The relationship between funding in education and quality education

by

Jean Wilhelm van Rooyen

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

Philosophiae Doctor

in the

Department of Education Management and Policy Studies
Faculty of Education
University of Pretoria

Supervisor
Professor Doctor J. L. Beckmann

October 2011

© University of Pretoria
## Contents

List of Figures ................................................................................................................ 5  
List of Tables ................................................................................................................. 6  
DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY .......................................................................... 9  
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ......................................................................................... 10  
ABSTRACT ................................................................................................................. 11  
KEY CONCEPTS ......................................................................................................... 12  
ACRONYMS ............................................................................................................... 13  
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION ............................................................................... 14  

1.1 Statement of purpose ........................................................................................ 14  
1.2 Significance and situatedness of this study ..................................................... 14  
1.3 Rationale .......................................................................................................... 15  
  1.3.1 From a personal perspective ................................................................... 15  
  1.3.2 From a ‘practical / school / systems’ perspective ................................... 16  
  1.3.3 Based on literature .............................................................................. 17  
1.4 Research questions ........................................................................................... 18  
1.5 Theoretical framework ..................................................................................... 19  
1.6 Conceptual framework ..................................................................................... 20  
1.7 Literature Review ............................................................................................. 24  
  1.7.1 Quality education .............................................................................. 24  
  1.7.2 Funding of public education in South Africa ......................................... 29  
  1.7.3 Democratisation of education in South Africa ....................................... 34  
  1.7.4 The economics of education – linking funding and quality education ... 36  
1.8 Research design ................................................................................................ 40  
  1.8.1 Epistemology .................................................................................. 40  
  1.8.2 Research approach .......................................................................... 41  
  1.8.3 Methodology ................................................................................... 41  

CHAPTER 2: QUALITY EDUCATION ................................................................... 47  
2.1 Introduction ...................................................................................................... 47  
2.2 Quality education ............................................................................................. 49  
2.3 Quality education in the South African context ............................................. 54  
  2.3.1 Progress in International Reading Literacy Study (PIRLS) .................. 59  
  2.3.2 Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS) ...... 60  
  2.3.3 Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) ............... 60  
  2.3.4 The Southern and Eastern Africa Consortium for Monitoring Educational Quality (SACMEQ) ............................................................ 61  
  2.3.5 Annual National Assessments (ANA) ................................................... 61  
  2.3.6 The National Senior Certificate Examination (NSCE) ..................... 63  
  2.3.7 Class size as factor in quality education ................................................. 69  
2.4 European Commission’s model on quality education .................................... 74  
  2.4.1 Attainment. ................................................................................................. 75  
  2.4.2 Success and transition. ................................................................................. 75  
  2.4.3 Monitoring of school education. ................................................................. 76  
  2.4.4 Resources and structures. ............................................................................. 76  
2.5 The role of the teacher .................................................................................... 77  
2.6 Conclusion and synthesis. ............................................................................... 79  

CHAPTER 3: LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR THE FUNDING OF EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC SCHOOLS ................................................. 81  
3.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................ 81
CHAPTER 4: ACCOUNTABILITY REGARDING THE FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT OF EDUCATION

4.1 Introduction

4.2 Conceptualisation

4.3 Primary responsibilities regarding the provision of education in South Africa

4.4 The funding of education in South Africa

4.5 Accountability in the South African education system

4.6 Liability

4.7 Conclusion

CHAPTER 5: RESEARCH DESIGN

5.1 Introduction

5.2 Epistemology

5.3 Theoretical and conceptual frameworks

5.4 Research approach

5.5 Methodology

5.6 Data collection

5.7 Data analysis
5.8 Trustworthiness, Validity and Reliability ...................................................... 159
5.10 Ethics .............................................................................................................. 162
5.11 Storage of data ............................................................................................... 163
5.12 Limitations ......................................................................................................... 163
5.13 In closing ........................................................................................................ 164

CHAPTER 6: DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION ........................................... 165
6.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................... 165
6.2 Section A: Demographic and other information ........................................... 165
6.2.1 Enrolment .................................................................................................... 165
6.2.2 Drop-out rate ............................................................................................. 167
6.2.3 University entrance .................................................................................... 168
6.2.4 Distinctions .................................................................................................. 169
6.2.5 Subject averages ........................................................................................ 170
6.2.6 Demographic information about the School Management Team (SMT) 173
6.2.7 Demographic information about the Grade twelve teachers ................... 176
6.2.8 Demographic information about the SGBs ................................................. 179
6.2.9 Demographic information about the Finance Committees (FCs) .......... 180
6.2.10 Budget information .................................................................................. 181
6.2.11 Additional funding per subject in preparation for the NSCE ................. 184
6.2.12 Activities funded in preparation for the NSCE ........................................ 184
6.3 Section B: Performance in the National Senior Certificate Examination ........ 185
6.3.1 Management of the academic programme .............................................. 185
6.3.2 Management of academic performance with special reference to grade twelve 186
6.3.3 Correlation between funding levels and academic performance of the school as a whole ................................................................. 190
6.3.4 Correlation of funding levels and academic performance of selected subjects in the National Senior Certificate Examination .................. 194
6.3.5 Reasons for the success in the National Senior Certificate Examination – supplementary comments derived from probing questions 196
6.4 Section C: Indicators of Quality Education ................................................. 202
6.5 Summary ........................................................................................................ 208

CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ..................................... 211
7.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................... 211
7.2 Reflection on and integration of literature review ........................................... 212
7.2.1 Quality education ..................................................................................... 213
7.2.1.1 Indicators of quality education ............................................................. 214
7.2.1.2 Performance levels ............................................................................. 215
7.2.1.3 Class size .......................................................................................... 216
7.2.1.4 Technology ....................................................................................... 217
7.2.1.5 Teacher / educator ........................................................................... 217
7.2.1.6 Role of money .................................................................................. 218
7.2.1.7 Managing academic performance ...................................................... 218
7.2.2 Legislative framework .............................................................................. 219
7.2.3 Accountability ............................................................................................ 222
7.2.4 To summarise ............................................................................................. 223
7.3 Findings ........................................................................................................... 224
7.3.1 The relationship between funding and the quality of education ............ 225
7.3.2 Factors impacting on the quality of education in the research sample. 225
  7.3.2.1 The teacher / educator ................................................................. 226
  7.3.2.2 Management of academic performance ...................................... 227
  7.3.2.3 The use of technology ............................................................... 228
  7.3.2.4 Class size .................................................................................. 229
  7.3.3 The role of money ........................................................................ 229
  7.3.4 Staff development ........................................................................ 230
7.4 Conclusions based on assumptions ...................................................... 231
7.5 Recommendations for improvement of practice and further investigation... 233
  7.5.1 Recommendations for improvement of practice ......................... 233
  7.5.2 Recommendations for further investigation .............................. 233
7.6 Final impression ................................................................................ 234
LIST OF REFERENCES ................................................................................. 235
Printed sources ....................................................................................... 235
  Case law: .............................................................................................. 246
  Web-based sources ............................................................................... 248
ANNEXURE 1 ........................................................................................... 250
ANNEXURE 2 ........................................................................................... 251
ANNEXURE 3 ........................................................................................... 253
ANNEXURE 4: RESEARCH DATA PER SAMPLE SCHOOL ...................... 263
  Case study 1: Sample school I ............................................................... 263
  Case study 2: Sample school II .............................................................. 281
  Case study 3: Sample school III ............................................................ 296
  Case study 4: Sample school IV ............................................................ 312
  Case study 5: Sample school V .............................................................. 330
  Case study 6: Sample school VI ............................................................ 346
ANNEXURE 5 ........................................................................................... 361

List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Conceptual framework 22
Figure 1.2: The Educational Production function 23
Figure 1.3: Management as the integration of needs, resources and actions 25
Figure 1.4: Leadership – the driving force (van Rooyen and Rossouw, 2007:19) 26
Figure 1.5: Continuum of categories of self-managing public schools in South Africa 35
Figure 2.1: Education Rights Circle Diagram (http://www.right-to-education.org/node/231 Accessed 20 August 2011). 50
Figure 2.2: Number of students writing the National Senior Certificate Examination 68
Figure 2.3: Pass rate for the National Senior Certificate Examination 68

Figure 3.1: Structure of SA Education system 1994 to 2009 84

Figure 3.2: Structure of SA Education system after 2009 elections 84

Figure 3.3: The organisation of a South African public school 87

Figure 5.1: The Research Process (Adapted from Fraenkel & Wallen, 2006: 19) 144

List of Tables

Table 1.1: National table of targets for school allocation (2007 – 2009) 33

Table 2.1: Excerpts from the table on key activities that the Department will embark on. (DoE 2003a: 30) 57

Table 2.2: 2011 Results for the Annual National Assessments. 62

Table 2.3: National Senior Certificate Examination results 66

Table 2.4: Class size projects in the USA (Adapted from http://ed.gov/pubs/ReducingClass/Class_size.html - accessed on 24/05/2011). 69

Table 2.5: Sixteen indicators of the Quality of School Education. (European Commission 2000:6) 74

Table 3.1: The national table of targets for school allocation (2007 to 2009) 93

Table 3.2: The national table of targets for school allocation (2010 to 2012) 93

Table 4.1: The responsibilities of the principal of a public school. 122
Table 4.2: *The responsibilities of educators.* 124

