A historical study of the polity of the gay and lesbian
ordination and/or installation, and same-gender marriage
debates in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) and its
predecessor churches

by

Roché Francois Vermaak

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

Philosophiae Doctor

in the Faculty of Theology, University of Pretoria

in the subject

Church History and Polity

Promoter: Professor G A Duncan

June 2009

© University of Pretoria
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Words</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terminology and Abbreviations</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Chronology of American Presbyterianism</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaration</td>
<td>xviii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dedication</td>
<td>xviii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 1</strong> Introduction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Aim of the Study</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Reason for the Study</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Hypothesis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Motivation and Goal</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Research Methodology</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 Source Review</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 Study Sections</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 History of the PC(USA)</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9 Terminology</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10 Governing and Ordination Practices in the PC(USA)</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.1 Governing in the PC(USA)</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.2 The Ordination and/or Installation of Deacons and Elders</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.3 The Ordination and/or Installation of Ministers of the Word and Sacrament</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.11 Summary</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 2</strong> The Historic Theological Controversies within the Presbyterian Church</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Introduction</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 The American Worldview Redefined</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 The Rights and Responsibilities of Governing Bodies</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 The <em>Adopting Act of 1729</em></td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 The Great Awakening and the Split in 1741</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 The Formation of a General Assembly</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7 The New School-Old School Schism in the 1830s</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8 The Briggs Case</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9 The Revision of the Westminster Confession of Faith</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.10 The “Five Points or Fundamentals” of 1910</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.11 The Fundamentalist-Modernist Controversy in the 1920s</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.12 Membership Loss</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.13 The Interpretation of Scripture Policies</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.14 Reunions and Schisms</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.15 Latitude in Matters of Doctrine</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.16 Summary</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 3  The History of the Polity of the Gay and Lesbian Ordination and/or Installation Debate in the United Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A. and the Presbyterian Church in the U.S. 1970 - 1983

3.1 Introduction 56
3.2.1 Summary 60
3.3 The 182nd General Assembly of the UPCUSA in 1970 60
3.3.1 Summary 64
3.4 The GAPJC of the UPCUSA Ruling in Maxwell v. Pittsburgh Presbytery. Remedial Case 1 in 1974 64
3.4.1 Summary 67
3.5 The 187th General Assembly of the UPCUSA in 1975 68
3.6 The 188th General Assembly of the UPCUSA in 1976 71
3.6.1 Overtures Requesting Definitive Guidance on the Ordination of an Avowed Homosexual 71
3.6.2 Overture on Affirming the Right of Presbyteries to Determine Whom They Ordain 72
3.6.3 Overture on Declaring a Biblical Position regarding Homosexuality 72
3.6.4 Report of the Assembly Committee on Bills and Overtures 72
3.6.5 Summary 74
3.7 The 116th General Assembly of the PCUS in 1976 74
3.8 The 189th General Assembly of the UPCUSA in 1977 76
3.9.1 Summary 78
3.10 The 117th General Assembly of the PCUS in 1977 78
3.11 The 118th General Assembly of the PCUS in 1978 83
3.12 The 190th General Assembly of the UPCUSA in 1978 83
3.12.1 The Report, The Church and Homosexuality 84
3.12.2 Suggested Actions 85
3.12.3 The Church and Homosexuality: Policy Statements and Recommendations of the General Assembly 89
3.12.3.1 Introduction 89
3.12.3.2 Homosexuality within a Theological Context 89
3.12.3.3 Scripture and Homosexuality 91
3.12.3.4 Church Membership 94
3.12.3.5 Ordination 95
3.12.3.6 Pluralism and Unity in the Church 95
3.12.3.7 Ministry and Mission 96
3.12.3.8 Decriminalisation and Civil Rights 97
3.12.3.9 The “Definitive Guidance” by the General Assembly 98
3.12.4 Amendment L of the UPCUSA in 1978 100
3.12.5 Report from the Committee on Pluralism 101
3.12.6 Summary 102
3.13 The 119th General Assembly of the PCUS in 1979 103
3.14 The 1978 and 1979 “Definitive Guidance” and Authoritative Interpretation 104
3.15 The 191st General Assembly of the UPCUSA in 1979 105
3.16 The 192nd General Assembly of the UPCUSA in 1980 106
3.17 The 120th General Assembly of the PCUS in 1980 107
3.18.1 Summary 112
3.19 The 193rd General Assembly of the UPCUSA in 1981 112
3.20 The 194th General Assembly of the UPCUSA in 1982 113
3.20.1 “Definitive Guidance” 113
3.20.2 The Report of the Task Force on Biblical Authority and Interpretation 114
3.21 The GAPJC of the PCUS Ruling in *Hambrick v. PJC of the Synod of North Carolina*. Complaint 1 in 1982 114
3.21.1 Summary 115
3.22 Summary of the Ordination Standards in 1983 116

**CHAPTER 4** Special Organisations

4.1 Introduction 118
4.2 The History of Special Organisations 118
4.3 G-9.0600, the *Book of Order* 119
4.4 The Presbyterian Lay Committee 123
4.5 The Witherspoon Society 124
4.6 More Light Presbyterians 124
4.7 Presbyterians for Renewal 124
4.8 That All May Freely Serve 125
4.9 Showers of Stoles Project 126
4.10 OnebyOne 126
4.11 The Presbyterian Coalition 126
4.12 The Covenant Network of Presbyterians 127
4.13 Presbyterian Parents of Gays and Lesbians 128
4.14 Summary 128

**CHAPTER 5** The History of the Polity of the Gay and Lesbian Ordination and/or Installation, and Same-Gender Blessing and Marriage Debates in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) 1983 - 2009

5.1 Introduction 129
5.2 The 195th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1983 129
5.2.1 Changes in the *Book of Order* 129
5.2.2 The Report, *Historic Principles, Conscience, and Church Government* 132
5.2.2.1 The Historic Principles of Presbyterianism 132
5.2.2.1.1 Preliminary Principles 133
5.2.2.1.2 The *Adopting Act of 1729* 134
5.2.2.1.3 The Radical Principles 136
5.2.2.1.4 Recommendations 138
5.2.3 The Document, *Presbyterian Understanding and Use of Holy Scripture* 138
5.2.4 Summary 139
5.3 The 196th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1984

5.4 The GAPJC Ruling in Union Presbyterian Church of Blasdell, et al. v. Presbytery of Western New York. Remedial Case 197-9 in 1985

5.4.1 Summary

5.5 The GAPJC Ruling in Simmons, et al. v. Presbytery of Suwannee. Remedial Case 197-4 in 1985

5.5.1 Summary

5.6 The 197th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1985

5.7 The 198th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1986

5.7.1 The Overture on “Fidelity in Marriage and Celibacy in Singleness”

5.7.2 Overtures on Ordination Standards

5.7.3 Overture on Amending the Book of Order Regarding Interpretations of the General Assembly and the GAPJC

5.7.4 Overture on Revoking the Status of Presbyterians for Lesbian and Gay Concerns

5.7.5 The Presbyterian Lay Committee

5.7.6 Summary

5.8 The 199th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1987

5.8.1 Amending the Book of Order Regarding Interpretations of the General Assembly and the GAPJC

5.8.2 Clarification on Conflict between “Definitive Guidance” and G-5.0103 & G-5.0202

5.8.3 The 1978 “Definitive Guidance” and Church Membership

5.8.4 Formation of a Special Committee on Human Sexuality

5.8.5 Overture on Elimination of Laws Governing Private Sexual Behaviour of Consenting Adults

5.8.6 Overtures on Sexual Responsibility

5.8.7 The Presbyterian Lay Committee

5.8.8 Summary

5.9 The 200th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1988

5.9.1 Overture on the Power of Ordaining Bodies

5.9.2 Overture on Adding Members to the Special Committee on Human Sexuality

5.9.3 The Report of the Task Force on Theological Pluralism, Is Christ Divided?

5.9.4 The Presbyterian Lay Committee

5.9.5 Summary

5.10 The 201st General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1989

5.10.1 Amending G-4.0403 to Grant Governing Bodies Discretionary Power to Ordain Church Officers without Regard to Sexual Orientation

