TOWARDS THE ABOLITION OF THE DEATH PENALTY IN AFRICA: A HUMAN RIGHTS PERSPECTIVE

By

LILIAN MANKA CHENWI

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

DOCTOR OF LAWS (LLD)

In the Faculty of Law, University of Pretoria

Under the promotership of Professor Frans Viljoen
And with Professor Michelo Hansungule as co-promoter

May 2005
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this thesis, which I submit for the degree: Doctor of Laws (LLD) at the University of Pretoria, is my own work and has not previously been submitted by me for a degree at another university. Both primary and secondary sources used have been duly acknowledged.

__________________     ________________
Lilian Manka Chenwi       Date
DEDICATION

In memory of my father

Mr Chenwi Henry Shu
ACKNOWLEDGMENT

I could not have achieved the completion of this thesis alone. I therefore acknowledge and thank the following persons for their assistance. First, I express gratitude to Professor Frans Viljoen for promoting this thesis, ensuring that it reached a successful conclusion, and for his contributions towards my intellectual growth in general. I also wish to thank Professor Michelo Hansungule, the co-promoter, for his professional assistance and the useful comments he made throughout my research. I am also grateful to Justice Michael Kirby of the High Court of Australia and Professor Fitzpatrick for their valuable comments on an earlier draft.

Second, I also wish to thank the Centre for Human Rights, University of Pretoria for giving me this opportunity and for all the assistance that I have received from the very beginning. Third, I thank Mr Norman Taku for providing me invaluable moral support.

Fourth, I was able to attend the “First International Conference on the Death Penalty in Commonwealth Africa” and the “Second World Congress Against the Death Penalty” thanks to the financial assistance I received from the British Institute of International and Comparative Law, and Ensemble Contre la Peine de Mort and Penal Reform International respectively. For this, I am indeed grateful. Fifth, I thank Tina Rossouw of the University of Pretoria law library, who did all she could to see that I get the necessary information I needed for this thesis. Last but not the least, my gratitude also goes to my mum, sisters and brother for their moral support. And to all other individuals who helped me in one way or the other – thank you.
SUMMARY

The death penalty has been an issue of debate for decades and it is of great relevance at present. Different reasons have emerged that make recourse to the death penalty appear necessary, such as, that it serves as a deterrent, it meets the need for retribution and that public opinion demands its imposition. Conversely, more convincing arguments have been raised for its abolition, amongst which is the argument that it is a violation of human rights.

Africa is seen as one of the “death penalty regions” in the world, as most African states still retain the death penalty despite the growing international human rights standards and trends towards its abolition. Further, the African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights makes no mention of the death penalty. The death penalty in Africa is therefore an issue that one has to be particularly concerned about. During the 36th Ordinary Session (2004) of the African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights, for the first time, the death penalty was one of the issues discussed by the Commission. Commissioner Chirwa initiated debate about the abolition of the death penalty in Africa, urging the Commission to take a clear position on the subject. In view of this and the international human rights developments and trends on the death penalty, discourses on the abolition of the death penalty in Africa are much needed.

Accordingly, this study examines the death penalty in Africa from a human rights perspective. It seeks to determine why African states retain the death penalty, the ways in which the current operation of the death penalty in African states conflicts with human rights, what causes obstructions to its abolition in Africa, and whether it is appropriate for African states to join the international trend for the abolition of the death penalty.

The current status and operation of the death penalty in Africa is first examined. The historical background to the death penalty in Africa from a traditional and western perspective is also discussed. Subsequently, the main arguments advanced by Africans (including African leaders, writers, priests and government officials) for the retention of the death penalty in Africa are evaluated. The study goes further to examine the death penalty in African states in the light of the right to life, the
prohibition of cruel inhuman and degrading treatment and fair trial rights at both the international and national levels.

After examining the death penalty in African states, the study arrives at the conclusion that it is appropriate for African states to join the international trend for the abolition of the death penalty, considering that the death penalty in Africa conflicts with human rights, the justifications for its retention are fundamentally flawed, and that alternatives to the death penalty in Africa exist. A number of recommendations are then made, which are geared towards the abolition of the death penalty in Africa.

**Key words**: death penalty, capital punishment, abolition, abolition trends, human rights, right to life, Africa, African Charter, African Commission, fair trial, cruel, inhuman and degrading punishment, torture, life imprisonment, punishment, execution, moratorium, criminal justice, alternative sanctions, retribution, deterrence, public opinion, retentionist, *de facto* abolitionist, mitigating factor, extenuating circumstance.
OPSOMMING

Die doodstraf heers vir dekades lank as debatspunt en is op die oomblik van groot belang. Verskeie redes het aan die lig gekom wat die hertoetrede van die doodstraf noodsaaklik laat blyk, byvoorbeeld: dit dien as afskrikmiddel, dit vervul die behoefte aan retribusie en openbare opinie veries die toepassing daarvan. Teenstellig daarmee, bestaan daar meer oortuigende redenasie vir die afskaffing daarvan, waaronder die redenasie dat dit ‘n skending van menseregte is.

