

Chapter 5

Evaluation of selected sight-singing programmes

5.1 Introduction

The criteria described in Chapters 2 and 3 are used to evaluate a number of sight-singing programmes in this chapter. This evaluation provides an indication of the contents of the programmes and the target group for which each programme is written. By evaluating other authors' work, the author of this thesis was able to compare the selected programmes according to specific criteria. In the evaluation process, he collected valuable ideas of presenting a sight-singing programme. These ideas are incorporated in the suggested sight-singing programme, which is described in Chapter 6.

A great number of sight-singing methods are available for teachers and learners to use. Each of these methods is written with specific readers in mind. In this chapter the author evaluates a variety of methods that were developed during the past 22 years. Sight-singing methods utilising multiple media are included. The methods that were chosen use a variety of approaches to the subject. Printed and audio materials are utilised in various ways to present the contents of the programmes. Each of the selected methods is briefly described here and is then evaluated according to the selected criteria. At the end of the chapter, the methods discussed are compared in a table.

5.2 Criteria for a sight-singing programme

Using specific criteria to evaluate a number of sight-singing programmes enables the author to compare these programmes. Considering the strong and weak points of existing programmes can be useful for the reader who has to choose a suitable sight-singing programme, or who needs to compile his own programme. It is of the utmost importance that a sight-singing programme should comply with the musical as well as the educational requirements for such a programme. It is also necessary that the educational media should be used optimally to convey the learning contents as effectively as possible.

Criteria for an effective sight-singing method are derived from Chapter 2 (sight-singing), Chapter 4 (educational media) and Chapter 6 (instructional design). Although there are many other criteria that can be used to evaluate sight-singing programmes, the author selected only a number of criteria. The criteria used to evaluate selected sight-singing programmes are:

1. Is each concept explained clearly?
2. Are examples of new concepts provided in the form of music notation?
3. Are audio examples of new concepts provided?
4. Is the material sequenced in a logical order?
5. Are sufficient exercises provided to practise each new concept?
6. Do the exercises have a limited vocal range?
7. Are exercises for evaluation provided?
8. Are rhythmic exercises included?
9. Are interval exercises included?
10. Are melodic exercises included?
11. Is the necessary music theory included?
12. Are exercises in both the treble clef and the bass clef included?
13. Are lyrics provided with some of the exercises?
14. Are different modes used?
15. Are learning aids for pitch and rhythm, such as tonic sol-fa or the Chev  system, used?
16. Is this programme suited for self-study?
17. Does this programme require active student participation?

The selected criteria used to evaluate the selected sight-singing programmes are briefly discussed in the following paragraphs. This brief discussion indicates what exactly is evaluated with each criterion.

5.2.1 Is each concept explained clearly?

Clear explanations can enable each learner to work at his own pace, without depending on a teacher to explain every new concept. The explanations can include written text, graphic illustrations, music notation or audio examples and narration.

5.2.2 Are examples of new concepts provided in the form of music notation?

Examples of the notation of every new concept can help the learner to understand the specific concept and to identify the concept when it occurs in music. It can also help learners to associate the symbols of music notation with musical sounds.

Using alternative systems of music notation may provide some variation, making the learning process more interesting. The disadvantage of using these systems is that the learner may get confused, using different symbols for the same concept. The purpose of learning to sing from sight, as described in this thesis, is to read and interpret staff notation by singing the notated music. Therefore, it could be wise to provide examples from the beginning in the form of proper music notation.

Although teaching aids such as the tonic sol-fa and French rhythm names are very useful, the author is convinced that these should only be used in combination with staff notation. A considerable percentage of South African choristers can read tonic sol-fa notation and not staff notation (Botha 2002). This fact limits these choristers' ability to read music and to follow a musical score.

5.2.3 Are audio examples of new concepts provided?

Music notation symbolise sound, therefore it is crucial that the learner can hear the sound while observing the notation. By doing so he can associate the notation with the sound it represents. A teacher can provide audio examples by singing it or playing the examples on a music instrument. As an alternative, the examples can be recorded by role models, and the recording can be used to provide the audio examples. In the author's opinion, it is more realistic to provide a recording for the learner than to accept that a competent teacher will always be available to assist the learner.

5.2.4 Is the material sequenced in a logical order?

The sequence in which material is introduced in a sight-singing programme can determine the outcome of the sight-singing programme. The contents of such a programme should be sequenced in such a way that each new concept builds on the ones that were previously

introduced. New material should be added gradually to give learners the opportunity to master each concept before moving to the next one.

5.2.5 Are sufficient exercises provided to practise each new concept?

A skill, such as sight-singing, can only be mastered when the student gets adequate opportunity to practise the skill. A sufficient number of sight-singing exercises on every new concept can encourage the student to master the concept and to practise using the new concept while applying it to sight-singing.

5.2.6 Do the exercises have a limited vocal range?

Because a sight-singing programme should be useable for singers in different voice-groups, including young singers with limited vocal ranges, it is wise to keep the majority of the sight-singing exercises within a limited range. The author suggests that the range of each exercise should not exceed an octave. More advanced exercises could require that the singer sings up to an interval of a twelfth.

5.2.7 Are exercises for evaluation provided?

The possibility exists that the learner can memorise the sight-singing exercises, creating the illusion that he can sight-sing very well. By providing new exercises for evaluation, the author can encourage students to read the music instead of memorising it.

5.2.8 Are rhythmic exercises included?

Exercises that focus only on rhythmic patterns can help learners to focus on the rhythmic component of sight-singing. This focus can enable them to sing rhythmic patterns accurately from sight.

5.2.9 Are interval exercises included?

Exercises that concentrate only on intervals and melodic patterns can help learners to focus exclusively on the melodic component of sight-singing. Being able to recognise and sing intervals and short melodic patterns without hesitation can help sight-singers to anticipate the music and to sing fluently.

5.2.10 Are melodic exercises included?

Rhythm patterns are combined with intervals in melodic exercises. In these exercises, the learner can revise the rhythmic concepts and the intervals (melodic concepts) that he learned. Since sight-singing is about reading and singing music, melodic exercises are probably the most important element of a sight-singing programme.

5.2.11 Is the necessary music theory included?

Knowledge of some music theory is essential for every person who wants to read music and sing from sight. This knowledge enables the reader to interpret the symbols of music notation and to realise the notation as musical sounds. The author regards the following theoretical concepts as essential knowledge for sight-singing:

- note values,
- time signatures,
- note names in the treble and the bass clef,
- key signatures and how to determine the key and the tonic, and
- the most commonly used musical terms.

