

**EVALUATION OF THE IMPACT OF THE INTEGRATED FOOD AND
NUTRITION PROGRAMME IN KUNGWINI**

by

Vasanti Pillay

**A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
degree**

DOCTOR PHILOSOPHIAE (Social Work)

in the

Department of Social Work and Criminology

at the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

FACULTY OF HUMANITIES

SUPERVISOR: DR C.E. PRINSLOO

OCTOBER 2010

DECLARATION

I declare that the dissertation, which I hereby submit for the degree DPhil (Social Work) at the University of Pretoria, is my own work and has not previously been submitted by me for a degree at another university.

Where secondary material is used, this has been carefully acknowledged and referenced in accordance with university requirements.

I am aware of university policy and implications regarding plagiarism.

SIGNATURE:

DATE:

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

“Sing to the Lord a new song, for He has done marvellous things”

“He has compassion on the poor and needy”

(Ps 98:1; 72:13)

I gratefully acknowledge the following people for their support during this research process:

- My husband, Sathivan Pillay. Without your invaluable support and encouragement this work would not have been possible.
- My daughters, Vanida, Nadine Nalini, Sandia, Roshila and Verashni, as well as my sons-in-law, Steve and Ivan, who have been my greatest supporters.
- My grandchildren, Kylarsen and Shalia (and my future grandchildren): Strive always for the best, without losing your unique qualities.
- The Department of Social Development, for enabling me to undertake the research.
- Mr. Engenas Senona, Department of Social Development, for the graphical representation of the quantitative data.
- Mr. Mike van der Linde and Ms. Judy Coetzee, Department of Statistics, University of Pretoria, for the quantitative data analysis.
- Mrs. Adelaid Pecko, for her assistance during the field research in Kungwini.
- Mrs. Delene Slabbert, for editing the manuscript.
- Finally, but most importantly, my promoter, Dr Reineth Prinsloo, for her skilled guidance, valued assistance and loyal support during this arduous journey. I am deeply grateful.

EVALUATION OF THE IMPACT OF THE INTEGRATED FOOD AND NUTRITION PROGRAMME IN KUNGWINI

ABSTRACT

Student: V Pillay
Supervisor: Dr CE Prinsloo
Department of Social Work and Criminology
University of Pretoria

The poor in South Africa encounter many obstacles that impact negatively on their wellbeing. These include high rates of unemployment and a lack of financial and material resources. The poor living in informal settlements dwell in conditions that have an adverse impact on family health, due to malnutrition and food insecurity. Post 1994, many poverty alleviation programmes, including the Integrated Food and Nutrition Programme (IFNP) sought to improve the lives of the poor.

The objective of the IFNP was to address poverty in Kungwini by increasing household food and income to enable poor households to attain a better standard of living. The purpose of this research is to evaluate whether the IFNP had achieved its objective to reduce poverty in Kungwini and whether programme implementation was effective.

Social development, a process of planned social change to promote the well-being of the population, including economic development, formed the theoretical base for the research study. Social development aims to link the promotion of human welfare and economic development, and to make development socially relevant. Policies and programmes such as the IFNP aim to enhance people's welfare and contribute to economic development.

The literature study included the impact of global and national poverty on poor households in terms of poverty levels and unemployment. Gender discrimination and the social marginalization of vulnerable groups which include children, the youth, the aged and the disabled poor, social justice for the poor and the gap between the formal and informal sectors informed the research process. The crucial need for collaborative partnerships to address poverty issues is stressed, including the involvement of the

poor in policy processes that impact on their wellbeing and the importance of reviewing policy implementation processes through regular programme evaluation.

Poverty challenges include skills development for employment; food security; and policy reforms to ensure effective service delivery. Appropriate skills development should be identified in consultation with the poor. It is imperative that policy makers are equipped with adequate policy development skills to develop stakeholder participation. Efficient communication between relevant departments and community organisations will maintain the collaborative partnership. Public policy implementation and project management remain inter-dependent processes. Public poverty policies are based on the specific Department's focus. Consequently, fragmented services are rendered by various public sectors, targeting the similar beneficiaries.

