

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

**THE REFORM OF THE COMMUNION SERVICE IN
SOUTH EASTERN DIOCESE OF ELCSA WITH SPECIAL
REFERENCE TO THE UMPUMULO PARISH (1985-1996)**

Douglas Menzi Mamba

Promoter: Professor Graham A. Duncan

**This thesis is submitted in fulfillment of the degree requirements of
The Master of Theology in the Faculty of Theology
University of Pretoria
2006**

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I am indebted to thank my promoter Professor Doctor Graham A. Duncan and Professor Doctor Philippe Denis for supervising me with remarkable patience. If it had not been for them, I would not have finished this thesis.

I like to thank my wife Agnes for encouraging me to finish the thesis even to a point of helping me with some research work. I dedicate this work to her, my son and my two daughters.

I like also to thank my mother, my whole family, my friends “boy” Jabulani Shabalala, Rev. U. Wittmann, Scelo Motsa, Siphon Shabangu and last but not least, my friend from Germany Andrea Schultz who also encouraged me to finish this work.

Above everybody else, I thank God the Almighty for his love and mercy to me. May all praise be to Him.

DECLARATION:

I declare that ‘The Reform of the Communion Service in South Eastern Diocese of ELCSA with special reference to the Umpumulo Parish (1985- 1996)’ is my own work and that all the sources I have used or quoted have been indicated by means of complete references.

Signature

26428467
Student Number

DISSERTATION STATEMENT:

The changes which were introduced between 1992 and 1996, during the leadership of Bishop S.P.Zulu in the Evangelical Lutheran Church in the South Eastern Diocese, brought new liturgical life in the diocese and in the whole of the ELCSA church.

It introduced new liturgical practices in ELCSA, like the burning of incense, use of acolytes and servers, ringing of bells, the processional reading of the Gospel while the congregation standing, wearing of copes by pastors; all of these, were of remarkable change and meaning to the Lutheran membership of the diocese.

These changes were brought by some clergy and laity and supported by Bishop Zulu. They felt a call to revive liturgical worship in the circles of the Lutheran Church.

The application and implementation of the ‘high church’ service however, was not overwhelmingly accepted in the diocese. There were members of the clergy and laity who felt that the Bishop Zulu had colluded with the teachings of the Catholic Church of “transubstantiation.” The consternations which arose thereafter, however, did not affect a breach, though the matter could have had a potential of a schism in the diocese.

The central message of the dissertation focuses on the way how the authorities of the diocese implemented and applied the innovation. It suggests that a consultative approach of the grassroots in regard both to clergy and laity could be employed. The study, on the other hand, recognizes the liturgical stride taken by the SED in influencing and injecting a new liturgical life of community event and participation.

Undersigned by

20 KEY WORDS IN THE DISSERTATION:

‘HIGH CHURCH’

DECISION- MAKING BODY

HOLY COMMUNION

ADMINISTRATION

LITURGY

REFORM

GRASSROOTS

PARTICIPATION

INVOLVEMENT

CHURCH COMMUNITY

WORSHIP

OLD SERVICE

NEW SERVICE

ACOLYTE

INCENSE

BELLS

VESTMENTS

PROCESSION

MINISTER OR PASTOR

LAITY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Introduction	p. 1
	The inception of Lutheranism in South Africa	p.1
	Problem	p.7
	Methodology	p.8
	Assessment of social structure of the interview situation	p.9
	Restructuring the data and omission	p.10
	Cross references	p.10
	Assessment of overall quality and value of the interviews in terms of historical research	p.11
	Outline of chapters one to five	p.12
CHAPTER 1 -	The Holy Communion in the early history of the Lutheran Church in South Africa (1912-1985)	p. 14
	1.0 Introduction	p.14
	1.1 Changes in liturgy made at the time of the Reformation.	p. 14
	1.2 The historical background of Holy Communion in South Africa (1912-1985)	p. 18
	1.3 Conclusion	p. 31
CHAPTER 2	The ‘high church’ communion service in the history of the church	p. 32
	2.0 Introduction	p.32
	2.1 Definition of ‘high church’ liturgy in the context of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa-South Eastern Diocese at Umphumulo	p. 34
	2.2 Outline of the old Sunday Holy Communion Service and the new ‘high church’ Holy Communion Service	p. 36
	2.3 Procession Liturgy	p. 49

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

2.4	Three readings: the Old Testament, the Gospel and the Epistle	p. 52
2.5	The signs of the cross	p.5 4
2.6	Bowing and genuflecting to the altar	p.56
2.7	The passing of the peace	p. 58
2.8	Vestments	p. 59
2.9	Acolytes and servers	p. 63
2.10	Incense	p.64
2.10.1	Incense - Historical use of incense	p. 64
2.10.2	Incense at the Eucharist	p. 67
2.11	Ringling of bells	p. 68
2.12	Conclusion	p.69
CHAPTER 3 -	Calls for liturgical reform (1985-1992)	p. 70
3.0	Introduction	p.70
3.1	The role of the Shiyane Circuit and the appeal for spiritual relevance and discovery in the ‘high church’ liturgy	p. 72
3.2	The challenge of the theology of the Roman Catholic Church and the AIC’s on worship in the ‘high church’ liturgy.	p. 77
3.3	The yearning for change, relevance and the perspectives of the Reformation in the ‘high church’ liturgy	p. 82
3.4	The process of change.	p. 86
3.4.1	The 1992 Diocesan Rally	p.86
3.4.2	The 1993 Diocesan Rally	p. 88
3.4.3	The 1994 Diocesan Rally	p. 89
3.4.4	The 1995 celebration of Jubilee Year	p. 91
3.5	Conclusion	p.93

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

CHAPTER 4	Reception of the liturgical reform at Umphumulo Parish	p. 95
4.0	Introduction	p.95
4.1	Response of the Youth	p. 96
4.2	Response of the Men’s league	p. 102
4.3	Response of the Women’s League	p. 105
4.4	Response of the members of the clergy	p.107
4.5	Conclusion	p.113
CHAPTER 5 -	Conclusion	p. 115
	Bibliography	p. 118
	APPENDIX A	p. 121
	APPENDIX B	p. 126
	APPENDIX C	p. 128
	APPENDIX D	p. 131

Introduction

The inception of Lutheranism in South Africa

Scriba and Lislrud asserted that, many of the white settlers in Cape Town, were granted permission to participate in the services of the Dutch Reformed Church and to take Holy Communion under clearly defined conditions. By the mid-eighteenth century about 28 per cent of the white settlers were Germans, and most of these were Lutherans. From 1741 onwards the Lutherans repeatedly asked the ruling council of policy to let them establish their own congregation. In 1774, they erected their own church in Strand Street, Cape Town, and received permission to hold their own services there in 1779.

Formal mission work among the indigenous inhabitants of South Africa, namely the Khoikhoi, began with the Moravians, a non-denominational community established in Germany in 1722 by Count Nikolaus Ludwig von Zinzendorf, adopting the Lutheran Augsburg Confession as its confessional basis. In July 1737, Georg Schmidt, a 26 year old Moravian missionary, settled at Baviaanskloof, and erected there a simple hut, laid out a garden and began teaching the nearby Khoikhoi. A few years later he baptized five or six converts, thereby offending the Dutch Reformed clergy, who had him expelled from the Cape in 1744. Almost a half century later, in 1792, three Moravian missionaries arrived at Baviaanskloof, discovering to their joy that one of Schmidt's converts, Lena, an old blind woman, was having others read her passages from the Dutch New Testament that Schmidt had given her.¹

¹ G. Scriba G. Lislrud, 1997. "The Lutheran Missions and Churches in South Africa", in R. Elphick R. Davenport. (eds), Christianity in South Africa, (Cape Town: James Currey and David Philip.) Pp. 174-5.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

In the nineteenth century, representatives of nine Lutheran mission societies arrived in South Africa. All these German and Scandinavian societies were founded in the revivalist movements of the early nineteenth century. One such society, the United Rhenish Missionary Society (RMS), was founded in 1828 by twelve pious laymen in Elberfeld, Germany and by participants in similar groups in other Rhineland towns.²

Another of the German mission societies, the Berlin Mission Society (BMS), was founded in 1824, in response to an appeal from prominent Berliners, among them university professors and members of the Prussian Upper classes. More urban in tone than the other Lutheran missions, it was destined to work in the growing towns and cities in South Africa.

Another German society, the Hermannsburg Mission Society (HMS), was founded in 1849 in the small town of Hermannsburg, near Hanover in Germany. Its founder, Ludwig Harms, was a strong critic of rationalism and the eighteenth century enlightenment. His preaching sparked a revival among the farming community that made up his congregation. The HMS founded its first mission station at “Hermannsburg” in Natal in the Zulu Kingdom. At the second station, Ehlanzeni, the mission set up the first seminary for indigenous evangelists in 1870.³

Scriba and Lislrud hold that the Norwegian missions, like their German counterparts, were founded in early nineteenth century revivals and influenced by the precedents of the Moravian missions. One revival was begun by the farmer and merchant Hans Nielsen Hauge, who emphasized bible study, prayer, conversion, and repentance. Another, partly influenced by the Danish pastor –poet N.F.S. Grundtvig, emphasized the pastoral office and

² Ibid.

³ Ibid. p.176

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

divine worship and made an impact upon Norwegian pastors. Haugian and Gruntvigian representatives, along with Moravians, came together in 1842 to found the Norwegian Mission Society (NMS), which developed as a church-oriented and democratic organization within the state church of Norway.⁴

The first NMS missionary to South Africa, Hans Palludan Smith Schreuder arrived in Port Natal on New Year's Day 1844. Denied access to the Zulu Kingdom of Mpande, he founded an influential mission station at Umphumulo north of Durban in 1850. After he had healed Mpande's rheumatism, he was granted land at Empangeni within the Zulu kingdom, where he served as the king's physician. By the time of the Anglo-Zulu War (1878-79), 22 Norwegian mission stations had been established in Zululand. Schreuder, appointed as bishop in 1866, quarreled with the NMS over his episcopal powers, and resigned in 1873. He aligned himself soon after with the Schreuder Mission, which gained support especially amongst the clergy in the Church of Norway, and established friendly contacts with the newly founded Church of Sweden Mission(CSM).⁵

Scriba and Lislrud observed that the Swedish missionaries who came to South Africa were not members of the evangelical, interdenominational Swedish Missionary Society, but rather of the more orthodox and "high church" Church of Sweden Mission (CSM), which was founded in 1874 and had the archbishop as its President. Scriba and Lislrud maintain that the first Swedish missionaries, O.Witt, and C.L.Flygare, who arrived in South Africa in 1876, went to Schreuder's station at Entumeni to study Zulu language and customs. Soon,

⁴ Ibid. 177

⁵ Ibid. 178

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

however, they split with Schruder and opened their own missions in Natal Zululand. In 1878, the Swedish Home Board established its first mission station, Oscarsberg, at Rorke's Drift. Its first indigenous worker, Joseph Zulu, a refugee from the Zulu royal house, received his training in Sweden and returned in Natal as an evangelist and teacher; in 1901, during a second visit to Sweden, he was ordained. In 1902 the CSM began to minister to Zulus in Johannesburg, many of them Lutherans, who had found employment in the Witwatersrand mines. Thus Lutheranism did not remain entirely attached to its rural roots.⁶

Achieving unity in the Lutheran Church has been and still is a difficult process. As it has been mentioned above that the Lutheran Church was planted in Africa by mission societies from Europe and America, which were the Berlin Mission Society, the American Mission Board, the Norwegian Mission Society, the Church of Sweden Mission and the Hermannsburg Mission Society; they had different constitutions, clerical vestures and liturgies.

When the synods established by these missions in Natal merged in 1960 to form the Evangelical Lutheran Church in South Africa (South Eastern Region), the liturgy was one of the major instruments to bring different Lutherans together. Other regional churches were formed: ELCSA (Cape Orange Region), ELCSA (Transvaal Region), and ELCSA (Tswana Region). The altar books, which were developed in these Regional Churches, were used for a long time without being changed or developed. In 1975, when the Regional churches merged into one church called the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern

⁶ Ibid

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Africa (ELCSA), some strides to develop the liturgy were taken, especially the liturgy of the Holy Communion.

This thesis focuses on the reforms that took place between 1985 and 1992 and from 1992 to 1996. It will also critically evaluate the impact made by the changes upon congregational life in the Umphumulo Parish. The study begins in 1985, when the youth of the Durban Circuit sent their complaints about the coldness and rigidity of the old ELCSA liturgy to Bishop L.E. Dlamini. The study ends in 1996, the year when Bishop S.P. Zulu took his retirement from his office as Bishop of the South Eastern Diocese. In the time of Bishop S.P. Zulu, remarkable liturgical changes had been introduced.

Due to its Catholic associations, the term ‘high church’ is not common in the Lutheran Churches. An exception is the Church of Sweden whose concept of ‘high church’ was introduced in the South Eastern Diocese of ELCSA. This implied additions to the old liturgy which was inherited from the regional churches, namely, the signing with the cross by clergy and laity, the use of clerical vestments like copes, albs, cassocks and stoles, the use of acolytes and servers, the burning of incense and the ringing of bells during the Holy Communion service. These reforms caused considerable consternation in some circles.

Umphumulo Parish is situated in the vicinity of the Diocesan centre of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa –South Eastern Diocese in KwaZulu-Natal near Kranskop, where diocesan church decisions are made and where ordinations and diocesan

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

rallies are held. Umphumulo Parish, therefore, becomes the first parish to witness new liturgical changes.

In the thesis I am attempting to critically identify the liturgical development in the Lutheran Church at parish level as a source of information.

Secondly, I want to draw the attention of the diocese to the positive and negative effects involved in bringing about such changes in the church, especially as these changes and developments emanate from the higher structures and filter down to the grassroots level, that is, the congregation.

Thirdly, I am trying to examine and clarify the perceptions that some people have, both clergy and laity, namely that through these reforms, the liturgical tradition of the Lutheran Church is eroded and through the back door, the hierarchy of the church introduces the Roman Catholic dogma of “transubstantiation”.

Fourthly, I want to examine the socio-religious meaning of Holy Communion in the Lutheran Church, and determine how it transforms the community of Umphumulo. Lastly, as a person involved in theological training, I desire students to be equipped with the understanding that proper church development should begin from below and be shaped by the grassroots together with the hierarchy.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

There are numerous dogmatic works on worship in the Lutheran tradition. However, there are no historical critical analyses of liturgical development in ELCSA. Moreover, I aim to investigate these changes from the perspective of the grassroots people, and both clergy laity and, how the changes affect them.

Problem.

The problem articulated in this thesis is that the introduction of the ‘high church’ service at Umphumulo Parish has caused liturgical disorder and confusion in the South Eastern Diocese of the Lutheran Church.

The development of a liturgy as such was something that should have been accepted with great enthusiasm and as a legitimate and essential movement. It is something that shows vitality and growth of spirituality in the church. The involvement of the youth as acolytes, for instance, aims at the liturgical service as not a one man’s show, but rather a community event.

However, in the thesis, it is hypothetically assumed that the development of the liturgy had by and large been imposed by the diocesan structures upon the lower structures. This could be attested by the fact that, most members of the clergy, who are the practitioners of liturgy in their parishes, were not involved in the introduction and implementation of the new liturgy, hence, the research demonstrates their disapproval of the way the liturgy was introduced. The diocesan decisions came through the committee on liturgy and hymnal and were communicated to the Ministerial and Diocesan Council for implementation. Further,

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

since the process of liturgical development did not involve the grassroots level, it led to the silent resistance of some pastors and lay people, including the parish pastor of Umphumulo parish at that time.

The most important contribution of the study would be to find understanding and co-operation between old folks, who feel as strangers in the church of their birth, and the already developing liturgy which appears to them Catholic in form and content.

Methodology

The methodological approach to be followed in the thesis will be to look into literature on liturgy and unpublished material like workshop handouts, diocesan, circuit and parish minutes. I shall examine documents presented by the Church Council of ELCSA and the Diocesan Council of the South Eastern Diocese (SED) on liturgy and hymnal. Diocesan archives will be researched on liturgical worship documents. I shall also use the Lutheran Theological Seminary archives for information.

The second methodology to be used is oral research. Oral interviews would be conducted with the bishops S.P. Zulu and L. Sibiya, with deans, pastors, congregational and parish council members, students of the seminary and with ordinary members of Umphumulo Parish.

I use oral research methodology in my research on the basis that oral research has an enormous contribution to the study of Church History in particular. Oral research is subjective. It is participatory history in the sense that the interviews themselves were engaged in the history making.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Assessment of the social structure of the interviews situation

The study demanded a predominant use of pastors, deans and bishops of the Lutheran Church in the South Eastern Diocese in KwaZulu-Natal exclusively because liturgy is mainly practiced and understood by the pastors. They would have the liturgical insights as to what transpired in the liturgical changes.

According to the understanding of some of the pastors, though it cannot be generalized, there were those who had an apt theological understanding, while others bore emotional experiences they acquired from the time they spent with mission societies they were attached to.

The elderly pastors appeared to be strongly opposed to the innovation because they did not want to betray their past missionary experiences, and at the same time they did not understand why an elderly bishop like Zulu adopted such a change, which to their understanding did not bear Lutheran traditions.

A seemingly ambiguous state was that of the interviewer himself; as a pastor in the same church, I was not very clear as to which side to follow. Sometimes I felt passionate about the new practice and on the other hand recognized the confusion caused by the abrupt changes to the congregants. The challenging factor was on the question how I conducted the study itself, especially that I did not have my influence upon the people, particularly the laity. Sometimes I felt that the interviewees too, were not clear as to which side did I drive them. This dilemma cleared itself as we went along with the interview. I learned from the questions I asked that the study itself on the point of the interviewer required, authenticity, honesty and subjectivity since it deals with fundamental questions of the informant's spiritual life, which has the liturgy in the centre of their Christian worship.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Restructuring the Data and Omission

I perceived that the pastors, despite being members of the Lutheran Church spoke from original perspective without reading from books or some articles of some sort. They spoke their minds critically. I realized that the informants were expressing their authentic views as they were, showing enthusiasm and a great interest at the subject topic.

I realized, too, that some of the pastors were not hesitant to openly criticize the bishop and the protagonist pastors of the ‘high church’ liturgy. On the other hand, however, some other pastors and most of the lay people were rather implicit in talking about specific incidences and direct sentiments concerning the change. The ambiguity of some informants was explicit when they were probed for specific questions and preferred to say “the authorities have found it requisite to introduce the new change, and we have nothing to say or do to oppose them.”

Cross References

I had faced difficulties in cross referencing the oral account with written materials as a secondary source. I discovered that even though there were enough written documents in libraries concerning the “high church” liturgy, especially in the Roman Catholic Church and Anglican Church, there was nothing specifically written about acolytes, incense or bells in relation to the Lutheran Church in Southern Africa. Moreover, most of my informants did not succinctly provide a liturgical and theological reflection which interlaces with the written sources. The information only proportionately tallied with those informants who were actively involved in the introduction of the new liturgy, understandingly so because they had made a research on it.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Assessment of overall quality and value of the interviews in terms of historical research.

I think that the quality of the interviews was of relative optimum standard, meaning that, it considered the relevant stakeholders namely, pastors, deans, bishops, church elders at a wide variety with whom a large part of the interviews were conducted. The informants predominantly were people of a critical outlook and self -assertive. The interviews themselves raised critical consciousness and great awareness of their social and spiritual realities. They began to have a new understanding of their own Lutheran Church and what it stands for in a way that has brought meaningful participation in the church. Most of them tended to understand how they became Lutherans in ELCSA. On the other hand, others got an opportunity to have a new perspective and understanding of the Roman Catholic liturgical roots. The value of the interviews in terms of historical research could be good, however, it was lacking in adequate and accurate chronological arrangement.

OUTLINE OF CHAPTERS ONE TO FIVE

1. The Holy Communion in the early history of the Lutheran Church in South Africa (1912-1985)

The chapter deals with the changes in liturgy which were at the time of the Reformation, and the historical background of Holy Communion in South Africa between the period 1912- 1985. The chapter ends with a short conclusion.

2. The ‘high church’ Communion Service in the history of the church

Chapter three provides a definition of ‘high church’ liturgy in the context of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa- South Eastern Diocese at Umphumulo. It deals with the outline of the old Sunday Holy Communion Service and the new ‘high church’ Holy Communion Service. The chapter then provides a delineation of the -elements of the ‘high church’ Communion Service which are: procession; three readings, that is, the Old Testament, the Epistle and the Gospel reading; the signs of the cross; bowing and genuflecting to the altar; the passing of the peace; vestments; acolytes and servers; incense and its use during Communion; and the ringing of bells during Communion.

3. Calls for liturgical reform (1985-1992)

The chapter explores the role played by the Shiyane Circuit of the South Eastern Diocese and the appeal for spiritual relevance and discovery in the ‘high church’ liturgy. It deals with the challenges of the theology of the Roman Catholic Church and the African Indigenous Churches (AIC’s) on worship in the ‘high church’ liturgy. The chapter also deals with the quest or yearning for change, relevance and the perspectives of the

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Reformation in the ‘high church’ liturgy. Lastly, the chapter gives a timeline of the process of the development or change of the new liturgy. The process unfolds from 1992, where the liturgy was first introduced at the Diocesan Rallies held each and every year until the celebration of the Jubilee Year in 1995.

4. Reception of the liturgical reform at Umphumulo Parish

The chapter demonstrates the reactions and responses of the grassroots membership of the South Eastern Diocese to the liturgical changes which came along with the ‘high church’ service. One believes that this was the actual test of the experiment, because a refined and sound teaching should be measured by the reaction or responses of the congregants. Each different sector of the church membership is provided where a reaction from each member group is shown. The reaction of the Youth, Men’s league, Women’s league and the members of the clergy is shown. The members of the clergy are classified under grassroots in the sense that their reaction was not too different from the rest of the membership.

5. Conclusion

Bibliography

Appendix A

Appendix B

Appendix C

Appendix D

CHAPTER ONE: THE HOLY COMMUNION IN THE EARLY HISTORY OF THE LUTHERAN CHURCH IN SOUTH AFRICA (1912-1985)

1.0 Introduction

The chapter introduces the formative period of the Lutheran Church in South Africa. It traces its establishment upon the basis of the Reformation in the sixteenth century. The chapter further explores how the Holy Communion service was conducted during the early part of the missionary intervention. It unfolds how the missionaries from Europe and America treated the Holy Communion service and the issue of church vestments, and how it was received by the indigenous clergy in South Africa.

1.1 Changes in Liturgy made at the time of Reformation

As early as 1516, Luther, in preaching on the Third Commandment, stressed the necessity of ‘hearing the Word of God’ as over against the idea of ‘hearing Mass’. In 1520, Luther advocated communion in both the Order of Divine Service and the Latin Divine Service. He rejected the verba being said secretly, and indicated a distinction between sacramental and sacrificial elements in the service, which ever since has been recognized as important in theoretical discussions. Declaring that man cannot lay the first stone, he said that God “must first come and give man a promise. This Word of God is the beginning, the foundation, the rock upon which afterward all works, words and thoughts of man must build.”⁷

In these writings, as in his later activities, Luther protested against un-evangelical features, but never sought to abolish the historic order and substitute a new service built upon

⁷ L.Reed, *The Lutheran Liturgy*. (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1947) pp. 69

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

evangelical principles. He recognized the fact that the whole devotional and ceremonial system of the church was deeply impressed upon popular imagination. He was convinced that purification and not destruction was needed.⁸

Luther asserted that to those who desired to observe the order of the Divine Service on no account he was going to make it a compulsory law, or to ensnare or make captive thereby any man's conscience; but that he intended to use it agreeably to Christian liberty at their pleasure as where, when, and so long as circumstances favour and demand it. Luther made his position very clear that he did not want to be misconstrued to mean that he desired rule, or by law to compel any one to follow his proposed Order of Divine Service. He clearly stated that those who had made their good order of service did not need to abolish it and yield to his; that the whole of Germany should have to adopt forthwith his Wittenburg Order. Luther mentioned he did not necessarily conduct the service for those who were Christians already, for they had no need of these things because they have their Divine Service in their spirits. He underlined that instead, they had such a service for the sake of those who are to become Christians, or are to grow stronger; just as a Christian has baptism, the Word and the sacrament not as a Christian but as a sinner. Above all, the Order is for the simple and for the young folk which must daily be exercised in the scripture and God's Word, to the end that they may become conversant with scripture and expert in its use and make music; ready and skilful in giving an answer for their faith, and able in time to teach others and aid in the advancement of the kingdom of Christ. For the sake of such, Luther said, we must read, sing, preach, write, and compose; and if it could in any wise help or promote their interests, he would have all the bells pealing and all the organs playing and everything making a noise that could. The Popish Divine Service was to

⁸ Ibid. pp.70

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

be condemned for this reason that they have made them laws, works, and merits; and so have depressed faith.⁹

The *Formula Missae* was Luther's greatest liturgical writing. It was his objective criticism of a historic and vital instrument. He was not concerned with introducing a new liturgical language, as he had been in the German Service, neither with paraphrasing portions to the historic order in German use for immediate use by congregations of limited capacity and unaccustomed to active participation in the service. Luther's Formula was intended as a local program and not a general order for the whole church. It proved to be, however, of all his many works, his greatest contribution to general liturgical reform.¹⁰

About the Latin Divine Service Luther said that he did not want it set aside or changed. He maintained that as he hitherto kept it, he wanted people to be still free to use it where and when it pleased them or as occasion required. Luther maintained that he did not in any way want to let the Latin language disappear out of the Divine Service, for he was deeply concerned for the young. He, in fact, wished that Greek and Hebrew languages were also familiar languages as Latin was, so that they could be used in the service. He so wished that these languages possessed a great store of fine music and song as the Latin did. Luther wished that on a Sunday Mass, all the four languages, that is German, Latin, Greek and Hebrew should be used alternatively with singing and reading in these four languages. He was strongly opposed to those who stood by one language and despised other languages. He had a vision of a missionary church whereby young missionaries would be deployed to

⁹ B.J. Kidd, (ed.), Documents Illustrative of the Continental Reformation, (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1911), pp.193.

¹⁰ L. Reed, The Lutheran Liturgy. (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1947) pp.72.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

foreign lands where the need to know these other languages like Greek and Hebrew would be of greater necessity.¹¹

When Luther began his reforms of the Mass, the German church had, to a limited degree, already a musical tradition of its own. It had been the custom for centuries to sing tropes and sequences (little hymns) in services in connection with the *Amens*, *Kyries*, and *Alleluias*. The German language was already employed with familiar parts of the service such as the Ten Commandments, the Seven Last Words, and some Psalms. But more importantly, German was regularly used as the language for the Credo (Creed) and the Lords Prayer. In addition to these musical settings to simple melodies, the congregation had many folk tunes and semi-religious songs called *Leisen*. Most of these songs were sung in unison in the style of Gregorian chants. Therefore, Luther's intent was to retain and expand upon a musical tradition that was already in existence in German churches. He was not the founder of congregational singing as some believe, but there is no doubt that Luther established the practice of congregational singing of the Mass as a regular means of worship. Luther saw music as a gift from God, and he set about to gather music into the service of the church. He wished to retain the richness and drama of the Roman Mass. However, it was in a gradual process that he found sweeping changes necessary.¹²

1.2 The historical background of Holy Communion in South Africa (1912- 1985)

¹¹ B.J. Kidd, (ed.), Documents illustrative of the Continental Reformation, (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1911), pp.193

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

The creation of synods in the Lutheran Church occurred under the auspices of the white missionaries in 1912 and reflected their theology¹³. The first steps towards unity among the different mission societies were the formation of the Cooperation of the Lutheran Mission (CLM) in 1912. It was mandated to foster unity talks, setting up the agenda of the meetings of the Cooperation, conduct liturgy discussions and provide a forum where matters of common interest would be debated. The CLM was formed with ease due to existing extensive overlaps of work and proximity of many Lutheran mission societies, such as the American, Hermannsburg, Berlin, Swedish and Norwegian in one area.¹⁴

Initially, from 1912 the CLM was to last for ten years, but fifty years later it had become the driving force for the formation of the United Lutheran Church in Natal and for closer cooperation of Lutheran missions throughout Southern Africa.¹⁵

H.E. Winkler (1970:38), a theologian argues that the aim of the Co-operation of the Lutheran Mission was to achieve unity and develop liturgical similarities at least between the different synods, and create one Zulu Lutheran Church in Natal. The CLM established a combined teacher's training college at the Norwegian Missionary Society station at Umphumulo. The South African government had given notice that it would support only four training centers and the Lutherans wanted to ensure that one of the four was Lutheran. In addition, the Cooperation of Lutheran Mission trained pastors in the common seminary

¹² Carolina Classical Connection, 1997-2005

¹³ H.E.Winkler, (1970). The divided roots of Lutheranism in South Africa. Cape Town : University of Cape Town. (Master's thesis). Pp.38.

¹⁴ Ibid.

¹⁵ G.Sciba and G.Lislerud, 1997. "Lutheran Missions and Churches in South Africa," In R. Elphick and R. Davenport (eds.), Christianity in South Africa, (Cape Town: James Currey and David Philip) Pp.180-181.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

at the Church of Sweden Mission station at Oscarsberg and Evangelists at Emmaus, a training centre of the Berlin Mission.¹⁶

The CLM also founded a Lutheran Publishing House to issue material in Zulu, particularly the small catechism and hymnbook. In 1928 it inaugurated *Isithunywa*, a Lutheran Magazine, and the Zulu Almanac, which included the directory of the hundreds of CLM missionaries and black pastors. *Credo*, a bilingual Lutheran theological journal for Southern Africa, was published by the CLM, beginning in 1954.¹⁷

Practical tasks such as the joint production of hymnbooks, devotional manuals, schoolbooks, and religious papers were discussed by delegates of a various mission societies under the auspices of the Cooperation of Lutheran Missions. Also joint theological education was on the agenda from the early stages. The work of the CLM was successful in producing literature on a common hymnbook, Holy Communion, translations of Martin Luther's writings, the small and the large catechisms and a common liturgy in 1949 in Durban.¹⁸

The historical background of the Holy Communion of the Zulu Lutheran Church can be traced way back to the formation of the CLM in 1912. However, a remarkable achievement in the formation of a common liturgy occurred in the 1950s. A meeting of

¹⁶ Ibid.

¹⁷ Ibid.

¹⁸ G.Scriba and G.Lislerud, 1997. "Lutheran Missions and Churches in South Africa", in R. Elphick and R. Davenport (eds.), *Christianity in South Africa*, (Cape Town: David Philip.1997) pp.180.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

pastors held in Dundee in 1950 highlighted some important aspects of the Holy Communion discussed in the meeting.¹⁹

The importance of the pastors meeting lies in the fact that very high-ranking church delegations attended the meeting as representatives of the various mission societies. They were: Bishop E. Sundgren, (chairman), Revs. O. Sarndal, vice chairman, H. Fosseus, J. Masindane, J. Mbatha, P. Mhlungu, S. Mzobe and many others.

These representatives came from the following mission societies: Berlin Mission Society (BMS), American Lutheran Mission (ALM), Hermannsburg Mission Society (HMS) and the Church of Sweden Mission (CSM).

The pastors meeting agreed on the following matters:

The officiating pastor who wishes to receive the Holy Communion should receive the communion together with the congregation, and should kneel where the congregation kneels, not in front of the altar. Secondly he must not give himself the Holy Communion if there is another pastor present. If no other pastor is present, he may give the Holy Communion to himself. Thirdly, another pastor may read the words of absolution to the officiating pastor if he so desires.²⁰

The meeting also addressed the matter of ecclesiastical vestments. A letter was read from Rev. S. Mbatha, one of the influential members in the unity talks of Lutheran mission in Natal. In the letter, Mbatha argued that all pastors should be allowed to use chasubles

¹⁹ Minutes of the Pastor's meeting, May 18, 1950, Dundee, RSA.

²⁰ Ibid

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

*because prior to this, African pastors had not been wearing them since only the Church of Sweden Mission (CSM) used them and their use was still a matter under discussion in the unity talks. The wearing of chasubles at the point was predominantly practiced by CSM, as the tradition brought from Sweden.*²¹

Bishop R. Schiele, from the Berlin Mission Society (BMS), a retired bishop of the Eastern Diocese in Swaziland, holds that the use of chasubles at that time was not an exclusive privilege of the missionaries. However, the wearing of albs and chasubles had been brought from the church of the Swedish Mission. Therefore, since talks concerning vestments were still going on, chasubles were not used until an agreement was reached. He maintains that not all of the missions used albs and chasubles. Some missions like Berlin Mission Society and the Hermannsburg Mission used talar, which is the black long gown, worn by clergymen, sometimes understood by some as Luther's academic gown. There was, therefore, caution that a certain mission tradition should not impose its practices upon other missions until common agreement was sufficiently reached.²²

Mbatha himself came from the church of Sweden Mission (CSM), which was a strong supporter of the high church liturgy, a tradition that was keen to introduce the use of chasubles, stoles, albs and many other vestments in the mission fields in Natal. Mbatha was an African National Congress (ANC) activist who supported the unity talks, and the son of a pastor, whose father also supported the amalgamation of the Lutheran mission into

²¹ Ibid

²² Bishop R.Schiele,interview at Pietermaritzburg,August 24, 2001.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

one powerful regional church. As a theologian trained by a Church of Sweden Mission Institute, he strongly motivated the use of these vestments in the church of his day.²³

The Dundee Conference resolved to accept that chasubles should only be used on festive occasions and when the Holy Communion is celebrated. It went on to say that chasubles could be used on condition they are used in properly designated buildings of worship, for instance, a properly constructed church building. It was then agreed that parishes should contribute money for buying them. The meeting accepted and appreciated the Rev. J.E. Hallendorffs suggestion that the financial help to buy the chasubles had to be sought from the funds of the CLM.²⁴

Hallendorffs was a missionary pastor from Germany who settled in Natal upon his arrival. He served in the committee of the Cooperating Lutheran Mission in Natal in 1955. At one stage, Hallendorffs was in charge of the task of translating prayer books from German into Zulu. He successfully published the new edition of the small catechism.²⁵ He played a critical role in the unity and on the liturgical vestment issue. The pastor's meeting also agreed that stoles be used. Bishop Erick Sundgren, of the Church of Sweden Mission also played an influential role in unity talks in that he facilitated the talks and graciously donated money to help pay for the expenses of the talks. Together with Superintendent G. Krause of the Berlin Mission Society who served in the Natal region, they were mandated by the pastor's conference in Dundee to develop a common liturgy, which would be acceptable to all stakeholders.

²³ Minutes of the Pastor's meeting, May 18, 1950, Dundee: South Africa.

²⁴ Ibid.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

They were also tasked to find whether liturgical berets were appropriate and obtainable for the use of parishioners. Bishop E. Sundgren was the first Bishop from the Church of Sweden to serve in the Zulu Lutheran Church in Natal. While there, the bishop tried to study Zulu, the language of the local people who he loved and served.²⁶ He was a conservative Lutheran who stood firm on ethical principles and church rules. Bishop Sundgren belonged to the “old generation” of missionaries, and he was aware of the challenges of mission work in the challenging socio-political climate in South Africa, which was marked by the African National Congress (ANC’s) quest for liberation from white domination. He was aware that mission work had to address such social issues.

Bishop Sundgren wanted to see a united Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa. During his time of office progress was greatly achieved in the preparation of unity. In a letter to the Dundee conference, Rev. Mbatha submitted that Bishop Sundgren served in many committees with great diligence. Among his achievements, he worked hard to see a common liturgy and hymnbook to be used in the envisaged church.²⁷ On the other hand, Krause, the missionary pastor from the Berlin Mission Society, was the longest serving chairman in the committee of the Cooperating Lutheran Missions.

The minister’s pastors meeting of 1950 resolved that vestments for evangelists should have different insignia from the ones worn by pastors. However this matter was not finalized, but referred to the Cooperating Lutheran Missions Committee on liturgical matters for

²⁵ Ibid.

²⁶ Ibid.

²⁷ H.E.Winkler, (1970). The divided roots of Lutheranism in South Africa. Cape Town: University of Cape Town. (unpublished Masters thesis). pp.38.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

more deliberations.²⁸ In 1957, the Cooperating Lutheran Mission Committee, with dedicated effort finished the compilation of a new altar book even before the formation of the regional church was finalized.

In the same year 1957, the Cooperation Lutheran Church invited all mission societies, the synod of Lutheran Churches in South Africa and all those interested parties in the unity talks to meet in Durban in a conference called the Preparatory Assembly. Two African delegates from each synod and two from the mission societies as well as observers from those who were not ready for the unity attended the conference representing their respective churches. The conference met on November ‘14th -15th 1957.²⁹

Scriba and Lislrud, point out that, within the black synods, which represent 700 000 members in South Africa and South West Africa, there was a demand for a single united church, while the white synods representing about 50.000 members, argued that the spiritual unity is already existing among the synod which made a constitutional merger unnecessary. Scriba and Lislrud observed that the German synods, in particular, stressed that their special responsibility to maintain the German culture and language made a merger within black synods difficult, and it is likely that many of their members were also motivated by the support of the South African government with its apartheid policies. In the end, despite white opposition, the Preparatory Assembly recommended that Lutherans strive to create a united Lutheran Church. Scriba and Lislrud further hold that, as the first step in this process, the Lutheran Mission Societies from South Africa, South West Africa,

²⁸ Ibid

²⁹ Minutes of the Pastor’s meeting, May 18, 1950, Dundee. South Africa.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Rhodesia, met in 1958, in a constituent Assembly at Christianenburg near Durban. This body pressed in particular by black delegates, decided to form a regional Church for the Zulu-Xhosa-Swazi Region, which would then federate with similar churches that would be founded in other regions.³⁰

In July, the third to the eleventh, 1961, there was a Church Assembly, which was a significant event in the history of the Lutheran church. It was that Assembly that the name of the first regional church was changed to ‘Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa, South Eastern Region’ (ELC-SER). This was in a way eliminating the tendency of the *volkskirche* ideology based on the ‘Nguni’ language and culture that was entailed in the words Zulu-Xhosa-Swazi Region. The aim was to emphasize the view that countered the government’s apartheid ideology that the Lutheran church was to be geographically, not culturally based.³¹

Many crucial matters on amalgamation talks were discussed at the Preparatory (General Church) Assembly of 1961. One theological problem that seemed to cause unrest among the merging synods was the question whether the united church should be governed according to the synodical or Episcopal principles. The Zulu Synod of the Church of Sweden Mission had submitted a proposal to the Union Committee from their synodical council for the Episcopal office. The synodical office had given the following reasons for its choice of the Episcopal office.

³⁰ G.Scriba and G.Lislerud, 1997. “Lutheran Missions and Churches in South Africa,” in R.Elphick and R. Davenport (eds.), *Christianity in South Africa*, Cape Town: James and David Philip (1997) pp.182.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

1. The episcopal office is old and also found in the New Testament 1Tim.3: 1.
2. The episcopal office is a heritage from the Roman Catholic Church.
3. Our great teacher Martin Luther did not object to it.
4. The episcopal office is found in many Lutheran churches as in the following countries; Norway, Denmark, Finland, Germany, and many others.

The proposal of the Church of Sweden Mission was considered significantly since it will be remembered that the Church of Sweden Mission which was the founding member of the Cooperation Lutheran Mission in Natal. The Berlin Mission was a small synod and had some financial problems especially after the Second World War.

The Norwegian Mission was still a small organization and it was not clear whether it was going to go back to Norway or continue in South Africa. The Hermannsburg Mission was still hesitant whether to join the merger or not. Therefore, the Church of Sweden Mission [CSM] was the one holding the key to the merger and had a significant unifying role. The proposal of the CSM through the Union Committee was finally accepted by the General Assembly as follows:

1. that the leader of the church be a bishop.
2. that the elections of the bishop be a period of 5 years.
3. that for the interim period of 5 years the present Chairman of the Union Committee, Bishop Helge Fosseus be the leader of the new church.³²

³¹ Ibid. pp.183

³² Minutes of the Union Committee of the Cooperating Lutheran Committee (CLC).May 10, 1959.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Rev. D.D.L. Makhathini, (late), who was a product of the Norwegian Mission Society, and who later taught theology at Umphumulo Theological Seminary, affirmed the fact that unity or merger, was not easily achieved. “The spirit of unity or merger grew until in the fifties. It was not easy to get the Zulu Lutherans to form one merged church. The reasons for the difficulties were not confessional. They were administrative and practical in nature. Disagreements lingered long over vestments, leadership (to be led by bishop or superintendent), salaries of workers etc. I am happy to say that the Norwegian Lutheran Zulu Synod, was one of the first synods to give up its vestments, for the sake of the merger. We agreed to let go our *izinyosi*, the honey comb-like Norwegian talar. Maybe it was easier for us to do so because our interest was never so much vested in vestments as it was on mission and evangelism.”³³

Theological matters concerning the Lutheran altar and pulpit fellowship were markedly discussed. The discussion centered mainly on the question of the altar and pulpit fellowship between the Lutheran groups in South Africa. The view was expressed that the Methodists, for example, could not be accepted at the Lutheran communion table, not even in exceptional circumstances. The reason was that the Methodist family does not keep an altar. Others maintained that when Lutheran pastors had been given exclusive right to administer the word and the sacraments in hospitals or other institutions, they were under the obligation to serve Christians of other denominations with the sacraments together with Methodists. Finally it became evident that many were against the word ‘only’ that implied that communion, be exclusively for Lutherans.³⁴

³³ D.D.L.Makhathini, 1974. “The Lutheran Church in KwaZulu: then and now”. Umphumulo, unpublished. P. 133.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

It must be said also that the Lutheran church did not give much guidance over liturgy, order and ethos. In the Article 7 of the Augsburg Confession, it stated that ‘for the unity of the church, is sufficient to agree on the doctrine of the gospel and the administration of the sacraments’. In 1961, the synods of the Norwegian Mission Societies (NMS), the Berlin Mission Society (BMS), the American Mission Societies (AMS), and the Hermannsburg Mission Societies (HMS) that joined the merger in 1963, wrote the document called the ‘United testimony and church discipline’. The ‘United testimony’ deals with the major articles in Christian faith including the church’s interpretation of the episcopal office. One of the major articles that the united testimony dealt with was the matter concerning the sacraments of Holy Communion and Baptism. Jointly the synods of these missions recognized each other as brethren in the Lord, especially since they claimed to be accepting the Lutheran confessions, which are believed to be teaching the holy doctrines of the sacred scriptures.

Concerning the Holy Communion, they agreed that in the Lord’s Supper, Christ offers his body and his blood for those who believe, and “by virtue of Christ’s promise, we hold that all communicants receive the body and the blood of Him who is present not only in the church but in the sacraments itself. Therefore, it is the duty of the church to urge the believers to make use of these gifts. The Lord is personally present during the celebration of the Holy Communion to give sacraments which he promises in the word”.³⁵

³⁴ Ibid.

³⁵ G.Lislerud, “*Ubufakazi obuhlangene ngenkonzo yo buLuthela kanye nendlela nesimo sekerikee*”. (Durban: Universal Printing Works, 1962), pp.23.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

The second addition to the liturgy of the South Eastern Region church published in 1966 reveals how the Holy Communion service was conducted and that the Holy Communion was held in utmost esteem. Communicants would in a most reverent manner gather around the altar, whereupon they read the words of exhortation taken from the letter of St. Paul to the Corinthian congregation (1.Cor. 11:27-29) which reads as follows: ‘For anyone who eats and drinks without discerning the body and the blood, eats and drinks own condemnation’.³⁶ Rev. Magwaza, an elderly Lutheran pastor who studied the history of the Reformation of the church, said that *‘the unity talks were not easy, especially in relation to Holy Communion. But once an agreement on the Holy Communion was reached, things began to move for the better.’*

Magwaza argues that the Biblical words above were rapidly read to the communicants before the distribution of the sacraments. “This order of service was very significant in reminding each communicant that we are all forgiven sinners, and it also gave a service great dignity and respect.”³⁷ In the 1970’s those who partook in the Holy Communion had to register their names with the parish pastor at his office on the Thursday before the main service that was held on a Sunday. This principle was tenaciously held for the communicants. The service of absolution was held on a Thursday so that all those who partake in the Holy Communion would privately confess their sins to the pastor. The service was called Isibiko senkonzo. The pastor laid hands on the absolved communicants. This service, however, died a natural death because a number of parishioners could not be available due to the fact that they worked in cities like Durban.

³⁶ The Lutheran Hymnbook, Third edition, (Durban: The Lutheran Publishing House: 1971), pp.1-2.

³⁷ M.Magwaza, Interview at Umphumulo ,August 21,1998.

something against the other, means of settling the matter has to be sought with immediate effect before they could both approach the altar. If someone has committed a public sin, that is, a sin that was obvious to everyone among the believers, that person was put under *The service on Thursday was practically transferred to the main service on Sundays. As time went by, the absolution of sins for communicants in the service was seen to be a time consumer. As a shortened version, the presiding pastor pronounced the words of absolution at once for all those who will partake in Holy Communion in the service, a practice that carried on to this day. The service of Isibiko senkonzo was once taken with seriousness and through it people were reminded of the sacredness of the Holy Communion service. In the service of Isibiko senkonzo, communicants were even taught by the old pastors of the synodical churches and the regional churches to abstain from food and drink some days before partaking in the sacrament.*

*Communicants were admonished that earthly pleasures and worries should yield before the Lord at His table. It was taught that communicants cannot come before the Lord's Table filled with anger, but must come with forgiving hearts trusting in the forgiveness of God.*³⁸

*Quoting from Biblical text, Mt.18, 15-17, it was also resolved that if any one has church discipline.*³⁹

1.3 Conclusion

The aim of the Cooperation of Lutheran Missions, namely, to foster unity among missions and regional churches and to develop a similar liturgy in the Lutheran church, was only

³⁸ Ibid

³⁹ Ibid.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

realized in 1975 to 1976. This was when the regional churches amalgamated for the second time to form a powerful and broadly represented united black church called the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa (ELCSA).

There were, however, a few changes in the vestments of the clergy after the formation of ELCSA. The significant difference in vestments was to be found in the fact that before 1976 a pastor in the South Eastern Region, as it was called, used to wear the talar, surplice and stole. This was done as a way to accommodate the Berlin Mission Society, the Hermannsburg Mission Society and the Scandinavian, especially the church of Sweden Mission traditions. In time the alb, stole and chasuble remained the most commonly used pastor's vestments in the South Eastern Diocese and other Dioceses under the Evangelical Lutheran Church in South Africa.

There were no changes in the liturgy of the Holy Communion until 1992. The South Eastern Diocesan Bishop, S.P. Zulu, introduced these changes. In the next chapters, I will give a discussion on the causes for the liturgical changes in the South Eastern Diocese.

CHAPTER TWO: THE 'HIGH CHURCH' COMMUNION SERVICE IN THE HISTORY OF THE CHURCH

2.0 Introduction

The chapter provides the definition of 'high church' liturgy in the context of the Lutheran Church in Southern Africa. It deals with the outline of the old Sunday Holy Communion and the new service, that is, the 'high church' service. The chapter also provides an outline

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

of the elements of the ‘high church’ service which are: the sign of the cross; bowing and genuflecting to the altar; the passing of the peace; procession; three readings, that is, the Old Testament, the Epistle and the Gospel reading; vestments; acolytes and servers; incense and its use during Communion; and the ringing of bells during Communion.

Before I provide an outline of the old order of the Sunday Holy Communion service in ELCSA, it is necessary to first briefly clarify the concepts and the understanding of the Lutheran Church concerning the sacrament of Holy Communion and define the word sacrament itself. In the same way, it is also necessary to explain what is meant by the Sunday Holy Communion service as a day of worship, and the other Sunday services which are conducted without Holy Communion. The purpose of the chapter too, will also be to give a historical and theological background of the various liturgical elements of the ‘high church’ service. This background information is required by the study to demonstrate what was considered an old liturgy service and the new elements of the ‘high church’ service.

There are basically two recognized sacraments in the Lutheran Church. They are the sacraments of Holy Communion and baptism. According to Walter Elwell, a sacrament is a religious rite or ceremony instituted or recognized by Jesus Christ. It is “a thing set apart as sacred.” He says that a sacrament came later to be defined as a “visible word” or an “outward and visible sign of an inward and spiritual grace”. He continues to say that, baptism and the Lords Supper were given a prominent place in the fellowship of the early church.⁴⁰

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

It is of great importance to define the sacrament of Holy Communion as understood in the Lutheran Church because the study extensively deals with the sacrament of Holy Communion and the elements of the ‘high church’ service. Luther Reed, says Holy Communion is an institution of the Lord. It is a memorial of his death and resurrection. It is a bond of fellowship and a means of grace. As a unique institution of Christ, Holy Communion conveys unique sacramental gifts. It is the culmination and completion of the service of the Word. The service of the Word finds its crown and completion in the celebration and reception of the sacrament.⁴¹

It is crucial to show when the Holy Communion service is served in the Lutheran Church in the South Eastern Diocese (SED). Holy Communion is served every Sunday by an ordained pastor. It is the usual practice that a pastor is in charge of more than four congregations. The pastor has to serve each congregation the Holy Communion once a month, which means that in three Sundays each congregation would have services without a pastor, therefore, without Holy Communion. The elders in this case conduct the congregational services.

2.1 Definition of ‘high church’ liturgy in the context of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa - South Eastern Diocese at Umphumulo Parish

The term ‘high church’ is a phenomena found in some of the major Protestant Churches but particularly used of the school of thought in the Church of England (Anglicanism). The ‘high’ normally refers to a high view of the continuity of the church through history, and

⁴⁰ W.A.Elwell, (eds.) *Evangelical Dictionary of Theology*. (Michigan: Baker Book House, 1984) pp. 652.

⁴¹ L. Reed, *The Lutheran Liturgy*. (Philadelphia : Fortress Press, 1947) pp.321-322

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

thus of its visibility; therefore, a particular denomination may claim to be part of the continuing one, Holy, Catholic, and Apostolic Church. With this emphasis on visibility and continuity there usually exists a view of the two Gospel Sacraments, Baptism and the Lord's Supper, which sees them as important and even indispensable means of grace. Other "signs" of being 'high' include an emphasis on duly ordained and educated clergy, respect for Catholic tradition (especially the ecumenical creeds), and a search for good liturgy. Within Lutheranism (from the seventeenth century) and within Methodism (from the nineteenth century) such an ethos or movement has often been found, although it has not been necessarily called 'high church'.⁴²

The inception of the 'high church' service at Umphumulo was motivated on the very same lines that its proponents wanted to be conformed to the Catholic and Anglican tradition in liturgical worship. They were also abreast of the liturgical dialogue going on in America within the Lutheran community. So, they were convinced that by introducing the liturgical innovation they were acting within the universal liturgical and theological framework. Their point of argument was that they were doing a practice which was in continuity with what was practiced by other Lutheran Churches after the Reformation in places like Sweden and America. It is maintained that the Latin High Mass Service was not entirely displaced in the Swedish service. It took the Latin Mass at which the people received the sacrament at a side altar. For decades the Latin and Swedish service continued side by side. Some dioceses in Sweden which were remote from Rome, retained the earlier Latin order and texts after changes had been made in Rome. Behind this background, it is argued that, elements of the 'high church' were not actually foreign to the Lutheran community, since

⁴² W.A.Elwell, (eds.), *Evangelical Dictionary of Theology*. (Michigan: Baker Book House, 1984) pp. 510.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Sweden from the Reformation period had used the service of the Latin order. In America too, in some places like Philadelphia in 1700, the form of worship was imported from Sweden, which again had the influence of the Latin order of service.⁴³ It is behind this context also that America and Sweden are viewed by the proponents of the ‘high church’ as traditional custodians of the Latin High Mass service within the Lutheran worldwide community. The emphasis on duly ordained and educated clergy, respect for Catholic tradition, and a search for good liturgy is also upheld tenaciously.

2.2 Outline of the old Sunday Holy Communion Service and the new ‘High Church’ Holy Communion Service.

The outline of the old and new is provided in order to identify the changes from the old to the new liturgy. This will show what elements are regarded new the ‘high church’ service, which have been introduced in the South Eastern Diocese (SED) since 1992.

⁴³ L.Reed, *The Lutheran Liturgy*. (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1947) pp.114

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Old Holy Communion Service	New Holy Communion Service
<p>1. Procession (occasional) It is done only when there are important church events. The procession is led by the elders or the assistants to the minister, who carry only the Bibles for the minister, then follows ministers, deans and then bishops.</p>	<p>The service begins with a procession of bearer of the crosier in the fore front, followed by the acolytes both male and female. Usually the acolytes would be wearing red and white long gowns and or black and white gowns. Each carry Bibles, candles, the Communion vessels, and others carry vessels containing the incense. One or two of the acolytes would be burning the incense as the procession begins. The acolytes are followed by lay preachers, evangelists if they are available, ministers, deans and lastly by bishops. In the ‘high church’ service, in most cases, the order of the procession would be in such order and it is done regularly with the burning of incense.</p>
<p>2. Prayer: The assistant then turns towards altar and kneels outside the altar rail while the congregation kneels and then prays.</p>	<p>As the throng of processions enters the church building, the entire congregation, which would have already assembled inside the church building, would graciously stand up as a gesture of</p>

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

	<p>according respect to the bishop's or presiding pastors entourage. Before the opening prayer which is done at the altar, the presiding pastor cleanses the altar, being assisted by the acolytes. Then an assisting elder would the prayer.</p>
<p>3. Hymn: The congregation shall stand. The minister shall rise and move to the altar and stand facing it while the hymn is being sung.</p>	<p>The first hymn will be sung, and the liturgist will stand in front of the altar facing the congregation. This is an innovation in itself that the liturgist faces the congregation all the time he presides over the service.</p>
<p>4. <i>Introitus</i>: The minister shall turn and face the congregation which shall stand. The minister shall rise then read or chant the <i>Introitus</i> for the day.</p> <p>5. <i>Gloria Patri</i>: The congregation shall read or chant: Glory be to the Father and to the Son and to the Holy Spirit. As it was in the beginning is now and ever shall be world without end. Amen</p>	<p><i>Introitus</i> – Is mostly one that is relevant according to the church calendars could be sung in different melodies. Most of the melodies are those employed either from the Catholic, Anglican Church or those which had been composed by a particular group of choristers. The liturgist would lead the chanting.</p> <p><i>Gloria Patri</i>: The congregation would respond according to the melody used for that particular Sunday Service and say:</p>

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

	<p>Glory be to Father and to the Son and to the Holy Spirit, as it was in the beginning is now and ever shall be world without end amen.</p>
<p>6. Confession of sins and <i>Kyrie</i>: The minister shall say to the congregation: Beloved in the Lord, let us draw near with a true heart and confess our sins to God our Father, beseeching Him, in the name of our Lord Jesus Christ, to grant us forgiveness. In saying the <i>kyrie</i>, the following response shall be chanted: Lord have mercy upon us, Christ have mercy upon us, Lord have mercy upon us.</p>	<p>The confession of sins and <i>Kyrie</i> are done but in different melodies which are not familiar to the old order. The liturgist may choose to use a hymn or sing the words: Lord have mercy upon us three times, but using different melodies. Sometimes may use words taken from a hymn like: <i>thethelela nkosi ungangibulali</i>. The liturgist may say these words while kneeling, and the congregation sitting. These melodies are changed from time to time, depending on its composers which ones did they saw fit. For a local congregation, which would be taught these melodies, it is easier and could be followed. However, in a mass service of different people from different parishes, so far it is not easy to follow some of those melodies used for that particular day.</p>

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

<p>7. Absolution: The minister shall then stand and turn to the congregation pronouncing one of the following words of absolution and beginning in each case by saying: To those who confess in faith with a penitent heart I pronounce the word of the assurance of forgiveness.</p>	<p>Absolution: It is done in the same way as it is done in the old service.</p>
<p>8. Gloria in <i>Excelsis</i>: While the congregation is still standing, the minister shall turn to the altar and lift up his hands and chants: glory be on God on high and peace on earth among men with whom He is pleased.</p>	<p>While the congregation standing and the pastor facing the congregation, he sings or chant the words with the congregation: <i>Thina sonke abantu bakho sikutusa Nkosi sithi sonke kanye nezingelosi- Gloria Gloria Gloria in Excelsis Deo Siyabong' umusa wakho ngesipho sempilo esivela kumsindisi wethu uJesu Kristu:Gloria Gloria in Excelsis Deo. Nkosi hlis' umoya wakho uzohlala nathi sense sonke sibemhlophe izinhliziyu zethu: Gloria Gloria in Excelsis.</i></p>
<p>9. Salutation: the minister shall turn to the congregation with hands lifted up in a blessing pose and sing; the Lord be with you.</p>	<p>Salutation:</p>

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

<p>9. Prayer or collect: the congregation shall kneel. Then the minister shall say or chant the collect for the day.</p>	<p>Prayer or collect: according to church year.</p>
<p>10. Proclamation of the Word: Epistle Reading: While the congregation is seated, the minister or helper in the service shall read the Epistle for the day.</p>	<p>Old Testament Reading and intonation of the Psalms. The liturgist may lead the congregation by chanting the Psalm while the congregation chants after him in the melody which he would introduce them to. Sometimes, the liturgist may have a small choir which would sing after him as he leads the chanting. The liturgist would read the whole chapter of Palms by taking a verse, and the congregation takes the following one. The congregation shall respond by saying: <i>Udumo alube kuyise nendodana njengoba kwakunjalo ekuqaleni kuyoba njalo namanje kuze kube phakade amen.</i> Immediately after finishing the chanting of the Palm, the liturgist shall read the Epistle for the day. The Epistle shall be read while the congregation sitting.</p>
<p>11. After the singing of Hallelujah, A Hymn shall be sung while the congregation</p>	<p>When the one reading the Epistle finishes, the congregation shall stand and sing either</p>

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

<p>standing.</p>	<p>the Hallelujah in the same way it is sung in the old service, or the liturgist may say these words: This is the Word of the Lord. The congregation then responds by saying: Thanks be to God. A Hymn shall then be sung</p>
<p>12. Reading of the Gospel at the lectern with the congregation seated</p>	<p>Reading of the Gospel: While the congregation is standing, there shall be a procession which is led by the presiding minister or liturgist of the service. The procession will include the liturgist and the acolytes who shall be carrying the crosier and the big Bible which is to be read by the presiding pastor. The procession shall move towards the middle of the isle. Incense shall be burnt as they move from the altar to the point of reading the Gospel. The acolyte shall raise the Bible high while the minister reads. Usually, the scripture portion is sung or chanted. When the pastor finishes reading the Gospel, a chorus which says: <i>Limnandi ivangeli</i> would be sung together with the congregation and people</p>

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

	would be dancing and clapping hands expressing the spirit of joy. After the reading of the Gospel, the procession moves back to the altar.
13. Confession of Faith: The minister shall turn to the congregation and say: let us confess our faith according to the words of the Apostles Creed	Confession of Faith: The minister shall turn to the congregation and say: As we have read the Word of God, let now affirm our faith according to the word of the Apostle's Creed. The Creed shall be said while the congregation is standing.
14. Sermon Hymn: the congregation shall stand.	Sermon Hymn: While the congregation standing, a sermon hymn shall be sung and the acolytes would be undressing the chasuble from the minister and leading him to the pulpit.
15. Deliverance of the sermon	Deliverance of the sermon
16. Offertory Hymn: at the end of the offering, the minister shall receive the offering plate, turn to the altar and sing with the congregation a short song of praise.	Offertory Hymn: At the end of the collection, the minister shall first make a short prayer, before singing: <i>Dumisa osibusisayo dumisani Bantu nonke, mawudunyiswe phakade Yise Ndodana noMoya Ongcwele.</i>
17. Main Prayer of the Church	Main Prayer of the Church

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

<p>18. Holy Communion Hymn. The congregation shall stand and while the minister prepares the communion elements on the altar.</p>	<p>.Holy Communion Hymn. The hymn is prolonged to enable the acolytes and the presiding minister to go to the vestry through a procession. The intention is to fetch the elements, the chalice, and pattern. Then they bring all these. Firstly acolytes incense the presiding minister. He too incenses them and the altar.</p>
<p>19. <i>Sursun Corda</i>: with hands lifted up slightly, the minister shall sing facing the congregation: Lift up your hands to the Lord. The congregation then say: We lift them up unto the Lord.</p>	<p><i>Sursum Corda</i>: The minister with hands lifted up slightly, shall say to congregation: Lift up your hearts to the Lord, and the congregation shall say: We lift them up unto the Lord, and the minister say: It is right and salutary that at all times and in all places we give thanks and praise to the Lord.</p>
<p>20. <i>Prefatio</i>: the minister shall turn to the altar and lifting up his hands slightly shall chant or say these words: <i>Ngempela kufanele kulungile ukuthi ngezikhathi zonke..</i></p>	<p><i>Prefatio</i>:</p>
<p>21. The <i>Sanctus</i>: the congregation sings: Holy Holy Holy.Lord God Almighty</p>	<p>The <i>Sanctus</i>: The congregation sings Holy Holy Lord God Almighty, Heaven</p>

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

<p>Heaven and earth are full of your glory, hosanna in the highest.</p> <p>22. Holy Communion Prayer and Lord's Prayer. The Lords prayer is said.</p>	<p>and earth are full of your glory hosanna hosanna in the highest.</p> <p>Holy Communion Prayer shall be read by the minister. Immediately, after the prayer, the congregation shall rise and sing the Lord's Prayer. Acolytes hold each other's hands until the epilogue of the Lord's Prayer is sung where the presiding pastor and acolytes hold up their hands. Congregation is also encouraged to do the same.</p>
<p>23. Words of Institution sung: the congregation shall stand. With his hands raised slightly above the elements, the minister shall sing or say the words of institution.</p>	<p>Words of institution sung: With the congregation standing, the minister shall say or sing the Words of Institution, and at intervals small bells would be rung three times. When the first bell is rung, the minister genuflects, and when the second one, and the third one is rung the minister genuflects also three times.</p>
<p>24. <i>Angus Dei</i>: The congregation while standing shall sing; O Christ the lamb of God, that takes away the sin of the world have mercy upon us.</p>	<p><i>Angus Dei</i>: The congregation respond by singing: O Christ the lamp of God, that takes away the sin of the world, have mercy upon us. Sometimes different</p>

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

	melodies would be sung.
25. The <i>Pax</i> -Greeting of Peace: With the patten and bread in his hands the minister shall turn to the congregation and invite the communicants by saying or chanting: The peace of the Lord be with you always.	The <i>Pax</i> . After the minister has sung or said: The Peace of the Lord be with you, the congregation responds by saying: And also with you. This shall be followed by the singing of choruses while the presiding minister, acolytes and congregants sharing the peace by greeting each other also possibly hugging each other. A bowl of water shall be given to the presiding minister and those assisting him in the distribution to wash their hands as they are about to distribute the Communion.
26. Distribution: While a suitable hymn is sung, those who want to partake, file in groups and kneel at the altar rail. The minister shall say: Take and eat this is the body of Christ given for you. Take and drink, this is the blood of Christ shed for you. The presiding minister is the last to receive the communion	Distribution beginning with the presiding minister and those assisting him, before distributing to the congregants. Otherwise, the arrangement followed in the old service, is the same as it is done in the new service. When the distribution is complete, the service of the blessing of children shall be sung: <i>Ujehova uyalonda abantwana abancane, ubafaka ekhwapheni, ubalonda ezingozini</i> . All children would file in front

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

	<p>of the minister to be prayed for by the minister in charge and his assistants. Normally, children enjoy this part of the service.</p>
<p>27. Post Communion Prayer or Thanksgiving Prayer</p>	<p>Post Communion Prayer, shall be followed by singing or saying the <i>Nunct Dimittis</i>. Which says; Lord, now let your servant depart in peace: according to your word; For mine eyes have seen your salvation; which you have prepared before the face of all people; A light to lighten the Gentiles; and the glory of your people Israel. Glory be to the Father, and to the Son and to the Holy Spirit: As it was in the beginning, is now and ever shall be world without end. Amen.</p>
<p>28. Salutation: The Lord be with you. Bless we the Lord</p>	<p>Sallutation:</p>
<p>29. The Benediction: The Lord bless you and keep you. The Lord make His face shine upon you, and be gracious unto you. The Lord lift up His countenance upon you, and give you peace. Amen.</p>	<p>The Benediction: After the Benediction which is the same as in the old service, the procession shall go back in retrospective manner, with the acolytes in front followed by the bishop and the rest of the</p>

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

	file.
--	-------

The element, which needs to be highlighted in this service, involves different clerical gowns, incense and ringing of bells. The detailed information about the use of these liturgical elements will be explained further in this chapter.

Meanwhile it is necessary to give clarity of some important concepts. The ‘High church’ communion service in the chapter and in the whole study refers to the liturgical development which took place in the South Eastern Diocese (SED) of the Lutheran Church in 1992. These changes entailed in the main Sunday service, the service of acolytes and servers, reading of the gospel while standing, burning of incense, ringing of bells and wearing of copes. These elements were added to the old main Sunday service, which will be outlined in full in the next chapter.

In this chapter, it will be also argued that the Lutheran Church in the South Eastern Diocese (SED), has to an extent been practicing the ‘high church’ liturgy or service during the time of the mission churches, which in this particular instance, it was the time of the Church of Sweden Mission (CSM). The main signs of ‘high church’ service, as Walter Elwell argues, are the two gospel sacraments, the Lord’s Supper and baptism, and includes an emphasis on duly ordained and educated clergy, respect for the Catholic tradition, especially the ecumenical creeds, and a search for good liturgy.⁴⁴ According to the explanation of the

⁴⁴ W.A.Elwell, *Evangelical Dictionary of Theology*.(Michigan: Backer Book House, 1984) pp.35

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

‘high church’ communion service by Walter Elwell, not many elements added to the old ELCSA service are new. However, the concept of ‘high church’ is new in ELCSA, something that makes the new service appear foreign and is viewed with suspicion by some members of the church.

2.3 Procession Liturgy

The ‘high church’ service begins with the procession liturgy. As it has been mentioned before that the ‘high church’ service has elements which also exist in the old ELCSA worship services, and the procession liturgy is one of those elements. The difference in the way procession is practiced in the ‘high church’ liturgy is that it is done with marked dignity and formality. The use of acolytes carrying burners, the crosier, incense vessels, liturgical books and Bibles, explains the dignity and difference accorded to the procession practice. Those who have seen the procession in the ‘high church’ service could tell that the service takes a different atmosphere and look from the old ELCSA service.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

According to Zondi, two people walk together in a column that also includes a column of pastors in their clerical vestments.⁴⁵ Paul Lang, an American theologian, echoes this point when he describes procession as a practice where during church service, two or three people walk together in a column, the superior walks behind those of lower rank. If the arrangement is practical, those of higher rank sit on the gospel side of the church facing north. Such an order into the church gives the service that is about to start dignity and respect. Processions are old customs that occur during festivals and special occasions and an opening hymn may be sung. The people in procession enter the church in reverence and silent procession. The congregation should rise as the people in the procession enter the church building.⁴⁶ It is said that Chrystostom made a prayer in which he thanked God for appointing orders and hosts of the service of the glory in heaven, He prayed: “make our ceremony a procession of angels and archangels, ministering with us and praising your goodness”.⁴⁷ We have a report of another procession in the church which was called the Gospel procession, whereby the priest and the deacon make three reverences before the altar, then the priest takes up the gospel book and gives it to the deacon.⁴⁸ There was also the Eucharistic procession where the priest takes the paten and sets it on the deacon’s head. The latter holds the paten with one hand, censer with the other, then the priest takes the chalice and both the priest and the deacon go out through the north door, preceded by a taper-bearer, and stand facing the congregation.⁴⁹

The late Bishop T.H. Mbuli, of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa (ELCSA) said that processions had been in the Jewish tradition a solemn and dignified

⁴⁵ M.Zondi; Interview at LTS, August 27,2000.

⁴⁶ L.D.Reed, *The Lutheran Liturgy*. (Philadelphia: Fortress Press,1947) pp.251.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.* pp .667

⁴⁸ *Ibid.* pp.251

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

practice. He pointed out that in a procession, no one may talk, play or greet friends. A procession is a practice, which leads the congregation to the solemn service.⁵⁰

In the ELCSA Holy Communion service, the Lutheran Church had observed the practice of the procession liturgy in the main Sunday services as in ordination, consecration services and in diocesan rallies. Processions are usually held in services that are led mostly by Bishops, Deans, parish or parochial pastors. At other times than the prescribed one, processions were optionally practiced by pastors for various church services. The order of the procession usually runs from the lowest rank, which is that of an elder up to the rank of the Bishop. At the end of the service at procession, the Bishop leads the procession in reverse order, followed by the rest of the ranks respectively. Deans follow the bishops. Pastors pair themselves according to their ordination dates and the order runs down to the rank of Evangelists.

The procession in the ‘high church’ communion service is not done in a different way as compared to the ELCSA procession liturgy, except for the fact that more dignity and solemnity is given, and it includes the servers and acolytes wearing long ropes of black and white or red and white colour, carrying candles and Bibles for the officiates. The procession therefore becomes one of the main features of the ‘high church’ communion service.

2.4 The three Readings: the Old Testament, the Gospel and the Epistle

⁴⁹ Ibid. pp. 679

⁵⁰ Th. Mbuli. (1997) “Guideline for gestures to be observed in the divine service.” Johannesburg: (unpublished, Church Council Minutes no. 67. pp.3.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

The practice of the three readings had not been done in the old ELCSA service as it is now practiced in the ‘high church’ service at Umphumulo. The old service restricted itself to only the epistle and gospel reading. The intoning or reading of the Old Testament in the new service has introduced a remarkable change in the ELCSA liturgy. Dean Khuzwayo believes that the church has taken a correct liturgical direction because the Old Testament worldview has to be reflected in the liturgical service.⁵¹ I assume that one would not be necessarily opposed to such practice if it had not been for its introduction without sufficient agreement in the diocese and the perception by some people that it consumes much time in the service than it was before. I personally do not see it as a problem to do the readings, so long as the congregation is prepared about such changes. D. Reed, a Lutheran theologian in his book, “The Lutheran Liturgy” writes, “the rubrics of the common service permitted the reading of the Old Testament lesson, before the Epistle reading”.⁵² Reed further states that the common liturgy has taken a step in the direction of the restoration of the Old Testament lesson. The lessons were regularly sung by the minister in the Lutheran services after the reformation. Dr. Martin Luther, in his *Deutsche Missa*, the German Mass in 1526, indicated a method for choral reading of the lessons in vernacular. The church services occasionally permitted the reading of the lessons instead of chanting or intoning them. If the minister was unable to sing, the Old Testament reading and the Epistle reading were read rather than chanted, and the Gospel was chanted or read.⁵³

The Lutheran reading according to Reed, has the following order,

1. Old Testament reading

⁵¹ L.Khuzwayo, Interview at Umpumulo, October 10, 1998.

⁵² L.D.Reed, *The Lutheran Liturgy*.(Philadelphia: Fortress Press,1947) pp. 75.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

2. Epistle reading

3. Gospel reading

As Reed says, the Old Testament moves us towards the Gospel. The Epistle reminds us of what it means to be a Christian. The Gospel is the climax to which the congregation has been moved by the first two readings. In the Gospel reading, it is Christ himself talking to his people. In response and loyalty, therefore, the congregation has to stand for the Gospel reading. Historically, the first mention of the reading of the Old Testament lesson in the Eucharist occurs in the Constitution of the Apostles. It indicates the reading of two Old Testament lessons, followed by a reading from Acts or the Epistles and at the end it is the reading from the Gospels.⁵⁴ One notices some changes occurring in the ‘high church’ liturgy in this regard.

In the ELCSA liturgy scripture lessons, as it was said before, reading usually started with Epistle reading, followed by the Gospel reading and a third reading would be either taken from the Epistle or from the Gospel as a sermon text. These readings did not include the Old Testament reading. Rev. R. Nxele, now a pensioned Lutheran pastor of ELCSA, comes from the Church of Swedish background and still serves as the Diocesan Chairman on the Committee on Liturgy, as a way of supporting and motivating the Diocesan committee on liturgy and the Diocesan Council of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa-South Eastern Diocese for the adoption of the three fold lesson reading. He says that the three-fold reading was adopted by the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa, Natal-Transvaal region (ELCSA-NT) in their lectionary. The American Lutheran churches

⁵³ Ibid. pp. 679

⁵⁴ J.D.Davies, A New Dictionary of Liturgy and Worship. (London: SCM. Press,1972) pp. 438.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

and the Lutheran Church in Australia and other Lutherans do likewise. In the ecumenical world, the liturgies of the Roman Catholic and the Anglican Church liturgies also have the three-fold readings, the Old Testament, the Epistle and the Gospel.⁵⁵

2.5 The Signs of the Cross

The Proponents of the ‘high church’ liturgy, like Mpanza, believe that signing oneself with a cross reaffirms you with your Christian identity that you belong to Christ. They believe that there is nothing theologically incorrect about signing yourself with a cross because it was practiced in the medieval church. It is true that such traditions are not going to be easily ignored, especially in churches like the Lutherans and the Anglicans that share their history and traditions with the Catholic Church.⁵⁶ Davies says that, one of the earliest references to signing with the cross is found at the end of the second century in the words of Tertullian (AD 200), where he says, “at every forward step and movement, at every going in and out, when we put on our clothes and shoes, in all the ordinary actions of

⁵⁵ R.E. Nxele, (1995) “The development of Liturgy”, Umphumulo: unpublished. Pp.4.

⁵⁶ J.Mpanza,interview at Umphumulo, July 8,1999.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

everyday life, we trace the sign of the cross.” Davies continues to say that, it is impossible to ascertain whether such continuous domestic self-crossing was ever generally observed, but it is historically evident that it became customary and was eventually prescribed as a regular ceremonial gesture in many points of liturgical life.⁵⁷

Lang says that, crossing oneself was practiced by Christians from the earliest centuries and goes back to apostolic times. Lang says, we know for certain that crossing oneself was a common ceremony used daily in AD 200, quoting again from the words of Tertulian where he says, “in all our undertakings- when we enter a place or leave it; before we dress; before we bathe; when we take our meals; when we light the lamps in the evening; before we retire at night; when we sit down to read; before each new task, we trace the sign on our foreheads”⁵⁸

Lang says, Luther in his small catechism prescribed that “in the morning when you rise in the evening when you go to bed, you shall bless yourself with the holy cross and say: In the name of God the Father, Son and Holy Spirit. Amen.” Again in his large catechism Luther recommended that parents should instruct their children to cross themselves for the purpose of recalling their divine protector in moments of danger, terror and temptation. Lang argues that this ceremony is still authorized in many of the present-day Lutheran service books⁵⁹

Describing how the ceremony of crossing oneself is done, Lang says, crossing oneself is done by putting the fingers on the right hand to the forehead, to the breast, and to the left

⁵⁷ J.D.Davies, A New Dictionary of Liturgy and Worship. (London: SCM Press, 1972.) pp.69.

⁵⁸ P.H.D.Lang, Ceremony and Celebration. (Missouri: Concordia Publishing House:1965), pp 71

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

and right shoulders. By doing this, Lang argues, Christians strengthen their faith in the Triune God and in their redemption through Christ crucified. However, this is more than a profession of faith (as it might appear to most); it is a prayer in action of thanksgiving or for blessing to God the Father, in the Holy Spirit, through the mediator, Jesus Christ.⁶⁰

2.6 Bowing and Genuflecting to the Altar

Bowing and genuflecting to the altar had been practiced in the old ELCSA liturgy though it was not a strict expectation of all the pastors. It mostly depended on which mission background one came from. It was mostly practiced by the pastors who shared a background with the Church of Sweden Mission (CSM). Rev. R.E. Nxele who comes from the CSM tradition maintains that this practice gives the service solemnity and an expression of devotion to God Almighty.⁶¹ It is implied by Nxele that a service without this practice disregards the dignity of the service as if it was actually a big omission even though there had not been a strict rule that all should do the practice without question. I think that it is up to the church authorities to give guidance about the practice as such. It would be prudent, therefore, to refer to scholars about the liturgical background of the practice. Lang explains bowing to the altar as closely related to genuflecting. He defines genuflection as a liturgical action whereby one touches the ground with the knee right at the place where the

⁵⁹ Ibid. pp.72

⁶⁰ Ibid. pp.73

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

foot was placed and stand up-right again at once in a continuous action. Lang continues to say, bowing and genuflecting are signs of respect. They give form and expression to inner devotions, and make worship meaningful and expressive. Bowing and genuflecting are acts of reverence to God.⁶² Kneeling has been a sign of submission and surrender to the conquering ruler as victor in the Gothic tradition and possibly in other traditions as well.

Davies also describes bowing of the head as a sign of recognition and respect. He says that it developed liturgically as a reverence to the bishop, to the altar, as the throne of Christ, to icons of Christ (especially the crucifix), and generally as a mutual salutation between participants in the liturgical action. Davies says, for more than a century a simple bow was the only reverence given in the course of the Latin mass. In the medieval period it was customary to bow at the *groria patri*, at the mention of the Holy Spirit in the Nicene Creed, and at the Sanctus.⁶³

Davies describes genuflection as brief kneeling on the right knee with body erect. It is usually used with reference to the sacraments since the fourteen century. It derives from civil recognition of the imperial officials in antiquity and previously had no place in the ceremonial of the Christian Eucharist. In the Roman Catholic Church it is also commonly used as a reverence towards prelates and to crucifixes.⁶⁴

⁶¹ R.E.Nxele, 1995, "The development of liturgy", Umphumulo: unpublished. Pp.4.

⁶² P.H.D. Lang, Ceremony and Celebration. (Missouri: Concordia Publishing House 1965), pp.68.
J.D.Davies, A New Dictionary of Liturgy Workship. (London: SCM Press, 1927), pp.317.

⁶³ Ibid.

⁶⁴ Ibid.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Davies continues to say, originally, kneeling was not a common posture for prayer of all kinds as it has become in the Roman Catholic Church and Anglican churches. The primitive posture for prayer was standing (often with arms outstretched- as in the catacomb paintings), and this is still the custom in the Eastern Orthodox churches. In contrast, in most Protestant churches, sitting is the preferred posture.

2.7 The Passing of the Peace

This practice has not been common or entirely done in the old ELCSA worship services. Zondi maintains that it allows an atmosphere of acceptance and openness between the members of the congregation. It is an act that promotes the spirit of reconciliation. The practice brings warmth and community into worship. The practice encourages and emphasizes on congregational participation and a response that is important. It makes the service more accessible.⁶⁵

According to Reed, the passing of peace is a short benediction that is the remaining fragment in the liturgy of two observances of the early church. It is a solemn blessing of the people by the celebrant immediately before the communion.⁶⁶ Reed observes that the passing of peace was practiced before partaking of the sacrament of the altar. He asserts that, the early Christians expressed their love of one another and their oneness in Christ by

⁶⁵ M.Zondi, Interview at Umphumulo LTS, August, 2000.

⁶⁶ L.D.Reed, *The Lutheran Liturgy*. (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1947), pp.366.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

kissing one another either at the offertory or just before the distribution of Holy Communion. The kiss is expressed in the *Pax Domini*, which is ‘the peace of the Lord be with you always’ immediately after the communion. In addition to the words, the celebrant may express it to the people by bowing and extending his open hands towards them, and they in turn may do so by bowing to him. Reed also notes that there are however no attempts made by the worshippers to extend the greeting of kissing one another.⁶⁷ As it has been said before that, the Umphumulo Parish has adopted the practice by having the congregants hugging each other, while pronouncing the peace to one another just before the distribution of Holy Communion.

2.8 Vestments

It has been mentioned before that when the synods established by the Berlin Mission Society (BMS), American Mission Society (AMS), Norwegian Mission Society (NMS), Hermannsburg Mission Society (HMS), and the Church of Sweden Mission (CSM), in Natal and Zululand merged in 1960 to form the Evangelical Lutheran Church (ELC) in South Africa, the liturgy was one of the major instruments used to bring the different Lutherans together.

Vestments had also been a matter of concern. Parishes, which came from the BMS, HMS, and the NMS, were exposed to the use of the talar. These vestments attempted to combine the traditions of the mentioned societies in Southern Africa. The CSM on the other hand, used albs, stoles, chasubles and copes. The use of copes, however, was reserved for bishops. When ELCSA was formed in 1975, the vestment issue was part of the agenda. It was agreed that all pastors were going to wear albs, stoles and chasubles when conducting Communion services. The agreement was, however, not adopted by all the stakeholders

⁶⁷ Ibid

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

because some of the synods still held their tradition tenaciously. It took those synods some time to come to terms with the use of those vestments like albs, stoles and chasubles. The ‘high church’ services, since most of its traditions come from the CSM background, has further introduced the use of copes by all pastors, not only restricted to bishops. It can be argued that in terms of vestments, the addition to the vestments that pastors of ELCSA had been using is only the cope. It is of interest to say more about the significance of these vestments.

2.8.1 The Stole

The stole is a strip of material about four inches (ten centimeters) wide and up to twenty-six feet (eight metres) long. It may be made of white or colored textiles and may be plain or embroidered. It is worn over one or both shoulders in distinctive ways by bishops, priests and deacons. It is normally worn over the alb and under any other outer vestments. The remote origin of the stole is obscure. However, its Christian use is derived directly from a scarf worn by Byzantine officials as an ensign of rank.⁶⁸

2.8.2 The Alb

The alb is directly derived from the tunica Alba of classical times. It is now usually a long white tunic reaching to the feet, made of linen, and belted with a girdle or cincture at the waist. It has close-fitting sleeves and is collarless. The long white tunic, which was generally worn by professional people, did not become exclusively a Christian vestment until the beginning of the fifth century.⁶⁹

⁶⁸ Ibid.

⁶⁹ J.D. Davies, *A New Dictionary of Liturgy and Worship*. (London: SCM Press, 1972), pp. 367.

2.8.3 The Chasuble

The chasuble and the cope alike are derived from an outer cloak generally worn in the Graeco-Roman world by all classes and both sexes (gender). The former type became known as a casula or ‘little house’, from which the name chasuble is derived, while the latter type is the forerunner of the cope, or kappa, signifying ‘topmost’ garment.⁷⁰

2.8.4 The Cope

The cope had been accepted or recognized to be used by all ordained pastors in the South Eastern Diocese. It is no longer restricted to be worn by bishops. The cope, like the chasuble, is a ceremonial version of an outdoor cloak commonly worn in the Byzantin Empire. Basically, it is a semi- circular piece of cloth worn around the shoulders and held together at the front by a clasp or morse. Apart from a curious deviation in the Church of England, the cope is worn at non-eucharistic ceremonies, e.g. baptism, marriage; procession, in place of the chasuble. It may also replace the dalmatic or the tunicle (the variant form of the tunica alb or alb, which by the fourth century was commonly worn over an alb as part of distinctive ‘uniform’ of both bishops and deacons).

Davies, continues to say that, the cope is not restricted to bishops and priests. Reed also points out that in some Lutheran countries, especially bishops use a cope.⁷¹ In the West, the cope is a general ecclesiastical garment of glamour and has never been a distinctive clerical vestment. Davies notes that, there is no liturgical equivalent to the cope in the Eastern Orthodox churches, though some bishops wear cope-like mantles on occasion. At

⁷⁰ J.D.Davies, A New Dictionary of Liturgy and worship. (London ,SCM. Press, 1972), pp. 368.

⁷¹ L.D.Reed, The Lutheran Liturgy. (Philadelphia: Fortress Press,1947), pp. 251,387

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

the time of the Reformation in England, it was ruled that the principal minister at the communion in cathedrals and collegiate churches should wear a cope with several colours over a plain alb. This custom is still observed in some cathedrals and ex-collegiate churches despite of the fact that a cope is an extremely inconvenient garment in which to perform the Eucharistic actions and gestures.⁷² Biyela echoes the point on the wearing of the cope when he points out that originally, a cope was a royal garment. A minister leading a procession or a wedding may wear a cope. He underlines that it is only in ELCSA where a cope is confined to bishops. In the other Lutheran traditions in America and Europe, it is used by the ministers and bishops.

2.8.5 The Cassock.

The Cassock has not been a common vestment in ELCSA. Many people have identified the vestment with the Catholic Church and the Anglican Church. In the advent of the “high church” liturgy, the cassock together with the other vestments which have been mentioned is at regular use in the South Eastern Diocese.

The word itself in English is derived from Latin *cassaca* or French *cacique*, possibly derived from the name of a barbarian tunic known in the second century as *caracal*. The cassock is an ankle-length tunic with narrow sleeves. It is usually girt at the waist with a belt or cincture, but may be buttoned from neck to foot; it may be of any colour. It is universally worn under the Eucharistic vestments and all other liturgical garments, but it is not itself a vestment, Davies says. He notes that though the cassock is used as an under-garment, it is also worn as an over-garment for wear indoors and outdoors. Davies also holds that the cassock is not an exclusively clerical garment and may be

⁷² Ibid.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

worn by servers, choristers, vergers and other ecclesiastical persons.⁷³ In agreement with Davies, Lang asserts that a cope was originally used as a raincoat. In appearance, it was similar to the chasuble, but the difference is that it was hung on the shoulders and fastened on the chest.⁷⁴ Lang also notes that the cope is not a Eucharistic vestment. Its chief use is for festive Matins, Vespers and outdoor services.⁷⁵ Dr M.D.Biyela, the rector of the Lutheran Theological Seminary at Umphumulo, argues that use of a cope is appropriate when a minister leads wedding or a procession service.⁷⁶

2.9 The Acolytes and Servers

Acolytes are one of the minor orders of the ministry. The office existed in the church in Rome by the middle of the third century. It was subsequently into the other parts of Western Christendom and is still one of the stages through which aspirants to the priesthood in the Roman Catholic Church pass.⁷⁷ The acolyte's functions were originally similar to those of the modern servers and included the carrying of ceremonial lights. It was used to denote someone who carries a torch or candles in liturgical processions.⁷⁸ Morrow says that, an acolyte was given a candlestick, with the right to carry lights and give wine and water at holy mass.⁷⁹ Pelikan observes that by the time of the Reformation, it is clear that acolytes and servers were an established part of the *cultus* of the mass.⁸⁰ However, Pelican's concern is whether this particular *cultus* of the mass did survive Luther's

⁷³ J.D.Davies, A New Dictionary and worship. (London: SCM. Press, 1972), pp. 376.

⁷⁴ Ibid. pp. 377

⁷⁵ P.H.D.Lang, Ceremony and Celebration. (Missouri: Concordia Publishing House, 1965), pp. 45-55.

⁷⁶ Ibid.

⁷⁷ M.D.Biyela, Interview at Lutheran Theological Seminary, September 17, 1998.

⁷⁸ J.D.Davies, A New Dictionary of Liturgy and Worship. (London: CM. Press,1972), pp.1.

⁷⁹

⁸⁰ Ibid.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Reformation scalpel.⁸¹ Elwell further develops the understanding of acolytes by saying, acolytes, exorcists, readers or lectors and doorkeepers or porters were all classified as minor orders. In the Eastern Church, Elwell asserts, acolytes, exorcists and doorkeepers have been merged with the sub deaconate, but readers and cantors remain.⁸²

He explains the ministry of servers by saying that, from the beginning, it becomes evidently clear that servers, as we have come to know them, are ministers or servants who assist ordained ministers in the service of worship. As early as the third century, the church began to use servers during the mass. The ELCSA parish at Umphumulo drew remarkable attention of the ‘high church’ service through the use of acolytes and servers. A number of the youth were drawn to the activities of these church services. Acolytes also broadened the suspicion of those pastors who were opposed to the ‘high church’ service, since for them the Lutheran Church had become a Catholic Church through the backdoor.

2.10 Incense

2.10.1 Historical use of incense

The use of incense at Umphumulo had been one of the causes of argument and conflict at the congregations of SED. A number of people saw the use of incense as introduced by Bishop Zulu. One can sympathize with the disgruntled masses on the view that they were not prepared for practices like burning of incense in the ELCSA church. It came as a shock and betrayal of loyalty to ELCSA’s practices and it challenged the integrity of the Bishop

⁸¹ J.O.R. Pelikan, *Catholic Faith*. (Kenosha: Wisconsin, 1961), pp.348.

⁸² W.A.Elwell, (eds.), *Evangelical Dictionary of Theology*. (Michigan: Backer Book House, 1984), pp.722-723.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Zulu in the eyes of those who were against the new liturgy. Again it would be worthwhile to investigate the theological significance of these elements in order to educate the church members, as it nearly cost the church its unity. Biyela says that, incense is universal in a sense that it exists in many religions. In Africa it is burnt when invoking the ancestors. It is traditionally called *impepho*. It is used for expelling evil spirits. Historically, it was used as a symbol of royalty. It was burnt for the king and for the captain of the army. So that is why incense is used in the procession because a procession has to do with the victory of Christ over death. Biyela maintains that St Paul is using incense in a metaphorical way when he says that, Christ is leading us in a parade of victory, and we are a sweet aroma of salvation to those who are saved, but to those who are not saved we are a bad smell. Biyela concludes by saying that, therefore, incense means the victory of Christ over all evil forces and that is what incense symbolizes.⁸³

Davies describes incense as a number of woods and resins which, when heated or burned, give off a fragrant smell; ‘frank’ or pure incense otherwise known as olibanum, is the solidified resin of trees belonging to certain species of bowllia. The use of incense in divine worship is of great antiquity and is exceedingly widespread. In the pre-Christian cultures of the Middle East and the Mediterranean, seven religious uses of it may be distinguished as a:

1. sacrifice to the god or gods;
2. sacrifice to the shades of a deceased human being or beings;
3. symbol of honour to a living person or persons;
4. demonfuge, to drive away evil spirits, whether from the living or from the departed;

⁸³ M.D. Biyela, Interview at Lutheran Theological Seminary, September 17, 1998.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

5. means of purification or healing (a use not always to be distinguished from the preceding);
6. festive accompaniment for processions and similar ceremonies;
7. simply to create a worshipful atmosphere.

Incense is also used on non-cultic as well as cultic occasions for practical purposes, but there is no evidence for, and considerable evidence against, the theory that this is the origin of its religious use.⁸⁴ Davies notes that during the first three centuries of the Christian era there was no ceremonial use of incense in the church's worship, and many writers of this period refer to it, as to most other practices of other religion, in terms of disapprobation. In this period, incense was associated in the Christian mind with its use in the emperor-worship; it was also used in the ceremonies of what the Christians regarded as false religion.⁸⁵ By the sixth century there were clear cases of the use of incense as a sacrificial offering in the sense of an act of adoration in return for which divine blessings are asked, a use which persists to this day in most of the Eastern liturgies. In the West, this sacrificial interpretation has almost completely disappeared since the early middle ages, being replaced by the offering of incense not as a prayer in itself, but simple as a symbol of prayer.⁸⁶

⁸⁴ J.O.R.Pelikan, *Catholic substance and Protestant Principles in Luther's Reformation*. (London: SCM: Press,1964), Pp.13.

⁸⁵ W.A.Elwell, (ed.), *Evangelical Dictionary of Theology*. (Michigan: Backer Book House, 1984), pp.722-723.

2.10.2 Use of Incense at the Eucharist

Davies holds that the earliest use of incense at the Eucharist was honorific. It was borne before the celebrant at the entrance, and before the reading of the gospel. The use of incense in the entrance procession gave rise in the Medieval West to a censuring of the altar on arrival, a sacrificial or devotional censuring, to which was commonly added an honorific censuring of the celebrant, and sometimes of others as well. Censuring of the altar, or of the book of the gospels on it, came commonly to be prefixed to the bearing of incense in the gospel procession, and in many places a censuring of the ministers and the choir was added after the reading of the gospel. From the tenth century, a sacrificial or devotional censuring was added after the offertory, often with the censuring of ministers, choir and people as well. Davies continues to say, from the thirteenth century, in many places, with the introduction of the elevation of host and chalice at the consecration, censuring came to be added at this point, as an act of adoration. According to the revised Roman Missal of 1970, incense when it is used, is used in the entrance procession, to cense the altar after the entrance in the gospel procession and during the reading of the gospel; after the offertory, to cense the offerings the altar, the ministers and the people; and at the elevation of the host and chalice at the consecration.⁸⁷

⁸⁶ J.D.Davies, *A New Dictionary of Theology and Worship*. (London: SCM. Press, 1972), pp. 196.

⁸⁷ *Ibid.* pp. 197

2.11 Ringing of Bells

In the same way the incense has drawn sensation to the church members, ringing of bells caused consternation. I think that if there had been educational workshops, people would have embraced these practices with less dissatisfaction since research has shown that the Catholic Church had been practicing them, which means that they have a liturgical and theological background. To make want to carry on these practices, they would need to be introduced gradually and the matter debated upon to reach sufficient consensus about their usage. Biyela argues that bells are reminiscent of the cymbals which the book of Psalm 150 attests to. (Psalm 150:4. Praise him with clanging cymbals; praise him with loud clashing cymbals) and He says that, originally, in the Roman Catholic Church, bells were meant to indicate a turning point of the liturgy of the Word to the liturgy of the Eucharist. Originally, bells were rung many times, but lately, they are rung when the celebrant has said the preface and when the congregation has sung the *sanctus* or the “holy, holy, holy”, repeatedly and when the minister has consecrated the bread and wine to which he may genuflect. Biyela clarifies that people may be confused by the connotation attached to the dogma transubstantiation, that in the Catholic Church the bells are rung when the Communion elements were said to be changing from bread to the body and from wine to the blood of Christ in that magical and miraculous way. As according to Biyela, this is a tradition which is no longer practiced in the Catholic Church.

Davies maintains that bells were much used in the British Isles from the sixth century. From the eighth century bells came into widespread use and were blessed by a bishop with

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

holy water and chrism. They were not only used to summon people to worship but also a bell was rung at the death of a parishioner. Small bells at the altar and in some instances a special small bell in the belfry at the lifting of the host. Davies continues to say, bells are used in the Eastern Orthodox rite not only to summon people to worship but also during the liturgy and offices to mark certain points in the services.⁸⁸

2.12 Conclusion

The chapter underlined that the concept of Holy Communion was not new in the Lutheran Church. The practices of acolytes, incense and vestments like copes were new. As the Lutheran Church, by historical background is related to the Roman Catholic, introducing the unfamiliar elements of the ‘high church’ service like acolytes, bells and incense, was probably not going to be a formidable task, if it had a well calculated approach to the people concerned.

