Utilization of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) for education in South Africa: An examination of the World Links for Development (WOrlD) programme

Gbagidi Hillar Komla Addo

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (DPhil) in Information Science in the Faculty of Engineering, Built Environment and Information Technology, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, South Africa

May 2003

Supervisor: Prof. Dr J.C. Cronje
DECLARATION

I, Hillar Addo, hereby declare that this thesis is a product of my own work, unless stated otherwise. I also declare that this thesis has not been submitted at any other university for the purpose of a degree.

Candidate:
Signed

Supervisor:
Signed
DEDICATION

This work is dedicated to my wife, Emily, and children, Mawuli, Edem and Kafui, for their understanding and support during the long and frequent absence of Pappa.
SUMMARY

South Africa was a recipient of the World Bank’s World Links for Development (WorLD) pilot programme (1997-2001) as part of the bank’s education projects in developing countries. The project sought to assist developing countries integrate information and communication technology (ICT) into their education systems and develop their youth to operate in a globalizing knowledge economy.

This study investigated concerns of WorLD project teachers in KwaZulu-Natal regarding the lack of achievement in project outcomes, and hence ICT impact in project schools in South Africa.

It was established by the study that ICT was not only an educational tool but also a driving mechanism for socio-economic development in a globalizing knowledge economy.

The study found that though educators in the WorLD schools in South Africa were adequately trained in computer application programmes and collaborative school projects, learners were not provided with such skills due to educators not having time to do so. Lack of technical training also inhibited computer access, hence the project from proceeding to the levels of integrating ICT into the curriculum.

This study established that, WorLD school project educators in South Africa were not familiar with, trained in and do not use most teaching methods that support integration of ICT in education. A preponderance of a chalk and talk pedagogy existed as the popular model in rural South African schools where this study was conducted.

The study found a strong correlation between ICT and other information resources for teaching and learning. In spite of this, the majority of WorLD schools in South Africa during the project phase had less than the minimum requirements of the pre-requisite information resources, namely computer networked laboratories, Internet access, libraries, media teachers and multimedia centres, to effect an ICT education. Marginalization of the school librarian created difficulties in the integration of ICTs into the curriculum in WorLD schools.
There was hardly time for educators to deliver on WorLD projects, even though teachers had acquired the skills and confidence to do so. Where educators braved the situation, project activities had a negative impact on their normal teaching duties.

The majority of WorLD learners could read, that is access information from books, and write without assistance. Reading problems were acute where they existed and only a few learners could read and access information from the Internet without assistance.

Though many WorLD educators and learners had used a multimedia system and are positive that the tool can assist in ICT education, none of the schools had the minimum ICT requirements to utilise such a system.

A positive spin-off of the project was that educators and learners in WorLD schools have been equipped with new skills and modern insights into education. Learners have been exposed to new learning methods and have been equipped with skills which they will utilize in work situations and for further education. WorLD educators have also been equipped with modern teaching methods and tools.

A model was proposed as a basis of evaluating the WorLD project outcomes and impact. This could be used in evaluating other ICT in education or e-learning projects in Africa.

**Keywords:** Computer-based pedagogy; disadvantaged communities; education; evaluation; ICT; information and communication technology; project; technology-enhanced learning; E-learning; World links for development (WorLD) programme.
ABSTRACT

South Africa was a recipient of the World Bank’s World Links for Development (WorLD) pilot programme (1997-2001) which is part of the bank’s educational projects in developing countries.

In 2000, at the end of the pilot phase of the project, some teachers in a number of WorLD schools in KwaZulu-Natal, one of the provinces in which the projects were sited, expressed concern at the lack of achievement in project outcomes, and hence ICT impact in their schools.

This study investigated whether concerns of WorLD project teachers in KwaZulu-Natal prevailed in other WorLD project schools in South Africa or not. An evaluative research method was used to investigate benchmarks developed as possible indicators to achieve project objectives.

The study found that despite the key role of ICT in improving the quality and delivery of education globally, imperatives to achieving educational outcomes, such as access to computers and Internet networking, training of educators and learners, and a supportive working environment were still unavailable to education role players in disadvantaged community schools in South Africa.

The study concluded that educators in WorLD schools have been equipped with new skills and modern insights into education. Learners have been exposed to new learning methods and have been equipped with skills which they will utilize in work situations and for further education. However the project failed to achieve a great proportion of its outcomes and impact.

The study recommended that the issues that have impeded achieving the objectives of the WorLD project be addressed through a national ICT education policy to achieve future outcomes and impact.
A model was proposed as a basis of evaluating the WorLD project outcomes and impact, which could be used for other ICT education projects in South Africa and in other African communities on the continent.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere thanks to a number of people who made it possible for me to undertake this study.

My very special thanks goes to my supervisor, Prof. Dr. Johannes Cronje, for his academic support, direction and guidance.

I would like to express my profound thanks to Dr Mike Van de Linde, who personally guided the data processing aspect of the study and developed a computer system that literally counted and apportioned the research data. I also wish to thank Miss Liebie Louw, for guidance in research methodology and a special thanks to all those teachers and students who took time to answer the questionnaires.

Finally sincere thanks to Randy Navunda and also to the staff of the Department of Information Science, University of Pretoria for the support and encouragement.
# Table Of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Declaration</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dedication</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of contents</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of acronyms</td>
<td>xviii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 The World Links for Development programme .......................... 1
1.2 Introduction ....................................................................... 2
1.3 Background to the problem .............................................. 2
  1.3.1 Researcher’s observations ........................................ 2
  1.3.2 The role of information and communication technology in education ................................. 3
  1.3.3 ICT for education in South Africa ................................ 4
  1.3.4 Efforts to equip South African schools with ICT .............. 5
1.4 Problem statement ................................................................ 6
1.5 Purpose of the study ........................................................ 7
1.6 Objectives of the study ..................................................... 7
1.7 Research questions ................................................................ 8
1.8 Justification of the study .................................................. 8
1.9 Scope and limitations of the study and its context in relation to other studies .................................................. 11
  1.9.1 Scope of the study in relation to the WorLD programme .......... 11
  1.9.2 Context in relation to other studies ................................ 11
  1.9.3 Limitations of the study .............................................. 14
1.10 Product .............................................................................. 14
1.11 Organization of thesis ...................................................... 15
1.12 Summary ............................................................................ 15
Chapter 2: Literature Review

2.1 Introduction ................................................................. 16

2.2 How relevant is information and communication technology (ICT) in education? ......................................................... 17

  2.2.1 What is the socially determined rationale of utilizing ICT in education? .......................................................... 18
  2.2.2 How relevant are computers in schools? .......................... 20

    2.2.2.1 How do computers enhance teaching and learning in schools? ............................................................ 21
    2.2.2.2 How do computers enhance access to information for education? ...................................................... 22
    2.2.2.3 Do computers contribute to distance and collaborative education? ...................................................... 22

  2.2.3 Barriers to utilizing ICT in the social context in developing countries .............................................................. 24

2.3 How successful was the training provided to teachers and students in WorLD schools to enable them to utilize computers for collaborative school projects? ................................................. 26

  2.3.1 Pedagogical skills for utilizing computers in education ...... 26
  2.3.2 Training required to effect computer assisted education ...... 27
  2.3.3 Computer skills .......................................................... 29

    2.3.3.1 Technical computer skills ........................................ 30
  2.3.4 Information skills ....................................................... 31

2.4 What information resources (computer laboratories, Internet, libraries, multimedia centres) exist in the schools and do the schools have media teachers? ............................................. 34

  2.4.1 Direction regarding school resource situation for ICT education ............................................................ 34
  2.4.2 What is the school resource situation for ICT education in South Africa? ...................................................... 35
  2.4.3 What role can the teacher librarian play in ensuring the use of ICT in schools? .................................................. 39
2.5 To what extent are computer teachers able to handle school computer projects, attend to computer systems and attend to their normal school lessons in South Africa? ________________________________ 40

2.5.1 What is the situation regarding computer teachers in schools in South Africa? ________________________________ 40

2.5.1.1 Teaching of computer skills in schools in South Africa ______ 40
2.5.1.2 Computer Studies as a formal school subject in schools in South Africa ________________________________ 41

2.5.2 Time as a factor for teachers to deliver on WorLD projects ________ 41

2.6 What is the literacy level of WorLD schools pupils in terms of reading, accessing and using information in the English language? __________ 42

2.6.1 Is the lack of resources a possible factor causing low language proficiency in English in many South African schools? ________ 42

2.7 How far can multimedia fill the gap in the utilization of ICT in South African WorLD schools? ________________________________ 44

2.7.1 What is the educational relevance of multimedia? ______________ 44
2.7.2 What multimedia equipment is required to effect ICT education? __ 46

2.8 Which other factors contribute to the success or failure of the WorLD programme in South Africa? ________________________________ 47

2.8.1 Lessons drawn from school ICT projects across the world and South Africa ________________________________ 47

2.8.1.1 Lessons form case studies of the Acacia initiative ________ 47
2.8.1.2 Lessons from ICT projects in South Africa ___________ 48
2.8.1.2.1 SchoolNetSA projects ................................. 48
2.8.1.2.2 Lessons from environmental education school ICT project in KwaZulu-Natal ........................................... 49
2.8.1.3 Lessons from (WorLD) programme evaluation research on Chile, Paraguay, Peru, Senegal and Uganda ................. 49

2.8.2 What other challenges are likely to hinder the utilization of ICT in education in African communities? ................................. 50

2.8.2.1 Challenges regarding the lack of national policy .......... 50
2.8.2.2 Challenges regarding ownership of knowledge and technology ................................................................. 50
2.8.2.3 Lack of developed local knowledge systems as a challenge to ICT education in developing countries ....................... 53
2.8.2.4 Arguments against the use of ICT in education ............ 53

2.9 Summary ............................................................ 56

Chapter 3: Research Methodology

3.1 Introduction ....................................................... 57
3.2 Literature search and review ................................... 57
3.3 Research methods employed in the study ....................... 58
    3.3.1 The survey method ........................................... 58
    3.3.2 Evaluative study ............................................. 59

    3.3.2.1 Types of evaluation approaches used in this study ...... 59

3.4 Data collection method and technique ........................... 60
    3.4.1 Data collection matrix ......................................... 61
    3.4.2 The self-administered questionnaire ........................ 62
3.4.2.1 Format of questionnaire ......................................... 63
3.4.2.2 Overview of questions in the questionnaires ............... 64

3.4.3 Pre-test for validity and reliability .................................. 65

3.5 Research population ..................................................... 66
3.5.1 Sampling .................................................................. 67
    3.5.1.1 Stratified random sampling .................................... 67

3.6 Data analysis .................................................................. 70
3.6.1 Data presentation and analysis ..................................... 70
3.6.2 Coding of data ............................................................ 70
    3.6.2.1 Coding of closed questions .................................. 70
    3.6.2.2 Coding of open questions .................................... 71

3.7 Summary ...................................................................... 71

Chapter 4: Data Presentation and Analysis

4.1 Introduction .................................................................... 72

4.2 Teacher/school data ...................................................... 72
    4.2.1 Background information of project teachers and learners ...... 73
    4.2.2 Students’ background data ....................................... 74

4.3 Data covering research questions .................................... 75
4.3.1 Training for the WorLD project ................................... 75
    4.3.1.1 Training of WorLD teachers for the WorLD programme .... 76
        1. Computer literacy training ........................................... 76
        2. Technical computer skills .......................................... 77
        3. Pedagogical skills .................................................... 79
        4. Collaboratory skills ................................................. 81
    4.3.1.2 Training for learners for the WorLD programme ........ 83
4.3.2 WorLD school resource situation____________________________88

4.3.2.1 Other technology present and used in WorLD schools___________91
4.3.2.2 Computer operating systems in WorLD schools________________93

4.3.3 Capacity issues__________________________________________94

4.3.4 Lack of proficiency in the English language as a hindrance to the use of ICT in schools

1. Reading and writing, generally in WorLD schools ________98
2. Accessing information from the Internet ___________ 99

4.3.5 Utilisation of multimedia ________________________________101

4.3.5.1 Utilization of multimedia by learners________________________102

4.3.6 Benefits and challenges of the WorLD programme__________103

1. Benefits of the project to WorLD schools ________________103
2. Challenges posed by the project to WorLD schools _______104
3. Improving upon the use of computers in schools _________106