The IFNP is evaluated against essential policy requirements to create an enabling service delivery environment and programme coordination. This includes good governance, transparency, public participation, and sustainable policy implementation. Achieving a balance between effective service delivery; adequate resources, and efficient monitoring and evaluation processes highlight the principles of successful poverty policies.

Evaluation research with a combined qualitative and quantitative research approach was utilized to gather data to evaluate the impact of the IFNP to reduce poverty in Kungwini. The collective case study design was used for the qualitative research and data was collected through focus group interviews. A questionnaire was the data collection method for the quantitative research. The research results indicated that the IFNP's objective to address poverty in Kungwini required interactive participation from relevant departments and community organisations. The collaborative partnership is essential to address poverty effectively.

Research findings include the need to equip the poor with relevant skills for the job market, or to develop their own businesses. Youth mentoring is essential to enable the youth to pursue future goals. Small scale farmers should be trained with improved farming methods. Access to financial institutions and trading markets would improve the economic circumstances of the informal sector.

Collaborative partnerships with a range of stakeholders, including the poor, would ensure effective service delivery through shared responsibilities. Service delivery should be based on achievable goals and effective communication strategies. Public policy developers require adequate policy development knowledge and policy implementation skills to ensure cost-effective policy processes.

The research recommendations indicate that the Integrated Model is more cost effective than the Organizational Model to reduce poverty as it includes stakeholder involvement in policy development and policy advocacy. Maintaining communication between relevant departments and community organizations remain key policy requirements. Ensuring personnel training in practical project management skills is an essential policy necessity.

Appropriate skills development should be identified in consultation with the poor. Efficient communication between relevant departments and community organizations will maintain the collaborative partnership. Policy implementation processes should be regularly reviewed to address policy constraints. Personnel training include policy and practical project management skills to ensure transparency and cost-effective service delivery. Addressing policy constraints through alternative policy options will ensure programmes are on track to achieve policy goals and objectives.



KEY WORDS

Poverty alleviation

Unemployment

Socio-economic challenges

Food and nutrition

Social justice

Service delivery environments

Policy intervention

Public transparency

Programme implementation

Collaborative partnerships

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION	I
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
KEY WORDS	VI
LIST OF GRAPHS	XVI
LIST OF TABLES	XVIII
CHAPTER 1: GENERAL INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.2 PROBLEM FORMULATION	6
1.2.1 Kungwini population profile	9
1.2.2 Household dependency status	10
1.2.3 Employment status	10
1.3. PURPOSE, GOAL AND OBJECTIVES	12
1.3.1 Purpose	12
1.3.2 Goal and objectives	12
1.4 RESEARCH QUESTION	13
1.5 RESEARCH APPROACH	13
1.6 TYPE OF RESEARCH	15
1.6.1 Applied research	15
1.6.2 Sub-type research	16
1.7 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	16
1.7.1 Informed consent	16
1.7.2 Confidentiality	17
1.7.3 Deception	17
1.7.4 Violation of privacy	17
1.7.5 Harm to respondents	18
1.7.6 Actions and competence of the researcher	18
1.7.7 Co-operation with contributors	19
1.7.8 Release or publication of the findings	19
1.8 DEFINITION OF KEY CONCEPTS	20
1.8.1 Evaluation	20

