HEART OF DARKNESS:
A deconstruction of traditional Christian concepts of reconciliation by means of a religious studies perspective on the Christian and African religions

by

Arnold Maurits Meiring

Submitted in fulfilment for the degree of Doctor Divinitatis (DD) to the Faculty of Theology of the University of Pretoria, South Africa.

Promoter: Prof PGJ Meiring
Department: Science of Religion and Missiology

April 2005
Heart of Darkness

I chose the title of my thesis, “Heart of darkness” deliberately to challenge and deconstruct the Western notion that African religion and philosophy are somehow primitive or at most of limited significance to the rest of the world. In his novel bearing the same title, Joseph Conrad’s main character, Marlow, sets off into the “heart of darkness” of Belgian Congo, only to realise during his journey, that lightness and darkness have been somehow inverted: darkness brings about enlightenment and whiteness death and despair. I believe that African religion and philosophy can similarly lead us to enlightenment where white, Western theology has failed (Conrad, 1983; Crafford, 1996a:3; Kgatla, 1999:130-133; O’Prey, 1983:9).

Darkness indicates night, the unknown, the impenetrable, but also creativity. I see theology more as a study of darkness, than of light. God remains beyond our finest description and theologians can only blindly delight in his unfathomable depths. Theology is always temporary, conditional and incomplete (Dunne, 1978:xi; O’Prey, 1983:9).

An interesting thing happened to Marlow: He set out to discover darkest Africa and in the end discovered himself. Marlow says that his journey to the “furthest point of navigation” somehow “[threw] a kind of light on everything about me” (Conrad, 1983:32). According to O’Prey (1983:15) this night journey represents the:

… archetypal myth dramatized in much great literature since the Book of Jonah; the story of an essentially solitary journey involving profound spiritual change in the voyager. In its classical form, the journey is a descent into the earth, followed by a return to light.
I believe any quest for knowledge (and theological insight) is reflexive: when I study or investigate African religion and philosophy I also discover myself, and am changed by the “object” of my study. “Heart of darkness” indicates this intended reflexivity or feedback-nature of my study.
Abstract

African Religion offers new images and symbols of reconciliation that may enhance existing Christian reconciliation metaphors and liturgies. Traditionally, Christians understood reconciliation through the images of either Augustine’s victory model, Anselm’s objective model or Abelard’s subjective model. While these images offered valuable insights, they are limited and increasingly difficult to understand in our modern context.

Postmodern philosophy presents theologians with the possibility of deconstructing dominant discourses in order to consider new possibilities. This approach is eminently applicable to the traditional Christian reconciliation models. A comparative study of Western Christian and African reconciliation myths, rituals and concepts is used to deconstruct the accepted positions on the matter of reconciliation.

Interviews with four African theologians, John Mbiti, Agrippa Khathide, Daniel Ngubane and Tinyiko Maluleke, reveal that African Christians have often understood reconciliation in more and different ways than those available in traditional Christian thought. They often derived their ideas from African Traditional Religion as well as the modern liberation struggle.

In studying African Traditional Religion, it becomes clear that that African religion offers very different options to traditional Christianity with regard to its view on God, ancestors and spirits, life force, and of special importance for this study, shame, guilt and sin. African religion’s this-worldly focus views reconciliation as taking place on a mostly human level rather than between humans and God. African reconciliation rituals can be classified according to the purpose or the myths behind them. Some rituals are intended to create or restore community, while others are meant to propitiate or at least transfer guilt. A third
A comparison between two religions should treat the religions equally. An investigation that examines both the integrating and transcending possibilities of religions can highlight the strengths and weaknesses of the various reconciliation models without reference to some sort of supernatural reality. The anthropological and social sciences also offer valuable insights into the possible structure of reconciliation. And the South African context demands some minimum requirements for reconciliation in this country. When all these criteria are used to evaluate African and Christian reconciliation models, new possibilities emerge.

Different models show themselves to be useful in different contexts. Some African models can improve our understanding of reconciliation between humans and God, while others fit the social context of South Africa.

