THE ESTABLISHMENT, THROUGH ACTION RESEARCH, OF AN APPROPRIATE STRATEGIC ICT PLANNING PROCESS FOR THE SOUTH AFRICAN DEPARTMENT OF DEFENCE AS A DIVERSIFIED ORGANISATION

By

MATTHEUS JOHANNES DU TOIT

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree Doctor Philosophiae

In the faculty of Engineering, Built Environment and Information Technology
in the subject

Information Technology

at the

University of Pretoria

PROMOTOR:
Dr. H.H. Lotriet

July 2007
SUMMARY: THE ESTABLISHMENT, THROUGH ACTION RESEARCH, OF AN APPROPRIATE STRATEGIC ICT PLANNING PROCESS FOR THE SOUTH AFRICAN DEPARTMENT OF DEFENCE AS A DIVERSIFIED ORGANIZATION

With the current drive of both academia and practice to ensure that there is an appropriate degree of collaboration to ensure mutual benefit, any study undertaken that has the application of theory as one of its objectives, should therefore be able to make a contribution to both areas. From a strategic ICT planning perspective the ability to apply a planning process in a cohesive and coordinated manner throughout diversified or complex organisations has been one of the challenges that faced both academics and practitioners. This becomes especially relevant in view of the drive to ensure alignment between business and ICT so as to ensure that the potential utility of ICT can be leveraged and sustained to contribute towards the competitive advantage of the organisation.

This situation is also relevant to the South African Department of Defence as a particular kind of diversified organisation. With this in mind the initiative was recognised to establish an appropriate strategic ICT planning process for the department and to apply it to the point where a corporate strategic ICT master plan could be institutionalised. A progressive and longitudinal action research process resulted in not only the development of an appropriate process of definition and alignment, but also on the ability to apply and manage the strategic ICT planning function with full collaboration of all role players and stakeholders.

The conclusion from this research was that it is indeed possible to develop and apply an appropriate strategic ICT planning process that recognises the strategic – corporate and business unit level – environment of a diversified organisation, but that it is largely dependant upon the ability to ensure collaboration and participation within a clear and distinct construct of functions and responsibilities. Without appropriate management arrangements and mechanisms, it was found to be very difficult indeed due to issues relating to the semi-autonomous nature of the respective business units in relation to corporate management.

Keywords: IT Strategy, Planning, Alignment, Framework, Action Research
CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1 - INTRODUCTION TO THIS RESEARCH

1.1 BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT 1

1.2 APPROPRIATENESS OF THE DOD TO THIS RESEARCH AS A DIVERSIFIED ORGANISATION 2

1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT AND MOTIVATION FOR THE STUDY 7

1.4 MOTIVATION FOR THIS STUDY 13

1.5 RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND OBJECTIVES 14

1.6 RESEARCH CONTRIBUTIONS 15

1.7 RESEARCH APPROACH 16

1.8 THESIS FRAMEWORK 17

1.9 CONCLUSION 17

CHAPTER 2 – DESCRIPTION OF THE DOD: IT’S CONTEXT, HISTORY, POSITION WITHIN SA GOVERNMENT, STRUCTURE AND ORGANIZATION

2.1 CONSTRUCT TO GUIDE THE MANAGEMENT OF THE DEFENCE ENTERPRISE INFORMATION SYSTEM IN THE DOD 19

2.1.1 Functional approach for strategic information management in the DOD 20

2.1.2 Functions of the Secretary for Defence as relevant to DEIS management 20

2.1.3 Functions of the C SANDF as relevant to DEIS management 21

2.1.4 Defence enterprise information system management context 22

2.1.5 Comments on the strategic DEIS management context 23

2.2 STRATEGIC CMIS MANAGEMENT APPROACH 24

2.2.1 Functions of the Secretary for Defence and the C SANDF 24

2.2.2 Functions of the GITO and the C CMIS as related to the functions of the Secretary for Defence and the C SANDF respectively 25

