DEVELOPMENT OF
A COMMUNICATION ASSESSMENT PROTOCOL
FOR YOUNG CHILDREN WITH CLEFT LIP AND/OR PALATE
(CL/P) IN MAURITIUS

BY

RACHNA GOPAL

SUBMITTED IN
PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
IN THE
DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNICATION PATHOLOGY
FACULTY OF HUMANITIES
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
PRETORIA

SUPERVISOR: PROF. B. LOUW
CO-SUPERVISOR: PROF. A. KRITZINGER

JULY 2009
Prof. Brenda Louw, for inspiring and guiding me to reach this level academically
Prof. Alta Kritzinger for her guidance, support and patience
Rina Owen for her support with the statistical analysis

Thank you to the Public Sector Research Scheme and Mauritius Research Council for partly funding this research project.

With appreciation for the participation of:
   Staff of Speech Therapy and Audiology Unit, Mauritius
   Children with CL/P and their parents

With grateful acknowledgement of the support of the following individuals:
   Dr. J.C. Mohith, Director of Mauritius Institute of Health
   Dr. N. Gopee, Director-General of Health Services, Ministry of Health & Quality of Life, Mauritius
   Dr. Gunesee, Plastic Surgeon, Victoria Hospital

With special thanks to the following leaders in cleft care in the UK who welcomed me to their centres
   Dr. Debbie Sell at Great Ormond Street Hospital
   Dr. Jane Russell at Birmingham Children’s Hospital

Thank you to my husband, Hurry, who has been a pillar of strength throughout, my children, Kushla, Komal and Rudramun who inspired me to study with focus, and my family in the UK and India, for their support and love. I would like to express special gratitude to Dr. Himender Makker and Dr. S. Seeruttun for their support during difficult periods.

The thesis is dedicated to my father Mr. Yagyavir Sinha who wished for his daughter to achieve the highest standard academically.
ABSTRACT

TITLE   Development of a communication assessment protocol for young children with cleft lip and/or palate (CL/P) in Mauritius

NAME   Rachna Gopal

SUPERVISOR   Prof B Louw

CO-SUPERVISOR   Prof A M Kritzinger

DEPARTMENT   Communication Pathology, University of Pretoria

DEGREE   DPhil

Research guides the parameters for assessment and treatment of individuals with cleft lip and/or palate (CL/P). Most developing countries cannot provide an adequate standard of cleft care, due to limited resources. Speech-language therapists and audiologists in developing countries can contribute to improving cleft care through early communication intervention to minimise/prevent the negative impact of a cleft on a young child’s communication ability and to support the families. However, they require linguistically and contextually relevant assessment instruments for early identification of communication disorders in these children.

The aim of the research was to develop and evaluate a communication assessment protocol for young children with CL/P, for use in Mauritius, a developing country in the Indian Ocean with a multilingual and multicultural population. A further aim was to develop an electronic database of children with CL/P in the public health sector of Mauritius. Eighty-eight children, with CL/P, 0-6 years, were selected by consecutive sampling and their parents acted as participants. Four
speech-language therapists and audiologists from the public health sector of Mauritius participated in the data collection and appraisal of the newly developed assessment protocol.

A mixed methods research design was selected. Based on exploratory research of cleft care in Mauritius and international recommendations for assessment of young children with CL/P, a comprehensive Communication Assessment Protocol was compiled and speech elicitation materials in Creole and French were prepared. Speech-language therapists and audiologists conducted assessments, using non-invasive procedures to assess feeding, hearing, communication skills development, emergent literacy skills, speech production and voice of the participants. Digital video and audio recordings of the elicited speech samples were made and auditory-perceptual procedures for speech analysis and inter-rater comparisons for reliability were employed.

The communication assessment protocol was useful in describing the characteristics of the children with CL/P treated in the National Health System in Mauritius. The speech-language therapists and audiologists together with the parents of the children as partners in assessment were successful in early identification of communication delays/disorders in children with CL/P (73%) and also referrals to other health care professionals. The protocol was evaluated and accepted for application in clinical practice.

The newly developed Communication Assessment Protocol was applied by local speech-language therapists and audiologists with the possibility of implementing this assessment
instrument nationally. This was an important contribution to improve cleft care in Mauritius where interdisciplinary team-based cleft care has not occurred to date.

