EVALUATION OF THE IMPACT OF THE INTEGRATED FOOD AND NUTRITION PROGRAMME IN KUNGWINI

by

Vasanti Pillay

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

DOCTOR PHILOSOPHIAE (Social Work)

in the

Department of Social Work and Criminology

at the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

FACULTY OF HUMANITIES

SUPERVISOR: DR C.E. PRINSLOO

OCTOBER 2010

© University of Pretoria
DECLARATION

I declare that the dissertation, which I hereby submit for the degree DPhil (Social Work) at the University of Pretoria, is my own work and has not previously been submitted by me for a degree at another university.

Where secondary material is used, this has been carefully acknowledged and referenced in accordance with university requirements.

I am aware of university policy and implications regarding plagiarism.

SIGNATURE: ......................................................

DATE: ............................................................
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

“Sing to the Lord a new song, for He has done marvellous things”
“He has compassion on the poor and needy”

(Ps 98:1; 72:13)

I gratefully acknowledge the following people for their support during this research process:

▫ My husband, Sathivan Pillay. Without your invaluable support and encouragement this work would not have been possible.
▫ My daughters, Vanida, Nadine Nalini, Sandia, Roshila and Verashni, as well as my sons-in-law, Steve and Ivan, who have been my greatest supporters.
▫ My grandchildren, Kylarsen and Shalia (and my future grandchildren): Strive always for the best, without losing your unique qualities.
▫ The Department of Social Development, for enabling me to undertake the research.
▫ Mr. Engenas Senona, Department of Social Development, for the graphical representation of the quantitative data.
▫ Mr. Mike van der Linde and Ms. Judy Coetzee, Department of Statistics, University of Pretoria, for the quantitative data analysis.
▫ Mrs. Adelaid Pecko, for her assistance during the field research in Kungwini.
▫ Mrs. Delene Slabbert, for editing the manuscript.
▫ Finally, but most importantly, my promoter, Dr Reineth Prinsloo, for her skilled guidance, valued assistance and loyal support during this arduous journey. I am deeply grateful.
EVALUATION OF THE IMPACT OF THE INTEGRATED FOOD AND NUTRITION PROGRAMME IN KUNGWINI

ABSTRACT

Student: V Pillay
Supervisor: Dr CE Prinsloo
Department of Social Work and Criminology
University of Pretoria

The poor in South Africa encounter many obstacles that impact negatively on their wellbeing. These include high rates of unemployment and a lack of financial and material resources. The poor living in informal settlements dwell in conditions that have an adverse impact on family health, due to malnutrition and food insecurity. Post 1994, many poverty alleviation programmes, including the Integrated Food and Nutrition Programme (IFNP) sought to improve the lives of the poor.

The objective of the IFNP was to address poverty in Kungwini by increasing household food and income to enable poor households to attain a better standard of living. The purpose of this research is to evaluate whether the IFNP had achieved its objective to reduce poverty in Kungwini and whether programme implementation was effective.

Social development, a process of planned social change to promote the well-being of the population, including economic development, formed the theoretical base for the research study. Social development aims to link the promotion of human welfare and economic development, and to make development socially relevant. Policies and programmes such as the IFNP aim to enhance people’s welfare and contribute to economic development.

The literature study included the impact of global and national poverty on poor households in terms of poverty levels and unemployment. Gender discrimination and the social marginalization of vulnerable groups which include children, the youth, the aged and the disabled poor, social justice for the poor and the gap between the formal and informal sectors informed the research process. The crucial need for collaborative partnerships to address poverty issues is stressed, including the involvement of the
poor in policy processes that impact on their wellbeing and the importance of reviewing policy implementation processes through regular programme evaluation.

Poverty challenges include skills development for employment; food security; and policy reforms to ensure effective service delivery. Appropriate skills development should be identified in consultation with the poor. It is imperative that policy makers are equipped with adequate policy development skills to develop stakeholder participation. Efficient communication between relevant departments and community organisations will maintain the collaborative partnership. Public policy implementation and project management remain inter-dependent processes. Public poverty policies are based on the specific Department’s focus. Consequently, fragmented services are rendered by various public sectors, targeting the similar beneficiaries.

The IFNP is evaluated against essential policy requirements to create an enabling service delivery environment and programme coordination. This includes good governance, transparency, public participation, and sustainable policy implementation. Achieving a balance between effective service delivery; adequate resources, and efficient monitoring and evaluation processes highlight the principles of successful poverty policies.

