INFLATION IN SOUTH AFRICA: 1921 TO 2006. HISTORY, MEASUREMENT AND CREDIBILITY

Johannes Jacobus (Jannie) Rossouw MCom Econ (UP), MBA (UP)

Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for a PhD in the School of Development Studies,
University of KwaZulu-Natal, 2007

Date: 1 August 2007

Supervisor: Prof M (Vishnu) Padayachee

DECLARATION

This doctoral thesis represents original work by the author and has not been submitted in any other form to another university.

Where use has been made of the work of others, it has been duly acknowledged and referenced in the text.

The findings presented and conclusions arrived at in this doctoral thesis are entirely those of the author.

The research for this doctoral thesis was performed under the auspices of the School of Development Studies at the University of KwaZulu-Natal. Research was undertaken under the supervision of Professor Vishnu Padayachee during the period January 2006 to August 2007.

ABSTRACT

This study reports the development and use of an original methodology to measure inflation credibility, as well as the first results of such measurement in terms of an inflation credibility barometer. The barometer is an instrument measuring the degree of acceptance of the accuracy of historic inflation figures. Despite the lack of knowledge about inflation and the low inflation credibility recorded by this first calculation of an inflation credibility barometer for South Africa, valuable information about inflation is unveiled to the authorities. The research results serve as a benchmark, but cannot be compared to earlier research, as this study represents the first systematic measurement of inflation credibility in South Africa.

The barometer yields better results than the limited current international measurement of perceptions of the accuracy of historic inflation figures. The barometer (i) reports the credibility of inflation figures as a figure between zero and 100; (ii) will highlight changes in credibility over time with repeated use; (iii) can be explained easily to the general public; (iv) provides for international comparison between countries; and (v) can be used by all countries. The use of inflation credibility barometers and changes in barometer readings over time can also serve as an early warning system for changes in inflation perceptions that might feed through to inflation expectations.

Sampling results used to calculate a South African inflation credibility barometer show little public understanding of the rate of inflation. Owing to an increased focus on inflation figures in countries using an inflation-targeting monetary policy, central banks entrusted with such a policy should adopt a communication strategy highlighting the calculation and measurement of the rate of inflation. This study shows that no generally accepted international benchmarks for successful central-bank communication strategies have been developed, but the use of the methodology developed in this study will assist in the assessment of the effectiveness of communication strategies.

This study makes three further contributions of significance to available literature on inflation in South Africa. The first is an analysis of price increases and inflation over a period of 85 years

(1921 to 2006) and a selected comparison of salaries and remuneration over a period of 78 years (1929 to 2006). To this end data sets were developed for comparative purposes, thereby distinguishing between perception and reality about the accuracy of inflation figures over time. As this comparison has not been done before, a methodology was developed that can be used in future research. Based on these comparisons an inflation accuracy indicator (IAI) is developed for the first time. The research showed no systematic over or under-reporting of price increases, therefore confirming the general accuracy of the consumer price index (CPI) over time. As with the inflation credibility barometer, this methodology can be used internationally to confirm the accuracy of countries' inflation figures over time. This methodology can also be used by developing countries with capacity constraints in economic modelling and forecasting.

The second contribution to available literature is the first analysis of South Africa's experience with inflation over a period of 85 years from the perspective of the central bank. This analysis highlights not only the difficulties encountered by a central bank to contain inflation, but also focuses the attention on the policy errors of the authorities in their quest to contain rising prices.

The third contribution is an analysis of international and domestic initiatives aimed at improving the accuracy and measurement of inflation. The implications of these initiatives for developing countries are considered in the interest of a level international playing field between developed and developing countries.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	Introduction	1
2.	Literature review	10
3.	Measurement of inflation	70
4.	Theoretical and conceptual framework: using anchors for monetary policy	97
5.	South Africa's experience with inflation: a central bank perspective	147
6.	South African price and salary changes measured against inflation since 1921	198
7.	Measuring inflation credibility	229
8.	Conclusions	283
9.	References	293
10.	Appendices	343

