

**IMPLEMENTING MUSIC IN AN INTEGRATED
ARTS CURRICULUM FOR SOUTH AFRICAN
PRIMARY SCHOOLS**

by

Dorette Vermeulen

A thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor Musicae

in the

Department of Music
Faculty of Humanities
University of Pretoria

Pretoria

2009

Promoter: Prof. Caroline van Niekerk

Co-promoter: Prof. Heinrich van der Mescht

ABSTRACT

Music Education as part of the learning area Arts and Culture is far from satisfactory in South African schools. Reasons for this include a highly sophisticated and complex curriculum (the revised National Curriculum Statement, 2002); the integration of four discrete arts forms into one learning area; and teacher training which is not always reflective of the teaching profession's demands.

The study was based on a mixed method design, investigating how teachers in best scenario schools implement music as part of the integrated learning area Arts and Culture. Interviews were held with various stakeholders in Music Education, including teachers currently involved with the presentation of the Arts and Culture learning area, lecturers at universities training students for Music Education, and policy makers such as subject advisors in the Arts and Culture learning area. Data was also collected by analysing commercially available resources for this learning area.

Analysis of the data obtained revealed that few teachers in the Arts and Culture learning area are qualified in more than one art form. A major concern is that music is often omitted from regular classroom activities in the Foundation Phase due to teachers feeling pressurised by multiple assessment standards in learning areas such as Literacy and Numeracy. Another finding in all primary school phases was that the time spent on Music Education was far less than that spent on Visual Arts. Learners are often involved in projects collecting knowledge about music, but seldom involved in active music making experiences.

Aspects such as different ways to integrate the arts into one learning area, generalist/specialist teacher training, as well as issues concerning product,

process and performance during the delivery of the arts, were also investigated. The researcher drew from all the data to design a course for teacher training in Music Education as part of the learning area Arts and Culture.

Recommendations include regular in-service teacher training courses; nationwide co-ordination of teacher training programmes and the establishment of a national council for Music Education. An urgent need for appropriate lesson material in Arts and Culture was also identified, including CDs with songs and backtracks.

Keywords

Praxial Music Education; Integrated learning; Interdisciplinary Arts; Arts and Culture; Teacher training; specialist versus generalist Arts teachers; Foundation Phase; Product/process/performance in Arts Education; Assessment in teacher training for Music Education; Outcomes Based Education.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude and appreciation to the people listed below, without whose support this study would not have been possible:

- My promoter, Professor Caroline van Niekerk, for stimulating intellectual thought, meticulous technical guidance, unwavering support and continuous encouragement which motivated me to endeavour to complete the study, and for her years of friendship;
- My co-promoter, Professor Heinrich van der Mescht, for his insight, thorough critical reading and inspiring comments;
- My former lecturer in Music Education, Professor Elsbeth Hugo, who believed in me and gave me the courage to complete the final stages of this project;
- My husband, Gerard, for his unflinching belief in my abilities, as well as my children, Martin and Annemie, for their patience and understanding;
- My friend and colleague Riekie van Aswegen, who always persuaded and inspired me to do my best;
- My students, who are a constant inspiration and motivation to continue my work, because they make a difference in the lives of South African children;
- The music teachers, lecturers and students who were willing to share their experiences, passions and ideas on Music Education during multiple interviews, and without whose insights this study could not have been realised;
- My dearest earthly father, Dick Hölscher, who was a role model and inspiration to me throughout his life; and
- My heavenly father, who instils me with dreams and hopes for the future.

Soli Deo Gloria

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	iv
KEY CONCEPTS IN THE STUDY	xi
ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	xiv
LIST OF TABLES.....	xv
LIST OF FIGURES.....	xvii

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

1.1	PURPOSE AND RATIONALE OF THE STUDY.....	1-1
1.2	RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	1-5
1.2.1	Main research question.....	1-6
1.2.2	To what extent do the views of policy makers of the national curriculum correspond with teachers' experiences in their interpretation of an integrated arts curriculum?	1-7
1.2.3	How are education students trained to implement the integrated arts curriculum?	1-7
1.2.4	What are the suitable resources which support a meaningful implementation of music into the arts curriculum?.....	1-7
1.3	RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY.....	1-9
1.3.1	Sampling strategy	1-10
1.3.2	Data analysis	1-11
1.4	DELIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY.....	1-11

1.5	PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED DURING THE STUDY.....	1-11
1.6	OUTLINE AND ORGANISATION OF THE THESIS.....	1-13
1.7	VALUE OF THE STUDY.....	1-14
1.8	NOTES TO THE READER.....	1-15

