

Variables impacting on the delivery of Music in the  
learning area Arts and Culture in South Africa

by

**Christopher John Klopper**

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

**Doctor Musicae**

in the

**Faculty of Humanities**

**University of Pretoria**

**Promoter: Dr Hetta Potgieter**

**Co-Promoter: Prof. Dr Johannes Cronje**

**2004**

## Summary

This thesis is the documentation of an empirical study using quantitative methods to identify variables that are impacting on the delivery of Music in the learning area Arts and Culture in South Africa. These variables were extrapolated from surveys, interviews and questionnaires.

The learning area Arts and Culture is one of the eight compulsory learning areas for all learners from Grades 4-9 in South Africa. One of the four strands is Music. The research question was formulated on the basis that a perceived problem existed in the delivery of Music in the learning area Arts and Culture. This supposition is supported by the literature review.

The employment of univariate descriptive statistics, cross-tabulations of two-variable relationships and chi-squared tests to draw inferences about the relationship between categorical variables were adopted to quantify which variables are impacting on the delivery of Music in the learning area Arts and Culture.

Four dominant approaches to Music were defined as key issues:

- Governmental policies on educational reform
- Learning area Arts and Culture
- International viewpoints
- An African perspective on Music

The findings on these dominant approaches to Music revealed that the government policy of decentralisation was employed as a mechanism to address the disparities in education. The curriculum implemented, Curriculum 2005, was also employed as a structure to redress the dispersed education system that existed prior to the democratic participation of South African citizens.

A comparative analysis of international countries reviewed depicts arts education as an encompassing field with discrete arts disciplines. South Africa, conversely, adopts an integrated approach to the arts in the learning area Arts and Culture. This aligns to an African perspective of Music, having no subject boundaries and with the performing arts disciplines seldom separated in creative thinking.

The findings in these dominant approaches to Music led to the further delineation of the research question into three main avenues of inputs:

- human resources
- physical resources
- the societal role of the arts

The analysis of the data obtained from the educators indicated that all educators possess a qualification of some kind, but that there is a lack of specialisation in Music. Those who have an arts qualification alluded to the fact that they have a natural bias towards the art form in which they received their training. Statistical analysis proved that the type of school influences the level of implementation, the budget and the accessibility of resources for Music.

The research indicates that the response of the learners to the learning area Arts and Culture in South Africa is associated with the grade of the learner, the race of the learner and whether the learner acknowledges the value of learning about Music or not. Although school principals view the learning area as an integral part of education, they raised justified concerns pertaining to the learning area.

On the basis of the identification and quantification of variables impacting on the delivery of Music in the learning area Arts and Culture in South Africa, recommendations are made.

**empirical study  
international viewpoints  
human resources  
societal role of the arts  
education system  
processes**

**educational reform  
an African perspective  
physical resources  
quantitative methods  
inputs  
outputs**

## Samevatting

Hierdie proefskrif is die dokumentering van 'n empiriese studie wat van kwantitatiewe metodes gebruik gemaak het om veranderlikes te identifiseer wat 'n impak op die lewering van Musiek in die leerarea Kuns en Kultuur het. Hierdie veranderlikes is ekstrapoleer uit opnames, onderhoude en vraelyste.

Die leerarea Kuns en Kultuur is in Suid-Afrika een van die agt verpligte leerareas vir alle leerders van Graad 4-9. Een van die vier kunstevorme is Musiek. Die navorsingsvraag is geformuleer op die grondslag dat daar 'n waargenome probleem bestaan in die lewering van Musiek in die leerarea Kuns en Kultuur. Hierdie aanname word deur die literatuuoroorsig gesteun. Daar is gebruik gemaak van eenvariaat beskrywende statistiek, kruistabellering van tweeveranderlike verhoudings en chi-kwadraattoetse om gevolgtrekkings te maak oor die verhouding tussen kategoriese veranderlikes, ten einde te kwantifiseer watter veranderlikes 'n invloed uitoefen op die lewering van Musiek in die leerarea Kuns en Kultuur.

