LAND REFORM POLICIES TO PROMOTE WOMEN’S
SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN SOUTH AFRICA

by

Jemina Kokotsi Moeng

Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree
PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR IN PUBLIC AFFAIRS
in the Faculty of Economic and Management Sciences

School of Public Management and Administration
University of Pretoria
Pretoria

Promoter: Professor G. van Dijk

May 2011
FOREWORD

I, Jemina Kokotsi Moeng herewith dedicate this work entitled “Land reform policies to promote women’s sustainable development in South Africa” to God Almighty, to my husband Willy and to my mother Virginia Phooko. I further would like to declare that all the work entailed herein is my own efforts and achieved through the support of some special people who were willing to assist.

References used within this document have been fully acknowledged except for situations where the writer had first-hand experience or else was part of the scenario in question.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to acknowledge my supervisor and promoter Professor H.G. Van Dijk, for her support and guidance during the period of this study. I thank God Almighty for his love, mercy and wisdom, most important for allowing me the opportunity to meet Prof Van Dijk. Words of Gratitude go to Professor Kuye and his staff who were willing and able to understand my predicament and challenge towards the conclusion of this study.

I cannot forget the most important and kind people in my life and career; my loving husband Willy Moeng and our three children: Nakedi, Sedumedi and Nomakhosi, guys you are wonderful.
To my husband you are one in a million; your support towards my achievements is highly appreciated. To my sister Pasie and her daughter Olwethu thank you for looking after Nomakhosi whilst I was busy doing this research and the report.

To the University of Pretoria management in particular, management in the School of Public Management and Administration, thank you for the excellent opportunity and exposure to me and my other PhD fellows.

To my employer and colleagues thank you for the time permitted and offered to allow me to undertake this work.
ABSTRACT

This study focuses on the role that land reform policies have played and are continuing to play in promoting women’s sustainable development in South Africa. The Land Reform Policy and its related Programmes which aim to provide equitable access to land have gathered strength after 1994 and intend to promote participation and involvement of women, youth and people with disabilities. To this effect the study has investigated the effectiveness of the Land Reform Policy and the Programmes with specific reference to women beneficiaries.

The topic of the thesis refers to the Land Reform Policies as opposed to only one Land Reform Policy (The White Paper on South African Land Policy of 1997) which was introduced with the aim of integrating the then three existing policies which were later renamed programmes; Redistribution, Tenure Reform and Restitution.

The Land Redistribution Programme is based on the *Provision of Certain Land Rights for Settlement Act*, 1993 (Act 126 of 1993) and Section 25 (b) (5) of the *Constitution*, 1996. The programme provides for the description of land for settlement purposes and financial assistance to people acquiring land for agricultural purposes. The Land Tenure Reform Programme is based on the *Upgrading of Land Tenure Rights Act*, 1993 (Act 112 of 1993) and Section 25 (b) (6) of the *Constitution*, 1996. This programme is aimed at availing and providing security of tenure in different ways to its beneficiaries. The Land Restitution Programme has its basis on the *Restitution of Land Rights Act*, 1994 (Act 22 of 1994) and Section 25 (b) (7) of the *Constitution*, 1996. The *Restitution of Land Rights Act, 1994 (Act 22 of 1994)* provides for the restitution of rights in land to those dispossessed of land in terms of racially based policies of the past.
This thesis will therefore make reference to the main Land Reform Policy (WPSALP, 1997) and the Redistribution Programme and its sub-programmes.

The role of government has been quite critical in the establishment and implementation of the Land Reform Policies. This is fundamental especially because land reform is a national mandate. There is proven necessity that each government sphere must play its role and support each other towards achieving this call. There is potential to achieve beyond what has been achieved to date if all spheres of government and the relevant stakeholders put enough effort into this and land reform is placed centrally in all government spheres. Formal agreements are necessary between the three spheres of government on ensuring that land reform is implemented successfully and benefits its targets beneficiaries.