4.3.6.1 Use of computers for learning ________________________106
4.3.6.2 Using computers for education advantages and challenges _____107

Chapter 5: Interpretation of Data

5.1 Introduction _____________________________________________109

5.2 How successful was the training provided to teachers and learners in WorLD schools (in terms of enabling them to utilize computers for collaborative school projects)? __________________________110

5.2.1 Training of teachers________________________________________110
5.2.2 Training of learners________________________________________112

5.2.3 How far does the existing pedagogy in WorLD schools support Computer-based teaching? ________________________________114

5.3 What information resources (computer laboratories, Internet, libraries, multimedia centres) exist in the school, and do the schools have media teachers? _____116

5.4 To what extent are the WorLD teachers able to handle school projects, attend to computer systems and teach their normal school lessons? __________118

5.5 What is the literacy level of WorLD school pupils in terms of reading and accessing and using information in the English language? ______________120
Chapter 6: Summary of study findings, conclusions and recommendations

6.1 Introduction ........................................................................... 130

6.2 Summary of findings ................................................................. 131

6.2.1 From the literature it has been established that:.................... 131

6.2.2 Training of educators and learners ....................................... 132

6.2.3 ICT pedagogy in WorLD schools ......................................... 133

6.2.4 School information resources ............................................ 133

6.2.5 Teachers’ capacity to deliver on WorLD projects.................. 134

6.2.6 Literacy effect of the WorLD project on learners .................. 134

6.2.7 Multimedia filling the gaps ................................................ 135

6.2.8 Success factors ................................................................. 135

6.2.9 Challenge factors .............................................................. 135

6.3 Conclusions ............................................................................ 136

6.3.1 Achievements....................................................................... 136

6.3.2 Failures ............................................................................... 136

6.3.2.1 Learners skilled in computer application systems ............... 137

6.3.2.2 Teachers’ use of technical skills ...................................... 137

6.3.2.3 Teachers’ use of Internet resources for education ............. 137

6.3.2.4 Teachers utilize new methods for teaching ....................... 137

6.3.2.5 Learners use of Internet Resources ................................ 138

6.3.2.6 Learners’ interactive, collaborative and communication skills developed .................................................. 138

6.3.2.7 Integration of ICT into the curriculum ............................. 138

6.3.2.8 Learners engage in collaborative projects ........................ 139
## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Provincial response rate of WorLD schools in South Africa</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Application in which WorLD teachers were trained</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Computer systems in which WorLD teachers were trained</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Project teacher’s training, knowledge and use of teaching methods</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Number of days and ours in which respondent teachers were trained</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Information technology related training that WorLD and other teachers had access to</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Manner of training WorLD learners</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Applications in which WorLD learners were trained</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>Computer systems in which WorLD learners were trained</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>Resources at schools before WorLD programme was introduced</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>Information resources existing in WorLD schools during the programme</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.12</td>
<td>Other technology used for teaching in WorLD schools</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.13</td>
<td>Other technology used before WorLD programme</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>Support received by WorLD teachers during the programme</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.15</td>
<td>Support received from WorLD school principal</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.16</td>
<td>Range of reading problems in WorLD schools</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.17</td>
<td>Access to equipment/system that supports multimedia</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>An evaluation model of the WorLD project in South Africa</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