2.2.3 GITO functions in support of the Secretary for Defence 25

2.2.4 C CMIS functions in support of the C SANDF 25

2.2.5 Contextual construct for the GITO and the C CMIS 26

2.2.6 Primary stakeholders 28

2.2.7 Participation in DOD management forums 28

2.2.8 DOD internal DEIS management mechanisms 30
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2.9</td>
<td>External information systems management mechanisms</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>THE INFORMATION SYSTEM MANAGEMENT FUNCTION WITHIN DOD</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1</td>
<td>Context for IS strategy formation and formulation as part of the ICT management paradigm</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2</td>
<td>Historical context for establishing a new strategic ICT management approach in the SA DOD</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3</td>
<td>Historical structural arrangements and intention with organisational and functional transformation of the DOD and the ICT management function</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.4</td>
<td>Expectations for the delivery of DEIS strategic direction</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.5</td>
<td>Expected future challenges subsequent to the establishment of the DEIS strategic direction</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 3</strong> - APPLYING AN APPROPRIATE THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK TO THE CASE STUDY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>THE NATURE OF COMPLEX OR DIVERSIFIED ORGANIZATIONS</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>Concept of the diversified organisation</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>Structure of diversified organisations</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>STRATEGIC MANAGEMENT IN DIVERSIFIED ORGANISATIONS</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1</td>
<td>Historical development of traditional considerations for strategic business management in diversified organisations</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2</td>
<td>Conceptual framework for strategic management</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3</td>
<td>Characteristics of the strategic management process as appropriate to diversified organisations</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.4</td>
<td>Conclusions on contextual issues relating to strategic management in diversified organisations</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.5</td>
<td>Strategy formation in diversified organisations</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.6</td>
<td>Strategic alignment within diversified organisations</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.7</td>
<td>Characteristics of the strategic management process as appropriate to diversified organisations</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>STRATEGIC ICT PLANNING AS A FUNCTION OF STRATEGIC ALIGNMENT</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1</td>
<td>The relationships between business and ICT solutions</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2</td>
<td>Functions of strategy as appropriate to ICT</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3</td>
<td>The nature of alignment from a business perspective</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>STRATEGIC ICT MANAGEMENT IN DIVERSIFIED ORGANISATIONS</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.5.1 Approach for ICT management in diversified organisations

3.5.2 Considerations for strategic ICT planning in diversified organisations

3.5.3 Critical issues to successful strategic ICT planning in diversified organisations

3.5.4 Establishing a contextual definition for an expanded strategic ICT planning process for diversified organisations

3.5.5 Establishing a strategic IS/ICT planning process for diversified organisations

3.5.6 Strategic ICT planning as a continuous learning process

3.6 STRATEGIC ICT PLANNING APPROACH, FRAMEWORK AND PROCESS AS APPROPRIATE TO THE DOD

3.6.1 The strategic ICT planning process: an overview of the model

3.6.2 Outputs of the strategic ICT planning process for diversified organisations

3.7 APPLYING THE STRATEGIC ICT PLANNING PROCESS

3.7.1 Initiating the planning cycle

3.7.2 Selecting, defining and implementing a planning approach

3.7.3 Framework for the is planning approach

3.7.4 Structure for strategic ICT planning deliverables

3.7.5 Formulation of the business is strategy to manage the demand for IS/ICT

3.7.6 Formulation of the strategy to supply ICT solutions

3.7.7 Expansion of the strategic ICT planning process

3.8 FORMULATION OF THE ICS/ICT MANAGEMENT STRATEGY

3.8.1 ICS/ICT management strategy

3.8.2 Issues related to institutionalisation of the strategic ICT planning process

3.9 RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN ORGANISATIONAL LEARNING AND THE REQUIREMENT FOR STRUCTURE

3.9.1 The development of appropriate structure for strategic ICT planning from learning experiences

3.9.2 Relevance of strategic management framework to strategic ICT planning in diversified organisations

3.10 RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE STRATEGIC ICT PLANNING PROCESS AND THE NATURE OF THE DIVERSIFIED ORGANISATION

