THE EFFECT OF A TAX ON COAL IN SOUTH AFRICA: A CGE ANALYSIS

by

THEUNIS JACOBUS DE WET

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

PhD (Economics)

in the

FACULTY OF ECONOMICS AND MANAGEMENT SCIENCES

at the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

PRETORIA OCTOBER 2003
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

During this study I have benefited from the inputs of a number of people and institutions. I wish to thank:

Professor Jan van Heerden who, as my study leader, provided me with direction and continued support throughout the study. I have benefited from his keen interest in CGE modelling and his desire to develop the CGE modelling capacity at the Department of Economics.

In the course of this study, I have been fortunate to meet Professor Mark Horridge of the Centre of Policy Studies in the University of Monash. I benefited from his assistance in the constructing of a CGE model and also his knowledge of CGE modelling. I appreciated his willingness to assist, and his interest in my studies.

My wife, Tessa, who approached this study with enthusiasm and support – this was truly a team effort! Apart from the infrastructure and moral support, I am also thankful for her assistance with the first round of proof reading of the document.

The study served to, once again, highlight the support that I have received from my family throughout my lifetime. Although each member played a unique part in this venture, I thank my mother in particular. For her example, her unwavering support and her complete disregard for herself with matters regarding her sons.

I am grateful for the funding that I have received from the Mellon Foundation. The funding assisted me in visiting the Centre of Policy Studies in Melbourne and a number of conferences.

I acknowledge that all of this, for which I am thankful, are blessing from God. All honour to Him.

Theuns De Wet
The Effect of a Tax on Coal in South Africa: A CGE Analysis

Probably the biggest concern for South African policy makers is the high level of unemployment that persists in the economy. There is thus an urgent need for policies that could increase employment growth. Any policy that could address these issues, would undoubtedly find favour with policy makers.

Despite high levels of unemployment and social imbalances, there are also concerns about South Africa’s environmental management. It seems as if the debate of sustainable development, that has held the attention of policy makers in developed regions of the world for the past decade, has finally caught up with South Africa. One of the concerns that needs to be addressed is the relatively high level of CO₂ emissions created by economic activity in South Africa.

Given the issues discussed above, the purpose of this study is to determine whether policy makers in South Africa could introduce environmental taxation in the form of an intermediate tax on coal, without aggravating the problems of unemployment and the skew welfare distribution. The literature pertaining to the “double dividend” and the “Porter Hypothesis” motivates the possibility of achieving this result.

The results from this study indicate that South African policy makers should approach the problem of controlling the demand for coal with caution. It is shown that any policy that attempts to increase the price of coal would achieve very little environmental benefit. Although such a tax could serve as an attractive source of revenue for the government, the socio-economic benefits achieved through recycling of the tax would also be small and it is debatable whether they would warrant the administration and political debate that would accompany them.

It is therefore evident that policy makers will have to invest in research and development programs that will result in a reduction in the use of coal within the production process. Results from policy simulations have indicated that successful implementation of such an investment would not only reduce CO₂ emissions significantly, but could also increase economic growth, welfare and employment.
# List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>v i</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

# List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>viii</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 1. Introduction and Background

