TOWARDS AN EQUITABLE SYSTEM
OF MUSICAL EVALUATION IN
SOUTH AFRICAN SERVICE BANDS

by

David John Galloway

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
degree of

Doctor Musicæ

Department of Music
School of Arts
Faculty of Humanities
University of Pretoria

Supervisor: Professor Heinrich van der Mescht
Co-supervisor: Professor Caroline van Niekerk

Pretoria
2006
The purpose
is to elicit what knowledge the candidate has
of the music for his instrument …
Examiners will give the candidate opportunities
to reveal what he knows,
rather than seek to expose
what he does not know.

(ABRSM 1985: 21)
An intrinsic component of South Africa's cultural and colonial heritage resides in the country's deep-rooted tradition of professional musical units known as "service bands": military or concert bands which are an adjunct to the various arms of service of the national defence force and police services.

In the first decade of the twenty-first century, the demographics of these bands are as varied as those of the country itself. Yet there is a common factor shared by all service bands, whatever their sociological composition: the need to perform at what is perceived to be a professional musical level in the public eye (and ear). This requires a relatively consistent level of instrumental competency from band members, and to this end a number of evaluation systems have been implemented – and supplanted – since the late 1940s. The purpose of these evaluations is not only an endeavour to maintain acceptable standards of musical performance, but to conveniently categorise band members into four fundamental levels of instrumental proficiency for purposes of salary and, to a lesser degree, rank.

Without exception, the previous systems of evaluation were deficient in one aspect or another. More specifically, they were found in the last decade to be lacking both in terms of musical consistency and, since 1994, in the ability to equitably accommodate members of the former "homelands" bands, whose previous training and experience were in the majority of cases confined to the rote learning of band parts, with an almost total lack of formal music training.

In a manner that aims to be at once discursive and narrative, this thesis describes the quest for and the realisation of an equitable process of musical evaluation for South African service band members. It documents the actions taken to address the challenges inherent in that quest, the empirical research that provided a tenable answer, and describes the essentially practical stance adopted by the participating musicians and compilers. The processes leading to the new evaluation syllabus are described in some detail, and a number of specific and practical recommendations are proposed for the further amelioration of South African service bands' modus operandi.

KEY WORDS
Music syllabus design, curriculum, evaluation, wind instruments, wind band, concert band, South African service bands, training of bandsmen.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- Firstly, to my professors and promoters, Caroline van Niekerk and Heinrich van der Mescht, for their consistent enthusiasm, stimulus, support, constructive criticism and patience during the period of researching and writing this thesis. They have convinced me of the merits of scholarly writing vis-à-vis the Bohemian journalism in which I previously indulged. U redenering, samewerking en ondersteuning word hoog op prys gestel.

- Secondly, to my good friends and fellow executive musicians Marc Duby and Chats Devroop, with whom I have shared many constructive hours not only on the MEUSSA team and the SGBs, but in metaphysical discussion, as a creative instrumentalist, and as a fellow doctoral student.

- Thirdly, to my friends and colleagues in IDMAC and in the various service bands of South Africa, most specifically Col Kevin T Williams, Lt-Col Neville Stevenson, Lt-Col Roger Buczynski, the late Sergeant-Major Alan Wright, Capts Eddie Clayton and Thys Pienaar, and S/Supt Jan Coetzer.

- Fourthly, to my good wife Marjorie, who has been a paragon of companionship, patience, support, and understanding throughout the five-plus years of this project.

- Fifthly, to a trio of departed souls – Christopher McGregor, John Bannister, and my father, David Murray Galloway – who in their distinctive and highly individual manners have demonstrated to me that even the most Byzantine puzzle can be unravelled.

- Sixthly, to the University of Pretoria for the subsidisation of this doctoral thesis.
TERMINOLOGY, ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ABRSM  The Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music  
ATCL  Associate of Trinity College, London  
CV  Curriculum vitae  
FTCL  Fellow of Trinity College, London  
IDMAC  The Inter-Departmental Music Advisory Committee of the South African Defence Force and South African Police Services  
IMC  International Music Corporation  
ITA  The International Trombone Association  
LRSM  Licentiate of the Royal Schools of Music  
LTCL  Licentiate of Trinity College, London  
MEUSSA  Music Education Standards for Southern Africa  
NQF  National Qualifications Framework  
RMSM  Royal Military School of Music or Royal Marines School of Music  
POLMUSCA  The Police Musicians' Association of South Africa  
QCA  Qualifications and Curriculum Authority (UK)  
SADC  Southern African Development Community  
SAMRO  South African Music Rights Organisation  
SANDF  The South African National Defence Force  
SAPS  The South African Police Services  
SAQA  South African Qualifications Authority  
SGB  Standards Generating Body  
Syllabus 2000  The newly-compiled, reconstructed instrumental syllabus used by IDMAC in the evaluation of bandsmen in South Africa (Appendix A)  
TCL  Trinity College, London  
TEQ  Trade Employment Qualification (UK)  
TUT  Tshwane University of Technology (Pretoria, SA)  
UK  United Kingdom  
UNISA  University of South Africa  
UP  University of Pretoria  
UCT  University of Cape Town  
UPLM  UNISA Performer's Licentiate in Music  
UTLM  UNISA Teacher's Licentiate in Music
LIST OF MUSIC EXAMPLES

1a  Galloway: bass clarinet passage from Variations for Clarinet Choir (2000)  5-28
1b  Mahler: bass clarinet passage from Ninth Symphony (1909)  5-28
2a  Norman Heim: passage from 4th movement of Alto Clarinet Sonata (1990)  5-28
2b  Grainger: passage from Hill Song No. 2 (1902)  5-29
2c  Julie Giroux: cor anglais/alto clarinet figure from Culloden III (2000)  5-29
3a  Persichetti: passages from 1st and 4th movements of Symphony No. 6 for Band (1956)  5-29
3b  Galloway: passage from 3rd movement of Sextet for Winds (1962)  5-30
4a  Galloway: passage from Rondo, 3rd movement of Maverick Sonata for Bass Clarinet (1999)  5-30
4b  Grainger: passage for high reeds, Hill Song No. 2 (1902)  5-30

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Equivalencies between IDMAC levels and TUT qualifications  3-18
Table 2: Distribution of marks in the evaluation of Musician, Senior and Principal Musician  4-17
Table 3: Distribution of marks in the evaluation of Chief Musician  4-18
Table 4: Equivalencies between existing qualifications  4-23
Table 5: Levels of practical musicianship assessed by IDMAC  4-24
Table 6: Practical working ranges of concert band winds  5-8
LIST OF INTERVIEWEES AND CORRESPONDENTS

Bannister, John Lawrence. A close personal friend of the author during the period 1956-75. A professional commercial artist, he was also an accomplished amateur bassoonist, being a leading protagonist of the French style of instrument (Buffet).

Coetzer, Jan. A Senior Superintendent in the SA Police Services, he was Director of Music of the Police College Band in Pretoria during the author's three years of service as Head of Music Training in that unit.

Davidson, Kevin. A full-time lecturer in saxophone, flute, contemporary harmony, composition and arranging at the TUT, and a friend and colleague of the author.

Hinch, John de C. Prof. Hinch, a leading flute and chamber music specialist, is currently the Acting Head of Music at the University of Pretoria. He and the author have been acquainted since 1987, and remain in regular contact via the University.

Juritz, John W F. Dr Juritz was Professor of Physics and lecturer at the University of Cape Town, also a lecturer in bassoon while the author was a student there. He and the author have been good friends since 1956.

