

University of Pretoria etd – More, D D (2004)

**THE IMPACT OF LARGE SCALE TRAINING
PROGRAMMES ON EDUCATION MANAGEMENT
DEVELOPMENT IN SOUTH AFRICA**

David Daniel MORE

Presented in fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree of

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

in

EDUCATION POLICY STUDIES

Department of Education Management and Policy Studies

University of Pretoria, South Africa

Supervisor: Prof. J.D. Jansen

March 2004

Abstract

South Africa has witnessed radical policy reforms since the advent of the new democratic dispensation in 1994. As provincial, district and local practitioners developed responses to those new national education policies, implementation issues were revealed in all their complexity. Policy implementation became one of the most difficult challenges South Africa had to contend with. It necessitated the development of the capacity of the state and its people to implement policy.

The complexities of the people development environment in South Africa create a range of challenges for development. The lack of multi-level empirical data on training effects continues to exacerbate this state of affairs. This context requires that comprehensive assessment mechanisms be put in place for training programmes aimed at the realisation of policy goals.

The broad purpose of this inquiry, therefore, is to determine the impact of an education management development training intervention as it passes through different levels of the education system in South Africa - national, provincial, district and local.

The following key questions guided this investigation. Firstly, how do stakeholder understandings of “education management development” transfer from one level to another in a cascade model of training?

And secondly, what is the operational impact of an education management development-training programme at the different levels (i.e., province, district and school) of the education system?

University of Pretoria etd – More, D D (2004)

Questionnaires, free attitude interviews and observations were used as key data collection instruments. Data was analysed using a combination of quantitative and qualitative strategies for making sense of the training information. Data was interpreted against the backdrop of the literature on the “transfer of training”, and these findings are represented in the last three chapters of this thesis.

This research generated four major findings, with a variety of subsidiary findings, which deepen our insights into policy implementation as it relates to education management development in South Africa.

Some of the major findings of this study are that:

- a) The organisers did not in the first place conduct the baseline study on training needs and secondly, they did not take into consideration the organisational requirements of the anticipated training. This anomaly could ultimately compromise the outcomes of this intervention.
- b) The policy deployment processes of the North West Department of Education (of ensuring that the governmental policies for quality, cost and service delivery are understood from the highest to the lowest level of the organisation) are fraught with problems that undermined basic understandings of the Education Management Development training programme which was conducted between 1998 – 2000.
- c) Successful policy implementation depends crucially on resource allocation and, in the case of the Education

University of Pretoria etd – More, D D (2004)

Management Development Training Programme, the nature and magnitude of allocated resources e.g., transport provision could not guarantee positive training results; and

- d) The overly rationalistic view adopted by the trainers of the Education Management development-training programme did not take into account the complex contexts within which change unfolds. Resultantly, the changing of the roles of facilitators could not be planned-for in advance.

The significance of this study is that it identifies the barriers to learning in training events, and sheds new light on the transfer of training problem that continues to undermine organisational change and human resource development. Some of the unique findings of the study can be found in the fact that the Expert Trainers could only recall a few intentions of the EMD modular training. The District Facilitators displayed limited knowledge of the disciplinary procedures in their areas of operation and there was limited conceptualisation of the EMD by the principals of schools.

Key Words:

1. Cascade model of training
2. Cognitive task analysis
3. Critical success factors
4. Education Management Development
5. Policy development
6. Relapse prevention strategies
7. Return on investment
8. Training evaluation
9. Transfer of training
10. Validation of training

Acknowledgments

I owe my heartfelt indebtedness to the following individuals and organisations(s):

My wife, Gabaiphiwe, for your patience and support. My sons Disang and Koketso-Kitso, “you surely cannot follow the steps of a sleeping father, boys, you stand to gain a lot from embracing the exciting challenges of your times”.

My brothers and sisters, Sello, Mantsha, Rhona and Thabo, for your meticulous handling of our parents’ God’s willing absence. That in itself gives one an advantage in challenging studies of this magnitude

The South African Democratic Teachers Union, for providing enabling initiatives which continue to serve as pre-determinants for access to ground-breaking innovations such as the PhD Education Policy studies of the University of Pretoria.

Dr. J.Z.O. Machiu, for your exemplary, ageless, insatiable appetite for reading, and in particular, for creating awareness of the advertised PhD programme which consequently became my field of study.

The support team in the data collection and ICT work, Adam Segodi, Sheila Kgatitsoe, Maphefo Magano and Ronel Kotzè. Your gut-wrenching maneuvers of the ICT tools and state-of-the-art, impeccable typing skills will undoubtedly expand your ever increasing market.

Mr Errol Gradwell, whose intrusion into my life world still left me with an option to focus, despite being kept busy by the very tight restructuring and transformation work schedule.

University of Pretoria etd – More, D D (2004)

The PhD Education Policy Studies class of 2001 - 2004, in particular Mamolahluwa Mokoena and Itumeleng Molale, for the academic companionship of remarkable experiences. “You are not necessarily out of control when you are not in control” is the greatest learning experience I have obtained in our partnership.

Alexa Barnby, whose editing skills have proved invaluable to this research initiative.

Prof. J.D. Jansen – The transformation of the lives of ordinary people, guided by the practicing of the Great Teacher’s philosophy of washing the disciples’ feet – knows no better contemporary comparison.

“I thank you”.

This humble effort is dedicated to my late parents, Buti and Shanta More.

DECLARATION

I, DAVID DANIEL MORE, declare that

“THE IMPACT OF LARGE SCALE TRAINING PROGRAMMES ON
EDUCATION MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT IN SOUTH AFRICA.”

is my own work, that all the sources used or quoted have been indicated and
acknowledged by means of complete references.

Signed:

.....

D. D. MORE

DATE

*“OBEY THE LORD AND SERVE HIM FAITHFULLY
WITH ALL YOUR HEART. REMEMBER THE GREAT
THINGS HE HAS DONE FOR YOU”*

1 SAMUEL 12:24

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	ii
Acknowledgements	vi
Declaration	viii
Table of Contents.....	x
List of Appendices	xiii
List of Figures and Tables.....	xiv
Acronyms.....	xv
Coding	xvi

CHAPTER ONE: An introduction to the study

1.1. Introduction.....	1
1.2. Policy Context	2
1.3. The Knowledge Base on Training.....	8
1.4. Conceptual Framework.....	10
1.5. The Training Context and Curricular Content.....	12
1.5.1 The Training Agency.	12
1.5.2 The Training Content.....	14
1.5.3 Sampling Choices of Modules.....	23
1.6. Research Design.....	24
1.7. Limitations	25
1.8. Organisation of the Dissertation.....	27

CHAPTER TWO: The Literature Context for the Study

2.1 Introduction.....	29
2.2 Training and Learning	29
2.3 Definitions of Learning and Concern for Transfer	30
2.3.1 Limited Transfer of Training	34
2.3.2 Enhanced Transfer of Training	35

2.4 Task-related Learning and Transfer.....	36
2.5 Management Training Methods and Transfer.....	38
2.6 Effective Transfer, its Scope and Limitations	41
2.7 The Significance of the Literature on “Transfer of Training” ...	45
2.8 Critical Issues related to the Evaluation of Training.....	50
2.8.1 A working Definition of “Evaluation of Training”.....	51
2.8.2 Measuring Changes in Knowledge.....	52
2.8.3 Measuring Changes in Levels of Skills.....	53
2.8.4 Measuring Changes in Attitudes and Behavior.....	55
2.8.5 Measuring Changes in Levels of Effectiveness.....	56
2.8.6 Comprehensive Programme Evaluation.....	57

CHAPTER THREE: Research Design and Methods

3.1 Introduction.....	61
3.1.1 The Content and Design of the Cases	62
3.1.2 The Service Provider Level.....	69
3.1.3 The Provincial Department Level.....	69
3.1.4 The District Level	71
3.1.5 The School Level.....	72
3.2 Validity Concerns.....	74
3.3 Limitations.....	74

CHAPTER FOUR: Conceptual Framework

4.1 Introduction	79
4.2 The Cascade Model of Training	80
4.2.1 The Cascade Model: Views of the Advocates	82
4.2.2 The Cascade Model: Views of the Critics	83

4.3 Towards an Idealised Framework for Cascade Training.....	86
4.3.1 Arguments for the successful use of the Cascade Model	87
4.3.2 An Idealised Framework for the Cascade Training	89

CHAPTER FIVE: Findings on Stakeholder Understandings

5.1 Introduction.....	95
5.2 Findings at the four different Levels	97
5.2.1 Findings at the level of the Service Provider	97
5.2.2 Findings at the level of the Department	103
5.2.3 Findings at the level of the District	104
5.2.4 Findings at the level of the School.....	116
5.3 Synthesis.....	123

CHAPTER SIX: Findings on Operational Impacts

6.1 Introduction.....	129
6.2 Findings at the four different Levels	130
6.2.1 Findings at the level of the Service Provider	130
6.2.2 Findings at the level of the Department	134
6.2.3 Findings at the level of the District.....	135
6.2.4 Findings at the level of the School	141
6.3 Synthesis.....	147

CHAPTER SEVEN: Significance and Implications of the Study

7.1 Introduction	152
7.2 Research Findings against the backdrop of an Idealised version of the Cascade Model	153

7.3 Contrasts between predicted changes in Understanding and Impact: An Explanation of the differences.	158
7.4 Educational and Methodological Implications for Policy Practice	160
7.5 Limitations of the inquiry	165
7.6 Implications for Further Research	165
Bibliography.....	168

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A	177
Appendix B	178
Appendix C	188
Appendix D	198

LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

Fig 2.3.1	Limited transfer of training	35
Fig 2.3.2	Enhanced transfer of training	35
Fig 4.2	Cascade levels of training	81
Fig 4.3.2	An idealised framework for cascade training	89
Fig 5.2.3(a)	The intended organisational plan	105
Fig 5.2.3(b)	Changing of the roles of the district facilitators	106
Table 5.3	Findings on Stakeholder Understandings	127

Acronyms

EMD	Education Management Development
EMDP	Education Management Development Programme
HEI	Higher Education Institution
HRD I	Human Resource Development – Module One
HRD II	Human Resource Development – Module Two
HRD III	Human Resource Development – Module Three
MEC	Member of the Executive Council
MSTP	Management of School Training Programme
NWDE	North West Department of Education
ROI	Return on Investment
RTU	Research Training Unit
SET	Stress Exposure Training
SKA	Skills Knowledge and Attitudes

Coding

MSTP Expert Trainers

ET1I Expert Trainer No.1 Interviews

ET2I Expert Trainer No.2 Interviews

ET3I Expert Trainer No.3 Interviews

Note that training consultants only responded to the Interviews.

District Facilitators

DF1Q District Facilitator No.1 Questionnaire

DF3CS2 District Facilitator No.3 Case study No.1 (2) 3

DF10I District Facilitator No.10 Interview.

Note that the District Facilitators responded to Questionnaires, Case studies and Interviews.

Site Managers

SM1Q Site Manager No.1 Questionnaire

SM3CS1 Site Manager No.3 Case study No. (1), 2,3

SM10I Site Manager No.10 Interview

Note that site managers responded to questionnaires, case studies and interviews