PASTORAL-THERAPEUTIC WORK WITH FAMILY MEMBERS INFECTED
AND AFFECTED BY HIV/AIDS: A NARRATIVE APPROACH

by

HECTOR LEON KLEIN

Submitted for the fulfilment of the requirements for the degree:

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

with specialization in the field

PASTORAL FAMILY THERAPY

in the

FACULTY OF THEOLOGY

DEPARTMENT OF PRACTICAL THEOLOGY

of the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

Course Director

PROF. DR. J. C. MÜLLER

November 2002
Many people have contributed to the completion of this study. I would like to extend to them my deepest gratitude and appreciation. Without their companionship I doubt whether this journey would ever been possible.

- I am indebted to the infected and affected individuals and families. This study could not have been embarked on without the generous, and at times painful, cooperation of the people whose stories are told in this dissertation. I am grateful to them for having allowed me to “invade” their privacy and for sharing their experiences.

- My course director, Prof Dr J Muller, who had an invaluable extension on my work and calling as therapist. He has lifted me to a higher level in terms of my relationship and understanding of others and myself.

- Dr. Wilhelm van Deventer, assistant course director, for his friendship, listening presence and wise insight on my personal journey into greater wholeness as therapist.
• Special recognition needs to be given to the scientific community, my PhD and SANPAD companions for having acted as a soundboard in this study.

• Special thanks are due to Mrs Heckroodt. Her partnership in this journey was invaluable to me.

• My father and late mother who were both uneducated, but who provided a home life that were accented with healthy attitudes for living. They have taught me the attitude to be a companion.

• My wife for support, encouragement, patience and for tirelessly typing the manuscript without fanfare or recognition. My baby daughter, Leigh Joy whose presence and always cheering face gave me enough energy to complete this study.

• The source of all Wisdom, our Lord Jesus Christ, for granting me the ability, courage and divine guidance to complete this study.
I dedicate this work to all those who are infected and/or affected by HIV/AIDS, of all ages, colours, cultures and beliefs. This study is also dedicated to all those (caregivers) who are committed to show unconditional and compassionate care to the infected and affected. My prayer is that this study may in a small way help caregivers to alleviate the suffering and pain of those infected and affected by HIV/AIDS and points them to the Lord of compassion.

*It is not the healthy who need a doctor, but the sick. Go and learn what this text means: I require mercy, not sacrifice. I have not come to call respectable people, but outcasts.* (Matthew 9:12-13)
SYNOPSIS

This research reports on narratives of people whose lives had been infected and affected by the devastating disease – HIV/AIDS. The core information, on which this study is based, comes from experiences of those infected and/or affected by HIV/AIDS as well as from caregivers. It sweeps away statistics and places those seeking to offer help in the midst of those seeking to be helped. This mutual subject-to-subject relationship becomes the stage on which research/therapy, interviews and conversations are conducted. This study therefore opts for an approach that is informed by the experiences of those infected and/or affected and that addresses the realities of their lives.

Care and/or lack of care is identified as a phenomenon, which is a direct reflection on how therapy (research) is done by those providing the care and perceived by those receiving the care. In the light of the experiences (stories) shared by the companions, it became evident that there is an existing need for alternative therapeutic ways, which seeks to embrace a therapeutic approach, which will minimize the external authority, or power of the therapist and at the same time maximizes the authority of those seeking therapy.

The Narrative approach is explored as a possible therapeutic approach that could be used to empower those infected and/or affected pastorally in a less-knowledgeable fashion that is not-controlling, not-manipulative, not-authoritative and not-knowing – as “guiding” metaphor which will permit the infected and/or affected to use their own thinking, understanding, emotions,
creativity and own resources in a way that best fits them in bringing meaning to their own lives.

The entire study seeks to emphasise the importance of a therapeutic approach, which seeks to symbolically embrace the “clouded” story of the infected and affected in a story of God’s hope. In this approach the therapist simply becomes aware of the presence of a person(s) for whom the devastating reality of HIV/AIDS is an every day reality. This research does not claim to have the solutions or quick fix miracle answer to the complex HIV/AIDS phenomenon, and it neither claims to have the power to bring any neat conclusion to the HIV/AIDS story, but rather have the potential to stimulate a new story of hope and purpose in the lives of the infected and affected. This research emphasises a position where the infected and affected can inhabit and lay claim to the many possibilities of their own lives that lie beyond the knowledge, assumptions, expectations, goals and understandings of the therapist. A position in which the therapist simply becomes available to talk, listen and support. A position that will empower those infected and affected to tell:

