An evaluation of the integration of indigenous musical arts in the Creative and Performing Arts syllabus and the implementation thereof in the primary schools curriculum in Botswana

by

Mothusi Phuthego

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the degree requirements for

Doctor of Music

in the

Department of Music
School of Arts
Faculty of Humanities
University of Pretoria

Supervisor: Prof John Hinch

Pretoria

December 2007
Abstract

The implementation of the Creative and Performing Arts (CPA) syllabus at lower primary school level in Botswana has been carried out without paying due regard to all that should be in place. As a result, the implementation exercise has been hampered by some administrative and logistical problems. The content for Creative and Performing Arts as a curriculum subject draws from Western culture, primarily due to the proliferation of literary sources for such content. It has therefore been a matter of urgent concern to establish the extent to which local culture, in the form of indigenous musical arts, have been integrated into the syllabus.

The methods employed in this study are qualitative. They include data collection by means of semi-structured interviews in focus group discussions, and content analysis of the syllabus document.

The results of this research suggest that the indigenous musical arts in the Creative and Performing Arts syllabus content are generally representative of the culture of the Batswana. But the indigenous musical arts content in the Creative and Performing Arts syllabus could be representative of the indigenous culture of the Batswana to a much greater extent, especially as it allows for the use of local resources and contains objectives that explicitly refer to the inclusion of the musical culture of a local community. Current limitations are mainly caused by the teachers' shortcomings in terms of appropriate teaching approaches and their vague understanding of the main concept that they should master, namely ‘integration’. The results of the study further indicate
that teachers cover most of the indigenous musical arts in their lessons. The results also indicate that teachers are usually able to relate music with physical education, but are unable to integrate content as much as it is practicable due to lack of knowledge and skill on their part.

On syllabus implementation, the results reveal that school administrators feel that they have not been duly recognized as key players in the implementation exercise. They suggest that specialization in the teaching of the various components of the Creative and Performing Arts be encouraged. They also suggest a review of the syllabus that would allow primary school teachers more input.

As far as the teachers are concerned, the results reveal that, the implementation workshops they have attended have not been adequate in equipping them with the necessary skills to teach the subject. They, like the school heads, suggest specialization by teachers. They also suggest the following: a review of the syllabus and teaching and learning materials; provision of in-service training; close monitoring by the implementing authority, and the provision of resources.

The conclusion reached is that the syllabus allows the teacher the freedom to draw as much as possible from the community, thus making learning more relevant to the learner. With regard to syllabus implementation, the implementation exercise is hampered by the absence of appropriate resources and facilities as well as the necessary support in the form of needs-oriented in-service training. Owing to lack of resources and in-
service training that addresses specific needs, the teachers are not very effective in syllabus delivery.
Acknowledgements

My sincere gratitude goes out to the following:

Prof John Hinch
For his robust and scholarly supervision of my research.

Rene Ehlers and Jacqui Sommerveld
Very helpful members of the Statistics Department, who patiently worked with me from the proposal stage of my research, through the pilot phase and ultimately through the research proper.

The Music Department Research Committee
For the comments that helped sharpen the focus of my research in its proposal stage.

The Staff of the Department of Music Library
For the friendly service. They would go to the extent of helping me find a book on the shelves.

The School Heads and Teachers
Those that I interviewed. Their responses have constituted the core of my research data. Without their participation my research would not have materialized.

The University of Botswana
For the generous sponsorship.

The Government of Botswana
For the support I received through the Ministry of Education.

My Family
For the encouragement and support.
**List of abbreviations**

The following abbreviations are used in this thesis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BEd</td>
<td>Bachelor of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOTA</td>
<td>Botswana Training Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCE</td>
<td>Centre for Continuing Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDE</td>
<td>Curriculum Development and Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPA</td>
<td>Creative and Performing Arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D&amp;T</td>
<td>Design and Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCD&amp;E</td>
<td>Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCE</td>
<td>Francistown College of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HE</td>
<td>Home Economics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCE</td>
<td>Lobatse College of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCE</td>
<td>National Commission on Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PE</td>
<td>Physical Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSLE</td>
<td>Primary School Leaving Examinations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RNCE</td>
<td>Report of the National Commission on Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RNPE</td>
<td>Revised National Policy on Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADC</td>
<td>Southern African Development Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAQA</td>
<td>South African Qualifications Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCE</td>
<td>Serowe College of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TCE (Tlokweng)</td>
<td>Tlokweng College of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTC</td>
<td>Teacher Training College</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UB</td>
<td>University of Botswana</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Key terms

arts education
Botswana
ccontent analysis
creative and performing arts
curriculum
evaluation
focus group
indigenous musical arts
lower primary
music
performance
syllabus
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER 1 .......................................................... 1  
**BACKGROUND** ...................................................... 1  
1.1 Motivation to carry out the research .................. 2  
1.2 Music teacher training .................................. 4  
1.3 Music in schools ........................................... 6  
1.4 Primary education in Botswana .......................... 8  
1.5 The Creative and Performing Arts (CPA) syllabus 10  
1.6 The Batswana as a nation ................................. 12  
1.6.1 Ethnic composition .................................. 12  
1.6.2 The indigenous culture of the Batswana .......... 14  
1.7 Problem statement ....................................... 17  
1.8 Main research question ................................. 18  
1.9 Research objectives .................................... 19  
1.10 Significance of the study .............................. 20  
1.11 Limitation of the study ............................... 21  
1.12 Delimitation of the study ............................ 21  
1.13 Preview of Chapters ................................ 22  

## CHAPTER TWO ..................................................... 24  
**AN INTERROGATION OF CURRICULUM EVALUATION AND IMPLEMENTATION THROUGH LITERATURE REVIEW** ........ 24  
2.1 Introduction ................................................. 24  
2.2 The arts in education ................................... 25  
2.2.1 Definition of arts education ................... 25  
2.2.2 The benefits of arts education ............... 27  
2.3 The indigenous musical arts .................................. 32  
2.3.1 Definition of 'musical arts' ....................... 32  
2.3.3 Methods of teaching and learning indigenous musical arts .......................................................... 34  
2.3.4 The value of indigenous musical arts education 37  
2.4 The music curriculum ................................... 38  
2.4.1 Definition of ‘curriculum’ ......................... 39  
2.4.2 The structure of a music curriculum .............. 41  
2.4.2.1 The objectives-based model .................. 42  
2.4.2.2 The standards-based model .................. 43  
2.4.2.3 The eclectic model ......................... 47  
2.4.3 Content in a music curriculum .................... 50  
2.5 Arts-based Curricula and integration of content .... 51  
2.5.1 The Creative and Performing Arts syllabus .... 55  
2.6 Curriculum evaluation ................................... 57  
2.6.1 Formative and Summative evaluation ............. 59  
2.6.2 Syllabus evaluation ................................ 62  
2.6.3 Evaluation design .................................. 64
2.6.4 Procedures and methods of curriculum evaluation 64
2.6.5 Models of evaluation and approaches to evaluation 67
2.7 Focus on the various evaluation approaches .......... 68
  2.7.1 The objectives-oriented approaches ................. 68
  2.7.2 Management-oriented approaches .................... 69
    2.7.2.1 The CIPP evaluation model .................... 70
    2.7.2.3 The UCLA evaluation model .................... 71
  2.7.3 Consumer-oriented approaches ....................... 71
  2.7.4 Expertise-oriented approaches ....................... 72
  2.7.5 Adversary-oriented approaches ....................... 73
  2.7.6 Participant-oriented approaches ..................... 74
2.8 Evaluation of curriculum implementation ............. 76
2.9 An overview of educational evaluation and programme implementation in Botswana ......................... 84
2.10 Conclusion ............................................. 88
  2.10.1 The case for the arts ............................. 88
  2.10.2 The music curriculum .............................. 90
  2.10.3 Methods of curriculum evaluation and models of evaluation ............................................. 90
  2.10.4 Evaluation of syllabus implementation ............ 91

CHAPTER THREE ............................................ 92
RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY ...................... 92
  3.1 Research design .................................... 92
  3.2 Methodology .................................. 93
  3.3 Data collection instruments .......................... 94
    3.3.1 Interview ...................................... 95
      3.3.1.1 Sample size and sampling procedures ....... 96
    3.3.2 Document analysis ................................ 99
      3.3.2.1 Procedure for carrying out content analysis 101
    3.3.3 Historical data .................................. 102
  3.4 Data analysis .................................. 103
    3.4.1 Qualitative data analysis ......................... 103
  3.5 Pilot study .................................. 104

CHAPTER FOUR ............................................. 106
THE PILOT STUDY ........................................ 106
  4.1 Purpose of the pilot study .......................... 106
  4.2 The pilot sample .................................. 106
  4.3 Access into the schools and ethical issues .......... 107
  4.4 The recording equipment ............................ 109
  4.5 School grouping system and its implications on the methodology ............................................. 110
  4.6 Instrument validity and reliability .................. 113
  4.7 Data capture .................................. 114
4.8 Results of the pilot study ........................................... 114
4.9 Conclusion .................................................................. 118

CHAPTER FIVE .................................................................. 120
ANALYSIS OF DATA, RESULTS AND DISCUSSION ........... 120
5.1 Introduction ................................................................. 120
5.2 Access into the schools and ethical issues ................... 120
5.3 Sources of data ............................................................ 122
5.4 Part 1 ............................................................................. 122
5.4.1 Organisation of lower primary (standard 1-4)
Creative and Performing Arts syllabus (refer to Appendix I) 122
5.4.2 Content analysis of lower primary (standard 1-4)
Creative and Performing Arts syllabus (see Appendix I) 123
5.4.2.1 Categories of analysis ........................................... 124
5.4.3 Discussion of results .................................................. 127
5.4.3.1 Music ................................................................. 128
5.4.3.2 Singing ............................................................... 129
5.4.3.3 Dance ................................................................. 131
5.4.3.4 Movement in music ............................................ 133
5.4.3.5 Drama ............................................................... 134
5.4.3.6 Clapping ............................................................ 135
5.4.3.7 Musical Instruments .......................................... 137
5.4.3.8 Poetry ............................................................... 138
5.4.3.9 Costume art ......................................................... 138
5.4.4 Representation of indigenous musical arts in the
Creative and Performing Arts syllabus ......................... 140
5.5 Part 2 ............................................................................. 142
5.5.1 Data on the implementation of the lower primary
(standard 1-4) Creative and Performing Arts syllabus .. 142
5.5.2 Analysis of data ........................................................ 143
5.5.3 Presentation of results ............................................... 143
5.5.4 Discussion of results .................................................. 166
5.5.4.1 On participants’ personal career ......................... 167
5.5.4.2 On indigenous musical arts and integration
of content ........................................................................ 168
5.5.4.3 On syllabus implementation .............................. 172
5.5.4.4 Impressions and views of teachers .................... 177
5.5.4.5 Answers to the research questions ..................... 184

CHAPTER SIX ................................................................. 189
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS ...................... 189
6.1 Conclusion ................................................................. 189
6.1.1 On syllabus implementation by school heads .... 189
6.1.2 On syllabus implementation by teachers .......... 190
6.1.3 On indigenous musical arts and integration of
content ............................................................................ 192
6.2 Recommendations .................................................197
6.2.1 Syllabus review ................................................198
6.2.2 Subject panels ..................................................198
6.2.3 Procurement of books and equipment ...............198
6.2.4 Programme monitoring ....................................199
6.2.5 Minimum equipment list ..................................200
6.2.6 In-service training ............................................200
6.2.7 Utilization of local human resource and community participation .................................................201
6.2.8 Further research .................................................201
REFERENCES ................................................................203

APPENDICES:

A  Questionnaire to teachers
B  Questionnaire to teachers - draft 2
C  Map of Botswana
D  Request for permission to conduct research
E  Letter granting permission
F  Photocopy of original letter granting permission
G  School action plan
H  Research statistics
I  Lower Primary School Syllabus