1.8.2	Impact.....	21
1.8.3	The Integrated Food and Nutrition Programme	21
1.8.4	Programme.....	21
1.8.5	Poverty	22
1.8.6	Poverty alleviation	22
1.9	LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY.....	22
1.10	PRESENTATION OF THE RESEARCH REPORT.....	23
1.11	CHAPTER SUMMARY	24
CHAPTER 2: GLOBAL AND NATIONAL POVERTY.....		26
2.1	INTRODUCTION.....	26
2.2	THE IMPACT OF GLOBAL POVERTY ON THE POOR	27
2.2.1	Millennium development goals and poverty reduction.....	27
2.2.2	Challenges to addressing poverty	29
2.2.3	Global politics and poverty	31
2.2.4	Creating a conducive environment to address poverty.....	32
2.2.5	Concluding remarks.....	32
2.3	THE IMPACT OF POVERTY IN AFRICA	33
2.3.1	Consequences of poverty in Africa.....	33
2.3.2	Consequences on children	34
2.3.3	Socio-economic consequences.....	34
2.3.4	Concluding remarks.....	35
2.4	THE IMPACT OF POVERTY IN SOUTH AFRICA.....	36
2.4.1	Poverty challenges	36
2.4.2	Socio-economic challenges.....	37
2.4.3	Socio-economic challenges and the South African Constitution.....	38
2.4.4	Socio-economic challenges versus the Growth, Employment and Redistribution Programme (GEAR)	38
2.4.5	Socio-economic challenges for the working poor	39
2.4.6	Addressing socio-economic challenges.....	40
2.4.7	Concluding remarks.....	41
2.5	THE IMPACT OF POVERTY ON WOMEN	41
2.5.1	Socio-economic constraints.....	41
2.5.2	Socio-economic challenges and social justice.....	42

2.5.3	Socio-economic constraints and gender discrimination.....	42
2.5.4	Concluding remarks.....	43
2.6	THE IMPACT OF POVERTY ON CHILDREN	44
2.6.1	Status of poor children.....	44
2.6.2	Health status of children from poor families.....	44
2.6.3	Family dysfunction.....	46
2.6.4	Concluding remarks.....	47
2.7	THE IMPACT OF POVERTY ON THE YOUTH.....	47
2.7.1	Socio-economic constraints.....	47
2.7.2	Environmental influences	48
2.7.3	Concluding remarks.....	50
2.8	THE IMPACT OF POVERTY ON THE AGED	50
2.8.1	Dealing with insecurity	50
2.8.2	Socio-economic constraints.....	51
2.8.3	Future prospects for the elderly.....	51
2.8.4	Concluding remarks.....	52
2.9	THE IMPACT OF POVERTY ON THE DISABLED.....	53
2.9.1	Socio-economic status of the elderly	53
2.9.2	Intervention strategies	54
2.9.3	Concluding remarks.....	54
2.10	CLIMATE CHANGE AND THE IMPACT ON POVERTY	55
2.10.1	Effects of climate change	55
2.10.2	Consequences of climate change	55
2.10.3	Consequences of climate change in South Africa	56
2.10.4	Concluding remarks.....	57
2.11	THE IMPACT OF HIV/AIDS ON POVERTY	58
2.11.1	The consequences of HIV/AIDS.....	58
2.11.2	Consequences of HIV/AIDS on children.....	58
2.11.3	Socio-economic consequences.....	59
2.11.4	HIV/AIDS and social exclusion	60
2.11.5	HIV/AIDS and social rights	61
2.11.6	Concluding remarks.....	62
2.12	THE SOCIO-ECONOMIC IMPACT OF POVERTY	62
2.12.1	The economy and wealth distribution	62

2.12.2	The economy and human development	64
2.12.3	Recognising degrees of poverty	64
2.12.4	Breaching the economic gap	65
2.12.5	Economic development constraints	66
2.12.6	Health status of the poor	67
2.12.7	The gap between the informal and formal economies	68
2.12.8	The economy and unemployment	69
2.12.9	The economy and health insurance.....	69
2.12.10	Concluding remarks.....	70
2.13	THE IMPACT OF THE MDG ON POVERTY	71
2.13.1	Reducing global poverty	71
2.13.2	International trade relations	72
2.13.3	International trade challenges	73
2.13.4	Agricultural trade challenges in Sub-Saharan Africa	73
2.13.5	International socio-economic assistance	74
2.13.6	Measuring the MDG achievements	75
2.13.7	Concluding remarks.....	76
2.14	POVERTY PROJECTIONS AND SOCIAL JUSTICE	76
2.14.1	Reducing global poverty	76
2.14.2	Addressing social justice in poverty policies.....	77
2.14.3	Social justice and poverty reduction	78
2.14.4	Social justice and third world development.....	79
2.14.5	Social justice and community development.....	80
2.14.6	Social justice and public service delivery constraints	81
2.14.7	Policy intervention	82
2.14.8	Policy limitations	83
2.14.9	Policy success and policy failures	84
2.14.10	Policy considerations for the future.....	86
2.14.11	Concluding remarks.....	86
2.15	ADDRESSING POVERTY EFFECTIVELY IN SOUTH AFRICA	87
2.15.1	Public transparency	87
2.15.2	Effective public service delivery.....	88
2.15.3	Ensuring socio-economic development.....	89
2.16	CONCLUDING REMARKS.....	90

