The implementation of Competitive Intelligence tools and techniques in Public Service departments in South Africa to improve service delivery: a case study of the Department of Home Affairs

By

Nisha Sewdass

Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree
DPhil (Information Science)

Department of Information Science
Faculty of Engineering, Building Environment and Information Technology
University of Pretoria

April 2009

© University of Pretoria
Dedication

I wish to dedicate this thesis to my father, the late Mr Bharath Sewdass, whose courage, determination and support remains my source of inspiration forever.

****************
SUMMARY

The implementation of Competitive Intelligence tools and techniques in Public Service departments in South Africa to improve service delivery: a case study of the Department of Home Affairs

Competitive Intelligence (CI) has become increasingly important for organisations in the private sector, or profit-making organisations, because the level and intensity of competition has increased in recent years. This increase in the level and intensity of competition has also affected the public sector, or non-profit-making organisations, such as Public Service departments.

In South Africa, the Public Service departments have undergone significant changes, in order to rectify the injustices of the past. Despite much progress, it is noticed that government does not have sufficient capacity to deliver and sustain a quality service to its citizens. It is further noted that improved service delivery cannot be implemented by issuing of circulars only, and it is not just an administrative activity, instead it is a dynamic process and to do this, Public Service managers require new management tools. The Department of Home Affairs (DHA) was chosen as the case study Public Service department for this study.

The purpose of this study was to ascertain how competitive intelligence tools and techniques could be implemented in Public Service departments in South Africa to enhance the delivery of services. This aim was established during this study by addressing the following issues:

- Identifying how CI tools and techniques could contribute to the functioning of the Public Service sector. The study outlined the benefits of CI for public service organisations and focussed on several tools and techniques that could be used. Most of these tools and techniques were not used in DHA.
- Assessing the current state of Public Service delivery in South Africa. It became evident from the study that the Public Service sector and in particular DHA was experiencing several problems in terms of achieving its service delivery mandate. The Department lacked structured and formal frameworks, policies and strategies for conducting its operations. The organisation was viewed to have many unskilled and de-motivated staff. The current state of service delivery in South
Africa also revealed disturbing findings of corruption, fraud, nepotism, and extreme despair in staff that had to work in these conditions.

- Identifying gaps in the Public Service current strategies for service delivery. It was established that DHA does not use reliable techniques and methods when conducting its strategic planning. Furthermore, staff lacked the competencies, skills and experience to assist in strategic planning. The existing strategic plan for DHA does not address the future desires of the organisation and can be regarded as a plan to address the immediate issues of the organisation only.

- Identifying the forms of competition that impact service delivery in Public Service departments in South Africa. Several forms of competition were encountered at DHA. These forms of competition can be divided into three different areas namely internal competition in DHA, external competition and left field competition. The information about these forms of competition was not readily available to managers and decision makers therefore appropriate actions could not be taken to counteract the impact of the competition on service delivery.

- Identifying initiatives adopted by Public Service departments to improve service delivery. It was evident from the study that while the new initiatives being implemented by DHA to improve service delivery would be able to, and in some cases, have already had a positive impact on the operating and service delivery environment, several concerns were also identified.

- Designing a new CI related framework for gathering and analysing information that can be used in all Public Service departments in South Africa to improve service delivery. From the empirical investigations it became evident that no single CI tool or technique would have been able to address the situation at DHA, therefore, a combination of tools was necessary. These tools were depicted in a CI framework that DHA could use to gather and analyse information for decision making and service delivery.

- Suggesting proposed solutions and recommendations that can assist Public Service departments in South Africa in improving its service delivery.

It was evident that CI can contribute towards the enhancement of decision making and service delivery not only in DHA but also in all other Public Service departments in South Africa.
KEYWORDS

Competitive intelligence
Competitive intelligence tools and techniques
Competitive intelligence framework
Public Service
Public service delivery
Service delivery
Services
Service quality
Service sector organisations
Non-profit organisations
The author wishes to express her sincere gratitude to:

- My supervisor Professor Maritha E. Snyman, and co-supervisor Professor Craig S. Fleisher, for their continuous guidance, supervision and support in the completion of this thesis.
- The University of Pretoria and the NRF for financial assistance during this study.
- The Staff at the Department of Home Affairs, Waltloo, Pretoria for accommodating me in their work environment and for their kindness and cooperation during my study.
- My mother, Mrs Nandarani Sewdass, my brother, Mr Preshen Sewdass and the rest of my family for their patience, understanding and support during my study.
- Ms Louise Cromhout, my dear friend, for her encouragement and continued belief in my abilities.
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

