Professional mathematics teacher identity in the context of pre-service training

by

Sonja van Putten

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree PhD
in the Faculty of Education
University of Pretoria

Supervisor: Dr GH Stols
Co-Supervisor: Professor S Howie

September
2011

© University of Pretoria
I am deeply grateful to the Lord and to all the people who have walked this road with me, in particular my family, my supervisors and Professors Douwe Beijaard and Chris Day who took a personal interest in my study and who contributed their invaluable insights.

The financial assistance of the National Research Foundation (NRF) towards this research is hereby acknowledged. Opinions expressed and conclusions arrived at, are those of the author and are not necessarily to be attributed to the NRF.
Abstract

This study investigates the development and nature of Professional Mathematics Teacher Identity (PMTI) in pre-service teachers. It is an explanatory, interpretive case study in which six Fourth Year mathematics education students participated. PMTI is examined in terms of three aspects: Mathematics Specialisation; Teaching-and-Learning Specialisation and Caring, and the actualisation of these aspects is analysed in the context of the teaching practicum classroom. The effect of each student’s personal history, their view of the subject mathematics as well as their experiences during tertiary training and teaching practica is probed. Of these, their experiences as learners in school were found to be the most influential factor, both on their initial career choice and who they are as mathematics teachers.

Main findings of this study are firstly that personal histories and perceptions lead to different PMTI’s and different retentions of what is taught at university; that PMTI is observed in interaction with the learners, and that the students’ self-perceptions are not congruent with those aspects as actualised in the classroom. For example, all six espouse the theory of learner-centred classrooms, but only two of them truly put this theory into practice in their own teaching, thus demonstrating that espoused theory and theory in action are not necessarily the same. It was also found that the mathematics methodology modules completed by these students were unable to shake entrenched beliefs with which the students enrolled at university. Factors determining career choice were key to understanding PMTI, as were the beliefs with which these students began their tertiary training.

Key Words: Professional Mathematics Teacher Identity; Pre-service; Influencers; Actualisation; Teaching Practica.
# Table of Contents

1. Introduction and contextualisation ......................................................................................................... 1
   1.1 Problem Statement ............................................................................................................................ 1
   1.2 Context of the study .......................................................................................................................... 3
   1.3 Rationale for the study ...................................................................................................................... 5
   1.4 Research questions ............................................................................................................................. 7
   1.5 Definition of terms ............................................................................................................................ 9
   1.6 Structure of the thesis ...................................................................................................................... 10
   1.7 Methodological considerations .......................................................................................................... 10

2. Literature review and conceptual framework ...................................................................................... 11
   2.1 Defining “identity” .......................................................................................................................... 11
      2.1.1 Professional identity ...................................................................................................................... 13
      2.1.2 Professional Teacher Identity ....................................................................................................... 15
      2.1.3 Professional Mathematics Teacher Identity ............................................................................... 21
   2.2 The interrelationships between PTI, beliefs and instructional practice ................................... 23
   2.3 The development of PTI ................................................................................................................ 27
   2.4 The nature of PTI ............................................................................................................................ 31
   2.5 The influencers of PMTI ................................................................................................................ 35
      2.5.1 The influence of personal background ...................................................................................... 36
      2.5.2 How tertiary education shapes PMTI ........................................................................................ 39
      2.5.3 The effect of teaching practica on PMTI .................................................................................. 46
      2.5.4 The influence of the view of the subject mathematics and its teaching and learning ........ 48
   Summary of the literature study ............................................................................................................ 54
   2.6 Conceptual Framework .................................................................................................................. 57
      2.6.1 PMTI .............................................................................................................................................. 58
         2.6.1.1. Mathematics specialisation ................................................................................................... 59
         2.6.1.2. Teaching-and-learning specialisation .................................................................................. 60
         2.6.1.3. Caring ...................................................................................................................................... 61
      2.6.2 Influencers ...................................................................................................................................... 61
3. Design of the study ................................................................................................................................. 64
   3.1 Researcher epistemology and ontology ........................................................................................ 65
   3.2 Research design ................................................................................................................................ 68
   3.3 Research methods ............................................................................................................................... 74
      3.3.1 Sample and participants in the study .................................................................................... 74
         3.3.1.1 Selection criteria ..................................................................................................................... 76
      3.3.2 Data collection: strategies and instruments ......................................................................... 81
         3.3.2.1 Questionnaire ......................................................................................................................... 82
         3.3.2.2 Interviews ............................................................................................................................... 83
         3.3.2.3 Classroom observation ......................................................................................................... 88
      3.3.3 Data analysis procedures ........................................................................................................ 89
   3.4 Methodological norms .................................................................................................................... 98
      3.4.1 Trustworthiness of the data ........................................................................................................ 100
         3.4.1.1 Interviews and observations .............................................................................................. 100
         3.4.1.2 The questionnaire ............................................................................................................... 102
      3.4.2 Ethical considerations ................................................................................................................. 103
   4. The six case studies ............................................................................................................................... 105
      4.1 The Fourth Year class ......................................................................................................................... 106
         4.1.1 Perceptions of their PMTI .......................................................................................................... 106
            4.1.1.1 Mathematics Specialist ......................................................................................................... 106
            4.1.1.2 Teaching-and-learning Specialist ........................................................................................ 107
            4.1.1.3 Carer ....................................................................................................................................... 108
         4.1.2 Learning about these aspects of PMTI ..................................................................................... 109
      4.2 Insight into students’ PMTI: six case studies ................................................................................. 110
         4.2.1 Martie ............................................................................................................................................. 113
            4.2.1.1 Influences ............................................................................................................................. 114
            4.2.1.2 Martie’s PMTI ....................................................................................................................... 120
            4.2.1.3 Actualisation of Martie’s PMTI .......................................................................................... 124
            4.2.1.4 Summary ............................................................................................................................... 131
         4.2.2 Ayesha ............................................................................................................................................ 134
            4.2.2.1 Influencers.......................................................................................................................... 134
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.2 Ayesha’s PMTI</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.3 Actualisation of Ayesha’s PMTI</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.4 Summary</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 Thandi</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3.1 Influencers</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3.2 Thandi’s PMTI</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3.3 Actualisation of Thandi’s PMTI</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3.4 Summary</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4 Thabo</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.1 Influencers</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.2 Thabo’s PMTI</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.3 Actualisation of Thabo’s PMTI</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.4 Summary</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5 John</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5.1 Influencers</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5.2 John’s PMTI</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5.3 Actualisation of John’s PMTI</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5.4 Summary</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6 Sipho</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6.1 Influencers</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6.2 Sipho’s PMTI</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6.3 Actualisation of Sipho’s PMTI</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6.4 Summary</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Cross-case Analysis</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Influencers of PMTI</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1 The influence of personal history</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.2 The influence of the tertiary environment</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.3 Influence of the teaching practica</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.4 Influence of their view of mathematics</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 The students’ perception of their PMTI’s</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1 As mathematics specialists</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.2.2 As Teaching-and-learning Specialists
5.2.3 As Carers
5.3 Actualisation of their PMTI’s
   5.3.1 Mathematical expertise
   5.3.2 Teaching and Learning
      5.3.2.1 Evidence of understanding
      5.3.2.2 Teacher/Learner-centeredness
      5.3.2.3 Flexibility
      5.3.2.4 Evidence and purpose of caring
6. Conclusions
   6.1 Who is this student in terms of her PMTI?
      6.1.1 Influencers
      6.1.2 The students’ perceptions of their PMTI
6.2 How are these PMTI’s actualised in the classroom?
6.3 Reflections
      6.3.1 Reflection on the conceptual framework
      6.3.2 Reflection on the methodology
6.4 Conclusions
6.5 Recommendations for policies, practice and research
6.6 Limitations of this study
7. References
   Addendum A: Student questionnaire
   Addendum B: First individual student interview questions
   Addendum C: Second individual student interview questions
   Addendum D: Group interview questions
   Addendum E: Questionnaire to be completed by student’s mentor teacher
   Addendum F: Interview protocol for interview with student’s mentor teacher
   CD: Atlas.ti files
List of Tables