Afrika word gesien as een van dié doodstraf gebiede in die wêreld, want meeste Afrika state pas die doodstraf toe ongeag die groeiende internasionale menseregte standarde en tendense vir die afskaffing daarvan. Verder maak die “African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights” geen melding van die doodstraf nie. Daarom is die doodstraf in Afrika ‘n aangeleentheid wat groot hoofbrekens besorg. Gedurende die 36ste Gewone Sessie (2004) van die Afriko Kommissie vir Menseregte, is die doodstraf vir die eerste keer op die Kommissie se agenda as aangeleentheid bespreek. Kommisaris Chirwa het die leiding geneem met die doodstraf afskaffing in Afrika debat, hy het die Kommissie aangemoedig om ‘n beduidende standpunt in te neem. Hierdie in ag geneem en die internasionale menseregte ontwikkelings en tendense van die doodstraf, is bespreking van die afskaffing van die doodstraf in Afrika noodsaaklik.

Gevolglik, ondersoek hierdie studie die doodstraf in Afrika vanaf ‘n menseregte perspektief. Dit probeer bepaal hoekom Afrika state die doodstraf behou, die maniere waarmee die huidige gebruik van die doodstraf bots met menseregte, watter oorsake lei tot obstruksie van teenvoeters vir die afskaffing in Afrika, en om vas te stel of dit betaamlik is vir Afrika om die internasionale tendens vir die afskaffing van die doodstraf te volg.

Die huidige status en gebruik van die doodstraf in Afrika is eers ondersoek. Die historiese agtergrond na die doodstraf in Afrika vanuit ‘n tradisionele en westerse perspektief is ook bespreek. As gevolg daarvan word die hoof argumente wat voorgesit is deur mense uit Afrika (en dit sluit leiers, skrywers, digters en regerings amptenare in) vir die behouding van die doodstraf in Afrika evalueer. Die studie gaan nog verder en ondersoek die doodstraf in Afrika in die lig van die reg tot lewe, die
verhinder van wrede, onmenslike en vernederende behandeling en regverdige verhoor regte op beide internasionale en nasionale vlak.

Na ondersoek na die doodstraf in Afrika, bereik die studie die slotsom dat dit wel betaamlik is vir Afrika om die internasionale tendens te volg vir die afskaffing van die doodstraf, in ag geneem dat die doodstraf in Afrika in konflik is met menseregte, die regverdiging vir die behoud van die praktyk is basies verkeerd, en dat alternatiewe vir die doodstraf in Afrika wel bestaan. ‘n Aantal voorstelle word dan gemaak wat gerig is tot die afskaffing van die doodstraf in Afrika.
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AAR  - Annual Activity Report
AC   - Appeal Cases
ACHPR - African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights
ACHR - American Convention on Human Rights
ADRDM - American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man
AHRLR - African Human Rights Law Reports
AI   - Amnesty International
All ER - All England Reports
ANC - African National Congress
AU   - African Union
BCLR   - Butterworths Constitutional Law Reports
BHRC - Butterworths Human Rights Cases
CA   - Court of Appeal
CAT - UN Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
CC   - Constitutional Court
C & F - Clark & Finelly’s House of Lords Cases
CPT  - European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
CRC    - Convention on the Rights of the Child
DOC - Document
DRC - Democratic Republic of Congo
ECHR - European Court of Human Rights Reports
ECOSOC - Economic and Social Council
ECOWAS - Economic Community of West African States
EHRR - Essex Human Rights Review
ESCOR - Economic and Social Council Official Records
ETS - European Treaties
F 3d  - Federal Reporter, Third Series
F SUPP - Federal Supplement
GA   - General Assembly
GAOR - General Assembly Official Records
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GLR</td>
<td>Ghana Law Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>High Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRC</td>
<td>Human Rights Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAYHR</td>
<td>Inter-American Yearbook on Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICC</td>
<td>International Criminal Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICJ</td>
<td>International Commission of Jurists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICCPR</td>
<td>International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTR</td>
<td>International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTY</td>
<td>International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILM</td>
<td>International Legal Materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JCPC</td>
<td>Judicial Committee of the Privy Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LRC</td>
<td>Law Reports of the Commonwealth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDC</td>
<td>Movement for Democratic Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NWLR</td>
<td>Nigerian Weekly Law Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OAS</td>
<td>Organization of American States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OAU</td>
<td>Organisation of African Unity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PACE</td>
<td>Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARA</td>
<td>Paragraph</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PC</td>
<td>Privy Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RLR</td>
<td>Rhodesian Law Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>South African Law Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Supreme Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCOR</td>
<td>Security Council Records</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCR</td>
<td>Supreme Court Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCSL</td>
<td>Special Court for Sierra Leone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCZ</td>
<td>Supreme Court of Zambia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SJC</td>
<td>Supreme Judicial Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TLR</td>
<td>Tanzanian Law Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRC</td>
<td>Truth and Reconciliation Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDHR</td>
<td>Universal Declaration of Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UHRC</td>
<td>Ugandan Human Rights Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNCHR</td>
<td>United Nations Commission on Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNHRC</td>
<td>United Nations Human Rights Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNTS</td>
<td>United Nations Treaty Series</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>United States of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VOL</td>
<td>Volume</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WL</td>
<td>Westlaw Transcripts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WLR</td>
<td>Weekly Law Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YB</td>
<td>Year Books</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZLR</td>
<td>Zimbabwe Law Reports</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration........................................................................................................... i  
Dedication........................................................................................................... ii  
Acknowledgment............................................................................................... iii  
Summary........................................................................................................... iv  
List of abbreviations.......................................................................................... viii  
Table of contents.............................................................................................. xi  
Table of cases.................................................................................................... xviii  
Table of international instruments.................................................................... xxxi  
Table of national constitutions consulted.......................................................... xxxv  
Table of selected statutes.................................................................................. xxxix  