It seems that African thought and religion has a lot to offer to the study of reconciliation. The African emphasis on this-worldliness and community, the use of rituals and symbols, as well as Africa’s still-coherent myths presents new and exciting perspectives. These insights and models can be incorporated into Christian liturgies and rituals that will deepen Christians’ understanding and celebration of reconciliation.
Key Words

African Traditional Religion, Christianity, reconciliation, missiology, religious studies, comparative religious studies, postmodern theology, African theology, myths, rituals, liturgy, this-worldly, community, ubuntu, South Africa.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Research problem ................................. 16

1.2 Aim of study ..................................... 16

1.3 Motivation and relevance ......................... 17

1.4 Research method ................................ 19

1.5 Outline ......................................... 20

1.5.1 Chapter 1: Introduction ................. 20

1.5.2 Chapter 2: Theoretical Framework .... 21

1.5.3 Chapter 3: Traditional Christian Images of Reconciliation (A Systematic Theological perspective) .... 21

1.5.4 Chapter 4: African views on Reconciliation (Phenomenology) ................. 21

1.5.5 Chapter 5: Religion and Reconciliation: Comparative Analysis (Comparative Religion) .... 22

1.5.6 Chapter 6: Reconciliation Models and Rituals (Comparative Religion) .... 22

1.5.7 Chapter 7: Contours of a New Understanding and Praxis of Reconciliation (Missiology) .... 23

1.5.8 Chapter 8: Concluding Reflections and Remarks .... 23

1.6 Departure points and limitations .............. 23

1.6.1 Disciplines of study ......................... 23

1.6.2 Reconciliation and Salvation ............... 24

1.6.3 “God” and “gods” .......................... 24

1.6.4 Missiology ................................ 24

1.6.5 Religious Studies ......................... 25

1.6.6 The Relationship between Missiology and Religious Studies .... 26
CHAPTER 2: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 Postmodernism

2.1.1 Postmodern Thought and Theology
2.1.1.1 Deconstruction
2.1.1.2 Relationships
2.1.1.3 Self-organisation
2.1.1.4 Participation
2.1.1.5 Truth, meaning and coherence
2.1.1.6 Metaphors
2.1.1.7 Poetic
2.1.1.8 Cosmology
2.1.1.9 Interdisciplinary dialogue
2.1.1.10 Tentative
2.1.1.11 Can a theology be postmodern?

2.2 Postmodernist approach to religious studies

2.2.1 A Comparative Religious Study
2.2.2 The Insider/Outsider Problem
2.2.3 Religious naturalism

2.3 Definitions and terminology

2.3.1 Myths and rituals
2.3.2 Theology

CHAPTER 3: TRADITIONAL CHRISTIAN IMAGES OF RECONCILIATION

3.1 Introduction
3.2 The Old Testament
3.3 The New Testament
3.4 Three Models
3.4.1 Victory over the devil
3.4.2 Objective substitution
3.4.3 Subjective Model
3.5 Evaluation of models
3.5.1 Victory Model: Victory over the Powers or Outdated Myth? 58
3.5.2 Objective Model: The Unforgivable or the Unforgiving? 59
3.5.3 Subjective Model: Example or Hopelessness? 62
3.6 What about new models? 63
3.7 Conclusion 65

CHAPTER FOUR: AFRICAN VIEWS ON RECONCILIATION 67

4.1 African Theology 67
4.1.1 The need for African Theologies 67
4.1.2 Interviews with four African Theologians 69
4.1.2.1 John Mbiti 69
4.1.2.2 Agrippa Khathide 61
4.1.2.3 Daniel Ngubane 62
4.1.2.4 Tinyiko Maluleke 63
4.1.3 Ideas on Reconciliation in African Theology 75
4.1.3.1 Liberation 76
4.1.3.2 Solidarity 76
4.1.3.3 Community and Ecology 80
4.1.3.4 Healing 80
4.1.4 African Theology and African Religion 81
4.1.5 The position of the African Initiated Churches 82

4.2 Traditional African Religion 83
4.2.1 An unexplored source 83
4.2.2 Which African religion? 84
4.2.2.1 One Religion 84
4.2.2.2 Old and new 85
4.2.3 Importance of Reconciliation in African Religion 86
4.2.4 Vertical or horizontal reconciliation? 87
4.2.4.1 The two dimensions 87
4.2.4.2 Western Christianity’s traditional vertical focus 87
4.2.4.3 African Religion’s horizontal focus 88
4.2.4.4 Grounds for comparison 91
4.2.5 Some central ideas in African religion and philosophy 91
4.2.5.1 God
4.2.5.2 World of the Spirits
4.2.5.3 Ancestors
4.2.5.4 Life force and *ubuntu*
4.2.5.5 Sin
4.2.5.6 Shame and guilt

4.3 Reconciliation myths and rituals

4.3.1 Introduction

4.3.2 Rituals intended to create community
4.3.2.1 Community or *ubuntu* as reconciliation
4.3.2.2 Sacrifices and offerings of reconstruction
4.3.2.3 Sacrifices and offerings of communion
4.3.2.4 Medicines

4.3.3 Rituals intended to propitiate and transfer guilt
4.3.3.1 Sacrifices and offerings of propitiation
4.3.3.2 Scapegoats as objects of punishment

4.3.4 Rituals intended to expel or accept
4.3.4.1 Prayer and petition
4.3.4.2 Rituals of expulsion
4.3.4.3 Acceptance
4.3.4.4 Cleansing

4.3.5 Rituals with a mixture of intentions
4.3.5.1 Rituals of rebellion
4.3.5.2 Dance

CHAPTER FIVE: RELIGION AND RECONCILIATION: COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

5.1 Preliminary observations and considerations

5.1.1 Not all are equal

5.1.2 An enquiry into religion
5.1.2.1 Qualitative research
5.1.2.2 Objectivity and Subjectivity
5.1.2.3 Shared humanity
5.1.2.4 Understanding and explaining
5.1.2.5 The cognitive dimension

5.1.3 Principles for evaluating religion
5.1.3.1 Integrating
5.1.3.2 Transcending

5.1.4 Patterns of reconciliation
5.1.4.1 Functionalism and Marxism  142
5.1.4.2 Harmony and conflict  143
5.1.4.3 Cyclical or linear  144
5.1.4.4 Structure or process  145
5.1.4.5 Society and individual  146
5.1.4.6 Society and culture  147

5.2 The South African situation  148

5.2.1 Truth, confession and forgiveness  150
5.2.1.1 Truth  150
5.2.1.2 Confession  151
5.2.1.3 Forgiveness  152

5.2.2 Justice  153

5.2.3 Participation of all the actors  154

5.2.4 Humility and dignity  156
5.2.4.1 Humility  156
5.2.4.2 Dignity  157

CHAPTER SIX: RECONCILIATION MODELS AND RITUALS  159

6.1 Evaluation and appraisal  159

6.1.1 Rituals intended to create community  159
6.1.1.1 Community  159
6.1.1.2 Sacrifices and offerings of reconstruction  160
6.1.1.3 Sacrifices and offerings of communion  161
6.1.1.4 Medicines  162

6.1.2 Rituals intended to propitiate and transfer guilt  163
6.1.2.1 Sacrifices and offerings of propitiation  163
6.1.2.2 Scapegoats  164

6.1.3 Rituals intended to expel or accept  164
6.1.3.1 Prayer  164
6.1.3.2 Scapegoats  165
6.1.3.3 Expulsion  166
6.1.3.4 Acceptance  167
6.1.3.5 Cleansing  167

6.1.4 Rituals with a mixture of intentions  168
6.1.4.1 Rituals of rebellion  168
6.1.4.2 Dance  169

6.1.5 Revisiting Augustine, Anselm and Abelard  169
6.1.5.1 Augustine’s Victory model  169
6.1.5.2 Anselm’s Objective model 170
6.1.5.3 Abelard’s Subjective model 171

6.2 Personal understanding 172

6.2.1 Possible models for personal understanding 174
6.2.1.1 Community 174
6.2.1.2 Prayer 175
6.2.1.3 Expulsion and cleansing 175
6.2.1.4 Acceptance 176
6.2.1.5 Rebellion 176
6.2.1.6 Initiative from above 177

6.2.2 Appraisal of models for personal understanding 177

6.3 The South African context 179

6.3.1 Possible models for the South African context 180
6.3.1.1 Scapegoats to transfer guilt 180
6.3.1.2 Expulsion and cleansing 185
6.3.1.3 Acceptance 186

6.3.2 Appraisal of models for the South African context 187

CHAPTER SEVEN: CONTOURS OF A NEW UNDERSTANDING AND PRAXIS OF RECONCILIATION 189

7.1 Africa’s contribution to the understanding of reconciliation 189

7.1.1 Central theses 189
7.1.1.1 This-worldliness 189
7.1.1.2 Connectedness, ecology and holism 191

7.1.2 Reservations 192

7.1.3 New emphases on existing ideas 193
7.1.3.1 Sin is conditional 193
7.1.3.2 Sacrifices 194
7.1.3.3 Expulsion and cleansing 195
7.1.3.4 Community 196
7.1.3.5 Communion 198

7.1.4 New ideas 198
7.1.4.1 This-worldly 198
7.1.4.2 Acceptance 200
7.1.4.3 Rebellion 201
7.1.4.4 God’s initiative 202
7.1.4.5 Solidarity 203
7.1.5 Participation and rituals

7.1.5.1 Rituals

7.1.5.2 Symbolism

7.1.5.3 Sacrifices

7.1.5.4 Medicine

7.1.5.5 Gifts

7.1.5.6 Expulsion and cleansing rituals

7.1.5.7 Dance

7.1.6 Coherent myths

7.1.6.1 Blood

7.1.6.2 Medicine

7.1.6.3 Connectedness

7.1.6.4 Acceptance

7.1.7 Possible exaggerations

7.1.7.1 Times have changed

7.1.7.2 Exorcism

7.1.7.3 Justice and mercy

7.1.7.4 The actors: God, humans and magic

7.1.7.5 Suffocating community

7.2 New liturgies and rituals

7.2.1 Requirements for new liturgies and rituals

7.2.2 Liturgies based on community

7.2.2.1 Funeral rite with spilling of blood

7.2.2.2 A community liturgy from the Psalms

7.2.2.3 A community liturgy from the Western Church

7.2.2.4 Reflections on wholeness

7.2.2.5 Re-enactment rituals

7.2.2.6 Other considerations

7.2.3 Liturgies based on propitiation and the transfer of guilt

7.2.3.1 Cleansing rite using a goat

7.2.3.2 Sacrifice liturgy from the Psalms

7.2.3.3 Other texts

7.2.3.4 Symbolic acts

7.2.4 Liturgies of prayer

7.2.4.1 We Kneel Before Thee

7.2.4.2 O Sun, As You Rise in the East

7.2.5 Liturgies based on expulsion and cleansing

7.2.5.1 Cleansing rite using bile/gall

7.2.5.2 Cleansing rite with water

7.2.5.3 Ritual of Aloe

7.2.5.4 Cleansing rite using fire

7.2.5.5 Nigerian prayer of expulsion

7.2.5.6 Deliver Us from Fear of the Unknown

7.2.5.7 Expulsion through Eucharist
7.2.5.8 Other symbolic ways to expel evil

7.2.6 Liturgies of acceptance
7.2.6.1 Freedom Park
7.2.6.2 Prayer of a dying man
7.2.6.3 Collect for Poplarville
7.2.6.4 A Prayer for Africa
7.2.6.5 Family metaphors

7.2.7 Liturgies of rebellion
7.2.7.1 Rebellion text from the Psalms
7.2.7.2 Symbolic actions
7.2.7.3 Extract from the Confession of Alexandria
7.2.7.4 The Confession of Belhar
7.2.7.5 May Anger and Fear turn to Love

CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUDING REFLECTIONS AND REMARKS

8.1 Validity of study
8.1.1 A study from below
8.1.2 Equality
8.1.3 New kind of critique
8.1.4 New options

8.2 Treasure at home
8.2.1 Not so unique
8.2.2 The story of the “Treasure at home”
8.2.3 Deconstruction

8.3 Practical value
8.3.1 Principles of good religion
8.3.2 Community use
8.3.3 Personal understanding

8.4 Suggestions for further investigation

BIBLIOGRAPHY