Table 1 Overview of studies on professional teacher identity, adapted from Beijaard et al. (2004) .... 16
Table 2 Overview of definitions of professional teacher identity formulated between 2001 and 2011 ............................................................................................................................................................................. 18
Table 3 Research design .................................................................................................................................. 73
Table 4 Distribution according to gender, race and high school they attended of students in sample group .................................................................................................................................................................. 78
Table 5 Distribution according to gender, race, and high school of students in subsample .......... 80
Table 6 First individual interview: questions related to conceptual framework............................................ 84
Table 7 Second individual interview: questions related to conceptual framework........................................ 86
Table 8 Interview questions for group interview .................................................................................................. 88
Table 9 Inclusion criteria for coding questionnaire data ............................................................................ 91
Table 10 Inclusion criteria for coding initial set of individual student interviews. ................................. 93
Table 11 Inclusion criteria for coding second set of individual student interviews ........................................ 95
Table 12 Inclusion criteria for coding group interview ............................................................................. 97
Table 13 Influencers and PMTI: Number of codes in terms of the conceptual framework........... 111
Table 14 Actualisation of PMTI: number of codes from conceptual framework ................................. 112
Table 15 Summary of career choice motivating influences from personal history .......................... 224
Table 16 Results of the ranking exercise ..................................................................................................... 230
Table 17 Personal history influencers: implicit statements ................................................................. 264
Table 18 Application of Ernest’s (1988) categorisations to these participants ................................. 266

List of Figures

Figure 1. Conceptual framework for PMTI ........................................................ ........................................................ 57
Figure 2. Mathematics Specialist: reasons for prioritisation .................................................. ........................ 107
Figure 3. Teaching-and-learning Specialist: reasons for prioritisation ............................................. 108
Figure 4. Carer: reasons for prioritisation ................................................................................................. 109
Figure 5. Martie’s PMTI according to the Conceptual Framework .......................................................... 132
Figure 6. Ayesha’s PMTI according to the Conceptual Framework ....................................................... 153
Figure 7. Thandi’s PMTI according to the Conceptual Framework ........................................................ 170
Figure 8. Thabo’s PMTI according to the Conceptual Framework ........................................................ 187
Figure 9. John’s PMTI according to the Conceptual Framework ........................................................... 205
Figure 10. Sipho’s PMTI according to the Conceptual Framework ....................................................... 221
Figure 11. Literature linked to findings ...................................................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Figure 12. Visual representations of all six participants’ PMTI’s ........................................................... 276

**List of abbreviations**

BEd – Bachelor of Education, a degree course offered at the University of Pretoria

DoE – Department of Education

FET - Further Education and Training

JPS – Professional Studies: a module that is taught in the BEd programme

OPV – Education: a module that is taught in the BEd programme.

PMTI - Professional Mathematics Teacher Identity

PTI - Professional Teacher Identity

SMTE - Department of Science, Mathematics and Technology Education

UP - University of Pretoria