5.2.12 Are exercises in both the treble clef and the bass clef included?

Exercises in both the treble and the bass clef can enable sight-singers to read both clefs equally well. Although most singers use only one clef for music that suits their particular vocal ranges, being able to read music in the other clef can help them to understand music better.

5.2.13 Are lyrics provided with some of the exercises?

Vocal music often combines music with lyrics. It is therefore important that sight-singers should be able to read the music and lyrics simultaneously. It is also important that the lyrics for all the exercises should not always be provided in the same language, to ensure that learners become used to singing in different languages.

5.2.14 Are different modes used?

Western music is often written in the major and the minor modes. Exercises in both these modes can help learners to be aware of the mode and to sing with self-confidence in these modes (Chapter 2.5.2).

5.2.15 Are learning aids for pitch and rhythm, such as Tonic sol-fa or the Chev  system, used?

A learning aid for pitch and one for rhythm can help the student to sight-sing accurately and with great confidence. By using systems such as the *tonic sol-fa* and the *Chev  system*, learners associate different degrees of the scale and different rhythmic patterns with specific syllables. This association can help learners to form a mental image of the music before singing it, and to sing it accurately.

5.2.16 Is this programme suited for self-study?

A programme which is suitable for self-study can encourage each learner to progress at his own tempo and to learn new concepts only when he has mastered the previous concepts. A devoted student can use such a programme even without a teacher's guidance.

5.2.17 Does this programme require student participation?

Mastering a skill such as sight-singing requires enough practise. Therefore, active participation is essential for the student who really wants to master sight-singing. In a sight-singing programme, the most important form of student participation is that the student should

sing melodic, rhythmic and interval exercises from sight. Other activities may include listening to explanations and examples, writing theoretical aspects of sight-reading, following a score, and memorising musical terms. The criteria discussed above serve as a measuring instrument to evaluate a number of sight-singing programmes. Different types of programmes are included in this selection to represent the existing literature.

5.3 Selected sight-singing programmes

Seven different sight-singing methods were selected to be evaluated. The author aimed to select a variety of methods in order to be able to compare different approaches to the subject. Two sight-singing methods from the 1980s, four from the 1990s and one published in 2000 are discussed in this chapter. Two of these methods are South African (McLachlan 1983b; Oosthuyzen 1994), while the other selected sight-singing methods are from the USA.

The following sight-singing programmes are briefly described and evaluated:

- J. Boyd (1981): *Teaching choral sight reading*
- P. McLachlan (1983b): *Fun with notes*
- N. Telfer (1992a, 1992b): *Successful sight-singing*
- R. Oosthuyzen (1994): *Training status programme*
- D. Bauguess (1995): *Sight-singing made simple*
- B. Arnold (1999): *A fanatic's guide to ear training and sight-singing*
- H. Austin and E. Howard (2000): *Music reading / Ear training. ABC's of vocal harmony*

The author selected the above-mentioned sight-singing programmes to indicate to the reader how some other authors approached the subject. Evaluating other sight-singing programmes underlined the need for a new sight-singing programme for South Africa and, particularly, the Drakensberg Boys' Choir.

Each of the selected sight-singing programmes is evaluated separately and at the end of the chapter, the evaluations are summarised in Table 5.1.

5.3.1 J. Boyd (1981): *Teaching choral sight reading*

This method is intended for the high school choral conductor who wants to improve his choir's standard of sight-singing. It consists of a workbook with twenty chapters. Each chapter focuses on a different aspect of sight-singing. Four sight-reading sheets of one page each are included in each chapter. Each of these sheets emphasises a different aspect of sight-singing. These aspects include interval drills, rhythm drills and exercises on melodic reading. The author and the publishers grant the owner of this book the right to reproduce the material for his choir, as needed (Boyd 1981:10). This permission is a practical way to provide affordable sight-singing material to choristers.

Boyd suggests six different excursions in this book to make sight-singing more exciting. These excursions include the use of "hand signals and other 'gimmicks' that work" (pp. 40-42), "demonstrating sight reading skills at a concert" (pp. 81-83) and "performing student-written exercises" (pp. 103-105). These excursions provide extra sight-singing practise, approaching it from different angles. It can stimulate learners' interest in sight-singing and motivate them to continue to learn this skill.

Four appendices are included in this book. They are intended to extend the sight-singing programme. The appendices are the following:

- teaching beginners the basics of sight-reading,
- rounds and canons,
- the C clef, and
- contemporary choral sounds.

In Appendix 2, 3 and 4, lyrics are included in English and Latin. This gives learners some experience in singing music with lyrics from sight.

5.3.1.1 *Is each concept explained clearly?*

Being intended for the conductor's use with his choir, this method includes only broad descriptions of each concept that is introduced. It is therefore essential that a knowledgeable person is available to explain the concept to the learners. Every chapter starts with a statement of the concepts that are introduced in that specific chapter. Suggestions on teaching the material are offered to help the conductor.

5.3.1.2 Are examples of new concepts provided in the form of music notation?

Specific examples of concepts are not given, but all the exercises are provided in standard music notation. All the music is printed in hand-written manuscript. Boyd (1981: 10) explains that many singers never learn to sing from hand-written manuscript and states that it is an enrichment for a singer to sing from manuscript. Since this book was written, music notation programs for the computer, such as *Sibelius*, *Mozart* and *Finale*, became readily available for composers, arrangers and enthusiasts. These programs make it possible to produce neatly printed music scores at home. Although some singers most likely will have to sight-sing some hand-written music, the author believes that it is more important for the novice sight-reader to get used to engraved notation, rather than to read hand-written notation.

5.3.1.3 Are audio examples of new concepts provided?

Audio examples are not provided with this handbook. When there is a teacher present to help learners, the teacher can play or sing examples, as necessary.

5.3.1.4 Is the material sequenced in a logical order?

The material is sequenced well, but it requires considerable musical knowledge from the beginning of the programme. As an example, the first exercise is already in 6/4 time, using syncopations, and in Worksheet No. 3, accidentals are used. Using 6/4 time and accidentals implies that the singer should know how to read and sing these musical symbols. This is not a realistic expectation for beginners in sight-singing; each concept will have to be explained before they can be expected to recreate this notated concept as vocal sound.

5.3.1.5 Are sufficient exercises provided to practise each new concept?

Three types of exercises are used in each chapter, namely interval drills, melodic reading and rhythmic drills. These exercises are presented as melodies of four to sixteen bars long. The emphasis in the exercises is on intervals, melody or rhythm. No lyrics are provided with the exercises. They are sufficient to practise melodic sight-singing, but by combining different elements in melodic exercises, learners do not get the opportunity to focus only on rhythm or intervals.