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1	South African economic indicators for selected years	55
Table 2.2	Comparison of measures to assess inflation perceptions	66
Table 3.1	Composition of the overall CPI in metropolitan and other urban areas:	
	selected weights, 2000	82
Table 3.2	Selected spending weights in metropolitan and other urban areas in	
	South Africa, 2000	83
Table 3.3	Main components of CPI and CPIX in metropolitan and other urban aeras,	
	1995 and 2000	87
Table 3.4	Average inflation rates in developed and selected emerging economies,	
	1949 – 1953 to 1980 – 1982	91
Table 3.5	Average inflation rates in developed and selected emerging economies,	
	1961 – 1970 to 1991 – 2000	92
Table 4.1	Possible outcomes of game theory between a central bank and private	
	economic agents	103
Table 4.2	Countries targeting inflation in 2006	127
Table 4.3	Inflation targets in 2006	128
Table 4.4	Average inflation rates of South Africa, 1961 – 1970 to 2001 – 2006	130
Table 4.5	Experience with containing inflation in selected inflation-targeting	
	and non-targeting countries over different periods	135
Table 5.1	Money supply growth targets, 1986 to 1989	180
Table 6.1	Historic prices adjusted in accordance with relevant changes in CPI,	
	1988 to 2006	208
Table 6.2	Historic annual salaries, projected salaries and actual salaries of a number of	\mathbf{f}
	identifiable positions, various periods	214
Table 6.3	Annual salaries and cost-to-employer remuneration of two civil	
	service positions, November 1984	216
Table 6.4	Annual top-notch salaries and cost-to-employer remuneration	
	of two civil service positions, July 2005	218

219
220
222
223
232
234
245
250
251
252
276
278

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 7.1	Perceptions on how well government is controlling inflation compared with				
	actual rate of South African inflation, 1995 to 2006	236			
E: 70	TOUR THE COMMENT OF T				
Figure 7.2	Inflation credibility: summary results of the surveys of the credibility of CPI				
	and CPIX, respectively	243			

LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX	X A				
Table A1 South African annual inflation rate measured as changes in CPI, 1921 to 2006					
APPENDIX	X B				
Table B1	South African CPI, 2000 = 100	344			
APPENDI	X C				
Table C1	South African CPI, 1922 = 100	345			
APPENDE	X D				
Table D1	Real interest rates, 1980 to 2006	346			
APPENDIX	X E				
Table E1	Overview of schools of thought in macroeconomics	347			
APPENDIX	X F				
Table F1	Issues in respect of the composition of CPI identified by OECD countries	348			
APPENDE	X G				
Table G1	Total annual spending of households in cash and in kind and composition of CPI, 2000	349			
APPENDI	хн				
Table H1	Weighted average retail prices in nine cities, 1921, adjusted in				
	accordance with change in CPI, 1921 to 2006, and for metrification	350			
APPENDI	X I				
Table I1	Historic prices adjusted in accordance with change in CPI, 1938 to 2006	351			

APPENDIX	X J					
Table J1	Table J1 Historic prices adjusted in accordance with relevant changes in CPI, relevant period to 2006					
APPENDIX	K K					
Table K1	Average prices at three stores in Pretoria, March 2004, adjusted with					
	changes in CPI to projected prices in 2006	353				
APPENDIX	X L					
Table L1	Comparison of projected prices of selected goods and services with					
	actual prices, June 2006	355				
APPENDIX	X M					
Table M1	Comparison of actual and projected prices of selected goods, 1974 to 2006	358				
Table M2	M2 Comparison of actual and projected prices of selected goods, 1984 to 2006 3					
Table M3	able M3 Comparison of actual and projected prices of selected goods, 1994 to 2006					
Table M4 Comparison of actual and projected prices of selected goods, 2004 to 2006						
APPENDIX	K N					
Table N1	Income tax on salaries and bonuses of married tax payers, 1985 tax year	365				
APPENDIX	K O					
Table O1	Income tax on salaries, bonuses and fringe benefits of individual tax payers,					
	2006 tax year	366				
APPENDIX	K P					
Questionnai	re to establish the credibility of published official inflation figures	367				

APPENDIX Q	
Additional questionnaire to establish the credibility of published official inflation	
figures used for inflation-targeting purposes	368
APPENDIX R	
Analysis of questionnaires to establish the credibility of published official inflation	
figures completed by MBA preparatory students	369
APPENDIX S	
Analysis of questionnaires to establish the credibility of published official inflation	
figures completed by EKN 213 students	370
APPENDIX T	
Analysis of questionnaires to establish the credibility of published official inflation	
figures completed by EKN 215 students	371
APPENDIX U	
Questionnaire to establish the credibility of published official inflation figures	372
APPENDIX V	
Questionnaire to establish the credibility of published official inflation figures	
used for inflation-targeting purposes	373
APPENDIX W	
Questionnaire	374
APPENDIX X	
Tax invoice: Markinor	375
APPENDIX Y	
Questionnaire	376

${f Z}$					
Table Z1 Responses about the accuracy of inflation figures according to gender and age in terms of Asians, Blacks, Coloureds and Whites					
$\mathbf{A}\mathbf{A}$					
Table AA1 Responses about the accuracy of inflation figures according to employment and education					
ВВ					
Table BB1 Responses about the accuracy of inflation figures according to monthly household income					
CC					
Responses about the accuracy of inflation figures according to province	380				
DD					
Responses about the accuracy of inflation figures according to community	381				
	Responses about the accuracy of inflation figures according to gender and age in terms of Asians, Blacks, Coloureds and Whites AA Responses about the accuracy of inflation figures according to employment and education BB Responses about the accuracy of inflation figures according to monthly household income CC Responses about the accuracy of inflation figures according to province				

