

A MODEL OF COGNITIVE BEHAVIOURAL THERAPY FOR HIV-POSITIVE

WOMEN TO ASSIST THEM IN DEALING WITH STIGMA

by

JAN TSHABALALA

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

Ph.D. PSYCHOLOGY

in the

FACULTY OF HUMANITIES

in the

DEPARTMENT OF PSYCHOLOGY

at the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

SUPERVISOR: PROF. M.J. VISSER

OCTOBER 2008

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere appreciation and thanks to the following people for making this research project possible:

- The Almighty God – for the strength, courage and guidance He has always given me throughout this study.
- My supervisor, Professor Maretha Visser – for her time, encouragement, guidance, patience, valuable advice, support and critical comments throughout this research. May you continue to help others realise their potential.
- My loving wife, Swe Kotishana Lizzy – for your sacrifices, support and encouragement. You mean the world to me and your unconditional love has made it possible for me to spread my wings.
- My clinical psychologist colleagues – for your invaluable input during this research.
- The Wellness Clinic staff at Witbank Hospital – for providing me with the relevant information.
- The participants who agreed to take part in this research and without whom this study would have been impossible – for your courage and willingness to allow me to interview you.
- The Department of Statistics at the University of Pretoria, especially Jaqui Sommerville – for providing me with an accurate quantitative analysis of the data.
- The library staff at the University of Pretoria and TUT at Witbank – for your professional and urgent assistance with the literature.
- Isabel Claassen – for not tiring in proofreading this study.
- My colleagues at work, translators and staff, especially Sarah – for providing me with the best support they could.
- Family, relatives and friends – for giving me encouragement and motivation.
- My wonderful son, Buhlebakhe – for your love, tolerance and understanding throughout the difficult times. You always put a smile on my face and I would like to say “ola ntwana”.



DEDICATION

This dissertation is dedicated to
HIV-positive people, from whom we learn so much on a daily basis.

ABSTRACT

In this study, a model of cognitive behavioural therapy (CBT) was developed, implemented and assessed. The aim of this model is to assist HIV-positive women in dealing with internalised and enacted stigma. Since much of the research about therapies developed to deal with HIV-related stigma so far has been done within a western frame of reference, in the current study a model was developed to suit the local South African situation.

Women were specifically targeted as they are more vulnerable to HIV/AIDS and are disproportionately affected by the epidemic. Because of culturally determined gender roles, women are not always in a position to take control of their sexual health. Furthermore, because of the negative experiences of HIV diagnosis, the stigma has a negative impact on women's behaviour. As a result, there is a need for a therapeutic model to assist HIV-positive women in changing the experience of internalised stigma and discrimination.

A CBT approach was used in therapy to challenge the women's dysfunctional beliefs, to change their automatic thoughts and to promote more realistic adaptive patterns of thinking. All of these aimed to assist them in dealing with stigma. Eight therapy sessions (one a week for eight weeks) were planned for each of the women.

This research was conducted in two phases. In Phase 1, data was gathered about the experiences of HIV-positive women to gain an understanding of their experiences of HIV-related stigma and discrimination. Various sources of information were used to identify not only the relevant themes contributing to the individual's experience of internalised stigma, but also possible ways to change them. These sources included a study of the available literature, the researcher's own experience and focus group discussions with other psychologists in practice, and interviews with five HIV-positive women (in the form of case studies). Five women living with HIV/AIDS, who were experiencing difficulties in dealing with stigma, were recruited at Witbank Hospital, where they were interviewed and asked to complete five psychometric instruments. The researcher scrutinised the data gained from the psychometric scales to assess the validity of the instruments to identifying the feelings of the participants the researcher observed in the interviews. Rubin and Rubin's (1995) method was used to analyse the data. The findings that emerged from Phase 1 were used to identify common themes to be addressed in the intervention, for example feelings of powerlessness, feelings of guilt, behavioural implications of stigma, the experience of the reaction of others and uncertainty about the future. These themes were used as guidelines and were adapted according to the specific needs of each of the women seen in therapy so as to address negative feelings and behaviour.