5.3.1.6 Do the exercises have a limited vocal range?

The majority of exercises has a limited vocal range and does not exceed an octave. A few exercises have a range of up to a fourteenth. These exercises will probably be very difficult for young singers or for boys with changing voices.

5.3.1.7 Are exercises for evaluation provided?

No special evaluation exercises are provided. Boyd (1981:16) suggests that the choir sings one worksheet per day and return to the difficult exercises on Friday. This is a sensible suggestion for revision of the week's work, but it does not provide for any evaluation of sight-singing, especially not individual progress.

5.3.1.8 Are rhythmic exercises included?

Four sight-reading sheets of one page each are included in each chapter. Each of these sheets emphasises a different aspect of sight-singing. These aspects include interval drills, rhythm drills and exercises on melodic reading. No separate rhythmic exercises are provided, but some of the melodic exercises focus on rhythmic aspects.

5.3.1.9 Are interval exercises included?

Some of the melodic exercises focus mainly on singing different intervals. By combining intervals with rhythm and melody, the learner is forced to concentrate on all these aspects at the same time. Without practising intervals in specific interval exercises, learners may find it difficult to apply these intervals while singing from sight.

5.3.1.10 Are melodic exercises included?

Worksheets with melodic exercises form part of each chapter. Some of these worksheets focus on melodic reading, while the others focus on rhythms or intervals.

5.3.1.11 Is the necessary music theory included?

Music theory is not included in this sight-singing method. The author assumes that a teacher is available to explain the theoretical aspects of the music.

5.3.1.12 Are exercises in both the treble clef and the bass clef included?

The treble and the bass clefs are both used. The tenor clef is also used in the second half of the book. By reading music in different clefs, the singer learns to observe the clef sign before starting to sing.

5.3.1.13 Are lyrics provided with some of the exercises?

No lyrics are provided with the exercises. Only in the appendices English and Latin lyrics are provided.

5.3.1.14 Are different modes used?

A great variety of modes is included in this programme. The major and minor scales are used as well as the pentatonic scale, the whole-tone scale and jazz scales. Using these different modes can help learners to broaden their perspective of music, and encourage them not to think only in terms of the traditional major or minor modes.

5.3.1.15 Are learning aids for pitch and rhythm, such as Tonic sol-fa or the Chev  system, used?

Boyd (1981:17-18) suggests that the exercises should be sung on different syllables, preferably with unvoiced consonants such as “*ta, pa or fa.*” He explains that when using voiced consonants such as *la*, sight-singers may have problems by allowing different pitches and time values for the *l* and the *ah* sounds. Starting each syllable with an unvoiced consonant enables learners to sound the tone at exactly the correct moment without a preparatory consonant. Such random syllables unfortunately do not help the singer to anticipate pitch or rhythm in the same way as the syllables of the tonic sol-fa or the Chev  system.

5.3.1.16 Is this programme suited for self-study?

Teaching choral sight reading is aimed at the choral conductor who wants to improve his choir’s performance. The exercises are intended to enable the conductor to explain different concepts that are relevant for sight-singing. Musical concepts are not explained in this workbook because this is general knowledge that every choral conductor should know. Unfortunately, this is not the reality in South Africa. Many choral conductors are not formally

trained musicians and do not have the knowledge to explain concepts related to sight-singing (Botha: 2002). This workbook will not provide sufficient information for these conductors or to individuals without musical knowledge.

5.3.1.17 Does this programme require active student participation?

Student participation is required, but only as part of a group. It is possible that many choristers can simply copy others' singing instead of sight-singing themselves.

5.3.1.18 General comments about Teaching choral sight reading

Teaching choral Sight Reading can be a very useful aid to refresh choristers' sight-singing skills. Under the guidance of a well-trained conductor, this programme can produce very good results.

The advantages of *Teaching choral sight reading* are:

- The contents are divided into units that can easily be completed in a short time span. Working with short units can help choral conductors to work on sight-singing during each rehearsal.
- The exercises are presented as worksheets that can easily be reproduced for the choir's use.
- Certain exercises focus more on rhythmic concepts and others on intervals.

The disadvantages of this programme are:

- The explanations of concepts are not sufficient for learners who want to master sight-singing without a teacher's help.
- No lyrics are provided with the exercises.
- No pure rhythmic exercises or interval exercises are provided.
- The music notation of the entire book is hand-written. Many singers will most certainly have to sing from hand-written manuscripts, but such a large repertoire is available in print that the author of the thesis believes that it is to the greater advantage of learners to sing from printed music.

The present author can recommend *Teaching choral sight reading* to choristers and choirs who can already read music and need to improve their skills. Beginners in sight-singing and

conductors who do not possess the essential knowledge and skills for sight-singing will probably not use the book.

5.3.2 P. McLachlan (1983b): *Fun with notes*

Fun with notes is a series of five small books, intended for use in South African schools from Grade 3 to Grade 7. These books were originally published in Afrikaans with the title *Notepret*. They contain graded exercises which can be used for group tuition and individual tuition. The author of *Fun with notes*, Philip McLachlan, probably was South Africa's most famous choral conductor and music educator during the 1970s. He was appointed as professor of music at the University of Stellenbosch and he had an exceptional influence on music education in South Africa.

5.3.2.1 *Is each concept explained clearly?*

The majority of musical concepts needed to sight-sing the examples in this series are not explained in *Fun with notes*. Although the exercises are well graded and new concepts are introduced, very few explanations are provided. To use this series effectively, a teacher should guide the learners.

5.3.2.2 *Are examples of new concepts provided in the form of music notation?*

New concepts are provided in staff notation. They are presented as exercises, usually with explanations of, or suggestions on how to sing the exercises. Rhythmic exercises are written on a single line, while melodic exercises are written on five lines. From Book 1 to the beginning of Book 3, no clef is used. The tonic chord and the tonic are given at the beginning of each melodic exercise in Books 1 to 3 and for some exercises in Books 4 and 5.

5.3.2.3 *Are audio examples of new concepts provided?*

No audio examples are provided.

5.3.2.4 Is the material sequenced in a logical order?

The material is sequenced well, using Kodály's order of introducing music concepts. Each of the five books is intended for use in a specific grade at school.

5.3.2.5 Are sufficient exercises provided to practise each new concept?

Sufficient exercises are provided to practise each new concept.