1.1 Introduction  

1.2 Objective of the study  

1.3 Outline of the study  

## 2. The Use of Coal and Carbon Pollution

2.1 Introduction  

2.2 An introduction to the South African coal industry  

2.3 The structure of the coal industry  

2.3.1 Coal production  

2.3.2 Coal consumption and forward linkages  

2.4 Coal consumption and the environment  

2.5 Economic incentives for reduction of carbon pollution  

2.6 Conclusion  

## 3. The South African Labour Market

3.1 Introduction  

3.2 South African unemployment: a description of the market  

3.3 South African unemployment: voluntary or involuntary?  

3.4 South African unemployment: the reasons  

3.5 South African unemployment: suggested solutions  

3.6 Conclusion  

## 4. The Double Dividend Hypothesis

4.1 Introduction  

4.2 Defining a double dividend  

4.2.1 The weak form of the double dividend  

4.2.2 The intermediate and strong forms of the double dividend  

4.3 The double dividend under partial equilibrium analysis  

4.4 The double dividend under general equilibrium analysis  

4.5 Requirements for attaining the second dividend
8 A CGE MODEL FOR SOUTH AFRICA: DATA BASE AND ELASTICITIES

8.1 Introduction

8.2 Description of the South African database that will be used for the model

8.3 Elasticities required for a CGE model of the South African economy

8.4 Conclusion

9 MODEL CLOSURES AND POLICY SHOCKS

9.1 Introduction

9.2 A suggested short-run closure for performing revenue neutral coal tax shocks on the South African economy

9.3 The proposed short-run policy shocks

9.4 A suggested long-run closure for performing revenue neutral coal tax shocks on the South African economy

9.5 The proposed long-run policy shocks

9.6 Conclusion

10 SHORT-RUN POLICY SIMULATION RESULTS

10.1 Introduction

10.2 A fifty percent tax on coal

10.2.1 Macroeconomic results

10.2.2 The terms of trade

10.2.3 Consumption

10.2.4 The effect on the demand for coal

10.2.5 Industry-specific results

10.3 A fifty percent tax on coal and lump sum transfer to low income households

10.3.1 Macroeconomic results

10.3.2 The terms of trade

10.3.3 Consumption

10.3.4 The effect on the demand for coal

10.3.5 Industry-specific results

10.4 A fifty percent tax on coal and decrease in the intermediate taxation of food and agricultural products
13 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS  168
13.1 Introduction  168
13.2 The dual challenge of reducing CO2 emissions and solving the unemployment problem  169
13.3 The theories behind environmental taxation and unemployment  170
13.4 A general equilibrium model of the South African economy  171
13.5 Policy proposals and results  171
13.6 Conclusions and suggestions for further research  172

REFERENCES  174

APPENDICES

1 Description of the data base used in the study  A1
2 Econometric results for elasticity estimation  A2
3 A stylised macro model useful for analysing results from a CGE model such as ORANI  A3
Table 2.1 Production statistics for the world’s coal producing countries  7
Table 2.2 Accounting for the natural environment  14
Table 5.1 Overview of conclusions on induced innovation and the “win – win” hypothesis  65
Table 8.1 Elasticity of substitution between capital and labour in the South African economy  107
Table 8.2 Estimated Armington elasticities for 45 South African industries  111
Table 8.3 Household expenditure elasticities for 39 commodities distinguished within a CGE model for SA  113
Table 10.1 The estimated macroeconomic effects of imposing a 50 percent tax on the intermediate use of coal  126
Table 10.2 Changes in real consumption and consumer price baskets of household groups  129
Table 10.3 Change in intermediate-, household and export demand in selected industries  131
Table 10.4 The estimated macroeconomic effect of a 50% tax on coal and a lump-sum transfer to low-income households  132
Table 10.5 Change in household consumption and consumer prices  133
Table 10.6 Change in intermediate-, household, and export demand for selected industries (coal-intensive)  135
Table 10.7 Change in intermediate-, household and export demand for selected industries  136
Table 10.8 The estimated macroeconomic effects of imposing a revenue-neutral tax on the South African economy  137
Table 10.9 Change in household consumption and consumer prices  139
Table 10.10 Change in intermediate, household and export demand in selected industries  140
Table 10.11 Change in employment: policy “winners and losers”  141
Table 10.12 A comparison of the short-run macroeconomic results  142
Table 11.1 The estimated long-run macroeconomic effects of imposing a 50% tax on the intermediate use of coal  146
Table 11.2 Changes in real consumption and consumer price baskets
Table 11.3 The change in the demand components for selected industries

Table 11.4 The policy simulation effect on the macroeconomic aggregates in the South African economy

Table 11.5 Change in real consumption and consumer price baskets of household groups

Table 11.6 Tax and technological innovation: the effect on selected macroeconomic aggregates

Table 11.7 Tax and technological innovation: the effect on the economy

Table 12.1 The change in the domestic demand for coal in the short-run and the long run
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1 South African coal production (millions of tonnes) 1990-2000 8
Figure 2.2 South African coal consumption 2000 10
Figure 2.3 A comparison of total CO2 emissions (million tonnes) 2002 12
Figure 3.1 Unemployment rates in South Africa 1993-1999 20
Figure 3.2 Unemployment rates by race in South Africa 1994 20
Figure 3.3 Measures of well-being for the unemployed, informally and formally employed (% of each sector) 22
Figure 4.1 Partial equilibrium analysis of the effect of an environmental tax on the welfare of society 34
Figure 5.1 An analysis of welfare benefits of induced technological innovation 62
Figure 8.1 South Africa’s share of total world exports in 9 broad commodity categories 115
Figure 9.1 A comparison between the consumption expenditure patterns of the poorest and the richest households 120
Figure 9.2 Employment of unskilled labour in South African industries 121
Figure 10.1 The increase in the exports of a select number of industries 127
Figure 10.2 A comparison of the lowest and the highest income group expenditures 129
Figure 10.3 Change in consumption of selected goods and services for lowest income households 134
Figure 10.4 Contribution towards South African exports 138
Figure 11.1 Increase in the exports for selected industries 153
Figure 11.2 Change in household consumption after the policy shock 153
Figure 12.1 The percentage decrease, and marginal decrease in the domestic use of coal due to technological improvement 160
Figure 12.2 Environmental taxation and the demand for unskilled and informal sector labour: a comparison of policy results 163
Figure 12.3 Decrease in real consumption expenditure in the short and long-run: zero revenue recycling 164
Figure 12.4 A comparison of changes in real consumption expenditure: lump-sum transfer and product subsidies 165
Figure 12.5  Change in aggregate consumption expenditure  165
Figure 12.6  Environmental tax policies and South African exports  166