Phase 2 focused on the implementation and evaluation of the cognitive behavioural model. A purposive sampling technique was used for this study. The model was tried out with ten HIV-positive women who served as the experimental group. A quasi-experimental design was used, involving a pre-and post-test and a control group consisting of ten other women identified at the same hospital. The scores that the experimental group and the control group obtained before the intervention were compared to verify that the two groups were comparable prior to the intervention. Post-test scores were compared to investigate differences between the groups after the intervention. The process notes of the therapy sessions were analysed by means of qualitative analysis to understand the reactions of the women in therapy. This contributed to the researcher's understanding of the appropriateness and effectiveness of various therapeutic techniques used with the experimental group.

Findings of this research indicate that, when compared to the control group, the experimental group not only experienced less depression, internalised stigma and negative coping, but also higher levels of self-esteem and positive coping after having participated in eight therapy sessions. The study further revealed that being HIV positive and trying to cope with stigma and discrimination involve diverse experiences for women, although there are common themes for all participants. It was recommended that the intervention be altered in future use in the following ways: Those techniques that were found to be more effective with the majority of women (positive cognitive reframing, teaching of coping strategies, homework assignments, decatastrophising and assertiveness training) could probably be used with success in similar conditions. Only the techniques that worked well should be used, and care should be taken not to use too many techniques. Each client should be given the time to question the evidence for her automatic thoughts and to draw her own conclusions about her situation, feelings or thoughts and to grasp the cognitive strategies, rather than to bombard her with many different techniques. The therapist should also relate more to the individual client and adapt the model to her context, rather than to implement the model rigorously.



KEY TERMS

Women living with HIV

Cognitive behavioural therapy (CBT)

HIV/AIDS-related stigma and discrimination

Psychometric scales

Coping with HIV/AIDS

Stigma

CBT model dealing with stigma

Mixed methods research

Case studies

Quasi-experimental design

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
CHAPTER 1 : INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 ORIENTATION TO THE STUDY	1
1.2 MOTIVATION FOR THE STUDY	3
1.3 AIM OF THE STUDY	5
1.4 THE OUTLINE OF THE STUDY	6
CHAPTER 2 : REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE ON HIV/AIDS, STIGMA AND DISCRIMINATION	7
2.1 INTRODUCTION.....	7
2.2 HIV TRANSMISSION.....	7
2.2.1 The Influence of Poverty and Low Socio-economic Conditions	8
2.3 THE IMPACT OF HIV ON THE BODY.....	9
2.3.1 Primary or Early HIV Infection.....	10
2.3.2 Clinically Latent or “Silent” Infection – the Asymptomatic Phase	11
2.3.3 Minor HIV-related Symptoms – the Minor Symptomatic Phase	11
2.3.4 HIV-related Disease – the Symptomatic Phase	12
2.3.5 Severe HIV-related Disease – AIDS, the Severe Symptomatic Phase.....	12
2.3.6 Stages of Development of HIV Infection into AIDS	13
2.4 EMOTIONAL EXPERIENCES OF BEING HIV-POSITIVE	14
2.5 HIV/AIDS STIGMA AND DISCRIMINATION.....	16
2.5.1 Response to HIV/AIDS Stigma and Discrimination.....	19
2.5.2 Internalisation of Stigma or Self-stigmatisation	23
2.5.3 Expected Stigmatisation and Discrimination	25
2.6 INTERVENTIONS TO ADDRESS STIGMA AND DISCRIMINATION.....	26
2.6.1 Categorising Differential Treatment	26
2.6.1.1 Redress.....	27
2.6.1.2 Preventing Infection	27
2.6.1.3 Social Distancing.....	27
2.6.1.4 Balancing Social Contributions	28
2.6.2 Differential Treatment versus Discrimination	28



CHAPTER 3 : THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES ON HOW TO FACILITATE CHANGE THROUGH PSYCHOTHERAPY..... 31

3.1 INTRODUCTION.....31
3.2 COGNITIVE THERAPY31
3.2.1 Important Cognitive Factors34
3.2.2 Cognitive Techniques.....34
3.2.3 The Use and Limitations of Cognitive Therapy37
3.3 BEHAVIOUR THERAPY40
3.3.1 General Principles.....40
3.3.2 Behavioural Techniques.....41
3.3.3 Evaluating Behaviour Therapies44
3.4 COGNITIVE BEHAVIOUR THERAPY (CBT).....45
3.5 A GUIDELINE OF THE INTERVENTION MODEL.....49

CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH METHODS 51

4.1 INTRODUCTION.....51
4.2 QUALITATIVE AND QUANTITATIVE METHODS51
4.3 RESEARCH DESIGN54
4.3.1 Phases of the Research.....54
4.3.2 Focus Group Discussions with Colleagues.....55
4.3.3 Interviews with HIV-positive Women56
4.3.3.1 Sampling57
4.3.3.2 Data collection methods.....57
4.3.4 Ethical Considerations61
4.3.5 Data Analysis62
4.3.6 An Intervention Model63
4.3.7 Evaluation of the Intervention Model.....69
4.3.7.1 Participants69
4.3.7.2 Design69
4.3.7.3 Data-gathering instruments.....70
4.3.7.4 Data analysis.....71
4.3.7.5 Ethical considerations72
4.4 ACCURACY AND RELIABILITY OF DATA72
4.5 THE RESEARCHER’S ROLE73



CHAPTER 5: RESULTS	75
5.1 INTRODUCTION.....	75
5.2 PHASE 1: PRESENTATION OF THE RESULTS	76
5.2.1 Qualitative Results	76
5.2.1.1 Focus group interview data	76
5.2.1.2 Case studies	79
5.2.1.3 Quantitative results	82
5.2.1.4 Summary.....	84
5.3 PHASE 2: PRESENTATION OF THE RESULTS	85
5.3.1 Quantitative Results.....	85
5.3.2 Qualitative Results	89
5.4 THE VALUE OF EACH THERAPEUTIC TECHNIQUE USED.....	204
5.4.1 Cognitive techniques.....	205
5.4.2 Behavioural techniques.....	210
CHAPTER 6: DISCUSSION OF THE RESULTS	212
6.1 INTRODUCTION.....	212
6.2 DISCUSSION OF WOMEN'S EXPERIENCES OF HIV AND AIDS-RELATED STIGMA	212
6.2.1 Feelings of Powerlessness	213
6.2.2 Guilt Feelings	214
6.2.3 Behavioural Implications	215
6.2.4 The Experience of the Reaction of Others.....	216
6.2.5 Uncertainty about the Future.....	218
6.3 DISCUSSION OF THE IMPLEMENTATION AND EVALUATION OF THE INTERVENTION MODEL.....	219
6.3.1 Feelings of Powerlessness	220
6.3.2 Feelings of Guilt	222
6.3.3 Behavioural Implications	223
6.3.4 The Experience of the Reaction of Others.....	225
6.3.5 Uncertainty about the Future.....	226
6.4 THE QUANTITATIVE RESULTS	226
6.5 THE COGNITIVE BEHAVIOURAL THERAPY TECHNIQUES THAT DID NOT FUNCTION WELL.....	229
6.6 SUGGESTIONS FOR FUTURE IMPLEMENTATION.....	231
6.7 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY	232
6.8 CONCLUSION	233



REFERENCES..... 235

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A : Guideline Questions for the Interviews 251
APPENDIX B : Brief Cope Scale 252
APPENDIX C : Personal View Scale 254
APPENDIX D : Enacted or Experienced Community Stigma Scale..... 255
APPENDIX E : Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale 256
APPENDIX F : Beck Depression Inventory Scale-II..... 257
APPENDIX G : Permission from Provincial Government of Mpumalanga 261
APPENDIX H : Approval of the University of Pretoria’s Research and Ethics
Committee..... 262
APPENDIX I : Informed Consent Form 263
APPENDIX J : Information about the Research Project for Women to assist them in
Dealing with Stigma 264
APPENDIX K : A Summary of all the Case Study Scores of Five HIV-Positive Women 266
APPENDIX L : A Summarised Table of the Quantitative Results on the Five
Psychometric Scales 267

LIST OF TABLES

Table 5.1 Scores of women involved in the case study interviews 83
Table 5.2 Comparison of experimental and control group scores 87
Table 5.3 Summary of the value of various CBT techniques..... 205
Table 6.1 Summary of the perceived effectiveness of various techniques..... 220