

**RESTRUCTURING VALUE-ADDED TAX IN SOUTH AFRICA  
A COMPUTABLE GENERAL EQUILIBRIUM ANALYSIS**

by

**MARNA KEARNEY**

**Submitted in Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of  
Commerce in the Faculty of Economic and Management Sciences**

**UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA**

**STUDY LEADER: PROF. JAN H. VAN HEERDEN**

**OCTOBER 2003**

*To my LORD because he's my Creator...*  
*To my husband because he's my inspiration...*  
*To my children because they are my motivation...*  
*To my family because they are my support...*

**A word of thanks to**

Prof. Jan van Heerden, my study-leader, for his advice.  
Delfin Go and the World Bank for the opportunity to do an internship at the World Bank.  
The Mellon Foundation for the grant received.  
The NRF for financial assistance received.

# CONTENTS

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Preface</b>	<b>ii</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1:</b>	
<b>INTRODUCTION, PROBLEM STATEMENT AND METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Poverty, Inequality and Unemployment in South Africa	1
1.3 Government Policy	5
1.4 Restructuring Value Added Tax	13
1.5 Using a Computable General Equilibrium Model to Simulate Changes in VAT	16
1.6 Summary	20
<b>CHAPTER 2:</b>	
<b>INTRODUCING VALUE-ADDED TAX</b>	<b>21</b>
2.1 Introduction	21
2.2 VAT Overview	22
2.3 Broad Issues Within a VAT System	23
2.3.1 VAT: A Tax on Consumption	24
2.3.2 VAT and International Trade	25
2.3.3 Methods Used for Computing VAT Liability	25
2.3.4 Items, Firms and Sectors to Exclude from VAT	27
2.3.5 Zero-rating Versus Exemptions	29
2.3.6 Single or Multiple Rates	32
2.3.7 VAT on Services	35
2.3.8 VAT Evasions	35

2.4	Analyzing VAT in South Africa from 1991 to 2001	37
2.4.1	VAT as a Revenue Source for Government	37
2.4.2	VAT and Inflation	44
2.4.3	VAT and the Balance of Payments	45
2.4.4	The Regressiveness of VAT	45
2.4.5	Developing an Equation for VAT Collections for South Africa	48
2.5	Future Issues to Consider Within a VAT System	54
2.6	Summary	55
<b>CHAPTER 3:</b>		
<b>THE MODEL</b>		<b>57</b>
3.1	Introduction	57
3.2	Activities, Production and Factor Markets	57
3.3	Institutions	59
3.4	Commodity Markets	60
3.5	Closures	62
3.5.1	Factor Markets	62
3.5.2	Government	63
3.5.3	Foreign Sector	64
3.5.4	Saving-Investment	64
3.6	Changes to the Standard IFPRI Model	65
3.7	Summary	66
<b>CHAPTER 4:</b>		
<b>THE SOCIAL ACCOUNTING MATRIX</b>		<b>89</b>
4.1	Introduction	89
4.2	Definition	90
4.3	The Objectives or Uses of a SAM	90
4.4	Standard CGE Model – The SAM as Data Requirement	95
4.4.1	Explaining the Content of the Standard SAM	95

4.5	SAM Development in South Africa	99
4.6	World Bank Commissioned SAM	100
4.6.1	The Process of Constructing the South African SAM	100
4.6.2	Data Sources Used Within the South African SAM	100
4.6.3	The Content of the South African SAM	101
4.6.4	Valuation of Transactions	107
4.7	Other Data Sources	107
4.8	Summary	108
<b>CHAPTER 5:</b>		
<b>RESTRUCTURING VAT</b>		<b>109</b>
5.1	Introduction	109
5.2	The CGE Model	111
5.3	Instruments	112
5.3.1	Regressiveness	112
5.3.2	Progressiveness	113
5.3.3	Distribution	114
5.3.4	Equivalent Variation	115
5.4	Simulations	115
5.4.1	Decreasing the Statutory VAT Rate from 14 Percent to 12.6 Percent	115
5.4.2	Zero-rating Food	116
5.4.3	Zero-rating Labor-intensive Industries	117
5.5	The Macroeconomic Adjustment Rules	119
5.6	The Results	120
5.6.1	Decreasing the Statutory VAT Rate from 14 Percent to 12.6 Percent	120
5.6.2	Zero-rating Food	127
5.6.3	Zero-rating Financial Services	142
5.7	What the Model Does Not Say	150
5.8	Summary	150

<b>CHAPTER 6:</b>	
<b>SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>155</b>
6.1 Summary	155
6.2 Conclusions and Recommendations	158
<b>List of Sources</b>	<b>160</b>

# Appendices

## LIST OF APPENDICES

<b>CHAPTER 2:</b>	
McKinnon Critical Values for the ADF-Statistic on Testing for the null of no cointegration	
Test Results for a Structural Break in GCOTH in 1994 Fourth Quarter	<b>56</b>
<b>CHAPTER 3:</b>	
The Mathematical Model	<b>67</b>

# Tables

## LIST OF TABLES

<b>CHAPTER 1:</b>	
TABLE 1.1	
The Percentage of South Africans Living in Poverty	2
TABLE 1.2	
Monthly Household Expenditures by Population Group	3
TABLE 1.3	
Gini Coefficients on Pay for African, Coloured and White People, 1995-1998	4
TABLE 1.4	
The Major Revenue Sources of National Government as a Percentage of Total Tax Receipts	15

<b>CHAPTER 2:</b>	
TABLE 2.1	
The Three Types of VAT	24
TABLE 2.2	
The Difference Between the Subtraction and Credit Method to Impose VAT	26
TABLE 2.3	
The Effect of Zero-Ratings and Exemptions on Government Revenue	31
TABLE 2.4	
VAT Introduced with a Single Rate	33
TABLE 2.5	
The Correlation Between VAT as a Percentage of GDP and Chosen Explanatory Variables	39
TABLE 2.6	
Variables Used in the Estimation of a VAT Collection Equation	49
TABLE 2.7	
Data Plots of Variables	49
TABLE 2.8	
Augmented Dickey-Fuller Tests for Non-stationarity, Levels 1991-2003	50
TABLE 2.9	
Augmented Dickey-Fuller Tests for Non-stationarity, First Differences 1991-2003	50
TABLE 2.10	
Estimation Results	52
TABLE 2.11	
Augmented Dickey-Fuller Test Statistics on Testing for the Null Hypothesis of No Cointegration	52
TABLE 2.12	
Estimation Results	54
<b>CHAPTER 3:</b>	
TABLE 3.1	
Additional Commodity Taxes Included in the CGE Model	65

<b>CHAPTER 4:</b>	
TABLE 4.1	
Basic SAM Structure used in the CGE Model	96
TABLE 4.2	
Commodities Included in the SA SAM	102
TABLE 4.3	
Household Categories in the SA SAM	103
TABLE 4.4	
Tax Revenue Sources Included in SA SAM	104
<b>CHAPTER 5:</b>	
TABLE 5.1	
Targeting Labor-Intensive Industries	118
TABLE 5.2	
Changes in Real GDP when Lowering the VAT Rate to 12.6 Percent	120
TABLE 5.3	
Some Macro Economic Results when Lowering the VAT to 12.6 Percent	121
TABLE 5.4	
Changes in Real GDP when Zero-rating Food	127
TABLE 5.5	
Some Macro Economic Results when Zero-rating Food	129
TABLE 5.6	
Gini Coefficients when Zero-rating Food	140
TABLE 5.7	
Changes in Real GDP when Zero-rating Financial Service	142
TABLE 5.8	
Some Macro Economic Results when Zero-rating Financial Services	143
TABLE 5.9	
The Change in Factor Income when Zero-rating Financial Services	146