Evaluation research with a combined qualitative and quantitative research approach was utilized to gather data to evaluate the impact of the IFNP to reduce poverty in Kungwini. The collective case study design was used for the qualitative research and data was collected through focus group interviews. A questionnaire was the data collection method for the quantitative research. The research results indicated that the IFNP’s objective to address poverty in Kungwini required interactive participation from relevant departments and community organisations. The collaborative partnership is essential to address poverty effectively.

Research findings include the need to equip the poor with relevant skills for the job market, or to develop their own businesses. Youth mentoring is essential to enable the youth to pursue future goals. Small scale farmers should be trained with improved farming methods. Access to financial institutions and trading markets would improve the economic circumstances of the informal sector.
Collaborative partnerships with a range of stakeholders, including the poor, would ensure effective service delivery through shared responsibilities. Service delivery should be based on achievable goals and effective communication strategies. Public policy developers require adequate policy development knowledge and policy implementation skills to ensure cost-effective policy processes.

The research recommendations indicate that the Integrated Model is more cost effective than the Organizational Model to reduce poverty as it includes stakeholder involvement in policy development and policy advocacy. Maintaining communication between relevant departments and community organizations remain key policy requirements. Ensuring personnel training in practical project management skills is an essential policy necessity.

Appropriate skills development should be identified in consultation with the poor. Efficient communication between relevant departments and community organizations will maintain the collaborative partnership. Policy implementation processes should be regularly reviewed to address policy constraints. Personnel training include policy and practical project management skills to ensure transparency and cost-effective service delivery. Addressing policy constraints through alternative policy options will ensure programmes are on track to achieve policy goals and objectives.
KEY WORDS

Poverty alleviation
Unemployment
Socio-economic challenges
Food and nutrition
Social justice
Service delivery environments
Policy intervention
Public transparency
Programme implementation
Collaborative partnerships
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION ............................................................................................................................................... I

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ................................................................................................................................. ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.

KEY WORDS ................................................................................................................................................ VI

LIST OF GRAPHS ......................................................................................................................................... XVI

LIST OF TABLES .......................................................................................................................................... XVIII

CHAPTER 1: GENERAL INTRODUCTION ..................................................................................................... 1

1.1 INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................................................... 1

1.2 PROBLEM FORMULATION ................................................................................................................. 6

1.2.1 Kungwini population profile ....................................................................................................... 9

1.2.2 Household dependency status ................................................................................................... 10

1.2.3 Employment status ....................................................................................................................... 10

1.3 PURPOSE, GOAL AND OBJECTIVES .............................................................................................. 12

1.3.1 Purpose ......................................................................................................................................... 12

1.3.2 Goal and objectives ....................................................................................................................... 12

1.4 RESEARCH QUESTION .................................................................................................................... 13

1.5 RESEARCH APPROACH .................................................................................................................. 13

1.6 TYPE OF RESEARCH ........................................................................................................................ 15

1.6.1 Applied research .......................................................................................................................... 15

1.6.2 Sub-type research ........................................................................................................................ 16

1.7 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS .......................................................................................................... 16

1.7.1 Informed consent .......................................................................................................................... 16

1.7.2 Confidentiality .............................................................................................................................. 17

1.7.3 Deception ....................................................................................................................................... 17

1.7.4 Violation of privacy ....................................................................................................................... 17

1.7.5 Harm to respondents .................................................................................................................... 18

1.7.6 Actions and competence of the researcher .................................................................................. 18

1.7.7 Co-operation with contributors .................................................................................................. 19

1.7.8 Release or publication of the findings ......................................................................................... 19

1.8 DEFINITION OF KEY CONCEPTS .................................................................................................. 20

1.8.1 Evaluation ....................................................................................................................................... 20
CHAPTER 2: GLOBAL AND NATIONAL POVERTY

2.1 INTRODUCTION

2.2 THE IMPACT OF GLOBAL POVERTY ON THE POOR

2.2.1 Millennium development goals and poverty reduction

2.2.2 Challenges to addressing poverty

2.2.3 Global politics and poverty

2.2.4 Creating a conducive environment to address poverty

2.2.5 Concluding remarks

2.3 THE IMPACT OF POVERTY IN AFRICA

2.3.1 Consequences of poverty in Africa

2.3.2 Consequences on children

2.3.3 Socio-economic consequences

2.3.4 Concluding remarks

2.4 THE IMPACT OF POVERTY IN SOUTH AFRICA

2.4.1 Poverty challenges

2.4.2 Socio-economic challenges

2.4.3 Socio-economic challenges and the South African Constitution

2.4.4 Socio-economic challenges versus the Growth, Employment and Redistribution Programme (GEAR)

2.4.5 Socio-economic challenges for the working poor

2.4.6 Addressing socio-economic challenges

2.4.7 Concluding remarks

2.5 THE IMPACT OF POVERTY ON WOMEN

2.5.1 Socio-economic constraints

2.5.2 Socio-economic challenges and social justice
2.5.3 Socio-economic constraints and gender discrimination ................. 42
2.5.4 Concluding remarks ........................................................................ 43
2.6 THE IMPACT OF POVERTY ON CHILDREN ........................................ 44
2.6.1 Status of poor children ................................................................... 44
2.6.2 Health status of children from poor families .................................... 44
2.6.3 Family dysfunction ......................................................................... 46
2.6.4 Concluding remarks ........................................................................ 47
2.7 THE IMPACT OF POVERTY ON THE YOUTH ..................................... 47
2.7.1 Socio-economic constraints ............................................................. 47
2.7.2 Environmental influences ............................................................... 48
2.7.3 Concluding remarks ........................................................................ 50
2.8 THE IMPACT OF POVERTY ON THE AGED ..................................... 50
2.8.1 Dealing with insecurity ................................................................... 50
2.8.2 Socio-economic constraints ............................................................. 51
2.8.3 Future prospects for the elderly ....................................................... 51
2.8.4 Concluding remarks ........................................................................ 52
2.9 THE IMPACT OF POVERTY ON THE DISABLED .............................. 53
2.9.1 Socio-economic status of the elderly ............................................... 53
2.9.2 Intervention strategies .................................................................... 54
2.9.3 Concluding remarks ........................................................................ 54
2.10 CLIMATE CHANGE AND THE IMPACT ON POVERTY .................. 55
2.10.1 Effects of climate change ............................................................... 55
2.10.2 Consequences of climate change .................................................... 55
2.10.3 Consequences of climate change in South Africa ............................ 56
2.10.4 Concluding remarks ...................................................................... 57
2.11 THE IMPACT OF HIV/AIDS ON POVERTY .................................. 58
2.11.1 The consequences of HIV/AIDS ....................................................... 58
2.11.2 Consequences of HIV/AIDS on children ....................................... 58
2.11.3 Socio-economic consequences ....................................................... 59
2.11.4 HIV/AIDS and social exclusion ..................................................... 60
2.11.5 HIV/AIDS and social rights ............................................................. 61
2.11.6 Concluding remarks ...................................................................... 62
2.12 THE SOCIO-ECONOMIC IMPACT OF POVERTY ............................. 62
2.12.1 The economy and wealth distribution ............................................. 62
2.17 CHAPTER SUMMARY ........................................................................................................ 91

CHAPTER 3: PUBLIC POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY ANALYSIS ....... 94