Vier dominante benaderings tot Musiek is as die sleutelkwessies gedefinieer:

- Regeringsbeleid oor onderwyservorming
- Leerarea Kuns en Kultuur
- Internasionale sienings
- 'n Afrika-perspektief op Musiek

Die bevindinge oor hierdie dominante benaderings tot Musiek het aan die lig gebring dat die desentraliseringsbeleid van die regering as 'n meganisme gebruik is om ongelykhede in die onderwys te hanteer. Die kurrikulum wat geïmplementeer is, naamlik Kurrikulum 2005, is as 'n verdere struktuur gebruik om die verstrooide onderwysstelsel wat voor die demokratiese deelname van Suid-Afrikaanse burgers bestaan het, reg te stel.

'n Vergelykende analise wat op internasionale gebied tussen verskeie lande gedoen is wat geraadpleeg is, stel kunsteopleiding voor as 'n allesomvattende veld wat aparte kunstedisiplines omvat. In teenstelling hiermee gebruik Suid-Afrika 'n geïntegreerde benadering tot die kunste in die leerarea Kuns en Kultuur. Dit is in ooreenstemming met 'n Afrikaperspektief van Musiek wat geen vakgrense het nie en waarin die uitvoerendekunstedisiplines selde in kreatiewe denke verdeel word.

Die bevindinge in hierdie dominante benaderings tot Musiek het tot 'n verdere verfyning van die navorsingsvraag gelei. Daar is drie vername insetwyses:

- menslike hulpbronne
- fisiese hulpbronne
- die samelewingsrol van die kunste

Die analise van die data wat van die opvoeders verkry is, het aangedui dat alle opvoeders oor die een of ander kwalifikasie beskik, maar dat daar 'n gebrek is aan spesialisasie in Musiek. Dié opvoeders wat oor 'n kunskwalifikasie beskik, het daarop gesinspeel dat hulle 'n natuurlike partydigheid het vir die kunstevorm waarin hulle hul opleiding ontvang het. Statistiese analise het getoon dat die tipe skool ook die implementeringsvlak, die begroting en die toeganklikheid tot Musiekhulpbronne beïnvloed.

Die navorsing het aangedui dat in Suid-Afrika die respons van die leerders op die leerarea Kuns en Kultuur verband hou met die graad van die leerder, die ras van die leerder en of die leerder die waarde insien daarvan om meer oor Musiek te leer. Alhoewel skoolhoofde die leerarea as 'n integrale deel van onderwys beskou, het hulle tog geregverdigde besorgdheid oor die leerarea.

Voorstelle word aan die hand gedoen op grond van die identifisering en kwantifisering van veranderlikes wat 'n invloed uitoefen op die lewering van Musiek in die leerarea Kuns en Kultuur in Suid-Afrika.

**empiriese studie  
internasionale sienings  
menslike hulpbronne  
samelewingsrol van die kunste  
onderwysstelsel  
prosesse**

**opvoedkundige hervorming  
'n Afrika-perspektief  
fisiese hulpbronne  
kwantitatiewe metodes  
insette  
uitsette**

## Acknowledgements

I wish to express my sincere gratitude to:

- God, my saviour and divine leader for creating an opportunity for me to fulfil a dream;
- Coral, my wife, who has been just as much a part of this research as I, her unfailing tolerance of sacrifice strengthened my yearning for success;
- Joy Klopper and the late Eldridge Klopper, my parents, for believing in their son with such pride;
- Family and friends for continued support, encouragement and patience;
- Dr Hetta Potgieter for her meticulous attention to detail, sense of humour, sound academic guidance and friendship;
- Prof. Dr Johannes Cronje for his insight and drive;
- Dr Edwin Hees for language editing expertise;
- Dr Mike van der Linde and Grettal Crafford for their 'magic' with numbers.

