OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA SINCE 1994: POLICY OBJECTIVES AND IMPLEMENTATION COMPLEXITIES

by

MMORI BENJAMIN MOKHABA

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR (PUBLIC AFFAIRS)

In the Faculty of Economics and Management Sciences

University of Pretoria

Promoter: Prof. Dr. N.L. Roux
Co-Promoter: Prof. Dr. C. Thornhill
Co-Promoter: Prof. Dr. P.A. Brynard

PRETORIA

September 2004
SUMMARY

OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA SINCE 1994: POLICY OBJECTIVES AND IMPLEMENTATION COMPLEXITIES

by

MMORI BENJAMIN MOKHABA

PROMOTER: PROF. DR. N.L. ROUX
CO-PROMOTER: PROF. DR. C. THORNHILL
CO-PROMOTER: PROF. DR. P.A. BRYNARD

FACULTY OF ECONOMICS AND MANAGEMENT SCIENCES

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR (PUBLIC AFFAIRS)
SUMMARY

The primary objective of the research for this thesis is to propose an implementation model for outcomes-based education which could be implemented in South Africa. However, the proposed public policy model and its implementation activities could be appropriate for all government departments as well as public institutions. Subservient to the primary objective is the secondary objective, which can be divided into two. The first aim of the research project is to highlight and emphasise the pivotal roles of the theory and practices of public policy making, analysis and implementation. The secondary objective was to pinpoint the necessity of describing a public policy being studied in simple, clear and unambiguous language, to promote understanding. This is crucial because before a public policy could be implemented it should be comprehended.

To attain the objectives of the study it is necessary to indicate the rationale for the introduction of outcomes-based education to satisfy the public policy imperatives and directives enshrined in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 (Act 108 of 1996). Amongst others, the Constitution emphasises equality of all citizens before the law, respect for human dignity and, foremost in this thesis, the right to basic education, including adult basic education and further education. Outcomes-based education was also introduced to teach the youth and the population at large the essential democratic principles and values.

To capture the essence of the thesis, a problem statement is formulated to express the objectives of the study. The problem statement hypothesises that the proposed implementation model for outcomes-based education policy in South Africa is a necessary and sufficient condition for successful public policy implementation. The proposed implementation model should be widely implementable in the public sector as well as by the Department of Education.
In keeping with one of the objectives of the study, public policy and policy analysis are described in detail. Matters that receive attention are: policy in general and public policy in particular, policy formulation, role players and factors in policy formulation, policy analysis, crucial variables for studying policy implementation, policy evaluation, and policy analysis institutions. The purpose of the study is twofold, namely, to explain the central role played by the theory and practice of public policy, and a scientific approach for dealing with public policy. Moreover, it is crucial to know and understand what every public policy is about – its definition, origins, characteristics, and advantages. In relation to outcomes-based education policy for South Africa all these matters have to be taken into account.

The effect of policy implementation must be viewed in relation to its impact on its implementers as well as its beneficiaries. Hence, the roles of both educators and learners have to be described in detail. Activities that enable educators and learners to express themselves in relation to outcomes-based education policy are: reflective teaching practice; multicultural classrooms; possible outcomes of learning; teaching strategies and teaching methods; and lesson planning and preparation. Moreover, the roles of educators and learners as dictated to or in keeping with outcomes-based education policy has to be explained. The rationale for this explanation is to indicate the extent to which the implementation of outcomes-based education policy brought about change in teaching and learning. Furthermore, from the description of roles of educators and learners one can deduce the impact of the public policy implemented. In addition, it is possible to see whether the initial intended objectives of the policy have been realised or not. Therefore, the roles of educators and learners serve as barometers to indicate the extent to which the objectives of the outcomes-based education policy have been achieved or not.

To ensure that a public policy is successfully implemented, there is a need for a guide to implementation in the form of a public policy implementation model. Hence, a public policy implementation model for South African outcomes-based education is proposed. Initially policy analysis techniques are explained. Four policy analysis bases are ex-
plained, namely, cost-benefit analysis, decision analysis, simulations and models, and experimental analysis. Implications of policy analysis techniques are indicated with regard to the model, followed by an explanation of the national curriculum statement. Aspects that are addressed include outcomes-based education, learning areas statement, learning programmes, time allocations, assessment, educator and learner. The impact of the national curriculum statement on the model is explained. A further component of the model is the management of the implementation process. Regarding the latter, personnel, financing, procedural arrangements, control and accountability, and organising are described as building blocks of the model. Monitoring and evaluation are explained in relation to policy implementation. The study contributes in particular to the successful implementation of outcomes-based education through the application of an implementation model. This could also apply to public policy management in general.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It is humane to acknowledge contributions that people made in various and varied ways towards completion of an important assignment. It is also in keeping with human nature to express one’s profound gratitude to the individuals who wholeheartedly assisted one to accomplish a marvellous achievement. Helping a candidate to complete a thesis is by all standards no small contribution. Therefore, it is prudent to mention those special individuals and to indicate their specific contributions towards the completion of a thesis. Furthermore, it is spiritually gratifying to acknowledge assistance received.

First and foremost, I would like to acknowledge the encouragement and sympathetic support I received from my promoter, Prof. Nico Roux, and my co-promoters, Prof. Chris Thornhill and Prof. Petrus Brynard, for a period of four years as I worked very hard undertaking this research project. I feel morally and duty-bound to openly acknowledge their scholarly advice, unfailing patience and readiness to help to me unlimitedly. Without their support, it would have been impossible for me to complete the research, especially taking into account my academic background which is inclined to Education. Through their assistance I was able to focus on public policy and policy analysis as the research demanded.

I would like to acknowledge encouragement I received from Prof. J.J.N. Cloete. From time to time he enquired about the progress I made towards the completion of the research. He did not hesitate to speak strongly with me if there was slow progress. He, undoubtedly, acted as my mentor, and for that, my thanks are more than words can tell.

This thesis was typed by Ms Lynette Albrecht. She, too, contributed in no small way towards the completion of the research. For her contribution, I would like to place on record my sincere thanks.
Family plays a crucial role in one's studies. My family contributed vastly to the completion of my studies by encouragement and creating an enabling environment for me to study. I would like to place on record my profound gratitude to my parents, Sentsho Caizer and Mmapula Freda, for the sacrifices they made for my education and for encouraging me to study hard. Unfortunately, both of them have passed away. Last, but not least, I would like to thank my dear wife, Dorothy, and my children, Abel, Rebecca, Reorapetse, Tshepang and Frederica for their support.
# TABLE OF CONTENT

## CHAPTER 1: RESEARCH PROBLEM AND RESEARCH DESIGN

1.1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................... 1
1.2 INTRODUCTORY OVERVIEW ..................................................................................... 1
1.3 FRAME OF REFERENCE ............................................................................................... 5
1.4 OBJECTIVE OF STUDY AND PROBLEM STATEMENT .............................................. 6
   1.4.1 Objective of study ............................................................................................... 7
   1.4.2 Problem statement .............................................................................................. 8
1.5 RESEARCH METHOD AND DESIGN ......................................................................... 10
1.6 DEFINITION OF KEY CONCEPTS ............................................................................. 11
1.7 STRUCTURE OF RESEARCH ..................................................................................... 19
1.8 CONCLUSION .............................................................................................................. 22

## CHAPTER 2: POLICY DIRECTIVES FOR OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION: A HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE

2.1 INTRODUCTION .......................................................................................................... 23
2.2 JUSTIFICATION FOR OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION .......................................... 24
   2.2.1 Regional and homeland administration .............................................................. 26
   2.2.2 The elimination of missionary control ................................................................. 27
   2.2.3 Decline in quality of education ......................................................................... 27
2.3 DEFINING OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION .......................................................... 29
2.4 ROOTS OF OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION ........................................................ 33
   2.4.1 Educational objectives ........................................................................................ 36
   2.4.2 Competency-based education .............................................................................. 36
   2.4.3 Mastery learning .................................................................................................. 38
   2.4.4 Criterion-referenced assessment ......................................................................... 40
2.5 CHARACTERISTICS OF OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION ................................. 41
2.6 ADVANTAGES OF OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION ..................................... 44
2.7 TYPES OF OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION ...................................................... 46
2.8 ORIGINS AND POLICY DIRECTIVES FOR SOUTH AFRICAN OUTCOMES-
BASED EDUCATION

2.8.1 Objectives of the national education policy ....................................................... 51
2.8.2 Policy preparation requirements ........................................................................ 53
2.8.3 Monitoring and evaluation of education ............................................................... 55
2.8.4 Council of Education Ministers ......................................................................... 56
2.8.5 Heads of Education Departments Committee .................................................... 57
2.8.6 Consultative bodies ............................................................................................. 58
2.8.7 Implementation policies ...................................................................................... 60
2.8.8 Outcomes of outcomes-based education ............................................................. 61
2.8.9 Monitoring directives .......................................................................................... 62
2.8.10 Outcomes-based education: South Africa’s choice ............................................. 63

(a) Status of outcomes-based education in South Africa ........................................... 63
(b) South African Qualifications Authority Act, 1995 (Act 58 of 1995) ............. 67

2.9 CONCLUSION ......................................................................................................... 74

CHAPTER 3: POLICY AND POLICY ANALYSIS ......................................................... 76

3.1 INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................... 76
3.2 POLICY AND PUBLIC POLICY DEFINED .............................................................. 76
3.3 POLICY FORMULATION ....................................................................................... 79

