The Influence of Environmental Impacts on Tailings Impoundment Design

Integrating environmental impacts with engineering costs for the design of tailings impoundments

Brian Rademeyer

Philosophiae Doctor

University of Pretoria

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree Philosophiae Doctor in the Faculty of Engineering, Built Environment and Information Technology of the University of Pretoria, Pretoria.

July 2007
I would like to dedicate this thesis to my co-supervisor Professor Geriant (Gary) Alan Jones whom I have had the privilege of studying under. He has mentored me during the past four years and although difficult at times, I do not wish to have it any other way. He truly knows how to inspire a person and has the ability to provide useful input on most subjects.

Prof. Jones's research into soil mechanics led to the development of the piezocone, a powerful tool used worldwide for assessing the strength and compressibility of soft soils, tailings and other materials. Piezocone testing has changed the method of investigation of soft soils around the world and consequently the design of embankments on soft soils.

He was born on 17 October 1933 in Wales. He obtained his BA and MA degrees in engineering from Clare College, Cambridge, in the UK, in 1957 and 1961 respectively. He was awarded a PhD by the University of Natal in 1993. Gary has more than forty year's experience as an engineering consultant and is presently an extraordinary professor of geotechnical engineering at the University of Pretoria.

Gary, I thank you warmly for the tremendous amount of selfless time and energy spent helping me during the lots of good and sometime less good times during my doctoral studies.
“...the key is to find technological ways of disposing debris without ecological upset.”

Robert Pirsig (Pirsig, 1999:128)

“...from a larger point of view it is only tailings deposition not the disposal that ceases and tailings management must continue until such time as the deposited tailings is assured to be permanently stable and environmentally innocuous...”

Steven Vick (Vick, 1983:324)

“Development and technological progress places increasing pressure on the earth’s resources. In this aspect South Africa is no exception and many unfortunate decisions have been taken in the past, often with disastrous consequences, due to ignorance or lack of essential environmental information.”

(van Riet, Claassen, van Rensburg, van Viegen and du Plessis, 1997:63)
Summary

Mining of South Africa’s gold, platinum and base metal resources has given rise to hundreds of mine residue deposits (MRDs) the footprints of which cover large areas of land. Metalliferous mines produce a substantial volume of fine-grained waste and it is estimated that approximately 12 000 ha of land is sterilised by 150 MRDs within the Gauteng province alone (Figure Ex 1).

The disposal of mine residue, mainly tailings, can impact on large areas of land through the change in visual landscape, the decrease in air quality, and the degradation of the water resource. MRDs are particularly susceptible to erosion giving rise to long term wind and water borne pollution. Mine residue can contain sulphide minerals which upon weathering give rise to a range of pollutants especially where there is insufficient neutralizing potential. Radionuclides are also found in drainage associated with some MRDs.

The quantitative prediction and integration of these impacts is difficult and the impacts are costly to manage and remedy.

The legacy of the impacts associated with MRDs, particularly in the long term after closure, has given rise to an increasingly complex regulatory regime. Obtaining approvals for upgrading old facilities, for the development of new facilities, and for closure plans are difficult owing to the lack of a suitable framework within which to make decisions. Since efficient development of the South African mining sector is essential, whilst maintaining a balance with an acceptable level of environmental risk, it is necessary to develop systems to facilitate transparent and effective decision making. The current state of the art of prediction and mitigation is not yet developed sufficiently to place South African regulators, in particular, in a position to evaluate and validate tailings impoundment schemes.
The research presented in this study is multidisciplinary. It integrates information from a range of disciplines, many of which have analytical structures and barriers separating them. The results of specialist studies are normally communicated to those within the discipline, and infrequently to specialists in other disciplines and even less so to stakeholders outside the planning and design team. This study describes a system to integrate different environmental impacts and engineering design aspects with the aim to present the results in a rational and understandable manner.

The research applies integrated environmental planning and design principles to the design of upstream deposited ring-dyke tailings impoundments which are widely applicable in South Africa, the result of which is an integrated environmental impact and engineering cost system for the configuration of such impoundments. A theoretical ecological and sustainable philosophical approach was adopted and used to critically evaluate, assess, and analyse environmental impacts and formulate solutions for the post-closure land use of tailings impoundments.

