A STUDY OF INCLUSIVE EDUCATION AND ITS EFFECTS ON THE
TEACHING OF BIOLOGY TO VISUALLY IMPAIRED LEARNERS

By

M.O. Maguvhe

BA.Ed (Education) B.Ed (Bachelor of Education) DSE (Diploma in
Special Education – *cum laude*) M.Ed (Visually impaired – *cum laude*)

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Philosophiae Doctor

with specialisation in Curriculum and
Instructional Design and Development

in the

Department of Curriculum Studies
Faculty of Education
University of Pretoria

April 2005-04-13  Supervisor:  Prof. W.J. Fraser
Co-supervisor:  Dr H Schoeman
DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis, which I hereby submit for the degree Philosophiae Doctor at the University of Pretoria, is my own work and has not previously been submitted by me for a degree at any other institution.

..................................................

M.O. Maguvhe
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

To someone who is blind, conducting research of this magnitude is a gruelling exercise characterised by frustration, challenges and huge demands. This achievement could have not been possible if people listed below did not stand by me through thick and thin. They are: L.S. Nengovhela, M.N. Diale, K.A. Madima, M.J. Mushiani, M.F. Nemathithi, N.C. Maguvhe P. Mtsweni and T.C. Ramasala.

I dedicate this work to you. Please accept my sincerest gratitude coming from the bottom of my heart. Your support, inspiration, dedication and determination were the pillar of my strength and you always offered me a strong shoulder to lean on in times of tribulation. Your eyes enabled me to access print material. Your unreserved effort and commitment to help me in many ways yielded this informative document, which would add value to the poor base and limited scope of literature in the field of the teaching and learning mediation of life sciences by blind and visually impaired learners in South Africa.

Although barriers such as ignorance, fear and stereotypes have led and are still leading to blind and visually impaired learners to be unfairly discriminated against in the teaching and learning mediation of life sciences, all of us can take pride in our efforts and endeavours to redress those imbalances so that the blind and visually impaired learners can benefit from life sciences subjects.

To Dr. Henoch Schoeman my colleague at the South African National Council for the Blind and Professor Fraser’s co-supervisor I cherish your guidance and valuable inputs you made for the success of this study. Professor W.J. Fraser, thank you for believing in my abilities and treating me like any other student. I once more thank you for your constructive criticisms that were passed in good faith; hence the quality work. Of all the things, I will dearly miss your wisdom, honesty, love and kindness.

It is said: behind every successful man there is a woman. I revere my wife Flora Tintswalo Rikhotso for the support she gave me under difficult circumstances. To her and my children Nsuku, Vhulenda and Andani I apologise for stealing your
precious time, which I was supposed to spend with you as a caring father and loving husband. I devoted that time to this work and it was for a good course.

Finally, God has been good to me. He is worthy to be praised. He gave me friends that were both reliable and patient, supervisors that were understanding and supportive. Above all, he gave me power, strength, dedication, determination and good health; hence this achievement.
ABSTRACT

A study of inclusive education and its effects on the teaching of biology to visually impaired learners

By

M.O. Maguvhe

Supervisor: Prof. W.J. Fraser
Co-supervisor: Dr H Schoeman
Department: Curriculum Studies
Degree: PhD (Curriculum and Instructional Design and Development)

AIM AND OBJECTIVES

The investigation aimed to determine how the learning of the life sciences is facilitated (mediated) in special schools for blind learners and to establish how the lessons learnt from this experience could be implemented to the advantage of blind learners in the Senior Phase and Further Education and Training Band in inclusive Outcomes-based education settings.

METHODOLOGY

Educators and blind learners were interviewed through the use of the Qualitative Inquiry methodology as well as its techniques and strategies for data gathering. Analysis of the transcripts resulted in the development of themes/codes discussed in the research investigation.

RESULTS

Educators spent a good amount of time and effort with blind learners in the biology and life sciences classrooms. It appeared as if the pastoral role of the educator predominantly exceeded the teaching of biology and life sciences to these learners. Further, it became evident that the emphasis did not fall strongly...
enough on the achievement of the outcomes envisaged with the biology curriculum but more on the establishment of a caring and supportive classroom environment.

CONCLUSIONS

Biology and other life sciences subjects have much potential for the blind learners in South Africa but they are not offered at some of the schools or efficiently mediated due to educators’ reluctance, lack of knowledge and resources. Learning mediation strategies to make biology and life sciences more accessible to blind learners could be explored.
KEY WORDS

Teaching and learning mediation of science
Blind and visually impaired learners
Inclusive education
Outcomes-based education
Strategies for learning
The importance of life science to blind learners and the society in general
Science process skills
The development of subject system
Competences for discovery
Interaction / social / emotional environment
Guidelines for biology educators
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TITLE PAGE</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KEY WORDS</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDEX</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

# INDEX

# CHAPTER 1

**OUTLINE OF THE RESEARCH INVESTIGATION**

1.1 Introduction 1
1.2 Problem statement 1
1.3 Aim and objectives of the study 3
1.3.1 Aim of the study 3
1.3.2 Objectives of the study 3
1.4 Research questions 7
1.5 Research hypothesis 8
1.6 Target population 9
1.7 Methodology 9
1.8 Definition of terms/concepts 10
1.9 Outline of the research 18
1.10 Summary and conclusion 20
# CHAPTER 2

**HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES ON EDUCATION, INCLUSIVE EDUCATION AND OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>African Education</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Peoples Education</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>An overview of special education and reasons for embarking upon an inclusive education policy</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>A historical perspective on Outcomes-based Education and Training</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1</td>
<td>What is Outcomes-based Education and Training?</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2</td>
<td>Different types of outcomes</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.3</td>
<td>The origin and development of Outcomes-based Education and Training</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.4</td>
<td>Educational objectives</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.5</td>
<td>Competence based education (CBE)</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.6</td>
<td>Community service learning</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.7</td>
<td>Major reasons behind the implementation of Outcomes-based Education and Training</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.8</td>
<td>The South African Schools Act No. 108 of 1997</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.9</td>
<td>The major aims of South African Schools Act</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.10</td>
<td>Comparison and contrast of historical education systems</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.11</td>
<td>The general principles on which the Outcomes-based Education and Training approach is based</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.12</td>
<td>The merits and demerits of Outcomes-based Education and Training</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.13</td>
<td>Summary and conclusion</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 3

THE STRUCTURE OF LIFE SCIENCE AND BIOLOGY AND ITS INFLUENCE ON THE FACILITATION OF LEARNING FOR BLIND LEARNERS

3.1 Introduction
3.2 The importance of life science (biology) and natural science to blind and visually impaired learners and society in general
3.3 The substance of natural science
3.4 The structure of biology as a subject
3.4.1 The substantive structure
3.5 Syntactic structure of the subject biology
3.5.1 Sensorimotor skills
3.6 The science process skills in the learning mediation of biology
3.6.1 The development of subject language system
3.6.2 Competences needed for discovery
3.7 The relationship between substantive and syntactical structures
3.8 The facilitation/mediation of life science (biology) through inquiry
3.8.1 The importance of inquiry sessions
3.9 Factors influencing the facilitation or learning mediation of biology among blind learners
3.9.1 Interactional/social emotional environment
3.9.2 The inclusive outcomes-based Education learning environment
3.9.3 The physical environment
3.10 Qualities of biology educator
3.11 Summary and conclusion
CHAPTER 4

LEARNING MEDIATION STRATEGIES FOR THE BLIND AND VISUALLY IMPAIRED LIFE SCIENCE (BIOLOGY) LEARNER

4.1 Introduction 96
4.2 How learning mediation takes place 98
4.2.1 The way learners generally learn 98
4.2.2 How learners learn biology 105
4.2.3 How blind learners learn biology 107
4.2.4 Blind learners additional learning mediation challenges 114
4.2.5 How blind and visually impaired learners could master the unique demands of biology as a subject 116
4.3 The importance of meeting blind and visually impaired learners needs 117
4.4 The origin of learning mediation needs for blind and visually impaired biology learners 118
4.5 The importance of learning mediation strategies for blind and visually impaired learners 118
4.6 The role of the biology educator during learning mediation processes 119
4.7 Requirements to ensure the utilisation of blind and visually impaired learners’ potential 120
4.8 Characteristics of the biology educator using proper and effective learning mediation strategies 121
4.9 Guidelines for biology educators to effectively mediate learning to blind and visually impaired learners in an Outcomes-based Education classroom 122
4.9.1 Consultative process 122
4.9.2 Important aspects for consideration regarding accommodation purposes 122
4.9.3 Guidelines for the provision of reasonable learning mediation accommodation 123
4.10 Learning mediation strategies for blind and visually impaired learners 129
4.10.1 Reading techniques 130
4.10.2 Strategies for managing time and resources 131
4.11 Assisitive devices and learning mediation aids for blind and visually impaired learners 142
4.12 The importance of educator training in order to effectively mediate the learning of blind learners 143
4.13 Summary and conclusion 145
# CHAPTER 5

**SELECTION AND APPLICATION OF THE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND DATA COLLECTION STRATEGIES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Data collection techniques and strategies applied</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1</td>
<td>Reasons behind the conducting of a qualitative investigation</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2</td>
<td>Focus group interviews</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3</td>
<td>Direct observation</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.4</td>
<td>Follow-up telephone interviews</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.5</td>
<td>The use of questionnaires or inventories in the collection of data</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Interview schedules</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1</td>
<td>Scheduling of interviews and related activities</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2</td>
<td>The content validation of the inventories</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.3</td>
<td>Interview schedule or inventory for educators</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.4</td>
<td>Interview schedule or inventory for learners</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.5</td>
<td>Follow-up interview</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>The composition of the research sample and selection of participants</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.1</td>
<td>Type of sampling</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.2</td>
<td>Population from which the sample was drawn</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Data collection processes and the application of the focus group</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>Method for analysing data</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>Summary and conclusion</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 6

DATA PRESENTATION AND RESULTS OF THE
EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATION

6.1 Introduction .................................................. 162
6.2 The learning outcomes prescribed for the teaching of biology Grade 10-12 .... 162
6.3 Descriptive data analysis ...................................... 163
6.3.1 Biographical data analysis ............................... 163
6.3.2 Educators and learners’ profiles ......................... 163
6.4 Discussion based on interview sessions .................. 164
6.4.1 Feedback and report on the interviews ............... 164
6.4.2 Feedback and report on the interviews with educators .......... 164
6.4.3 Feedback and report on the focus group interviews .... 186
6.5 General comments of the respondents .................. 199
6.6 Reasons why blind learners thought and felt they were excluded from doing biology .... 201
6.7 Coding and classification of educator and learner interviews .......... 204
6.8 Summary and conclusion .................................... 209
CHAPTER 7

SUMMARY OF THE RESULTS OF THE EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATION,
CONCLUSIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Synopsis of the study</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.1</td>
<td>Findings extracted from the literature review</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.2</td>
<td>Findings extracted from the interview transcripts and focus group interviews</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.3</td>
<td>Findings extracted from the interviews transcripts with educators</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.4</td>
<td>The central findings of the study</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Ways in which this research supports and adds to both previous and current literature</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Weaknesses and limitations of the research</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>Recommendations and implications of the study and its impact on the broadening and strengthening of policy on inclusive education</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.1</td>
<td>Accommodative measures for blind learners</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.2</td>
<td>Research</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.3</td>
<td>Capacitating process</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.4</td>
<td>Policies and legislations</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.5</td>
<td>Educator training</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.6</td>
<td>Modification of materials</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.7</td>
<td>Inclusive settings</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.8</td>
<td>The curriculum</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.9</td>
<td>Support services</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.10</td>
<td>Tertiary institutions</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.11</td>
<td>Expert knowledge</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.12</td>
<td>The development and field-testing of a comprehensive science package</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.13</td>
<td>The responsibilities of the South African National Council for the Blind</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.14</td>
<td>Further research possibilities</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Outline of the research 20
Figure 2.1: Illustrates the outline of issues dealt with in chapter 2. 24
Figure 3.1: The outline of the issues dealt with in chapter 3 55
Figure 4.1: The outline of the issues dealt with in chapter 4. 97

LIST OF TABLES

Table: 20 schools for/with sections for the blind in South Africa, illustrated in the table. 157
Table: The table illustrates the profiles of educators who participated in this study. 158
Table: The following is an illustration of themes and sub-themes in outcomes 162
Table: Experiments 204

LIST OF PHOTO'S

Photo 1: Apparatus used for the sweet/sour taste experiment 165
Photo 2: Co-operation between learners sharing information when conducting a common experiment. 167
Photo 3: Blind and visually impaired learners participating in a classical ‘question-and-answer’ session. 174
Photo 4: Teaching in a poor learning environment. 176
Photo 5: Sources of information. 189
Photo 6: Educator writing on the chalkboard. 198

BIBLIOGRAPHY 250
APPENDICES

APPENDIX A  A PHOTOCOPY OF A SCANED TACTILE AMOEBA SKETCH ILLUSTRATING HOW A SMALL THING COULD BE BLOWN OUT OF PROPORTION IN A TACTUAL FORMAT

APPENDIX B  A PHOTOCOPY OF A SCANED TACTILE HYDRA SKETCH ILLUSTRATING HOW COMPLICATED IT BECOMES FOR A BLIND LEARNER TO UNDERSTAND A TOO DETAILED TACTILE SKETCH

APPENDIX C  A PHOTOCOPY OF A TACTILE EARTHWORM SKETCH DRAWN FROM THE ZYTEC MACHINE USING A SWELL-PAPER ILLUSTRATING THE POOR QUALITY OF SUCH SKETCHES AS COMPARED TO THERMOFORM ONES

APPENDIX D  THE RESEARCHER’S REQUEST TO CONDUCT INTERVIEWS AT SCHOOLS FOR THE BLIND

APPENDIX E  RESEARCH REQUEST PROCESS WITHIN THE GDE

APPENDIX F  REQUEST RESEARCH FORM FROM GAUTENG DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

APPENDIX G  PERMISSION TO CONDUCT THE RESEARCH AT SIBONILE SCHOOL

APPENDIX H  APPROVAL LETTER TO CONDUCT RESEARCH AT BOSELE SCHOOL

APPENDIX I  APPROVAL LETTER TO CONDUCT RESEARCH AT FILADELFIA SECONDARY SCHOOL

APPENDIX J  APPROVAL LETTER TO CONDUCT RESEARCH AT KATLEHONG/SNE’THEMBA SCHOOL

APPENDIX K  APPROVAL LETTER TO CONDUCT RESEARCH AT LETABA SCHOOL

APPENDIX L  APPROVAL LETTER TO CONDUCT RESEARCH AT SIBONILE SCHOOL

APPENDIX M  APPROVAL LETTER TO CONDUCT RESEARCH AT SILOE SCHOOL

APPENDIX N  APPROVAL LETTER TO CONDUCT RESEARCH AT PRINSHOF SCHOOL

APPENDIX O  APPROVAL LETTER TO CONDUCT RESEARCH AT TSHILIDZINI SCHOOL

APPENDIX P  FOLLOW-UP INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPS