

**HUMANITARIAN INTERVENTION IN AFRICA: THE
ROLE OF INTERGOVERNMENTAL
ORGANISATIONS**

A dissertation submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree
Doctor of Laws (LLD) of the University of Pretoria, South Africa

By Kithure Kindiki

Prepared at the Faculty of Law, University of Pretoria
under the promotorship of Professor Frans Viljoen

31 October 2002

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I acknowledge with deep gratitude the support of my supervisor Professor Frans Verbeet of the University of Pretoria, who took a very real interest in my studies. Without his guidance and encouragement, the writing of this thesis would not have been possible. I am also indebted to my wife Joyce and daughter Hannah for faithfully standing with me at the very end of a very long journey while I wrote this work.

To my scholar friends I must thank the criticism of Prof. Fredu van der Vaart of Amsterdam, Prof. Theodor Oden of the University of Cape Town, Prof. Anura (Kings College London), Ms. Jacqui Doolabh (Executive Director of the Executive Leadership Institute of South Africa), and a former classmate of my time at the University of Pretoria, who I met a long time ago. I would also like to thank my friends and family, especially my brother and sister, for their love and support during this journey. I am also grateful to my friends and family for their love and support during this journey.

I thank Ms. Gillian To my wife Joyce and daughter Hannah for tirelessly keeping me updated on new publications and news related to my field of research. I also thank Ms. Gillian for her support and encouragement throughout this journey. I am also grateful to my friends and family for their love and support during this journey.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I acknowledge with deep gratitude the support of my promoter Professor Frans Viljoen of the University of Pretoria, who took a very keen interest in my studies. Without his guidance and encouragement, the writing of this thesis would not have been possible. I am also indebted to my wife Joyce, and daughter Hannah for faithfully standing with me through very tough moments while I wrote this work.

Of all scholars I must thank, the criticisms of Prof Nico Shvrijer (Vrije University of Amsterdam), Prof Theodore Orlin (University of Syracuse), Dr Amazu Asouzu (Kings College, London), George Okoth-Obbo (UNHCR), Charlotte Ku (Executive Secretary, American Society of International Law), and Dr Edward Kwakwa (Legal Counsel, WIPO, Geneva), went a long way in shaping my ideas. Despite these criticisms, I must, as I should, bear full responsibility for any inaccuracy or shortcomings in the study.

I thank Ms Gillian Couthino of the University of Pretoria Law Library for tirelessly keeping me updated on new publications. The editorial assistance given to me by Mrs Marlene Botha, and the moral support and encouragement from Mr Martin Nsibirwa, are also acknowledged, with thanks.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	i
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms	ix
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1 Background.....	1
1.2 Aims of the Study.....	5
1.3 Conceptual Clarification.....	7
1.3.1 'Humanitarian Intervention'	7
1.3.1.1 'Intervention' Generally	8
1.3.1.2 Who May Intervene?.....	9
1.3.1.3 The Means of Intervention	10
1.3.1.4 The Aim of Intervention: Humanitarian Intervention Distinguished from Related Concepts.....	11
1.3.1.5 Humanitarian Intervention Differs from Intervention with Consent	17
1.3.1.6 Humanitarian Intervention Differs from Individual or Collective Self-defence.....	19
1.3.1.7 Humanitarian Intervention Differs from Peacemaking, Peacekeeping and Peace Enforcement.....	19
1.3.1.8 Statutorily Authorised Humanitarian Intervention versus Humanitarian Intervention under Customary International Law	20
1.3.1.9 Working Definition of 'Humanitarian Intervention'	23
1.3.2 'Intergovernmental Organisations'	25
1.4 Importance of This Study	31
1.5 Work Already Done in This Field	35
1.6 Research Methodology and <i>Modus Operandi</i>	37
1.7 Overview of Chapters	39
1.8 Limitations of The Study	40

Chapter 2: The Legal Basis for Humanitarian Intervention	42
2.1 Introduction	42
2.2 The Sources of International Law	43
2.3 Treaty Law and Humanitarian Intervention	46
2.3.1 The United Nations (UN) Charter.....	46
2.3.2 The Genocide Convention	56
2.3.3 Treaties adopted under the Auspices of African Intergovernmental Organisations.....	59
2.3.3.1 The Constitutive Act of the African Union (AU).....	59
2.3.3.2 The Treaty Establishing the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS)	62
2.3.3.3 The Treaty Establishing the Southern Africa Development Community (SADC)	67
2.3.4 Instances in which Treaties have been Invoked to Justify Humanitarian Intervention.....	73
2.3.4.1 The United Nations (UN) Charter.....	73
2.3.4.2 Treaties Adopted Under the Auspices of African Intergovernmental Organisations.....	87
2.3.4.4 Conclusion.....	102
2.4 A Customary International Law Basis for Humanitarian Intervention?	102
2.4.1 State Practice (<i>usus</i>)	103
2.4.1.1 Syria (1860–1861)	104
2.4.1.2 Cuba (1898).....	104
2.4.1.3 Macedonia (1903–1912).....	105
2.4.1.4 Bohemia and Moravia (1939).....	105
2.4.1.5 Congo (1964).....	107
2.4.4.6 Dominican Republic (1965).....	108
2.4.4.7 Pakistan (1971).....	109
2.4.4.8 Cambodia (Kampuchea) (1978).....	111
2.4.4.9 Uganda (1979).....	114
2.4.4.10 Central African Republic (1979).....	116
2.4.4.11 Kosovo (1999)	117

2.4.4.11	Kosovo (1999)	117
2.4.4.12	Conclusion	120
2.4.2	Opinio Juris	121
2.4.3	The Link Theory, State of Necessity and Distress: Can they offer Customary International Law Basis for Humanitarian Intervention?	123
2.4.4	Is There an Emerging Norm of Custom Regarding Humanitarian Intervention?	126
2.5	Conclusion	129
Chapter 3: Addressing the Legal and Policy Objections to Humanitarian Intervention		
		131
3.1	Introduction	131
3.2	Legal Objections to Humanitarian Intervention	133
3.3	Policy Objections to Humanitarian Intervention	141
3.3.1	Humanitarian Intervention is Prone to Abuse and is Selectively Applied	142
3.3.2	Humanitarian Intervention has Short-Term Complications and Lacks Long-Term Benefits	145
3.3.3	A 'Humanitarian War' is a Contradiction in Terms	146
3.4	The Changing Nature of State Sovereignty	147
3.4.1	Sovereignty Versus Humanity: The Dilemma	147
3.4.2	Factors Contributing to the Erosion of State Sovereignty	150
3.4.2.1	Internalisation of Human Rights	150
3.4.2.2	Globalisation	155
3.4.2.3	The Role of the Media and Information Technology	157
3.4.2.4	Individualisation of International Law and New Actors on the International Plane	157
3.4.2.5	The Changing Nature of Armed Conflict	160
3.4.3	The Effect of the Erosion: Sovereignty as Responsibility	162
3.5	The Concept of 'Public Good' in General International Law-Making	163
3.5.1	International Criminal Law	167
3.5.2	International Humanitarian Law	178

3.5.3	International Environmental Law.....	184
3.5.4	Law of International Watercourses	191
3.5.3	International Law of the Sea	194
3.5.6	What Public Good does Humanitarian Intervention Serve?.....	200
3.6	Conclusion.....	204
Chapter 4: The Past and Future Role of African Intergovernmental		
Organisations in Humanitarian Intervention: Challenges and Prospects		
4.1	Introduction.....	206
4.2	The Subsidiary Role of African Intergovernmental	
	Organisations in the Maintenance of International Peace and	
	Security in Africa: Implications for Humanitarian Intervention.....	208
4.3	The Organisation of African Unity (OAU), Human Rights and	
	Intervention: Challenges and Achievements in Historical	
	Perspective	214
4.3.1	The Evolution and Consolidation of African Unity	215
4.3.2	The OAU, Human Rights and Intervention	220
4.3.2.1	The 1963 OAU Charter	222
4.3.2.2	Examples of OAU's Role in Post-Independence Conflicts.....	223
4.3.2.3	Human Rights Norm-setting Under the OAU	224
4.3.2.4	The 1990 OAU Declaration on the Political and Socio-	
	economic Situation in Africa.....	229
4.3.2.5	The 1993 Mechanism for Conflict Prevention, Management	
	and Resolution.....	232
4.3.2.6	The 1999 OAU Declaration on Security, Stability, Development	
	and Co-operation	236
4.3.2.7	General OAU Norms on Conflict Prevention, Management and	
	Resolution.....	237
4.3.2.8	Conclusion.....	239
4.4	The African Union (AU).....	239
4.4.1	Background.....	239
4.4.2	The AU Act, Human Rights and Humanitarian Intervention.....	240
4.4.2.1	Human Rights Mechanisms and Structures under the AU Act.....	240
4.4.2.2	Prospects for Humanitarian Intervention under the AU Act	247

4.4.2.3	The Protocol Relating to the Establishment of the Peace and Security Council of the AU, 2002	255
4.4.2.4	Conclusion	263
4.5	The Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS) and Humanitarian Intervention: Prospects	263
4.6	The Southern Africa Development Community (SADC) and Humanitarian Intervention: Prospects	265
4.7	The Potential Role of Other African Sub-Regional Organisations in Humanitarian Intervention	267
4.7.1	The Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (COMESA)	268
4.7.2	The Economic Community for Central African States (ECCAS)	269
4.7.3	The Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD)	270
4.7.4	The East African Community (EAC)	270
4.7.5	The Arab Maghreb Union (AMU)	273
4.7.6	Conclusion	274
4.8	Conclusion	274
Chapter 5: Criteria for Humanitarian Intervention and Aspects of Institutional Reform of Intergovernmental Organisations related thereto		
5.1	Introduction	276
5.2	The Need for Criteria for Humanitarian Intervention	277
5.3	Guidelines for Humanitarian Intervention	279
5.3.1	The Primacy of Preventive Measures	280
5.3.2	The Primary Role of the UN Security Council Should be Recognised	282
5.3.3	Which States Should be Allowed to Intervene?	283
5.3.4	When Should Intervention be Allowed?	284
5.3.5	Which Conditions have to be Met during the Intervention?	291
5.3.5.1	Proportionality	291
5.3.5.1	Respect for International Humanitarian Law	293
5.3.5.3	Compliance with the Purposes of the UN	294
5.3.5.4	Compliance with the Purposes of the Intervening Intergovernmental Organisation	295

5.3.6	When and How Must the Humanitarian Intervention End?	295
5.4	Aspects of Institutional Reforms	297
5.4.1	The Security Council.....	297
5.4.2	Reforms within African Intergovernmental Organisations	303
5.4.2.1	The African Union (AU).....	303
5.4.2.2	The Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS)	312
5.4.2.3	The Southern Africa Development Community (SADC)	313
5.4.2.4	Other African Sub-regional Organisations	314
5.5	Conclusion	315
Chapter 6: Conclusions and Recommendations.....		319
6.1	Introduction	319
6.2	Conclusions	320
6.2.1	Conclusion 1: The UN Charter offers a treaty law basis for humanitarian intervention	320
6.2.2	Conclusion 2: The Genocide Convention and certain treaties adopted under the auspices of African intergovernmental organisations also provide a legal basis for humanitarian intervention	321
6.2.3	Conclusion 3: States have in the Past Invoked treaties to Justify Humanitarian Intervention.....	322
6.2.4	Conclusion 4: There is Customary International Law Basis for Humanitarian Intervention.....	323
6.2.5	Conclusion 5: The Legal and Policy Objections to Humanitarian Intervention can be Addressed through a Progressive Interpretation of the UN Charter and by the Inherent Deficiencies in the Objections Themselves	324
6.2.6	Conclusion 6: State Sovereignty in the Classical sense has been Eroded Significantly, and should be interpreted as such	325
6.2.7	The OAU did not play any role in humanitarian intervention, but there are prospects for humanitarian intervention under the auspices of the AU... ..	326
Recommendations		327

6.3.1 Recommendation 1: There is need to expand the meaning of humanitarian intervention.....	
6.3.2 Recommendation 2: The primacy of the UN Security Council should be retained	327
6.3.3 Recommendation 3: The Security Council should be reformed.....	328
6.3.4 Recommendation 4: There is need to define criteria for humanitarian intervention.....	328
6.3.5 Institutions provided for under the AU Protocol should be established	330
Bibliography.....	331
Primary Sources.....	331
Secondary Sources	336
Articles, Essays and Chapters in Books	336
Books.....	346
Newspapers and Magazines	351
Websites	352

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ACUNS	–	Academic Council on the United Nations System
AFRC	–	Armed Forces Revolutionary Council
AMU	–	Arab Maghreb Union
AU	–	African Union
CAT	–	Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
CEDAW	–	Convention on Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
CERD	–	Convention on Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
COMESA	–	Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa
CRC	–	Convention on the Rights of the Child
EAC	–	East African Community
ECCAS	–	Economic Community of Central African States
ECOMOG	–	ECOWAS Ceasefire Monitoring Group
ECOSOC	–	Economic and Social Council
ECOSOCC	–	Economic Social and Cultural Council
ECOWAS	–	Economic Community of West African States
EU	–	European Union
FLS	–	Front Line States
FRY	–	Federal Republic of Yugoslavia
ICC	–	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	–	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	–	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICISS	–	International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty
ICJ	–	International Court of Justice
ICRC	–	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR	–	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

ICTY	–	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IGAD	–	Intergovernmental Authority on Development
IGADD	–	Intergovernmental Authority on Drought and Development
ILA	–	International Law Association
ILC	–	International Law Commission
IMF	–	International Monetary Fund
INTERPOL	–	International Criminal Police Organisation
ISDSC	–	Inter-State Defence and Security Committee
KLA	–	Kosovo Liberation Army
MAI	–	Multilateral Agreement on Investment
MNC	–	Multinational Corporation
MNF	–	Multinational Force
NATO	–	North Atlantic Trade Organisation
NGO	–	Non-Governmental Organisation
OAS	–	Organisation of American States
OAU	–	Organisation of African Unity
PCIJ	–	Permanent Court of International Justice
RPF	–	Rwandan Patriotic Front
RUF	–	Revolutionary United Front
SADC	–	Southern Africa Development Community
SADCC	–	Southern Africa Development Co-ordination Conference
SAPS	–	Structural Adjustment Programmes
UK	–	United Kingdom
UN	–	United Nations
UNAMIR	–	United Nations Assistance Mission in Rwanda
UNCED	–	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNCHE	–	United Nations Conference on the Human Environment
UNCTAD	–	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNIDO	–	United Nations Industrial Organisation
UNITAF	–	Unified Task Force

UNMIH	–	United Nations Mission in Haiti
UNOSOM	–	United Nations Operations in Somalia
UNPROFOR	–	United Nations Protection Force
US	–	United States
WTO	–	World Trade Organisation
WSSD	–	World Summit of Sustainable Development

BACKGROUND

The study was conducted in the context of the globalisation of the world economy and the increasing role of the state in the economy. The study was also influenced by the growing interest in the role of the state in the economy and the increasing role of the state in the economy.

The study was conducted in the context of the globalisation of the world economy and the increasing role of the state in the economy. The study was also influenced by the growing interest in the role of the state in the economy and the increasing role of the state in the economy.