Li, Young-Guang. Mr Li was formerly the principal trombonist of the Beijing National Opera Orchestra. He has been a friend of the author since 1993. They worked together for 3 years in the Band of the SA Military Health Services (1995-98) and the Police College, Pretoria Band of the SA Police Services (1999-2001), where Li remains active as principal trombonist.
**Malan, Etienne.** Bass clarinettist of the erstwhile National Symphony Orchestra, he was conductor of the Oliver de Groote Clarinet Choir (in which the author performed on bass and alto clarinets). He and the author made a number of appearances and a recording with their "Double Quartet": four players doubling on clarinets and saxophones (Clarinets: Bb 1 / Bb 2 / Alto / Bass; Saxophones: Soprano / Alto / Tenor / Baritone).

**Malan, Jacobus.** Elder brother of the above, he is an accomplished oboist, teaching part-time at two of the private schools in Pretoria where the author himself teaches.

**Marlow, Ronald.** Commander Ron Marlow was the Director of Music of the SA Naval Band (Simonstown) in the 1970s and ‘80s, and a personal friend of the author since 1956. They shared many experiences as professional trombonists in Cape Town during the period 1957-1975.

**Pienaar, Matthys.** Capt Thys Pienaar is the Musical Director of the SA Air Force Band, an IDMAC member, and has been active as a contributor to the compilation and updating of *Syllabus 2000*.

**Pretorius, Johan.** A professional trumpeter, he studied low brass instruments as second instrument with the author at the University of the Free State. He has been Head of the brass division at the Hugo Lamprechts Music Centre in Parow, Cape Town, since 1990.

**Roberts, David W.** A medical doctor who is also an accomplished amateur trombonist. Dr Roberts and the author have shared views on matters musical, pedagogic and metaphysical since they met in 1979.

**Schorn, Steffen.** Herr Schorn is Professor of composition and arranging at the *Musikhochschule* in Nürnberg, Germany. The author met him on his visit to
South Africa with his group *Triosphere*, which performed at the TUT and other venues. He is an outstanding performer on bass clarinet, baritone saxophone and bass saxophone.

**Seveso, Marcello.** Son of the late Franco Seveso, principal viola of the Cape Town Symphony Orchestra while the author was a member. He is the principal bassoonist in the SA Naval Band, Simonstown, doubling on soprano saxophone when required in the marching band.

**Stevenson, Ronald.** A Scottish composer who lectured in composition at the UCT College of Music for a short period during 1963/4, where the author had the privilege of studying with him.

**Wright, B. Alan.** Sergeant-major Alan Wright was the Bandmaster of the Band of the National Ceremonial Guard (SA National Defence Force) until his untimely demise in February 2004. He became a close friend of the author from 1995 onwards, and was an exceptionally talented multi-instrumentalist.

**Zack, Daniel J.** A Johannesburg businessman, instrument repairer and amateur clarinettist, who holds qualifications in mechanical engineering and is the owner of an instrument hiring facility (The Instrument Library). Since 2003 Mr Zack has imported a number of wind instruments from The Peoples' Republic of China. He and the author have collaborated extensively in the thorough testing and evaluation of these instruments – which were in most cases an "unknown quantity" prior to this. Mr Zack regularly visits the Frankfurt Music Trade Fair, keeping himself informed of the latest innovations in wind instrument manufacture.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

- ABSTRACT ii
- ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS iii
- TERMINOLOGY, ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS iv
- LIST OF MUSIC EXAMPLES v
- LIST OF TABLES v
- LIST OF INTERVIEWEES AND CORRESPONDENTS vi