5.10.2 The Presbyterian Lay Committee

5.10.3 Summary

5.11 The 202nd General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1990

5.11.1 Overture on Affirming the Church’s Historical Stand against Ordination of Self-avowed Practicing Homosexuals

5.11.2 Presbyterians for Lesbian and Gay Concerns

5.11.3 Special Organisations and G-9.0600-.0601

5.11.4 Summary

5.12 The 203rd General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1991

5.12.1 Same-Gender Marriage
5.12.2.1 The Majority Report 178
5.12.2.2 The Minority Report 179
5.12.3 The Presbyterian Lay Committee 181
5.12.4 Summary 181
5.13 The 204th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1992 184
5.13.1 Overture on Amending G-6.0106 184
5.14.1 Summary 187
5.15.1 Summary 192
5.16 The GAPJC Ruling in *Presbytery of West Jersey v. Synod of the Northeast*. Remedial Case 205-15 in 1993 193
5.16.1 Summary 195
5.17 The 205th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1993 196
5.17.1 Overtures on Amending W-4.9001 196
5.17.2 Overture on the Unacceptability of Practicing Homosexual Leaders 197
5.17.3 Overture on Removing Impediments Placed by the “Definitive Guidance” 198
5.17.4 The ACC Response to Overtures on “Definitive Guidance,” Which Became Authoritative Interpretation 199
5.17.5 Overtures on G-6.0106 201
5.17.6 Overture on Amending D-8.1600 to Provide for Accountability of the GAPJC to the General Assembly 202
5.17.7 The Representative Committee on Human Sexuality 204
5.17.8 Summary 204
5.18 The GAPJC Ruling in *Hope Presbyterian Church v. Central Presbyterian Church*. Remedial Case 206-3 in 1993 205
5.18.1 Summary 209
5.19 The 206th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1994 210
5.19.1 Overture on Clarifying the Nature of the “Definitive Guidance” Regarding Ordination 210
5.19.2 Overture on Amending the GAPJC Ruling in *Sallade, et al. v. Presbytery of Genesee Valley* 211
5.19.3 Overture on Amending W-4.9001 Regarding Same-Gender Unions 212
5.19.4 Overtures on Amending G-6.0106 214
5.19.5 Overture on Correcting an Erroneous Action by the GAPJC 216
5.19.6 Overture on Amending D-8.1600 to Provide for Accountability of the GAPJC to the General Assembly 217
5.19.7 Overture on Declaring Paragraph 14 of 1978 an Authoritative Interpretation 218
5.19.8 Request for an Interpretation of G-14.0203 and the Ordination of Homosexuals 219
5.19.9 The Presbyterian Lay Committee 220
5.19.10 Summary 221
5.20 The GAPJC Ruling in *Session of Mount Auburn Presbyterian Church v. Presbytery of Cincinnati*. Remedial Case 207-8 in 1995 222
5.20.1 Summary 224
5.21  The 207th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1995  224
5.22  The GAPJC Ruling in *Session of Central Presbyterian Church of Huntington, NY v. Presbytery of Long Island*. Remedial Case 208-4 in 1995  224
5.22.1  Summary  228
5.23  The 208th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1996  230
5.23.1  Guidance from the ACC  230
5.23.2  Overture on Amending G-6.0106  232
5.23.3  A Critical Evaluation of G-6.0106b  236
5.23.3.1  What does “historic confessional standards of the church” mean?  237
5.23.3.2  What does “chastity in singleness” mean?  238
5.23.3.3  What does “self-acknowledged practice” mean?  242
5.23.3.4  What does “practice” mean?  243
5.23.3.5  What does “refusing to repent” mean?  244
5.23.3.6  What does “sin” mean?  245
5.23.3.7  What does “shall not be ordained and/or installed” mean?  248
5.23.3.8  Why is “obedience to Scripture and conformity to the historical confessional standards” and not “obedience to Christ” required?  248
5.23.4  Special Organisations and Accountability  249
5.23.5  Resolution on Civil Rights for Same-Gender Partners  249
5.23.6  Summary  250
5.24  The 209th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1997  251
5.24.1  Overture on Amending G-6.0106b  252
5.24.1.1  Amendment A of 1997  254
5.24.2  Overture on Determining the Essential Tenets  256
5.24.3  Overture on Setting Aside the 1978 “Definitive Guidance” and 1993 Authoritative Interpretation  256
5.24.4  Overture on Amending Procedures to Interpret and Amend the Constitution  257
5.24.5  Overture on Amending the Preface of the Directory for Worship  258
5.24.6  Overture on a New Translation of the Heidelberg Catechism  259
5.24.7  Summary  262
5.25  The PJC of the Synod of the Covenant Ruling in *Riefle v. Session of John Knox Presbyterian Church*. Remedial Case 96-1 in 1997  263
5.25.1  Summary  265
5.26  The 210th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1998  266
5.26.1  Overture Not to Exclude Any Person on the Basis of That Person’s Class or Category  266
5.26.2  Overtures on Amending G-13.0103r  267
5.26.3  Overture on a More Truthful and Accurate Translation of the Heidelberg Catechism  268
5.26.4  The Special Committee on Relationships of Accountability between the PC(USA) and Presbyterian Groups  268
5.26.5  Summary  269
5.27  The GAPJC Ruling in *Wier v. Session of Second Presbyterian Church of Fort Lauderdale, FL*. Remedial Case 211-2 in 1998  269
5.27.1  Summary  272
5.28  The 211th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 1999  272
5.28.1  The Women of Faith Award and Rev. Dr. J A Spahr  273
5.28.2  Overtures on G-6.0106b  273
5.43 The GAPJC Ruling in *Presbyterian Church (U.S.A) by the Presbytery of Cincinnati v. Van Kuiken*. Disciplinary Case 216-16 in 2004

5.43.1 Summary

5.44 The 216th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 2004

5.44.1 Overtures on Essentials

5.44.2 Overtures on G-6.0106b

5.44.3 Recognising Same-Gender Civil Marriages

5.44.4 Summary

5.45 The Investigating Committee of National Capital Presbytery in *Jensen v. Andrews*. Disciplinary Complaint in 2004

5.46 The Ordination of Ms. E Marlow in 2005


5.48 The GAPJC Ruling in *Williamson v. Presbytery of Western North Carolina*. Remedial Case 217-7 in 2005

5.48.1 Summary

5.49 The 217th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 2006

5.49.1 The 2005 Peace, Unity, and Purity Report of the Theological Task Force

5.49.2 Overtures on G-6.0106b

5.49.3 Same-Gender Unions and Marriages

5.49.4 Summary

5.50 The New Wineskins Association of Churches


5.51.1 Summary

5.52 The GAPJC Ruling in *Stewart v. Mission Presbytery*. Disciplinary Case 218-07 in 2007

5.52.1 Summary

5.53 The PJC of the Synod of the Pacific Ruling in *Session of Davis Community Church, et al. v. Sacramento Presbytery*. Remedial Case 06-03 in 2007

5.53.1 Summary

5.54 The Presbytery of Baltimore and Rev. D Stroud

5.55 Scruples Declared over G-6.0106b in 2007-2008

5.55.1 Ms. Lisa Larges

5.55.2 Dr. Paul Capetz

5.55.3 Mr. Scott Anderson

5.55.4 Summary


5.56.1 Summary


5.57.1 Summary


5.58.1 Summary

5.59 The GAPJC Ruling in *Spahr v. Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) through*
the Presbytery of Redwoods. Disciplinary Case 218-12 in 2008

5.59.1 Summary

5.60 The 218th General Assembly of the PC(USA) in 2008

5.60.1 Overture on Authoritative Interpretation of G-6.0108

5.60.2 Overtures on Deleting and/or Amending G-6.0106b and Issuing a New Authoritative Interpretation

5.60.3 Overture on Revising the Heidelberg Catechism

5.60.4 Overture on Amending W-4.9000 Regarding the Definition of Marriage

5.60.5 Overture on Equal Rights of Same-Gender Partners

5.60.6 Summary


5.61.1 Summary


5.64 The GAPJC ruling in Bierschwale, et al. v. Presbytery of Twin Cities Area. Remedial Case 219-08 in 2009

5.64.1 Summary

5.65 The PJC of the Synod of the Pacific Ruling in Naegeli, et al v. Presbytery of San Francisco. Remedial Case 08-01 in 2009

5.65.1 Summary


5.67 Summary of the PC(USA) Polity from 1983 - 2009

5.67.1 The Polity on the Ordination and/or Installation of Partnered Gay and Lesbian Christians

5.67.2 The Polity on Same-Gender Blessings and Marriages

CHAPTER 6 Summary, Alternatives, Conclusions, and Recommendations

6.1 Summary of the Gay and Lesbian Ordination and/or Installation Policy in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.)