The study revealed that previous policies and legislations purposefully neglected and isolated women as beneficiaries of any developmental initiatives. The study proved that women are still regarded as the main provider of support to their families and yet have little say in land matters. The way in which the inferiority of women was inculcated was evident in the manner in which women were complacent with their lifestyles and ability to still take care of their families irrespective of the lack of resources.

The study mainly discusses the White Paper on South African Land Policy of 1997 in isolation of the other policies even though there is strong mentioning of the Constitution, 1996, the land related legislation which the programmes are based on and the RDP document as some of the policies supporting land reform. The other beneficiary categories as mentioned are equally important but the focus herein is on women.

The study applied the qualitative research method towards addressing the study focus challenges. A qualitative study is defined as an inquiry process of understanding based on distinct methodological traditions of analysis that explore a social or human problem. The ability of women to own and utilise land is the focus of the study particularly in
terms of promoting sustainable development for women. The desired result out of this study is an enquiry on how has the land reform empowered women towards their sustainable development, as well as what has been the process of ensuring that women have equal access to land. The qualitative research types that have been applied are a combination of case studies, literature review and unstructured interviews.

An analysis of the relationship between Public Administration and land reform is undertaken by the study. Within the analysis of the relationship between Public Administration and land reform, focus is on the origin of Public Administration and sustainable development’s perspective to Public Administration. The need to maintain a balance between economic development and environmental protection to ensure generational equity is highlighted as critical for sustained livelihoods. The use of natural resources such as land in an environmentally friendly manner will ensure that future generations can utilise land for their livelihoods as well. The enquiry has revealed that there is a lot of literature on the subject of land reform. Further on, through the unstructured interviews and cases used within the study, women have made a success of the land they received even though support to utilise land was not timeously provided by the relevant Department of Agriculture. The level of education, presence of women on farms, the ability to make decisions and knowledge of business concepts contributed to the women’s success.

The study revealed that previous policies and legislations purposefully neglected and isolated women as beneficiaries of any developmental initiatives. The study has proven that women were and still are regarded as the main support for their families and yet do not have any say in what happens on land matters. The way in which the inferiority of women was inculcated was evident in the manner in which women were complacent and satisfied with their lifestyles and ability to still take care of their families irrespective of the lack of resources.
The study further emphasises the important role of government in the establishment and implementation of the Land Reform Policies. There is proven necessity that each government sphere must play its role and support each other towards achieving this call. There is potential to achieve beyond what has been achieved to date if all spheres of government put enough effort into this and land reform is placed centrally in all government spheres. Cooperation between the three spheres of government and the beneficiaries of land is necessary towards ensuring that land reform is implemented successfully.

The thesis proposes that women should not be regarded as recipients of land only but also as contributors towards the government’s land reform. The lack of support that has been observed in the early years of land transfers to women has only delayed success of women but it did not hamper their continuous production on land. Implementation of these Land Reform Policies has supported women towards their sustainable development and improved livelihoods.

The study has also revealed that some of the international countries still face challenges towards the inclusiveness of women in land related initiatives and can exchange success cases and learning with the South African models. The systems model that has been proposed by the study is based on the contribution of all the affected stakeholders and not government alone. The Land Reform Programmes have made a difference in people’s lives but there is work that is still necessary in terms of ensuring cooperation, coordination and strategies that indicate the extent to which government can support women.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADB</td>
<td>Asian Development Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DLA</td>
<td>Department of Land Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRDLR</td>
<td>Department of Rural Development &amp; Land Reform</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESCAP</td>
<td>Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAO</td>
<td>Food and Agriculture Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEAR</td>
<td>Growth, Equity and Redistribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDPs</td>
<td>Integrated Development Plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFAD</td>
<td>International Fund for Agricultural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LRAD</td>
<td>Land Reform for Agricultural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAMC</td>
<td>National Marketing Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDIs</td>
<td>Previously Disadvantaged Individuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGDS</td>
<td>Provincial Growth and Development Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLAS</td>
<td>Pro-Active Land Acquisition Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RDP</td>
<td>Reconstruction and Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLAG</td>
<td>Settlement for Land Acquisition Grant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TBVC states</td>
<td>Transkei, Bophuthatswana, Venda &amp; Ciskei states</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCAP</td>
<td>United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNCED</td>
<td>United Nations Conference on Environment and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children’s Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNRISD</td>
<td>United Nations Research Institute for Social Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LAND REFORM POLICIES TO PROMOTE WOMEN’S SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN SOUTH AFRICA

CHAPTER 1

BACKGROUND AND OUTLINE TO THE STUDY 1

1.1 Introduction 1

1.2 The basis for land allocation 1

1.3 Motivation for the study 4

1.4 Current Land Reform Programmes in South Africa 13

1.4.1 Land Restitution Programme 14

1.4.2 Land Redistribution Programme 16

1.4.2.1 Settlement for Land Acquisition Grant (SLAG) 16

1.4.2.2 Land Redistribution for Agricultural Development 17

1.4.2.3 Pro-Active Land Acquisition Strategy 19

1.4.3 Land Tenure Reform Programme 20
1.5 Problem Statement 22
1.6 Objectives of the research 29
1.7 Definition of key concepts 31
1.8 Framework for the study 34
1.9 Conclusion 37

CHAPTER 2

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

2.1 Introduction 38
2.2 Public administration research 39
2.3 Qualitative research and its applicability to the study 43
2.4 Qualitative research types 46

2.4.1 Case study 52
2.4.2 Unstructured interviewing 58
2.4.3 Documents as sources of data 60

2.5 Ethical considerations in Public Administration research 62
CHAPTER 3

AN ANALYSIS OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION IN RELATION TO LAND REFORM

3.1 Introduction

3.2 Background

3.3 The origin and development of Public Administration

3.4 The discipline of contemporary Public Administration

3.5 The sustainable development perspective in Public Administration

3.6 Conclusion

CHAPTER 4

ENVIRONMENTAL FACTORS IMPACTING ON WOMEN’S SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

4.1 Introduction

4.2 South African land policy framework

4.2.1 The Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP)
4.2.2  The White Paper on South Africa Land Policy (WPSALP)  

4.2.3  Broad Based Black Economic Empowerment  

4.3  International policy framework supporting women's sustainable development  

4.3.1  Millennium Development Goals for women’s sustainable development  

4.3.2  Gender 21  

4.3.3  Agenda 21  

4.3.4  The World Summit on Sustainable Development  

4.3.5  The importance of International partners for women’s sustainable development  

4.4  Women’s sustainable development and the economic environment  

4.4.1  Production practices  

4.4.2  Market related enterprise  

4.4.3  Market access  

4.5  Women’s sustainable development and the cultural environment  

4.5.1  The role of women in the homestead
4.5.2 Women’s role in the community 133

4.6 Women’s sustainable development and the social environment 134

4.7 Conclusion 136

CHAPTER 5

SELECTED CASES ON WOMEN’S SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT THROUGH LAND REFORM

5.1 Introduction 137

5.2 Criteria used in the identification of cases 139

5.3 Criteria pertinent to the demographics of each case 141

5.3.1 Farm or land details 142

5.3.2 Details of beneficiaries 142

5.3.3 Details of the business 144

5.4 An analysis of the cases 147

5.4.1 Case 1 RESPL1: First LRAD case 148

5.4.2 Case 2 RESPL 2: Second LRAD case 153

5.4.3 Case 3 RESPP 1: First PLAS case 156
5.4.4 Case 4 RESPP 2: Second PLAS case 161

5.4.5 Case 5 RESPS 1: SLAG case 163

5.5 Common characteristics observed on women within the cases 168

5.5.1 Acquisition and awareness 169

5.5.2 Level of education versus productivity 171

5.5.3 Hectares grown for sales 172

5.5.4 Other enterprises owned for income 173

5.6 Women’s inputs towards sustainable production on farms 174

5.6.1 Women’s economically related inputs towards sustainability 175

5.6.1.1 Commitment of the participants 175

5.6.1.2 Knowledge of participants 177

5.6.1.3 The success of the participants 178

5.6.2 Socially related inputs from participants 178

5.6.3 Cultural aspects and women’s inputs 179

5.6.4 Environmental aspects and women’s inputs 180
5.7 The role of government in sustaining women 180

5.8 International Land Reform experiences 183

5.8.1 The South American land experience 183

5.8.2 Land cases in Zimbabwe 185

5.8.3 The Indian experience 187

5.8.4 Other SADC countries’ land experiences 190

5.9 International trends in women’s access to land for sustainable development 194

5.10 Conclusion 197

CHAPTER 6

A SYSTEMS MODEL FOR WOMEN’S SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT THROUGH LAND REFORM

6.1 Introduction 199

6.2 The systems approach defined 200

6.3 The open systems model 201

6.4 The proposed systems model for women’s sustainable development through land reform 205
6.4.1 Political aspects for women’s sustainable development in land reform 208

6.4.2 Economic aspects for women’s sustainable development in land reform 212

6.5.3 Social aspects for women’s sustainable development in land reform 215

6.4.4 Technological aspects for women’s sustainable development in land reform 216

6.7 Conclusion 220

CHAPTER 7

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 Introduction 222

7.2 Specific conclusions regarding land reform for women’s sustainable development 223

7.2.1 Conclusions regarding the research methodology 224
7.2.2 Conclusions regarding Public Administration and land reform 225

7.2.3 Conclusions regarding the environmental factors impacting on women’s sustainable development 226

7.2.4 Conclusions regarding women and sustainable development 227

7.2.5 Conclusions regarding the selected cases 228

7.2.6 Conclusions regarding model 228

7.3 Recommendations regarding policy 229

7.4 Recommendations for the factors that influence productivity 231

7.4.1 Environmental recommendations 232

7.4.2 Recommendations regarding sustainability 233

7.4.3 Recommendations regarding women involved in
LIST OF DIAGRAMS

Diagram 1.1: Number of women that have accessed land 25
Diagram 1.2: Key aspects that contribute to development 27
Diagram 1.3: An expression of people’s needs and solutions 29
Diagram 3.1: The working field of a public official 74
Diagram 3.2: Three Pillars of Sustainability 84
Diagram 3.3: Effects of people on the environment towards development 88
Diagram 5.1: Levels of maize production on RESPL1 case 150
Diagram 5.2: Bar chart indicating level of area used versus total area of the farm in years from acquisition on RESPP 1 case 159
Diagram 5.3: SWOT analysis in the South African cases 167
Diagram 5.4: A series of stages in a crop production field cycle 172
Diagram 6.1: The open system model 203
Diagram 6.2: Process flow in terms of decision making institutions and Contributions from other institutions towards the same goal 204
Diagram 6.5: Outcomes of development 213
Diagram 6.6: Sustainable development as a result of joint government and people efforts within the systems model 219
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1 Distribution of females and males in South Africa 9
Table 2.1: Difference between concepts and variables 45
Table 2.2: Distinctions between quantitative and qualitative research methods 48
Table 4.1: Land transferred and beneficiaries 1994 – 2009 105
Table 4.2: Participants that received off-farm training and able to use the training on the farm 128
Table 5.1: Implementation differences between SLAG and LRAD 140
Table 5.2: Details of case participants that are common and contribute to their production activities on the farm 146
Table 5.3: Case 1 RESPL 1 Land acquisition details versus support 149
Table 5.4: Maize grown on hectares versus prices of maize from 2005 - 2010 on RESPL 1 case 151
Table 5.5: Performance of maize yield planted by RESPL 1 case and Maize prices 152
Table 5.6: Enterprises produced by RESPL 2 group 155
Table 5.7: Enterprises for RESPP 1 case 158
Table 5.8: Enterprises grown on RESPP 2 case 162
Table 5.9: Level of education in relation to age and production 166
Table 5.10: Year of acquisition and awareness table for all 169
Table 5.11: Status of members in the case 174
Table 5.12: Aspects used to determine the commitment of participants as their inputs towards sustainable farming 176

Table 5.13: Land policy framework for some SADC countries 190

Table 6.1: Government based inputs towards the systems model for land reform 206

Table 6.2: Non-Government based inputs towards the systems model for land reform 207

Table 7:1: The land reform roles for all three spheres of government 243