2.17	CHAPTER SUMMARY	91
CHAPTER 3: PUBLIC POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY ANALYSIS		94
3.1	INTRODUCTION	94
3.2	HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES ON PUBLIC POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY ANALYSIS PROCESSES	95
3.2.1	Historical perspective following the Second World War.....	95
3.2.2	Process and skills that informed public policy	96
3.2.3	Addressing gender issues in public policy processes.....	96
3.2.4	Effective public service delivery.....	97
3.2.5	Policy development and service delivery in Africa and South Africa.....	98
3.2.6	Concluding remarks.....	99
3.3	HISTORICAL BACKGROUND TO PUBLIC POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY ANALYSIS IN SOUTH AFRICA	100
3.3.1	The South African Constitution and the Bill of Rights	100
3.3.2	Policy development and implementation	102
3.3.3	Policy implementation and resource constraints	102
3.3.4	Concluding remarks.....	104
3.4	THE NEED FOR EFFECTIVE PUBLIC POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY ANALYSIS.....	105
3.4.1	A collaborative process	105
3.4.2	Addressing health issues.....	107
3.4.3	Addressing gender equity	108
3.4.4	Concluding remarks.....	109
3.5	THE ROLE OF POLICY ANALYSIS AND POLICY ADVOCACY	110
3.5.1	Policy analysis and policy advocacy processes: Lessons from relevant research initiatives.....	110
3.5.2	Policy development constraints: Lessons from relevant research initiatives	112
3.5.3	Community involvement in public policy development: Lessons from research initiatives.....	114
3.5.4	Concluding remarks.....	115
3.6	A REVIEW OF SELECTED NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL SERVICE DELIVERY MODELS.....	116

3.6.1	Policy constraints in Africa and South Africa	116
3.6.2	Policy success in Costa Rica and Cuba	118
3.6.3	Policy success and constraints in Europe and New Zealand	118
3.6.4	Concluding remarks.....	120
3.7	POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY ANALYSIS CHALLENGES FOR GOVERNMENT.....	120
3.7.1	Pressure group and implementation challenges.....	121
3.7.2	Globalisation challenges.....	122
3.7.3	Informal sector challenges.....	124
3.7.4	Formal sector challenge	125
3.7.5	Trade reform and grassroots challenges	126
3.7.6	Health insurance and unemployment compensation challenges.....	128
3.7.7	Concluding remarks.....	130
3.8	AGRICULTURE POVERTY POLICIES	130
3.8.1	The role of the agriculture sector to address poverty in South Africa ...	130
3.8.2	International and national adverse agricultural models.....	132
3.8.3	Concluding remarks.....	133
3.9	ADDRESSING THE CHALLENGES OF PUBLIC POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY ANALYSIS	134
3.9.1	Policy development lessons from Africa and South Africa.....	134
3.9.2	Concluding remarks.....	135
3.10	THE IMPERATIVE FOR COLLABORATIVE PARTNERSHIPS TO ADDRESS POVERTY POLICY ISSUES.....	136
3.10.1	Effective political institutions and environments	136
3.10.2	Developing public services to address poverty in South Africa	138
3.10.3	Effective collaborative partnerships	139
3.10.4	Technology collaboration.....	140
3.10.5	Concluding remarks.....	141
3.11	CHAPTER SUMMARY	142
CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY		144
4.1.	INTRODUCTION.....	144
4.2	RESEARCH DESIGN.....	145
4.2.1	Quantitative design.....	145