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

В

Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System Fed Bureau for Economic Research BER Bureau of Market Research BMR Bureau of Labor Statistics BLS C Central Statistical Service CSS Committee of Central Bank Governors **CCBG** Common Monetary Area CMA Consumer price index CPI CPI excluding changes in interest costs **CPIXX** CPI for metropolitan and other urban areas excluding changes in the interest costs of mortgage bonds **CPIX** D Demand for money/nominal demand for money balances Md Democratic Republic of the Congo DRC Е European Central Bank **ECB European Commission** EC European Monetary System **EMS** Exchange rate mechanism **ERM**

F

Federal Economic Statistics Advisory Commit Federal Open Market Committee First Order Conditions	ttee	FESAC FOMC FOC
	G	
Gross domestic product		GDP
	Н	
Harmonised index of consumer prices		HICP
Household		HH
	I	
Income		Y
Indice Nacional de Precios al Consumidor		INPC
Inflation accuracy indicator		IAI
International Bank for Reconstruction and Dev	velopment	World Bank
Institute for Security Studies		ISS
International Monetary Fund		IMF
	L	
Less developed countries		LDCs
	M	
Marginal benefit		MB
Marginal cost		MC
Monetary Policy Committee		MPC
Money supply		M
Master of Business Administration		MBA

N

National Finance Corporation		NFC
New neoclassical synthesis	NNS	
Non-accelerating inflation rate of unemployme	ent	NAIRU
	O	
Organisation for Economic Co-operation and I	Development	OECD
Organisation for European Economic Co-opera	ation	OEEC
Output		y
Owner-occupied housing		ООН
	P	
Penny		d
Policy Target Agreement		PTA
Prices		P
Production price index		PPI
	Q	
Quantity		Q
	S	
Southern African Development Community		SADC
Standard error		SE
Statistical Office of the European Communitie	S	Eurostat
	T	
The Commision of inquiry into the monetary s	ystem and	
monetary policy in South Africa		De Kock Commission

xvi

U

University of Stellenbosch US
United Kingdom UK

United States of America United States

Unidad de Fomento UF

V

Velocity of circulation of money V

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to use this opportunity to thank many people and institutions for supporting this study. Although too many to mention all by name, I wish to highlight in particular the following:

- Prof M (Vishnu) Padayachee for the confidence he has put in me, and for his supervision of this study;
- Prof J A Lombard, retired Head of the Economics Department at the University of Pretoria and retired Senior Deputy Governor of the SA Reserve Bank, who introduced me to the study of economics:
- the invaluable assistance of Proff J H Martins and A A Lightelm, and of Ms M E Maritz of the Bureau of Market Research of the University of South Africa, which is gratefully acknowledged;
- the Chairperson of the Ethics Committee of the Faculty of Economic and Management Sciences at the University of Pretoria, Prof R van Eyden, for permission to do research among students at that university;
- the Dean of Student Affairs at the University of Pretoria, Prof M T Speckman, for permission to do research among students at that university;
- the management and staff of Markinor;
- the Cillie family for the expenditure records of Dr G G Cillie;
- Proff P Engelbrecht and T de Coning and Ms G Arangies, all of the University of Stellenbosch, for information about the remuneration of professors at the University;
- Dr W Botha of the Stella Street Dutch Reformed Church in Pretoria for information about the remuneration of reverends;
- Mr H Pringle of the National Treasury for information about remuneration structures in the civil service;
- Mr G van de Wall, a retired Director-General, for valuable discussions on the remuneration structure of the civil service;
- Prof J F Potgieter, retired Director of the Institute for Planning Research at the University of Port Elizabeth (as it was known at the time);
- Ms I Gaspar of the SA Reserve Bank for translation assistance;

xviii

- Mr H H van Gass of the SA Reserve Bank for translation and other assistance;
- Library staff of the SA Reserve Bank;
- Dr E J van der Merwe, a retired Chief Economist of the SA Reserve Bank, for commenting on various aspects of this study;
- Ms A Mostert of the SA Reserve Bank for linguistic services;
- the SA Reserve Bank for financial and other assistance with this study; and
- my long-suffering family: Sunélle, my wife, and my son Malherbe and my daughter Carina, who have both grown considerably in the months that I have spent completing this study.

•	1 •	\mathbf{r}			1	•
Sol	11	,,	nn	1 +1	\sim	ria
11111		1	C()		~ /	ıuu.

Jannie Rossouw

Pretoria