**LIST OF TABLES**

xiv

**LIST OF FIGURES**

xiii

### 1

**INTRODUCTION AND PROBLEM STATEMENT**

1

1.1 INTRODUCTION

1

1.2 THE NEED FOR THE STUDY

2

1.3 THE STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

5

1.4 VALUE OF THE STUDY

6

1.5 SCOPE AND LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

7

1.6 RELATED LITERATURE

8

1.7 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

15

1.7.1 GENERAL INTRODUCTION

15

1.7.1.1 Literature Review

15

1.7.1.2 Empirical Component

16

1.7.2 SUBJECTS OF THE STUDY

18

1.7.3 INSTRUMENTS FOR THE STUDY

19

1.7.4 ANALYSIS OF DATA

20

1.8 DEFINITION OF KEY TERMS AND EXPLANATION OF ABBREVIATIONS

20

1.8.1 CLARIFICATION OF TERMS

20

1.8.2 ABBREVIATIONS

21

1.9 FRAMEWORK OF THE STUDY

23

1.10 ETHICAL STATEMENT

24

### 2

**COMPETITIVE INTELLIGENCE IN ORGANISATIONS**

25

2.1 INTRODUCTION

25

2.2 WHAT IS COMPETITIVE INTELLIGENCE?

25

2.3 NEED FOR CI IN ORGANISATIONS

29

2.4 BENEFITS OF CI IN ORGANISATIONS

30

2.5 IMPLEMENTING CI IN ORGANISATIONS

33

2.6 CI TOOLS AND STRATEGIES

35

2.7 CI FOR THE SERVICE SECTOR

38

2.7.1 WHAT IS THE SERVICE SECTOR ORGANISATION?

38

2.7.2 NATURE OF THE SERVICE SECTOR

39
4 PUBLIC SERVICES AND SERVICE DELIVERY IN SOUTH AFRICA

4.1 INTRODUCTION

4.2 STRUCTURE OF GOVERNMENT IN SOUTH AFRICA

4.3 PUBLIC SERVICES AND ADMINISTRATION

4.4 DEPARTMENT OF HOME AFFAIRS (DHA) AS A CHOSEN PUBLIC SERVICE DEPARTMENT

4.4.1 THE VISION, MISSION AND STRATEGIC INTENT OF DHA

4.4.1.1 Vision of DHA
4.4.1.2 Mission Statement of DHA
4.4.1.3 Strategic Intent of DHA

4.4.2 ORGANISATIONAL STRUCTURE AND FLOW OF INFORMATION

4.4.2.1 Organisational Structure of DHA
4.4.2.2 Flow of Information in DHA

4.4.3 ACTIVITIES THAT TAKE PLACE IN THIS ENVIRONMENT

4.4.3.1 Civic Services
4.4.3.2 Immigration Services
4.4.3.3 Support Services

4.4.4 INTERACTION PATTERNS IN DHA

4.4.5 LANGUAGE AND COMMUNICATION CODES IN DHA

4.4.6 ORGANISATIONAL CULTURE IN DHA

4.4.7 INTERNAL POLICIES AND PROCEDURES AND THEIR IMPACT ON OPERATIONS AT DHA

4.4.8 STRATEGIC PLANNING TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES USED IN DHA

4.4.9 CURRENT STATE OF SERVICE DELIVERY IN DHA

4.4.9.1 A high standard of professional ethics must be promoted and maintained
4.4.9.2 Efficient, economic and effective resources must be promoted
4.4.9.3 Public Administration must be development-orientated
4.4.9.4 Services must be provided impartially, fairly, equitably and without bias
4.4.9.5 People’s needs must be responded to, and the public must be encouraged to participate in policy making
4.4.9.6 Public Administration must be accountable
4.4.9.7 Transparency must be fostered by providing the public with timely, accessible and accurate information
4.4.9.8 Good human resource management and career development practices, to maximise human potential, must be cultivated

4.4.9.9 Public administration must be broadly representative of South African people, with employment and personnel management practices based on ability, objectivity, fairness and the need to redress the imbalances of the past to achieve broad representation

4.5 SUMMARY

5 CI FOR PUBLIC SERVICE DELIVERY

5.1 INTRODUCTION

5.2 NEW INTERVENTIONS INITIATED BY DHA TO IMPROVE SERVICE DELIVERY

5.2.1 TURNAROUND PROGRAMME

5.2.2 OTHER INITIATIVES THAT IMPACT ON SERVICE DELIVERY

5.2.3 SUPPORT FOR THE NEW INITIATIVES

5.2.3.1 DHA Reputation

5.2.3.2 DHA Working environment

5.2.3.3 DHA Service Delivery

5.2.4 CONCERNS ABOUT THE NEW INITIATIVES

5.2.4.1 Leadership at DHA

5.2.4.2 Communication at DHA

5.2.4.3 Consultation with staff at DHA

5.2.4.4 Skills Transfer

5.3 KEY INTELLIGENCE NEEDS OF DHA

5.4 FORMS OF COMPETITION IDENTIFIED IN DHA

5.4.1 LEFT FIELD COMPETITION IN DHA

5.4.1.1 Sudden changes in demand

5.4.1.2 Labour and labour costs

5.4.1.3 Scarce skills competition

5.4.1.4 Third Party service providers

5.4.1.5 Financial fluctuations

5.4.1.6 Turnaround Programmes

5.4.1.7 Repositioning the image of DHA

5.4.1.8 Identity theft

5.5 CI TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES ALREADY BEING USED AT DHA WITHOUT REALISING IT

5.5.1 SERVICE DELIVERY MODEL
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.5.2</td>
<td>STAKEHOLDER IDENTIFICATION</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.3</td>
<td>SWOT ANALYSIS</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.4</td>
<td>PERFORMANCE MEASURES AND DASHBOARDS</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>SUMMARY</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>CI TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES FOR IMPROVING SERVICE DELIVERY AT DHA</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>COMPETITIVE REALITIES AT DHA</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>CI TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES FOR DHA</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1</td>
<td>CI VALUE CHAIN FOR DHA</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2</td>
<td>CI FRAMEWORK FOR GATHERING AND ANALYSING INFORMATION AT DHA</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2.1</td>
<td>Environmental Analysis</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2.2</td>
<td>Service Business Analysis</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2.3</td>
<td>Financial Analysis</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2.4</td>
<td>Evolutionary Analysis</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2.5</td>
<td>Customer Analysis</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2.6</td>
<td>Competition Analysis</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3</td>
<td>SERVICE QUALITY COMPETITIVE ANALYSIS</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.4</td>
<td>ASSESSING THE ADEQUACY OF THE CI TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>SUMMARY</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>RESEARCH OBJECTIVES</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>CRITICAL FINDINGS OF THE STUDY</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.1</td>
<td>CURRENT STATE OF PUBLIC SERVICE DELIVERY IN SOUTH AFRICA</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.2</td>
<td>GAPS IN PUBLIC SERVICES’ CURRENT STRATEGIES FOR SERVICE DELIVERY</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.3</td>
<td>INITIATIVES TO IMPROVE SERVICE DELIVERY</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.4</td>
<td>CI TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES THAT COULD CONTRIBUTE TO THE FUNCTIONING OF THE SERVICE SECTOR</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.5</td>
<td>COMPETITION THAT IMPACTS ON SERVICE DELIVERY IN PUBLIC SERVICE DEPARTMENTS</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.6</td>
<td>CI FRAMEWORK FOR GATHERING AND ANALYSING INFORMATION</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 1.1</td>
<td>Definition of key terms</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 1.2</td>
<td>List of abbreviations and meanings</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.1</td>
<td>A comparison of paradigms</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.2</td>
<td>Comparison of ethnographic and participatory research methods</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.1</td>
<td>Categories of organisational culture</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.2</td>
<td>Constitutional basic values and principles for Public Administration and service delivery</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.1</td>
<td>Areas of competition identified in DHA</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.2</td>
<td>DHA key stakeholder identification</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.1</td>
<td>Summary of competitive realities at DHA</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.2</td>
<td>CI objectives of each tool and technique suggested in the CI framework for DHA</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.3</td>
<td>FAROUT elements and assessment scheme</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1.1</td>
<td>The ethnographic research process</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1.2</td>
<td>Framework for the study</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.1</td>
<td>The intelligence cycle</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.1</td>
<td>Qualitative research alternatives</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.2</td>
<td>Types of ethnographic research</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.1</td>
<td>Department of Home Affairs organisational structure</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.1</td>
<td>Phases in the Turnaround programme of DHA</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.2</td>
<td>Department of Home Affairs service delivery model</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.3</td>
<td>Programme governance structure and Phase 2 breakdown</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.1</td>
<td>Competitive realities at DHA</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.2</td>
<td>CI value chain for DHA</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.3</td>
<td>CI Framework for gathering and analysing information at DHA</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.4</td>
<td>Service quality competitive analysis model</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>