***History has proven that people are successful not because of brilliance, but because of persistence and desire (Maxwell 2001:52)***

## Contents

Summary	<i>i</i>
Samevatting	<i>iii</i>
Acknowledgements	<i>v</i>
Contents	<i>vi</i>
List of annexure	<i>x</i>
List of tables	<i>xi</i>
List of figures	<i>xii</i>
Acronyms and abbreviations	<i>xiv</i>
<b>1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b>
1.1	Rationale of the research 1-1
1.2	Defining core concepts and terminology 1-3
1.3	Background to the research 1-8
1.3.1	Overview of the learning area Arts and Culture 1-9
1.3.2	Origin of the research 1-10
1.4	Outlining the research question 1-11
1.4.1	Research problem 1-11
1.4.2	Research question 1-12
1.5	Aim of the research 1-13
1.6	Research design and methodology 1-14
1.7	Geographical demarcation of the research 1-17
1.8	Limitations and strengths of the research 1-18
1.9	Organisation of thesis 1-18
<b>2</b>	<b>A LITERATURE REVIEW OF MUSIC IN THE LEARNING AREA ARTS AND CULTURE</b>
2.1	Introduction 2-1
2.2	Historical background 2-2
2.2.1	The governance of education prior to 1994 2-2
2.2.2	The position under democratic governance 2-3
2.3	Government policies 2-4
2.4	Curriculum 2005 and school governance 2-9
2.5	Arts and Culture 2-12

<b>2.5.1</b>	<b>International viewpoints</b>	<b>2-15</b>
<b>2.5.1.1</b>	<b>Australia</b>	<b>2-18</b>
<b>2.5.1.2</b>	<b>Botswana</b>	<b>2-19</b>
<b>2.5.1.3</b>	<b>Canada</b>	<b>2-20</b>
<b>2.5.1.4</b>	<b>Malawi</b>	<b>2-21</b>
<b>2.5.1.5</b>	<b>Namibia</b>	<b>2-22</b>
<b>2.5.1.6</b>	<b>New Zealand</b>	<b>2-22</b>
<b>2.5.1.7</b>	<b>United Kingdom</b>	<b>2-23</b>
<b>2.5.1.8</b>	<b>United States of America</b>	<b>2-25</b>
<b>2.5.1.9</b>	<b>Analysis of findings</b>	<b>2-26</b>
<b>2.5.2</b>	<b>African perspective</b>	<b>2-27</b>
<b>2.6</b>	<b>Music in the learning area Arts and Culture</b>	<b>2-29</b>
<b>2.7</b>	<b>Identifying variables impacting on curriculum delivery</b>	<b>2-33</b>
<b>2.8</b>	<b>Conceptual framework of this research</b>	<b>2-39</b>
<b>2.9</b>	<b>Summary</b>	<b>2-44</b>

### **3 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY**

<b>3.1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>3-1</b>
<b>3.2</b>	<b>Principles of research design and methodology</b>	<b>3-1</b>
<b>3.3</b>	<b>Defining the research question</b>	<b>3-4</b>
<b>3.3.1</b>	<b>Paradigm</b>	<b>3-4</b>
<b>3.3.2</b>	<b>Purpose</b>	<b>3-5</b>
<b>3.3.3</b>	<b>Techniques</b>	<b>3-6</b>
<b>3.3.4</b>	<b>Context</b>	<b>3-6</b>
<b>3.4</b>	<b>Data collection plan</b>	<b>3-7</b>
<b>3.5</b>	<b>Issues of measurement (validity and reliability)</b>	<b>3-8</b>
<b>3.6</b>	<b>Sample design and sampling methods</b>	<b>3-9</b>
<b>3.7</b>	<b>Data collection methods and fieldwork practice</b>	<b>3-11</b>
<b>3.8</b>	<b>Data capturing and data editing</b>	<b>3-13</b>
<b>3.9</b>	<b>Data analysis</b>	<b>3-14</b>
<b>3.10</b>	<b>Shortcomings and sources of error</b>	<b>3-14</b>
<b>3.11</b>	<b>Summary</b>	<b>3-15</b>