⁸⁸ J.D.Davies A New Dictionary of Liturgy and Worship. (London: SCM. Press, 1972), pp. 197.

CHAPTER THREE: CALLS FOR LITURGICAL REFORM (1985-1992)

3.0 Introduction

The chapter explores the role played by the Shiyane Circuit of the South Eastern Diocese and the appeal for spiritual relevance and discovery in the ‘high church’ liturgy. It deals with the challenges of the theology of the Roman Catholic Church and the African Indigenous Churches (AIC’s) on worship in the ‘high church’ liturgy. The chapter also deals with the quest or yearning for change, relevance and the perspectives of the Reformation in the ‘high church’ liturgy. Lastly, the chapter gives a timeline of the process of the development or change of the new liturgy. The process unfolds from 1992, where the liturgy was first introduced at the Diocesan Rallies held each and every year until the celebration of the Jubilee Year in 1995.

Calls for liturgy reform in the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa (ELCSA), according to Rev Musa Zondi, a Lutheran pastor of the South Eastern Diocese (SED), a member of Parliament and national deputy minister of labour, were first demanded by members of the Youth League in the South Eastern Diocese (SED), in the Durban South parish as early as 1985.⁸⁹ Zondi argues that the dissatisfaction with the old liturgy was expressed by the youth in Durban who complained that they felt as if they were not part of the church service. In an attempt to address this need, the youth began to sing choruses in the service, something that had not been a usual practice before. This did not help because after singing the choruses, they still reverted to the same liturgy, where the presiding pastor would do everything.⁹⁰ It appears a bit unbelievable, though, that the youth was not given

⁸⁹ M.Zondi, Interview at the Lutheran Theological Seminary, August 27, 2000

⁹⁰ M.Zondi, Interview at the Lutheran Theological Seminary, August 27,2000.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

opportunities to participate in the service. One is inclined to think that the youth was not deprived of opportunities to participate in the services as it appeared to many as such.

The youth were involved in the scripture readings, both the New and the Old Testaments. They were also engaged in the collection of offering, church choir and in many other activities like sweeping the floor of the church building and decorating it with flowers every Sunday. What appears to be more appealing to the youth about the ‘high church’ liturgy, is the fact that within the main service, the youth have a portion of participation where they carry candles, burn the incense and wear long robes, something which gives them some recognition and self-satisfaction. The youth who were attracted to the ‘high church’ Holy Communion service were also encouraged by the church visits they made to the Roman Catholic and the Anglican churches where these activities were practiced. In a historic meeting with Bishop LE. Dlamini, (late) leader of the SED in 1987, it is reported that some of the youth leaders indicated to the bishop that they were not accommodated in the liturgy, expressing their strong feeling of dislike and dissatisfaction with the liturgy.⁹¹

It is highly improbable, however, that the meeting of the youth with the bishop would spark a situation in the church that could cause a reform of such great stature. In the first place, the youth was not constitutionally represented in the Diocesan Council, thus they could not easily and quickly penetrate the whole structures of the Diocese.

One can assume that the youth was not alone in their call for a more participatory service.

Some elders from some congregations of the Lutheran church saw the need for a more

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

spiritual edification and joined the call for a change in the way in which the liturgy was conducted. Among those influential people was Mr. M. Zondi, a layperson and not ordained at the time. Why did the laity call for liturgical changes? For many, the old liturgy had become non-participatory and restricted mainly to pastors and a few elders of the congregations. Others saw the new service as encouragement to their youth in attending church services. In the case of Zondi, the reason why he became more involved and so interested in the new service was because of his wife. He stated that his wife formerly belonged to the Roman Catholic Church. For this reason, he had to make some adjustments in the Lutheran church in order to accommodate her as she continuously complained that the Lutheran church had a dormant liturgy.⁹² After a congregation at Shiyane Circuit at Madadeni in Newcastle had introduced the 'high church' liturgy, the move gave his wife a reason to consider joining the Lutheran ranks. The new changes gave Zondi even more enthusiasm to study the history of liturgy and to seek for ways of making the new service acceptable in the Lutheran Church, SED.⁹³

3.1 The role of the Shiyane Circuit and the appeal for spiritual relevance and discovery in the 'high church' liturgy

⁹¹ Ibid

⁹² M.Zondi, Interview at Umphumulo Lutheran Theological Seminary, August 27, 2000.

⁹³ Ibid.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

The Shiyane Circuit in the South Eastern Diocese introduced the ‘high church’ service for the first time in 1992 at the KwaNomusa congregation at Madadeni in Newcastle. Meetings were held where discussions concerning the introduction of the ‘high church’ communion service were conducted, where people were informed in the Diocese. Information was championed by the parishioners of Newcastle led by three powerful members of the Newcastle Parish Council: Mrs. E. Ntombela, Mr. J. Mpanza and Mrs. E. Madonsela. These members were greatly motivated by the research made by Zondi. The basis of his research was that other European Lutheran churches already practice the ‘high church’ communion service. Zondi himself argues that the demand and implementation of the ‘high church’ service was brought about by the lay people and later taken up by pastors.⁹⁴

Once a few pastors had supported the introduction of the ‘high church’ service in the parishes, willing elders and members of parish councils spread the news and immediately implemented the new order of service in their respective parishes. The practice of the new service gained power when it was also supported by Dean J.J. Mbatha, Dean of the Shiyane Circuit at the time, who was mostly loved and favoured by his parishioners.⁹⁵ One can assume, therefore, that the ‘high church’ service was fought for by the laity, youth, some pastors, deans and later by the bishop. It can be observed that the liturgical movement which started at Shiyane Circuit of the South Eastern Diocese (SED) influenced the rest of the diocese. Parishes in the Durban Circuit and those of Umvoti Circuit, adopted the high church’ service. The Shiyane Circuit to this very day still practices the service vigorously. To that effect, they employ pastors and deans who are congruent and adherents of the ‘high

⁹⁴ J. Mpanza, Interview at Mbabane, July 8, 1999.

⁹⁵ J.Mpanza, Interview at Mbabane, July 8, 1999.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

church' service, despite the fact that the church, ELCSA, used a sending system in deploying pastors to parishes. The Shiyane Circuit, as its own method of recruiting used to get those pastors who would support and promote the 'high church' service in their circuit. Through the influence of the Shiyane Circuit, the new service exists as if it had always existed in the Lutheran Church of ELCSA. It must be taken into cognizance, however, that this liturgical development has strengthened the double existence of the old ELCSA service and the new 'high church' service.

'We can recall, too, that the idea of the 'high church' communion service was not entirely new in the South Eastern Region. As we already hinted before in the second chapter that the Cooperation of the Lutheran Missions (CLM) had to meet and accomplish its goals in the unity talks, each mission had to give its contribution in the founding of the Regional Church. For instance, the Church of Sweden Mission (CSM) contributed the 'high church' liturgy which expressed the high regard of the liturgical movements and the wearing of copes by their bishops, while the Norwegian Mission Society [NMS] contributed the task of awakening spirituality, emphasizing Bible studies and evangelism. The Berlin Mission Society (BMS) contributed the pure doctrine, emphasizing a high standard of academic training for its missionaries, and the American Mission Society (AMS) contributed organizational skills in church work.⁹⁶

According to this source, the (CSM) had to an extent introduced some parts of the 'high church' liturgy, though not practicing all of its elements, e.g. the lighting of candles, the procession, high respect of the altar by the presiding pastor, and the wearing of albs and

⁹⁶ G. Scriba and G. Lislerud, 1997. "Lutheran Missions and Churches in South Africa," in R. Elphick and R. Davenport (eds.), *Christianity in South Africa*, (Cape Town: James Currey and David Philip). Pp.107.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

chasubles. Copes were also used, however, by only the bishops. The practice at the time did not include elements like the burning of incense, acolytes and servers and the ringing of bells. Those congregations that were started by the CSM, like the Appelsbosch and Mtulwa parish, North-West of Pietermaritzburg and East of Tongaat, and other parishes, could bear witness to this fact. It must be said that ‘high church’ liturgy was experienced in these mentioned parishes, except for those parishes the CSM did not touch. One can, therefore, argue that what is said to be new in the ‘high church’ liturgy was mainly the burning of incense, acolytes, wearing of copes by pastors, intoning and reading of the Gospel standing, and the ringing of bells. In my opinion, these were the changes Mpanza and Zondi are referring to.

Mr. J. Mpanza said that the causes of the highly innovative ‘high church’ service in the Lutheran church in the SED, brought to the Newcastle parish council members profound joy, something they had been demanding for a long time, a more expressive and demonstrative form of worship service in the Lutheran church. He says they wanted a service which would appeal to all the senses of a human being in worship, one which would be engaging or participatory, involving the youth as acolytes, thus expressing the meaning of worship in a church service.⁹⁷ A second interview with Mpanza helped to clarify this sentiment. Mpanza believes that the quest for the emancipation of the liturgy from the Western oriented liturgical worship did not become the concern only for the members of the African Initiated or Independent Churches (AICs). It virtually became the concern of all Africans consciously or unconsciously.⁹⁸

⁹⁷ J Mpanza, Interview at Mbabane, July 8, 1999.

⁹⁸ J.Mpanza, Interview at Mbabane, July 8, 1999.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Simon Moriipe attests to this fact when he says, ‘The Western-oriented churches in Southern Africa have europeanized, institutionalized and intellectualized Christianity in this sub-region of Africa. But this approach has no future in Africa because the human being is not merely intellect, but has also feelings, a desire for fellowship and mutual concerns which are basic elements of a true and meaningful religion.’⁹⁹

Rev. E.N. Nsibande, church historian and former rector of Umphumulo Lutheran Theological Seminary, echoes the concerns both of Mpanza and Moriipe when he says, the need to contextualize Christianity in the African Lutheran Zulu Church has been felt much in connection with worship. The liturgy and music used in worship in the church have been influenced by the expatriate church (referring to the European and American church). The church still follows blindly the ways of worship as practiced in Europe and America, despite the fact that such ways do not penetrate the hearts of African people. The rituals followed in the church like when the congregation should sit or stand during worship services, are all practices dictated by the Western norms.¹⁰⁰ Nsibande continues to say, in worship, indigenous Christians wish to see the African church liberated from European and American domination. This can be seen by the desire shown by many church members to use or initiate certain practices that are used in the African Independent Churches (AIC). Western hymns, melodies and musical instruments are too complicated and in many cases people are not touched by such music. The church should be free to set up its own way of

⁹⁹ S. Moriipe, 1995. “ The making of an Indigenous Clergy in the Zion Christian Church” in P. Denis (eds), *The Making of the Indigenous Clergy*, (Pietermaritzburg: Claster Publications) pp.102.

¹⁰⁰ E.N. Nsibande, (1981). *Historical Development of the Evangelical Lutheran Church- South Eastern Region*. Pretoria: UNISA. (unpublished Masters thesis) pp.106.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

worship, not just for the purpose of differing from European or American ways of worship, but for the purpose of reaching and touching the hearts of Africans.¹⁰¹

Dr John S Mbiti says that Africa should not copy the design of European church buildings. He suggests that round or oval church buildings could be used for worship rather than only rectangular ones. Mbiti continues to say, in fact, there are many areas in worship and sacraments where local customs could be followed instead of foreign customs.¹⁰² These concerns confirm the fact that the African Indigenous Churches have had a valid point in saying that faith and worship should not be the matter of only intellectual and abstract participation. This also confirms the point that the ‘mission churches’ at long last have come to the realization that AICs and the Roman Catholic Church, which followed thereafter, have been relevant in their theological approach to African people, and they will remain in the leading roll in the concept of Africanizing the church in Africa.¹⁰³

3.2 The challenges of the theology of the Roman Catholic Church and the AIC’s on worship in the ‘high church’ liturgy

One can therefore assume that the calls for the liturgical changes in the Lutheran church in the SED, were informed, challenged and motivated by the evident works of the Roman Catholic Church and indirectly by the influence of the AICS. The African Indigenous Churches (AICs), and the Roman Catholic Church have worked out a relevant and contextual theology for African people. It invites them and reaches out to their own worldview without taking them across the sea with the European and Western concepts of

¹⁰¹ Ibid.

¹⁰² J. Mbiti, *African Religions and Philosophy*. (London: Ibadan, Heinemann, 1969) pp.25-27.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

understanding God and defining belief. As a result of this approach, these churches have gained a large following and support from the African population. The Roman Catholic Church, by way of recognizing that Christ and the Bible is not the only way to God, uses human mediation. Among other human mediations, they employ the invocation of the saints. They believe that each saint has a special sphere of activity assigned to him. Thus, Saint Anne grants riches, Sebastian wards off pestilence, Valentine heals epilepsy, and George protects knights. It is believed that the great things that the saints have done serve as examples to men in their public or private life, as a means of confirming their faith and as an incentive to imitate them in public affairs.¹⁰⁴ The invocation of saints as used by the Catholics, have shown or revealed an important element about human life and belief. Understood from an African philosophy and religion, the concept of ancestor veneration is one of the strong human mediations used by Africans.

John Mbiti says, after the physical death of a member of the family, especially an adult, he continues to exist. Relatives and friends who knew him in this life and who have survived him remember him. They recall him by name, his character, his words and incidents of his life. He is a person who is physically dead but alive in the memory of those who knew him in his life as well as being alive in the world of the spirits. Mbiti continues to say that, in other societies such spirits are incorporated into the body of intermediaries between God and man, and human beings approach God through them or seek other help from them.¹⁰⁵ This insight could show us how the Roman Catholic Church, in its theology and liturgy, has been relevant to the philosophy and religion of African people. It is against this

¹⁰³ B. Britten, *We don't want your white religion*. (Wheaton, IL: Tyndale House of Publishers, 1984) pp. 29.

¹⁰⁴ T.G. Tappert, (ed.) *The book of Concord*. (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1959) pp. 233-4.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

background also that it has been so successfully responsive to the African context in the inculturation of its theology and worship. Catholics have approached the concept of human mediation with a positive and open-minded encounter as one of the important vehicles to God. The Catholics have done this with a collective approach rather than with an individualistic approach, as Martin Luther tended to adopt. Clergy, vestments, paintings, incense, rituals and others, serve the purpose of human mediation in worship. The question, which can be asked, is, if the Lutheran Church in ELCSA has begun to recognize some of the human mediations in their worship, like incense, vestments and other rituals like bells, does it mean also a change in their theology of worship which could possibly mean that they could openly employ the role of ancestors in their worship, just as it is practiced in the Catholic Church and in the African Indigenous Churches (AICs). This question will have to be faced extensively in the fifth chapter.

The argument that the elements of the ‘high church’ liturgy were taken either from the Anglican or the Roman Catholic Church cannot be disputed. The Lutheran church could not resist the temptation of using the ‘high church’ service from the Catholic Church. However, in one’s opinion, it is questionable whether this liturgy came only as a result of the youth and the laity’s influence. It would rather appear that an influence of a theologian with the Church of Sweden Mission (CSM) background was involved, and the theologian is no other than Rev. M. Zondi.

The exposure of Zondi to liturgical studies and personal experiences from traveling around the world; meeting with American Lutherans and many others who already practice the ‘high church’ service, meant that the youth had great chances to successfully call for the

¹⁰⁵ J.Mbiti. *African Religions and Philosophy*. (London- Ibadan, Heinemann, 1969) pp. 25-27.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

introduction of the “high mass” service. This discovery of a new form of worship was valued in contrast to the existing ELCSA liturgy, which according to Mpanza, is dormant and inactive.¹⁰⁶ It is, therefore, clear that the partnerships of the American Lutheran church and the European churches also largely contributed to the development of the ‘high church’ service in the South Eastern Diocese. It is, however, necessary at this point to realize that the youth could not be the ones who actually called for the ‘high church’ liturgical changes, since they would not have much theological meaning and understanding about it. It seems more likely that the youth called for a simple liturgy, which could permit them to sing choruses and to render personal testimonies, as is common practice in the Pentecostal churches. One would, however, suspect that a certain person took advantage of the demands of the youth to meet the requirements of introducing the elements of the ‘high church’ liturgy or service in the Lutheran Church.

It is crucial to analyze the way the new changes of the liturgy were introduced to the SED. One thinks that it is essential to understand that the role of worship in a church service is to foster unity. The church or congregants join together in worship to celebrate the oneness they have in Jesus Christ, the head of the church. For this reason, it is very important for congregants to worship the Lord united in aim and in purpose. Such unity must be observed and appreciated by those in and outside the church. The introduction of the new elements of the ‘high church’ service in the diocese was an immense change itself, It, therefore, would have required a very careful way of handling it. People ought to be prepared for such changes if the diocese aspires to uphold unity and oneness. Rev. R.E. Nxele, chairman of the Committee on Liturgy in the South Eastern Diocese, argues that the introduction of the

¹⁰⁶ J.Mpanza, Interview at Mbabane, Swaziland, July 8, 1999.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

‘high church’ service in 1992, means that the Lutheran and Roman Catholic churches share much in common, making them close as a result. He argues that there is nothing wrong with the two churches growing closer to each other.¹⁰⁷ However, it is equally significant for him to consider that not all pastors were happy with this development, and mainly because they were not involved in the deliberations about those changes, which the Diocesan Liturgy Committee was responsible of facilitating.

There is another trend that the liturgy is constantly developing as an essential part of the life of the church. Lobbyists for the ‘high church’ service find it easy to live with the changes that have been introduced in the new service, while other members find it hard to deal with the new service, especially in aspects like the clerical vestments, burning of the incense, the use of bells and the role of acolytes and servers in the Lutheran church. Whether the new changes are good or not is a highly debatable matter. At present, it is sufficient to argue that the ELCSA-SED will have to constructively engage in the analysis and review of its administration and teaching strategies in the diocese, how the new change is going to be managed by the authorities of the diocese, and assessing the future of the ‘high church’ communion service.

3.3 Yearning for change, relevance and the perspectives of the Reformation in the ‘high church’ liturgy

According to Bishop S.P. Zulu, the coming of the ‘high church’ service in the South Eastern Diocese was indirectly caused by the discontinuation of financial assistance from overseas mission donors. Dioceses of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa (ELCSA) had to see to it how to generate income for itself. Diocesan consultations were

¹⁰⁷ R.E.Nxele, 1995, ‘The development of liturgy’, Umphumulo: unpublished. pp.4.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

made firstly with church members of the church who were of respectable standing in the communities around the diocese. The reason for using people of such stature according to Bishop Zulu, was that they have command and influence to the lives of the people, and if their influence was to be used for the benefit of the church in encouraging the congregants to support the church, then their social and political positions as community chiefs and *indunas* was used fruitfully in the church. The next step that was taken to bring awareness and concern about the life of the diocese was to consult with the category of professionals like nurses, doctors, teachers and magistrates who were members of the church. The same intention was to make them take full responsibility and ownership of the church in terms of supporting it, not only financially, but also with their selfless involvement in the activities and life of the church in the diocese.¹⁰⁸ As a result of the several consultations held in the diocese, a theme that would guide and motivate everyone in the diocese to revive and transform the church in the diocese was developed. It was called, “*impilo yebandla lami ingumtwalo wami*” meaning, “the needs and concerns of my church is my responsibility”. Out of this theme came the question whether people are to dedicate themselves to the needs of the church, what and how the church itself can give as a response. According to Bishop Zulu, it was discovered that the worship service was not fulfilling and did not involve the congregants to participate meaningfully in a church service. It was discovered that the Lutheran Church had neglected spiritual treasures after the Reformation, some of which Martin Luther did not abrogate and negated, but which had significance in the spiritual edification in the church. A number of research papers were delivered at diocesan consultations and synods on worship. It was finally realized that a service which appealed

¹⁰⁸ Bishop S.P. Zulu, Interview at Escourt, March 15, 2002.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

to all the senses of a person was needed to be developed, such as the sense of touch, smell, hearing, sight and feel. According to Bishop Zulu, the ‘high church’ service accommodates all these senses in it.

In a Reformation service in 1993 at Umphumulo, Bishop S.P. Zulu, delivering a speech stated that the South Eastern Diocese introduced the ‘high church’ service because they clearly understood the historical meaning of the reformation of Martin Luther that, it was meant initially to challenge the Roman Catholic church on some liturgical practices in the Latin mass and in other theological matters. Bishop Zulu’s understanding about the new service was that Lutherans, especially of the South Eastern Diocese, understand and emphasize that the intrinsic aim of Reformation was not to form a new church, but to abrogate the wrong teachings that tended to obscure and incapacitate the teaching of the scriptures. Zulu believes that the reformation of the church is not a dead past. It contextually exists today. For that reason, the South Eastern Diocese (SED), accordingly, retrieves the liturgical practices and traditions as practiced in the Roman Catholic Church. He holds that the SED practices the ‘high church’ service not as foreigners to these rich liturgical traditions, but only retrieving that, which was ignored and left out in the development of the Lutheran church. Bishop Zulu by introducing the new service, aimed at the reviving worship spirit and hoped that congregants would be strengthened and encouraged to use the treasures of the tradition in their gatherings.¹⁰⁹

¹⁰⁹ Bishop S.P.ZULU, 1993, “Reformation day speech on the introduction of the ‘high church’ service,” Umpumulo: unpublished. Pp 2.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

One would also believe that the liturgy the Lutheran Church took from the Catholic Church has to be revoked, if there is time and means to do so. However, it must be considered that for the Lutheran Church in Southern Africa, it would be like beginning a new Lutheran Church, especially in the minds of the elderly congregants of the church. Arguably it would be like going back to the mother Catholic Church. However, if such a change had been preceded by intensive educational workshops of pastors to start with, and proceeded to the laity and youth, one presumes that many misconceptions could have been avoided, and that would have also not compromised the Diocese in its way of exposing its theological discourses and relating them to its church members.

Dr. M. Biyela is correct when he says that the ‘high church’ service is a universal trend in the Lutheran church. However, the major problem is that this new service had not been used in the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa (ELCSA) ever since her existence in 1975. The Church of Sweden Mission (CSM) in Natal used the ‘high church’ service, even though not all aspects of it as they did at home in Sweden, but it used most of them in ELCSA services. In the United States, most of the elements of the ‘high church’ service are practiced. This is because in the United States, the Lutheran congregations have always been leading in terms of developing the liturgy and other respects because their churches have congregational autonomy. Some of them even go as far as reforming their liturgy.¹¹⁰

Biyela argues that the reason why ELCSA is always left behind in liturgical development is that the church in Africa, in most cases, is left out in the ecumenical dialogue occurring

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

either in Europe or in America.¹¹¹ This dialogue Biyela refers to, should have been something similar to what ought to take place within the Diocese, to fully ensure maximum consensus and common understanding about the new service before attempting to implement it. In accordance with the main question how the ‘high church’ service came about in the diocese, Biyela maintains that the idea was presented by Rev. M. Zondi to Bishop Zulu, and Bishop Zulu responded by accepting it and introduced it without wasting time.¹¹² Rev. M.D. Biyela confirmed by saying that the people who were instrumental in spearheading the discussions on liturgy was Rev. M. Zondi together with the youth of Durban and elders of the Shiyane Circuit who are said to have started the ‘high church’ communion service. Judging from the way the whole service was started; a possibly by an influential person in the diocese who works for a powerful national political organization, you are likely to assume that he might have been aware of the bishop’s soft spot when convincing him to blankly accept the idea and eventually implement it without deliberating on where and how he could involve all the stakeholders, beginning with the members of the clergy, followed by the Diocesan Council, Circuit Council, Parish council, and Congregational Council, respectively following the top down trend.

It can therefore be assumed that the reason why many congregants rejected the ‘high church’ communion service is that no consultation took place with the lower structures of the church. Bishop Zulu was seen as imposing his will on the church in the diocese without caring to follow proper communication channels.

3.4 The process of reform (1992 - 1996)

¹¹⁰ M.D. Biyela, Interview the Lutheran Theological Seminary, September 17, 1999.

¹¹¹ Ibid.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

It is a prerequisite in this instance to show the process in which the new service begun in the 1992 Diocesan Rally, to show how the new service was initiated and how the congregation responded to it. A rally according to the understanding of Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa South Eastern Diocese (ELC-SED), is a mission festival whereby the members of the church either at a parish level, circuit level or diocesan level gather for church activities. These may include an offering for the diocese, discussion of important church or theological discourses and all church members would all assemble at a Church Centre to attend the church event and participate in the gathering.

3.4.1 The 1992 Diocesan Rally

The elements of the ‘high church’ service were not introduced in the diocese before 1992. Dean LB Khuzwayo argues that the rally became the vehicle to unfold the new service. He says that he is the one who conducted the liturgy on the day of the introduction of the ‘high church’ service.¹¹³ Khuzwayo says he had acolytes and servers for the first time at the rally. Something remarkable is that Khuzwayo, himself being a member of the Committee on Liturgy in the South Eastern Diocese, did not know that on that day a new liturgy was going to be introduced¹¹⁴. Khuzwayo says not many people knew what item was going to follow next, including himself. He says that in the procession, the acolytes and servers were in front, with a few pastors following. Khuzwayo himself came after the acolytes, and the last to enter the church was the bishop.¹¹⁵ It sounds very strange that even a member of the committee on liturgy was not included in the huge liturgical changes that were about to

¹¹² L.B.Khuzwayo, Interview at Umphumulo, June 10, 1999.

¹¹³ Ibid.

¹¹⁴ Ibid

¹¹⁵ Ibid.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

start. It confirms the assumption that the arrangements and discussions for the service were conducted behind close doors with the bishop of the diocese.

Once the service had begun, Khuzwayo says he appealed for calm, urging the congregants not to be too surprised with the new order of things. Slowly, the congregation followed the service in dismay until they came to the liturgy of the Holy Communion. He argues that as soon as incense was burnt by one of the acolytes, a few congregants left the church, some coughing in disbelief to what was happening.¹¹⁶ “There was nothing that could be done because once the service had commenced, there was no going back. Somehow we survived the day through struggling with the liturgy until the end of the service. The bishop addressed the congregants telling them that this was a new way of doing business in the diocese.”¹¹⁷

Khuzwayo say not all were too astonished. Some were excited about these elements of the ‘high church’ service. He says that Bishop Zulu later admonished his pastors to take the ‘high church’ service seriously and implement it in their parishes and congregations. According to J. Mpanza, the idea of the ‘high church’ service was that it was going to be reserved for important occasions like ordinations and diocesan rallies. He says he was taken aback to learn that the new service was to be implemented in the parishes and had become formally introduced in the Lutheran church, commencing from the 1992 Diocesan Rally held at Umphumulo.¹¹⁸ One can already observe that the way the bishop presented the new

¹¹⁶ Ibid.

¹¹⁷ L.Khuzwayo, Interview at Umphumulo, October 10, 1998.

¹¹⁸ J.Mpanza, Interview at Umphumulo, October 10, 1998.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

service as alleged by the informant, sounded more like imposition and you are more likely to expect negative reactions thereafter.

3.4.2 The 1993 Diocesan Rally

A new element that was introduced in the rally of 1993 at the Diocesan Centre at Umphumulo was the ringing of bells during Holy Communion service. The ringing of bells was introduced in addition to the acolytes and servers. It transpired that each diocesan rally since 1992 brought new elements of the ‘high church’ service.¹¹⁹

The ringing of bells did not come without questions from congregants; but more especially from the members of the clergy. On the same night of the rally in which the ringing of bells had been introduced, Khuzwayo says he received a call from a pastor complaining about the bells which were rung during the service. He says the pastor was disturbed and argued that the bells had disturbed the free-flow of the service and upset the general congregants. The pastor went on to complain that, such a practice for him meant that the Lutheran church was taken through the back door to the Roman Catholic Church where it once belonged in the medieval times.¹²⁰ Those are the reactions you would most likely receive when things had been done the way the new liturgical change was implemented.

3.4.3 The 1994 Diocesan Rally

As it was mentioned earlier on that in 1992 in the Diocesan Rally where the ‘high church’ service was first introduced, there was burning of incense, a thing which caused some disturbance in the congregation, and which resulted in some congregants coming out of the

¹¹⁹ L.B.Khuzwayo, Interview Umphumulo, June 10, 1999.

¹²⁰ Ibid.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

church hall. The use of incense at that time however, after the rally, was sporadic. It was not frequently used since the Rally Committee was not sure of the reaction of the congregants. Despite the reaction of the congregants in the rally, the Diocesan Rally Committee, the members who organized the diocesan rally, formally introduced the use of incense in a sense that they discussed about its use, and evaluated the previous reaction of the congregants. The committee was composed of Rev. M. Zondi and Mr. J. Mpanza, among others. It was this committee that implemented the burning of incense at that rally. As mentioned before, Zondi was the most influential figure in the implementation of these elements of the ‘high church’ service. Armed with the expertise, knowledge, experience and exposure, it was very easy for him to convince his willing committee to implement these sweeping changes in the 1994 rally. Also, he commanded a great deal of respect from the church officials as well.

Meanwhile, an interesting development regarding the introduction of the ‘high church’ service occurred. In the same year, the Diocesan Committee on Liturgy made a formal complaint to the Diocesan Council after seeing that many liturgical practices had been implemented at the diocesan level without consultations or their participation.¹²¹ The Diocesan Council then issued a statement saying that the Rally Committee had erred in failing to consult the Diocesan Committee on Liturgy about the new changes. The statement said that it is the privilege and responsibility of the Committee on Liturgy to make recommendations regarding liturgical matters in the diocese.

¹²¹ Ibid.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

The Diocesan Council adopted the ‘high church’ service, and issued a formal statement accepting the use of copes, the use of the sign of the cross, the use of the *nunc dimittis*, a prayer which is said at the end of the service, and many other changes that came with the ‘high Church’ service.¹²² The Diocesan Council’s acceptance of the ‘high church’ service marked the end of the conflict between the Diocesan Committee on Liturgy and the Rally Committee. However, significantly, this meant that the new changes had been finally accepted by the body that executes the decisions in the diocese, thus making the ‘high church’ service an official service to be implemented by all Lutherans in the South Eastern Diocese. Ironically however, we did not get reports which said that, the practice of the new service was formally accepted in the Diocesan Synod, which is the highest decision-making body in the diocese.

3.4.4 The 1995 celebration of Jubilee Year

The Jubilee Year celebrated in 1995 at the Diocesan Centre by all Lutherans marked 150 years of the existence of the Diocesan Centre that was founded by the Norwegian Mission Society through Bishop Hans Schroeder. J H. Magagula, a history student, recalls that Schroeder first built Umphumulo Lutheran Church Centre and then Umphumulo Lutheran

¹²² *Nunc Dimittis*- The liturgical words which were said by Simeon in Jerusalem when Jesus was brought by his parents for blessing in the temple; “Master, now you are dismissing your servant in peace, according to your word; for my eyes have seen your salvation which you have prepared in the presence of all your peoples, a light for revelation to the Gentiles and for glory to your people Israel.” Luke2: 25-32. N R S V. (Oxford: University Press), pp. 60.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Hospital in 1845, after securing permission from King Mpande, king of the Zulus, before settling at Entumeni in Zululand.¹²³

It was during the festive day at the Church Centre in Umphumulo that saw all the associations in the Lutheran church attend the occasion. The Women's League (*Abasizikazi*), the Men's League (*Amadoda*), and the Youth League (*Abasha*) from all congregations, parishes and circuits attended the occasion in numbers to celebrate 150 years of the existence of the church. There were also delegates from the Norwegian Mission Society who came to attend the occasion.

The significance of the Jubilee celebrations lies in the fact that it was here that the 'high church' service was fully implemented with all the acolytes and servers, wearing of copes, ringing of the bells during holy communion, burning of incense and other activities associated with the 'high church' were practiced.

Later in the Diocesan Council meeting, the Diocesan Committee on Liturgy and Hymnal requested pastors to give their reactions regarding the use of 'high church' service in the South Eastern Diocese. According to Dean Khuzwayo, all pastors were agreeable to the use of the 'high church' service.¹²⁴ Bishop L. Sibiya, current incumbent leader of the South Eastern Diocese, says that, pastors in the SED agreed that they were going to begin to teach congregants and parishioners the new liturgy or service as soon as possible.¹²⁵ According to

¹²³ Diocesan Council Minutes, no. 74, May 1994.

¹²⁴ J.H.Magagula, (1996) *Inkanyezi Yase Natal as an outlet of political opinion, 1889-1896*. Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal. (unpublished Honours thesis). Pp.6.

¹²⁵ L.B.Khuzwayo, Interview at Umphumulo, June 10, 1999.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Bishop L.Sibiya, the practice of the ‘high church’ liturgy was not a back-door arrangement between Bishop Zulu and the pastors like Rev. Zondi and a few deans in the diocese. Sibiya maintains that the new liturgy was fairly discussed at the pastors’ convention and at the diocesan synod, where all pastors agreed to accept and practice the liturgy in their respective parishes.

The bishop’s view, however, is challenged by the evidence of the dissatisfaction one gathers from the informants that a relatively large number of pastors and laity did not wholeheartedly support the practice of the new liturgy. One can understand why Bishop Sibiya came to such an understanding. He had just succeeded Bishop Zulu in the SED in 1997 for the bishopric, and was very cautious not to seem to be opposed to some work already done by his predecessor. This, however, does not suggest that Bishop Sibiya was blatantly opposed to the liturgy. We do not know about that for certain. All we know from the interview is that he did not oppose the new liturgy. Despite the explanations given both by Dean Khuzwayo and Bishop Sibiya, it still remained that many pastors complained about the introduction of the ‘high church’ liturgy.

It can be argued that the existence of the difference of opinions concerning the reform could mean a serious danger to the whole diocese, where in the same diocese there exist liturgical elements which are not acceptable to a larger group, where those pastors who feel like practicing the new liturgy do so, and those unwilling to do the service also simply refrain. The main issue is that the new change had become a highly controversial matter in the circles of the diocese.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

After the South Eastern Diocesan Council had given its blessing of the ‘high church’ liturgy, it referred the matter to the Church Council, the highest decision making body of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa (ELCSA), as per procedure. The Church Council referred the matter to the Episcopal Council as per procedure, where papers on the ‘high church’ service were tabled for deliberations, before the matter was sent back to Church Council for ratification.¹²⁶ Since neither the Church Council nor the Episcopal Council opposed the ‘high church’ service, it meant that the church had officially adopted the new service.

3.5 Conclusion

It can be concluded therefore, that the issue of the ‘high church’ service was among other reasons the call for a participatory liturgy. On the other hand, there was also a call to revoke the liturgical traditions that were left from the Catholic Church. There was a desire for the ‘high church’ with the hope to revive or bring spiritual awakening in the church. Whether spiritual awakening would be attained with the ‘high church’ service remains a question. It transpired that the development of the ‘high church’ service had been a matter which was not implemented according to the usual structural ways of the SED. That is, from the congregational council up to the diocesan council, if not the other way round, coming from the top structures down to the bottom structures. It would appear that a few individuals had exercised some influence on the authorities of the diocese, something that was not acceptable to many members of the clergy and to some laity members, and something, which finally caused consternation in the diocese.

¹²⁶ L. Sibiyi, Interview at the Diocesan Centre, October 30, 1998.

CHAPTER FOUR: RECEPTION OF LITURGICAL REFORM AT UMPUMULO PARISH

4.0 Introduction

The chapter shows the reactions and responses of the grassroots membership of the South Eastern Diocese to the liturgical changes which were brought by the ‘high church’ service. This was the high point of the exercise, because a refined and sound teaching should be measured by the reaction or responses of the congregants. In the chapter, each sector of the

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

church membership is shown and its reaction. The church membership were, the Youth, Women's, Men's league and the members of the clergy.

In every change conflict of interests and ideas is inevitable. There are people who can accept change. They view change as a challenge and a legitimate and essential thing. Change for such people shows vitality and growth of spirituality in the church. On the other hand, there are those who subversively look at change as a threat to conventional and traditional ways of life.

The changes in the liturgy of the "high church" Holy Communion in ELCSA, have raised some considerable concerns and consternation in some parts of the diocese. To others, it meant to put the church on the track of good liturgical development in line with the Lutheran community in Europe and North America.

It is crucial at this juncture to introduce Umphumulo Parish of the South Eastern Diocese, SED, as a case study in this work. Umphumulo Parish is situated in the vicinity of the diocesan centre, where diocesan decisions are made and most ordinations and diocesan rallies are held. Umphumulo Parish, therefore, became the first parish to witness the new liturgical changes in the diocese. This development already informs us about how liturgical activities were handled in the diocese.

When the 'high church' Holy Communion liturgy was first introduced in 1992, at the Diocesan Rally at Umphumulo, there were subsequent mixed reactions as the liturgy was

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

progressively practiced. I had an opportunity to conduct interviews with the various segments of the church membership at Umphumulo and its vicinity. I held interviews with the youth, men and woman's league, and with the members of the clergy. This wide overview in the investigations helped me to get a broad impression of what the various groups had to say about the matter. I conducted interviews among the groups at Umphumulo Parish. I will begin with the youth, men, women and the members of the clergy respectively.

4.1 Response of the Youth

Most of the youth I interviewed were in the age group of thirteen to about twenty-six years of age. Some of them were servers and acolytes and the others were not involved at all in any of these activities mentioned, but attended the church services on a regular basis on Sundays. Most of the youth, who participate in the services of acolytes and servers, were unreservedly in favour or in full support of the 'high church' liturgy on Holy Communion. The other part of the youth on the other hand, thought that the new liturgical changes had brought confusion and disorder in the liturgical life of the church and particularly in the youth league. Siphon Ntuli, one of the members of the youth who is not in favour of the change argues that, in their youth league, there is now subtle division between those who practice as acolytes and servers and those who are not participants in these services. Those who are acolytes and servers complacently regard themselves as superior to the rest of the other youth. They think that in every youth gathering they should preside over the decision-making and in the youth activities.¹²⁷

¹²⁷ S. Ntuli, Interview at Umphumulo, September 21, 1999.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Those members of the youth who aspired to be acolytes needed to adhere to the ethical rules of good moral behavior. The way those who wanted to be acolytes were selected later became unclear. It later appeared that some were selected because they had been in good favour with the pastor. This, therefore, later brought bitter division among the youth. There were those among them who felt that they were discriminated against, and the pastors did not properly address this kind of attitude. When one tries to follow the argument, it is not easy to tell whether the youth who are opposed to the service are actually opposed. It would rather appear to me that they need recognition; they need to be also accommodated in the 'high church' service without being discriminated against. It is the duty of the church to care for those who are spiritually handicapped. Those youth, who are against the use of the new liturgy, are in reality not against the service as such, but they feel neglected and unaccommodated by the demands of the new service. For those members of the youth who are not necessarily affected by these psychological traces mentioned above, their reason for disliking the new service is that the service takes a long time with its ritualistic proceedings, thus, keeping them too long in the service.¹²⁸

Those youth who are in favour of the liturgical change, think that the liturgy has encouraged them to regard the church as a serious entity in their lives as never before. They believe that they now have a great enthusiasm in participating in the youth and church activities just because of the coming of the new service. This youth also think that it is only after they have been exposed to this new service that they have had ample opportunities in taking up active participatory roles in the church.

¹²⁸ T. Gumede, Interview at Umphumulo, September 27, 1999.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

It is, however, questionable to say that after the introduction of the new service they have more opportunities to participate in the church, as if such chances were restricted before. I would be inclined to think that the chances of participation in the church were granted to the youth even in the old ELCSA service, opportunities like singing and reading of the epistles during Sunday worship services. It had been always the pride of the incumbent pastors in parishes and parents to see the youth participating in the church. The statement made by one member of the acolytes by the name of Thembi Khumalo that the service of acolytes has injected new enthusiasm and united the youth together is questionable.¹²⁹

Organizing the youth had never been an easy task and cannot be over simplified. The fact that there are those members of the youth who cannot be afforded an opportunity to participate as acolytes, already has caused division which could develop into stalling any progress in the youth organisation itself. Musa Mthethwa, a youth member at Umphumulo Parish, argues that the selection of those who are to participate as acolytes is not clearly done. At the end of the day you find that the children who participate are of those notable and highly regarded elders in status in the church. This biased selection has caused a silent protest against the ‘high church’ liturgy by some members of the congregations of Umphumulo Parish.¹³⁰ The service of acolytes and servers is one of the essential minor services of the church, and it is liturgically acceptable to have such a service. However, if such changes are not handled as community events, made open for the youth to participate, it is likely not to receive an overwhelming support of the congregants. The same is true, if it has not been properly introduced to the congregation members.

¹²⁹ T. Khumalo, Interview at Umphumulo, September 27, 1999.

¹³⁰ S.Mthethwa, Interview at Umphumulo, October 10, 1999.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Thabani Duma, a member of the youth at Umphumulo, who also participates as an acolyte, in an overly enthusiastic statement, argues that their involvement in the ‘high church’ service has contributed to preventing them from being involved in crime related activities like drugs, rape, vandalism and violence. Duma maintains that the youth who participate in the ‘high church’ liturgy as acolytes and servers now spend most of their leisure time in service to the church. He says that most of the youth feel encouraged to attend church services rather than staying at home on Sunday.¹³¹

The validity of Duma’s opinion is questionable, because in the interview I held with the youth who are not involved in the ‘high church’ liturgy, I established on one hand that a large majority of the youth league membership is not part of the service of acolytes. The reasons for that vary from strict moral principles laid for an acolyte, to administration limitations in running the acolyte services around the whole parish. On the other hand, I established that the involvement of the youth as acolytes could not necessarily prevent them from engaging in criminal activities. It is an ambitious argument to assume that the ‘high church’ liturgy of acolytes in itself could prevent the youth from immoral and criminal acts.

It is an enthusiastic argument to assume that attempts at building and spiritually guiding the youth in the church only began with the advent of the ‘high church’ service. The guidance from parents, the youth organization and the teachings of the church, all play a pivotal role in the shaping and guiding the life of the youth. It is important to think of the ‘high church’ liturgy of acolytes as one among other church activities that keep the youth active, but not

¹³¹ T.Duma, Interview at Umphumulo, October 10, 1999.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

to regard it as uniquely different from the other church activities. It should not be regarded as a ministry of its own. Acolyte and servers services are those minor services as stated by Walter Elwell.¹³²

Therefore, acolytes' service must not be thought of having extraordinary transformation powers to change the youth. In reality, acolytes and servers should be drawn from the youth organization through some form of co-operation program that guarantees continuity between the youth organization and this minor service in the church.

Thokozani Ngidi, a youth member at Umphumulo Parish, argues that the pastors who practice the service of acolytes and servers in their parishes are inclined to pay too much of their attention to promoting the service of acolytes, spending their time on teaching them, and paying little attention to the youth in their organization.¹³³

The impression one gained from the youth, especially those who seem to be opposed to the 'high church' service were questioning the selection method. For them it is not clear how one becomes an acolyte, since according to the requirement that an acolyte should not do certain things, some of those who are acolytes have already been involved in illicit affairs. Summarily, they then think that the whole matter about being an acolyte or server depends on the favour of the pastor or those responsible for the service. I realized that had it not been for the perception of being ignored or rejected, many of them would have liked to become acolytes and servers.

¹³² W.A.Elwell, *Evangelical Dictionary of Theology*. (Michigan: Baker House, 1984), pp. 723.

¹³³ T.Ngidi, Interview Interview at Umphumulo, February 02, 2001.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

The other reason why they have not joined the service is due to lack of proper administration skills in the diocese, to show how the program of advertising and marketing the service was going to be run. It is imperative that this service is practiced by all the parishes of the diocese and as Umphumulo is our context, to all the congregations of the parish. In this matter, it is not the question whether the ‘high church’ service of acolytes and servers is legitimate or not. It is rather a matter of how the administration of the service was going to be handled. It would have been important to follow the channels and protocols in place with the introduction and the running of the service.

4.2 Response of the Men’s League

It is noteworthy that most of the men who are members of Umphumulo parish, and most of whom are members of the organization which run the affairs of men in the parish called Men’s League, seem not agree with the practice of the ‘high church’ service which had begun in the South Eastern Diocese (SED) in 1992. Those in favour of the new service maintain that it is this kind of a participatory and involving service that has caused the Reformation in the Lutheran Church which Dr. Martin Luther would have loved to see continuing in ELCSA today. Proponents of this service also demonstrate great excitement about this service because it gives them self-dignity in its attributes allowing them

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

remarkable activity, and wearing of the long garments in church services, leading processions and other noticeable roles they play in the service. Those men or church elders who support the service also argue that the service has injected a remarkable motivation in the youth. However, they don't mention that the involvement of the youth has not been a significant one.

Dumisani Sosibo, a member of Umphumulo Parish Council, believes that the Lutheran church in the (SED) has taken a correct liturgical direction which connects it with the long forgotten and lost traditions practiced in the mother church, the Roman Catholic Church. Sosibo believes that all congregations of the South Eastern Diocese (SED), should be taught the 'high church' service.¹³⁴

Mr. J.Mpanza, an officer at the South Eastern Diocese (SED), says that the new service has revived all groups in the church, men and women, girls and boys. He argues that there is cooperation between the acolytes and the elders of the various congregations. Mpanza rejects the allegations that there are conflicts of roles between the acolytes and the elders. This allegation came from a certain elder who complained that the youth, through their role as acolytes, have taken some of the duties allocated for church elders. According to Mpanza, acolytes and elders complement each other. He believes that these duties have helped in alleviating the burden upon the pastor and the elders themselves.¹³⁵ The argument concerning the conflict between elders and the acolytes must not be underplayed because some elders have had these kinds of grievances.

¹³⁴ D.Sosibo, Interview at Umphumulo, October 10, 1999.

¹³⁵ J.Mpanza, Interview at Umphumulo, October 13, 1999.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Sipho Gumede, an elder of the Emnyameni congregation confirmed the argument that some elders now feel they have their duties taken away from them by the acolytes. He argued that it used to be the duty of elders to, for instance, carry Bibles, candles, and lighting up the candles in the church. He had the concern that now it happens that they come to the church and do not know exactly what to do.¹³⁶

It sounds a bit unrealistic what Sipho said, but when viewed closely you could find that there is real conflict of roles, especially when such functions have not been clearly defined. In most cases there had been no teaching for the congregations about the dynamics involved in running the service, let alone the liturgical meaning, and the rubrics of the service. There is no wonder therefore, that in some congregations, even at the main congregation at Umphumulo, there would be some liturgical disorder in the main services. One can, therefore, safely say that, when the service was started from the very beginning in 1992, it was not carefully thought out that such a service had aspects in it, which were virtually new to the people of the diocese. There were aspects that had to be slowly introduced to the people until such time that people had become accustomed to them. Firstly, the service was not known to the people, and secondly, people in the South Eastern Diocese, were not used to long services that could take more than two hours. Thirdly, people were not used to services that used the burning of incense and ringing of bells in the service. These liturgical activities may not be historically and liturgically incorrect in practice, however, such changes should be carefully evaluated before being implemented in the church. Arguments concerning the use of incense were strongly raised by some men or elders in no uncertain terms.

