THE SOUTH AFRICAN INDIAN MUSLIM FAMILY: PERSONAL NARRATIVES

By

NADIA PATEL

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

MASTER OF ARTS

in

CLINICAL PSYCHOLOGY

in the

FACULTY OF HUMANITIES

at the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA, PRETORIA

Supervisor: Annalie Pauw
Co-Supervisor: Professor Maria Marchetti-Mercer 9 December 2002
Acknowledgements

- It is without a shadow of a doubt that my first and most important expression of appreciation is to my God. It is only through the Will of the Almighty, that this research endeavour has materialised.

- I would like to thank my parents and my brother, who have always responded to my needs with the greatest of love and sincerity. You have been an unending source of inspiration, courage and strength.

- My husband, for his tireless support and understanding, as well as his constant companionship. Thank you for being willing to even share the darker of days.

- My gratitude must be expressed to my supervisor, whose guidance and patience always eased my load.

- I would also like to thank my co-supervisor for her time and expertise.

- The National Research Foundation for generously granting me the financial aid to carry out this study.
SUMMARY

This study can be seen as an exploration of the contributions (or lack thereof) made from various schools of family therapy with regards to culture, and, as an augmentation to the current literature, through articulating a South African Indian Muslim family narrative.

It commences with a review of the academic literature, comprising of the studies and general approaches taken towards the subject matter of culture and family therapy within this field. The study thereafter offers a description of the epistemological framework from which the author is operating which can be seen as a combination of second-order cybernetics and social constructionism. This serves to familiarize readers with the frame of reference that has guided the approach to this study as it impacts significantly on the manner in which research is conducted. A detailed discussion of the research approach adopted in this study thus ensues. The research approach assumes a postmodern flavour and can be regarded as alternate paradigm research.

The study also engages in an examination of the various discourses or schools of thought that have provided the predominant epistemological orientations within the field of family therapy. These are the systemic, first and second order cybernetics, constructivist, social constructionist and narrative approaches. The core characteristics of these discourses are critically described and their associated ramifications for culture are explored.

Finally, the study attempts to articulate a South African Indian Muslim family narrative. In doing so, it draws on a number of combined resources. The primary source of data is in the form of personal narratives that are extracted from the author’s own experiences and observations of being a member of this specific cultural group. This data is supplemented with community narratives regarding the family. These narratives are extrapolated through participant observation in a community setting. The main themes that emerge from both sources are then utilized as areas of discussion. At the same time, these narratives reflect specific cultural and religious discourses as the latter is threaded into the fabric of the former. The main areas of discussion involve family structure, cohesion, role allocation, communication, hierarchy and life cycle. Those academic narratives which are considered to be applicable and relevant are applied to the data where necessary, thereby highlighting
features of significance and illuminating points of convergence and contrast. The author also attempts to explore the systems of meaning that may inform the patterns in the family.

Keywords: South African, Indian, Muslim, family therapy, epistemology, social constructionism, narrative, culture
Hierdie verhandeling kan beskou word as ’n ondersoek van die bydrae (of gebrek daaraan) van verskeie skole van familie terapie met betrekking tot kultuur. Deur die weergawe van ’n Suid Afrikaanse Indiër Moslem familie-narratief kan dit ook gesien word as ’n toevoeging tot die bestaande literatuur.

Dit begin met ’n oorsig van die akademiese literatuur in die veld, wat uit studies en algemene benaderings tot die onderwerp van kultuur en familie terapie bestaan. Daarna gee die verhandeling ’n beskrywing van die gekose epistemologiese raamwerk ten einde die leser te oriënteer met die verwysingsraam van die skrywer. Die kombinasie van tweede-orde kibernetika en sosiale konstruksionisme het ’n groot impak op die manier wat die navorsing uitgevoer is. ’n Omslagtige bespreking van die navorsingsbenadering wat gebruik is in die studie volg daarop. Die navorsingsbenadering het ’n posmodernistiese aanslag en kan gesien word as alternatiewe paradigma navorsing.

Die verhandeling ondersoek verder die verskeie diskoerse wat tot die heersende epistemologiese oriëntasies binne die veld van familie-terapie aanleiding gegee het. Hierdie sluit in sistemiese, eerste- en tweede-orde kibernetika, konstruktivisme, sosiale konstruksionisme en narratiewe benaderings. Die sentrale eienskappe van hierdie diskoerse word krities beskryf en die geassosieerde ramifikasies vir kultuur word ondersoek.