5.3.2.6 Do the exercises have a limited vocal range?

The exercises have a limited range. Book 1 starts with a range of a third and the range is gradually increased up to a tenth in Book 5.

5.3.2.7 Are exercises for evaluation provided?

McLachlan provides assignments in the series, but he does not include specific exercises to evaluate sight-singing.

5.3.2.8 Are rhythmic exercises included?

Specific rhythmic exercises are included.

5.3.2.9 Are interval exercises included?

Specific interval exercises are not included in this series, although different intervals are presented in the exercises.

5.3.2.10 Are melodic exercises included?

Melodic exercises are included. The majority of them are folk melodies from various Western countries.

5.3.2.11 Is the necessary music theory included?

Basic theoretical concepts are explained. McLachlan provides a number of written exercises and questions on theoretical aspects of the music.

5.3.2.12 Are exercises in both the treble clef and the bass clef included?

Exercises are written only in the treble clef.

5.3.2.13 Are lyrics provided with some of the exercises?

Lyrics in Afrikaans and some in English are provided with many exercises.

5.3.2.14 Are different modes used?

Books 1 to 4 only use the major mode. Books 4 and 5 include exercises in the minor mode.

5.3.2.15 Are learning aids for pitch and rhythm, such as Tonic sol-fa or the Chev  system, used?

The tonic sol-fa as well as the Chev  systems are used.

5.3.2.16 Is this programme suited for self-study?

A teacher who can guide the learners is needed to present *Fun with notes* to the learners. The series is not intended for self-study.

5.3.2.17 Does this programme require active student participation?

Active student participation is required throughout the series.

5.3.2.18 General comments about Fun with notes

Fun with notes can be a very useful teaching aid in the primary school. When a well-trained teacher presents the music class and each child has a copy of the book, *Fun with notes* can be a valuable teaching aid. The material is graded according to children's abilities and the series provide suggestions for teaching the material. McLachlan used folk melodies from South Africa and various European countries, with Afrikaans and some English lyrics. The series is also available in Afrikaans with the title *Notepret*. In the English series, the lyrics are mostly English and some are in Afrikaans.

Using a great percentage of folk songs from Afrikaans and European cultures ignores the reality of South Africa's diverse cultures. The South African education authorities are placing

a great emphasis on awareness of different indigenous cultures at the beginning of the 21st century. Therefore, the contents of this series should be revised to include folk music from all the cultural groups in South Africa.

5.3.3 N. Telfer (1992a, 1992b): *Successful sight-singing*

Successful sight-singing is a series of two workbooks, accompanied by two teacher manuals. This programme is intended for use by choirs and can be equally effective in the classroom. Most of the exercises in this programme are written in two parts which should be sung simultaneously. Singing from sight while someone else is singing a counterpart can encourage students to concentrate on their own reading and singing.

Various items of general advice on singing and music reading are provided throughout both workbooks. The teacher's books include the workbook and it provides additional information as well as teaching suggestions.

5.3.3.1 *Is each concept explained clearly?*

The concepts are explained clearly, although they are very simplified for the sake of beginners. Only the most important information on each concept is provided. This can encourage the learner to concentrate on reading and singing rather than on theoretical work.

5.3.3.2 *Are examples of new concepts provided in the form of music notation?*

Examples are given in regular staff notation. Rhythmic concepts are notated without a music staff.

5.3.3.3 *Are audio examples of new concepts provided?*

No audio examples are provided as part of this programme.

5.3.3.4 *Is the material sequenced in a logical order?*

Both melodic and rhythmic materials are graded in a logical way. Each new section builds on the previous ones, gradually increasing in difficulty.

5.3.3.5 Are sufficient exercises provided to practise each new concept?

The workbook contains sufficient exercises to practise most of the concepts that are introduced.

5.3.3.6 Do the exercises have a limited vocal range?

The exercises rarely exceed the range of an octave. This makes them suitable for the majority of singers.

5.3.3.7 Are exercises for evaluation provided?

No special exercises for evaluation are provided.

5.3.3.8 Are rhythmic exercises included?

Short rhythmic exercises are included to illustrate new concepts and to give learners an opportunity to practise it.

5.3.3.9 Are interval exercises included?

Short interval exercises are included, followed by melodic exercises in which the intervals are used.

5.3.3.10 Are melodic exercises included?

A great number of melodic exercises are offered in both workbooks.

5.3.3.11 Is the necessary music theory included?

Limited music theory is included in the workbook. The theoretical aspects of music reading are mentioned between the sight-singing exercises. It may be possible that learners will disregard these short explanations. In the process, learners may not acquire all the essential information.

5.3.3.12 Are exercises in both the treble clef and the bass clef included?

In Book 1, only the treble clef is used. In Book 2, the bass clef is used in the lower part(s) of two or three part music.

5.3.3.13 Are lyrics provided with some of the exercises?

All the melodic exercises are provided with English lyrics. This encourages the learner to read the lyrics and the music simultaneously.

5.3.3.14 Are different modes used?

The majority of the exercises are in the major mode. A few exercises are in the natural minor, but the concept of minor keys is not explained.

5.3.3.15 Are learning aids for pitch and rhythm, such as Tonic sol-fa or the Chev  system, used?

Telfer refers to the tonic sol-fa syllables, but the exercises are to be sung on the lyrics and not on the sol-fa syllables. The Chev  system is not used.

5.3.3.16 Is this programme suited for self-study?

Because the exercises are written in two parts, they are intended to be used in group tuition. The explanations are often not sufficient to learn the contents without the aid of a teacher.

5.3.3.17 Does this programme require active student participation?

From the first exercise the learners are expected to participate actively by reading and singing. Active participation from the learners is required throughout both books.

5.3.3.18 General comments about Successful sight-singing

Successful sight-singing can be a very effective sight-singing programme to teach sight-singing to a choir or to refresh their sight-singing skills. Because this programme consists of short, challenging units, it is realistic for incorporation into a choir's rehearsal time. By

presenting exercises as two-part music, this programme invites learners to think for themselves and it forces each participant to read.

The disadvantage of this programme is that a teacher is necessary to explain and demonstrate the different musical concepts. With the exercises written in two parts, it is often difficult for an individual to learn sight-singing from these books. The author of this thesis can recommend *Successful sight-singing* to any choir or group who wants to learn sight-singing in a group or who wants to refresh their sight-singing skills.