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1	INTRODUCTION.....	2-1
2.2	THE ARTS.....	2-2
2.2.1	The value of the arts.....	2-2
2.2.2	The arts in contemporary society.....	2-3
2.2.3	The role of the arts in schools.....	2-3
2.2.4	Intrinsic and utilitarian merits for the arts.....	2-7
2.2.5	The arts all have a product.....	2-12
2.3	CULTURE.....	2-12
2.4	INTEGRATION OF THE ARTS.....	2-15
2.5	MUSIC AS COMPONENT OF AN ARTS EDUCATION.....	2-21
2.5.1	The role of music in 21 st -century society	2-21
2.5.2	Music as an intrinsic part of African cultures.....	2-23
2.5.3	The merit of Music Education in schools.....	2-24
2.5.4	Specialist or generalist teachers for Music Education.....	2-28
2.5.5	Process, product, presentation and performance in Music Education.....	2-26

2.6	CONCLUDING REMARKS.....	2-32
-----	-------------------------	------

CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHOD

3.1	INTRODUCTION.....	3-1
3.1.1	Theoretical perspective.....	3-2
3.1.2	Broad approach or research design.....	3-2
3.1.3	Positivist and post-positivist beliefs.....	3-4
3.1.4	Specific research procedures.....	3-5
3.2	RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY.....	3-6
3.3	RESEARCH PARADIGM FOR THIS STUDY.....	3-7
3.4	SAMPLING STRATEGY.....	3-9
3.4.1	Purposive sampling.....	3-9
3.4.2	Teachers interviewed.....	3-10
3.4.3	Lecturers involved in Music Education at South African universities	3-11
3.4.4	Policy makers in Arts Education.....	3-11
3.5	DATA COLLECTION STRATEGIES.....	3-12
3.6	INTERVIEWS.....	3-14
3.6.1	General remarks regarding interviews.....	3-14
3.6.2	Planning the interview structure.....	3-16
3.6.3	Questioning technique during interviews.....	3-18
3.6.4	Computer technology used during interviews.....	3-18

3.6.5	Focus group interviews.....	3-19
3.7	QUESTIONNAIRES.....	3-19
3.8	DATA ANALYSIS.....	3-20
3.9	ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS.....	3-21
3.10	VALIDITY AND RELIABILITY.....	3-22

CHAPTER 4: COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS OF DATA

4.1	INTRODUCTION.....	4-1
4.2	METHOD OF ANALYSIS.....	4-1
4.3	ANALYSIS OF INTERVIEWS.....	4-4
4.3.1	Interviews at schools.....	4-4
4.3.1.1	The A Section of the interview: school environment and resource	4-6
4.3.1.2	The B Section of the interview: profiles of teachers.....	4-12
4.3.1.3	The C Section of the interview: time allocation in Arts and Culture	4-17
4.3.1.4	The D Section of the interview: Implementing Music as part of the Arts and Culture learning area	4-30
4.3.1.4.1	D Section: Question 1 – The Value of Music	4-30
4.3.1.4.2	D Section: Question 2 – Arts and Culture as an integrated learning area in the new curriculum	4-37
4.3.1.4.3	D Section: Question 3 – Outcomes Based Education and group work.....	4-43
4.3.1.4.4	D Section: Question 4 – Music activities included during lessons.....	4-43
4.3.1.4.5	D Section: Open-ended discussion.....	4-48
4.3.2	Interviews with lecturers from universities.....	4-51
4.3.3	Interviews with policy makers.....	4-54

4.4	REVIEW OF ARTS AND CULTURE RESOURCES.....	4-57
4.5	SUMMARY.....	4-59

CHAPTER 5: OBE, THE RNCS AND A WHOLE-BRAIN APPROACH TO STUDENT TRAINING IN MUSIC EDUCATION

5.1	INTRODUCTION.....	5-1
5.2	OUTCOMES BASED EDUCATION.....	5-1
5.3	THE REVISED NATIONAL CURRICULUM STATEMENT.....	5-3
5.4	ACTIVE MUSIC MAKING AND SKILLS DEVELOPMENT IN MUSIC EDUCATION.....	5-9
5.5	MUSIC CONCEPTS IN THE RNCS.....	5-10
5.6	WHOLE-BRAIN LEARNING.....	5-19
5.7	TRAINING STUDENTS IN MUSIC EDUCATION.....	5-22
5.7.1	General aspects of teacher training.....	5-22
5.7.2	Music Education at the Faculty of Education, University of Pretoria..	5-23
5.7.3	Training Music Education specialist students.....	5-27
5.7.4	Training students for the learning area Arts and Culture	5-36
5.7.5	Training generalist students in the Foundation Phase for the implementation of music.....	5-40
5.7.6	Co-operative learning and group work.....	5-43
5.7.7	Guided-Study.....	5-44
5.7.8	Assessment strategy.....	5-45
5.7.9	Micro presentations.....	5-48