Ten slotte, poog die verhandeling om ’n Suid-Afrikaanse Indiër Moslem familie narratief weer te gee deur ’n kombinasie van bronne te raadpleeg. Die primêre bron van data is in die vorm van persoonlike narratiewe vanuit die skrywer se eie ervarings en waarnemings as lid van die spesifieke kulturele groep. Die data is aangevul met gemeenskapsnarratiewe ten opsigte van die familie. Hierdie narratiewe is verkry deur deelnemerobservasie teen ’n gemeenskapsagtergrond. Die hoof temas wat vanuit hierdie bronse gedistilleer is word dan as aftrekpunte vir bespreking gebruik. Terselfdertyd reflekteer die narratiewe spesifieke kulturele en religieuze diskoerse soos wat die laasgenoemde die eersgenoemde deurspek. Die hoofareas van bespreking sluit familie-struktuur, kohesie, roltoewysing, kommunikasie, hierargie en lewensskiklus in. Waar nodig word gepaste akademiese narratiewe dan op die data toegepas ten einde betekenisvolle kenmerke en die punte van ooreenstemming en
teenstelling uit te wys. Die skrywer poog verder om die sisteme van betekenis, wat patrone binne die familie kan beinvloed, te ondersoek.

Sleutelwoorde: Suid-Afrikaans, Indiër, Moslem, kultuur, familieterapie, epistemologie, sosiale konstruksionisme, narratief.
# Table of contents

## Chapter 1  Contextualisation of the study

1.1 Introduction  
1.2 Rationale  
1.2.1 Context of the study  
1.2.1.1 Local context  
1.2.1.2 International context  
1.3 Description of the study  
1.4 Aims

## Chapter 2  Literature review

2.1 Definition of culture  
2.2 Culture in the field of family therapy  
2.3 Culture-specific approaches  
2.3.1 Studies based on a culture specific-approach  
2.3.2 Contrasting culture-specific characteristics  
2.3.3 Culture-specific practices of families  
2.3.4 Culture-specific approaches to therapy  
2.3.5 Assessing the culture-specific approaches  
2.4 The relativist, absolutist and universalist approaches  
2.4.1 The relativist position  
2.4.2 The absolutist position  
2.4.2.1 Cultural encapsulation  
2.4.3 The universalist position  
2.4.4 Multiculturalism  
2.5 Alternative perspectives  
2.5.1 Cultural ignorance  
2.5.2 Cultural sensitivity  
2.5.3 Cultural skill  
2.5.4 Anthropological approach  
2.5.5 Strategic approach
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.5.6 Culture as co-constructed</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.7 Social constructionist and narrative approaches</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 A multidimensional framework</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7 Conclusion</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3 Epistemological foundations of the study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Defining epistemology</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 The drawing of distinctions: The construction of reality</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 The self-referential and reflexive nature of distinctions</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Punctuation</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 The <em>social</em> construction of reality</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 The broader relationship</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 Recursiveness</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8 Epistemology and research</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8.1 The postmodern approach</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8.1.1 Describing the postmodern</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8.1.2 Reflexivity</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8.1.3 Critique of modernist research</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8.2 Alternative paradigm research</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8.3 Implications</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9 Conclusion</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4 Methodology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Research method</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Data collection</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 Participant observation</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Personal experience</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 Ethnography</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Research procedure</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Access to participants</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Research setting</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 Sampling</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.7 Utilisation of data 52
4.8 Research aims 54
4.9 Conclusion 56

Chapter 5 Discourses in schools of family therapy
5.1 Modernism 57
5.1.1 First-order cybernetics 59
5.1.2 General systems theory 60
5.1.2.1 Context 61
5.1.2.2 Systemic interdependence 61
5.1.2.3 The systemic metaphor 61
5.1.2.4 Feedback mechanisms 62
5.1.2.5 Critique of the general systems approach 62
5.2 Postmodernism 63
5.2.1 Second-order cybernetics 64
5.2.1.1 Observing systems 65
5.2.1.2 Objectivity and truth 65
5.2.2 Constructivism 66
5.2.2.1 Structure determinism 66
5.2.2.2 Objectivity and truth 67
5.2.2.3 Knowledge 67
5.2.2.4 Context 67
5.2.3 Social constructionism and the narrative approach 68
5.2.3.1 Constructivism and social constructionism 68
5.2.3.2 Truth 68
5.2.3.3 Truth and power 69
5.2.3.4 The social construction of reality 70
5.2.3.5 Language and the construction of reality 71
5.2.3.6 The narrative approach 71
5.2.3.6.1 Meaning 71
Chapter 8 Conclusion

8.1 Implications of findings for therapy 119
8.2 Impact on individual and larger group 123
8.3 Concluding remarks 123

Chapter 9 References 127