3.3.1 Establishment of the context .............................................................................. 80
3.3.2 Formulation of the problem ............................................................................... 81
3.3.3 Search for alternative solutions ......................................................................... 81
3.3.4 Setting the policy ................................................................................................ 82
3.3.5 Context of policy-making and implementation .................................................. 83

3.4 TYPES OF POLICIES ........................................................................................... 87
3.5 ROLEPLAYERS AND FACTORS IN POLICY FORMULATION......................... 91

3.5.1 The public bureaucracy .............................................................. 92
3.5.2 Think tanks and shadow cabinets ............................................. 94
3.5.3 Interest groups ........................................................................ 95
3.5.4 Members of legislatures .......................................................... 96
3.5.5 Circumstances or the environment ........................................... 97
3.5.6 Needs and expectations of the population .................................... 99
3.5.7 Policies of political parties .................................................... 100

3.6 POLICY ANALYSIS................................................................................. 101

3.6.1 Origins of policy analysis .......................................................... 101
3.6.2 Defining Policy Analysis ............................................................ 103
3.6.3 The scope of Policy Analysis ..................................................... 110

3.7 POLICY IMPLEMENTATION.................................................................... 112

3.7.1 Factors to be considered in policy implementation ................... 115

(a) Legislation ................................................................................ 115
(b) Policy issues ........................................................................ 116
(c) Political setting ...................................................................... 117
(d) Interest group ...................................................................... 118
(e) The institutional setting ......................................................... 119
(f) Institutional disunity .............................................................. 120
(g) Standard operating procedures ............................................. 121
(h) Organisational communication ........................................... 122
(i) Time problems .................................................................... 123
(j) Incomplete and inaccurate public planning ............................. 124
(k) Interinstitutional politics within public institutions ................. 125

3.8 CRITICAL VARIABLES FOR STUDYING POLICY IMPLEMENTATION ...... 127

3.8.1 Content ................................................................................ 127
3.8.2 Context ............................................................................... 128
3.8.3 Commitment ....................................................................... 128
3.8.4 Capacity ............................................................................. 128
3.8.5 Clients and coalitions ......................................................... 131

3.9 MONITORING POLICY OUTCOMES.................................................... 132
3.10 POLICY EVALUATION ................................................................. 137
3.10.1 Defining policy evaluation ................................................... 137
3.10.2 Reasons for policy evaluation .............................................. 139
3.10.3 Policy evaluation foci ......................................................... 141
3.10.4 Evaluation decision ........................................................... 142
3.10.5 Evaluation design ............................................................... 144
3.10.6 Types of evaluation ............................................................ 144
3.10.7 Evaluation management ...................................................... 147
3.10.8 Requirements for effective policy evaluation ......................... 151
3.10.9 Assessing policy outcomes or impacts .................................. 152
3.10.10 Responsibility for evaluation ............................................. 157
3.10.11 Evaluation constraints ....................................................... 158
3.10.12 Utilisation of evaluation results ............................................ 160

3.11 POLICY ANALYSIS INSTITUTIONS ............................................. 162
3.11.1 Functions of policy analysis institutions ............................... 164
3.11.2 Possible contributions of research to policy ......................... 167
3.11.3 Centre for Policy Research in Education: An overview ............ 169

3.12 CONCLUSION .................................................................................. 177

CHAPTER 4: ROLES OF EDUCATORS AND LEARNERS IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITIES ........................................ 179

4.1 INTRODUCTION ............................................................................... 179
4.2 REFLECTIVE TEACHING PRACTICE ........................................... 180
4.3 MULTICULTURAL CLASSROOMS ................................................... 181
4.4 POSSIBLE OUTCOMES OF LEARNING ........................................ 187
4.5 TEACHING STRATEGIES ................................................................. 195
4.5.1 Deductive and inductive teaching strategies ............................. 196
4.5.2 Co-operative learning as a teaching strategy ............................ 198
4.5.3 Problem-solving as a teaching strategy ................................... 206
4.6 LESSON PLANNING AND PREPARATION .................................... 212
4.7 ROLES OF EDUCATORS AND LEARNERS ................................. 222
4.8 CONCLUSION .................................................................................. 229
CHAPTER 5: COMPLEXITIES OF IMPLEMENTATION OF OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION ................................................................. 231

5.1 INTRODUCTION ................................................................................... 231

5.2 CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT ................................................................ 232

5.2.1 Definitions............................................................................... 233
5.2.2 Characteristics of a curriculum .................................................. 235
5.2.3 Curriculum orientations and perspectives................................... 236
5.2.4 Curriculum organisation............................................................ 237