5.8 SUMMARY..... 5-60

CHAPTER 6: FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 INTRODUCTION..... 6-1

6.2 FINDINGS OF THE RESEARCH..... 6-2

6.3 ANSWERING THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS..... 6-5

6.3.1 Schools and the music teacher..... 6-5

6.3.2 Policy makers and the curriculum..... 6-7

6.3.3 Universities and teacher training..... 6-9

6.3.4 Resources..... 6-10

6.4 SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH..... 6-12

6.5 CONCLUSION..... 6-13

APPENDICES A-1

SOURCES..... S-1

KEY CONCEPTS IN THE STUDY

There are various theories, concepts, issues and trends related to the research topic. This section clarifies the key concepts of the research topic and the interpretation thereof for application in this study.

Arts and Culture: In South Africa, all the Arts are combined into one learning area entitled 'Arts and Culture'. This includes Music, Visual Arts, Drama and Dance.

Early Childhood Development (ECD): This is the education of young learners from the ages of 0 to 5 before they enter the formal schooling system of primary schools. This phase also includes grade R which is the reception stage of formal schooling in South Africa.

Discrete arts: The learning area Arts and Culture consists of four separate or discrete arts, including Music, Visual Arts, Drama and Dance. The focus in the curriculum, however, is on an integrated and holistic approach.

FET Band: The Further Education and Training Band is focus-based and includes grades 10 to 12 of the secondary school (Pretorius, 1998, p. 36). Learning outcomes for the FET Band have been designed to link with Arts and Culture in the GET (General Education and Training Band). This ensures inclusivity, enabling all learners to choose Music (or any of the other discrete art forms) as subjects in the FET Band (South Africa. Department of Education, 2003b, p. 11).

First Education Specialist (FES): This term is applied to administrators who are responsible for the implementation of a learning area in a school district. They are also called Subject Advisors. These specialists (previously known as

‘inspectors’) visit schools and provide or organise in-service training (INSET) courses for teachers during cluster meetings.

Foundation Phase: This term refers to the first three years of formal compulsory schooling in South African primary schools, including grades 1 to 3.

Generalist teachers: These are teachers of the Foundation and Intermediate phases who are required to teach all learning areas and who do not necessarily have any specialist training in any of the art forms.

GET Band: The General Education and Training Band includes learners from grades R to 9. This band follows an integrated approach, ending with the Senior Phase of compulsory schooling (grades 7 to 9). The Senior Phase links the integrated approach of the Foundation and Intermediate phases with the specialised and focused approach of the FET Band (Pretorius, 1998, p. 36).

INSET: An acronym used internationally referring to in-service training.

Intermediate Phase: This phase indicates grades 4 to 6.

Intersen Phase: This term is used to refer to the higher grades of the primary school, extending over the Intermediate Phase into the Senior Phase. It includes the Intermediate Phase (grades 4 to 6), and ends with the first year of the Senior Phase (grade 7).

KDA: The KDA or Kids Development Academy is a private organisation providing supplementary training in the learning area Life Skills.

Music Education: For the purposes of this thesis, Music Education is defined as being music taught to groups of learners, in comparison to instrumental music tuition where for example piano or orchestral instruments are taught to

individual learners. Furthermore, Music Education includes a variety of activities such as singing, playing percussion instruments, listening to music, moving to music, creating music, reading notation and playing music games.

OBE: Outcomes Based Education is the approach used in the new curriculum of South Africa, implemented since 1997.

RNCS: The Revised National Curriculum Statement of South Africa was published in 2002 and fully implemented in 2008.

Senior Phase: This phase extends over both the primary and secondary schools, including grades 7 up to grade 9.

Ubuntu: A South African term which implies that one cannot exist as a human being in isolation. It refers to the interconnectedness of all humans, to kindness, humanity, compassion, and generosity. It is regarded as fundamental to the way Africans approach life (Wikipedia, 2009).