Key Terms: Cleft lip and/or palate; communication assessment protocol; early communication intervention; developing country; Mauritius; speech-language therapists and audiologists.
Development of a Communication Assessment Protocol for young children with cleft lip and/or palate in Mauritius

Rachna Gopal

Prof B Louw

Prof A Kritzinger

Kommunikasiepatologie, Universiteit van Pretoria

D.Phil

Die parameters vir die assessering en behandeling van individue met gesplete lip en/of verhemelte word deur navorsing gerig. Die meeste ontwikkelende lande kan nie sorg van ’n toereikende standaard aan individue met splete voorsien nie, hoofsaaklik as gevolg van beperkte hulpbronne. Spraak-taalterapeute en oudioloë in ontwikkelende lande kan deur vroeë intervensie bydra tot die verbetering van spleetsorg en sodoende die negatiewe impak van ’n spleet op die lewe van ’n jong kind se kommunikasievermoë minimaliseer/verhoed en ondersteuning bied aan gesinne wat daar deur geraak word. Spraak-taalterapeute en oudioloë benodig egter assessoringsinstrumente vir vroeë identifikasie van kommunikasie-afwykings in hierdie kinders.

Die doel van hierdie navorsing was om ’n omvattende kommunikasie-assesseringsprotokol vir jong kinders met gesplete lip en/of verhemelte saam te stel en te evalueer vir gebruik in Mauritius. ’n Verdere doel was om ’n elektroniese databasis te ontwikkelsom kinders met
gesplete verhemelte aan te teken in die publieke gesondheidsektor van Mauritius. Mauritius is 'n ontwikkelende land met 'n multilinguistiese, multikulturele bevolking in die Indiese oseaan.

Deelnemers: Agt-en-tagtig kinders met gesplete lip en/of verhemelte in die ouderdomsgroep 0-6 jaar is deur opeenvolgende steekproefneming geselekteer en het saam met hulle ouers aan hierdie navorsingsprojek deel geneem. Vier spraak-taaltherapeute en oudioloë van die openbare gesondheidsektor van Mauritius het deel geneem aan die data-insameling en evaluering van die navorsingsprotokol wat ontwikkeld is.

Die navorsingsontwerp het op gemengde metodes berus. Op grond van verkennende navorsing oor spleetsorg in Mauritius en internasionale aanbevelings vir die assessoring van jong kinders met gesplete lip en/of verhemelte, is 'n omvattende assessoringsprotokol saamgestel. Verder is ontlokkingsmateriaal vir spraak in Kreools en Frans saamgestel. Spraak-taaltherapeute en oudioloë het die assessoring van voeding, gehoor, ontwikkeling van kommunikasievermoëns, ontwikkelende literêre vaardighede asook spraak- en stemproduksie van die deelnemers deur middel van nie-indringende assessoringsmetodes uitgevoer. Digitale video- en oudio-opnames is van die ontlokte spraakmonsters gemaak en ouditief-perseptuele prosedures vir spraakanalises en inter-beoordelaarvergelijking is vir die doeleindes van betroubaarheid gebruik.

Die bevindinge het aangetoon dat die kommunikasie-assessoringsprootol nuttig was in die beskrywing van die kenmerkende eienskappe van kinders met gesplete lip en/of verhemelte wat deur die Nasionale Gesondheidstelsel in Mauritius behandeling ontvang. Die spraaktaaltherapeute en oudioloë, tesame met die ouers van die kinders as vennote in die assessoring,
was suksesvol in die vroeë identifisering van vertraagde kommunikasie-ontwikkeling en -afwykings in 73% van kinders met gesplete lip en/of verhemelte. Kinders in hierdie groep wat verwysing na ander kundiges in gesondheidsorg benodig het, kon ook geïdentifiseer word. Die protokol is toepaslik verklaar en aanvaar vir aanwending in kliniese pratyk.

Slot: Die nuut-ontwikkelde 'Commuication Assessment Protocol' is plaaslik toegepas deur spraak-taalterapeute en oudioloë met die moontlikheid dat dit as nasionale asesseringsinstrument gebruik kan word. Hierdie protokol verteenwoordig 'n belangrike bydrae tot die verbetering van spleetsorg in Mauritius waar 'n interdissiplinêre span-gebaseerde benadering tot op hede nog nie bestaan nie.