6.2 Summary of the Same-Gender Blessing and Marriage Policy in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.)

6.3 Alternatives

6.3.1 Theology versus Polity

6.3.2 Imbalance of Voting Members and Representation at Presbytery

6.4 Conclusions

6.5 Recommendations

BIBLIOGRAPHY
SUMMARY

Since the 1970s, the Presbyterian Church in the United States has dealt with its most divisive issue ever: same-gender relationships. Two polity debates have occurred simultaneously: 1) The ordination and/or installation of partnered gay and lesbian Christians as church officers, i.e. deacons, elders, and ministers of the Word and Sacrament; 2) The permissibility of ministers to perform and officers to participate in same-gender blessings and marriages, both liturgical and civil.

This period is characterised by an absence of theological discussion and formulation of biblical and/or theological statements. Rather, the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.), and its predecessor churches, the United Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A. and Presbyterian Church in the U.S., all used polity to guide them. This is in line with the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, which decided in 1927 to solve controversial theological issues, not through theological discussion, but through polity.

Since 1978, various polity processes have guided and shaped the two debates to form the current policies: 1) Presbyteries send overtures to General Assemblies, which, in turn issue “definitive guidance” statements and Authoritative Interpretations; 2) General Assembly Permanent Judicial Commissions (GAPJC) issue Authoritative Interpretations in both remedial and disciplinary cases, after complaints have moved through the ecclesiastical courts at Presbytery and/or synod level; 3) The 173 Presbyteries vote on amendments, approved by General Assemblies, to amend the Book of Order. The most notable amendment was the addition of G-6.0106b in 1997.

This writer argues that G-6.0106b in the Book of Order, requiring “fidelity within the covenant of marriage between a man and a woman, or chastity in singleness,” is a form of subscription, and, therefore, contrary to the entire history of the Presbyterian Church, which has rejected all forms of subscriptionism since 1706. Subscription to five standards briefly existed from 1910-1925, and was rejected by the 1926 and 1927 General Assemblies of the PCUSA. One ordination standard is now elevated above all other standards and, since 1997, there have been three attempts to rid the Book of Order of this requirement.

W-4.9001 and G-6.0106b in the Book of Order reflect the changes made in the Westminster Confession of Faith in the 1950s, allowing for the divorce and remarriage of officers; namely marriage is between a man and a woman. Yet, it is used to exclude partnered gay and lesbian Christians from ordination and/or installation, and from participating in same-gender liturgical marriages.

The debates have created camps of conservatives, centrists, and liberals, which consistently threaten the peace, unity, and purity of the church. Thousands of evangelicals and conservatives, opposed to partnered gay and lesbian officers, have left the denomination for the Evangelical Presbyterian Church. Additionally, Special Organisations, which are not accountable to the denomination, have added to the tension and created intolerance of others’ views.
KEY WORDS

Adopting Act of 1729; Authoritative Interpretation; Book of Order; Constitution; “definitive guidance;” G-6.0106b and G-6.0108 in the Book of Order; gay and lesbian; General Assembly; ordination and/or installation; Permanent Judicial Commission; 2005 Peace, Unity and Purity Report; Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.); same-gender unions, blessings, ceremonies, and marriages; sexual orientation; Special Commission of 1925; The Book of Confessions.
ABREVIATIONS

Old Testament

Gn   Ex   Lv   Nm   Dt   Jos   Jdg   Rt   1 Sm   2 Sm   1 Ki
2 Ki  1 Chr  2 Chr  Ezr  Neh  Es  Job  Ps  Pr  Ec  Can
Is   Jr   Lm   Ezek  Dn   Hs   Jl   Am   Ob   Jnh   Mi
Nah  Hab  Zph  Hg  Zch  Ml

New Testament

Mt   Mk   Lk   Jn   Ac   Rm   1 Cor   2 Cor   Gl   Eph   Phlp
Col  1 Th  2 Th  1 Tm  2 Tm  Tt  Phlm  Heb  Ja  1 Pt   2 Pt
1 Jn  2 Jn  3 Jn  Jude  Rv

Bible Translations

NEB   - New English Bible
RSV   - Revised Standard Version

Denominations

DRC   - Dutch Reformed Church in South Africa
EPC   - Evangelical Presbyterian Church
NWAC  - New Wineskin Association of Churches
PCA   - Presbyterian Church in America
PCUS  - Presbyterian Church in the U.S.
PCUSA - Presbyterian Church in the United States of America
PC(USA) - Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.)
RCA  - Reformed Church in America
UPCUSA - United Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A.
UPCNA - United Presbyterian Church in North America
ACBO  - Assembly Committee on Bills and Overtures of the PC(USA)
ACBOO - Assembly Committee on the Book of Order of the PC(USA)
ACC   - Advisory Committee on the Constitution of the PC(USA)
ACCM  - Assembly Committee on Candidacy and Ministry of the PC(USA)
ACCOM - Assembly Committee on Church Orders and Ministry of the PC(USA)
ACDW  - Advisory Council on Discipleship and Worship of the PC(USA)
ACOS  - Assembly Committee on Ordination and Human Sexuality of the PC(USA)
ACPPUC- Assembly Committee on Ordination Standards of the PC(USA)
ACSWP - Advisory Committee on Social Witness Policy of the PC(USA)
AI    - Authoritative Interpretation
ARC   - Administrative Review Commission
CCM   - Confessing Church Movement
Church officers - Deacons, elders, ministers of the Word and Sacrament
CN    - Covenant Network of Presbyterians
COM   - Committee on Ministry of a presbytery
COMP  - Committee on Ministry Preparation of a presbytery (now CPM)
COVC  - Church Orders and Vocation Committee of the PC(USA)
CPC   - Committee on Pluralism and Conflict of the PC(USA)
CPM   - Committee on Preparation for Ministry of a presbytery
EAC   - Ecclesiastical Affairs Committee of the PC(USA)
GA    - General Assembly of the PC(USA)
GAC   - General Assembly Council of the PC(USA)
GAMC  - General Assembly Mission Council of the PC(USA)
GAPJC - Permanent Judicial Commission of the General Assembly
GLBT  - Gay, Lesbian, Bisexual, and Transgender Persons
Minutes - Minutes of the General Assembly, Part 1: Journal
MLP  - More Light Presbyterians
NWA   - New Wineskins Association
OGA   - The Office of the General Assembly of the PC(USA)
Overture - A proposed amendment to the Constitution by a presbytery
PFR   - Presbyterians for Renewal
PJC   - Permanent Judicial Commission
PLC   - Presbyterian Lay Committee
PLGC  - Presbyterians for Lesbian and Gay Concerns
PPJC  - Presbytery Permanent Judicial Commission of the PC(USA)
PPR   - Presbyterian Panel Report
RCHS  - Representative Committee on Human Sexuality of the PC(USA)
SARC  - Special Administrative Review Committee
SOSP  - The Shower of Stoles Project
SPJC  - Synod Permanent Judicial Commission of the PC(USA)
TAMFS - That All May Freely Serve
TTF   - Theological Task Force
TWMU - Theology and Worship Ministry Unit of the PC(USA)
A Chronology of American Presbyterianism

