A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF THE ECCLESIOLOGY OF THE EMERGING APOSTOLIC CHURCHES WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO THE NOTION OF THE FIVEFOLD MINISTRY.

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR PHILOSOPHIAE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF THEOLOGY – DOGMATICS AND CHRISTIAN ETHICS

BY

KELEBOGILE THOMAS RESANE

SUPERVISOR: PROF Dr J BUITENDAG

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

July, 2008
DECLARATION

I declare that a critical analysis of the ecclesiology of the emerging apostolic churches with special reference to the notion of the fivefold ministry is my own work, that it has not been submitted for any degree or examination in any other university, and that all the sources I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by complete references.

KELEBOGILE THOMAS RESANE 

DATE ________________

SIGNED ________________

DEDICATION

It was He Who gave some to be apostles, some to be prophets, some to be evangelists, and some to be pastors and teachers, to prepare God’s people for works of service, so that the body of Christ may be built up until we all reach unity in the faith and in the knowledge of the Son of God and become mature, attaining to the whole measure of the fullness of Christ (Eph 4:11-13)

This work is dedicated to all members of my family, especially my dearest wife Tabby, who gave me moral support. My son, Koketso was exceedingly understanding and tolerant of my technology limitation and edited most, if not all of the documentation put into place. My two daughters, Mamosa and Duduetsang also provided their moral support and love. They accommodated my excuses for not being with them due to this research, when they needed me.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many people have given their support, encouragement, and inspiration to this academic endeavour. The following, however, were singularly helpful, and deserve a mention.

During the six years that I spent at the University of Pretoria, where the basic work for my postgraduate theological study was undertaken, I received help from several members of the Faculty of Theology in the Department of Dogmatics and Christian Ethics. The most helpful of these, on whom I depended for guidance and encouragement, were Prof J Buitendag and Prof C Wethmar. The Faculty of Theology has done much to ensure that I obtain bursaries and scholarship assistance for the entire period of my studies at the university. The library assistants at the university were always helpful during my research and I appreciate them for that.

To several people in Youth for Christ International: Dr Ajith Fernando (Sri Lanka), who is my mentor and source of inspiration, Don Osman (Sierra Leone), Emmanuel Chijindu (Nigeria), Joseph Aryee (Ghana), and David Kadalie (South Africa) who are my colleagues in Youth for Christ International/Africa and have been comrades in arms with me. They have allowed me the opportunity to undertake these studies by always understanding when I was behind with my normal job deadlines. To the former Training Director of Youth for Christ South Africa, Geoff Rutter who brought me into the ministry three decades ago.

I am especially grateful to the late Reverends B S Mookapilo and P Moletsane of Assemblies of God in South Africa who encouraged, mentored and nurtured me in the formative years of my spiritual development and growth.
ABSTRACT

The main purpose of this research is to explore and analyze the ecclesiology of the emerging charismatic or apostolic churches with a special reference to their church polity based on the fivefold ministry of Ephesians 4:11. The survey of the traditional church government is done as a basis and directional guide for church government and polity.

Since the Classical Pentecostals and Charismatics form a sizeable part of evangelical Christianity, their ecclesiology is explored and it is discovered that this is generally not formulated into certain cohesion. This mainstream evangelical Christianity does not formulate dogma, but adds pneumatological dynamism to their faith. However, the ecclesiastical understanding of the emerging apostolic movement is endeavored as a way of trying to understand the premise of ecclesiological understanding.

There is a historical survey of the fivefold ministry since the dawn of the twentieth century, especially starting with the Latter Rain Movement. As in all researches of this kind, the marks of this phenomenon are identified and the different terms used to refer to it explored. These marks are highlighted in view of their theological and hermeneutical approaches to doctrinal conclusions.

The rationale behind the movement’s fivefold ministry hangs on the doctrine of restoration, whereby the church is believed to be prepared in the last days for a great eschatological realization, and that to accomplish this, the restoration of church government structure based on the fivefold ministers is to be applied. It is believed that the church can only fulfill its mission here on earth when it operates under the guidance of apostolic structure as laid out in Ephesians 4:11.

The research argues the theological bases and the roots of the fivefold ministry and compares this with the current scenarios found among the apostolic churches. This is examined in regard to the leadership in the early church, the principles of ecclesiality and contextuality, phenomenology, Realpolitik and vox populi. The argument is enhanced by
the fact that the Charismatic theology lacks cohesion and synergy because of the lack of *catechesis* and apostolic *paradosis*.