Sleutelwoorde: Gesplete lip en/of verhemelte; kommunikasie-assesseringsprotokol; vroeë kommunikasie-intervensie; ontwikkelende land; Mauritius; spraak-taalterapeute en oudioloë.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPSOMMING</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND ORIENTATION</td>
<td>1-23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 OVERVIEW OF INTERVENTIONS FOR YOUNG CHILDREN WITH CLEFT LIP AND/OR PALATE IN DEVELOPING AND DEVELOPED COUNTRIES</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 RATIONALE FOR THE STUDY</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 THE RESEARCH APPROACH</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 TERMINOLOGY</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 ORGANISATION OF THE STUDY</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9 CONCLUSION</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10 SUMMARY</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 2: CLEFT CARE PRACTICES FOR YOUNG CHILDREN</td>
<td>24-55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.2 IMPACT OF A CLEFT ON A YOUNG CHILD AND THE FAMILY  26

2.2.1 Impact of a cleft on communication development  27

2.2.2 Impact of a cleft on general development  37

2.2.3 Impact of a cleft on parents and families  41

2.3 RECOMMENDED BEST PRACTICE FOR THE CARE OF YOUNG CHILDREN WITH CLEFT LIP AND/OR PALATE  43

2.3.1 Team approach  44

2.3.2 Early communication intervention and parental participation  46

2.3.3 Treatment outcome measures  48

2.3.4 National registry and databases for individuals with craniofacial anomalies  50

2.4 CONCLUSION  53

2.5 SUMMARY  54

CHAPTER 3: COMMUNICATION ASSESSMENT OF YOUNG CHILDREN WITH CLEFT LIP AND/OR PALATE  56-104

3.1 INTRODUCTION  56

3.2 PURPOSES OF COMMUNICATION ASSESSMENT  58

3.3 RATIONALE FOR A NEW COMMUNICATION ASSESSMENT PROTOCOL IN A DEVELOPING COUNTRY  60
3.4 AREAS OF COMMUNICATION ASSESSMENT AND DEVELOPMENTAL

ASSESSMENT STAGES

3.4.1 Case history

3.4.2 Genetic screening

3.4.3 Feeding

3.4.4 Hearing and listening skills

3.4.5 Communication interactions, pragmatics and speech-language development

3.4.6 Emergent literacy skills

3.4.7 Orofacial structures and oral motor function

3.4.8 Speech production

3.4.9 General developmental screening

3.5 ASSESSMENT PROCEDURES AND INSTRUMENTS FOR YOUNG CHILDREN WITH CLEFT LIP AND / OR PALATE

3.5.1 Procedures for case history taking

3.5.2 Genetic screening

3.5.3 Feeding assessment

3.5.4 Hearing and listening evaluations

3.5.5 Assessment of communication interactions, pragmatics and speech-language development

3.5.6 Emergent literacy skills’ assessment

3.5.7 Orofacial examination

3.5.8 Speech production assessment
3.5.8.1 Perceptual speech assessment procedures 91

3.5.8.2 Instrumental speech assessment procedures 95

3.5.9 Developmental screening 96

3.6 CHALLENGES TO COMMUNICATION ASSESSMENT IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES AND POSSIBLE SOLUTIONS 98

3.7 CONCLUSION 102

3.8 SUMMARY 104

CHAPTER 4: METHODOLOGY 105-187

4.1 INTRODUCTION 105

4.2 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK 106

4.3 RESEARCH AIM AND OBJECTIVES 108

4.4 RESEARCH DESIGN AND THE RESEARCH PHASES 108

4.5 CONTEXT OF THE STUDY 111

4.6 RESEARCH ETHICS 113

4.7 PHASE ONE 115

4.7.1 Objectives of Phase One 115

4.7.2 Phase One participants 116

4.7.2.1 Children with cleft lip and/or palate 117

4.7.2.2 Parents of the children as respondents 123

4.7.2.3 Speech-language therapists and audiologists as participants 126

4.7.3 Phase One materials 128
### 4.7.3.1 Hospital medical records

4.7.3.2 Interview schedule

4.7.4 Phase One data collection procedure

4.7.5 Phase One data recording and analysis

4.7.6 Phase One validity and reliability

#### 4.8 PHASE TWO

4.8.1 Objectives of Phase Two

4.8.2 Phase Two participants

4.8.2.1 Children with cleft lip and/or palate

4.8.2.2 Speech-language therapists and audiologists

4.8.2.3 Additional support staff

4.8.3 Phase Two materials and apparatus

4.8.3.1 Compilation of the Communication Assessment Protocol

4.8.3.2 Compilation of the speech material

4.8.3.3 Questionnaire: Perceptions of the speech-language therapists and audiologists regarding the Communication Assessment Protocol

