



UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA  
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA  
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

**The implementation of Competitive Intelligence tools and techniques in Public Service departments in South Africa to improve service delivery: a case study of the Department of Home Affairs**

By

**Nisha Sewdass**

Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree  
DPhil (Information Science)

Department of Information Science  
Faculty of Engineering, Building Environment and Information  
Technology  
University of Pretoria

April 2009



## ***Dedication***

*I wish to dedicate this thesis to my father, the late Mr Bharath Sewdass, whose courage, determination and support remains my source of inspiration forever.*

\*\*\*\*\*

## SUMMARY

### **The implementation of Competitive Intelligence tools and techniques in Public Service departments in South Africa to improve service delivery: a case study of the Department of Home Affairs**

Competitive Intelligence (CI) has become increasingly important for organisations in the private sector, or profit-making organisations, because the level and intensity of competition has increased in recent years. This increase in the level and intensity of competition has also affected the public sector, or non-profit-making organisations, such as Public Service departments.

In South Africa, the Public Service departments have undergone significant changes, in order to rectify the injustices of the past. Despite much progress, it is noticed that government does not have sufficient capacity to deliver and sustain a quality service to its citizens. It is further noted that improved service delivery cannot be implemented by issuing of circulars only, and it is not just an administrative activity, instead it is a dynamic process and to do this, Public Service managers require new management tools. The Department of Home Affairs (DHA) was chosen as the case study Public Service department for this study.

The purpose of this study was to ascertain how competitive intelligence tools and techniques could be implemented in Public Service departments in South Africa to enhance the delivery of services. This aim was established during this study by addressing the following issues:

- Identifying how CI tools and techniques could contribute to the functioning of the Public Service sector. The study outlined the benefits of CI for public service organisations and focussed on several tools and techniques that could be used. Most of these tools and techniques were not used in DHA.
- Assessing the current state of Public Service delivery in South Africa. It became evident from the study that the Public Service sector and in particular DHA was experiencing several problems in terms of achieving its service delivery mandate. The Department lacked structured and formal frameworks, policies and strategies for conducting its operations. The organisation was viewed to have many unskilled and de-motivated staff. The current state of service delivery in South

Africa also revealed disturbing findings of corruption, fraud, nepotism, and extreme despair in staff that had to work in these conditions.

- Identifying gaps in the Public Service current strategies for service delivery. It was established that DHA does not use reliable techniques and methods when conducting its strategic planning. Furthermore, staff lacked the competencies, skills and experience to assist in strategic planning. The existing strategic plan for DHA does not address the future desires of the organisation and can be regarded as a plan to address the immediate issues of the organisation only.
- Identifying the forms of competition that impact service delivery in Public Service departments in South Africa. Several forms of competition were encountered at DHA. These forms of competition can be divided into three different areas namely internal competition in DHA, external competition and left field competition. The information about these forms of competition was not readily available to managers and decision makers therefore appropriate actions could not be taken to counteract the impact of the competition on service delivery.
- Identifying initiatives adopted by Public Service departments to improve service delivery. It was evident from the study that while the new initiatives being implemented by DHA to improve service delivery would be able to, and in some cases, have already had a positive impact on the operating and service delivery environment, several concerns were also identified.
- Designing a new CI related framework for gathering and analysing information that can be used in all Public Service departments in South Africa to improve service delivery. From the empirical investigations it became evident that no single CI tool or technique would have been able to address the situation at DHA, therefore, a combination of tools was necessary. These tools were depicted in a CI framework that DHA could use to gather and analyse information for decision making and service delivery.
- Suggesting proposed solutions and recommendations that can assist Public Service departments in South Africa in improving its service delivery.

It was evident that CI can contribute towards the enhancement of decision making and service delivery not only in DHA but also in all other Public Service departments in South Africa.



## **KEYWORDS**

Competitive intelligence

Competitive intelligence tools and techniques

Competitive intelligence framework

Public Service

Public service delivery

Service delivery

Services

Service quality

Service sector organisations

Non-profit organisations

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author wishes to express her sincere gratitude to:

- My supervisor Professor Maritha E. Snyman, and co-supervisor Professor Craig S. Fleisher, for their continuous guidance, supervision and support in the completion of this thesis.
- The University of Pretoria and the NRF for financial assistance during this study.
- The Staff at the Department of Home Affairs, Waltloo, Pretoria for accommodating me in their work environment and for their kindness and cooperation during my study.
- My mother, Mrs Nandarani Sewdass, my brother, Mr Preshen Sewdass and the rest of my family for their patience, understanding and support during my study.
- Ms Louise Cromhout, my dear friend, for her encouragement and continued belief in my abilities.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b>LIST OF TABLES</b>	xiii
	<b>LIST OF FIGURES</b>	xiv
<b>1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION AND PROBLEM STATEMENT</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	INTRODUCTION	1
1.2	THE NEED FOR THE STUDY	2
1.3	THE STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM	5
1.4	VALUE OF THE STUDY	6
1.5	SCOPE AND LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY	7
1.6	RELATED LITERATURE	8
1.7	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	15
1.7.1	<i>GENERAL INTRODUCTION</i>	15
1.7.1.1	Literature Review	15
1.7.1.2	Empirical Component	16
1.7.2	<i>SUBJECTS OF THE STUDY</i>	18
1.7.3	<i>INSTRUMENTS FOR THE STUDY</i>	19
1.7.4	<i>ANALYSIS OF DATA</i>	20
1.8	DEFINITION OF KEY TERMS AND EXPLANATION OF ABBREVIATIONS	20
1.8.1	<i>CLARIFICATION OF TERMS</i>	20
1.8.2	<i>ABBREVIATIONS</i>	21
1.9	FRAMEWORK OF THE STUDY	23
1.10	ETHICAL STATEMENT	24
<b>2</b>	<b>COMPETITIVE INTELLIGENCE IN ORGANISATIONS</b>	<b>25</b>
2.1	INTRODUCTION	25
2.2	WHAT IS COMPETITIVE INTELLIGENCE?	25
2.3	NEED FOR CI IN ORGANISATIONS	29
2.4	BENEFITS OF CI IN ORGANISATIONS	30
2.5	IMPLEMENTING CI IN ORGANISATIONS	33
2.6	CI TOOLS AND STRATEGIES	35
2.7	CI FOR THE SERVICE SECTOR	38
2.7.1	<i>WHAT IS THE SERVICE SECTOR ORGANISATION?</i>	38
2.7.2	<i>NATURE OF THE SERVICE SECTOR</i>	39

2.7.3	<i>NEED FOR CI IN THE SERVICE SECTOR</i>	40
2.8	CI FOR THE PUBLIC SERVICE SECTOR	42
2.8.1	<i>DEFINITION OF PUBLIC SERVICE SECTOR AND NON-PROFIT ORGANISATIONS</i>	43
2.82	<i>COMPETITION IN THE PUBLIC SERVICE ORGANISATIONS</i>	44
2.8.2.1	Competition for Funding	44
2.8.2.2	Competition for Personnel	45
2.8.2.3	Competing for Users / Customers	47
2.8.2.4	Competing for Influence and Prestige	48
2.9	SUMMARY	49
<b>3</b>	<b>RESEARCH METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>51</b>
3.1	INTRODUCTION	51
3.2	RESEARCH APPROACHES	51
3.3	A QUALITATIVE RESEARCH METHOD	54
3.4	ETHNOGRPAHIC RESEARCH	56
3.4.1	<i>PURPOSE OF ETHNOGRAPHIC RESEARCH</i>	58
3.4.2	<i>HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF ETHNOGRAPHY</i>	59
3.4.3	<i>TYPES OF ETHNOGRAPHIC RESEARCH</i>	61
3.4.4	<i>CHARACTERISTICS OF ETHNOGRAPHIC RESEARCH</i>	62
3.4.5	<i>BENEFITS OF ETHNOGRAPHIC RESEARCH</i>	64
3.4.6	<i>LIMITATIONS OF ETHNOGRAPHIC RESEARCH</i>	65
3.4.7	<i>ETHNOGRAPHIC RESEARCH vs PARTICIPATORY RESEARCH</i>	66
3.4.8	<i>ETHNOGRAPHIC RESEARCH IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION</i>	69
3.5	DESIGNING THE ETHNOGRAPHIC RESEARCH PROCESS	71
3.5.1	<i>DATA COLLECTION TECHNIQUES</i>	73
3.5.1.1	Triangulation	74
3.5.1.2	Data collection	75
3.5.2	<i>DATA ANALYSIS</i>	81
3.5.3	<i>VALIDITY AND RELIABILITY IN ETHNOGRAPHIC RESEARCH</i>	83
3.5.3.1	Validity of the Ethnographic study	84
3.5.3.2	Reliability of the Ethnographic study	84
3.6	RESEARCH REPORT WRITING AND LEGEND USED	85



3.7	ETHICS IN ETHNOGRAPHIC RESEARCH	86
3.8	SUMMARY	87
<b>4</b>	<b>PUBLIC SERVICES AND SERVICE DELIVERY IN SOUTH AFRICA</b>	<b>89</b>
4.1	INTRODUCTION	89
4.2	STRUCTURE OF GOVERNMENT IN SOUTH AFRICA	89
4.3	PUBLIC SERVICES AND ADMINISTRATION	91
4.4	DEPARTMENT OF HOME AFFAIRS (DHA) AS A CHOSEN PUBLIC SERVICE DEPARTMENT	92
4.4.1	<i>THE VISION, MISSION AND STRATEGIC INTENT OF DHA</i>	94
4.4.1.1	Vision of DHA	94
4.4.1.2	Mission Statement of DHA	96
4.4.1.3	Strategic Intent of DHA	98
4.4.2	<i>ORGANISATIONAL STRUCTURE AND FLOW OF INFORMATION</i>	99
4.4.2.1	Organisational Structure of DHA	100
4.4.2.2	Flow of Information in DHA	106
4.4.3	<i>ACTIVITIES THAT TAKE PLACE IN THIS ENVIRONMENT</i>	108
4.4.3.1	Civic Services	109
4.4.3.2	Immigration Services	109
4.4.3.3	Support Services	110
4.4.4	<i>INTERACTION PATTERNS IN DHA</i>	111
4.4.5	<i>LANGUAGE AND COMMUNICATION CODES IN DHA</i>	113
4.4.6	<i>ORGANISATIONAL CULTURE IN DHA</i>	116
4.4.7	<i>INTERNAL POLICIES AND PROCEDURES AND THEIR IMPACT ON OPERATIONS AT DHA</i>	122
4.4.8	<i>STRATEGIC PLANNING TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES USED IN DHA</i>	127
4.4.9	<i>CURRENT STATE OF SERVICE DELIVERY IN DHA</i>	131
4.4.9.1	A high standard of professional ethics must be promoted and maintained	132
4.4.9.2	Efficient, economic and effective resources must be promoted	134
4.4.9.3	Public Administration must be development-orientated	135
4.4.9.4	Services must be provided impartially, fairly, equitably and without bias	136
4.4.9.5	People's needs must be responded to, and the public must be encouraged to participate in policy making	138
4.4.9.6	Public Administration must be accountable	139
4.4.9.7	Transparency must be fostered by providing the public with timely, accessible and accurate information	140

4.4.9.8	Good human resource management and career development practices, to maximise human potential, must be cultivated	141
4.4.9.9	Public administration must be broadly representative of South African people, with employment and personnel management practices based on ability, objectivity, fairness and the need to redress the imbalances of the past to achieve broad representation	144
4.5	SUMMARY	145
<b>5</b>	<b>CI FOR PUBLIC SERVICE DELIVERY</b>	<b>148</b>
5.1	INTRODUCTION	148
5.2	NEW INTERVENTIONS INITIATED BY DHA TO IMPROVE SERVICE DELIVERY	148
5.2.1	<i>TURNAROUND PROGRAMME</i>	149
5.2.2	<i>OTHER INITIATIVES THAT IMPACT ON SERVICE DELIVERY</i>	154
5.2.3	<i>SUPPORT FOR THE NEW INITIATIVES</i>	155
5.2.3.1	DHA Reputation	157
5.2.3.2	DHA Working environment	157
5.2.3.3	DHA Service Delivery	157
5.2.4	CONCERNS ABOUT THE NEW INITIATIVES	158
5.2.4.1	Leadership at DHA	159
5.2.4.2	Communication at DHA	160
5.2.4.3	Consultation with staff at DHA	161
5.2.4.4	Skills Transfer	162
5.3	KEY INTELLIGENCE NEEDS OF DHA	163
5.4	FORMS OF COMPETITION IDENTIFIED IN DHA	164
5.4.1	<i>LEFT FIELD COMPETITION IN DHA</i>	167
5.4.1.1	Sudden changes in demand	167
5.4.1.2	Labour and labour costs	170
5.4.1.3	Scarce skills competition	171
5.4.1.4	Third Party service providers	172
5.4.1.5	Financial fluctuations	173
5.4.1.6	Turnaround Programmes	174
5.4.1.7	Repositioning the image of DHA	174
5.4.1.8	Identity theft	175
5.5.	CI TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES ALREADY BEING USED AT DHA WITHOUT REALISING IT	177
5.5.1	<i>SERVICE DELIVERY MODEL</i>	177

5.5.2	<i>STAKEHOLDER IDENTIFICATION</i>	178
5.5.3	<i>SWOT ANALYSIS</i>	179
5.5.4	<i>PERFORMANCE MEASURES AND DASHBOARDS</i>	179
5.6	<i>SUMMARY</i>	180
<b>6</b>	<b><i>CI TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES FOR IMPROVING SERVICE DELIVERY AT DHA</i></b>	<b>182</b>
6.1	<i>INTRODUCTION</i>	182
6.2	<i>COMPETITIVE REALITIES AT DHA</i>	183
6.3	<i>CI TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES FOR DHA</i>	187
6.3.1	<i>CI VALUE CHAIN FOR DHA</i>	188
6.3.2	<i>CI FRAMEWORK FOR GATHERING AND ANALYSING INFORMATION AT DHA</i>	190
6.3.2.1	<i>Environmental Analysis</i>	194
6.3.2.2	<i>Service Business Analysis</i>	195
6.3.2.3	<i>Financial Analysis</i>	198
6.3.2.4	<i>Evolutionary Analysis</i>	199
6.3.2.5	<i>Customer Analysis</i>	201
6.3.2.6	<i>Competition Analysis</i>	202
6.3.3.	<i>SERVICE QUALITY COMPETITIVE ANALYSIS</i>	206
6.3.4	<i>ASSESSING THE ADEQUACY OF THE CI TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES</i>	208
6.4	<i>SUMMARY</i>	211
<b>7</b>	<b><i>RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS</i></b>	<b>213</b>
7.1	<i>INTRODUCTION</i>	213
7.2	<i>OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY</i>	213
7.3	<i>RESEARCH OBJECTIVES</i>	214
7.4	<i>CRITICAL FINDINGS OF THE STUDY</i>	215
7.4.1	<i>CURRENT STATE OF PUBLIC SERVICE DELIVERY IN SOUTH AFRICA</i>	215
7.4.2	<i>GAPS IN PUBLIC SERVICES' CURRENT STRATEGIES FOR SERVICE DELIVERY</i>	216
7.4.3	<i>INITIATIVES TO IMPROVE SERVICE DELIVERY</i>	217
7.4.4	<i>CI TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES THAT COULD CONTRIBUTE TO THE FUNCTIONING OF THE SERVICE SECTOR</i>	217
7.4.5	<i>COMPETITION THAT IMPACTS ON SERVICE DELIVERY IN PUBLIC SERVICE DEPARTMENTS</i>	218
7.4.6	<i>CI FRAMEWORK FOR GATHERING AND ANALYSIN INFORMATION</i>	218
7.5	<i>RECOMMENDATIONS</i>	219



7.6	CONCLUSIONS OF THE STUDY	228
7.6.1	<i>HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING, DEVELOPMENT AND EDUCATION</i>	229
7.6.2	<i>EFFECTIVE COMMUNICATION AND LIAISON</i>	229
7.6.3	<i>EFFECTIVE MANAGEMENT AND LEADERSHIP</i>	229
7.6.4	<i>INFORMATION AND KNOWLEDGE MANAGEMENT</i>	230
7.6.5	<i>ENHANCED CUSTOMER FOCUS</i>	230
7.6.6	<i>IMPROVED TRANSPARENCY OF ACTIVITIES AND PROCESSES</i>	231
7.7	LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY	231
7.8	ACTIVITIES ALREADY IMPLEMENTED AT DHA AS A RESULT OF THIS STUDY	233
7.9	FUTURE RESEARCH	234
7.10	SUMMARY	235
<b>8</b>	<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	<b>237</b>



## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1	Definition of key terms	20
Table 1.2	List of abbreviations and meanings	22
Table 3.1	A comparison of paradigms	52
Table 3.2	Comparison of ethnographic and participatory research methods	69
Table 4.1	Categories of organisational culture	117
Table 4.2	Constitutional basic values and principles for Public Administration and service delivery	131
Table 5.1	Areas of competition identified in DHA	166
Table 5.2	DHA key stakeholder identification	178
Table 6.1	Summary of competitive realities at DHA	185
Table 6.2	CI objectives of each tool and technique suggested in the CI framework for DHA	204
Table 6.3	FAROUT elements and assessment scheme	209



## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1	The ethnographic research process	17
Figure 1.2	Framework for the study	23
Figure 2.1	The intelligence cycle	28
Figure 3.1	Qualitative research alternatives	56
Figure 3.2	Types of ethnographic research	62
Figure 4.1	Department of Home Affairs organisational structure	100
Figure 5.1	Phases in the Turnaround programme of DHA	150
Figure 5.2	Department of Home Affairs service delivery model	152
Figure 5.3	Programme governance structure and Phase 2 breakdown	153
Figure 6.1	Competitive realities at DHA	184
Figure 6.2	CI value chain for DHA	189
Figure 6.3	CI Framework for gathering and analysing information at DHA	193
Figure 6.4	Service quality competitive analysis model	207