Table 1.1 Communication and information resources of WorLD programme African countries ___________________________10
Table 2.1 Labour distribution trends in the United States between 1880 and 2000 ___________________________19
Table 2.2 Labour distribution trends in South Africa between 1880 and 2000 ___________________________19
Table 2.3 Total number of schools in South Africa, number of schools with libraries, telephones, electricity and computers ________________ 36
Table 2.4 Computer networks, Internet connectivity, access and costs of electricity _________________________ 37
Table 3.1 Data collection matrix ________________ 61
Table 3.2 Research population ________________ 66
Table 3.3 Name of school, number of learners and sample range ________________ 69
Table 4.1 Data analysis of background on WorLD school coordinators and Students______________________________________________ 72
Table 4.2 Grades of respondent learners______________________________ 74
Table 4.3 Training provided during the WorLD project______________________________ 75
Table 4.4 Applications in which WorLD teachers were trained ________________ 77
Table 4.5 Computer systems in which WorLD teachers were trained N=8 ________________ 78
Table 4.6 Other teachers on staff who had access to technical skills ICT Training N=7___________________________________________83
Table 4.7 Hours trained per day N=30______________________________ 84
Table 4.8 Number of days trained N=8______________________________85
Table 4.9 Satisfaction with training in computer applications N=44______________________________ 85
Table 4.10 Operating systems learners were trained in. Percentage not satisfied______________________________ 86
Table 4.11 Access to computer to practice after training N=30 ________________ 86
Table 4.12 Manner of training for collaborative school projects N=31 ________________ 87
Table 4.13 WorLD information resource situation questions and data N =8 ________________ 87
Table 4.14 Computers not in working conditions N=8______________________________ 90
Table 4.15 Computers in working conditions N=8______________________________90
Table 4.16 Computers with CDROMS N=8______________________________ 91
Table 4.17 Forms of support received by WorLD schools ________________ 92
Table 4.18 Computer operating systems in WorLD schools N=8 ________________ 93
Table 4.19 Teachers’ capacity situation providing questions asked and data ________________ 94
Table 4.20 Attributes acquired to manage school computer system N=8 ________________ 95
Table 4.21 WorLD teachers’ rating of their ability, time and confidence ________________ 95
Table 4.22 Effects of project on normal classrooms N=8 ________________ 96
Table 4.23 Reasons for lack of support from WorLD school principal N=6 ________________ 97
Table 4.24 Learners English language proficiency level ________________ 98
Table 4.25 Ability to read and write without assistance N=8 ________________ 99
Table 4.26 Ability to read English texts from books N=45 ________________ 100
Table 4.27 Learners’ ability to read from computers and the Internet =45 ________________ 100
Table 4.28 Why reading was not as good as expected N= 18 ________________ 100
Table 4.29 Utilization of multimedia by WorLD schools ________________ 101
Table 4.30 How multimedia aids ICT education___________________________________________ 102
Table 4.31 Benefits and challenges of the WorLD programme data______________ 103
Table 4.32 Benefits of WorLD programme to the project coordinator N=8 104
Table 4.33 Benefits of the WorLD programme to the school N = 8 104
Table 4.34 Challenges of the WorLD programme for teachers N=8 105
Table 4.35 Hindrances posed by the WorLD programme N=8 105
Table 4.36 Future problems N =8 105
Table 4.37 Suggestions to improve upon the use of computers in schools N=8 106
Table 4.38 Frequency of using computers for class exercises N= 44 106
Table 4.39 Collaborative projects that learners were involved in N = 44 106
Table 4.40 How the computer can help improve learners’ studies N= 39 107
Table 4.41 Deriving full benefits from learning with computers N =42 108
Table 4.42 Suggestions to help improve the WorLD programme N= 45 108
Table A1 WorLD sampled schools Teachers and learners 167

List of Acronyms and abbreviations

CAI Computer Assisted Instruction
CAL Computer Assisted Learning
CD ROM Compact Disk Read Only Memory
CK: P Common Knowledge Project in Pittsburg
DOS Disk operating systems
Etc Et Cetera (and so forth)
E.g. Example
GII Global Information Infrastructure
ICT Information and Communication Technology
IT Information Technology
NCET National Council for Educational Technology
NEPI National Educational Policy Investigation
NGOs Non Governmental organizations
OSF Open Society Foundation
TELI Technology-Enhanced learning Investigation
WorLD World links for Development Programme
SACat South African Cathalogue of thesis and Dissertations
SAIDE South African Institute for Distance Education
SchoolNetSA SchoolNet South Africa
SRI Standard Research International
TV Television
UCLA University of California Los Angeles
VCR Video Cassette Recorder
VGA Video Graphics Array
VoIP Voice over Internet Protocol
Windows NT Windows New Technology
WWW World Wide Web

xix