

Chapter 12. Findings, recommendations, conclusions, limitations and further literature review research

12.1 Findings and recommendations from the literature review chapters

Management, entrepreneurship and small business management experienced decades of rapid growth after the fall of communism, but after the disaster of 11 September 2001 which destroyed the World Trade Centre in New York, business as usual will never be the same again. Therefore this thesis took a new look at evaluation concepts and constructs such as, ethics, reappraisal, responsibility, outcomes, impact and accountability, and their importance to management, entrepreneurship and small businesses. It underlined the importance of triple bottom line non-financial accountability: Social responsibility, ethical standards, and environmentally sustainable development.

Within a proposed new management paradigm backed by evaluation constructs, the thesis elaborated on the question: Are we doing the things right?; and how it could be enhanced by the question: Are we doing the right things? Therefore one of the most important conclusions is that evaluating efficiency (things right) should be followed by evaluating effectiveness (right things). Although processes and especially outputs are important, the thesis illustrated how evaluation is shifting its emphasis to outcomes and impact, thus from efficiency measurement to effectiveness measurement. This paradigm shift is crucial but might be difficult for enterprises built on processes, performance, production and profits. Hopefully these changes in business outlook will offer opportunities to entrepreneurs propagating evaluation concepts and constructs.

Evaluating economic development is one of the prime targets for the evaluation science and enterprise. Both evaluation and development have many years of practice. Development evaluation changed the emphasis and direction of economic development worldwide. The increased use of evaluators to improve economic development performance is obvious and the major use of evaluation results was for purposes of program improvement. The evaluation itself is an intervention and instrument of social change in many development interventions. This thesis also emphasises the fact that evaluation is not something done to people but with people.

Given the above summarised literature study findings the null hypothesis $1H_0$ is accepted: Evaluation as science and as enterprise are contributing to positive changes in the development fraternity. (Please refer to Section 1.4.2).

Related to the $1H_0$ the second hypothesis $2H_0$ is also accepted based on the literature review: Evaluation concepts can be successfully used in SMMEs.

Businesses already go beyond their traditional role of maximising shareholder value, employing people, paying taxes and keeping within law as business is emerging as a principal engine of growth and development. Development economists have recognised the importance of the entrepreneur. Chapter 4 pointed out how evaluation could bring new value to management and entrepreneurship. Entrepreneurs should have an Evaluative Focus when they plan their endeavours.

To enhance this, evaluations should be mainstreamed by managers and entrepreneurs by widening their perceptions and making evaluation constructs a part of organizational culture. Evaluation holds great promise in providing stakeholders with badly needed information, which can be used to improve management and entrepreneurship. Evaluation is a science but also an enterprise in its own right.

International funders require greater accountability from management, entrepreneurship and small businesses. This is fortunate for businesses that are becoming good corporate citizens with emphasis on corporate social investment and responsibility. Evaluations are necessary to maximise development outcomes and impacts for all inhabitants, while accountable entrepreneurship and responsive management also aim to maximise development outcomes, impacts and the well-being of all people involved.

The thesis stressed the fact that evaluation should be an integral part of an organization's everyday operations. The corporate evaluator should, similar to the corporate entrepreneur (or intrapreneur), be recognized as a potentially viable means for promoting and sustaining corporate efficiency, effectiveness, competitiveness, innovation and creative ideas. The role of the evaluator, especially the corporate evaluator, shows similarities with the definitions of a corporate entrepreneur, as evaluations should be innovative; it should create new ideas on old issues, and should investigate alternative ways to reach efficiency and effectiveness.

There is an increasing demand for good evaluations to assess the effectiveness of business endeavours in achieving their objectives and to estimate the impacts they have produced on the intended beneficiaries. The thesis placed a strong emphasis on simple and economical evaluation approaches, stressed the fact that the

evaluation enterprise is becoming big business, and evaluators are like entrepreneurs also looking for business opportunities.

The use of evaluation concepts and constructs is an opportunity that entrepreneurs and managers should not overlook. This will not only buy them goodwill from stakeholders, but will facilitate to optimise their efficiency and effectiveness. It is thus of utmost importance for entrepreneurs and managers to acquaint themselves with evaluation concepts and constructs. Entrepreneurs and managers should take leadership in propagating and utilising evaluation concepts and prove that it can contribute to their success.

Thirdly, from the economic development and entrepreneurial applications of the evaluation enterprise and science and based on the literature review the third hypothesis $3H_0$ is also accepted: Evaluation concepts, theory and practice can be successfully used in women construction SMMEs.

Women are nowadays regarded as the hidden resource of construction entrepreneurial potential and development. The World Bank spends approximately \$40billion (R350billion) and the Development Bank of Southern Africa about R3billion on development projects per annum. A large percentage of these funds find their way to the construction sector, and is earmarked for qualifying women entrepreneurs. Women construction entrepreneurs who acquaint themselves with the DFI prescriptions will find it much easier to obtain business opportunities. DFIs do not bring in their own people from their own countries to do the construction, but make use of local construction entrepreneurs that understand development evaluation concepts and operate within the legislation and enabling measures of that specific country. At the moment the legislation and procurement procedures in South Africa benefit women and are inherently important windows of opportunity for women construction entrepreneurs.

