

## CHAPTER 6

### CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### 6.1 ANSWERING THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The main research question of this doctoral thesis was:

How can a General Music Appraisal Programme (GMAP) with the option to specialise in Ensembles for available instruments be facilitated in the Further Education and Training (FET) phase?

This question was addressed through action research, and by reviewing the music curricula (Chapter 2) of England, the United States of America, the status quo schools in South Africa, as well as informal interviews with facilitators from Gauteng and North-West provinces in South Africa, facilitators from England, and informal discussions with MEUSSA critical friends via the internet.

As a music facilitator and researcher who for many years has dealt with extra-curricular outcomes of Music and Music education, the author is quite confident to confirm that the proposed unit standards in this thesis can lay the foundation for a quality General Music Appraisal Programme with the option to specialise in Ensembles for available instruments. The main concerns with the implementation of a GMAP and an ESP for available instruments are the lack of qualified music facilitators who will have to teach the Music programmes. However, with in-service training and support material provided by the Department of Education and Tertiary institutions, the author is confident that a GMAP can be facilitated in the Further Education and Training (FET) phase.

The author found that standards for music must be robust enough to define and defend the core of knowledge and cultural experience which is the entitlement of

every learner in South Africa. At the same time, such standards should be flexible enough to give teachers the scope to build their teaching around them in ways which will enhance their achievement by learners.

The author will address the following sub-questions simultaneously.

- Is there a demand for a General Music Appraisal Programme (GMAP) with the option to specialise in Ensembles for available instruments in the Further Education and Training (FET) phase?
- How can realistic unit standards for an Ensemble Specialisation Programme (ESP) for available instruments be formulated that can be used by all schools in South Africa?

During the study it was found that there is a demand for a GMAP for NQF levels 2-4 (Grades 10-12) as an elective as well as an Ensemble Specialisation Programme (ESP) for available instruments. This information was gathered in the form of informal discussions with facilitators at schools listed in Chapter 2.5 and confirmed with music facilitators during August/September 2001, while examining the practical examinations for the Senior Certificate Examination of Gauteng province at the following schools (the schools are named in no particular order):

- Sir Pierre van Rhyneveld High School in Kempton Park
- Pretoria High School for Girls, Pretoria
- Drie Riviere High School, Vereeniging
- Crawford College, Pretoria
- Kudung Contemporary School, Vereeniging
- Kutla Thara Contemporary School, Sebokeng
- Zwartkop High School, Centurion
- Eldoraigue High School, Centurion
- Transvalia High School, Vanderbijlpark.

The researcher came to the conclusion that all learners should have the chance to include music in their curriculum from NQF levels 1-4, whatever their individual needs may be. She is positive that a qualification based on the MEUSSA model, which includes a GMAP and an ESP for available instruments for NQF at levels 2-4, could work towards the vision of SAQA (2000a:2):

To ensure the development and implementation of a National Qualifications Framework which contributes to the full development of each learner and to the social and economic development of the nation at large.

The author used her experience as a music teacher since 1962 as a basis to write unit standards for an ESP for available instruments. She also used the expertise of the MEUSSA members and the MEUSSA model mapped by Petro Grové that resulted in a set of unit standards provided in Chapter 5.7. The researcher made an additional study of the status quo music education in South Africa. The reason for this research was

- to prepare for the task of writing unit standards that will set out a clear, full and statutory entitlement for Music education as a sub-field for NSB 02 (Culture and Arts), and
- to react with a positive contribution to the statement made by Dr. M. Nkomo, chair of SAQA (SAQA 2000b:24):

We need systemic change, not just curriculum or pedagogic change, we need a new driving vision for our system, not just a new paradigm for curriculum design and delivery in the classroom; we need to accept the fallacy in some of the assumptions about education that exist in our society and realise that there are some new “truths”.

The author agrees with the current Minister of Education that in the National Curriculum Framework for Further Education and Training (FET) (DoE 2000:ii):

[T]he new curriculum should move towards a new, balanced learning experience that will provide flexible access to further education, lifelong

learning and higher education, and to productive employment in a range of occupational contexts.

## **6.2 RECOMMENDATIONS**

The author made an in-depth study regarding the implementation of a General Music Appraisal Programme and an Ensemble Specialisation Programme for available instruments for NQF levels 2–4, with the option to specialise in Ensembles for available instruments, and then formulated recommendations regarding further development in this field. Recommendations are based on the assumption that the proposed unit standards for GMAP and ESP for available instruments, levels 2–4 (Grades 10–12), will be accepted by SAQA.