## CHAPTER ONE:

**BACKGROUND AND AIMS**

1.1 Introduction 1-1
1.2 Background to the study 1-5
1.3 The Shifting Paradigm of the Service Band 1-9
1.4 Preamble to the Research Questions 1-11
1.5 The Primary Research Question and Sub-Questions 1-12
1.6 Principal aims of the study in brief 1-13
1.7 Secondary aims of the study 1-14
1.7.1 To indicate how the lesser-known winds can be more widely utilised in the Concert Band 1-15
1.7.2 To validate the encouragement of band members to explore viable "doubling" instruments 1-15
1.7.3 To encourage IDMAC to award recognised certificates of competency as an adjunct to the evaluation process 1-15
1.7.4 To establish a "complete" instrumental syllabus 1-16
1.7.5 To disseminate information that will afford candidates increased confidence in performing on a second instrument 1-17
1.8 Methodology 1-17
1.9 Division of chapters 1-18
1.10 Addressing the current realities of service band functions 1-21
1.11 The writer's background and qualifications 1-22
1.12 Limitations of the Study 1-24
1.12 Contributions of the Study 1-24

**CHAPTER TWO:**

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

2.1 A brief overview of relevant material accessed 2-1
2.2 The development of the Wind Ensemble 2-3
2.3 Specialist literature on wind instruments 2-9
2.4 Articles from specialist publications 2-16
2.5 Syllabuses of examining bodies in the United Kingdom and South Africa 2-16
2.6 The music libraries of the SAMHS and the SAPS Bands 2-19
2.7 References to wind and percussion syllabuses in other MEUSSA-related and wind band-oriented theses 2-19
2.8 Articles with specific reference to syllabus or curriculum design 2-23
2.9 Music publishers' catalogues consulted during the process of repertoire selection 2-24
2.10 Other sources accessed 2-26
2.11 Summary of literature reviewed 2-27

**CHAPTER THREE:**

**THE SELECTION PROCESS, PERSPECTIVES ON INSTRUMENTS, INHERITED IMBALANCES AND METHODOLOGY**

3.1 Considerations concerning repertoire choice and instrument selection 3-1
3.2 Problems requiring special consideration in the course of compiling *Syllabus 2000* 3-6
3.2.1 Sociological imbalances 3-7
3.2.2 The varied nature and efficacy of in-service training 3-9
3.2.3 The scarcity of non-Western music obtainable in print, and of original repertoire for certain wind instruments 3-10
3.2.4 Necessary omissions: extreme register woodwinds 3-11
3.3 Alternative evaluation structures in the evaluation process 3-13
3.3.1 Trinity College, London 3-14
3.3.2 The University of South Africa Department of Music 3-15
3.3.3 The University of Pretoria Department of Music 3-15
3.3.4 The Tshwane University of Technology School of Music 3-16
3.3.5 The Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music 3-18
3.4 Training the previously disadvantaged 3-18
3.5 The course of action followed in compiling Syllabus 2000 3-22
3.6 The repertoire selection panels 3-28
3.7 Express actions taken by the selection panels following the IDMAC resolution on November 1998 3-29
3.8 Later revision of band extracts 3-32
3.9 Summary of Chapter 3 3-33

CHAPTER FOUR:
EVALUATION PROCEDURES IN IDMAC-REGULATED SERVICE BANDS

4.1 Inconsistencies in previous evaluation systems 4-1
4.2 Factors initiating change 4-3
4.3 Established categories or levels of musical performance in South African service bands 4-7
4.3.1 First category: Learner Musician 4-7
4.3.2 Second category: Musician 4-8
4.3.3 Third category: Senior Musician 4-8
4.3.4 Fourth category: Principal Musician 4-9
4.3.5 Fifth category: Chief Musician 4-9
4.3.6 The category of Group Leader 4-9
4.3.7 Officer categories 4-11
4.3.8 The Entertainment Units 4-12
4.4 Issues intrinsic to Southern Africa 4-13
4.5 Composition of the IDMAC evaluation boards 4-16
4.6 Allocation of marks in the practical examinations 4-17
4.6.1 Mark distribution in the IDMAC evaluations 4-17
4.6.2 The cultivation of a common perspective among examiners 4-19
4.7 Opportunities for the re-examination of candidates 4-23
4.8 The comparison of IDMAC competency levels with those of other relevant examining bodies 4-24
4.9 Current equivalency levels between IDMAC and other examining bodies 4-25
4.10 Sociological factors that impact negatively on the IDMAC evaluation process 4-26
4.11 Reserve Force opportunities 4-28
4.12 Summary of Chapter 4 4-29