5.3.4 R. Oosthuizen (1994): *Training status programme*

The training status programme was compiled specifically to teach sight-singing to the new choristers of the Drakensberg Boys' Choir. The title refers to the *training* course that new choristers have to complete before obtaining *choir status*. New boys at the Drakensberg Boys' Choir school have *training status*, which means that they are undergoing training to become members of the choir. The training course consists of a sight-singing programme and some information on choir-related subjects, such as tone, intonation, and touring. After he has completed the training course, the new boy is expected to learn six songs from the choir's repertoire and to sing some of them in an audition to the whole choir. When the new boy is accepted into the choir he has *concert status*, which allows him to perform as part of the Drakensberg Boys' Choir. The programme consists of a workbook with explanations, theoretical exercises and sight-singing exercises, as well as a separate testbook. The contents are divided in ten tests, namely:

- the reading of rhythm
- time signatures
- time patterns
- rhythm patterns
- the stave
- key signatures
- keyboard sense
- intervals
- melodic sight-singing and
- musical terms.

The testbook contains written tests as well as rhythmic and melodic sight-singing tests. The sight-singing tests consist of a number of exercises selected from those in the workbook. After completing all the exercises of a section in the workbook, the learner can sing some exercises from the testbook.

5.3.4.1 Is each concept explained clearly?

Beat and metre are thoroughly explained. Learners are expected to do appropriate conducting gestures while singing the exercises. Durations of notes used in this method are semibreves, minims, crotchets, quavers, semiquavers and demi-semiquavers as well as dotted notes. Melodic concepts are not explained sufficiently. Different keys are introduced by explaining the construction of major and minor scales. In the section on intervals, the tonic sol-fa syllables for major and minor is given and students are required to learn eleven exercises in the major mode and four in the minor mode.

Apart from beat and metre, most of the explanations in this sight-singing book are not sufficient to ensure that learners will understand the various concepts. Using this book, the author had to explain every new concept to each learner when he reached a new section in the programme.

5.3.4.2 Are examples of new concepts provided in the form of music notation?

Rhythmic examples are provided without lines, i.e. not on a staff, while melodic exercises are provided in staff notation. Intervals, however, are introduced as tonic sol-fa syllables and the construction of scales is explained on drawings of the keyboard.

5.3.4.3 Are audio examples provided as part of this programme?

No form of audio examples is provided. The teacher or the learner can play the notated examples on the piano as needed.

5.3.4.4 Is the material sequenced in a logical order?

The material is sequenced in a logical order. Beat and metre is introduced first, followed by a chapter on note values. In Chapter 4, a number (111) of short rhythmic exercises is provided for the learner to read from sight. Melodic concepts are introduced after the rhythmic

for the learner to read from sight. Melodic concepts are introduced after the rhythmic concepts. Chapters on key signatures, keyboard sense, the construction of scales, and triads and intervals precede the melodic sight-singing exercises. After these concepts are explained, a number of graded melodic exercises is presented. The melodic exercises start with the scale degrees *do* and *re*. The remaining degrees of the major scale are introduced in the following order: 7th, 3rd, 4th, 5th, 6th and 8th, followed by the flattened 3rd, 6th and 7th and the raised 5th.

5.3.4.5 Are sufficient exercises provided to practise each new concept?

A great number of rhythmic exercises and melodic exercises is provided in two separate chapters. These exercises are not presented as each new concept is explained. This implies that the learner is expected to remember various concepts and apply them all at once.

5.3.4.6 Do the exercises have a limited vocal range?

Most of the exercises do not exceed the range of an octave.

5.3.4.7 Are exercises for evaluation provided?

A separate testbook is provided for the teacher, consisting of a selection of exercises from the student's workbook. Because the tests are also given as exercises in the workbook, they do not encourage the students to read from sight, but rather to remember the exercises they have learnt.

5.3.4.8 Are rhythmic exercises included?

Rhythmic patterns are presented in Chapter 4. The chapter includes graded exercises in both simple and compound time. Some of the exercises have lyrics derived from the music literature. These lyrics are either in English or in Latin. Rare time signatures such as 5/8 and 7/4 are also included in this chapter.

5.3.4.9 Are interval exercises included?

Intervals are presented in Chapter 8 in the form of tables with the tonic sol-fa for major and minor scales. Learners are expected to sing all intervals in the major and minor scales from these two tables.

5.3.4.10 Are melodic exercises included?

Melodic exercises are only presented in Chapter 9. Short melodies and excerpts from choral works are graded as sight-singing exercises.

5.3.4.11 Is the necessary music theory included?

This method provides sufficient guidance regarding the theoretical concepts of rhythm and metre, but only brief descriptions of intervals and melodic concepts. The construction of major and minor scales is emphasised in Section 6 and learners are required to write both major scales as well as harmonic and melodic scales before they do any melodic sight-singing.

5.3.4.12 Are exercises in both the treble clef and the bass clef included?

In the written exercises, both these clefs are used, but in the melodic exercises, only the treble clef is used.

5.3.4.13 Are lyrics provided with some of the exercises?

Some rhythmic as well as melodic exercises are provided with an English, Afrikaans or Latin text. The text for the rhythmic exercises helps the singer to sing the rhythms correctly.

5.3.4.14 Are different modes used?

The major and minor modes are used in this workbook.

5.3.4.15 Are learning aids for pitch and rhythm, such as Tonic sol-fa or the Chev  system, used?

Tonic sol-fa is only used in Chapter 8, where intervals are introduced. Tables with the tonic sol-fa for the major, natural minor, harmonic minor and the melodic minor are given. *Do* is regarded as the tonic of both the major and the minor scales. Oosthuyzen does not suggest specific syllables on which learners should sing or chant rhythmic patterns or exercises.

5.3.4.16 Is this programme suited for self-study?

It will be difficult for students to follow this programme without help from a teacher or another musician. Several concepts are not explained clearly and no audio examples are provided.

5.3.4.17 Does this programme require active student participation?

The sequence in which the contents are presented does not encourage active learner-involvement from the beginning. Various theoretical, written exercises are presented before the learner starts singing. After completing written exercises on scales, key signatures and triads, the student starts to sing from sight.

5.3.4.18 General comments about Training status programme

This method offers a solid theoretical background to sight-singing. Only after seven chapters with written exercises, does the learner start to sing from sight. Spending such a percentage of the programme on purely theoretical aspects of music can discourage students who actually want to learn how to sing from sight. The great number of rhythmic exercises, first in one chapter and then the many melodic exercises in another, does not encourage learners to experience sight-singing as a real form of music making. The melodic exercises commence with intervals of a tone and a semitone. The present author found that beginner sight-singers could easily become confused when they are required to read and sing tones which are close to each other.