## Chapter 1: Introduction............................................................................... 1  

1.1 Background to the study........................................................................... 2  
1.2 Nature and magnitude of the problem to be investigated..................... 4  
1.3 Specific objectives and significance of the study.................................... 9  
1.4 Work already done in this field............................................................... 10  
1.5 Methodology adopted in the study.......................................................... 12  
  1.5.1 Literature review............................................................................... 13  
  1.5.2 Comparative method....................................................................... 13  
  1.5.3 *Modus operandi*........................................................................... 14  
1.6 Scope of the study.................................................................................... 16  
1.7 Clarification of terms............................................................................... 18  
  1.7.1 Capital punishment / death penalty............................................... 18  
  1.7.2 Abolitionist / *de facto* abolitionist / retentionist............................ 19  
  1.7.3 Mitigating factor / extenuating circumstance............................... 20  
1.8 Overview of chapters.............................................................................. 20  
1.9 Limitations of the study.......................................................................... 22  
  1.9.1 Generalisation about Africa............................................................ 22  
  1.9.2 Inaccessibility of data and materials.............................................. 23  
  1.9.3 Analysing criminological arguments............................................. 23  
  1.9.4 Taxonomy of African states............................................................. 24
Chapter 2: History, current status and operation of the death penalty in Africa

2.1 Introduction ...........................................................................................................27
2.2 Historical background to the death penalty in Africa.......................................29
2.3 An analysis of the current status and scope of the death penalty....................32
  2.3.1 Status of the death penalty .............................................................................32
  2.3.2 Scope of the death penalty .............................................................................39
    2.3.2.1 Restrictions on the imposition of the death penalty .........................40
    2.3.2.2 Offences for which the death penalty is imposed in Africa ...............50
2.4 Application of the death penalty in African states ...........................................56
  2.4.1 The application of the law in capital trials ...................................................56
    2.4.1.1 Pre-trial phase .......................................................................................56
      a. Investigations ..............................................................................................57
      b. Bail .............................................................................................................59
    2.4.1.2 Trial phase ............................................................................................62
      a. Evidence .....................................................................................................63
      b. Mitigating factors .......................................................................................65
    2.4.1.3 Post-trial phase .....................................................................................67
      a. Constitutional challenges ...........................................................................68
      b. Pardon or commutation ............................................................................71
  2.4.2 The question of the mandatory imposition of the death penalty ......... 74
  2.4.3 Death row ....................................................................................................78
  2.4.4 Execution .....................................................................................................82
  2.4.5 Scale of death sentences and executions between 2000 and 2004.. 86
2.5 Conclusion .........................................................................................................89
Chapter 3: Rebutting the arguments for the retention of the death penalty in Africa