## **4 PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION OF PILOT SURVEYS AND STUDIES**

<b>4.1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>4-1</b>
<b>4.2</b>	<b>Presentation and discussion of pilot surveys and studies</b>	<b>4-1</b>
<b>4.2.1</b>	<b>Stage One: Johannesburg North</b>	<b>4-2</b>
<b>4.2.1.1</b>	<b>Formal training in one or more of the art disciplines</b>	<b>4-2</b>
<b>4.2.1.2</b>	<b>Rating of level of implementation</b>	<b>4-3</b>
<b>4.2.1.3</b>	<b>Correlation between level of implementation and formal training and budget allocation</b>	<b>4-4</b>
<b>4.2.1.4</b>	<b>Response to suggested recommendations</b>	<b>4-4</b>
<b>4.2.1.5</b>	<b>Focus learning or selected learning</b>	<b>4-5</b>
<b>4.2.2</b>	<b>Stage Two: Music Action Team (MAT) Cells in Africa</b>	<b>4-5</b>
<b>4.2.2.1</b>	<b>Description of a MAT cell</b>	<b>4-6</b>
<b>4.2.2.2</b>	<b>Findings of MAT cells</b>	<b>4-8</b>
<b>4.2.3</b>	<b>Stage Three: Tshwane South</b>	<b>4-8</b>
<b>4.2.3.1</b>	<b>Formal training in one or more of the art disciplines</b>	<b>4-8</b>
<b>4.2.3.2</b>	<b>Rating of level of implementation</b>	<b>4-9</b>
<b>4.2.3.3</b>	<b>Correlation between level of implementation and formal training and budget allocation</b>	<b>4-10</b>
<b>4.2.3.4</b>	<b>Focus learning or selected learning</b>	<b>4-10</b>
<b>4.3</b>	<b>Discussion of results</b>	<b>4-10</b>
<b>4.4</b>	<b>Survey refinement</b>	<b>4-11</b>
<b>4.5</b>	<b>Summary</b>	<b>4-12</b>

## **5 PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS OF EMPIRICAL DATA**

<b>5.1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>5-1</b>
<b>5.2</b>	<b>Sample profile</b>	<b>5-3</b>
<b>5.2.1</b>	<b>Educators</b>	<b>5-4</b>
<b>5.2.2</b>	<b>Principals</b>	<b>5-5</b>
<b>5.2.3</b>	<b>Learners</b>	<b>5-6</b>
<b>5.3</b>	<b>Analysis of empirical data</b>	<b>5-8</b>
<b>5.3.1</b>	<b>Presentation of descriptive analysis</b>	<b>5-8</b>
<b>5.3.1.1</b>	<b>Research sub-question (a)</b>	<b>5-8</b>
<b>5.3.1.2</b>	<b>Summary of research sub-question (a)</b>	<b>5-16</b>

5.3.1.3	Research sub-question (b)	5-17
5.3.1.4	Summary of research sub-question (b)	5-21
5.3.1.5	Research sub-question (c)	5-21
5.3.1.6	Summary of research sub-question (c)	5-27
5.3.2	Presentation of statistical inferences	5-27
5.3.3	Summary of results	5-43
5.3.4	Concluding remarks	5-46

## **6 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

6.1	Summary of salient points	6-1
6.2	Interpretation of results	6-4
6.2.1	Main research question	6-5
6.2.2	Research sub-question (a)	6-7
6.2.3	Research sub-question (b)	6-8
6.2.4	Research sub-question (c)	6-9
6.3	Limitations	6-10
6.4	Recommendations	6-11
6.4.1	Research sub-question (a)	6-11
6.4.2	Research sub-question (b)	6-14
6.4.3	Research sub-question (c)	6-15
6.5	Conclusion	6-16
	<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>Bib-1</b>

## List of annexure

<b>Annexure A</b>	<b>Research analysis</b>	<b>Annex-1</b>
<b>Annexure B</b>	<b>Pre-Pilot Questionnaire</b>	<b>Annex-3</b>
<b>Annexure C</b>	<b>MAT Cell Guidelines</b>	<b>Annex-4</b>
<b>Annexure D</b>	<b>Consent letter of PASMAE participants</b>	<b>Annex-8</b>
<b>Annexure E</b>	<b>Pilot Questionnaire</b>	<b>Annex-9</b>
<b>Annexure F</b>	<b>Research Consent Form</b>	<b>Annex-11</b>
<b>Annexure G</b>	<b>Educator Informed Consent Letter</b>	<b>Annex-13</b>
<b>Annexure H</b>	<b>Educator Questionnaire</b>	<b>Annex-14</b>
<b>Annexure I</b>	<b>Principal Informed Consent Letter</b>	<b>Annex-21</b>
<b>Annexure J</b>	<b>Principal Interview Format</b>	<b>Annex-22</b>
<b>Annexure K</b>	<b>Learner Informed Consent Letter</b>	<b>Annex-25</b>
<b>Annexure L</b>	<b>Learner Questionnaire</b>	<b>Annex-26</b>
<b>Annexure M</b>	<b>Possible relationships existing between data</b>	<b>Annex-28</b>

