Voice to the silent: An ecology of local knowledge in psychology

by

Linda Marie Eskell-Blokland

submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

Philosophiae Doctor

In the Department of Psychology, University of Pretoria, Mamelodi Campus.

Promoter: Professor T M Bakker

January 2005

Pretoria
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author wishes to acknowledge the following people who assisted, contributed or both, in some way to this work.

Terri Bakker for her patient supervision

The research participants for their willingness to share

My children Jasper, Megan and Rachel for their faith and tolerance

All my students who shared their ecologies

Peter Jacobs and Roger Rivas, my own healers, for keeping me on the path

My colleagues at the campus in Mamelodi (Willem, Gerhard, Monique, Ilse and Terri) for picking up after me

My family and close friends who just quietly expected me to finish this

Maria, for the time and space
Declaration

I declare that: *Voice to the silent: An ecology of local knowledge in psychology*, is my own work, that all the sources used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references, and that this dissertation or research project was not previously submitted by me for a degree at another university.

Notes about the text:

1. All participants in this research granted permission to present their conversations here.
2. Names have been changed to protect the identities of the participants except where this was specifically not requested.
3. To simplify the reading the feminine third person pronoun has been used throughout.
SUMMARY

Voice to the silent: An ecology of local knowledge in psychology

By Linda Marie Eskell-Blokland

Philosophaie Doctor

Department of Psychology

Promoter: Professor T. M. Bakker

Mainstream psychology is argued to be a discipline of western orientation and thus problematic when applied in non-western contexts. It is recognised that psychology has an important role to play in the developing context of South Africa and thus the relevance and appropriateness of psychology as an applied discipline in both practice and research is of concern to local practitioners. Previous research into the problem has been presented from western academic frameworks but little has been recorded exposing local voices on the subject, or proposing useful approaches to praxis. In an attempt to address these shortcomings in the discipline, this study explores the academic context as well as some local voices from the field on the relevance of mainstream psychology as currently practiced generally in South Africa. A framework for reflecting on practice at a meta level, in an ecologically sensitive approach, is proposed.
Considering the history of the problem, constraining factors to the development of a more appropriate praxis in psychology are seen to include epistemological issues in the discipline emerging from western academic hegemony and contributing to the perceived previous elitism of psychology as a discipline. The study deciphers issues around epistemology in as far as they impact on the problem. Epistemological issues call for an exploration of indigenous or local knowledges in an attempt to arrive at a relevant and appropriate praxis of psychology in the local context.

In the handling of the research material, the study adopts a narrative literary stance in a postmodern attitude, to avoid epistemological issues arising from conventional approaches to research. The voices from the previously silenced majority are presented through stories of experiences involving human problems and psychotherapy in the township of Mamelodi, east of Pretoria in South Africa.

The research material is discussed using ecological and evolutionary language at a meta level. The researcher distinguishes between what takes place in a professional dialogue and how she reflects on this process. Ecological and evolutionary language at the reflexive meta level is considered to facilitate a context-sensitive approach to psychology as a discipline practiced in a non-western context.

Key terms: local knowledge; epistemology; ecology; western; non-western; hegemony; context; culture; globalisation; developing; indigenisation
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Title page ...........................................................................................................i
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................ii
Declaration .........................................................................................................iii
Summary .............................................................................................................iv
Table of contents .............................................................................................vi

## CHAPTER ONE: THE STORY

A Journal: The Story of Lesaka .....................................................................1
Reflection .....................................................................................................19

## CHAPTER TWO: THE FLOW: INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY

The Context ..................................................................................................21

*The Approach* ..........................................................................................23
Area of Focus ...............................................................................................25
Background ..................................................................................................26

The Problem Defined ...................................................................................27

The African, the Global and the Local in Psychology and Philosophy ....29

Ecologies and Paradigms .............................................................................30

Hegemony within Psychology .....................................................................34

The Narratives ..............................................................................................35

Layout of the Text ........................................................................................36

## CHAPTER THREE: OTHER STORIES

The Term Diagnosis........................................................................................40
Definition of Diagnosis ................................................................. 41
1. Alice and Doozy ........................................................................... 41
   The Diagnostic Story ................................................................. 42
   The Narrative ........................................................................... 42
2. Thabo .......................................................................................... 47
   The Diagnostic Story ................................................................. 47
   The Narrative ........................................................................... 48
3. Cabangile .................................................................................... 50
   The Diagnostic Story ................................................................. 50
   The Narrative ........................................................................... 51
4. Agape: A prototype community counselling centre? ................. 60
   The Diagnostic Story ................................................................. 60
   The Narrative ........................................................................... 61
5. A young healer’s story .................................................................. 67
   The Diagnostic Story ................................................................. 67
   The Narrative ........................................................................... 67
Concluding The Stories ................................................................ 71