4.2.2	Qualitative design: collective case study	146
4.3	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	147
4.3.1	Literature study.....	147
4.3.2	Pilot study.....	148
4.4	RESEARCH POPULATION, SAMPLE AND SAMPLING METHOD.....	152
4.4.1	Description of the research population	152
4.4.2	Research sample.....	152
4.4.3	Sampling method.....	153
4.5	EMPIRICAL RESEARCH	155
4.5.1	Data-collecting methods	155
4.5.2	Qualitative data collecting.....	155
4.5.3	Quantitative data collecting	159
4.5.4	Document analysis	159
4.6	DATA ANALYSIS	160
4.6.1	Quantitative data analysis	160
4.6.2	Qualitative data analysis.....	160
4.7	CHAPTER SUMMARY	161
	CHAPTER 5: QUALITATIVE RESEARCH	163
5.1	INTRODUCTION.....	163
5.1.1	Research setting.....	163
5.1.2	Beneficiary profile.....	164
5.1.3	Informal settlement.....	165
5.2	PHASES OF QUALITATIVE DATA COLLECTING	165
5.3	QUALITATIVE DATA.....	165
5.3.1	Focus group interviews.....	165
5.3.2	Extended household interviews.....	166
5.3.3	Data-collecting method.....	166
5.4	QUALITATIVE DATA ANALYSIS	167
5.5	RESPONSES TO QUESTIONS	168
5.5.1	Question 1: “How were you assisted to improve your household food needs?”	168
5.5.2	Question 2: “How were you assisted to establish food gardens?”	173
5.5.3	Question 3: “How were you assisted with skills development?”	177

5.5.4	Question 4: “How were you assisted to access child or pension grants?”	182
5.5.5	Question 5: “How were you assisted to form community organisations?”	186
5.6	SUMMARY	190
CHAPTER 6: QUANTITATIVE EMPIRICAL RESEARCH FINDINGS.....		193
6.1	INTRODUCTION.....	193
6.2	RESEARCH SETTING.....	194
6.3	PHASES OF QUANTITATIVE DATA COLLECTING.....	194
6.4	MEASURING INSTRUMENT - QUANTITATIVE DATA COLLECTING	195
6.5	QUANTITATIVE DATA ANALYSIS	196
6.6	FINDINGS OF THE QUANTITATIVE DATA.....	196
6.6.1	Biographical data.....	196
6.6.2	Achieving the IFNP objectives.....	199
6.7	ACHIEVING THE SUB-OBJECTIVES OF THE IFNP.....	203
6.8	IMPROVING HOUSEHOLD NUTRITION AND HEALTH	208
6.9	ESTABLISHING SAFETY NETS AND FOOD EMERGENCY	210
6.10	SUPPORT FOR COMMUNITY INCOME AND JOB OPPORTUNITIES	215
6.11	DEVELOPING EFFECTIVE AND EFFICIENT FOOD MARKETS.....	218
6.12	IMPROVED INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION.....	219
6.13	INTEGRATED STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT	220
6.14	PROVINCIAL STEERING COMMITTEE ROLES.....	223
6.15	LOCAL STEERING COMMITTEE ROLES.....	224
6.16	CONCLUDING REMARKS.....	226
6.17	CHAPTER SUMMARY	228
CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....		231
7.1	INTRODUCTION.....	231
7.2	CHAPTER 1: GENERAL INTRODUCTION.....	232
7.2.1	Summary	232
7.2.2	Research goal and objectives	234
7.2.3	Research question.....	235
7.2.4	Chapter 1: The research process	236
7.2.5	Recommendations Chapter 1: the research process.....	236