## List of tables

Table 1	Origin of the research	1-10
Table 2	Tabulation of addressing research questions by aims	1-14
Table 3	Tabulation of addressing research questions by method employed	1-16
Table 4	Provincial per learner budgets (in rands) for personnel and non-personnel items 2000/01 (amounts expressed as a percentage of the national average)	2-4
Table 5	Three approaches to outcomes-based education	2-10
Table 6	Specific outcomes and assessment criteria	2-30
Table 7	Summary of categorised percentages of prior research	2-34
Table 8	Identified variables categorised into components of a system	2-38
Table 9	Positivist paradigm	2-40
Table 10	Four paradigms for the analysis of social theory (Burrell and Morgan 1979:22)	2-41
Table 11	Data collection plan	3-7
Table 12	Issues of measurement (validity and reliability) for this research	3-9
Table 13	Advantages and disadvantages of using personal interviews (adapted from Van Vuuren and Maree 2002:281-284)	3-11
Table 14	Advantages and disadvantages of using mail questionnaires (adapted from Van Vuuren and Maree 2002:281-284)	3-12
Table 15	Four ways of administering questionnaires (Bourque and Fielder 1995:8)	3-12
Table 16	Waves of induction of MAT cells in Africa	4-7
Table 17	Learners' response to strands in the learning area Arts and Culture	5-22

## List of figures

Figure 1	Core concepts and terminology	1-4
Figure 2	Hierarchical representation of the development of this research	1-15
Figure 3	Evolvement of this research	1-16
Figure 4	Geographical boundaries	1-17
Figure 5	Influences on music in this research	2-1
Figure 6	The structure of the learning area Arts and Culture	2-15
Figure 7	The Australian Arts Education Framework	2-18
Figure 8	The approach to Music in Botswana	2-19
Figure 9	The arts curriculum of Canada	2-20
Figure 10	The framework of the Music curriculum in Malawi	2-21
Figure 11	The Primary Arts Core of Namibia	2-22
Figure 12	The Arts in the New Zealand Curriculum	2-23
Figure 13	The programme of study Music of the United Kingdom	2-24
Figure 14	Arts Education of United States of America	2-25
Figure 15	Learning model for the arts	2-27
Figure 16	Variables outside the classroom impacting on OBE/C2005 implementation	2-36
Figure 17	Objects of a system	2-37
Figure 18	Delineation of variables addressed in this research	2-39
Figure 19	Research process in four stages (Durrheim 2002b:30)	3-1
Figure 20	Wheel of science (Bailey 1996:26)	3-2
Figure 21	A typology of research design types (Mouton 2001:57)	3-2
Figure 22	Graphical representation of this research design (adapted from Davidson 1970)	3-3
Figure 23	Four dimensions of design decisions (Durrheim 2002b:33)	3-4
Figure 24	Process for refining main survey instrument	3-15
Figure 25	Formal training in one or more of the art disciplines: Johannesburg North	4-2
Figure 26	Scale of implementation for Johannesburg North	4-3
Figure 27	Response to suggested recommendations	4-5
Figure 28	The MAT cell structure	4-6
Figure 29	Formal training in one or more of the art disciplines: Tshwane South	4-9
Figure 30	Viewpoint of the respondents: Tshwane South	4-9