The testbook, which forms part of the *Training status programme*, duplicates a number of exercises from the workbook. Asking students to sing exercises which they already know, only test their memory and not necessarily their sight-singing skills. Because only the first time a person sings a piece of music while reading the notation is regarded as sight-singing (see the definition in section 1.9.2), the exercises in the testbook cannot be regarded as sight-singing.

In this author's opinion the *Training status programme* is not the ideal programme for teaching or learning sight-singing.

5.3.5 D. Bauguess (1995): *Sight singing made simple*

Sight singing made simple is intended for students with no or very little music knowledge. The use of the CD with the book makes it possible for the author to demonstrate melodic and rhythmic concepts very clearly. The student gets the opportunity to practise singing with the recording. It is indicated clearly in the book when the pupil should start and stop the recording. It progresses very slowly and unfortunately only gives a few exercises to practise every new concept.

This sight-singing course combines a printed text with an audio recording on CD or cassette. The student needs no prior knowledge of music notation. As the author explains in the introduction, this course only covers the “fundamentals of reading music” (Bauguess 1995: 3). Although only limited music concepts are dealt with in the sight-singing method, the material is clearly presented and explained in a simple and logical way. The author uses the audio recording to complement the written text. This recording contains narrated text with short musical extracts as examples.

Bauguess (1995: 32) suggests that the learners should sing in a comfortable pitch range according to his voice group, rather than to sing exactly on the written pitch. The author of this thesis strongly agrees with this viewpoint of Bauguess. It is surely more important for sight-singers to sing the intervals between tones correctly than to sing with a forced tone, trying to reach the written pitch.

5.3.5.1 *Is each concept explained clearly?*

Musical concepts are explained in the workbook as well as on the CD. By presenting the music notation in print and the sound of the music on a recording, this programme provides thorough explanations of relevant concepts.

5.3.5.2 *Are examples of new concepts provided in the form of music notation?*

Bauguess uses clefless staves for music notation and writes the tonic sol-fa notation on music staves. Complete staff notation is used towards the end of the book (Ex. 59, onwards).

5.3.5.3 Are audio examples of new concepts provided?

A CD recording accompanies the workbook of *Sight singing made simple*. On this CD, musical concepts are demonstrated. Echo exercises are provided in which students are expected to echo the music that they hear. These exercises are used to explain melodic as well as rhythmic concepts and to provide opportunities for students to practise these concepts.

The learner is expected to sing with a recording of the exercises, while reading the notation. This sight-singing course is called “an audio course”. This implies that the audio recording is the dominant part of the course, with print to complement the recording.

A soprano and a tenor sing the examples together on the recording. This can make it easy for both high and low voices to sing these exercises. The tonic chord or the first tone is played on a piano and a metronome on the recording provides a steady beat.

5.3.5.4 Is the material sequenced in a logical order?

The material in *Sight-singing made simple* is sequenced in a logical order. After each concept has been introduced, the learner is provided with a number of exercises to practise the particular concept.

5.3.5.5 Are sufficient exercises provided to practise each new concept?

Not many exercises are provided in this programme. The workbook only provides 68 exercises. All of the exercises are sung on the CD. This does not encourage learners to read the notation and develop their sight-singing skills. Listening to a recording while reading music notation cannot be regarded as real sight-singing because the singer can imitate the role models on the recording.

5.3.5.6 Do the exercises have a limited vocal range?

All the exercises are written within the range of an octave. This makes the exercises easy for all voice groups to sing.

5.3.5.7 Are exercises for evaluation provided?

Specific exercises for evaluation of sight-singing are not provided. The learner can compare his sight-singing efforts to the singing on the recording as a form of self-evaluation.

5.3.5.8 Are rhythmic exercises included?

Rhythmic exercises are included in the workbook and on the CD recording. They are presented as echo exercises in which the learner should first listen and then sing, and as rhythmic exercises in which the learner sings the exercise with the recording. Note values used in this method are semibreves, minims, dotted minims, crotchets and quavers. The rests for these note values are also used and some of the notes are combined with ties. The metre is limited to simple time with a crotchet beat.

5.3.5.9 Are interval exercises included?

Interval exercises are provided as echo exercises. Exercises 17 to 23 are interval exercises. Number 17 and 18 are not notated. The learner is expected to listen and echo what he heard. Number 19 to 23 are written as tonic sol-fa, following the contour of the music. Reading the tonic sol-fa notation without staff notation helps the learner to associate intervals with the corresponding tonic sol-fa syllables. Being written without staff notation, these exercises do not help the learner to read staff notation.

5.3.5.10 Are melodic exercises included?

In *Sight singing made simple*, only the last 10 exercises use complete music notation with the symbols that are normally present such as a clef, key signature and time signature. The lack of sufficient melodic exercises is probably one of this method's shortcomings. Students should have a considerable number of exercises with which they can practise sight-singing. The disadvantage of having only a few exercises for every concept is that learners do not have sufficient opportunity to practise actual sight-reading.

5.3.5.11 Is the necessary music theory included?

The music theory relevant to the concepts that are introduced are explained when a new concept is introduced. Bauguess provides only the minimum of music theory to help the

learner understand the sight-singing concepts. He explains briefly what key signatures are and how to find *do*. From Exercise 53, *do* is not given any more and the student has to find it on his own. The explanation of key signatures on page 29 helps students to find *do*, but it does not explain exactly how sharps and flats affects certain notes.

5.3.5.12 Are exercises in both the treble clef and the bass clef included?

The treble clef is introduced from Exercise 59. All the exercises before Number 59 are notated without any clef sign. This has the advantage that the learner can sing the exercise at any comfortable pitch and that the pitch of the exercise is not specified. Although only the treble clef is used in these exercises, they are sung by a soprano and a tenor on the accompanying recording. Students with low voices can sing these exercises an octave lower than written.

At the end of the book, the bass clef is introduced. The letter names of the notes in the different clefs are given.

5.3.5.13 Are lyrics provided with some of the exercises?

No lyrics are provided with the exercises.

5.3.5.14 Are different modes used?

Only the major mode is used in this study package.

5.3.5.15 Are learning aids for pitch and rhythm, such as Tonic sol-fa or the Chev  system, used?

The tonic sol-fa is used throughout the programme for melodic and interval exercises. In the first exercises only the tonic sol-fa notation is given. After staff notation is explained, six excises with sol-fa names on the staff are given. These exercises can help learners to realise the relationship between the tonic sol-fa syllables and the notes' positions on the music staff. The exercises are sung on the tonic sol-fa syllables to "build a strong association with the name of the pitch and what it sounds like" (Bauguess 1995: 16).