3.1 Introduction

3.2 International law

3.2.1 The death penalty is provided for in international law

3.2.2 Rebuttal of argument

3.3 Traditional African societies

3.3.1 Some African traditional philosophies allow for the imposition of the death penalty

3.3.2 Rebuttal of argument

3.4 Religions in Africa

3.4.1 Major religions in Africa prescribe the death penalty

3.4.1.1 The death penalty is prescribed in the Bible

3.4.1.2 Rebuttal of argument

3.4.1.3 The death penalty is prescribed in the Shari'a

3.4.1.4 Rebuttal of argument

3.5 Public opinion

3.5.1 Public opinion in Africa favours the death penalty

3.5.2 Rebuttal of argument

3.6 Criminological justifications for the imposition of the death penalty in Africa

3.6.1 Retribution

3.6.1.1 The death penalty has to be imposed for the purpose of retribution

3.6.1.2 Rebuttal of argument

3.6.2 Deterrence

3.6.2.1 The death penalty serves as a deterrent to crime

3.6.2.2 Rebuttal of argument

3.6.3 Prevention

3.6.3.1 The death penalty prevents an offender from committing other crimes

3.6.3.2 Rebuttal of argument

3.6.4 Rehabilitation
Chapter 4: The right to life and the death penalty in Africa

4.1 Introduction

4.2 The right to life under the United Nations human rights system
   4.2.1 The Universal Declaration of Human Rights
   4.2.2 The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
   4.2.3 The United Nations Human Rights Committee

4.3 The right to life in the African human rights system
   4.3.1 The African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights
   4.3.2 The African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights

4.4 The right to life in African national constitutions

4.5 Jurisprudence of African national courts
   4.5.1 The Court of Appeal of Botswana
   4.5.2 The Supreme Court of Nigeria
   4.5.3 The High Court and Court of Appeal of Tanzania
   4.5.4 The Constitutional Court of South Africa

4.6 Jurisprudence of other national courts and their relevance to Africa
   4.6.1 The Canadian Supreme Court
   4.6.2 The Hungarian Constitutional Court

4.7 Conclusion

Chapter 5: The prohibition of cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment and the death penalty in Africa

5.1 Introduction

5.2 Prohibition of cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment under the United Nations human rights system
   5.2.1 The Universal Declaration of Human Rights
   5.2.2 The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
5.2.3 The Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment .......................... 220

5.2.4 Other United Nations standards .................................................. 220

5.3 Prohibition of cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment in the African human rights system ........................................ 221

5.3.1 The African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights .............. 221

5.3.2 The African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights ....... 222

5.4 Prohibition of cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment in African national constitutions .............................................. 224

5.5 The death row phenomenon ............................................................. 230

5.5.1 Main elements of the death row phenomenon ......................... 234

5.5.1.1 Prolonged delay ................................................................. 234

5.5.1.2 Conditions on death row .................................................. 236

5.5.2 Jurisprudence the United Nations Human Rights Committee .... 238

5.5.3 Comparative jurisprudence: The European Court of Human Rights ................................................................. 243

5.5.4 Jurisprudence of African national courts ................................. 247

5.5.4.1 The Supreme Court of Zimbabwe ..................................... 247

5.5.4.2 The Constitutional Court of South Africa ......................... 250

5.5.5 Jurisprudence of other national courts and their relevance to Africa .............................................................................. 254

5.5.5.1 The Judicial Committee of the Privy Council .................... 254

5.5.5.2 The Supreme Court of India .............................................. 259

5.5.5.3 The position in the United States of America ................... 261

5.6 Methods of execution as cruel and inhuman .................................. 262

5.6.1 The United Nations Human Rights Committee ..................... 263

5.6.2 The High Court and Court of Appeal of Tanzania ............... 265

5.6.3 The Supreme Court of the United States of America ............. 267

5.7 Conclusion ....................................................................................... 268

Chapter 6: Fair trial rights and their relation to the death penalty in Africa ................................................................................. 272

6.1 Introduction ....................................................................................... 273
6.2 Fair trial rights under the United Nations human rights system .......................... 275
   6.2.1 The Universal Declaration of Human Rights........................................ 275
   6.2.2 The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights .................. 276
   6.2.3 Other United Nations fair trial standards........................................... 279
   6.2.4 The United Nations Human Rights Committee..................................... 280
6.3 Fair trials rights in the African human rights system .................................... 283
   6.3.1 The African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights ......................... 283
   6.3.2 The African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights ................. 284
6.4 Fair trial rights in African national constitutions.......................................... 291
6.5 Respect for fair trial rights in capital trials in Africa .................................. 292
   6.5.1 The right to be tried within reasonable time...................................... 292
   6.5.2 The right to be presumed innocent until proven guilty by a court of law................................................................. 297
   6.5.3 The right of an accused to have adequate time for the preparation of his or her defence....................................... 298
   6.5.4 The right to a fair hearing by an independent and impartial court established by law ......................................................... 300
   6.5.5 The right to be present at the trial..................................................... 303
   6.5.6 The right to legal assistance and proper defence ................................ 305
   6.5.7 The right to appeal to a higher judicial body ..................................... 308
   6.5.8 The right to seek pardon or commutation ......................................... 310
6.6 Consequences of failure to respect fair trial rights in capital trials in Africa .................... 311
   6.6.1 Discriminatory and disproportionate use ........................................... 312
   6.6.2 Arbitrary application of the death penalty ........................................ 314
   6.6.3 Risk of executing the innocent increases ......................................... 317
   6.6.4 Using the death penalty as a tool of political repression .................. 321
6.7 Conclusion.................................................................................................. 324