CHAPTER FIVE:

AESTHETIC AND PHYSICAL CHARACTERISTICS OF THE INSTRUMENTS OF THE CONCERT BAND REVIEWED

5.1 Rationale of the repertoire choices made in Syllabus 2000: the compiler's perspective 5-1
5.2 The instruments of the Concert Band and their repertoire individually considered 5-5
5.2.1 The Flutes 5-9
5.2.2 The Oboes 5-11
5.2.3 The Clarinets 5-13
5.2.4 The Bassoons 5-17
5.2.5 The Saxophones 5-21
5.2.6 Contrasting tone-qualities within the same range 5-27
5.2.7 The soprano and mezzo-soprano brass: Trumpet/Cornet/Flügelhorn 5-31
5.2.8 The French Horn and Alto horns 5-33
CHAPTER SIX:  
PRACTICAL INSTRUMENTAL COMPETENCY LEVELS  
in South African Service Bands

6.1 An internal approach by IDMAC to unit standards in practical instrumental performance  6-1
6.2 The University of Pretoria's MEUSSA team  6-1
6.3 A pragmatic approach to establishing unit standards for instrumental performance  6-6
6.4 IDMAC performance levels: specific competencies required  6-10
   6.4.1 Woodwind instruments  6-11
   6.4.2 Brass instruments  6-15
   6.4.3 Percussion instruments  6-18
6.5 Relevant learning outcomes and criteria in the United Kingdom comparable to the aims of IDMAC  6-21
6.6 Possible joint examination with South African tertiary music institutes  6-23
6.7 Further refinements of evaluation methods  6-24
6.8 Summary of Chapter 6  6-27
CHAPTER SEVEN:  
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 Introduction 7-1
7.2 Response to the first sub-question 7-2
7.3 Response to the second sub-question 7-3
7.4 Response to the third sub-question 7-3
7.5 Response to the fourth sub-question 7-4
7.6 Response to the main research question 7-5
7.7 Value of the study to bands within and outside South Africa 7-7
7.8 Recommendations arising from this study 7-8
7.8.1 Explicit recommendations regarding marching band instrumentation 7-8
7.8.2 The standardisation of note value terminology 7-10
7.8.3 Future equivalency between examining bodies 7-11
7.9 Suggestions for further research 7-13
7.10 Conclusions and final observations 7-14

LIST OF SOURCES  S-1

APPENDIX A: Syllabus 2000 (complete second edition)

APPENDIX B: A portfolio of compositions by David J Galloway for selected wind instruments of the concert band

LIST OF COMPOSITIONS IN APPENDIX B

1. *Lila* for cor anglais or flügelhorn and piano

2. *Cool Caprice* for Eb alto clarinet, bassoon or baritone saxophone and piano

3. *A Mysterious Event* for tenor or baritone saxophone and piano

4. *The Maverick Sonata* for bass clarinet and piano

5. *The Minstrel Boy Goes Walkabout* for saxophone quartet or quintet

6. *Legend of the South* for bass trombone and piano
LIST OF SOURCES


Davidson, K. 2003. Conversations with the author. Tshwane University of Technology (TUT), Pretoria.


Galloway, D.J. 1999a. *Syllabus 2000* [Appendix A to this thesis]: *Section D (Learner Musician)*. Pretoria: IDMAC.


George, S.P. 1969. *A Descriptive List of Baroque Solo Editions Which may be Practically Integrated into the Solo Literature for Trombone*. MA thesis. The American University, Tulsa, USA.


<http://iimpft.chadwyck.com.cgi>


<http://uk.jstor.org/> 


Twyford, M. 2005. Published circular sent to the music departments of all relevant secondary schools in South Africa. Johannesburg: ABRSM.