Table 5.1: *Key contributors to our understanding of knowledge as concept* 138

Table 5.2: *Common Types of Qualitative Research (Merriam, 1998: 12)* 146

Table 5.3: *Probability methods.* 153

Table 5.4: *Quota methods.* 154

Table 5.5: *Selective methods* 154

Table 5.6: *Convenience methods.* 155

Table 5.7: *Ethnographic methods.* 155

Table 6.1: *Total enrolment of the sample schools* 166
Table 6.2: *Grade 12 enrolment of the sample schools* 167
Table 6.3: *Drop-out rate for Grades 8 to 12* 168
Table 6.4: *University entrance admissions* 169
Table 6.5: *Distinctions in the NSCE* 170
Table 6.6: *Overall averages in NSCE* 171
Table 6.7: *English averages in NSCE* 172
Table 6.8: *Mathematics averages in NSCE* 172
Table 6.9: *Physical science averages in NSCE* 172
Table 6.10: *Demographics of the Principals* 174
Table 6.11: *Demographics of the Deputy Principals* 175
Table 6.12: *Demographics of the HODs* 176
Table 6.13: *Demographics of the all Grade 12 teachers/educators combined* 177
Table 6.14: *Demographics of the Grade 12 English teachers/educators* 177
Table 6.15: Demographics of the Grade 12 Mathematics teachers/educators  178

Table 6.16: Demographics of the Grade 12 Physical Science teachers/educators  179

Table 6.17: Demographics of SGB members  180

Table 6.18: Demographics of the Finance Committee members  181

Table 6.19: The annual budgets for 2007 to 2009  182

Table 6.20: Academic budget as a percentage of the annual budget.  184

Table 6.21: SGB appointed staff as a percentage of the Annual budget.  184

Table 6.22: Average class size  191

Table 6.23: Availability of technology  192

Table 6.24: Budget for staff development  193

Table 6.25: Attainment as indicator of quality education.  203

Table 6.26: Success & transition as indicators of quality education  205

Table 6.27: Monitoring as indicator of quality education  206

Table 6.28: Resources & structures as indicators of quality education  208

Table 7.1: Academic performance levels  215
DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY

Full names of student: Jean Wilhelm van Rooyen

Student Number: 6804160

Declaration

1. I understand what plagiarism is and am aware of the university’s policy in this regard.

2. I declare that the thesis, “The relationship between funding in education and quality education” is my own original work. Where other people’s work has been used, this has been acknowledged and referenced in accordance with Departmental requirements.

3. I have not used work previously produced by another student or any other person to hand in as my own.

4. I have not allowed, and will not allow, anyone to copy my work with the intention of passing it off as his or her own work.

SIGNATURE STUDENT: .........................................................

SIGNATURE SUPERVISOR: .....................................................
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It is with deep gratitude that I express my sincere appreciation to the following:

- Professor JL Beckmann, as supervisor, colleague and critical friend, for his sustained support and guidance during my studies. I also wish to thank him sincerely for editing the language.
- My wife Rika, our children, family and friends for their support and encouragement.
- My colleagues that, through their critical engagement, shaped my thinking over the years.
- All the respondents that participated in the study.
- My Creator and Saviour for every blessing in my life.
ABSTRACT

My entire career in lecturing and research in the field of financial management in education, have led to me becoming more and more intrigued by questions related to the amounts of money being spent on education and the performance of learners in the Senior Certificate Examination in public secondary schools in South Africa. The South African education system has changed dramatically since 1994 and is aimed at restoring the injustices of the past by providing equitable quality education. Despite many reforms our system is not rendering acceptable results as is evident from our participation in international and national tests (TIMSS, PIRLS, SACMEQ and ANA). Internationally UNESCO is driving the Educational for All campaign in an attempt to address issues related to quality education.

The purpose of this research was to investigate the relationship between the funding of education and the quality of education in selected diverse top performing secondary schools in the Gauteng province of South Africa. The results of the sample schools in the National Senior Certificate examination was used as indicator of the quality of education provided. Towards this end, I have done multiple case study research in six schools selected using purposive and convenience sampling techniques. Semi-structured interviews and document analysis were used to collect data.

I found that there is a definite link between funding and the quality of education provided. This manifests itself in allowing schools to reduce class size by appointing additional teaching staff, access to technology and staff development. However, all the schools in the sample indicated that the crucial factor determining their success was their teachers! In addition to the role of the teachers, I found that structures created for and the manner in which academic performance was managed and parental involvement also played determining roles. Contrary to what was expected, the use of technology as teaching aid, although convenient, was not playing a decisive role.

The research led to a much better and deeper understanding of the intricate relationship between funding and the quality of education, but additional investigation is required in order to highlight this matter even further to allow for the informed improvement of efforts to raise the quality of education in South Africa and the world.

---

2 See paragraphs 2.3.1 to 2.3.5 in Chapter two
KEY CONCEPTS

- Accountability
- Democratisation
- Financial management in education
- Funding of education
- Indicators of quality education
- National Senior Certificate Examination
- Private funds
- Public Funds
- Quality education
- School fund
ACRONYMS

ANA  Annual National Assessment
CCEM Commonwealth Council of Education Ministers
DoE  Department of Education
DoBE Department of Basic Education
GDP  Gross Domestic Product
NSCE National Senior Certificate Examination
NSSF National Norms and Standards for School Funding
PFMA Public Finance Management Act
PIRLS Progress in International Reading Literacy Study
SACMEQ Southern and Eastern Africa Consortium for Monitoring Educational Quality
SASA South African Schools Act
SGB School Governing Body
SMT School Management Team
TIMSS Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study
UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation