

THE EXPLICIT KYPIOS AND ΘΕΟΣ CITATIONS BY PAUL:
AN ATTEMPT AT UNDERSTANDING PAUL'S DEITY
CONCEPTS

A Thesis

Submitted to

The Faculty of Theology (New Testament)

At the University of Pretoria

In Fulfilment

Of the Requirements for the degree

Philosophiae Doctor (Ph.D)

Promoter: Prof. Dr. Gert J Steyn

By

Peter Nagel

May, 2012

OPSOMMING

Hierdie studie ondersoek die eksplisiete κύριος en θεός aanhalings in die Pauliniese literatuur. Die studie evalueer ook die impak wat sodanige aanhalings op Paulus se konsep van 'n Hebreuse godheid in verhouding tot Jesus as die χριστός en κύριος gehad het. Die ondersoek na die eksplisiete aanhalings word gedoen teen 'n breë literêre agtergrond, manuskrip data wat dateer tussen die 3de eeu VCE en 2de eeu NCE. Die omvang van die literêr-konseptuele impak van die eksplisiete aanhalings word dan oorweeg in beide die Romeine- en Korintiër-briewe. As konklussie, word die literêr-konseptuele waarde van die eksplisiete κύριος en θεός aanhalings ge-evalueer (a) ter bepaling van 'n meer komprehensiewe begrip van Paulus se konseptuele verstaan van die terme κύριος en θεός; en (b) ter formulering van 'n moontlike Pauliniese konsep van 'n Hebreuse godheid.

SUMMARY

This study investigates the explicit κύριος and θεός citations in the Pauline literature and their impact on Paul's concept of a Hebrew deity in relation to Jesus as the χριστός and κύριος. The investigation into the explicit citations is done against a broad literary backdrop, data from manuscripts dated between the 3rd century BCE and 2nd century CE. The extent of the literary conceptual impact of these citations is then considered in both the Epistles to the Romans and Corinthians. In conclusion, the literary conceptual value of the explicit κύριος and θεός citations is evaluated in an attempt (a) to determine a more comprehensive perception of Paul's conceptual understanding of the terms κύριος and θεός; and (b) to formulate a plausible Pauline concept of a Hebrew deity.