CHAPTER FOUR: THE ECOLOGY OF MINDS IN THE CONTEXT
OF CHANGE ..................................................................................... 72
The Context of Practice: The Township ........................................ 72
   Socio-Political Flux of the Context of Practice ....................... 73
Culture .......................................................................................... 74
   Falling Through the Cracks in the Culture ......................... 74
Criticism of Psychology in Africa .............................................. 76
Indigenisation as an Approach ................................................. 77
Indigenisation as a Polarising Process ..................................... 79
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arguments for Indigenisation</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arguments for Universality</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Institutionalisation Processes: Alienation?</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Globalisation-Particularisation</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Local Position</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alienation Within the Community</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evolutionary Processes in South African Psychology</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical Development of the Context</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alienation Through Prejudice</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stories of Alienation Within the Profession</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberation from the Institution</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Well-Being and Psychopathology in Context</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge Base and Psychopathology</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER FIVE: KNOWLEDGE BASE AS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CULTURAL CONSTRUCT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing and The Oral Tradition</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dialectics of African Traditional and Western Scientific Thought</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modernity and Hegemony in Philosophy</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alienation Through Social Change</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making Sense of the World: A Question of Knowledge Base</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Truth, Power and Knowledge</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Dualism in Knowledge</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approach to Knowledge</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afrocentrism</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Considering Psychology in the Socio-Cultural Context</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Use of Metaphors in Culture .................................................................121
Healing and Ritual ................................................................................122
Seeking an Afrocentric ‘Sense of Self’ ..............................................124
Aspects and Stages of Selfhood..........................................................125
Psychological Development and Intelligence ..............................126
The Naming Ceremony and Sense of Self. ....................................126
An Afrocentric ‘Sense of Community’ .............................................128
From Tradition to Multiculturalism .................................................130

CHAPTER SIX: RESEARCH PARADIGM CONSIDERED ..............131
The Climate of Research Methodologies ........................................131
Research Approaches and Approaches to Research in Africa .........133
Praxis....................................................................................................134
A Reflexive Approach and Learning Posture ..............................135
A Postmodern Position ..................................................................137
A Postmodern Position for a Context of Discovery .................139
Methodological Issues in Postmodern Research: Pros and Cons ..140
Criticism of Postmodernism ............................................................140
Beyond the Criticism ......................................................................142
A Postmodern Paradigm for Research: Social Constructionism ...143
Narrative Approaches .................................................................144
Positioning the Study .................................................................144
The Research Process ......................................................................146
The Narratives of this Study ..........................................................148
A Link to Participatory Action Research ......................................148
Implementing PAR ........................................................................150
Major Principles of PAR ...............................................................150
The Spiral Process of PAR ..........................................................152

Knowledge as Part of the Spiral ..............................................153

Processes Discovered ..........................................................154

Local and Popular Knowledge ............................................155

Introduction to Local Knowledge .........................................155

The Relationship Between PAR and Local Knowledge .........156

Debunking Formalities and Elitism Around Knowledge .........157

Beyond the Knowledge Agenda of Research .......................159

(Local) Knowledge, Research and Responsibility ................161

The Relationship Between Knowledge and Control .............163

Ownership, Production and Recognition of Knowledge .......164

Researching for Relevance ................................................167

Conclusion ..............................................................................169

CHAPTER SEVEN: EXPLORING THE FLOW ..........................170

Tools for Analysis ...............................................................171

Making the Shift ...................................................................172

Systemic Punctuations ........................................................175

The Story ..............................................................................176

Alice and Doozy .................................................................176

Thabo ..................................................................................178

A Young Healer’s Story .......................................................179

Communication, Consciousness and Human Adaptation

(mind in ecology) ..............................................................180

The Relationship Between Evolution and Ecology ...............183

Mind in Ecology ....................................................................184

Relevance of Patterns of Organisation for Psychological Practice 184
Patterns of Organisation in Other Artefacts .................................................. 186

Cognition and Communication in Ecology 186

Knowing in an Ecological Sense .................................................................187

The Process of Interpretation .................................................................188

Change in Social Domains......................................................................192

The Ecology of Healing ..........................................................................193

Conclusion..............................................................................................194

CHAPTER EIGHT: SOME CONCLUSIONS ..............................................195

Training and Epistemology in an Ecology of Mind...............................196

Approaching Diversity ............................................................................198

Psychology – A Discipline for Change? ...............................................198

Taking a Meta Level for Globalisation and Diversity .........................199

Psychotherapy Practice and Ecology of Mind ....................................201

Connecting with the Context ................................................................202

Knowledge and Academia .....................................................................203

Final Word..............................................................................................204

REFERENCES.............................................................................................206