5.3.5.16 Is this programme suited for self-study?

This study package is ideal for self-study because it provides clear explanations of concepts and provides a role model for the different exercises.

5.3.5.17 Does this programme require active student participation?

The student is asked to sing with the recording while following the notation in the workbook. All the exercises are sung on the recording, creating the possibility that the learner can follow the role models instead of singing from sight.

5.3.5.18 General comments about Sight-singing made simple

The advantage of this sight-singing method is that a person without any music knowledge can learn the basics of sight-singing on his own with the aid of this course.

The disadvantages of this method are:

- Very few exercises are provided to practise actual sight-singing with each new concept.
- The method only covers the basics of sight-singing.

Sight singing made simple can be a highly effective introduction to the most basic elements of sight-singing. The programme is very user-friendly and is presented in a pleasant way. Using echo exercises to demonstrate new concepts involves the learner and invites him to participate in making music.

5.3.6 B. Arnold (1999): *A fanatic's guide to ear training and sight-singing*

This very interesting sight-singing programme is intended for the serious student who can read music and sing from sight. All intervals and combinations of intervals are covered in the workbook. In the introduction to the book, Arnold offers help to readers via the webpage of the publisher, Muse-Eek. Using the Internet as part of a teaching strategy, communication between the readers and the author becomes possible, regardless of the geographic distance between them.

Arnold (1999: 2) explains that all twelve pitches of the chromatic scale “have a unique sound against a key and this unique sound can be memorised.” This can hardly be disputed and is worth learning. On page 5, Arnold states that students should not memorise melodic patterns, but rather relate each individual pitch to the key. The author of this thesis cannot share Arnold’s viewpoint. When sight-singing is reduced to relating each pitch to the key, the art of music may disappear and the singer may only experience each pitch as an isolated sound. Learning melodic patterns (the building stones of sight-singing) helps the singer to sight-sing accurately. When a sight-singer can recognise melodic patterns and associate them with the appropriate melody, he can form a mental image of the music that he should reproduce vocally.

Although *A fanatic’s guide to ear training and sight singing* is not a sight-singing guide for beginners, it uses a unique approach to the subject that cannot be ignored when comparing sight-singing programmes.

5.3.6.1 Is each concept explained clearly?

Arnold expects the learner to have “intermediate to advanced knowledge of music.” It is therefore not necessary for him to explain every concept of music and music notation. The exercises are explained at the beginning of each chapter.

5.3.6.2 Are examples of new concepts provided in the form of music notation?

All the exercises in the book are written as music notation. The exercises consist of all the possible ascending melodic patterns that can be formed with one to seven notes. These combinations of intervals can hardly be described as *new concepts*.

5.3.6.3 Are audio examples of new concepts provided?

A CD recording is included as part of the programme. This recording consists of the tonic chord being repeated in each of the twelve major and minor keys. Each track of the CD contains the following chord progressions in a specific key: I, IV, V; I, IV, V; I, I, I, I; etc.

5.3.6.4 Is the material sequenced in a logical order?

The exercises start with one note which the learner should sing, progressing to a series of six notes.

5.3.6.5 Are sufficient exercises provided to practise each new concept?

All possible combinations of intervals are included in the exercises.

5.3.6.6 Do the exercises have a limited vocal range?

Using no more than six notes per exercise, the range of each exercise does not exceed the range of a seventh.

5.3.6.7 Are exercises for evaluation provided?

No special exercises for evaluation are provided.

5.3.6.8 Are rhythmic exercises included?

No rhythmic concepts are included in this programme.

5.3.6.9 Are interval exercises included?

The programme consists of interval exercises only.

5.3.6.10 Are melodic exercises included?

No real melodic exercises are included. Each exercise is a combination of single notes that the singer should not treat as a melody.

5.3.6.11 Is the necessary music theory included?

No music theory is explained in the workbook because the learner is supposed to have prior music knowledge.

5.3.6.12 Are exercises in the treble clef and the bass clef included?

Only the treble clef is used.

5.3.6.13 Are lyrics provided with some of the exercises?

No lyrics are provided for any of the exercises.

5.3.6.14 Are different modes used?

In the series of notes, mode is not really relevant. On the CD recording, only major chords are played.

5.3.6.15 Are learning aids for pitch and rhythm, such as Tonic sol-fa or the Chev  system, used?

No system except staff notation is used.

5.3.6.16 Is this programme suitable for self-study?

This programme can probably only be used for self-study.

5.3.6.17 Does this programme require active student participation?

Through the whole programme active student participation is essential.

5.3.6.18 General comments about A fanatic's guide to ear training and sight-singing

A fanatic's guide to ear training and sight-singing may be useful for students who are extremely serious about mastering sight-singing. In this scientific, rather unmusical approach the relationship between each pitch and the tonic is regarded as the most important. The present author prefers a more musical approach in which melody and the intervals within a key are more important.

5.3.7 H. Austin and E. Howard (2000): *Music reading / Ear training. ABC's of vocal harmony*

Although this is not purely a sight-singing method, ear training and vocal harmony are closely related to sight-singing. Austin and Howard have compiled an exciting programme which covers a wide spectrum of music. This study package consists of a workbook and two audio CDs or cassettes. According to the authors, the course is designed for learners of any age and musical taste (Austin & Howard 2000: iv).

The workbook is divided into seven chapters on the following aspects of sight-singing:

- scales,
- intervals,
- chords,
- rhythm / metre,
- chords, transposing, finding your key, key signatures, and
- a glossary of musical terms.

This study package forms a good introduction to sight-singing, providing written and audio examples of music concepts.

The study material is packaged in an attractive cover, which includes the workbook and two cassettes. A colourful cover contributes to the visual impact of this study package. The workbook is A5 sized with a clear print. The music notation is in a big font size that is easy to read.

5.3.7.1 Is each concept explained clearly?

The relevant musical concepts are described very briefly in the workbook and on the recording.

5.3.7.2 Are examples of new concepts provided in the form of music notation?

Not all the music examples are provided with written notation. Several of the exercises are only illustrated by singing on the recording, while other exercises are provided with notation. Triads are introduced by presenting the notenames with the number of the scale degree as

music notation (Austin & Howard 2000: 44-52). Using different systems of music notation may become confusing for learners who have not mastered staff notation yet.

5.3.7.3 Are audio examples of new concepts provided ?

An audio recording on CD or cassettes accompanies the workbook. Examples of the different concepts are provided on the recording. These examples are sung by different people. A piano accompaniment is used for some exercises. The explanations on the recording are very brief and the notation of many examples is not provided. The learner will have to listen to the recording several times to understand what the authors mean.