DEDICATION AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Dedicated to my two loving parents, Peter and Martie Nagel...you have given me the gift of life and the opportunity to learn. Without your unconditional love and support this study would not have been possible... for this I am eternally grateful.

~~~~~

I am indebted to a number of people and institutions mainly from Germany and South Africa for their assistance and support during the different stages of this study. Gratitude is hereby expressed to:

- *Deutsche Akademische Austauschdienst* for a grant that assisted me to stay a total of sixteen months in Germany during the period 2007-2008.
- *University of Pretoria* for a grant that assisted me to stay a total of four months in Germany during the period 2010.
- *Westfälische-Wilhelms Universität Münster (Westf.)*, Germany, which provided an environment and resources conducive for doing research.
- Prof. Dr. G. J. Steyn, for his devoted guidance, support and friendship. As promoter, he guided with unconditional willingness, availability and motivated by being an exceptional example as scholar and human being.
- Prof. Dr. Dietrich-Alex Koch, for his expert guidance. He is a *Doktorvater* in more ways than one. His willingness to guide, teach and motivate exceeded far beyond expectation. The hospitality he has shown on both visits to Germany was truly humbling.
- Prof. Dr. Hermut Löhr, for the hospitality and assistance in ensuring a productive second visit to Germany.
- To all my fellow *postgraduate students*. Thanks for all your support, input and continued friendship.
- Last but not least, a big word of thanks is definitely in order first and foremost to *my wife*. Not only for all the sacrifices during the years, but her willingness and dedication in assisting with the final editing of the manuscript. Secondly, to *my family* at Linqenda, without your continued support and motivation this study would have been an impossible task.

## ABBREVIATIONS

The following abbreviations are being used:

- Standard Latin abbreviations
- The SBL Handbook of Style (see Bibliography) – Biblical and other ancient authors
- Manuscript abbreviations used for the appropriate eclectic editions (e.g. Göttingen LXX edition)

In addition to these, the following abbreviations are also used:

|                        |                                  |
|------------------------|----------------------------------|
| BCE                    | Before Common Era                |
| BHS / BHS <sup>5</sup> | Biblia Hebraica Stuttgartensia   |
| CE                     | Common Era                       |
| Codex A                | Codex Alexandrinus               |
| Codex B                | Codex Vaticanus                  |
| Codex D                | Codex Claromontanus              |
| Codex V                | Codex Venetus                    |
| col. /Col.             | Column                           |
| DJD                    | Documents from the Judean Desert |
| DSS                    | Dead Sea Scrolls                 |
| fr.                    | fragment                         |
| LXX                    | Septuagint                       |
| LXX <sup>Gött</sup>    | Septuagint (Göttingen edition)   |
| MT                     | Masoretic Text                   |
| NA / NA27              | Nestle/Aland 27th Edition        |
| OG                     | Old Greek                        |
| OT                     | Old Testament                    |
| par.                   | paragraph                        |
| PFouad                 | Papyrus Fouad                    |
| POxy                   | Papyrus Oxyrhyncus               |
| SamP                   | Samaritan Pentateuch             |
| v. or vv.              | verse or verses                  |
| p. or pp.              | page or pages                    |
| pap.                   | papyrus                          |

## PREFACE

The Pauline literature<sup>1</sup>, as the general consensus goes, consists of some of the oldest documents<sup>2</sup> in the New Testament. Furthermore, if one would take the so-called *deutero-pauline literature*<sup>3</sup> into account then it becomes clear that the *Corpus Paulinum*<sup>4</sup> occupies nearly 50% of the New Testament. Thus, the interpretation, conceptualisation, exegesis, hermeneutics and theologising of these letters are of the utmost importance for the reconstruction of early Christianity as a movement, first within Judaism<sup>5</sup> and soon afterwards outside of it. The Pauline literature in general and the explicit citations in particular, offers a valid point of entry into the literary history of the Greek terms θεός and κύριος used as equivalents for a Hebrew deity. It is thus reasonable to propose an in-depth investigation into 1.) the literary sources<sup>6</sup> of the 3<sup>rd</sup> century BCE and 2<sup>nd</sup> century CE with regard to the Hebrew and Greek terms used for a Hebrew deity, and 2.) the explicit κύριος and θεός citations in Pauline literature.

---

<sup>1</sup> These are the epistles addressed to the early Christian groups in Thessalonica (1<sup>st</sup> Thessalonians), Corinth (1 & 2 Corinthians), Philippi (Philippians), the province of Galatia – whether it be the northern or southern region, the latter is preferred here (Galatians), the Roman capital (Romans), and Philemon residing in Colossians; also referred to as the ‘true’, ‘genuine’ or ‘authentic’ letters of Paul.

<sup>2</sup> Dating from as early as 49 CE (1<sup>st</sup> Thessalonians), (some argue that James is the oldest document in the New Testament), up until between 55-59 CE (Romans).

<sup>3</sup> This includes the ‘true’ Pauline letters together with the so-called *deutero*-Pauline letters: Colossians, Ephesians, 2 Thessalonians (some consider 2<sup>nd</sup> Thessalonians as *post* Pauline), 1 and 2 Timothy, and Titus.

<sup>4</sup> All the letters that are traditionally linked to the Apostle Paul.

<sup>5</sup> This demands the identification of various traditional sources such as Christological and soteriological creeds (Rom 1:3-4; 10:9-10; 1 Cor 15:34b-5 respectively), as well as Christological hymns Phil 2:6-11; doxologies Rom 11:33-36), and baptism formulas (Gal 3:27-28); sin lists (Rom 1:29-31) in an attempt to reconstruct *pre*-Pauline traditions. It goes without saying that the latter sources include those explicit citations containing the terms κύριος and/or θεός.

<sup>6</sup> These sources would include both Hebrew and Greek Biblical manuscripts dated to this period of which the manuscripts found in and around the Judean desert and in Egypt would be of special significance. Some of the works of both Philo of Alexandria as well as Josephus will be included to provide a conceptual frame of reference from a Jewish perspective, that existed in the first century CE.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                                                                                                                                    |           |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| Opsomming/Summary.....                                                                                                             | ii        |
| Dedication and Acknowledgements.....                                                                                               | iii       |
| Abbreviations.....                                                                                                                 | iv        |
| Preface.....                                                                                                                       | v         |
| <b>Chapter 1: Introduction.....</b>                                                                                                | <b>1</b>  |
| 1.1 INTRODUCTION.....                                                                                                              | 1         |
| 1.2 FIELD OF RESEARCH.....                                                                                                         | 2         |
| 1.2.1 Identified Citations.....                                                                                                    | 3         |
| 1.2.2 Target and Source Contexts.....                                                                                              | 4         |
| 1.3 PROBLEM FORMULATION.....                                                                                                       | 6         |
| 1.4 A HISTORY OF RESEARCH.....                                                                                                     | 10        |
| 1.4.1 Old Testament Citations in the Pauline Literature.....                                                                       | 10        |
| 1.4.2 Research Done on the Origin of KYPIOΣ.....                                                                                   | 17        |
| 1.5 THE THEORY.....                                                                                                                | 20        |
| 1.6 METHOD OF RESEARCH.....                                                                                                        | 20        |
| 1.7 OBJECTIVES.....                                                                                                                | 21        |
| <b>Chapter 2: Literary Problem.....</b>                                                                                            | <b>23</b> |
| 2.1 INTRODUCTION.....                                                                                                              | 23        |
| 2.1.1 Examples.....                                                                                                                | 26        |
| 2.1.2 The General “Rule of Thumb” – A Problem of Rendition.....                                                                    | 27        |
| 2.2 <i>VORGESCHICHTE</i> AND LITERARY CONTEXT.....                                                                                 | 33        |
| 2.2.1 The Transmission Problem: <i>Hebrew Text Tradition</i> .....                                                                 | 33        |
| 2.2.2 The Translation Problem: <i>Greek Text Tradition (OG)</i> .....                                                              | 40        |
| 2.2.3 Theological Explicit Renditions of the Hebrew Esther.....                                                                    | 47        |
| 2.2.4 Preliminary Conclusions.....                                                                                                 | 48        |
| 2.3 THE TRANSMISSION PROBLEM – NT TEXT TRADITIONS.....                                                                             | 49        |
| 2.3.1 Introduction.....                                                                                                            | 49        |
| 2.3.2 The Terms κύριος and θεός – <i>Reflecting upon the Text</i><br><i>Critical Variations</i> .....                              | 50        |
| 2.3.2.1 <i>Synoptic Gospels</i> .....                                                                                              | 50        |
| 2.3.2.2 <i>Acts of the Apostles</i> .....                                                                                          | 52        |
| 2.3.2.3 <i>Johannine Gospel</i> .....                                                                                              | 54        |
| 2.3.2.4 <i>Pastoral Letters</i> .....                                                                                              | 54        |
| 2.3.2.4.1 1 and 2 Timothy.....                                                                                                     | 54        |
| 2.3.2.5 <i>General Letters</i> .....                                                                                               | 55        |
| 2.3.2.5.1 James.....                                                                                                               | 55        |
| 2.3.2.5.2 1 and 2 Peter.....                                                                                                       | 55        |
| 2.3.2.5.3 Jude.....                                                                                                                | 56        |
| 2.3.2.5.4 Johannine Epistles.....                                                                                                  | 56        |
| 2.3.2.5.5 Hebrews.....                                                                                                             | 57        |
| 2.3.2.5.6 Revelation.....                                                                                                          | 57        |
| 2.3.3 The Terms κύριος and θεός – <i>Reflecting on the Text Critical</i><br><i>Variations and Concepts (Deutero-Pauline)</i> ..... | 58        |

|         |                                                                       |    |
|---------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 2.3.3.1 | <i>Colossians</i> .....                                               | 58 |
| 2.3.3.2 | <i>Ephesians</i> .....                                                | 61 |
| 2.3.3.3 | <i>2 Thessalonians</i> .....                                          | 62 |
| 2.4     | THE TERMS KYPIOS AND ΘEOΣ IN THE PAULINE LETTERS (NON-CITATIONS)..... | 62 |
| 2.4.1   | 1 Thessalonians.....                                                  | 62 |
| 2.4.2   | Galatians.....                                                        | 64 |
| 2.4.3   | Philippians and Philemon.....                                         | 66 |
| 2.5     | THE WORKS OF PHILO.....                                               | 70 |
| 2.5.1   | Introduction.....                                                     | 70 |
| 2.5.2   | <i>Quis Rerum Divinarum Heres Sit</i> .....                           | 71 |
| 2.5.3   | <i>Legum Allegoria</i> .....                                          | 72 |
| 2.5.4   | <i>De Sobrietate</i> .....                                            | 73 |
| 2.5.5   | <i>De Mutatione Nominum</i> .....                                     | 74 |
| 2.5.6   | Summary.....                                                          | 75 |
| 2.6     | THE WORKS OF FLAVIUS JOSEPHUS.....                                    | 76 |
| 2.6.1   | Introduction.....                                                     | 76 |
| 2.6.2   | <i>Antiquitates Judaicae</i> .....                                    | 76 |
| 2.6.3   | <i>De Belle Judaico</i> .....                                         | 78 |
| 2.6.4   | <i>Contra Apionem</i> .....                                           | 79 |
| 2.6.5   | Summary.....                                                          | 79 |

### Chapter 3: Explicit KYPIOS and ΘEOΣ Citations in the Literary Conceptual

|         |                                                       |     |
|---------|-------------------------------------------------------|-----|
|         | <b>Context of Romans</b> .....                        | 80  |
| 3.1     | INTRODUCTION.....                                     | 80  |
| 3.1.1   | Relating Romans to the Literary Problem.....          | 80  |
| 3.2     | ESTABLISHING THE EXPLICIT CITATIONS.....              | 82  |
| 3.2.1   | Citations with Introductory Formulae.....             | 82  |
| 3.3     | EXPLICIT CITATIONS WITHOUT INTRODUCTORY FORMULAE..... | 83  |
| 3.3.1   | Romans 11:34 and 1 Corinthians 2:16.....              | 83  |
| 3.3.2   | 1 Corinthians 10:26.....                              | 84  |
| 3.3.3   | 2 Corinthians 3:16.....                               | 84  |
| 3.4     | ESTABLISHING THE KYPIOS AND ΘEOΣ TEXT IN ROMANS.....  | 85  |
| 3.4.1   | Romans 1.....                                         | 85  |
| 3.4.2   | Romans 2.....                                         | 86  |
| 3.4.2.1 | <i>Romans 2:24</i> .....                              | 86  |
| 3.4.3   | Romans 3.....                                         | 92  |
| 3.4.3.1 | <i>Romans 3:11 and Romans 3:18</i> .....              | 92  |
| 3.4.4   | Romans 4.....                                         | 95  |
| 3.4.4.1 | <i>Romans 4:3</i> .....                               | 95  |
| 3.4.4.2 | <i>Romans 4:8</i> .....                               | 98  |
| 3.4.5   | Romans 5.....                                         | 101 |
| 3.4.6   | Romans 6.....                                         | 102 |
| 3.4.7   | Romans 7.....                                         | 102 |
| 3.4.8   | Romans 8.....                                         | 103 |
| 3.4.9   | Romans 9.....                                         | 104 |
| 3.4.9.1 | <i>Romans 9:26</i> .....                              | 104 |
| 3.4.9.2 | <i>Romans 9:28</i> .....                              | 105 |
| 3.4.9.3 | <i>Romans 9:29</i> .....                              | 107 |
| 3.4.10  | Romans 10.....                                        | 114 |

|          |                                                                             |     |
|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 3.4.10.1 | <i>Romans 10:13</i> .....                                                   | 114 |
| 3.4.10.2 | <i>Romans 10:16</i> .....                                                   | 115 |
| 3.4.11   | Romans 11.....                                                              | 119 |
| 3.4.11.1 | <i>Romans 11:3</i> .....                                                    | 119 |
| 3.4.11.2 | <i>Romans 11:8</i> .....                                                    | 123 |
| 3.4.11.3 | <i>Romans 11:34</i> .....                                                   | 125 |
| 3.4.12   | Romans 12.....                                                              | 128 |
| 3.4.12.1 | <i>Romans 12:19</i> .....                                                   | 128 |
| 3.4.13   | Romans 13.....                                                              | 131 |
| 3.4.14   | Romans 14.....                                                              | 131 |
| 3.4.14.1 | <i>Romans 14:11</i> .....                                                   | 131 |
| 3.4.15   | Romans 15.....                                                              | 138 |
| 3.4.15.1 | <i>Romans 15:9</i> .....                                                    | 138 |
| 3.4.15.2 | <i>Romans 15:11</i> .....                                                   | 140 |
| 3.4.16   | Romans 16.....                                                              | 142 |
| 3.5      | SUMMARY.....                                                                | 142 |
| 3.5.1    | Proposed Solution: <i>Theological Conceptual Problems</i> .....             | 143 |
| 3.5.2    | Proposed Solution: <i>Translation and Greek Transmission Problems</i> ..... | 144 |

**Chapter 4: Explicit KYPIOΣ and ΘΕΟΣ Citations in the Literary Conceptual Context of First and Second Corinthians**.....145

|          |                                                                   |     |
|----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 4.1      | INTRODUCTION.....                                                 | 145 |
| 4.2      | ESTABLISHING THE KYPIOΣ AND ΘΕΟΣ TEXT IN 1 AND 2 CORINTHIANS..... | 145 |
| 4.2.1    | 1 Corinthians 1.....                                              | 145 |
| 4.2.1.1  | <i>1 Corinthians 1:31</i> .....                                   | 145 |
| 4.2.2    | 1 Corinthians 2.....                                              | 150 |
| 4.2.2.1  | <i>1 Corinthians 2:9</i> .....                                    | 150 |
| 4.2.2.2  | <i>1 Corinthians 2:16</i> .....                                   | 152 |
| 4.2.3    | 1 Corinthians 3.....                                              | 156 |
| 4.2.3.1  | <i>1 Corinthians 3:20</i> .....                                   | 156 |
| 4.2.4    | 1 Corinthians 4.....                                              | 159 |
| 4.2.5    | 1 Corinthians 5.....                                              | 160 |
| 4.2.6    | 1 Corinthians 6.....                                              | 160 |
| 4.2.7    | 1 Corinthians 7.....                                              | 161 |
| 4.2.8    | 1 Corinthians 8.....                                              | 163 |
| 4.2.9    | 1 Corinthians 9.....                                              | 164 |
| 4.2.10   | 1 Corinthians 10.....                                             | 164 |
| 4.2.10.1 | <i>1 Corinthians 10:26</i> .....                                  | 164 |
| 4.2.11   | 1 Corinthians 11.....                                             | 168 |
| 4.2.12   | 1 Corinthians 12.....                                             | 168 |
| 4.2.13   | 1 Corinthians 13.....                                             | 169 |
| 4.2.14   | 1 Corinthians 14.....                                             | 169 |
| 4.2.14.1 | <i>1 Corinthians 14:21</i> .....                                  | 169 |
| 4.2.15   | 1 Corinthians 15.....                                             | 176 |
| 4.2.16   | 1 Corinthians 16.....                                             | 177 |
| 4.2.17   | 2 Corinthians 1 and 2.....                                        | 177 |
| 4.2.18   | 2 Corinthians 3.....                                              | 178 |
| 4.2.18.1 | <i>2 Corinthians 3:16</i> .....                                   | 178 |
| 4.2.19   | 2 Corinthians 4.....                                              | 181 |



|                                                                                      |                                                                                                    |            |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 4.2.20                                                                               | 2 Corinthians 5 – 9.....                                                                           | 181        |
| 4.2.21                                                                               | 2 Corinthians 10.....                                                                              | 183        |
| 4.2.21.1                                                                             | 2 Corinthians 10:17.....                                                                           | 183        |
| 4.3                                                                                  | SUMMARY.....                                                                                       | 186        |
| 4.3.1                                                                                | Proposed Solution: <i>Theological Conceptual Problems</i> .....                                    | 186        |
| 4.3.2                                                                                | Proposed solution: <i>A Translation, Transmission and Theological Conceptual Problem</i> .....     | 187        |
| <b>Chapter 5: Conclusion – Observations on Paul’s Concept of a Hebrew Deity.....</b> |                                                                                                    | <b>188</b> |
| 5.1                                                                                  | INTRODUCTION.....                                                                                  | 188        |
| 5.2                                                                                  | EVALUATING THE JEWISH-HELLENISTIC BACKDROP.....                                                    | 189        |
| 5.3                                                                                  | PAUL’S KYPIOΣ AND ΘΕΟΣ CONCEPTS.....                                                               | 192        |
| 5.3.1                                                                                | Summary: Paul’s KYPIOΣ and ΘΕΟΣ Concepts – Non-Citations.....                                      | 193        |
| 5.3.2                                                                                | Greek Equivalents Attested in the Explicit Citation – <i>Unique KYPIOΣ and ΘΕΟΣ Concept?</i> ..... | 193        |
| 5.3.3                                                                                | The KYPIOΣ and ΘΕΟΣ Concepts in the Romans Epistle.....                                            | 194        |
| 5.3.4                                                                                | The KYPIOΣ and ΘΕΟΣ Concepts in the 1 <sup>st</sup> Corinthian Letter.....                         | 198        |
| 5.3.5                                                                                | The KYPIOΣ and ΘΕΟΣ Concepts in the 2 <sup>nd</sup> Corinthian Letter.....                         | 201        |
| 5.4                                                                                  | PAUL’S CONCEPT OF A HEBREW DEITY.....                                                              | 202        |
| 5.5                                                                                  | PROPOSALS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH.....                                                                 | 203        |
| ADDENDUM A.....                                                                      |                                                                                                    | x          |
| ADDENDUM B.....                                                                      |                                                                                                    | xx         |
| ADDENDUM C.....                                                                      |                                                                                                    | xxii       |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY.....                                                                    |                                                                                                    | xxiv       |