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

The following acronyms and abbreviations are used in this thesis:

AS	Assessment Standard
ASME	Australian Society for Music Education
CD	Compact Disk
CIRCME	Callaway International Resource Centre for Music Education
DoE	Department of Education, South Africa
DVD	Digital Versatile Disc
ECD	Early Childhood Development
FET	Further Education and Training
FES	First Education Specialist
GDE	Gauteng Department of Education
HOD	Head of Department
HSRC	Human Sciences Research Council
INSET	In-Service Training
ISME	International Society for Music Education
KDA	Kids Development Academy
LO	Learning Outcome
LTSM	Learner Teacher Support Material
MENC	Music Educators National Conference (USA)
MI	Multiple Intelligences
MCM	Music Centred Model
MTV	Music Television
NAAE	National Advocates for Arts Education (Australia)
OBE	Outcomes Based Education
PASMAE	Pan African Society for Musical Arts Education
RNCS	Revised National Curriculum Statement
SAQA	South African Qualifications Authority
WCED	Western Cape Education Department

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1:	Research Paradigms	3-2
Table 3.2:	Post-positivism and positivism	3-4
Table 3.3:	Interpretive and behaviourist procedure	3-5
Table 3.4:	Options, advantages and limitations of interviews	3-14
Table 4.1:	Interviews at schools	4-4
Table 4.2:	Themes and related categories in interviews.....	4-5
Table 4.3:	Total time per week allocated for all learning activities	4-18
Table 4.4:	Official time allocation for Arts and Culture in the Foundation Phase.....	4-20
Table 4.5:	Number of full time music lecturers of the <i>Onderwyskollege Pretoria</i> [Teacher’s Training College, Pretoria] (1977-2001) in comparison to the University of Pretoria (2002-2008).....	4-52
Table 5.1:	Four learning outcomes of the RNCS	5-4
Table 5.2:	LOs, ASs and music concepts for Grade R (Reception).....	5-11
Table 5.3:	LOs, ASs and music concepts for Grade 1	5-11
Table 5.4:	LOs, ASs and music concepts for Grade 2.....	5-12
Table 5.5:	LOs, ASs and music concepts for Grade 3.....	5-12
Table 5.6:	LOs, ASs and music concepts for Grade 4.....	5-13
Table 5.7:	LOs, ASs and music concepts for Grade 5.....	5-14
Table 5.8:	LOs, ASs and music concepts for Grade 6.....	5-15
Table 5.9:	LOs, ASs and music concepts for Grade 7.....	5-16
Table 5.10:	Aspects of music concepts included and omitted in the RNCS	5-17
Table 5.11:	Description of modules offered in Music	5-26
Table 5.12:	Knowledge and skills required from Music Education students	5-29
Table 5.13:	Compiling a Professional Portfolio	5-31
Table 5.14:	Lesson Plan Template	5-32

Table 5.15: Essential differences between choral and instrumental tuition	5-35
Table 5.16: Expectations and preferences of students based on whole- brain learning	5-46
Table 5.17: Skills and assessment methods used for Music students.....	5-50
Table 5.18: Assessment criteria for an instrumental activity	5-53
Table 5.19: Assessment rubric for an instrumental activity.....	5-54
Table 5-20: Assessment criteria for a listening activity	5-55
Table 5.21: Assessment rubric for a listening activity	5-56
Table 5.22: Assessment criteria for a singing activity	5-57
Table 5.23: Assessment rubric for a singing activity	5-58
Table 5.24: Peer Assessment and self assessment form	5-59

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Research focus of this thesis	1-8
Figure 1.2: An “outside in” approach.....	1-9
Figure 1.3: An “inside out” approach.....	1-10
Figure 2.1: Data collection process No 1	2-1
Figure 4.1: Data collection process No 2	4-3
Figure 4.2: Socio-economic status of schools.....	4-6
Figure 4.3: Training of teachers	4-13
Figure 4.4: Specialist or generalist teachers	4-14
Figure 4.5: Art forms presented by teachers.....	4-15
Figure 4.6: Time allocation for all learning programmes in the Foundation Phase.....	4-19
Figure 4.7: Real time allocated to the Arts in the Foundation Phase	4-21
Figure 4.8: Time allocated to each of the art forms in the Foundation Phase	4-23
Figure 4.9: Time allocated for learning areas in the Intermediate and Senior Phases	4-25
Figure 4.10: Real time allocated to each of the four Arts in the Intermediate and Senior Phases.....	4-27
Figure 4.11: Which activities do learners enjoy most?.....	4-47
Figure 4.12: Data collection process No 3	4-57
Figure 5.1: Music Centred Model (MCM)	5-6
Figure 5.1: Whole-Brain Model, adapted from Herrmann	5-20
Figure 6.1: Research focus and findings	6-5
Figure 6.2: Aspects leading to success in Music Education	6-15