7.3	CHAPTER 2: GLOBAL AND NATIONAL POVERTY.....	237
7.3.1	Summary	237
7.3.2	Conclusions Chapter 2: Global and national poverty.....	238
7.3.3	Recommendations Chapter 2: Global and national poverty	239
7.4	CHAPTER 3: PUBLIC POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY ANALYSIS.....	241
7.4.1	Summary	241
7.4.2	Conclusions Chapter 3: The research process.....	244
7.4.3	Recommendations Chapter 3: The research process	244
7.5	CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY	245
7.5.1	Summary	245
7.5.2	Conclusions Chapter 4: The research process.....	246
7.5.3	Recommendations Chapter 4: The research process	247
7.6	CHAPTER 5: QUALITATIVE EMPIRICAL RESEARCH.....	247
7.6.1	Summary	247
7.6.2	Conclusions Chapter 5: The research process.....	248
7.6.3	Recommendations Chapter 5: The research process	249
7.7	CHAPTER 6: QUANTITATIVE EMPIRICAL RESEARCH	249
7.7.1	Summary	249
7.7.2	Quantitative data analysis	250
7.7.3	Conclusions Chapter 6: Empirical research.....	259
7.7.4	Recommendations Chapter 6: Empirical research	260
7.8	CONCLUDING REMARKS.....	261
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	262
	ANNEXURE A: INFORMED CONSENT MANAGERS	289
	ANNEXURE B: INFORMED CONSENT MINORS.....	291
	ANNEXURE C: QUESTIONNAIRE.....	295
	ANNEXURE D: SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW SCHEDULE.....	296

LIST OF GRAPHS

Graph 1:	Gender distribution of respondents.....	196
Graph 2:	Age distribution of respondents	197
Graph 3:	Qualifications of respondents.....	197
Graph 4:	Province employed	198
Graph 5:	District employed	198
Graph 6:	Involvement in the IFNP	199
Graph 7:	Increase household food production.....	199
Graph 8:	Improve safety nets and food emergency systems.....	200
Graph 9:	Increase community income and job opportunities	201
Graph 10:	Improve the effectiveness and efficiency of food markets	202
Graph 11:	Improve information and communication management systems	202
Graph 12:	Establishing functioning household food gardens.....	203
Graph 13:	Establishing food garden trading	204
Graph 14:	Establishing school feeding programmes	205
Graph 15:	School gardens established and functioning	206
Graph 16:	Empowering beneficiaries to understand their nutritional needs	206
Graph 17:	Formulating a basic food basket for different household compositions.....	207
Graph 18:	Education and awareness campaigns undertaken	208
Graph 19:	Supplementary nutrition programmes established.....	209
Graph 20:	Food safety information systems created	209
Graph 21:	Pension support established.....	210
Graph 22:	Disability support established	211
Graph 23:	Monetary savings from household food garden trade established	212
Graph 24:	Community food gardens established.....	213

Graph 25:	Food emergency support established.....	214
Graph 26:	Land for community farming identified	215
Graph 27:	Grain reserves established	216
Graph 28:	Community food markets increased	216
Graph 29:	Promotion and support for non-farming income generating activities	218
Graph 30:	Comprehensive support for agriculture development	218
Graph 31:	Food security and information mapping established.....	219
Graph 32:	Integrated planning and implementation.....	220
Graph 33:	Community based partnerships established	221
Graph 34:	Clear stakeholder roles established.....	221
Graph 35:	Short-, medium-, long-term interventions established.....	222
Graph 36:	Maintaining representation on the National Steering Committee	223
Graph 37:	Utilising the policy framework for strategic guidance	224
Graph 38:	Beneficiaries assisted to form community organisations and co-operatives	224
Graph 39:	Community organisations assisted with technical, financial and administrative matters.....	225

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Unemployment by gender (2008-2009)	3
Table 2: Unemployment rate by population group (2008-2009).....	4
Table 3: Phases of the quantitative and qualitative methods:.....	10
Table 4: Phases of the quantitative and qualitative methods	154