Chapter 7: Conclusion and recommendations....................................................... 327

7.1 Introduction.................................................................................................. 328
7.2 The abolition movement ............................................................................. 329
7.3 International abolition trends ..................................................................... 330
7.3.1  Abolition trends in the United Nations human rights system…… 331
  7.3.1.1 United Nations human rights instruments……………… 331
  7.3.1.2 United Nations resolutions……………………………….. 332
  7.3.1.3 United Nations sponsored tribunals…………………….. 333
7.3.2  Abolition trends in the African human rights system…………….. 333
  7.3.2.1 African human rights instruments………………………. 334
  7.3.2.2 African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights
          policies……………………………………………. 334
  7.3.2.3 Commutation of death sentences and other recent
          developments………………………………………….. 336
7.3.3  Abolition trends in the European human rights system…………. 339
7.3.4  Abolition trends in the Inter-American human rights system….. 340
7.4  Conclusion………………………………………………………….. 341
7.5  Recommendations………………………………………………….. 345
  7.5.1 Recommendation to the African Union……………………….. 345
  7.5.2 Recommendations to the African Commission on Human
          and Peoples’ Rights…………………………………….. 348
  7.5.3 Recommendations to African governments (comprising the
          executive, judiciary and legislature) ……………………… 349
  7.5.4 Recommendations to civil society (including Non-
          Governmental Organisations)…………………………… 353

Bibliography………………………………………………………………… 355
### TABLE OF CASES

**African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights**

*Amnesty International (on behalf of Orton and Vera Chirwa) v Malawi*, Communications 68/92 and 78/92, 8th AAR: 1994-1995…………..223, 286, 322


Pagnoulle (on behalf of Mazou) v Cameroon, Communication 39/90 (2000) AHRLR 57 (ACHPR 1997)…………………………………………………………………………295

African national courts

Attorney General v Abuki (2001) 1 LRC 63 (SC, Uganda)………………………………228


Chileya v S (unreported) SC 64/90 (1990) (SC, Zimbabwe)………………68, 227, 250

Conjwayo v Minister of Justice and Another 1991(1) ZLR 105 (SC, Zimbabwe)………81

Dhlamini and Others v Carter NO and Another (1968) 1 RLR 136 (Appellate Division of the High Court of Rhodesia (now Zimbabwe))………………………………………247

Dogbe v The Republic (1976) 2 G.L.R. 82 (Ghana)……………………………………61

DPP v Nyanje (unreported) Criminal Appeal No 68/1980 (CA, Tanzania)…………67

Joseph Mutaba Tobo v The People (unreported) SCZ Judgment No. 2 of 1991 (SC, Zambia)………………………………………………………………………………50, 66

Joseph Mwandama v The People (unreported) SCZ Appeal No 127 of 1995 (SC, Zambia)………………………………………………………………………………51, 66

Kaunda and Others v The President of the Republic of South Africa and Others
(2004) Case CCT/23/04 (CC, South Africa) ..............................................6

Lemmy Bwalya Shula v The People (unreported) SCZ Appeal No 122 of 1995 (SC, Zambia) .................................................................51, 66

Letuka v R (1991-96) LLB & LB 346 (HC, Lesotho) .................................66

Mabope v R (1993-94) LLR & LB 154 (CA, Lesotho) ..............................64

Mbushuu and Another v The Republic (1995) 1 LRC 216 (CA, Tanzania)...35, 68-69
127, 188-189, 197, 229-230, 266-267, 316, 318

Mohamed v President of the Republic of South Africa and Others 2001 (7) BCLR 685
(CC, South Africa) ..................................................................................6, 205-206, 270

Mohammed Garuba and Others v Attorney General of Lagos State and Others (Suit
No. ID/559m/90 (HC, Lagos State, Ikeja Judicial Division) .........................48

Mphasa v R (unreported) Criminal Appeal No 5 of 2003 (HC, Lesotho). .........66

Nemi and Others v The State (1994) 1 LRC 376 (SC, Nigeria) .................105

Prah and Others v The Republic (1976) 2 G.L.R. 278 (Ghana) .................61

Re Mlambo (1993) 2 LRC 28 (SC, Zimbabwe) .....................................293

Republic v Arthur (1982-83) G.R.L 249 (Ghana) ..................................61

Republic v Hauli (unreported) Criminal Sessions Case No 3/1984, Dar es Salaam,
(HC, Tanzania) ....................................................................................67

S v Letsolo 1970 (3) SA 476 (A) (Appellate Division, South Africa)…………………66


S v Ntuli (1996) 1 BCLR 141 (CC, South Africa) ………………………………………308

Said s/o Mwamwindi v Republic (1972) HCD No 212 (HC, Tanzania)………………67

Sanderson v A-G [1997] 12 BCLR 1675 (CC, South Africa) ………………………293

Smyth v Uhsewokunze (1998) 4 LRC 120 (SC, Zimbabwe) ………………………293

Susan Kigula and Others v The Attorney General (Decision pending) ………68, 70, 78, 85, 228, 237-238, 269-270

Turon v R (1967) E.A 789 (CA, Kenya)………………………………………………………48

Human Rights Committee


Collins v Jamaica, Communication 240/1987, UN Doc. A/47/40, 1 November 1991…………………………………………………………………………………………..242


Kelly v Jamaica, Communication 253/1987, UN Doc. A/46/40, 8 April 1991…….282


LaVende v Trinidad and Tobago, Communication 554/1993, UN Doc. CCPR/C/61/D/554/1993, 17 November 1997……………………………………………………..242


Pinto v Trinidad and Tobago, Communication 512/1992, UN Doc. CCPR/C/57/D/512/1992, 29 July 1996………………………………………………..282


Judicial Committee of the Privy Council

Abbott v Attorney General of Trinidad and Tobago (1979) 1 WLR 1342………………255

De Freitas v Benny (1976) AC 239; (1975) 3 WLR 388……………………………255

Fisher v Minister of Public Safety and Immigration (1998) 3 WLR 201………………258

Fox v The Queen Appeal No. 66 of 2000 (2002) 2 AC 284…………………………76

Guerra v Baptiste, Privy Council Appeal No. 11 of 1995, judgment delivered on 6 November 1995………………………………………………………………………258


Reckley v The Minister of Public Safety and Immigration and Others (1996) 2 WLR 281………………………………………………………………..258-259

Riley and Others v Attorney General of Jamaica and Another (1982) 2 All ER 469………………………………………………………………………….249, 255, 259

Roodal v The State of Trinidad and Tobago Privy Council Appeal No. 18 of 2003; [2003] UKPC 78…………………………………………………………………..76

The Queen v Hughes Appeal No. 91 of 2001 (2002) 2 AC 259………………76

European Court of Human Rights

Allenet de Ribemont v France (1995) 20 EHRR 557………………………………….274

Collozza and Rubinat v Italy (1985) 7 EHRR 516………………………………….274

Delcort v Belgium (1970) 1 EHRR 355………………………………………………274

Dudgeon v United Kingdom (1982) 4 EHRR 149…………………………………….130

McCann and Others v United Kingdom (1995) Series A, No. 324, Application No. 18984/91………………………………………………………………..102


Yagci and Sargin v Turkey (1995) 20 EHRR 505……………………………………274
European Commission on Human Rights

Greek case, Opinion of 5 November 1969, YB XXII 186…………………...214

Ireland v United Kingdom (1978) 2 EHRR 25…………………………………214

Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Hilaire et al v Trinidad and Tobago, 21 June 2002, Series C, No. 94…………..77

Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

Aitken v Jamaica, Case 12.275, Report No. 58/02, 21 October 2002…………73, 77, 181, 238


Baptiste v Grenada, 13 April 2000, Report No. 38/00…………………………77

Beazley v United States, Case 12.412, Report No. 101/03, 29 December 2003………………………………………………………………………………….47, 181

Case 9647 v United States, resolution No 3/87, 22 September 1987…………242

Case 10.037 v Argentina (1989) IAYHR 52…………………………………293


Downer and Tracey v Jamaica, 13 April 2000, Report No. 41/00………………77

Edwards v The Bahamas, 4 April 2001, Report No. 48/01………………………77
Graham v United States, Case 11.193, Report No. 97/03, 29 December 2003…47, 181, 283

Sewell v Jamaica, Case 12.347, Report No. 76/02, 27 December 2002………77, 181

Thomas v United States, Case 12.240, Report No. 100/03, 29 December 2003……47, 181

Other national courts

Ahmed v State of Maharashtra AIR 1985 SC 231 (SC, of India)…………………..260


Campbell v Wood (1994) 18 F.3d 662 (SC, USA)…………………………..267-268

Canada (Minister of Justice) v Burns and Another (2001) SCC 7; (2001) 5 LRC 19 (SC, Canada)……………………………………………………………………206-209

Coker v Georgia (1977) 433 U.S. 584 (SC, USA)…………………………..55, 314

Decision 23/1990, 24 October 1990 (CC, Hungary)………………..104, 175, 206, 209

District Attorney for the Suffolk District v Watson (1980) 411 NE 2d 1274 (Mass.) (SJC, Massachusetts)……………………………………………………252, 262

Francis Cotalie Mullin v The Administrator, Union Territory of Delhi AIR 1983 SC 746 (SC, India)…………………………………………………………259

Furman v Georgia, (1972) 408 U.S. 238 (SC, USA)…………………..129, 136, 215, 312


Kindler v Canada (Minister of Justice) (1993) 4 LRC 85 (SC, Canada)……….207
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Country</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lockett v Ohio</td>
<td>1978</td>
<td>SC, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisiana v Wilson</td>
<td>1996</td>
<td>SC, Louisiana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madhu Mehta v Union of India</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>SC, India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prosecutor v Klunge</td>
<td>1946</td>
<td>SC, Norway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R v Home Secretary, Ex parte Bugdaycay</td>
<td>1987</td>
<td>SC, England</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R v M’Naghten</td>
<td>1843</td>
<td>SC, England</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reference re Ng Extradition (Canada)</td>
<td>1993</td>
<td>SC, Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roberts v Louisiana</td>
<td>1977</td>
<td>SC, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roper v Simmons, judgment of 1 March 2005</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>SC, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sher Singh and Others v The State of Punjab</td>
<td>1983</td>
<td>SC, India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Dakota v North Carolina</td>
<td>1904</td>
<td>SC, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sumner v Shuman</td>
<td>1987</td>
<td>SC, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The People v Anderson</td>
<td>1972</td>
<td>SC, California</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treveniben v State of Gujarat</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>SC, India</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

xxix
Vatheeswaaran v State of Tamil Nadu AIR 1983 SC 361 (SC, India)……… 259-260

Woodson v North Carolina (1976) 428 U.S. 280 (SC, USA)………………………….75
## TABLE OF INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS

### African human rights system


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9, 18, 23, 27, 37, 43-44, 60, 77, 100-101, 104-105, 173-180, 183, 204, 210-211, 221-223, 283-291, 300-302, 306-309, 335, 345-349, 351</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27, 45, 48-49, 100, 104, 173, 334</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Constitutive Act of the African Union, 2000

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27, 45, 100, 104, 334</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### United Nations human rights system

Charter of the Nuremberg Tribunal, 1951

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Charter of the United Nations, 1945

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 1984

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>216, 220</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>45, 48-49, 98, 104</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Geneva Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War of 12 August 1949 (Third Geneva Convention)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>98, 103</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Geneva Convention relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War of 12 August 1949 (Fourth Geneva Convention)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>98, 103</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966………………………………………………………………………………232-234

Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I), 1977……………………………………………………………………………………………98

Protocol Additional to the Geneva Convention of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts (Protocol II), 1977……………………………………………………………………………………………98


Second Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Aiming at the Abolition of the Death Penalty, 1989…………………..4, 37, 97, 126, 143, 174, 331, 340, 346

Statute of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda, 1994……………5, 40, 333

Statute of the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia, 1993……………………………………………………………………………………..40, 333

Statute of the Special Court for Sierra Leone, 2002……………………………5, 333


Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963……………………………181, 283

Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action, 1993…………………………167

**European human rights system**

Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union, 2000………………339

European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 1987……………………………………..219


**Inter-American human rights system**


American Declaration on the Rights and Duties of Man, 1948…………..167, 176, 181

Protocol to the American Convention on Human Rights to Abolish the Death Penalty, 1990…………………………………………………………..100, 340
Islamic human rights system

Arab Charter on Human Rights, 1994

Universal Islamic Declaration of Human Rights, 1981
## TABLE OF NATIONAL CONSTITUTIONS CONSULTED


Constitutional Law of the Republic of Cape Verde (as amended in 1999)............................................................................................................................................190

Constitutional Proclamation of Libya, 1969 (as amended on 2 March 1977). ...........................................................................................................................................184, 227


Constitution of Botswana, 1966 (as amended in 1999).……..69, 184, 192-193, 226


Constitution of Djibouti, 1992.................................................................291

Constitution of Kenya, 1963 (as amended in 1999).............................184, 266

Constitution of Lesotho, 1993 (as amended in 2001).......................184, 186, 226, 294

Constitution of Mali, 1992........................................................................187, 227

Constitution of Mauritius, 1968 (as amended in 2001)....................184

Constitution of Sierra Leone, 1991 (as amended in 1996)...............184, 226, 291, 294

Constitution of the Arab Republic of Egypt, 1971 (as amended on 22 May 1980). ...........................................................................................................................................183

Constitution of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, 1994……………………………………………………………………..44, 60, 62, 184, 291, 308


Constitution of the Fifth Republic of Niger, 1999……………………………184

Constitution of the Fourth Republic of Togo, 1992…………………………184, 227, 300

Constitution of the Gabonese Republic, 1991 (as amended on 22 April 1997)………183

Constitution of the Kingdom of Morocco, 1962 (as amended on 3 September 1996)…………………………………………………………………………………………………….183, 224, 291, 297

Constitution of the People’s Republic of Mozambique, 1990…………………………190


Constitution of the Republic of Chad, 1996……………………………187, 227

Constitution of the Republic of Côte d’Ivoire, 2000……………………………190

Constitution of the Republic of Guinea-Bissau, 1984 (as amended on 4 December 1996)………………………………………………………………………………………………….90

Constitution of the Republic of Liberia, 1984…………………………….64, 184, 224

Constitution of the Republic of Madagascar, 1992 (as amended in 1998)…..183, 224

Constitution of the Republic of Malawi, 1994 (as amended in 2001)……….62, 184, 186, 227, 305, 308

Constitution of the Republic of Namibia, 1990………………………………….190

Constitution of the Republic of Rwanda, 2003…………………………….....184, 224

Constitution of the Republic of Senegal, 2001……………………………….187, 224

Constitution of the Republic of Seychelles, 1993 (as amended in 1996)……….191


Constitution of the Republic of Uganda, 1995…………………………………60, 72, 184, 227-230, 291, 311


Constitution of the Tunisian Republic, 1959(as amended in 1991)……….184, 224

Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania, 1977 (as amended on 30 June 1995)……………………………………………………………68-69, 127, 184, 188, 196-198, 224, 267, 291
Constitution of Zimbabwe, 1979 (as amended in 2000)..................68, 184, 226-227, 248-250, 300

Fundamental Law of Equatorial Guinea, 1991..........................184-185, 224


Political Constitution of São Tomé and Príncipe, 1975 (as amended on 10 September 1990).................................................................191

The Constitution of Eritrea, 1997.............................................184, 227, 308

The Constitution of Mauritania, 1991..........................................187

Transitional Constitution of the Republic of Burundi, 2001...............187, 227
# TABLE OF SELECTED STATUTES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statute</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children’s Act No. 12 of 1998 of Egypt</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal Code Act 29 of 1960 of Ghana</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal Code Act Cap 77 Laws of the Federation of Nigeria, 1990</td>
<td>27, 47-48, 52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal Law Amendment Act No. 5 of 2003 of Kenya</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal Procedure Act 51 of 1977 of South Africa</td>
<td>199, 201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal Procedure Act Cap 80 Laws of the Federation of Nigeria, 1990</td>
<td>47, 48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal Procedure Act of Sierra Leone, 1965</td>
<td>47-48, 62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal Procedure Act of Sudan, 1991</td>
<td>46, 49, 62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal Procedures Act of Tanzania, 1985</td>
<td>72, 311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act No. 10 of 2002 of Lesotho</td>
<td>61, 64, 66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act No. 67/1938 of Swaziland</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Death Penalty (Restoration) Decree of 1995 of The Gambia</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decree No. 2004/344 of 29 December 2004 of Cameroon</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Law No. 90/61 of 19 December 1990 of Cameroon</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penal Code Act Cap 345 Laws of the Federation of Nigeria, 1990</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Penal Code Act No. 01-079 of 20 August 2001 of Mali...............................52

Penal Code Amendment Ordinance No. 72/16 of 1972 of Cameroon...............51


Penal Code of Kenya, 1985.................................................................46, 52

Penal Code of Sudan, 1991.........................................................48, 49, 51-52, 74, 137

Penal Code of Tanzania, as amended by Act No 3 of 1990............50, 52, 66, 74, 127

Penal Code of the Empire of Ethiopia, 1957.................................46, 48, 52, 66, 79

Penal Code of Zambia, as amended by Act No.3 of 1990.............50, 52

Sexual Offences Act No. 3 of 2003 of Lesotho.................................27

Trial on Indictments Decree of Uganda, 1971.................................47