### **6.2.1 GMAP at NQF levels 2–4 (Grades 10–12)**

In this regard, the author makes four recommendations:

- All schools should have an equal opportunity to implement GMAP NQF level 1 so that learners can have the possibility to select GMAP NQF levels 2–4 as an elective thereafter.
- Support material should be available to all schools, including guidelines for lessons, with sound examples on tape and/or CD.
- There should be a structure in the education system providing formal credits for activities such as ensemble, orchestra, bands, choir, sport, etc.
- Although there are many problems to resolve concerning the size of class groups (30–40 learners in a class), facilitators should experiment continuously with new ideas.

The following suggestions are made which the Department of Education and the management of schools should seriously consider:

- Appoint qualified facilitators for Culture and Arts.

- Appoint assistant facilitators to help with the management of groups bigger than 25 learners.
- Supply appropriate sound resources and technology.
- Learners specialising in an instrument should be able to elect an ESP for available instruments.

The author is aware of the fact that funding may not be readily available for the above-mentioned suggestions. She therefore recommends that a 10 year plan be implemented to facilitate Music Magnet schools identified by the Gauteng Department of Education at a meeting on 7 August 2001, with music educators attached to Extra-Curricular centres. The recommended Music Magnet schools in Gauteng are the following (GDE 2001):

- East Rand Art School, Daveyton
- Lefa Secondary School, Kwa Thema
- Liverpool Secondary School, Benoni
- Cultura High School, Bronkhorstspuit
- F.J.L.Wells School, Randfontein
- Monument High School, Krugersdorp
- Randburg High School, Fontainbleau
- Thabajabula Secondary School, Pimville
- Daliwonga Secondary School, Orlando
- Kwadedangdla Middle School, Zola North
- Willow Crescent Middle School, Eldorado Park
- Willowmead Secondary School, Willowmead
- Letsibogo Secondary School, Meadowlands
- P.J. Semelane Middle School, Dobsonville
- Drie Riviere High School, Vereeniging
- Roshnee Secondary School, Roshnee
- Khutlo Tharo Secondary School, Sebokeng
- Beverly Hills High School, Beverly Hills
- Soshanguve Secondary School, Soshanguve
- Hendrik Verwoerd High School, Pretoria
- Mamelodi Secondary School, Mamelodi
- Laudium College, Pretoria
- P.T. Xulu Secondary School, Vosloorus
- Sir Pierre van Rhyneveld, Kempton Park
- Buhlebuzile Secondary School, Thokoza

- Alexandra Career Directorate Centre, Alexandra
- Eginisweni Secondary School, Ivory Park.

### **6.2.2 ESP at NQF levels 2–4 (Grades 10–12) for available instruments**

Ensemble Specialisation for available instruments will be a new experience for learners and facilitators. Its establishment might seem daunting at the outset, but will be a challenge to many facilitators. The researcher recommends that any available instruments should be used in the beginning. As soon as funds are available, instruments should be provided by the Department of Education, or bought by the learners or by the school.

Schools in disadvantaged areas may have groups of learners who initially show no interest in conventional music ensembles. Yet these learners may have unique musical talents and may respond to opportunities to play in alternative ensembles where music making is taught by ear and by rote, for example African Drums or Steel Pan Ensembles. It is, however, recommended that learners specialising in Ensembles for available instruments should be able to read notes, pitch and rhythm.

Assessment forms an important part of the curriculum and leads music facilitators to adjust their instruction or revise their curriculum. Yet, no matter how carefully music facilitator's plan or how meticulously they record, assessments cannot capture all that students gain from their experiences in the classroom. Assessment should be an experience in each learner's curriculum that should be a special time when he or she can show off his or her expertise and talent in music.

Flexible differentiation of outcomes on a basic, proficient and advanced level should be encouraged to allow learners to work at different rates and at different performance levels. The unit standards for GMAP and ESP for available instruments should have the adaptability to include a local flavour while, at the

same time, focusing on transferable skills and knowledge for new times and an uncertain future.

Finally the researcher recommends that the proposed unit standards for a GMAP and an ESP for available instruments, NQF levels 2-4 (Grades 10-12), be approved and registered by the South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA) in the near future.

### **6.3 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH**

The recommendations made in this thesis need further research. Prospective researchers wishing to do further work on a GMAP and an ESP for available instruments at NQF levels 2-4, should familiarize themselves with work already done by the MEUSSA members to avoid overlapping as far as possible.

African instruments and percussion ensembles need high priority for further research to accommodate the great majority of South Africa's learners.

The author hopes that the general goal of the two proposed programmes will form an integrative part of Music Education in the future. The following aspects should receive high priority from future researchers:

- Support material for a General Music Appraisal Programme for NQF levels 2-4 with music examples to accommodate all cultures
- Arrangements for Ensembles from beginners to advanced instrumentalists.

Practical experience and enjoyment of music must be the ultimate goal for all learners in South Africa.