1640  The first Presbyterian congregation in the USA is organised.
1708  The first American presbytery is formed. Also known as the Presbytery or the General presbytery.
1716  The first American Synod is organised in Philadelphia.
1729  The *Adopting Act of 1729* distinguishes between essential and nonessential components of the Westminster Standards.
1736  The subscriptionist – anti-revivalist coalition rescinds the *Adopting Act of 1729* and imposes strict subscription on all members of the Synod.
1738  The New Lights establish the New Brunswick Presbytery.
1741  Schism between New Side and Old Side Presbyterians over the legitimacy of the Great Awakening.
1745  The New York Presbytery withdraws from the Synod of Philadelphia, and with revival party, forms the Synod of New York.
1758  The Synod of New York (New Side) and Synod of Philadelphia (Old Side) reunite under *Plan of Union*.
1789  The first General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America (PCUSA), with four synods, is held in Philadelphia.
1801  The *Plan of Union* is adopted, uniting Presbyterians and Congregationalists.
1837  Old School and New School factions divide at the PCUSA General Assembly; the 1801 *Plan of Union* is declared unconstitutional.
1857  Southern New School Presbyterians form the United Synod of the South or United Synod of the PCUSA.
1858  The Associate Reformed Church and the Associate Church unite to form the United Presbyterian Church in North America (UPCNA).
1861  The Old School’s Southern section splits off to form the Presbyterian Church in the Confederate States of America (PCCSA).
1864  The PCCSA merges with the United Synod of the South to form the Presbyterian Church in the United States (PCUS).
1869  The Old and New School General Assemblies reunite in Pittsburgh.
1892  In response to the Briggs trial, the General Assembly adopts language defending the “inerrancy” of Scripture.
1903  The PCUSA amends the Westminster Confession of Faith.
1906  The majority of Cumberland Presbyterian churches reunite with the PCUSA, ending a division of nearly 100 years.
1910  The PCUSA General Assembly adopts the “five points” of fundamentalism.
1924  The Auburn Affirmation is published.
1925  The PCUSA General Assembly appoints the Special Commission of 15 or Swearingen Commission, due to the fundamentalist-modernist controversy.
1927  The final report of the Special Commission of 1925 is approved and the “five points” are revoked. Two key principles from the *Adopting Act of 1729* are affirmed: the right of the ordaining body to determine the fitness of a candidate is paramount, and neither the General Assembly nor the ordaining body can erect essential and necessary articles which are paraphrases of the Confessions or Scripture.
1929  The PCUSA General Assembly reorganises Princeton Seminary, ending the control of the fundamentalists. Machen begins rival Westminster Seminary in Philadelphia.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1936</td>
<td>Machen and others form the Presbyterian Church in America, which becomes the Orthodox Presbyterian Church in 1939</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1958</td>
<td>The United Presbyterian Church in North America (UPCNA) and the PCUSA merge to form the United Presbyterian Church in the United States of America (UPCUSA).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972</td>
<td>Conservatives withdraw from the PCUS to form the Presbyterian Church in America (PCA).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>Congregations from the UPCUSA and the PCUS form the Evangelical Presbyterian Church (EPC).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>The UPCUSA and the PCUS reunite to form the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) (PC(USA)) and heal the split from 1861.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am especially grateful to the following persons and institutions for various kinds of assistance and encouragement I received before and during this study:

My professors at the Faculty of Theology at the University of Pretoria, for my theological training and shaping my theology;
Brentwood Presbyterian Church, for being a welcoming and inclusive congregation, and the study time and financial resources provided to complete this study. You will always hold a special place in my life;
The PC(USA), my new spiritual home. May we find a complementary solution to polity to bridge our theological differences;
The University of Pretoria, for financial assistance to complete my current and earlier degrees. I will always be a TUKKIE living in the United States;
Jacob Meiring, for our special and lasting friendship;
Reverends Lisa Bove, Sue Fisher, and Dan Smith, and Mrs. Renna Killen for your loving friendship and support. Thank you for stretching my understanding of this complex subject. I applaud you for living out your calling as church officers and members in the face of homophobia, heterosexism, injustice, and fear;
Countless others who have cured me of the homophobia and ignorance with which I was raised;
Prof. Dr. Graham Duncan, my promoter, thank you for investing in me; for your guidance. This study has been the most rewarding experience of my academic and professional career;
Prof. Dr. Jack Rogers, for answering difficult polity questions;
Suzie Crisp, for proofreading this document and for your friendship;
Kobie Vermaak, my wife and fellow theologian, for your total support.
Cara and Leo Vermaak, my children, for the sacrifices you made during the countless hours of this study. You are the lights of my life;
God in Christ, who has shown me a more inclusive way of being Christian. I dedicate this study to you, that through it others might also come to a more welcoming attitude toward all whom you call to service.
DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis, *A historical study of the polity of the gay and lesbian ordination and/or installation, and same-gender marriage debates in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) and its predecessor churches*, which I hereby submit for the degree Philosophiae Doctor at the University of Pretoria, is my own work and has not been submitted by me for a degree at this or any other tertiary institution.

_________________________     _________________
Roché F Vermaak      June 2009
Student No. 86392566

DEDICATION

Dedicated to Kobie Vermaak, my wife and mother of our children, friend and theologian.