5.3.7.4 Is the material sequenced in a logical order?

The material is not sequenced in the most logical order. The four chapters of the workbook present scales, intervals, chords and rhythm respectively, followed by a number of additional exercises, charts with all the major and minor scales, and selected musical terms. A variety of rhythmic patterns and note values are used in Chapters 1 to 3, while rhythms and note values are only introduced in Chapter 4.

5.3.7.5 Are sufficient exercises provided to practise each new concept?

After a concept is explained, the learner is asked to sing with the presenters on the recording. The notation of these exercises is often not provided and the learner has to rely on his hearing alone to sing along. The exercises are repeated to help the learner and many of them are followed by the exclamation "Good!" The author of this thesis finds the exclamations quite disturbing and unnecessary. A limited number of exercises is provided at the end of each of the four main sections of the workbook. The exercises may help learners to apply various aspects of sight-singing but they are not sufficient to enable learners to master this skill.

5.3.7.6 Do the exercises have a limited vocal range?

The exercises seldom exceed the range of an octave. This ensures that the exercises are within the vocal reach of most singers.

5.3.7.7 Are exercises for evaluation provided?

No special exercises for evaluation are provided. The exercises at the end of each section can be regarded as evaluation exercises that enable the student to evaluate his understanding of the work that has been explained.

5.3.7.8 Are rhythmic exercises included?

Only one section of the study package is about rhythm. In Chapter 4, exercises with rhythm only are provided. A number of additional rhythmic exercises are included at the back of the workbook (Austin & Howard 2000: 69i - 69cc).

5.3.7.9 Are interval exercises included?

In the section on intervals, exercises on this aspect are offered. The learner is requested to sing the intervals with the presenters. By doing so, the listener can internalise the sound of the different intervals. Notation is given for the different interval exercises.

5.3.7.10 Are melodic exercises included?

A limited number of melodic exercises is presented at the end of each section. These exercises are not sufficient for learners to master the relevant concepts.

5.3.7.11 Is the necessary music theory included?

More music theory than necessary is explained in this programme. This can be very confusing to the learner.

5.3.7.12 Are exercises in both the treble clef and the bass clef included?

Both the treble clef and the bass clef are used for the various examples and exercises.

5.3.7.13 Are lyrics provided with some of the exercises?

A few of the exercises and examples have lyrics. The great majority of the exercises do not have lyrics.

5.3.7.14 Are different modes used?

A variety of modes is used. The major, minor, blues scale and church modes are introduced and used in exercises.

5.3.7.15 Are learning aids for pitch and rhythm, such as Tonic sol-fa or the Chev  system, used?

The interval exercises are sung on numbers or on the names of the notes, while the rhythm exercises are sung on numbers or on a *taa*-sound.

5.3.7.16 Is this programme suitable for self-study?

This study package is intended to be used without the help of a teacher. Unfortunately, the number of actual sight-singing exercises is so limited that they do not provide sufficient opportunity to practise sight-singing.

5.3.7.17 Does this programme require active student participation?

The student is frequently asked to sing with the recording. The workbook does not provide notation for many of the sing-along exercises. After listening to the exercises and singing along the learner may know the exercises off by heart. Learning exercises in this way, without seeing the notation, can hardly improve sight-singing.

5.3.7.18 General comments about Music reading / Ear training. ABC's of vocal harmony

In this programme, sight-singing is combined with aural training and vocal harmony. Although each of these aspects of music is introduced in separate sections of the workbook and the recordings, they should not be regarded as isolated elements of music. Concepts are unfortunately not introduced in a logical sequence. As an example: the authors expect learners to read different rhythm patterns in Chapter 1 and they only explain them in Chapter 4.

The number and title of the different track are not mentioned on the cassettes. This makes it difficult for the learner to know exactly which track is playing. On a CD, this should not be a problem, because the CD player indicates the number of the track.

In the preface of *Music reading / Ear training. ABC's of vocal harmony*, the authors state that this course will help the reader to “improve pitch accuracy and develop the skills of sight-reading and harmonizing.” After evaluating the programme, the author of this thesis concluded that it might be an interesting refresher course for learners who can already sing from sight and read music. He can, however, not recommend this work for learners who want to acquire the knowledge and skills to master sight-singing.

5.4 Summary

In Table 5.1 the selected sight-singing programmes can be compared according to specific criteria. Comparing the programmes, it becomes clear that each programme is written for a specific group of learners and aims to reach different levels of competency. Adding an audio recording to a workbook enables the learner to follow the programme without a teacher's help. Role models on the recording provide audio examples of the music, which can enable learners to associate the symbols of music notation with musical sounds.

The evaluation of sight-singing programmes in Table 5.1 is coded as follows:

1 = very good

2 = good

3 = average

4 = poor

5 = very poor and

* = not at all / absent.

Table 5.1: Comparison of selected sight-singing programmes

Sight-singing programme	<i>Fun with notes</i>	<i>Teaching choral sight-reading</i>	<i>Successful sight-singing</i>	<i>Training status programme</i>	<i>Sight-singing made simple</i>	<i>A fanatic's guide to ear training and sight-singing</i>	<i>Music reading / Ear training. ABC's of vocal harmony</i>
Criteria							
1. Each concept explained clearly	3	4	1	3	1	3	1
2. Music notation for new concepts	2	3	1	*	1	1	3
3. Audio examples	*	*	*	3	1	4	1
4. Logical sequence	1	2	1	2	5	2	3
5. Sufficient exercises	1	3	1	1	4	2	4
6. Limited vocal range	1	2	2	4	4	1	1
7. Evaluation exercises	3	4	5	2	3	5	4
8. Rhythmic exercises	1	4	3	4	3	5	3
9. Interval exercises	4	4	3	2	2	1	3
10. Melodic exercises	1	2	1	2	2	4	3
11. Music theory	2	*	4	5	5	*	2
12. Treble and bass clef	4	1	3	1	5	5	1
13. Lyrics	2	*	2	2	5	*	3
14. Different modes	2	1	3	4	2	1	1
15. Learning aids (sol-fa / Chev�)	1	5	4	4	2	5	3
16. Self-study	5	5	4	*	1	1	2
17. Active participation	1	3	1	4	1	1	2
Recommended for self-study	4	5	5	4	1	2	1
Recommended for class use	1	3	3	4	3	5	4
Recommended for choir	3	2	1	5	4	5	4