRM, LDC states will have to strike a difficult balance or make a critical choice between promoting the interests of Northern agencies in order to secure conditions of production and defending the interests of local communities in order to secure social integration. The responses by LDC states will have significant implications on the success of CBNRM initiatives.

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ART South Africa	Africa Resources Trust, South Africa
CAMPFIRE	Communal Areas Management Programme for Indigenous Resources
CBC	Community Based Conservation
CBD	Convention on Biodiversity Conservation
CBNRM	Community Based Natural Resources Management
CBO	Community Based Organization
CITES	Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species
CPA	Communal Property Association
DBSA	Development Bank for Southern Africa
DFID	Department for International Development (United Kingdom)
DWAF	Department of Water Affairs and Forestry
EWT	Endangered Wildlife Trust
FoM	Friends of Makuleke
FRD	Foundation for Research and Development
GEAR	Growth, Employment and Redistribution
GEM	Group for Environmental Monitoring
GTZ	Gesellschaft Technische Zusammenarbeit
HDI	Human Development Index
ICDPs	Integrated Conservation and Development Projects
IDRC	International Development and Research Council (Ottawa)
IIED	International Institute for Environment and Development
IEMF	Integrated Environmental Management Framework
IUCN	International Union for the Conservation of Natural Resources
JMB	Joint Management Board
KNP	Kruger National Park
LA21	Local Agenda 21
LDC	Less Developed Country
LRG	Land Reform Group
LRM	Local Resource Management
MEC	Member of the Executive Council (of the Provincial Legislature)
MCPA	Makuleke Communal Property Association
MCTP	Makuleke Conservation and Tourism Programme
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NPB	National Parks Board
RALES	Responsible and Accountable Legal Entities

RAMSAR	Convention on Wetlands of International Importance
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
SANDF	South African National Defence Force
SANP	South African National Parks
SASUSG	Southern African Sustainable Use Support Group
SMMEs	Small and Medium and Micro-Enterprises
TAE	Tribal Authority Executive
TBCAs	Trans-Border Conservation Areas
TBNRMs	Trans-Boundary Natural Resource Management Areas
TC	Tribal Council
TLC	Transitional Local Council
TLGA	Transitional Local Government Act
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
WCED	World Commission on Environment and Development
WESSA	Wildlife and Environment Society of South Africa