

**A PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION APPROACH TO MANAGING
INTERGOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS SYSTEM IN THE
GOVERNANCE OF THE STATE: A CASE REVIEW OF NIGERIA AND
SOUTH AFRICA**

ISIOMA UREGU ILE

**A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree
Philosophiae Doctor (PhD) – Public Affairs**

**In the School of Public Management and Administration, Faculty of
Economic and Management Sciences, University of Pretoria,
Pretoria, South Africa.**

SUPERVISOR: PROF. DR. J. O. KUYE

July 2007

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- To my Creator, I am yet again humbled and grateful for everything.
- To my promoter and mentor, Prof. Dr. J. O. Kuye, thank you for believing in me, inspiring me and providing me with guidance throughout the course of this work.
- To my friends (particularly Korede), my University of Pretoria lecturers and peers who supported and encouraged me, thank you all.
- To my parents and siblings, thank you for your unwavering, love and support. It means the world to me. A special note of gratitude to you Chuks, for all the errands run to ensure timely submissions of this work to the institution.
- To my children, Oriete, Omeniem and Obulor, thanks for your phenomenal support and understanding why your mother had to make numerous trips to the University of Pretoria. And thank you, for all the numerous errands you ran. You have remained my inspiration and I really do appreciate it all. This one is for you all – my girls.
- To my husband and friend Okey, you taught me how to dream and follow the dream through; it certainly would have been a different outcome without your unwavering support and encouragement. I cannot thank you enough for nurturing my academic growth on this journey, I appreciate it immensely.

Thank you all.

Isioma Uregu Ile

Cape Town, South Africa

July 2007

DEDICATION

This work is dedicated to the memory of my late brother and friend –

ADIEME ERESIA EKE.

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this thesis submitted for the Doctor of Philosophy degree at the School of Public Management and Administration, University of Pretoria, is my work and has never been submitted for any other degree at any other university

.....

Isioma Uregu Ile

Student No - 23288770

Cape Town

July 2007

ABSTRACT

The research proposes that the management of intergovernmental relations (IGR) in the governance of any state does present opportunities for improving government service delivery. Two countries with different governance systems, namely, Nigeria (a federal state) and South Africa (a unitary state), provided the context of the case study. The study identified and analysed four IGR cases in each country; namely, the Ministries of Steel, Power, Water Resources and Petroleum Resources in Nigeria and the Departments of Housing, Health, Agriculture, Provincial and Local Government in South Africa. In the case analysis, due consideration was given to the historical and socio-political context of the selected countries, the structures, the facilitative role of IGR in development and current delivery imperatives. The research revealed a range of IGR complexities around the management of structures, the inevitability of overlaps, and the need to strike a balance between independence and the alignment of roles amongst government units. From the analysis, the emerging trends were carefully identified and the extent to which they can facilitate or hinder delivery in a particular department/ministry is discussed.

The study revealed that the critical elements needed for successful IGR management in both unitary and federalist systems were largely the same and linked to the principles of Public Administration. These elements were formed into a formula captured as: C+ 3C+ 3P+ L (Commitment plus communication, coordination and capacity, project management, planning and policy management and, finally, leadership). The study also revealed that some of these IGR challenges could have been further complicated by the very nature of IGR in these countries, which may have been weakened owing to

inadequate emphasis on the relationship element, which seemed to have been taken for granted that as long as there are legislative provisions, tiers or spheres of government will work together. On the contrary, government must manage the systemic tensions that exist and which hinder institutional relationships in a proactive manner. IGR may remain problematic without a management model. Hence the study proposes the evolution of a hybrid model of IGR management that is transactional, collaborative and relational in nature. Any single of the above mentioned elements would not suffice but could be strengthened by a comprehensive strategy that considers the peculiarities of the context, in an effort to improve service delivery.

TABLE OF CONTENTS	Page No
Acknowledgements	ii
Dedication	iii
Declaration	iv
Abstract	v
Clarification of acronyms	xv
CHAPTER ONE: NATURE OF THE STUDY	1
Introduction	1
The histography of selected countries (Nigeria and South Africa)	3
Nigeria	3
South Africa	5
Rationale of the research	7
The purpose of the study	9
The Objectives of research	11
Problem statement	13
Explanatory overviews of selected concepts	14
State	14
Unitarism	15
Federalism	15
Confederalism	16
Intergovernmental relations	17
Co-operative government	18
Spheres of government	21
Decentralisation	22
Governance	26
Leadership	26
Public Administration Approach	26

Origin of Intergovernmental relations	27
Outline of study	30
Chapter summary	33
CHAPTER TWO: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	35
Introduction	35
Public Administration and qualitative research	36
Rationale for the utilisation of the qualitative research design	37
Data and information collection	40
Case study	41
Historical method	44
Ethnography	45
Research tools	49
Data analysis, validation and reporting	50
Ethical considerations in the research study	52
Limitations of the study	53
Significance of the study	54
Chapter summary	57
CHAPTER THREE: LITERATURE REVIEW	59
Introduction	59
A theoretical perspective in the study of intergovernmental relations	59
A systems perspective to the study of intergovernmental relations	61

A functionalist approach to the systems theory	64
A Public Administration approach to the systems theory	66
The practice of intergovernmental relations in states: a conceptual framework	68
Nature of the African state	72
Nigeria	74
South Africa	77
An overview of Public Administration principles and functions that govern IGR	80
Chapter summary	85
CHAPTER FOUR: IGR - AN INTERNATIONAL AND CONTINENTAL OVERVIEW	85
Introduction	85
Overview of the roles of the three arms of government within an IGR framework	90
IGR systems: an overview of selected international case studies	92
The Canadian IGR contextual perspective	93
The Australian IGR contextual perspective	96
The Swiss IGR contextual perspective	98
IGR systems: an overview of selected African case studies	100
Understanding IGR: a Nigerian perspective (in ECOWAS sub-region)	104
Emergence of IGR in Nigeria – a historical overview	105
Historical and socio-political contexts	106
Nigerian IGR constitutional mandate	111
Nigerian IGR institutional structure	114

Understanding IGR: a Southern African Perspective (in SADC sub-region)	117
Emergence of IGR in South Africa – a historical overview	118
South African IGR constitutional mandates	119
South African IGR institutional structures	121
Presentation of selected IGR cases in Nigeria and South Africa	128
Chapter summary	138
CHAPTER FIVE: ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS ON SELECTED CASES IN THE NIGERIAN AND SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC SERVICE	139
Introduction	139
Service delivery imperatives in the selected countries	142
Service imperatives: A Nigerian public service critique	143
Nature of the selected Nigerian case studies (and inherent issues)	146
Case study 1: PHCN- Ministry of Steel and Power	146
Case study 2: Ministry of Housing and Urban Development	150
Case study 3- Federal Ministry of Water Resources	153
Case study 4 – Ministry of Petroleum Resources (Niger Delta Development Corporation projects)	158
A periodic analysis of the nature of intergovernmental relations in Nigeria	163
Independence era	163
Post Independence era	166
Post Military era	168

An overview of the South African Public Service	170
Nature of the selected South African case studies (and inherent issues)	174
Case study 1 - Department Of Housing	175
Case study 2 - Department of Health	182
Case study 3- Department of Provincial and Local Government	185
Case study 4 - Department of Agriculture	189
A periodic analysis of the nature of intergovernmental relations in South Africa	192
Apartheid era	193
The dawn of the democratic era	194
Consolidation era (10 years into the new democracy)	198
Cross country analysis	199
Chapter summary	210
CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	212
Recommendations	216
Areas for further research	227
LIST OF REFERENCES	229
APPENDICES	250
Appendix 1 - Nigerian Constitution (Chapter 1)	
Appendix 2 - Nigerian Constitution (Chapter 2)	
Appendix 3 - Nigerian Constitution (Chapter 6)	

- Appendix 4 - Nigerian Constitution (Schedule 2.1)
- Appendix 5 - Nigerian Constitution (Schedule 2.2)
- Appendix 6 - South African Constitution (Chapter 3)
- Appendix 7 - South African Constitution (Chapter 10)
- Appendix 8 - Batho Pele document
- Appendix 9 - SERVICOM document

LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.1 Summary of the roles of the provinces in the NCOP	125
Table 4.2 Nigerian Case study 1: Service delivery in the electricity sector	129
Table 4.3 Nigerian Case study 2: Housing provision	130
Table 4.4 Nigerian Case study 3: Service delivery in the water sector	131
Table 4.5 Nigerian Case study 4: Projects initiation and Management in the NDR	132
Table 4.6 South African Case study 1: Housing provision	133
Table 4.7 South African Case study 2: Functional integration across the DoH	135
Table 4.8 South African Case study 3: programmes and programmes coordination	136
Table 4.9 South African Case study 4: Service delivery in the Agricultural sector	137
Table 5.1 Patterns of governmental sector planning and actual budgetary allocations (Nigeria)	144
Table 5.2 Comparative costs of contacts across selected countries	145
Table 5.3 Patterns of electricity generation and consumption in Nigeria	148
Table 5.4 Depicting cubic meter shortfall between demand and supply of water in Port Harcourt	155
Table 5.5 Demographics of the NDR (Nigeria)	159
Table 5.6 Department of Education Enrolment figures (South Africa)	173
Table 5.7 Department of Housing expenditure and service delivery patterns towards elimination of asset capital poverty	180
Table 5.8 Number of registered infant deaths, South Africa 1997-2002	184
Table 5.9 Framework for the transfer of responsibility between the spheres of government (South Africa)	186
Table 5.10 Budgetary items in the Department of Agriculture, Eastern Cape, South Africa	191

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1 A depiction of a triangulation approach to qualitative research	39
Figure 2.2: Variation of case study approach adopted	43
Figure 2.3 Steps of content analysis	51
Figure 3.1 The systems theory	63
Figure 3.2 The functionalist model of the systems theory	65
Figure 3.3 Public Administration functionalist system approach to the management of IGR	
Figure 5.1 Showing the current water supply in Port Harcourt	154
Figure 5.2 Depicting the per cubic meter short fall between demand and supply of water provision in Port Harcourt, Nigeria	155
Figure 5.3 Graph showing income poverty alleviation patterns from the Department of Social Development (South Africa)	172
Figure 5.4 Emerging trends impacting on IGR management in selected cases	200

LIST OF MAPS

1.1 Map of Nigeria	5
1.2 Map of South Africa	7
4.1 Map of Canada	94
4.2 Map of Australia	98
4.3 Map of Switzerland	100
4.4 Map of ECOWAS	105
4.5 Map of SADC	118

CLARIFICATION OF ACRONYMS

AG	Action Group
AU	African Union
ANC	African National Congress
DFFRI	Directorate for Food, Roads and Rural Infrastructure
DoA	Department of Agriculture
DoE	Department of Education
DPLG	Department of Provincial and Local government
DHLTA:	Department of Local Government and Traditional Affairs
DPSA	Department of Public Service and Administration
EC	Eastern Cape
ECN:	Electricity Corporation of Nigeria
ECOMOG:	ECOWAS Community Cease- Fire Monitoring Group
ECOWAS:	Economic community of West African States
FI:	Functional Integration
IDP	Integrated Development Plan
IGR:	Intergovernmental Relations
LGA	Local Government Area
KZN	KwaZulu Natal
MEC	Member of Executive council
MFMA	Municipal Financial Management Act, No. of 56 of 2003
MINMEC	Minster and Member of executive council
NCOP	National Council of Provinces
NCNC	National Convention of Nigerian Citizens
NCP	Nigerian People's Congress

NEC	National Electoral Commission
NEPA	National Electric Power Corporation
NEPAD	New Partnership for Africa's Development
NDA	Niger Dams Authority
NDDC	Niger Delta Development Commission
NDP	Niger Delta Development Plan
NDR	Niger Delta Region
NGO	Non-governmental organizations
NLNG	Nigeria Liquefied National Gas
OAU	Organization of African Unity
OMPADEC	Oil Minerals Producing Area Commissions
OPEC	Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries
PCC	President's Coordinating Council
PGDP	Provincial Growth and Development Plan
PHC	Primary Health Care
PFMA	Public Financial Management Act, No. 1 of 1999
PHCN	Power Holding Company of Nigeria
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SALGA	South African Local Government Association
SERVICOM	Service Compact with Nigerians
SCOPA	Standing Committee on Public Accounts
SLGP	State Local Government Programme
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nation's Development Programme