3.10.1 Context for the relationship between the nature of the diversified organisation and its strategic ICT planning process

3.10.2 Conceptual relationship between the strategic ICT planning process and the strategic management process of a diversified organisation
3.10.3 The problematic nature of the simple approaches to strategic ICT planning

3.11 THE DISCONNECTION BETWEEN STRATEGIC ICT PLANNING PROCESS AND THE DIVERSIFIED ORGANISATION

3.11.1 Nature of strategic management within diversified organisations

3.11.2 Leading issues to guide this research as from the nature of complex organisations

3.11.3 Considerations relevant to this research

3.11.4 Systemic problems and barriers in information systems planning

3.12 IMPLICATIONS OF LEADING ISSUES THAT GUIDED THIS RESEARCH

3.12.1 Dimensions of strategic decisions

3.12.2 Levels of strategy as related to capability

3.12.3 Formality in strategic management

3.12.4 The strategy makers

3.12.5 Benefits of strategic management

3.12.6 Relationship between the business system and the ICT system

3.12.7 Setting and managing strategic ICT objectives for the diversified organisation

3.12.8 Activities that constitute the setting of strategic ICT objectives for the diversified organisation

3.13 A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK AS INTERPRETED FROM LITERATURE TO GUIDE THE INSTITUTIONALISATION OF THE STRATEGIC ICT PLANNING PROCESS IN THE DOD AS A DIVERSIFIED ORGANISATION

3.13.1 Prerequisites for corporate ICT management structures

3.13.2 Characteristics, roles and responsibilities that would influence structural arrangements in the DOD as appropriate ICT planning process

3.13.3 Mechanisms or enablers appropriate to the formulation of the ICT vision and mission for diversified organisations

3.13.4 Alignment of corporate business strategy and policy with strategic ICT planning and policy

3.13.5 Contextual focus for alignment for extended strategic ICT planning model

3.13.6 Organisational structures appropriate to strategic ICT planning and management in the diversified organisation

3.13.7 Summary of influences

3.13.8 Utilisation of influences

3.14 CRITICAL ISSUES THAT WILL ENSURE SUCCESSFUL STRATEGIC
ICT PLANNING IN A DIVERSIFIED ORGANISATION

3.15 CONCLUSION

CHAPTER 4 – RESEARCH METHODOLOGY/DESIGN

4.1 INTRODUCTION

4.2 AIM OF THIS CHAPTER

4.3 APPROPRIATENESS OF USING A SINGLE CASE STUDY

4.4 ACTION RESEARCH AS A RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

4.4.1 General comments on action research

4.4.2 Contextual aspects of action research

4.4.3 Action research as an appropriate research methodology

4.4.4 Dialogical action research

4.5 ALIGNMENT BETWEEN THE RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT AND THE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

4.6 SYNOPSIS OF THE CASE STUDY UNDERTAKEN IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN DEPARTMENT OF DEFENCE

4.7 INFERENCES AND DEDUCTIONS AS DRAWN FROM THE PRACTICAL APPLICATION OF THE ACTION RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND ITS CHARACTERISTICS TO THE CASE STUDY

4.8 ESTABLISHMENT OF AN APPROPRIATE FRAMEWORK TO COMBINE AND PRESENT RESEARCH AND RESEARCH FINDINGS

4.8.1 Framework for findings

4.8.2 Framework for testing pragmatism

4.9 CONCLUDING DISCUSSION

4.10 CONCLUSIONS

CHAPTER 5 – RESULTS AND FINDINGS OF RESEARCH UNDERTAKEN IN THE DOD

5.1 GENERAL INTRODUCTION

5.1.1 Research objectives as a background to understanding the DOD in context

5.1.2 Approach to be followed with the presentation of the learning experience in the SA DOD

5.2 THE HISTORY OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF AN INFORMATION SYSTEM STRATEGY FOR THE DOD, INCLUDING CONTEXT, TIMELINE, AND PERSONS INVOLVED, ETC.

5.2.1 Establishment of the contextual timeline for the research

5.2.2 Cursory description of the research time-line
5.2.3 Specifying the improvement in structural arrangements and the strategic ICT planning process of the SA DOD 184

5.3 CONCLUSIONS FROM THE FUNCTIONAL RESEARCH 187

5.3.1 Functional conclusions on the establishment of and appropriate strategic ICT planning process for the DOD as a diversified organisation 187

5.4 PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS OF FUNCTIONAL RESEARCH 189

5.4.1 Utilisation of the construct to present action research information 189

5.5 PRESENTING THE DATA FROM THE RESEARCH 191

5.6 PRESENTATION OF A CONCEPTUAL MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK FOR STRATEGIC ICT PLANNING IN DIVERSIFIED ORGANISATIONS 236

5.6.1 Issues of alignment relevant to the setting of strategic ICT objectives for the diversified organisation 236

5.6.2 Group strategic planning with business focus providing initial planning guidelines for ICT emanating from the enterprise planning process 239

5.6.3 Business unit strategic planning with business focus including ICT planning in conformance with enterprise planning guidelines 241

5.6.4 Dynamically iterative approval and ratification process at group (enterprise) level with involvement of business units (including ICT) 243

5.6.5 Strategic planning process for ICT function in diversified organisations in support of business objectives and requirements 245

5.6.6 Graphic representation of the strategic ICT planning process for diversified organisations 247

5.7 CONCLUSIONS DRAWN REGARDING THE STRATEGIC ICT PLANNING PROCESS IN THE DOD 248

5.8 SUMMARY OF LESSONS LEARNT 252

CHAPTER 6 – EVALUATION OF RESEARCH METHODOLOGY, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS 257

6.1 EVALUATION OF RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 257

6.2 TRANSFERABILITY OF RESEARCH FINDINGS 259

6.3 ASSESSMENT OF CONTRIBUTION OF RESEARCH 261

6.4 RECOMMENDATIONS FOLLOWING FROM RESEARCH ON FURTHER RESEARCH 261

6.5 CONCLUSION 262
## LIST OF FIGURES/ILLUSTRATIONS

| Figure 1.1: | Strategic management construct as from the RSA Constitution and Defence Act. | 4 |
| Figure 1.2: | SA DOD organisation construct from a functional perspective to indicate complexity as relevant to the existing matrix relationship between process and capability. | 5 |
| Figure 2.3: | Defence information system management context. | 23 |
| Figure 2.4: | Strategic ICT management construct as from the DOD management construct. | 27 |
| Figure 2.5: | Research time-line for practice and theory. | 36 |
| Figure 3.1: | Progressive time-line as relevant to strategic ICT planning in the DOD. | 38 |
| Figure 3.2: | Contextual definition of the problem environment as interpreted from Thompson and Strickland (2003), Pearce and Robinson (2003) and Luftman (1996). | 42 |
| Figure 3.3: | Organisational hierarchy for strategic ICT planning in diversified organisations taken from Thompson and Strickland (2003). | 43 |
| Figure 3.4: | Value chains for diversified organisations with differentiated output as adapted from Porter (1985). | 44 |
| Figure 3.5: | Five tasks of strategic management as from Thompson and Strickland (2003). | 50 |
| Figure 3.6: | Generic contextual model for strategic ICT planning as appropriate to this research. | 54 |
| Figure 3.7: | Transition between computer and information management: relationships and emphasis as from Ward and Griffiths (1996:6). | 55 |
| Figure 3.8: | The relationship between business, IS and IT strategies as from Ward and Griffiths (1996:31). | 56 |
| Figure 3.9: | Strategic Management as adapted from Thompson and Strickland (2003:5) to include the task of Alignment for Strategic ICT Planning in Diversified Organisations with Control Feedback Loop. | 57 |
| Figure 3.10: | Strategic alignment model as adapted from Chorn (2004) to indicate alignment for synergy. | 59 |
| Figure 3.11: | Expanded contextual positioning of the influences of the management approach towards the strategic ICT planning process in diversified organisations. | 63 |
| Figure 3.12: | Analytic and creative approach to interpret business as from Ward and Griffiths (1996:137). | 68 |
| Figure 3.13: | The inputs, outputs and related process activities and enablers as from Ward and Griffiths (1996:129). | 69 |
| Figure 3.14: | Information flows and feedback for IS/IT planning as from Ward and Griffiths (1996:112). | 73 |
| Figure 3.15: | Options for ICT strategies for an organisation with distinctive business units as from Ward and Griffiths (1996:119). | 75 |
| Figure 3.16: | Framework for IS/ICT strategic planning process as from Ward and Griffiths (1996:129). | 78 |

Figure 3.17: Strategic context of information as from Marchand, D. A and Horton F. W. Jr. (1986).

Figure 3.18: Relationship between organisational capabilities, resource management systems and management levels in organisations as considered appropriate to this research by the researcher.

Figure 3.19: Relationship of strategising functions as considered appropriate to strategic ICT planning by the researcher.

Figure 3.20: Relationship between the business system and the ICT system management life cycle as interpreted by the researcher.

Figure 3.21: Contextual definition of strategic ICT planning process in diversified organisations.

Figure 3.22: The external environment as appropriate to strategic business and strategic ICT planning as adapted from as from Pearce and Robinson (2003:57).

Figure 3.23: Extended enterprise ICT planning model indicating primary planning cycles as interpreted by the researcher from Luftman (1996).

Figure 3.24: Transition between computer and information management: relationships and emphasis as from Ward and Griffiths (1996:6).

Figure 3.25: The relationship between business, IS and IT Strategies as from Ward and Griffiths (1996:31).

Figure 3.26: Integrated and aligned strategic ICT management model as interpreted by the researcher from existing theory.

Figure 3.27: Management structures to manage the Enhanced Enterprise ICT Strategic Planning Process for Diversified Organisations.

Figure 4.1: Context for research approach and methodology

Figure 4.2: Context for action research process.

Figure 4.3: Contextual construct for action research as an interpretation of theory and practice.

Figure 4.4: Action research process as interpreted from Lewin (1857) and Lindgren, Henfridsson and Schultze (2004) and Baskerville and Lee (2003).

Figure 4.5: Illustration of the researcher / practitioner relationship.

Figure 5.1: Time line as followed during the research period where the focus was on the actual execution of the planning process, but with due consideration of the research methodology.

Figure 5.2: Process of aligning strategic ICT planning for the DEIS with business strategy as appropriate to the defence function.

Figure 5.3: DEIS Master Plan construct to provide a corporate framework for DEIS SD implementation.

Figure 5.4: Rational supply chain for CMIS and services management in the DOD.

Figure 5.5: Functional relationship between GITO and the C CMIS as the primary ICT system integrator.

Figure 5.6: DEIS management arrangements and mechanisms.
Figure 5.7: Strategic planning model as adapted from an interpretation by Smith A. J. (2001) and a general interpretation of Ward and Griffiths (1996).

Figure 5.8: Strategic enterprise planning (group level) as appropriate to strategic ICT planning in diversified organisations.

Figure 5.9: Strategic business unit planning as appropriate to strategic ICT planning in diversified organisations.

Figure 5.10: Interaction of strategic planning at enterprise level and strategic planning at business unit level as appropriate to strategic ICT planning in diversified organisations.

Figure 5.11: Strategic ICT planning process for diversified organisations as part of strategic business planning in a diversified organisation.

Figure 5.12: Approach to strategic ICT planning in diversified organisations as adapted from Ward and Griffiths (1996:137).

LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.1: Framework for presentation and summary of research as adapted from Lindgren (2004) et al.

Table 4.2: Framework for the summary of research findings as appropriate to practice and scientific theory.

Table 4.3: Premises for pragmatism in research as interpreted from Baskerville and Myers (2004) and Lewin (1957).

Table 5.1: Summary of action research project.

Table 5.2: Summary of contributions to existing theory with due consideration of practice.

Table 6.1: Review of research in as appropriate to the research approach.