¹³⁶ S.Gumede, Interview at Umphumulo, October 12, 1999.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Fanuel Shezi, an elder at Umphumulo parish said that incense was burnt by Zulu diviners or *izinyanga*, and other people when conversing with the ancestors and when driving away evil spirits. Shezi expressed a remarked dismay when he learnt that incense was also burnt in a Christian service. He maintained that, according to him, the use of incense in a church service was nothing less than retrogressing to pagan worship. He could not understand why at that point incense was given a Christian meaning and significance. He held that the use of incense without intensive teaching could lead people to the understanding that, it is used to invoke the spirits of the dead or departed, or even to drive away the evil spirits. He also underlined the concern that, even if the church had decided to use incense in services, it did not make it its prerogative to first inform the congregations through proper channels about the new change, let alone organizing educational programs for its parishioners.¹³⁷

Xakaza and the other elders, did not have the theological understanding that incense can also be used for a liturgical, church purposes, that it is used for invoking God's spirit, that it symbolizes our prayers rising up to God as aroma, that it is used as a festive accompaniment for processions and similar ceremonies and used as simply to create a worshipful atmosphere.¹³⁸ If such information had been communicated to the congregation through teaching, maybe, there would be a minimal level of confusion or misunderstanding.

Besides those men or elders who expressly refuted the use of incense in the church, there were those who also critically opposed the ringing of bells. They saw the use of incense and bells as the devious introduction of the Lutheran Church to the practice of the Roman Catholic and the Anglican Churches.

¹³⁷ F.Shezi, Interview at Umphumulo, October 01,1999.

¹³⁸ J.D.Reed, A New Dictionary of Liturgy and Worship. (London: SCM. Press, 1972), pp. 197.

4.3 Response of the Women's League

It must be mentioned that a large number of women in the league accept the new service because they believe that it has contributed in encouraging their children in attending church services. Most of the women whose children are acolytes and servers say that after the service has been introduced, they do not have to tell their children to go to church services, as they are self-motivated about worship. It appears that most of those women who have high regard of the new service like it for their children. It appears as if the service exists for their children. They seem not to show the meaning and understanding of the service. The reasons they give for loving the service that, “when we see our children wearing those long robes in the procession, we feel highly spirited, and we imagine as if our children are leading the procession of saints to heaven,”¹³⁹ shows lack of theological meaning and information about the service itself. The women rather show an emotional support of the service than one of ownership and understanding. One can, however, understand why they have little understanding of the service. The fact that the women do not have the basis of theology could have bearing to the understanding of the new service, as it was the case with the men. It is at this point where a minimum theological background of the ‘high church’ communion service would have made great sense before the service was implemented.

Some women did express some serious concerns about the service that it was implemented without first being discussed or taught. Lindiwe Maphumulo represents this concern when she says that, in as much as she appreciates the new service, she is, however, concerned

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

that it was introduced to the parishioners without teaching and involving local congregations in their decision-making bodies. The results of failure to do that have caused discontent and dissatisfaction about the new service, as if the service is illicit in itself. Maphumulo continues to say, the way the matter was handled by the diocesan authorities could be serious in the sense that it could even divide the diocese itself by creating groups of those who support the practice of the service and those against it.¹⁴⁰

The interviews conducted both among the men and women of the South Eastern Diocese had shown some constructive engagements, especially with the men. Some of the interviewees indicated that the subject I have chosen was relevant to their concerns in the diocese. They felt that worship is a significant matter in the sense that it brings the soul into the presence of God. Most of the interviewees indicated that they would like to see the final document of the research since they found it educational and enriching in liturgical matters they were not aware of. Most of them showed disappointment about the introduction of the liturgy without first teaching the congregation. That was too serious to be underrated and they appealed that it must not be repeated in the future. The limitations in the research with the men and women of the diocese, was that the subject demanded some basic theological knowledge for them to follow different lines of argumentation and that some of them argued their points with emotions rather than with informed arguments.

4.4 Response of the members of the Clergy

¹³⁹ S.Langeni, Interview at Umphumulo, October 30,1999

¹⁴⁰ L.Mapumulo, interview at Umphumulo, September 11, 1998

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

It should be mentioned that strong comments about the legitimacy and the demerits of the ‘high church’ service were received from the members of the clergy. It is not surprising that the pastors got involved in the matter. Evidently pastors practice the liturgy of the church predominantly from one Sunday to another. The liturgy has become such a routine in their lives that they do not recite it before going to the congregation. On the basis of that argument, it must come as a surprise to learn that suddenly the liturgy you have used for a long time has since been changed or developed without you even being involved before its implementation.

The other reason why the clergy became more involved in the debates concerning the new service is that they know the theology of the church and its practices. Therefore, they have something to contribute about the structure of the church and its sacraments.

As it was mentioned earlier that, the ‘high church’ service was first introduced in the South Eastern Diocese (SED) in 1992 at Umphumulo, during a Diocesan Rally, where all the ten circuits and all the congregations estimated at more than two hundred and fifty converged for a big service and diocesan announcements and reports are made. The unfolding of the event where all people and pastors who assembled at the rally learnt of the new service for their first time with acolytes, some elders, some pastors and deans, and the bishop in the long procession, all in long robes ranging according to their positions in the church, took everyone who was not aware by surprise. The frequent bowing and signing of the crosses, burning of incense, intoning of the Gospel at the centre of the congregation, dressing and undressing of the presiding pastors and the bishop, ringing of bells during the service of

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

holy communion, and all the strange movements of the new liturgy, roused dissatisfaction in the congregants while some were excited by what they saw happening. To a number of pastors and the general congregants, the service was a Roman Catholic or Anglican Church service or a mixture of the two. They were convinced that the bishop and other church authorities had through back doors returned the Lutherans of the diocese to the Catholic Church, the mother church. Rev.R.Mashiyane, a parish pastor of Umphumulo between 1990 and 1998, at the time when the ‘high church’ service was introduced, says, when the incense was burnt a number of the parishioners were coughing profusely and ultimately came out of the church hall in protest of what was happening.¹⁴¹

No wonder Dean Khuzwayo, who served as dean of Eshowe circuit before his retirement, received a call on the evening of the Diocesan Rally from a certain pastor accusing him of conducting the liturgy of the service he called a “Roman Catholic” type, and disapproving of the whole leadership of the diocese, saying that they have allowed the bishop to mislead the church into Catholicism, and that the deans have failed to advise the bishop appropriately.¹⁴²

In such a situation, you could have expected reactions like those of the pastor, and I believe that he was not alone in this reaction since many pastors had complaints about the innovations. Most likely before the pastor phoned Dean Khuzwayo, he had discussed the matter at length with his co-workers. I would have thought that before the bishop introduces whatever change in church practice or in whatever area he would best consider

¹⁴¹ R.Mashiyane, Interview Umphumulo, September 11, 1998.

¹⁴² L.Khuzwayo, Interview at Umphumulo, October 13, 1999.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

to seek counsel from his advisers, moreover, together with his clergy discuss the theological and pastoral implications of that particular innovation before announcing it to the congregants. I presume that the Lutheran Church in the South Eastern Diocese has channels and protocols through which such a matter could have been dealt with. According to Bishop S.P. Zulu, the introduction of the ‘high church’ service was implemented in accordance with the structures of the diocese. He believes that he consulted with every stakeholder of the diocese. In his assertions, he had consulted with the members of the clergy, the diocesan synod, diocesan council and with the membership of those who felt called to attend the diocesan consultations conducted. The Bishop acknowledges that he had difficulty in convincing some members of the clergy to accept the new service.

Khuzwayo says, however, at the end of the day some of them came to realize that the service was spiritually fulfilling. The Bishop, however, does not say that he received less support from the clergy than from the laity. It was mostly the clergy who opposed the service, mostly opposing the incense, ringing of bells and that the service takes a longer time. The Bishop believes that incense is rightly appropriated in the service. For him, it symbolized prayers and the presence of God. He says, with the incense, the church is trying to translate the inconceivable spiritual insights that which our intellect cannot understand.¹⁴³

Although, of course there are some pastors who argue that Dr. Martin Luther would not have allowed the ‘high church’ service to be practiced in the Lutheran Church. This kind of argument, I believe, can be clarified from the historical background by employing Luther’s position on the question of his development of the *Deutche Massa*. Luther characteristically expressed his general attitude and that of his followers in his tract of 1525, *wider die*

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

himmlischen propheten. “We take the middle path...we are neither Popish nor Karlstadtish, but free and Christian. We elevate the sacrament or not, we do as it pleases us, as God has given us the liberty to do just as we are free to remain unmarried or married; to eat meat or not, to wear a chasuble or not, to be cowled or tonsured or not. Here we are masters, and allow no law, commandment, doctrine, or prohibition.”¹⁴⁴ A possible interpretation of Luther in this caption would be that Luther would not feel un-Christian to practice the ‘high church’ liturgy so long as it does not contradict the authority of the scripture. Gordon W. Lathrop, says that, “the Lutheran form of the Reformation was dealing with worship, critical of the tradition and critically open to innovation. This openness to new cultural phenomena was demonstrated more by Luther’s sorting of the tradition than by the creation of entirely new forms of worship. While “retaining the mass”, while not making “conspicuous changes” in the liturgy, Luther did attack the major and minor canons of the mass, the offertory prayers and the sacrificial prayers of the “consecration”.¹⁴⁵ If we read Luther in context, this tells us that he did not necessarily abrogate the mass. Instead of destroying the whole service, he chose to reform the mass and not to substitute a new service for it. He further said that man is not justified by the performance of rites, nor is he justified by the negligence of rites. He said, liturgical forms are seen as essential tools in our way to heaven. He condemned their abuse but confirmed their proper use in faith.¹⁴⁶

Luther would have considered the arguments for or against the ‘high church’ liturgy, a diaphora, meaning something of insignificant substance or value to ones salvation. The

¹⁴³ Bishop S.P.Zulu, Interview at Escourt, May 15, 2002.

¹⁴⁴ L.D.Reed, *The Lutheran Liturgy*. (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1947) .Pp.106.

¹⁴⁵ S.Anita Stauffer, (eds). *Worship and Culture in Dialogue*. (Geneva: 1994), PP. 129.

¹⁴⁶ T.Ellwyn, 1985, “Lecture notes on Worship”, Umphumulo: unpublished. Pp.27.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

discussions against the ‘high church’ liturgy would matter for Luther if it had enshrined elements that contradicted the authority of the scripture. It must be considered however, that those informants who argued against the use of the ‘high church’ liturgy do so with legitimate reasons. The ‘high church’ service with its elements like burning of incense, ringing of bells during holy communion, wearing of copes by pastors than bishops were anomalous practices to a number of clergy and laity in the then South Eastern Region (SER) and also after the formation of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa (ELCSA) when the South Eastern Region (SER), became the South Eastern Diocese (SED) in 1975/6. Although some clergy and laity in the (SER) were exposed to the wearing of copes by bishops like H. Fosseus, whose background was Church of Sweden Mission (CSM), and first led the South Eastern Region (SER) as bishop; and also although they got exposed to the use of albs and stoles by pastors (especially those who also came from the Church of Sweden background), it did not change the fact that those pastors whose backgrounds for instance, were Berlin Mission Society (BMS), and Hermannsburg Mission Society (HMS), still felt that the use of the talar and *beffchen*, which is the long black gown and the white preaching tab on the neck worn by clergy, during their services was a tradition and practice they maintained and cherished for a considerable time until the formation of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa (ELCSA), in 1975 to 1976.

Differences in liturgy within the societies that brought the gospel in Southern Africa meant that after Martin Luther’s reformation, people interpreted him differently. There were those who maintained that anything which had to do with the Roman Mass had to be abrogated, especially those in Germany. Yet, there were those who read Luther in the context referred

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

above that his reformation, did not necessarily mean overthrowing the liturgy nor to replace it but that he wanted to reform it.

The need for this background in the South Eastern Diocese is to demonstrate that the reason for the complaints of some of the members of the clergy and laity about the new service could be legitimate, in the sense that, the introduction of the ‘high church’ service did not take account of the fact that people were not accustomed to it; moreover they shared different liturgical backgrounds which took the “new” church ELCSA itself considerable time to overcome before reaching some liturgical uniformity even in the liturgy which has been used all along. It comes as no surprise, therefore, why there was and still is consternation and commotion when the ‘high church’ service was introduced in the diocese. The importance of the historical and liturgical background of the diocese and the need to follow the channels of the diocese when the service was introduced was less considered yet it would eventually cause division of ideas about the new liturgical change.

There is a relentless question that needs to be asked as to what happens now to the standpoint of the Lutheran Church of ELCSA concerning the issue of human mediation in worship as it is used and understood in the Roman Catholic Church.

4.5 Conclusion

From the responses of the different leagues, it is evident that there was a need of a workshop session concerning the introduction of the new liturgy. The responses of the Youth league together with the Women’s league, do agree in a sense. The Youth is

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

yearning for a participatory kind of service which is more appealing to them, whereas, the women, or the mothers of the children were happy to see their children attending church services. It was for this reason that most women supported the new service, and that it was gratifying to see their children participating with the pastor in the church service. Some members of the clergy, on safeguarding the ELCSA Church traditions and missionary backgrounds, were not receptive of the new service despite the fact that the service was pioneered by their bishop, some deans and pastors. It can be assumed therefore, that a proper way of approaching the issue in a form of conducting workshop for both clergy and laity on the subject, would have archived positive results.

CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION

It has been established through interviews, published material like workshop handouts, diocesan, circuit and parish minutes, that most people in the South Eastern Diocese have not wholeheartedly accepted the new development of the liturgy. This view, however, does not suggest that all people in the diocese were against the advent of the liturgy.

Those people who were opposed to the service, however, were a remarkable number because they included even a good number of the members of the clergy. The main reason some people opposed the service was due to the way it was introduced at Umphumulo in 1992 at a Diocesan Rally, as it was introduced without proper structural consultation and profound teaching. The members of the clergy wanted extensive theological debate about the service before its implementation. Practices in the liturgy like the burning of the incense, acolytes and the ringing of bells during the Holy Communion, surprised many people because they were not used to it in the ELCSA services.

The practice of the ‘high church’ liturgy, with these pitfalls, nearly caused SED an irreparable breach and indelible mark that would have compromised the peace and unity of the diocese for a long time. Possibly in the future, extensive precautions must be taken to

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

safeguard against strife and division which would in the long run, overshadow any positive attempts invested in the spiritual growth of the church.

The reaction of most members of the clergy concerned the imposition of the service, and that according to their theological understanding, such liturgical practices like the use of incense, acolytes and the ringing of bells, were abrogated by Dr Martin Luther to be used.

I conclude, therefore, that it is such theological misunderstandings and lack of proper information that Luther did not oppose the ‘high church’ liturgy of the Catholic Church but was opposed to the elevation of the mass at the expense of the emphasis of the Gospel.

I concur that a thorough theological convocation should have been conducted before the implementation of the liturgy. There are those existing theological discrepancies that should have been clarified first before its practice. In a way, the imposition of the service upon the grassroots, the pastors and laity, had confirmed the existence of hierarchical leadership structures of ELCSA. These structures allow very little room for the participation of the grassroots level in church decision-making. According to the ELCSA Constitution, the grassroots is provided with the democratic forum however, as the pyramidal structure of the constitution narrows at the top, it becomes the decisions of bishops and deans who have the final word. Therefore, the empowerment of the grassroots in this regard is compromised.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

It must also be stated, however, that the SED had been a remarkable challenge to ELCSA. It must be acknowledged that the development and reform of the liturgy is legitimate and essential. It shows vitality and growth of spirituality in the church. It also challenges the traditional mentality that church practices that were introduced by the ‘ancestors’ of the church are untouchables. The SED has clearly demonstrated that in order to be relevant to the people, there should be changes in the church, though the changes in this particular instance were brought by imposition, which is something that can be avoided in the future. On the overview of the investigation, I think that some practices like the passing of the peace, has brought a new sense of warmth and community into the worship. I think that there is more emphasis on congregational participation. The aim and objective of the development was to make the liturgy more accessible. The colour of vestments and burners has made the rituals richer.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Anita, S. 1994. Worship and Culture in dialogue. Geneva: LWF.
- Benoit, J.D. 1958. Liturgical Renewal: Studies in Catholic and Protestant Developments on the Continent. London: S.C.M. PRESS.
- Blomfield, L. 1930. The Eucharistic canon. London: S.P.C.K.
- Brenner, S.F. 1944. The Way of Worship: A Study in Ecumenical Recovery. New York: Macmillan.
- Britten, Bruce. 1984. We do not want your white religion. Wheaton: Tyndale House of Publishers.
- Davies, J.D. 1972. A New Dictionary of Liturgy Worship. London: SCM Press.
- Denis, P. (ed.) 1995. The making of the indigenous clergy in South Africa. Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publication.
- Elpphick, R. and Davenport, R. 1997. Christianity in South Africa. South Africa: David Philip Publishers.
- Imberg, J. 1989. Let us pray. Sweden: Stiftelsen evangelisk litteraturmission.
- Kidd, B.J. 1911. Documents Illustrative of the Continental Reformation. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Lislerud, G. 1962. *Ubufakazi obuhlangene ngenkolo yobu Luthela kanye nendlela nesimo se Kerike*. Durban: Universal Printing Work.
- Elwell, W.A. 1984. Evangelical Dictionary of Theology. Michigan: Backer Book House.
- Lang, P.H.D. 1965. Ceremony and Celebration. Missouri: Concordia Publishing House.
- Leske, E.V. (ed.) 1977. God's People at Prayer. Australia.
- Lowrie, W. 1953. Action in the Liturgy. New York: Philosophical Libriry.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

- Moripe, S. Micklem, N. (ed.) 1937. Christian Worship, Studies in its History and Meaning. Oxford: Clarendon. in Philippe Denis (ed.) 1995. The making of indigenous clergy in South Africa. Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publication.
- Morrow, L 1961. Catholic Faith. Kenosha: Winsconsin.
- Mbiti, J. 1969. African Religions and Philosophy. London. Ibadan: Heinemann.
- Pelikon, J.O.R. 1964. Catholic Substance and Protestant Principles in Luther's Reformation. London: SCM.
- Parsch, P. The Liturgy of the Mass. St. Louis: Herder.
- Reed, L.D. 1947. The Lutheran Liturgy. Philadelphia: Fortress Press.
- Reed, L.D. 1959. Worship: A Study of Corporate Devotion. Philadelphia: Muhlenberg.
- Sciba, G. and Lislerud, G. 1997. 'Lutheran Beginnings in South Africa,' in Elphick, R. and Davenport, R. Christianity in South Africa. South Africa: David Philip Publishers.
- Shepherd, M.H. Jr. 1946. The Living Liturgy. New York: Oxford.
- Sperry, W. 1925. Reality in Worship; a Study of Public Worship and Private Religion. New York: Macmillan.
- Stauffer, S.A. (ED.) 1994. Worship and Culture in Dialogue. Geneva: LWF
- Tappert, T. G. (ed.) 1959. The Book of Concord. Philadelphia: Fortress Press.

UNPUBLISHED SOURCES

- Ellywn, T. 1985. "Lecture notes on worship". Umphumulo: unpublished.
- Magagula, J.H. Inkanyiso yase Natal as an outlet of political opinion, 1889-1896. (Honours thesis) Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal: 1996
- Makhathini, D.D.L. 1974. "The Lutheran in KwaZulu: then and now". Umphumulo.
- Mbuli, Th. "Guideline for gesture to be observed in the devil service" Johannesburg: ELCSA Church Council minutes, no. 67, 1997
- Nsibande A.E., Historical Development of the Evangelical Lutheran Church-South Eastern Region. UNISA, M.th. Thesis 1981.
- Nxele, R.E. "The development in liturgy", Umphumulo: June 27-29, 1995
- Nxele, R.E. 1994. "The sign of the Cross" Umphumulo.
- Zulu, S.P. "Reformation day speech on the introduction of the 'high church' service, Umphumulo: 1993

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

South Eastern Diocesan Council, no. 50, 1988. (Usage of clerical gown in the church).

South Eastern Diocesan Council, no. 74, 1974. (Usage of clerical vestments).

Church Council Minute no. 90. 1999. (The use of acolytes and servers during worship).

Altar Book-of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa. 1995. Pine Town: Pine Town Printers.

Handbook of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Southern Africa, 1984.

INTERVIEWS

Biyela, M.D. Interview at the Lutheran Theological Seminary, September 17, 1999.

Duma, T. Interview at Umphumulo, September 29, 1999.

Gumede, T. Interview at Umphumulo, September 27, 1999.

Khumalo, T. Interview at Umphumulo, September 27, 1999.

Khuzwayo, L.B. Interview at Umphumulo, June 10, 1999.

Langeni, S. Interview at Umphumulo, October 30, 1999.

Magwaza, M. Interview at Umphumulo, September 11, 1998.

Mapumulo, L. Interview at Umphumulo, September, 11, 1998.

Mpanza, J. Interview at Umphumulo, July 8, 1999.

Mthethwa, S. Interview at Umphumulo, September 29, 1999.

Ngidi, T. Interview at Umphumulo, February 02, 2001.

Ntuli, S. Interview at Umphumulo, September 21, 1999.

Sibiya, L. Interview at the Diocesan Centre at Umphumulo, October 30, 1998.

Sosibo, D. Interview at Umphumulo, October, 1999.

Schiele, R. Interview at Pietermaritzburg, August 24, 2001.

Shabalala, J. Interview at Umphumulo, November 15, 2000.

Zondi, M. Interview at the Lutheran Theological Seminary, Umphumulo, August 27, 2000.

Zulu, S.P. Interview at Escourt, March 15, 2002.

APPENDIX A: on interviews .

Identity of the interviewee- Dr. Musa D. Biyela.

Socio-cultural background:

Biyela was born in 1948, in Kwa-Zulu Natal at Mawanda in Nseleni District. He grew in a Zulu traditional family and community. Common during his upbringing was that young boys used to follow after cows in the woods. He grew up under strong Zulu- cultural ethos. At his early years, he was exposed to Christianity in the Lutheran denomination. At an early age, he was influenced by the Church of Sweden Mission. He went to church and school at the Church of Sweden Mission station. He went to school at Mawanda, Amangwe High and at BhekuZulu College. He later worked at the Post Office. At church and school, his worldview began to change slowly to accommodate other things than only the socio-cultural worldview he grew in. After finishing school and working for sometime at the Post Office, he received a call to train as a minister at Umphumulo Theological Seminary in Kwa-Zulu Natal. He later furthered his studies with the University of South Africa (UNISA) and later in the United States of America, and obtained his Doctoral Degree in Theology. On his return home, he was called to lecture at Umphumulo Theological Seminary, where he later became Rector of the seminary.

The actual interview.

Interviewer: As I am investigating about the history of liturgy in the Lutheran Church from the period of the merger of the mission synods in 1960, among the issues of the merger discussed, did liturgy become a centre of the important discussion.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Interviewee: The matter on liturgy was one of the important aspects of discussion of the merger of 1960. The Synods who were leading in the talks were the following four Mission Societies, namely: The Church of Sweden Mission (CSM), Norwegian Mission Society (NMS), American Mission Society (AMS) and the Berlin Mission Society (BMS). The Hermannsberg Mission Society (HMS) came on board to the merger a bit later. Initially, there was a common altar book before the merger which included the liturgical traditions from all the different synods. The main contributors in the merger, however, were the Church of Sweden Mission (CSM) and the Norwegian Mission Society (NMS) for instance, the opening prayer, which is still used even today, came from the Norwegian contribution, whereas, the liturgy on Holy Communion was contributed by the Church of Sweden Mission. Apparently, the other two which is BMS and AMS did not take an issue because they were also accommodated in vestments.

Interviewee:

How would you describe the altar and vestments which was used during the time of the synods? Is there any big difference to the altars we use in the modern age?

Interviewee: The difference is not very big on the issue of the altar. I can say that the CSM was the synod which took a particular interest to the respect of an altar. On the issue of vestments, the BMS, used a black gown called talar with a preaching tab worn called *beffchen*. The talar was used by the Berlin Mission Society (BMS) and the Hermannsberg Mission Society (HMS). The Norwegian Mission Society (NMS) used the black cassock-like gown with what was called the honey comb which was worn around the neck. The Church of Sweden Mission (CSM) used the alb.

There were reported complaints with pastors who came from the CSM background wearing an alb at congregations of Norwegian background. People got confused with the white garment and thought, that pastor belonged to the Zionist Church. A compromise for the merger in the vestments was later forged which accommodated almost all the Mission stations. The alb was sown like the talar that you did not use the girdle for. The surplus was introduced from the Church of Sweden Mission and from the Norwegian Mission Society. The black gown, the talar, was worn with the surplus. In that way, the Berlin Mission

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Society and Hermansberg with the Norwegian and Church of Sweden Mission were accommodated.

Interviewer: When the church got into the second merger in 1975, what adjustments did the church had to undergo on the liturgy and what had to be done on the different traditions of the missions or other traditions had to be dropped. ?

Interviewee: In the second merger of 1975, the church had to embark on the compromises it used in the first merger. For instance, the opening prayer which is still used nowadays is Norwegian by origin. The *Sanctus* and *Agnus Dei*, which is the, (Holy, Holy, Holy), originally, comes from the Berlin Mission Society. However, except for the two parts of the Holy Communion, the whole liturgy of Communion is derived from the Church of Sweden Mission. In regard to the vestments, the alb became the main clerical gown, and this change was huge for mission societies like the Berlin and Hermansberg Mission societies.

Interviewer: When the alb was made the main gown of the clergy, how was the reaction of the other mission societies. ?

Interviewee: There were apparently many complaints for instance, at Umphumulo Theological Seminary during our time as students, there were lecturers who never wore an alb and very repulsive to the use of an alb in the Lutheran Church. Many people were opposed to the changes which they thought were brought by Bishop L.E. Dlamini. Other people tended to stick to their old traditional practices, while others were still struggling to adapt to the new changes.

Interviewer: How was the ELCSA liturgy made known to the congregants. ?

Interviewee: We learnt the new liturgy in ministerial conferences and conventions. I used also to use a church choir to rehearse the liturgy and then I would use the choir to teach the congregants.

Interviewer: When coming closer to the recent liturgical development of 1996, which is called the ‘high church’ liturgy which incorporates the acolytes, incense, copes and others; how would you describe it to be, its meaning and significance. ?

Interviewee: The ‘high church’ liturgy is a universal phenomenon in the Lutheran Church community. It is interesting to observe that the things we consider to be new in ELCSA, they have always been practiced in Sweden and America. The CSM has always been practicing the ‘high church’ service. The only thing they did not do was that they did not bring along to South Africa all the practices they used at home. America, has also been leading in these practices.

America has what is called congregational autonomy. Some of their congregations are far ahead in liturgical renewal. It was in America where I first saw the acolytes in the Lutheran Church, where I also saw Ash-Wednesday with the imposition of ashes. The reason in Africa, particularly in ELCSA, we struggle with the understanding of the ‘high church’

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

service is because we are most often left out in the ecumenical dialogues happening in Europe and America.

Lutherans, Anglicans and sometimes Presbyterians would be talking together about liturgical development in such a way that they would develop a common lectionary. This would be made possible because there is inter-penetration of traditions something which we do not have in Africa. The 'high church' liturgy got here in the South Eastern Diocese at the Diocesan Rally in 1992, through certain individuals and, fortunately, it landed on the receptive ear of Bishop SP Zulu. Those individuals would inform him about the practices of the liturgy, and the bishop would be eager to experiment with them. Papers were written concerning the liturgy. I was also one of those who were asked to write a paper. I must say that, however, many parishes have not accepted the new liturgy yet and some of the clergy are still not happy with it.

Interviewer: What in your opinion do you think makes those clergy and parishes drag their feet in accepting the new liturgy. ?

Interviewee: I think that there was not enough time given for exposing the clergy to the liturgical changes. It can also be observed that there is unwillingness of other pastors to learn new changes. We are a church that does not do refresher courses. This lack of willingness to learn contributes to the negative uninformed attitude that minister have towards the service. Sometimes I disagree with some of the pastors when they say that the congregants are opposed to the service. I think myself that it is the very minister who is opposed to it but hide behind the congregants. Because I believe that if the pastor himself is willing and receptive to the service, undoubtedly, the congregants would resemble their leader.

Interviewer: According to your own understanding, what are acolytes and their significance in the worship service. ?

Interviewee: The idea about acolytes is to have as many people involved in the liturgy as possible. Mainly we need young people to play an active role.

Interviewer: what is the significance of incense. ?

Interviewee: Incense is universal thing, existing in many religions. In Africa it is burnt when invoking the ancestors. It is traditionally called *impepho*. It is used for expelling evil spirits. Historically, it was used as a symbol of royalty. It was burnt for the king and for the captain of the army. So that is why incense is used in the procession because procession is to do with victory of Christ over death. St. Paul is using incense in a metaphorical way when he says that-Christ is leading us in a parade of victory, and we are a sweet aroma of salvation to those who are saved, but to those who are not saved we are a bad smell. The whole issue about incense is victory of Christ over all evil forces. That is what incense symbolizes.

Interviewer: What is the meaning of the ringing of bells in the worship service. ?

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Interviewee: Bells are reminiscent of the symbols which the book of Psalms 149 speaks about. Originally, in the Roman Catholic Church, bells were meant to indicate a turning point of the liturgy of the Word to the liturgy of the Eucharist. It was meant to indicate that the liturgy is changing to another step. Originally, they were rung many times, but of late, they are rung when the celebrant has just said the Preface, and when the congregation has sung the *Sangtus* or the “Holy, Holy, Holy”, then the bells would be rung and when the minister has consecrated the bread and wine to which he may genuflect. People may be confused by the connotation attached to the dogma of ‘transubstantiation’, that in the Catholic Church it rung when the Communion elements were said to be changing from bread to the body and from wine to the blood of Christ in that miraculous way. This is what the Catholic Church no longer even practice.

Interviewer: What is the meaning of the usage of copes and cassocks in the ‘high church’ service. ?

Interviewee: Originally, the cope was used as a royal garment. A minister leading a procession or a wedding may wear a cope. It has to do with Christ’s victory or power. In ELCSA, we have confined to it to a bishop because of its association with royalty, yet in essence, it can be worn even by a minister. It is only in ELCSA, where it is confined to bishops. In the other traditions in Europe and America, it is used by the ministers and bishops.

APPENDIX B: ON INTERVIEWS

Identity of interviewee: Bishop SP.Zulu

Socio-cultural background.

Bishop Zulu was born in 1936 in Kwa-Zulu Natal. He grew up in a Zulu cultural milieu. He also got exposed to becoming a Christian through the missionary activities of the Church of Sweden Mission. When he had grown up, he became a teacher and a school principal. He then received a call to ministry and went to a Theological College at Shiyane. He worked as a pastor but later he was sent to teach at the Theological College for a short time and was elected Dean of Ondini Circuit at Escourt. In 1988, he was elected bishop of the South Eastern Diocese at Maphumulo in Kwa-Zulu Natal. He was bishop of the diocese until he retired in 1996.

The actual interview.

Interviewer: As I have been gathering the information concerning the establishment of the ‘high church’ service in the South Eastern Diocese, Father Bishop, I learnt that you became the pioneering bishop of the new liturgical innovation in the Diocese. From you Bishop, I am solely following this very matter and the only one; how did you establish the change.

Interviewee: Before I say anything, I want to first acknowledge the efforts you have taken to have an interest in the work we have done with those who supported us in the development of this important task in the diocese. The advent of the service came at a time where the diocese was in a big financial setback. At the time our partner donors had pulled out from supporting the diocese financially. I called all the stakeholders of the diocese, especially the business community of our church. There was great concern taken about the financial situation of the church. We started a Million Drive Campaign which was overwhelmingly supported. I tried to make diocesan consultations with church members of notable standing in the diocese. I needed to use people of influential social standing because the command respect from the people. I knew that they were the people who would be easily listened to, and they would encourage the people to support the diocese. I consulted with the category of professionals like nurses, doctors, teachers and magistrates who were members of the church. The other intention was to get the church members involved in the church’s business.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

We were looking for a suitable theme for a big church event, a theme that would guide and motivate everyone in the diocese to revive and transform the church.

The theme was called “*impilo yebandla lami ingumtwalo wami*” which means that that, “the needs and concerns of my church is my responsibility.” At that point, I was approached by some pastors with a suggestion of a service which when I thought about it, I found it to be so spiritually fulfilling.

It came at a time where I thought it would be proper to do something for the congregants that will edify their souls because they had shown to be caring for their church when they established the million drive campaign. Besides that, after all, when the pastors approached me with the suggestion, I recollected that the practice of the ‘high church’ service was not anti- Lutheran at all, because Martin Luther himself died a Catholic Priest. Over and above that, Luther did not abrogate the practice of the ‘high church’ service. He was only opposed to making the mass the central message of the church instead of the preaching of the Gospel. We have since realised that the Lutheran Church has neglected spiritual treasures after the Reformation. We wanted to have a service which would appeal to all the senses of a person, such as the sense of touch, smell, hearing, sight and feel. I believe that what we are actually doing in the SED, we want to bring back what once belonged to us as Lutheran Church in SED, that which other Lutheran communities in Europe and America are doing.

Interviewer: What would you say to those who argue that the new liturgy was not properly introduced to the people rather it was imposed. ?

Interviewee: In every change there is bound to be some problems. There would some people who would stand against the change and development. In this case particularly, after I was introduced to the service, I then introduced it to the Diocesan Committee on liturgy. I then introduced it to the diocesan Council. I finally introduced it to the Pastor’s Convention, where I learnt that there were those pastors who were against it. However, they were not many to make us not to proceed with the good work which we have already started.

Interviewer: In your own view, do you find a bright future to the new service. ?

Interviewee: Indeed, I see a bright future to the service. People tell me that we have done a great job and they wish us a good future. In many congregations now the service is being practiced. For that reason the service is going to continue despite those who oppose it at the moment, but I hope that in the future they will happily accept it.

APPENDIX C: THE OLD SUNDAY SERVICE WITH HOLY COMMUNION

- Opening of the service
- The pastor proceeds to the altar and kneels, while the congregation bow or kneel
- The congregation may pray silently to themselves or an assistant reads the following prayer:

-

1. Opening Prayer

“Lord I have come into your holy temple in order to listen that which you will speak to me, Father, my Creator, Lord, Jesus. My redeemer; Holy Spirit, my comforter in life and death. Lord open my heart through your Holy Spirit so that I may be taught by Your Holy Word to plead for the forgiveness of my sins and to believe in Jesus Christ throughout my life as well as at the hour of death, and that I may daily grow in life of holiness. Hear my prayer and do this, oh lord, though Jesus Christ. Amen”.

2. Hymn: Then a hymn is sung while the congregation is standing, and also the pastor, but facing the altar and not the congregation.

3. Introitus: The introitus may be chanted by the pastor or read to the congregation. The pastor reads or sings the introitus for the day of the church year or takes the following general one:

“Oh come let us worship and bow down, let us kneel before our lord and maker.
For He is our God, and we are the people of His pasture and the sheep of His hand.
Oh come let us sing unto the Lord, let us make a joyful noise to the rock of our salvation”.

The congregation, still standing respond by singing the following:
Glory be to the Father and to the Son and to the Holy Spirit.

As it was in the beginning, is now and ever shall be world without end. Amen.

4. The Confession of Sins and Kyrie

The pastor turns into the congregation and say:

“Let us humble ourselves before God, and confess our sins saying,

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

Holy God, Father in heaven! I have sinned to you in thought, words and deeds. I am dreadful in my heart. Through Jesus Christ, I ask for the forgiveness of my sins, help me to fear and only love you. Amen”.

5. **Absolution:**

The pastor shall pronounce the words of absolution by saying:

“Those who confess in faith with a penitent heart, I pronounce the word of the Lord...”

6. **Gloria in Excelsis:**

while the congregation is still standing, the pastor shall turn to the altar, lift up his hands and sing:

“Glory be to God on high”.

And the congregation respond by saying:

“And peace on earth among men with whom he is pleased”

then the congregation shall sing Te Deum Laudamus hymn:

“ Sing praise to God who reigns above the God of all creation. The God of power, the God of love, the God of our salvation. With healing balm my soul he fills and every faithless murmur stills to God all praise and glory”.

7. **Salutation:** The pastor shall turn to the congregation with his hands lifted up in a blessing pose and sing;

“The Lord be with you”.

The congregation responds;

“And with thy Spirit”,

The pastor: let us pray.”

The pastor then prays the collect for the day, while the congregation sits down and bow their heads or kneel down.

8. **The Epistle reading.**

The pastor shall announce the epistle while facing the congregation.

9. **Hymn:** The congregation shall stand and sing the designated hymn.

10. **The Gospel reading:** The pastor shall face the congregation and read the gospel while the congregation is standing. Once the reading is through and the congregation shall sing the following:

“Praise God for His holy Word. Hallelujah! Hallelujah! Hallelujah!-

“*Makabongwe uNkulunkulu ngezwi lakhe elingcwele*”

11. **The Apostle’s Creed:** The pastor shall invite the congregation to affirm their faith by saying the apostle’s creed.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

12. Sermon hymn

13. Deliverance of the sermon

14. Offering hymn

15. Other church services like baptism, dedication of committees, confirmation may be taken.

16. **Prayer for church:** The prayer is comprehensive, meant for all the needs of the church and also of the society and its leaders. But the prayer did not have breaks in between where the congregation proceeds by saying e.g.....

“We beseech thee to hear us good Lord”,
as it said in ELCSA church prayer.

17. **Holy Communion:** The congregation shall stand while the pastor prepares the Holy Communion elements, and as assistant may light the candle.

18. **Sursum Corda:** With hands up slightly, the pastor shall sing or read facing the congregation. The pastor: “Lift up your hearts to the Lord”

The congregation: “We lift them up unto the Lord”

The pastor: “Let us give thanks unto the lord”.

The congregation: “It is meet and right so to do”

19. **Prefatio:** While the congregation is standing, the pastor turns to the altar and lift up hands slightly and chant or say these words:

“Ngempela kufanele kulungile ukuthi ngezikhathi zonke nasezindaweni zonke sidumise wena Nkosi engcwele, baba mninimandla onke, Nkulunkulu waphakade, ngoJesu Kristu iNkosi yethu”

20. **Holy Communion prayer:** “We thank you Lord Jesus Christ we praise your holy name the only Son of God, our Saviour. We praise your love, you who defeated death. Give us, faithful hearts so that we may partake in your holy table sincerely. Unite us with you Lord, like tree branches united to the vine. Teach us to love one another as you loved us and died for us. Give us comfort and joy as your holy church”.

21. The Lord’s Prayer

22. **Words of Institution:** The congregation shall stand. With his hands slight raised above the elements, the pastor shall sing or say the words of institution.

23 Agnus Dei:

The congregation respond by singing:

“Wundlu lika Nkulunkulu, elithwele izono zezwe sihawukele.”

24. The Pax:

“The peace of the lord be with you“.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

25. **Distribution of Holy Communion.**

When the pastor is distributing the body and the blood of Christ the rest of the congregation shall sit and sing hymns with dignity. Those who come for the distribution shall kneel down at an altar.

26. **Thanksgiving Prayer**

27. **Conclusion and Benediction**

28. **Closing Hymn**

29. **Closing Prayer**

APPENDIX D: New Holy Communion Service

- 1. Procession:** The service begins with a procession of bearer of the crosier in the fore front, followed by the acolytes both male and female. Usually, the acolytes would wear red and white long gowns and black and white gowns. Each carrying Bibles, candles, the Communion vessels, and others carry vessels containing the incense. One or two of the acolytes would be burning the incense as the procession begins. The acolytes are followed by lay preachers, evangelists if they are available, pastors, deans and lastly by bishops. In the ‘high church’ services, in most cases, the order of the procession would be in such arrangement, and it is done regularly with the burning of incense.
- 2. Opening Prayer:** As the throng of procession enters the church building, the congregation graciously stand up as a gesture of respect to the procession. Before the opening prayer which is done at the altar, the minister presides over the service assisted by the acolytes. Then an assisting elder would then pray.
- 3. Hymn:** The first hymn will be sung, and the liturgist will stand in front of the altar facing the congregation. This is an innovation in itself, that the minister or liturgist faces the congregation all the time he presides over service.
- 4. Introitus:** Use the one that is most relevant according to the church calendar, and it is sung in different melodies. Most of those melodies are those employed either from the Catholic or Anglican Church or those which have been composed by a particular group of choristers. The liturgist would lead the chanting.
- 5. Gloria patri:** The congregation would respond according to the melody used for that particular Sunday service and say: Glory be to the Father and to the Son and to the Holy Spirit, as it was in the beginning is now and ever shall be, world without end amen.
- 6. Confession of Sins and Kyrie:** It is done but in different melodies not familiar to the old order of service. The liturgist may choose to use a hymn or sing the words: Lord have mercy upon us three times, but using different melodies. The liturgist may say these words while knelt down and the congregation sitting. These melodies are changed from time to time, depending on its composers which one did they see

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

fit. For a local congregation, which would be taught how to sing these melodies, it is easier for them to sing it and to follow them. However, it is difficult for people who have been gathered for a day and make them sing these melodies.

7. **Absolution:** Is not different to the one used in the old liturgy.
8. **Gloria in Excelsis:** While the congregation standing and the minister facing the congregation, he sings or chant the words with the congregation: *Thina sonke abantu bakho sikutusa Nkosi sithi sonke kanye nezingelosi-Gloria Gloria Gloria in Excelsis Deo. Siyabonga umusa wakho ngesipho sempilo esivela kumsindisi wethu uJesu Kristu : Gloria Gloria Gloria in excelsis Deo. Nkosi hlis'umoya wakho uzohlala nathi sense sonke sibemhlophe izinhliziyi zethu:Gloria Gloria in Excelsis.*
9. **Salutation:** As it is used in the old service.
10. **Prayer or Collect:** As it is used in the old service, according to the church calendar.
11. **Proclamation of the word: Old Testament and Epistle reading:** The liturgist may lead the congregation by chanting the Psalm while the congregation chants after him in the melody which he introduces them to. Sometimes, the liturgist may have a small choir which sings after him as he leads the chanting. The liturgist may read the whole chapter of Psalms by taking a verse, and the congregation takes the following one. The congregation shall respond by saying: *Udumo alube kuyise nendodana kanye nomoya ongcwele, njengoba kwakunjalo ekuqaleni kunjalo namanje kuyoba njalo nanininini.* Immediately after finishing the chanting of the Psalm, the liturgist shall read the Epistle for the day.
12. **The Hallelujah and Hymn:** When the one reading the Epistle finishes, the congregation shall stand and sing either the Hallelujah in the same way it is sung in the old service, or the liturgist may say these words: This is the Word of the Lord. The congregation responds by saying: Thanks be to God. A hymn shall then be sung.
13. **Gospel Reading:** While the congregation is standing, there shall be a procession which is led by the presiding minister. The procession will include the liturgist and the acolytes who shall be carrying the crosier and the Bible which is to be read by the presiding minister. The procession shall move towards the middle of the aisle. Incense shall be burnt as they move from the altar to the point where the Gospel shall be read. The acolyte shall raise the Bible high while the minister reads. Usually, he chants or reads. When he finishes reading the Gospel, a chorus which says: *Limnandi ivangeli* would be sung together with the congregation. People would be dancing and clapping hands expressing the spirit of joy. After the reading, the procession moves back to the altar.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

- 14. Apostle Creed:** The minister shall turn to the congregation and say: As we have read the Word of God, let us now affirm our faith according to the words of the Apostle Creed. The Creed shall be said while the congregation standing.
- 15. Sermon Hymn:** While congregation standing, a sermon hymn shall be sung and the acolytes would undressing the chasuble from the minister. And lead him to the pulpit.
- 16. Deliverance of Sermon**
- 17. Offertory Hymn:** At the end of the collection, the minister shall first make a thanksgiving prayer before singing: *Mawudunyiswe wena Kristu Mawudunyiswe wena Kristu.*
- 18. Holy Communion Hymn:** The hymn is prolonged to enable the acolytes and the presiding minister to go to the vestry in a procession. The intention is to fetch the elements, the chalice, and pattern. Firstly, acolytes cense the elements and the altar.
- 19. Sursum Corda:** The minister with hands lifted up slightly, shall say to the congregation: Lift up your hearts to the Lord; and the congregation shall say: We lift them up unto the Lord.
- 20. Prefatio:** The minister shall say these words: *Ngempela kufanele kulungile ukuthi ngezikhathi zonke nasezindaweni zonke sidumise uNkulunkulu sithi..*
- 21. The Sanctus:** The congregation sings Holy Holy Holy, Lord Almighty, Heaven and earth are full of your glory Hosanna Hosanna in the highest.
- 22. Holy Communion Prayer:** Shall be read by the minister. Immediately after it is read, the congregation shall rise and sing the Lord's Prayer. Acolytes hold each other's hands until the epilogue of the Lord's Prayer is sung where the presiding minister and the acolytes hold up their hands. The congregation is also encouraged to do the same.
- 23. Words of Institution:** With the congregation standing, the minister shall say or sing the Words of Institution: Our Lord Jesus Christ, in the night in which He was betrayed, He took bread and after giving thanks broke it saying, this is my body which is given for you. Do this in remembrance of me. After, the same manner also, He took the cup, and after He had supped, He drank of it saying, this cup is the New Testament in my blood which is shed for many. Do this, as often as you drink it in remembrance of me. At the intervals, small bells would be rung three times. When the first bell is rung, the minister genuflects three times as the bells would be rung three times.
- 24. Agnus Dei:** The congregation respond by singing: O Christ the Lamb of God have mercy upon us. Sometimes different melodies would be sung.

University of Pretoria etd – Mamba, D M (2006)

- 25. The Pax:** After the minister has sung or said: The peace of the Lord be with you, the congregation responds by saying: and also be with you. This shall be followed by the singing of choruses while the presiding minister, acolytes and congregation sharing the peace by greeting each other, also hugging each other. A bowl of water shall be given to the minister and those assisting him in the distribution to wash their hands as they are about to distribute the Communion.
- 26. Distribution:** It begins with the presiding minister and those assisting him, before distributing to the congregants. Otherwise, the order which is followed in the old service, is the same as it is done in the new service. When the distribution is complete, the service of the blessing of children shall follow, and a hymn shall be sung: *uJehova uyalonda abantwana abancane ubafaka ekhwapheni abalonde ezingozini*. All children will file in front to be prayed for. Children seem to like this part of the service so much. It is like it is when they start to feel to be part of the whole service.
- 27. Post Communion Prayer and *Nunc Dimittis*:** The Thanksgiving prayer shall be followed by the *Nunc Dimittis*, the prayer of Simeon, the Priest who blessed the baby Jesus when His parents brought Him to the Temple eight days after his birth. The prayer which says: Lord, now let your servant depart in peace: according to your word; for mine eyes have seen your salvation; which you have prepared before the face of all people; a light to lighten the Gentiles; and the glory of your people Israel. Glory be to the Father and to the Son and to the Holy Spirit: As it was in the beginning, is now and ever shall be world without end Amen.
- 28. Salutation:** The minister shall turn to the congregation, which is also standing, and say: The Lord be with you, and the congregation respond by saying: And also be with you. Minister then say: Bless we the Lord. Congregation respond by saying: Thanks be to God.
- 29. Benediction:** The benediction is the same as in the old service where the minister say: The Lord Bless you and keep you. The Lord make His face to shine upon you and be gracious unto you. The Lord lift up his countenance upon you, and give you peace. In the name of God the Father, the Son and the Holy Spirit. The congregation respond by singing: AMEN, AMEN, AMEN. After the Benediction, the procession shall go back in retrospective manner, with the acolytes in front, followed by the bishops, and the rest of the procession file.