The Ephesians 4:1-16 exegeses acts as a precursor to understanding the fivefold ministry and the *charismata* in the church as supported by history and the application of *domata* that the fivefold ministry was intended for *ecclesia's* growth, life and nourishment. The *domata* of Eph 4:11 were intended for maturity, not for the government of the church.

The climax of the research endeavours to answer the hypothesis if the fivefold ministry can be a theologically legitimate application for church government. The apostolic churches are reviewed and their distinctive characteristics surveyed. The fivefold ministry is critically discussed and the arguments against if for church government brought forth. These arguments are evaluated by comparing them with the contemporary participative ecclesiologies.

Some further valuable deductions can be made from research:

1. There is disparity and lack of synergy regarding the fivefold ministry among the Charismatics.
2. Ephesians 4 passage cannot be used to justify the church government structure based on the fivefold ministry.
3. The *ecclesia* is a charismatic fellowship.
4. The church needs structure for the sake of order and effectiveness in the world.
5. Most of the fivefold ministry promoters are not scholarly or theologically elite.

A few constraints have been encountered which have a limiting effect on the research. The research highlights a number of important areas which can be further researched.
CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1
ORIENTATION

1.1. INTRODUCTION TO THE PROBLEM 1
1.2. DESCRIPTION OF THE PROBLEM 2
1.3. BACKGROUND AND IMPORTANCE OF THE STUDY 2
1.4. STATEMENT OF THE RESEARCH QUESTION 4
1.5. DEFINITION OF TERMS AND CONCEPTS 4
  1.5.1. The church government 4
  1.5.2. The church polity 5
  1.5.3. Evangelical Christianity 5
  1.5.4. The fivefold ministry 5
  1.5.5. Ecumenism 5
  1.5.6. The New Apostolic Reformation 5
  1.5.7. The Charismatic Movement 5
  1.5.8. The classical Pentecostalism 5
  1.5.9. Realpolitik 6
  1.5.10. Vox populi 6
1.6. ASSUMPTIONS OF THE STUDY 6
  1.6.1. Church orders for the sake of order and effectiveness in the world 6
  1.6.2. Need for theological clarification for acceptable polity 6
  1.6.3. Limited resources on the subject 6
  1.6.4. Limited scope 7
1.7. RESEARCH HYPOTHESIS 7
1.8. DELIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY 7
  1.8.1. The evangelical review is narrowed down 8
  1.8.2. Survey of major church government systems 8
  1.8.3. Research focuses on Fivefold ministry within Charismatic groups 8
1.9. RESEARCH DESIGN 8
  1.9.1. Literature study 8
  1.9.1.1. Theological understanding of church government and Fivefold
Ministry 8
1.9.1.2. Historical development of ecclesiastical governance 8
1.9.1.3. Evaluation of different understandings of church polity 8
1.9.2. Development of a model and guidelines 8

1.10. CHAPITERS OUTLINE 9

CHAPTER 2

EVANGELICAL REVIEW OF CHURCH GOVERNMENT

2.1. INTRODUCTION 11

2.2. EVANGELICAL CHRISTIANITY 11

2.2.1. The evangelical definition 11
2.2.2. The evangelical dogma 12
2.2.3. The evangelical identification 14
2.2.3.1. New evangelicals 14
2.2.3.2. Fundamentalists 14
2.2.3.3. Confessionals 14
2.2.3.4. Charismatic Movement 14
2.2.3.5. Radicals 14
2.2.3.6. Ecumenical evangelicals 15
2.2.3.7. Black evangelicals 15
2.2.3.8. Pentecostals 15

2.3. EVANGELICAL ECCLESIOLOGY 16

2.3.1. Definition 16
2.3.2. Distinctives 17

2.4. THE COMMON PROTESTANT POLITIES 18

2.4.1. The Episcopal Church Structure 18
2.4.1.1. Definition 18
2.4.1.2. The mainstreams within the episcopacy 20
2.4.1.2.1. The monarchical episcopacy 20
2.4.1.2.2. The managerial episcopacy 20
2.4.1.2.3. The pastoral episcopacy 20
2.4.2. The Presbyterial Structure 21
2.4.2.1. Definition 21
2.4.2.1.1. The Representative Eldership 23
2.4.2.1.2. Leadership by appointment and seniority 25
2.4.2.1.3. Leadership by discernment 24
2.4.2.2. The Presbyterial editio princeps 26
2.4.2.3. Summary 28

The Ecclesiology Of The Emerging Apostolic Churches – Fivefold Ministry
K.T. Resane
July 2008
2.4.3. The Congregational Structure 29
2.4.3.1. Definition 29
2.4.3.2. The connective congregationalism 30
2.4.3.3. The associational congregationalism 31

2.5. THE PENTECOSTAL/CHARISMATIC ECCLESIOLOGY 32

2.5.1. Introduction 32
2.5.2. Ecclesiastical definitions 33
2.5.2.1. Koinonia 33
2.5.2.2. The people of God 34
2.5.2.3. The kingdom of God 34
2.5.2.4. The covenant community 35
2.5.3. Charismatic ecclesiology: A debatable issue 36

2.6. THE EMERGING APOSTOLIC MOVEMENT: THE FIVEFOLD MINISTRY OF THE CHURCH 37

2.6.1. Definition and biblical base 37
2.6.2. The marks of the apostolic churches 37
2.6.2.1. Donald Miller (Vineyard, Calvary Chapel, Hope Chapel) 37
2.6.2.2. George G Hunter III 38
2.6.2.3. Elmer L Towns 38
2.6.2.4. Peter Wagner 39
2.6.3. Historical and theological bases 39
2.6.4. Views and church government and polity 41
2.6.4.1. Restoration of church government through fivefold ministry offices 41
2.6.4.2. Structure insufficient to produce spirituality and God’s mission 41

Table 2.1. Some of the well-known fivefold churches 42

2.6.5. Reasons for fivefold ministry 42

Table 2.2. The well-known preachers of the fivefold doctrine 43

2.6.6. Summary 44

CHAPTER 3
HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF THE FIVEFOLD MINISTRY

3.1. INTRODUCTION 45

3.2. THE HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF TEACHING ON GIFTS 45

3.2.1. From the apostolic age to the first few centuries of the church age 46
| 3.2.2. | From the Middle Ages | 46 |
| 3.2.3. | The Reformation Period | 47 |
| 3.2.4. | The Twentieth Century | 48 |

3.3. **THE LATTER RAIN MOVEMENT**

| 3.3.1. | The historical background | 49 |
| 3.3.2. | The historical figures associated with the movement | 50 |
| 3.3.3. | The reaction received | 51 |

3.4. **THE SHEPHERDING MOVEMENT**

| 3.4.1. | The leading historical figures | 52 |
| 3.4.1.1. | Don Bashan | 52 |
| 3.4.1.2. | Ern Baxter | 52 |
| 3.4.1.3. | Bob Mumford | 53 |
| 3.4.1.4. | Derek Prince | 53 |
| 3.4.1.5. | Charles Simpson | 54 |
| 3.4.2. | Their unique contribution | 54 |
| 3.4.2.1. | Inadequate church structure that enhances community | 54 |
| 3.4.2.2. | Relational base for pastoral care and discipleship | 55 |
| 3.4.2.3. | Non-professional leadership and non-traditional leadership training | 55 |
| 3.4.2.4. | Relational organic nature of the church | 55 |
| 3.4.2.5. | Authority based on fivefold ministry | 55 |

3.5. **THE POSITIVE CONFESSION MOVEMENT**

| 3.5.1. | The historical background | 56 |
| 3.5.2. | The prominent promoters | 57 |
| 3.5.2.1. | Kenneth Hagin | 57 |
| 3.5.2.2. | Kenneth Copeland | 58 |
| 3.5.3. | Their contribution to the fivefold ministry | 58 |

3.6. **THE “THIRD WAVE” CHURCHES**

| 3.6.1. | The ecclesiastical practices of the “Third Wave” Churches | 59 |
| 3.6.1.1. | Apostolic government | 59 |
| 3.6.1.2. | Making new disciples | 60 |
| 3.6.1.3. | Raising new leaders | 60 |
| 3.6.1.4. | Planting new churches | 61 |
| 3.6.1.5. | Pioneering new territories | 62 |
| 3.6.1.6. | Unity in the body of Christ | 62 |
| 3.6.1.7. | Power and miracles | 63 |
| 3.6.1.8. | Workplace apostles (Public apostles) | 64 |
| 3.6.1.9. | Territorial vision | 65 |
3.6.1.10. Equipping paradigms 65
3.6.1.11. Holiness doctrine 67
3.6.1.12. The apostolic networks 68
3.6.12.1. Autonomous 69
3.6.12.2. Voluntarily 69
3.6.12.3. Relationships 70
3.6.12.4. Interdependency 70
3.6.12.5. Apostolic oversight 70

3.7. THE NEW APOSTOLIC REFORMATION (NAR) 72

3.7.1. Its origin 72
3.7.2. Names and designations 73
3.7.2.1. Postmodern churches 73
3.7.2.2. Independent churches 73
3.7.2.3. Charismatic churches 73
3.7.2.4. Restoration churches 74
3.7.2.5. Grassroots churches 74
3.7.2.6. Neo-denominational churches 74
3.7.2.7. New-paradigm churches 74
3.7.2.8. The Next church 74
3.7.2.9. The Emerging Apostolic Movement 75
3.7.2.10. The New Apostolic Churches 75
3.7.2.11. The New Apostolic Reformation 75
3.7.3. Its polity and church government 75
3.7.4. Its view of the fivefold ministry 76

Table 3.1. Men alive in 1990 representing forty years of renewal 77

3.8. SUMMARY 78

CHAPTER 4
THEOLOGICAL REFLECTIONS ON FIVEFOLD MINISTRY

4.1. INTRODUCTION 79

4.2. NEW APOSTOLIC REFORMATION’S FIVEFOLD MINISTRY 79

4.3. THE THEOLOGICAL ROOTS OF FIVEFOLD MINISTRY 80

4.3.1. It is all about restoration 80
4.3.2. The fivefold ministry “Hand Illustration” 84
4.3.2.1. The thumb: Apostle 85
4.3.2.2. The index finger: Prophet 85
4.3.2.3. The middle finger:
   Evangelist 85
4.3.2.4. The ring finger:
   Pastor 86
4.3.2.5. The little finger:
   Teacher 86
4.3.3. The allegorical interpretation of Scriptures 87
4.3.4. The influence of fundamentalism 90
4.3.4.1. Biblical infallibility 90
4.3.4.2. The virgin birth of Christ 91
4.3.4.3. Christ’s substitutionary atonement 91
4.3.4.4. Christ’s physical resurrection 91
4.3.4.5. Christ’s imminent, visible, and personal second coming 91
4.3.5. The New Testament church leadership as a precursor 94
4.3.5.1. The charismatic leadership attitude 94
4.3.5.2. Leadership in the early church 94
4.3.5.3. Two principles in the early church 96
4.3.5.4. Ecclesiality and contextuality demonstrates organization 98
4.3.6. Lack of synergy and cohesion 102
4.3.6.1. The ecclesiastical and theological background of the founders/leaders 102
4.3.6.2. The charismatic training schools curriculum limitation 107
4.3.6.3. The lack of theological academia 112
4.3.7. The charismatic dogma is undeveloped 112
4.3.8. Phenomenology in charismatic studies 116
4.3.9. Realpolitik and Vox populi influence charismatic ecclesiology 116
4.3.9.1. Realpolitik (Power politics) 117
4.3.9.2. Vox populi (the voice of the people is a form of Realpolitik) 118
4.3.10. The lack of catechesis 121
4.4. THE BIBLICAL SURVEY ON CHARISMATA 124
4.5. THE CHARISMATA: TRADITIONAL, REFORMED AND CHARISMATIC UNDERSTANDING 124
4.5.1. The traditional understanding of charismata 126
4.5.2. The reformed understanding of charismata 128
4.5.3. The charismatic understanding of charismata 128
4.6. THE PROBLEMS CITED IN RELATION TO CHARISMATA 128
4.6.1. Disagreement 129
4.6.2. Neglect
4.6.3. Confusion

Table 4.1. Distinctions of gifts and fruit

4.6.4. Abuse

4.7. CONCLUSION

CHAPTER 5

EPHESIANS 4:1-16 EXEGESIS: PRECURSOR TO UNDERSTANDING THE FIVEFOLD MINISTRY AND CHARISMATA IN THE CHURCH

5.1. INTRODUCTION

5.2. AUTHORSHIP

5.3. LANGUAGE AND STYLE

5.4. THE SETTING

5.5. THE PANORAMIC VIEW OF EPHESIANS 4:1-16

5.6. BROADER UNDERSTANDING OF THE EPHESIANS PASSAGE

5.6.1. Four parts
5.6.2. Two parts

5.7. TWO PRINCIPLES OF TRUTH

5.8. POSSIBLE DIFFERENCES OF INTERPRETATION OF EPHESIANS 4:11

5.8.1. Gifts, but not leaders to the church
5.8.2. Leadership gifts are for the universal church
5.8.3. The King James Version phraseology

5.9. THE BIBLICAL DOCTRINES IN EPHESIANS 4:1-16

5.9.1. Christian ethics
5.9.2. Theology proper – The premise of apostolic argument
5.9.2.1. The \textit{unitas singularitatis}
5.9.2.2. The \textit{unitas simplicitatis}
5.9.3. Revelation – The context of apostolic argument
5.9.4. Christology – The basis of apostolic argument
5.9.5. Pneumatology – The inspiration for apostolic argument
5.9.6.  Ecclesiology – The focus of apostolic argument 158
5.9.7.  Gifts – The content of apostolic argument 163

5.10.  THE TWO ECCLESIASTICAL EXEGESIS OF EPHESIANS 4:11 –
REFORMED AND CHARISMATIC 165

5.10.1.  Reformed Tradition 165
5.10.1.1. He gave some to be apostles 167
5.10.1.2. He gave some to be prophets 173
5.10.1.3. He gave some to be evangelists 177
5.10.1.4. He gave some to be pastors 180
5.10.1.5. He gave some to be teachers 184
5.10.2.  Pentecostal/Charismatic Approach 186
5.10.2.1. The apostles 187
5.10.2.2. The prophets 190
5.10.2.3. The evangelists 192
5.10.2.4. The pastors 194
5.10.2.5. The teachers 196

5.11.  THEOLOGICAL REFLECTIONS: THE NEW APOSTOLIC
REFORMATION 197

5.12.  ARGUMENTS AGAINST FIVEFOLD MINISTRY FOR CHURCH
GOVERNMENT 202

5.12.1.  The timing of the letter of Ephesians 202
5.12.2.  The wording of the Ephesians 4:11-13 passage 203
5.12.2.1. The equipment of the saints 203
5.12.2.2. The servant work 204
5.12.2.3. The construction of the body of Christ 205
5.12.3.  The nature of the church at Ephesus 206
5.12.3.1. The ecclesia is a mysterion 206
5.12.3.2. The ecclesia is an organism and organization 207
5.12.3.3. The Ephesians church received apostolic paradosis 208
5.12.3.4. The Ephesians church needed to be a charismatic fellowship 208
5.12.3.5. The Ephesians church was expected to be a self-developing
community 209

5.13.  CONCLUSION 211

CHAPTER 6

THE CONTEMPORARY ECCLESIOLOGY CONTRADICTS THE
FIVEFOLD MINISTRY FOR CHURCH GOVERNMENT

6.1.  INTRODUCTION 214
6.2. THE ECCLESIOLOGY OF CHURCH LEADERSHIP 214
   6.2.1. Communion ecclesiology (John Zizioulas) 214
   6.2.2. Charismatic ecclesiology (Hans Kung) 216
   6.2.3. Universal ecclesiology (Wolfhart Pannenberg) 218
   6.2.4. Messianic ecclesiology (Jürgen Moltmann) 220
   6.2.5. Participatory ecclesiology (Miroslav Volf) 222

6.3. CONCLUSION 223

CHAPTER 7

CONSTRAINTS, DEDUCTIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1. INTRODUCTION 225

7.2. AN OVERVIEW OF THE RESEARCH 226

7.3. CONSTRAINTS OF THE RESEARCH 227

   7.3.1. The extent of the research 227
   7.3.1.1. Subjectivity is inevitable 227
   7.3.1.2. Assessment of available literature 228
   7.3.1.3. The limitation of terminology 228
   7.3.2. The newness of the concept of fivefold ministry 228

7.4. DEDUCTIONS MADE FROM THE RESULTS OF THE RESEARCH 228

   7.4.1. Disparity and lack of synergy 229
   7.4.2. Eph 4 passage cannot be applied to church structure 229
   7.4.3. The ecclesia is a charismatic fellowship 229
   7.4.4. Church structure is needed for order and effectiveness 230
   7.4.5. Fivefold ministers not scholarly or theologically elite 230

7.5. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH IN THE AREA OF CHURCH GOVERNMENT BASED ON FIVEFOLD MINISTRY 230

   7.5.1. Concise definition and the marks of the emerging apostolic churches 231
   7.5.2. Formulation of theologically acceptable church government and polity 231
   7.5.3. The ecclesiality of the emerging apostolic churches 231
   7.5.4. The synergy between apostolic networks and ecumenism 231
   7.5.5. Hierarchical leadership as opposed to contemporary participative ecclesiologies 232
   7.5.6. The African monarchical influence on the emerging apostolic
7.5.7. Critical analysis of ecclesiology of C Peter Wagner in relation to NAR

7.5.8. The classical Pentecostal stance on the fivefold ministry with special reference to Assembly of God

7.5.9. The emerging apostolic churches and theological training

7.5.10. Critical reflection on the doctrine of holiness and its influence on the emerging Apostolic churches

7.6. CONCLUDING REMARKS

BIBLIOGRAPHY AND INTERNET REFERENCES