5.3 ASSESSMENT ....................................................................................... 241

5.3.1 Assessment of outcomes-based learning.................................... 242
5.3.2 Purpose of assessment............................................................. 246
5.3.3 Principles of assessment........................................................... 250
5.3.4 Developmental assessment....................................................... 257
5.3.5 Assessment methods ............................................................... 261
5.3.6 Continuous assessment............................................................ 263
5.3.7 Features of continuous assessment ........................................... 265
5.3.8 Criteria/assessment standards .................................................. 266
5.3.9 Criterion referencing and norm referencing............................... 267

(a) Issues to be assessed .................................................................. 269
(b) Timing of assessment .................................................................. 269
(c) Persons responsible for assessment .......................................... 269
(d) Methods of assessment ............................................................... 270

5.3.10 How to record and report ........................................................ 271

5.4 CRITIQUE OF OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION................................. 276

5.5 CONCLUSION.......................................................................................... 293

CHAPTER 6: POLICY IMPLEMENTATION MODEL FOR SOUTH AFRICAN OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION 295

6.1 INTRODUCTION ................................................................................... 295

6.2 POLICY ANALYSIS TECHNIQUES ...................................................... 295

6.2.1 Cost-benefit analysis ................................................................ 296
6.2.2 Decision analysis ..................................................................... 302
6.2.3 Simulations and models ............................................................ 305
6.2.4 Experimental analysis ............................................................... 307
6.2.5 Policy analysis techniques: Implications for policy implement-
tation 310

6.3 THE NATIONAL CURRICULUM STATEMENT ................................. 313
6.3.1 Outcomes-based Education .......................................................... 313
6.3.2 Revised National Curriculum Statement: Learning Areas
Statements ................................................................................... 314
6.3.3 Revised National Curriculum Statement: Learning
Programmes .................................................................................. 314
6.3.4 Time allocations ........................................................................ 315
6.3.5 Assessment ............................................................................... 316
6.3.6 Envisaged educator ................................................................... 316
6.3.7 Envisaged learner ..................................................................... 316
6.3.8 The National Curriculum Statement: Implications for policy
implementation .............................................................................. 316

6.4 MANAGEMENT OF THE IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS ...................... 317
6.4.1 Human Resources ...................................................................... 317
   (a) Leadership ............................................................................... 318
   (b) Position classification .............................................................. 319
   (c) Training and development ....................................................... 321
   (d) Ethics in the public service ....................................................... 323
   (e) Human Resources: Implications for policy
       implementation ......................................................................... 324
6.4.2 Financing .................................................................................. 326
   (a) Organisational arrangements .................................................... 326
   (b) Budget .................................................................................... 327
   (c) Control .................................................................................... 332
   (d) Financing: Implications for policy implementation ................. 334
6.4.3 Procedural arrangements ............................................................... 335
   (a) Development of work procedures ............................................. 335
   (b) Necessity for formal procedures .............................................. 336
   (c) Factors that necessitate the revision of procedures .................. 338
   (d) Procedural arrangements: Implications for policy
       implementation ......................................................................... 339
6.4.4 Control and accountability ........................................................................ 340
   (a) Internal control ....................................................................................... 340
   (b) Accountability ......................................................................................... 344
   (c) Control and accountability: Implications for policy implementation ....... 345

6.4.5 Organising ............................................................................................... 346
   (a) Internal organisational arrangements ..................................................... 348
   (b) Human dimension of organisation: Organisational development .......... 349
   (c) Organising: Implications for policy implementation ......................... 352

6.5 MONITORING AND EVALUATION .............................................................. 353
   6.5.1 Monitoring and evaluation: Implications for policy implementation .... 353

6.6 POLICY IMPLEMENTATION MODEL: OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION ...... 355

6.7 CONCLUSION ............................................................................................. 367

CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .................................... 369

BIBLIOGRAPHY ............................................................................................... 383
   Books ............................................................................................................ 383
   Journals ........................................................................................................ 397
   Newspapers .................................................................................................. 401
   Official Publications ..................................................................................... 401
   Conference/Seminar .................................................................................... 403
   Dissertations ................................................................................................. 404
   Electronic Sources ....................................................................................... 404
   Video ............................................................................................................. 404
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1: Policy-making cycle................................................................. 104
Figure 3.2: Policy analysis by problem type.............................................. 110
Figure 6.1: Decision tree for purchasing a car ......................................... 303
## LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: The structure of the National Qualifications Framework................. 69
Table 3.1: Policy analysis by activity.......................................................... 111
Table 3.2: Basic methods by steps in the policy analysis process ................. 149
Table 3.3: Data collection methods for formative evaluation ....................... 150
Table 3.4: Social impact assessment: General methodology ....................... 154
Table 3.5: The revised social assessment process ...................................... 155
Table 4.1: Instructional activities for educators .......................................... 192
Table 5.1: The sift from content measurement to performance assessment 258
Table 6.1: Helicopter patrol cost-benefit analysis........................................ 296
Table 6.2: Human Resources expenditure for education by province......... 331