<b>Figure 31</b>	<b>Delineation of variables addressed in this research</b>	<b>4-12</b>
<b>Figure 32</b>	<b>Main objectives contained in the questionnaires and interviews</b>	<b>5-2</b>
<b>Figure 33</b>	<b>Triangulation in this research</b>	<b>5-3</b>
<b>Figure 34</b>	<b>Strata of schools and racial demographics</b>	<b>5-5</b>
<b>Figure 35</b>	<b>Sample categories of schools in this research</b>	<b>5-6</b>
<b>Figure 36</b>	<b>Composition of learners and school strata</b>	<b>5-6</b>
<b>Figure 37</b>	<b>Learner-grade composition</b>	<b>5-7</b>
<b>Figure 38</b>	<b>Gender and race composition</b>	<b>5-7</b>
<b>Figure 39</b>	<b>Summary of research sub-question (a)</b>	<b>5-17</b>
<b>Figure 40</b>	<b>Summary of research sub-question (b)</b>	<b>5-21</b>
<b>Figure 41</b>	<b>Summary of research sub-question (c)</b>	<b>5-27</b>
<b>Figure 42</b>	<b>Summary of main findings</b>	<b>5-45</b>
<b>Figure 43</b>	<b>Summary of findings of dominant approaches to Music</b>	<b>6-3</b>
<b>Figure 44</b>	<b>Delineation of research question</b>	<b>6-4</b>
<b>Figure 45</b>	<b>Triangulation of input</b>	<b>6-4</b>

## Acronyms and abbreviations

<b>AC</b>	Arts and Culture
<b>ANC</b>	African National Congress
<b>ATKV</b>	Afrikaans Taal en Kultuur Vereniging
<b>Band</b>	There are three bands in the NQF: GET, FET and HET band
<b>CEDP</b>	Centre for Education Policy Development, Evaluation and Management
<b>C2005</b>	Curriculum 2005
<b>CASS</b>	Continuous Assessment
<b>CD</b>	Compact disc
<b>DoE</b>	Department of Education
<b>EMS</b>	Economics and Management Sciences
<b>FES</b>	First Education Specialist
<b>FET</b>	Further Education and Training
<b>FET</b>	Further Education and Training Certificate
<b>GDE</b>	Gauteng Department of Education
<b>GET</b>	General Education and Training
<b>GETC</b>	General Education and Training Certificate
<b>GIED</b>	Gauteng Institute for Education Development
<b>GICD</b>	Gauteng Development for Curriculum Development
<b>Grade 10-12</b>	School sector that is part of FET band
<b>Grade R</b>	Reception year
<b>HEI</b>	Higher Education Institute
<b>HET</b>	Higher Education and Training
<b>HSS</b>	Human and Social Sciences
<b>INSET</b>	In-Service Training
<b>Institution</b>	A direct service provider (college or school) in the education sector
<b>INTERSEN</b>	Intermediate and Senior Phase in GET
<b>IMC</b>	International Music Council
<b>ISME</b>	International Society of Music Education
<b>LA</b>	Learning Area
<b>Levels</b>	National Qualifications Framework levels that represent the degree of complexity of programmes according to the different bands
<b>LLC</b>	Language, literacy and communication
<b>LO</b>	Life Orientation

<b>LSM</b>	Learner Support Material
<b>NEPA</b>	National Education Policy Act
<b>NS</b>	Natural sciences
<b>NQF</b>	National Qualifications Framework, South Africa's basic system for classifying education qualifications
<b>MAGIC</b>	Magnitude, articulation, generability, interestingness and credibility
<b>MAT cells</b>	Music Action Team cells
<b>MMLMS</b>	Mathematics Literacy, Mathematics and Mathematical Sciences
<b>NATED 550</b>	National Education Syllabi 550
<b>OBE</b>	Outcomes-Based Education
<b>OBA</b>	Outcomes-Based Assessment
<b>PASMAE</b>	Pan African Society for Musical Arts Education
<b>PRESET</b>	Pre-Service Training
<b>RNCS</b>	Revised National Curriculum Statement
<b>SABC</b>	South African Broadcasting Corporation
<b>SAQA</b>	South African Qualifications Authority
<b>SASA</b>	South African Schools Act
<b>SGB</b>	School Governing Body
<b>SMT</b>	Senior Management Team
<b>SO</b>	Specific Outcome
<b>TECH</b>	Technology
<b>UNESCO</b>	United Nations Educationally Scientific Cultural Organisation