4.8.4 Phase Two pilot study

4.8.4.1 Objectives of the pilot study

4.8.4.2 Pilot study participants
4.8.4.3 Pilot study materials and apparatus 158

4.8.4.4 Training of the speech-language therapists and audiologists 158

4.8.4.5 Pilot study data collection procedure 161

4.8.4.6 Pilot study results 162

4.8.5 Phase Two data collection procedure 164

4.8.6 Phase Two data analysis 168

4.8.7 Phase Two validity reliability and trustworthiness 170

4.9 PHASE THREE 173

4.9.1 Objectives of Phase Three 173

4.9.2 Phase Three participants 174

4.9.2.1 Speech-language therapists and audiologists 174

4.9.2.2 Additional support staff 174

4.9.3 Phase Three materials and apparatus 175

4.9.3.1 Data collection instrument: Questionnaire 175

4.9.3.2 Focus group topic guide 177

4.9.3.3 Apparatus 179

4.9.4 Phase Three data collection procedure 179

4.9.4.1 Self-administered questionnaire 179

4.9.4.2 Focus group discussion 180

4.9.5 Phase Three data analysis 182
CHAPTER 5: RESULTS AND DISCUSSION  188-246

5.1 INTRODUCTION  188

5.2 BACKGROUND INFORMATION  190
   5.2.1 Background information of the children with CL/P in the sample  190
   5.2.2 Family characteristics and home languages of the children  198
   5.2.3 Parental perceptions of feeding, speech and hearing problems in children with CL/P  203

5.3 CHARACTERISTICS OF THE CHILDREN WITH CLEFT LIP AND/OR PALATE BASED ON THE COMMUNICATION ASSESSMENTS  205
   5.3.1 Feeding  206
   5.3.2 Hearing abilities  208
   5.3.3 Orofacial characteristics  214
   5.3.4 Communication, speech and language characteristics  217
   5.3.5 Emergent literacy skills  225
   5.3.6 Developmental and educational aspects  227
5.4 CLINICAL APPLICABILITY OF THE COMMUNICATION ASSESSMENT PROTOCOL

5.4.1 Identification of communication disorders using the Communication Assessment Protocol 229

5.4.2 Reliability of the auditory perceptual speech analysis 233

5.5 CLINICAL ACCEPTABILITY OF THE COMMUNICATION ASSESSMENT PROTOCOL

5.5.1 Speech-language therapists’ and audiologists’ perceptions as obtained by the questionnaire 236

5.5.2 Speech-language therapists’ and audiologists’ perceptions shared in the focus group discussion 240

5.6 CONCLUSION 245

5.7 SUMMARY 246

CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS 248-279

6.1 INTRODUCTION 248

6.2 SYNOPSIS OF THE PREVIOUS CHAPTERS 251

6.3 CRITICAL REVIEW OF THE STUDY 254

6.3.1 Strengths of the study 254

6.3.2 Limitations of the study 259
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>CONCLUSIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>IMPLICATIONS OF THE RESEARCH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>FINAL COMMENTS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
<td>280-306</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>APPENDICES</th>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX I: PERMISSION FROM THE RESEARCH ETHICS COMMITTEE OF MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND QUALITY OF LIFE, MAURITIUS</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX II: PERMISSION FROM THE RESEARCH PROPOSAL AND ETHICS COMMITTEE, FACULTY OF HUMANITIES, UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX III: LETTER OF INFORMATION AND INFORMED CONSENT FOR PARENTS AS RESPONDENTS</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX IV: LETTER OF INFORMATION AND CONSENT FORM FOR THE SPEECH LANGUAGE THERAPISTS AND AUDIOLOGISTS</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX V: INTERVIEW SCHEDULE FOR RESPONDENTS PHASE ONE OF THE STUDY</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX VI: THE COMMUNICATION ASSESSMENT PROTOCOL</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX VII: SPEECH MATERIAL FOR ELICITING SPEECH</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX VIII: QUESTIONNAIRE FOR SPEECH LANGUAGE THERAPISTS AND AUDIOLOGISTS</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX IX: FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION</td>
<td>361</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 1.1 Outline and description of the sections comprising this study 20-21
TABLE 2.1 Impact of a cleft on communication development 28-30
TABLE 3.1 Areas of communication assessment and developmental assessment stages 64
TABLE 3.2 Feeding assessment procedures 83
TABLE 3.3 Hearing evaluations 85
TABLE 3.4 Assessment procedures and instruments for communication interactions, pragmatics and speech-language development 88
TABLE 3.5 Assessment procedures for emergent literacy skills 89
TABLE 3.6 Procedures for orofacial examinations 90
TABLE 3.7 Examples of perceptual speech assessment instruments and procedures 93
TABLE 3.8 Developmental screening procedures and instruments 97
TABLE 4.1 Sample frame of children with CL/P 120
TABLE 4.2 Characteristics of children with respect to cleft types 122
TABLE 4.3 Description of the speech-language therapists and audiologists 128
TABLE 4.4 Development and description of the interview schedule 131-132
TABLE 4.5 Descriptive statistical analysis of Phase One (description of children with CL/P). 137
TABLE 4.6 Materials compiled for use in Phase Two 142
TABLE 4.7 Apparatus used during Phase Two 143-144
TABLE 4.8 Contents of the Communication Assessment Protocol 146-147
TABLE 4.9 Consonants in Creole

TABLE 4.10 Pilot study to develop the speech material

TABLE 4.11 Perceptions of speech-language therapists and audiologists regarding the Communication Assessment Protocol

TABLE 4.12 Description of children with CL/P selected for the pilot study.

TABLE 4.13 Data analysis of Phase Two

TABLE 4.14 Trustworthiness of Phase Two

TABLE 4.15 Section II: Clinical applicability of the Communication Assessment Protocol

TABLE 4.16 Trustworthiness of Phase Three

TABLE 5.1 Maternal histories of children with CL/P

TABLE 5.2 Surgical histories of the children with CL/P

TABLE 5.3 Feeding methods of children in age Group 1

TABLE 5.4 Hearing risk indicators

TABLE 5.5 Type and degree of hearing loss

TABLE 5.6 Listening behaviours of the children during communication assessments

TABLE 5.7 Orofacial characteristics contributing to speech production errors

TABLE 5.8 Pre-linguistic communicative behaviours of children in age Group 1

TABLE 5.9 Consonant repertoire of children in age Group 1

TABLE 5.10 Speech characteristics as determined by perceptual speech analysis in age Group 2
TABLE 5.11 Identifiable etiological factors of the speech disorders in age Group 2 224
TABLE 5.12 Emergent literacy skills in age Group 1 226
TABLE 5.13 Emergent literacy skills in age Group 2 227
TABLE 5.14 Percentage agreement of perceptual speech analysis: interobserver reliability 234
TABLE 5.15 Perceptions of the speech-language therapists and audiologists regarding the Communication Assessment Protocol 237-238

LIST OF FIGURES
FIGURE 1.1 Continuum of cleft care 6
FIGURE 1.2 Bottom up approach as a strategy to improve cleft care in a developing country 10
FIGURE 2.1 Impact of the cleft 27
FIGURE 2.2 Recommended best practice for the care of young children with cleft lip and/or palate 44
FIGURE 3.1 Purposes of assessment 58
FIGURE 3.2 Challenges to communication assessments in developing countries and possible solutions 99
FIGURE 3.3 Framework for development of a Communication Assessment Protocol for young children with CL/P in a developing country 103
FIGURE 4.1 Research phases to develop the communication assessment protocol 110
FIGURE 4.2 Context of the study: Mauritius 111
FIGURE 4.3 Steps taken to explore and describe the characteristics of the children with CL/P in Mauritius (Phase One) 116
FIGURE 4.4 Age distribution of children as participants 121
FIGURE 4.5  Presence of syndromes in the children as participants  123
FIGURE 4.6  Marital statuses of the biological parents of children with CL/P  125
FIGURE 4.7  Highest educational qualifications of the parents  126
FIGURE 4.8  Steps taken to compile and evaluate the Communication Assessment Protocol  140
FIGURE 4.9  Steps taken to evaluate the acceptability of the Communication Assessment Protocol  173
FIGURE 5.1  Schematic overview of the presentation of the results  189
FIGURE 5.2  Ages of the children when the cleft was first identified  192
FIGURE 5.3  Consultations of the children with CL/P with health care professionals  196
FIGURE 5.4  Number of languages spoken in the children’s homes  201
FIGURE 5.5  The most commonly spoken language in the children’s homes  202
FIGURE 5.6  Feeding, speech and hearing problems among the children: parental reports  203
FIGURE 6.1  Presentation of the main themes discussed in Chapter Six  251
FIGURE 6.2  Sample page from the proposed national register for cleft palate-craniofacial anomalies in Mauritius  268
FIGURE 6.3  A plan for longitudinal communication assessments  270
FIGURE 6.4  Clinical implications of the Communication Assessment Protocol  272