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES ON PUBLIC POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY ANALYSIS PROCESSES</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Historical perspective following the Second World War</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2 Process and skills that informed public policy</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3 Addressing gender issues in public policy processes</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4 Effective public service delivery</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5 Policy development and service delivery in Africa and South Africa</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.6 Concluding remarks</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND TO PUBLIC POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY ANALYSIS IN SOUTH AFRICA</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1 The South African Constitution and the Bill of Rights</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2 Policy development and implementation</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3 Policy implementation and resource constraints</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.4 Concluding remarks</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 THE NEED FOR EFFECTIVE PUBLIC POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY ANALYSIS</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1 A collaborative process</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2 Addressing health issues</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3 Addressing gender equity</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4 Concluding remarks</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 THE ROLE OF POLICY ANALYSIS AND POLICY ADVOCACY</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.1 Policy analysis and policy advocacy processes: Lessons from relevant research initiatives</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2 Policy development constraints: Lessons from relevant research initiatives</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3 Community involvement in public policy development: Lessons from research initiatives</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.4 Concluding remarks</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 A REVIEW OF SELECTED NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL SERVICE DELIVERY MODELS</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.6.1 Policy constraints in Africa and South Africa ........................................ 116
3.6.2 Policy success in Costa Rica and Cuba ............................................... 118
3.6.3 Policy success and constraints in Europe and New Zealand ............... 118
3.6.4 Concluding remarks.............................................................................. 120
3.7 POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY ANALYSIS CHALLENGES FOR GOVERNMENT ................................................................. 120
3.7.1 Pressure group and implementation challenges................................... 121
3.7.2 Globalisation challenges....................................................................... 122
3.7.3 Informal sector challenges.................................................................... 124
3.7.4 Formal sector challenge ....................................................................... 125
3.7.5 Trade reform and grassroots challenges .............................................. 126
3.7.6 Health insurance and unemployment compensation challenges ........ 128
3.7.7 Concluding remarks.............................................................................. 130
3.8 AGRICULTURE POVERTY POLICIES ................................................ 130
3.8.1 The role of the agriculture sector to address poverty in South Africa ... 130
3.8.2 International and national adverse agricultural models......................... 132
3.8.3 Concluding remarks.............................................................................. 133
3.9 ADDRESSING THE CHALLENGES OF PUBLIC POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY ANALYSIS .................................................... 134
3.9.1 Policy development lessons from Africa and South Africa.................... 134
3.9.2 Concluding remarks.............................................................................. 135
3.10 THE IMPERATIVE FOR COLLABORATIVE PARTNERSHIPS TO ADDRESS POVERTY POLICY ISSUES .............................................................. 136
3.10.1 Effective political institutions and environments ................................ 136
3.10.2 Developing public services to address poverty in South Africa .......... 138
3.10.3 Effective collaborative partnerships.................................................... 139
3.10.4 Technology collaboration...................................................................... 140
3.10.5 Concluding remarks.............................................................................. 141
3.11 CHAPTER SUMMARY ......................................................................... 142

CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY .............................. 144
4.1. INTRODUCTION .................................................................................. 144
4.2 RESEARCH DESIGN........................................................................... 145
4.2.1 Quantitative design............................................................................ 145
LIST OF GRAPHS

Graph 1: Gender distribution of respondents ............................................ 196
Graph 2: Age distribution of respondents ................................................. 197
Graph 3: Qualifications of respondents ..................................................... 197
Graph 4: Province employed ................................................................. 198
Graph 5: District employed ................................................................. 198
Graph 6: Involvement in the IFNP ......................................................... 199
Graph 7: Increase household food production ...................................... 199
Graph 8: Improve safety nets and food emergency systems .................. 200
Graph 9: Increase community income and job opportunities ............... 201
Graph 10: Improve the effectiveness and efficiency of food markets .... 202
Graph 11: Improve information and communication management systems 202
Graph 12: Establishing functioning household food gardens ............... 203
Graph 13: Establishing food garden trading ......................................... 204
Graph 14: Establishing school feeding programmes .............................. 205
Graph 15: School gardens established and functioning ....................... 206
Graph 16: Empowering beneficiaries to understand their nutritional needs 206
Graph 17: Formulating a basic food basket for different household compositions ........................................ 207
Graph 18: Education and awareness campaigns undertaken ............... 208
Graph 19: Supplementary nutrition programmes established ............... 209
Graph 20: Food safety information systems created .............................. 209
Graph 21: Pension support established ................................................. 210
Graph 22: Disability support established .............................................. 211
Graph 23: Monetary savings from household food garden trade established .................................................................................. 212
Graph 24: Community food gardens established .................................. 213
Graph 25: Food emergency support established ........................................ 214
Graph 26: Land for community farming identified .................................. 215
Graph 27: Grain reserves established .................................................... 216
Graph 28: Community food markets increased ................................... 216
Graph 29: Promotion and support for non-farming income generating activities .......................................................... 218
Graph 30: Comprehensive support for agriculture development ............. 218
Graph 31: Food security and information mapping established ............. 219
Graph 32: Integrated planning and implementation ............................. 220
Graph 33: Community based partnerships established ...................... 221
Graph 34: Clear stakeholder roles established .................................... 221
Graph 35: Short-, medium-, long-term interventions established .......... 222
Graph 36: Maintaining representation on the National Steering Committee 223
Graph 37: Utilising the policy framework for strategic guidance .......... 224
Graph 38: Beneficiaries assisted to form community organisations and co-operatives .......................................................... 224
Graph 39: Community organisations assisted with technical, financial and administrative matters ........................................ 225
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Unemployment by gender (2008-2009) .................................................. 3
Table 2: Unemployment rate by population group (2008-2009)............................. 4
Table 3: Phases of the quantitative and qualitative methods:.............................. 10
Table 4: Phases of the quantitative and qualitative methods ..............................154