Women construction entrepreneurs who acquaint themselves with evaluation principles will find it much easier to obtain business opportunities. The thesis also come to the conclusion that to be successful, women construction entrepreneurs should have an evaluative focus, women should 'think evaluation' and foster an evaluation culture in order to give them this competitive advantage in accessing business opportunities.

Corporate leaders, management and entrepreneurs are seeking tools to enable them to manage evaluations. The current complex technical language creates a barrier to the spread of monitoring and evaluation. It is important to understand the use, benefits and technical language of evaluation tools, logical development thinking, logic models and outcome constructs. Logical modelling is an extension of PERT, because it reaches beyond the output phase by emphasising outcomes. No endeavour will ever again be regarded as complete when the output only is completed. Processes are important, but they are only the first step towards outputs, outcomes and finally impact. Models offer evaluators structure and support. The practice of social and ethical accounting, auditing, evaluation and reporting provides a set of tools that can address these emerging needs. The literature on objective-oriented evaluation is extensive, filled with creative ideas for applying the outcomes approach.

The Logical Framework or Logframe is one of the most important evaluation tools. The Logical Framework not only integrates the outcomes construct, but also adds value to the outcomes construct by presenting it in a useable framework integrated with qualitative and quantitative aspects. The Logframe puts logical development thinking into a framework.

The Logframe is one of the most flexible evaluation tools. The Logical Framework described integrates the outcomes construct with outputs and impact through its vertical logic. It also adds value to the activity, output, outcome and impact constructs by presenting it in a useable framework integrated with qualitative and quantitative aspects through its horizontal logic. Based on the above findings from the literature the fourth hypothesis $4H_0$ is accepted: Logic modelling and outcome constructs can be successfully used to empower women construction entrepreneurs. The fifth hypothesis $5H_0$ is also accepted: Logframes can be successfully used to empower women construction entrepreneurs.

This thesis illustrated how business plans could benefit from the logical development thinking and the logframe concept. Managers and entrepreneurs already have to include Logframes in their business plans where international or development funding is at stake in order to answer 'why' and 'so what' questions, and Logframes became the defacto standard for international development project design and evaluation.

12.2 Findings and recommendations from the empirical study chapters

Due to the detailed and technical nature of the hypothesis and constructs the acceptability of women construction entrepreneurs were formulated separately for the empirical study. (Please refer to Sections 8.5 and 9.5).

An instrument was successfully developed to apply the Logical thinking approach of evaluation to women construction entrepreneurs. Given the results of the Cronbach Alpha and Factor analysis, the instrument developed to apply the logical thinking approach especially for the acceptability element of the Outcomes construct, proved to be reliable and valid. This instrument could be used for similar studies in future.

The null hypotheses were accepted for Constructs 1 to 8, which are more or less all technical skills and outcomes. The acceptance of H_0 implies a significant statistical and practical difference in the acceptability of the outcomes and skills of male and female entrepreneurs. In all these cases the difference in means implies that the male and female respondents both feel that males are significantly better than female construction entrepreneurs in technical skills and outcomes, and that these technical outcomes and skills of women construction entrepreneurs are not acceptable even for the female respondents. On the technical skills and outcomes women construction entrepreneurs need to work hard to change these negative perceptions.

For Construct 3, Carpentry, the ANOVA pointed out that the officials of the Department of Public Works (DPW) adjudicating tenders and business opportunities are far more negative than the local government officials handling feedback from clients about women carpentry entrepreneurs. This is in line with the queries of women in construction that because of such barriers they are not able to access the available business opportunities in order to prove their skills and outcomes.

Both male and female respondents agreed that women are better than men on traditional African building, thatching, painting and flooring. The differences were however not significant. ANOVA pointed out that the private sector allocating business opportunities, are far more positive than the local government officials in accepting women entrepreneurs involved in traditional African building.

Constructs 10 to 13, which are education, management and business related, leave a negative connotation. In all four constructs neither males nor females have acceptable skills and outcomes because all their means are below 2.5. This finding has profound implications regarding the planning of training strategies for both men

and women construction entrepreneurs. The past emphasis placed on technical training should make place for education, management and business related training and entrepreneurial programmes.

On Construct 13 (tendering) it was found that even female respondents are more negative about women in construction than male respondents. This strengthens the belief of women in construction that their tenders are not accepted. In Construct 11 (management) and C12 (innovation) female respondents accepted male entrepreneurs above women construction entrepreneurs, while male respondents accepted women construction entrepreneurs above males.

The Anova pointed out a statistical and practical difference in C13 (tendering) between the opinions of the private sector S4 and S1 DPW adjudicating tenders. This implies that the DPW finds the outcomes and skills of women entrepreneurs on tendering acceptable, while the private sector does not agree that their skills and outcomes on tendering are at an acceptable standard. This finding is also in line with the opinion of women in construction that they do not get adequate access to construction business opportunities. They could thus obtain more business opportunities if their tendering skills are upgraded.

As SAWiC is operational for three years, both the acceptability and utilization elements of the outcomes construct were tested in a second empirical study.

Given the results of the Cronbach Alpha and Factor analysis, the instrument developed to apply the logical thinking approach especially for measuring the acceptability and utilization elements of the Outcomes construct, proved to be reliable and valid. This instrument could also be used for similar studies in future.

There is a significant positive attitude towards SAWiC's outcomes in measuring their acceptability, as well as the utilisation of their training and networking opportunities by both male and female entrepreneurs in all nine provinces. Despite the fact that SAWiC is based in Midrand, the lack of provincial differences points out that SAWiC succeeds in being accepted and being utilised by all provinces equally.

The acceptance by men of SAWiC is an important finding for SAWiC as one of their slogans is "Women in Construction ... Supported by Men in Construction." As SAWiC is a women's association, no males can become construction entrepreneurs in SAWiC, but in order to obtain the support of males the policy of SAWiC to include males under the 'Service Provider' category seems to be successful.

12.3 Findings and recommendations from the case study chapters

The aim of Chapters 10 and 11 was to illustrate that, similar to a project or endeavour, an institution should be efficient in its daily processes and activities and should deliver a product or output. However, to be effective, outcomes should be stated under the objectives and the envisaged impact should be stated under the goal. For institutions and businesses to develop from process thinking to outcome thinking is crucial to ensure development effectiveness.

The Logframe construct was as a case study successfully applied to an institution. The institution in this case study is the South African Women in Construction Association (SAWiC). The Logframe developed in this case study is in line with the business plan prescriptions of international development finance institutions (DFIs). The versatility of the Logframe as a design tool is evident from the above illustration. Although Logframes should never replace business plans, if the Logframe is not used, institutions easily formulate their business plans only in a process mode, without asking the questions WHY or SO WHAT.

The incorporation of the logical development approach and evaluation approach using specialist modules on a construction project was implemented successfully. Evaluators are interested in the before, envisaged and after situation of an endeavour. The framework provides answers in a condensed format by making use of the logframe and indicators. Logical development models and Logframes were originally developed to serve as design, implementation and evaluation tools to ensure development effectiveness in development projects. In line with the Schematic design of this thesis presented in Chapter 1, Chapter 11 handled the Logframe on the project design and evaluation levels.

It is important that the Logframe be accepted as a design tool for projects to ensure development logic. Logframes are not something to be done by evaluators at the end of the project cycle but should be reviewed throughout the project cycle. It is a way of thinking outcomes instead of outputs. The question What is being done should be enhanced by Why it is being done.

12.4 Conclusions

Development evaluation constructs and concepts can be successfully utilised to benefit managerial and entrepreneurial theory and practice. The construct of Outcomes proved to be helpful within the concept of Logical Development Thinking

and Logical Frameworks by exploring the effectiveness of business endeavours. At the design phase evaluation constructs and Logframes could have a positive impact on future business plans. To qualify for international business opportunities women construction entrepreneurs should take note of logical frameworks.

Business plans for development related institutions should be in line with the evaluation concepts discussed in Chapter 2, the economic development concepts, Millennium Development Goals and World Summit on Sustainable Development discussed in Chapter 3, the entrepreneurial and managerial concepts of Chapter 4, and of course the gender principles discussed in Chapter 5. The logical development models of Chapter 6 and especially the Logframe described in Chapter 7 can be utilised to design 'outcomes' sensitive business plans.

12.5 Limitations of the thesis and further research

Literature of evaluation constructs in business are scarce and in most cases non-existent. To overcome this problem the success of parallel situations had to be used as such from the development fraternity.

Only the Outcomes construct and especially the Acceptability and Utilization elements could be tested empirically within the scope of this thesis. Given the extensive literature on the topic of evaluation, there is space for further empirical research on evaluation constructs.

This thesis mainly illustrated how management and entrepreneurship could benefit from evaluation constructs. Research is also needed on how evaluation theory and practice could be enriched by managerial and entrepreneurial sciences.

This thesis utilised women construction entrepreneurs as field of practical application. However, women are nowadays regarded as the hidden resource of construction entrepreneurial potential and development and are an important research topic on its own.

Due to the low utilisation of women in the construction enterprises the outcomes study of women only dealt with the acceptability aspect. As women are being utilised more, research could include utilization aspects in future.

The reasons why women got involved in a male dominated construction industry might be an interesting topic for further research.

The impact of other international organisations for women on the outcomes of women in construction in these countries lends itself to a useful comparative analysis.

Logframes should never replace business plans, but more research is necessary to hone the use of Logframes in different types of business plans for different types of business ventures.

Different international funders are involved in construction endeavours worth billions of Dollars. This thesis only handled the Logical Framework prescriptions. Some DFIs also have various performance measures and requirements for greater accountability that needs to be investigated in order for entrepreneurs to access these business opportunities successfully.

Social Accountancy Matrixes (SAMs) could be used to determine the impact of women in the construction sector on the macro economy by means of an Input-output analysis.