THE EXPERIENCE OF INSIGHT:
AN EXISTENTIAL-PHENOMENOLOGICAL STUDY

by

JOHN FREETH

Submitted in partial fulfilment for the degree

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR
(Psychotherapy)

in the

FACULTY OF HUMANITIES
Department of Psychology
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

SUPERVISOR : Dr A.A. Gildenhuys
CO-SUPERVISOR : Dr R.J. Alapack
DATE : APRIL 2010

© University of Pretoria
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Umuntu ngumuntu ngabantu

A person becomes a person through other persons

In this context I particularly want to acknowledge and thank:

- My parents for their faith and the considerable sacrifices they made for my development, values and education
- My wife for her love, support, understanding and typing of this thesis despite her brain tumour. Surprisingly, in the light of our limited computer skills, it was a remarkably convivial experience of working together
- Our children and their partners for encouragement, shrewd comments and intelligence, not only related to this thesis; my continuing education in terms of reading, music, films and technology is almost entirely dependent on them
- Each one of the research participants for sharing their experiences so honestly and profoundly, and being so generous with their time
- Librarians who have been so helpful and courteous at all times, especially Lourette Visser, Liesl Stieger, Russel Williams and Irma Liberty
- Several people gave invaluable help and came to the rescue when we had computer problems, particularly Trevor Hughes and Ken Dunbar-Curran
- Palmer Development Group, where my wife used to work, for being extraordinarily generous in allowing us to use their equipment
- Joyce Scott and Lindy Mavuso for some typing, Carolyn Butler for some layout advice and Candice Platt for skilful and meticulous help with editing and proof reading
- My supervisors, Assie Gildenhuys and Richard Alapack whose very different skills, temperaments and abilities complemented one another and challenged, guided and enriched me in this strange, but enjoyable, academic process
- My supervisor of my therapeutic work, Rod Anderson, for his support and wisdom.
ABSTRACT

In the last fifteen to twenty years there has been increasing agreement about the phenomenon of insight, but a clear mechanism for insight is not yet understood.

The present study examines nine different approaches to the experience of insight: the holistic approach of gestalt psychology; the existential approach of phenomenological psychology; the puzzle-problem approach of cognitive psychology; the creative approach of genius, dreams, design and invention; the representational approach of models; the case-study approach of great minds; the metaphors-of-mind approach; the intersubjective approach of psychotherapy, and the body-mind-spirit continuum approach of spirituality to insight.

The distinctive value of this qualitative research lies in the opportunity to interview the research participants to get rich descriptions, not only about their experiences of significant insight and the conditions under which they occurred, but also to investigate the results of their insights. Archbishop Emeritus Desmond Tutu’s insight, in prayer before the Soweto Uprising, resulted in him writing a historic letter of warning to the Prime Minister. Debbie Brown had a series of insights in therapy and while listening to music, about responding to her husband’s long-term infidelity; the results were totally unexpected and expressed in a contemporaneous e-mail. Sir Roger Penrose’s experience of insight was subliminal as he crossed a road and needed to be remembered later from a lingering feeling of elation; it resulted in a scientific proof about black holes. Tony Grogan’s insights and associations occurred while scanning the news and were expressed in a socio-political cartoon form for the Cape Times newspaper.

The particular findings include the necessity for awareness and disposition of openness, the importance of confronting and containing the problematic raw material, and the significance of the moments of ‘impact’ and ‘interpreting’. Insight is seen as crucial to the quality of understanding, transcending the usual or dominant way of seeing things, as key to a self-actualising process and as self-authenticating yet tested in the public realm. At each occurrence of insight understanding develops and action is enabled. The relationship between insight and
sight, foresight and humour, is discussed. The qualitative research findings are considered in relation to recent neurobiological research.

**Key Terms:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Insight</th>
<th>Spirituality</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intuition</td>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>Phenomenology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Existential</td>
<td>Gestalt</td>
<td>Creative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affective</td>
<td>Metaphor</td>
<td>Interpreting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive</td>
<td>Body-Mind-Spirit</td>
<td>Intersubjective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioural</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Conventions**

A number of atypical, or potentially unclear uses, meanings and typography of words are used in this thesis because of the distinct political context in South Africa at the time. For example, groups of people are referred to as “Black”, “White”, or “Coloured” and the apartheid regime as “Government”.

In addition, a number of words are hyphenated to indicate a slightly different emphasis to the usual use of the word. For example, psycho-logical, re-member and re-imagine or re-image.

The text of the transcribed interviews in Chapter 5 is in bold type to make a clear distinction between the text and the analysis of, or comments on, the text. Numbers of chapters, as in Chapter 5 above, are also in bold, as are numbers of sections, figures and cartoons. The names of the research participants, in Chapters 6 and 7 are also in bold, to enable greater clarity about who’s experience is under discussion.

Single quotation marks around a word or phrase indicate key terms, whose meaning and significance are defined in the study.
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 1 The Introduction to this Study

1.1 The Motivation for the Study .................................................. 1  
1.2 The Nature and Aim of the Study ........................................... 2  
1.3 An Overview of the Study ..................................................... 3  

## Chapter 2 The Literature Review

2.1 Introduction and Approach ................................................... 9  
2.2 Some Definitions of Insight .................................................. 10  
   2.2.1 Some Definitions of Intuition ......................................... 13  
   2.2.2 Exploring the Relationship between Intuition and Insight ......... 14  
   2.2.3 Some Phenomenological Characteristics of Insight ............... 16  
2.3 The Holistic Approach of Gestalt Psychology to Insight ............... 17  
   2.3.1 Five Inter-Related Views of Insight in Gestalt Psychology .......... 17  
   2.3.2 An Evaluation of the Contribution of the Approach of Gestalt Psychology .................................................. 23  
2.4 The Existential Approach of Phenomenological Psychology to Insight 25  
   2.4.3 Insight as Impact and as Interpreting ................................ 27  
   2.4.4 Insight as Feeling ..................................................... 29  
   2.4.5 Disturbed Disposition: Unconscious Behaviour ...................... 31  
   2.4.6 An Evaluation of the Contribution of the Approach of Existential-Phenomenology .................................................. 32  
2.5 The Puzzle-Problem Approach of Cognitive Psychology to Insight .... 36  
   2.5.1 Three Alternative Perspectives on Insight ............................ 36  
   2.5.2 The Mental Preparation for Insight .................................. 39  
   2.5.3 The Incubation Phase of Insight ..................................... 40  
   2.5.4 The Process in the Moment of Insight ................................ 42  
   2.5.4.1 The Cognitive Components of Insight ............................ 43  

2.11.6.1 An Individual’s Experience 131
2.11.6.2 Dialoguing for Spiritual Insight 132
2.11.6.3 A Theologian’s Experience of Insight through Music 135
2.11.6.4 *Ubuntu*: A Crucial Insight in African Spirituality 137

2.11.7 An Evaluation of the Contribution of the Mind-Body-Spirit Approach of Spirituality 140

2.12 A Summary of the Significance of Each Approach for this Study 144
2.12.1 The Significance of the Holistic Approach of Gestalt Psychology 144
2.12.2 The Significance of the Existential Approach of Phenomenology 144
2.12.3 The Significance of the Puzzle-Problem Approach of Cognitive Psychology 145
2.12.4 The Significance of the Creative Approach of Genius, Dreams, Design and Invention 145
2.12.5 The Significance of the Representational Approach of Models 146
2.12.6 The Significance of the Approach of Great Minds and Dedicated Lives 146
2.12.7 The Significance of the Approach of Metaphors-of-Mind 147
2.12.8 The Significance of the Inter-subjective Approach of Psychotherapy 148
2.12.9 The Significance of the Body-Mind-Spirit Continuum Approach of Spirituality 149

2.13 Conclusion 151

CHAPTER 3 THE METHODOLOGY 153

3.1 Introduction and Orientation 153

3.3 The Choice of the Existential-phenomenological Approach 154

3.4 A Brief Philosophical Background to Existential Phenomenology 156
3.4.1 Existentialism 156
3.4.2 Phenomenology 156
3.4.3 Existential Phenomenology 158

3.5 The Adaptation of Existential Phenomenology for Psychology 158

3.6 The Research Process 159
3.6.1 The Literature Review 159
3.6.2 A Self-reflective Search 160
3.6.3 The Central Research Question for the Interview 160
3.6.4 The Ethical Protocol and Informed Consent Form 162
3.6.5 Selection of Research Participants 163
3.6.6 A Preliminary and Exploratory Study 164

3.7 The Interview 165
3.7.1 Theoretical Clarification of the Interview 165
3.7.2 Characteristics of a Qualitative Interview 167
3.7.3 Methodological Implications of the Interview 168
3.7.4 Practical Matters Relating to the Interview 169

3.8 The Procedure for the Analysis of the Protocols 169
3.8.1 Obtaining a Sense of Each Protocol as a Whole Experience (Step 1) 170
3.8.2 Discerning and Numbering Meaning Units (Step 2) 171
3.8.3 Stating the Meaning That Dominates Each Meaning Unit (Step 3) 171
3.8.4 Interrogating Each Transformed Meaning Unit (Step 4) 172
3.8.5 Synthesising These Interrogated Transformed Meaning Units into a Descriptive Situated Structural Statement (Step 5) 173
3.8.6 Developing a General Structural Statement (Step 6) 174
3.8.7 Elucidating a Comprehensive Structural Statement (Step 7) 175

CHAPTER 4 THE PRELIMINARY STUDY 177
4.1 Introduction 177
4.2 The Purpose of the Preliminary Study 177
4.3 The Research Participant 178
4.4 The Selection of one Part of the Interview for Study 178
4.5 The Context 184
4.6 The Verbal Text 188
4.7 The Situated Structural Statement 190
4.8 The Visual Text 191
CHAPTER 7  THE DISTINCTIVE VALUE OF THIS RESEARCH

7.1 The Value of the Structure of the Experience of Insight 366
7.2 The Value of the Selection of Research Participants 366
7.3 The Value of ‘Disposition of Openness’ for Insight 368
7.4 The Value of ‘Confronting and Containing’ for Insight 369
7.5 The Value of the ‘Moment of Impact’ 370
7.6 The Value of the ‘Moment of Interpreting’ 371
7.7 The Value of Insight as ‘Key to a Self-Actualising Process’ 373
7.8 The Value of the Quality of ‘Understanding’ in Insight 374
7.9 The Value of Insight as ‘Self-Authenticating’ 377
7.10 The Value of the ‘Recurrence’ of Insight 379
7.11 The Value of the ‘Experience’ and the ‘Fruit of Insight’ 380
7.12 The Value of the Experience of Insight in the ‘Unfolding Context’ of Life 384
7.13 The Value of the ‘Relationship Between Sight and Insight’ 385
7.14 The Value of the ‘Relationship Between Foresight and Insight’ 386
7.15 The Value of the ‘Relationship Between Humour and Insight’ 387
7.16 The Value of the ‘Philosophical Understanding of Intuition for Insight’ 390
7.17 The Value of ‘Relating the Qualitative Research to Neurobiological Research’ 391
7.18 The Value of the ‘Researcher’s Own Learning Experience’ 395
7.19 The Limits, Shortcomings and Omissions in this Research Requiring Further Investigation 400
7.20 A Concluding Overview of this Study 401

REFERENCES 402
APPENDIX A 456
   The Preliminary Study Interview: Additional Material

APPENDIX B 471
   Desmond Tutu’s Letter to the Prime Minister: the Result of his Experience of Insight 471

APPENDIX C 477
   Sample Letters to Research Participants

APPENDIX D 480
   Informed Consent Forms