- the story of need as broadly as possible,
- the story of the past,
- the future story in the story of the past,
- the reinterpreted story of the past,
- the imagined story of the future. (Muller 1999:84)
OPSOMMING

In hierdie verhandeling word verslag gedoen oor die narratiewe van mense wie se lewens geinfekteer en/of geaffekteer word deur MIV/VIGS. Die kern informasie waarop hierdie studie gebaseer is, kom uit die ervaringswêrelde van die geinfekteer en/of geaffekteer sowel as van beraders. Hierdie navorsing doen weg met statistieke en plaas die terapeut in die midde van die wat berading soek. Die studie kies daarom, 'n benadering wat deur die ervaringswêrelde van die geinfekteerdes en/of geaffekteerdes toegelig word en wat die realiteite soos deur hulle ervaar word, aangespreek.

Sorg en/of gebrek aan sorg word geidentifiseer as 'n fenomenaal wat 'n direkte refleksie van hoe terapie (navorsing) gedoen word deur diegene wie die versorging doen, en soos ervaar deur diegene wie sorg ontvang. In die lig van die ervaringe (verhale) soos vertel deur die "vennote", word dit duidelik dat daar 'n behoefte bestaan vir alternatiewe terapeutiese maniere, wat 'n benadering beklemtoon waarin gepoog word om die eksterne outoriteit of mag van die terapeut te verminder en terselfdertyd die outoriteit en mag van diegene wat beraad word te vermeerder.

Die Narratiewe benadering word as 'n moontlike terapeutiese benadering gebruik waarin die geinfekteerde en/of geaffekteerde pastoraal begelei word in 'n nie-oorheersend, nie-manipulerend, nie-utoriteitêre, en nie-wetende manier. Hierdie posisie geld egter as 'n begeleidings metafoor waardeur die
geïnfekteerde en/of geaffekteerde toegelaat word om hul eie denke, verstaan, emosies, kreatiwiteit en bronne te gebruik op 'n manier wat hulle bes pas in die meebring van betekenis in hul eie lewens.

Die belangrikheid van 'n terapeutiese benadering wat simbolies die "verduisterde" verhaal, in 'n verhaal van God se hoop plaas, word beklemtoon. In hierdie benadering word die terapeut eenvoudig bewus van die teenwoordigheid van 'n persoon(e) vir wie die vernietigende realiteit van MIV/VIGS 'n daaglikse werklikheid is. Hierdie navorsing maak nie daarop aanspraak dat dit wonderwerkende oplossings of kits herstel antwoordie het vir die gekompliseerde MIV/VIGS probleem nie. Ook maak dit nie daarop aanspraak dat dit die mag het om enige netjies, afgeronde konklusies tot die MIV/VIGS verhaal te bring nie, maar wel die potensiaal het om 'n nuwe verhaal van hoop en doel in die lewens van die geaffekteerdes en/of geïnfekteerdes te stimuleer. Die navorsing beklemtoon 'n positie waar die "vennote" aanspraak maak op die verskeie moontlikhede wat verhewe bo die kennis, verwagtinge, doelwitte en begrip van die terapeut lê. 'n Posisie waar die terapeut hom/haar eenvoudig beskikbaar stel om in gesprek te tree, te luister, vrae te stel en te ondersteun. Die positie bemagtig die vennote om:

- die noodverhaal so breedvoerig as moontlik te vertel,
- die verledeverhaal te vertel,
- die toekomsverhaal in die verledeverhaal te vertel,
- die herinterpretseerde verledeverhaal te vertel, asook
- die verbeelde toekomsverhaal. (Muller 1999:84)
CHAPTER 1
RESEARCH ORIENTATION

1.1 Introduction 1

1.2 Positioning 6

1.2.1 The narrative-social constructionists paradigm 6

1.2.2 The scientific paradigm in narrative research 9

1.2.3 Positioning of study within narrative practical theology 11

1.2.4 Positioning of study within traditional scientific methods 19

1.3 Narrative paradigm in research methodology 21

1.3.1 Research action in narrative research 21

1.3.2 Story background in narrative research 30
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.3.3 Story development in narrative research</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.4 The climax in narrative research</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.5 Story ending in narrative research</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Research outline</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 The importance of self-reflection</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 The institutional and disseminational implication of the study</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 Practical execution</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 2

AN OVERVIEW OF THE RESEARCH ACTION

2.1 Introduction

2.2 Transcripts: Case examples and interviews
   2.2.1 Case study A: An interview with an infected
   2.2.2 Case study B: An interview with a pastor

2.3 A brief reflective account on the interviews

2.4 A review of Benners’ short-term strategic model

2.5 A narrative evaluation of the structured/strategic model

2.6 How is the narrative approach different?

2.7 In conclusion
CHAPTER 3

A MEDICAL, EMOTIONAL AND THEOLOGICAL ACCOUNT OF HIV/AIDS

3.1 Introduction 85

3.2 A basic medical account 86

3.2.1 The nature of the illness 88

3.3 An etiology of HIV/AIDS 92

3.3.1 Spread through sexual activity 93

3.3.2 Spread by contaminated needles 94

3.3.3 Spread by blood transfusion 94

3.3.4 Spread by prenatal causes 94

3.3.5 Spread by unidentified causes 95

3.4 Emotional reactions resulting from HIV/AIDS 96

3.4.1 Denial 97

3.4.2 Anger 99

3.4.3 Bargaining 101

3.4.4 Acceptance 101
3.5 A theological and pastoral response to HIV/AIDS

3.5.1 HIV/AIDS and our image of God

3.5.2 A New Testament perspective on HIV/AIDS

3.5.3 HIV/AIDS and the Church

3.6 Misconcepts about HIV/AIDS

3.7 In conclusion
CHAPTER 4

THE IMPACT OF HIV/AIDS ON THE FAMILY SYSTEM

4.1 Introduction 125

4.2 The family in crisis as a result of HIV/AIDS 128
4.2.1 The crisis 128
4.2.2 The experience of the crisis 129

4.3 A family response to the crisis 131
4.3.1 The “fight” response 132
4.3.2 The “flight” response 133

4.4 Stresses experienced by the family as a result of HIV/AIDS 135
4.4.1 Stress caused on the family by an HIV/AIDS diagnosis 136
4.4.2 Physical stress on the family system 138
4.4.3 The emotional stress on the family 141
4.4.4 Financial stress on the family 152
4.4.5 Stress caused by the social network 153

4.5 The impact of HIV/AIDS on individual family members 155
4.5.1 The person living with HIV/AIDS 156
4.5.2 The parents of infected children 158
4.5.3 The spouse of the infected

4.6 Bereavement in the family

4.7 In conclusion
CHAPTER 5

THE NARRATIVE PARADIGM IN PASTORAL FAMILY THERAPY

5.1 Introduction 168

5.2 A brief history of family therapy 169
5.2.1 A development from linear to circular thinking 169
5.2.2 First-order cybernetic model 173
5.2.3 Second-order cybernetic model 176
5.2.4 The Narrative approach in Family Therapy 180

5.3 A pastoral perspective in narrative therapy 185
5.3.1 Eco-systemic influence on the pastorate 186
5.3.2 Eco-hermeneutical pastorate 189

5.4 Narrative pastorate and the position of the pastor 194
5.4.1 Narrative pastorate 194
5.4.2 The position of the Narrative pastoral therapist 197

5.5 In conclusion 203
CHAPTER 6

ALTERNATIVE THERAPEUTIC WAYS IN WORKING WITH HIV/AIDS INFECTED AND AFFECTED

6.1 Introduction 207

6.2 The aim of therapy 208

6.3 Common dominant discourses in HIV/AIDS stories 211
  6.3.1 Some of the common discourses in society 213
  6.3.2 The effect of the dominant story on the infected and affected 215
  6.3.3 Deconstruction of the dominant story 218

6.4 Essential elements in doing therapy with the infected and affected 224
  6.4.1 The not-knowing position 226
  6.4.2 Responsive- active listening 231
  6.4.3 Therapeutic questioning 234
  6.4.4 Externalization as "method" of therapy with the infected and/or affected 238

6.5 In conclusion 253
CHAPTER 7

A CRITICAL REFLECTION ON THE STUDY

7.1 Introduction 255

7.2 A critical reflection on the research 258

7.3 Reflection on the researcher/therapist 266

7.4 A critical reflection on a theology of HIV/AIDS 273

7.5 Common problems encountered in the research 282
7.5.1 The "recruitment" process 282
7.5.2 Time constrains 283
7.5.3 Report back 284
7.5.4 A distorted image of narrative research/therapy 285

7.6 In conclusion 287

Bibliography 293