# Figures

## LIST OF FIGURE

<b>CHAPTER 1:</b>	
FIGURE 1.1	
Distribution of the Employed in Economic Sectors in 2001	4
FIGURE 1.2	
Government Expenditure from 1990 to 2002	10
FIGURE 1.3	
Government Revenue from 1990 to 2002	11
FIGURE 1.4	
The Budget Deficit / Surplus from 1990 to 2002	12
FIGURE 1.5	
Growth in Real GDP from 1990 to 2001	13
<b>CHAPTER 2:</b>	
FIGURE 2.1	
The Ratio of Small, Medium and Large Firms in the Sectors of Production in 1998	28
FIGURE 2.2	
VAT Compared to GST	38
FIGURE 2.3	
VAT as a Percentage of GDP from 1991 to 2001	39
FIGURE 2.4	
VAT Compared to Other Taxes from 1991 to 2001	40
FIGURE 2.5	
VAT per Sector in 2001	41

FIGURE 2.6 VAT as a Percentage of Gross Value Added in 2001	42
FIGURE 2.7 The Efficiency and C-Efficiency Ratio of VAT from 1991 to 2001	43
FIGURE 2.8 The Regressiveness of VAT in 2001	46
FIGURE 2.9 The Progressiveness of the Complete Tax System in 2001	47
FIGURE 2.10 Residual Plot	52
<b>CHAPTER 3:</b>	
FIGURE 3.1 Production Technology	58
FIGURE 3.2 Commodity Flows	61
<b>CHAPTER 4:</b>	
FIGURE 4.1 Contribution per Activity	102
FIGURE 4.2 Wage Income per Household Category	104
FIGURE 4.3 Value Added by Factor Category	106
FIGURE 4.4 Employment by Labor Category	107
<b>CHAPTER 5:</b>	
FIGURE 5.1 The Portion of Income Spend on Food per Household Deciles 1998	110
FIGURE 5.2 The Expected and Actual Change in Commodity Prices when Lowering VAT to 12.6 percent	123

FIGURE 5.3	
The Percentage Change in Factor Income when Lowering the VAT rate to 12.6 Percent	125
FIGURE 5.4	
The Equivalent Variation when Lowering the VAT Rate to 12.6 Percent	126
FIGURE 5.5	
<b>The Expected and Actual Change in Commodity Prices When Zero-rating Food</b>	131
FIGURE 5.6	
The Expected and Actual Change in Commodity Prices When Zero-rating Food While Increasing Direct Taxes	133
FIGURE 5.7	
The Expected and Actual Change in Commodity Prices When Zero-rating Food and Increasing VAT on Business Services	134
FIGURE 5.8	
The Percentage Change in Factor Income When Zero-rating Food	135
FIGURE 5.9	
The Percentage Change in Household Consumption Expenditure on Food When Zero-rating Food	136
FIGURE 5.10	
The Percentage Change in Household Consumption Expenditure on Business Services When Zero-rating Food	137
FIGURE 5.11	
Changes in the Regressiveness of VAT When Zero-rating Food	138
FIGURE 5.12	
Changes in the Progressiveness of the Overall Tax Structure When Zero-rating Food	139
FIGURE 5.13	
Equivalent Variation When Zero-rating Food	141

FIGURE 5.14	
Percentage Change in the Demand for Semi- and Unskilled Labor When Zero-rating Financial Services	145
FIGURE 5.15	
Percentage Change in the Demand for Semi- and Unskilled Labor When Zero-rating Financial Services While Increasing Direct Taxes	146
FIGURE 5.16	
Consumption of Financial Services When Zero-rating Financial Services	147
FIGURE 5.17	
Changes in the Regressiveness of VAT When Zero-rating Financial Services	148
FIGURE 5.18	
Changes in the Progressiveness of the Tax Structure When Zero-rating Financial Services	149
FIGURE 5.19	
Equivalent Variation When Zero-rating Financial Services	149