The research is innovative both because it envisages tailings impoundment design from the view of landscape architecture and also because it introduces the concept of visual impacts in a novel way. In essence, there must be a shift in emphasis from designing and operating an impoundment to contain tailings for a 20 year period, to the design of a man-made landform within the landscape with the end of life configuration and land use envisaged prior to construction. Generic models for the environmental impacts and engineering costs throughout the life cycle of a tailings impoundment are described such that the design can be optimised ab initio with respect to the environmental impacts and costs.

The research depends on the use of models and experimental work. The challenge was to develop a system that reflects the real world situation. Uncertainty exists regarding the detailed processes controlling and contributing to the environmental and engineering aspects. Uncertainties are incorporated into the predictions by means of following a systematic and rational approach. A systems approach ensures that the environmental problems associated with tailings impoundments are not considered in isolation but holistically.

The system for the evaluation of the life cycle of tailings impoundments with particular emphasis on post-closure land use can be used to:
- inform the stakeholders in the planning stage to consider alternative configurations;
- assist with decision making;
- provide a platform for constructive discussion with relevant authorities; and
- facilitate transparent liaison with stakeholders.

Regulators, proponents, environmental practitioners, and engineering consultants can use the system to understand better what the implications are of alternative configurations such as flattening tailings impoundment embankment side slopes and changing cover types.

Through a process of elimination the following key environmental issues that influence tailings impoundment design are:
- visual aspects;
- air quality aspects; and
- water aspects.

This study combines and integrates these environmental aspects with engineering costs.
It was recognized early on in the research that a complete model could contain a number of aspects currently not included such as heritage, tourism and the living environment. The exclusion of environmental aspects does not mean that they are in any way less important. Also, the time period for the life cycle considered in the quantification of environmental impacts and engineering costs is for a period from the start of tailings impoundment design up to 20 years after closure. Had a full set of aspects with more indicators been considered over a longer post-closure period some of the conclusions may have been different. However, the view was taken that initially only key aspects will be included and modelled for a 20 year post-closure period with the aim of creating a robust system demonstrating its efficacy.

Some of the input parameters in the system are not definitive and require conservative value judgements to be applied. Future research can refine the predictive models by initiating longer term monitoring programs. Even though there are uncertainties pertaining to some of the parameters used in the study it can be stated that the approach developed and described in this thesis presents a complex problem in such a manner as to make it more useful for rational decision making.

This study demonstrates that real costs can be ascribed to environmental impacts and that these can be added to the direct engineering cost to produce a total cost model. It is from this that rational decisions can be made. For example alternative tailings impoundment configurations and post-closure land uses are compared through the valuation of environmental change which assists to identify critical aspects determining the sustainability of the proposed land use.

Although there are many challenges to the process of estimating values, this study identifies and discusses the requirements to valuate visual, air, and water impacts associated with tailings impoundments. It is recommended that the environmental impact and engineering costing system should be used to inform decision making involving the rehabilitation of existing as well as new tailings impoundments.

Key words in alphabetical order:
Air quality, configuration, decision making, environmental impacts, environmental costs, engineering costs, environmental impact and engineering cost system, integration, land use, post-closure land use, sulphate mass flux, tailings impoundment, upstream deposited ring-dyke tailings impoundments, valuation, visual perception distances, water quality.
**Samevatting**

Die ontginning van Suid-Afrika se goud-, platinum- en onedele metaalhulpbronne het tot honderde mynoorskotafsetse (MOA’s) aanleiding gegee, waarvan die oppervlaktes groot landsgebiede bedek. Metaalhoudende myne produseer groot hoeveelhede fynkorrelrige afval en daar word geraam dat slegs in Gauteng ongeveer 12 000 ha grond deur 150 MOA’s gesteriliseer word (Figuur Ex 1, p. b).

Die wegdoening van mynreste - hoofsaaklik uitskot - kan deur middel van veranderings in die visuele landskap, die afname in luggehalte, en die degradasie van die waterbronne ‘n impak op groot landsgebiede hê. MOA’s is veral vatbaar vir erosie, wat langtermyn wind- en waterbesoedeling veroorsaak. Mynoorskot kan sulfiedminerale bevat wat tydens verwering tot ‘n reeks besoedelende stowwe aanleiding gee, veral waar daar onvoldoende potensiaal vir neutralisering bestaan. Radionukliedies word ook in dreinering wat met sommige MOA’s gepaard gaan, aangetref.

Die kwantitatiewe voorspelling en integrasie van hierdie impakte is moeilik, en duur om te bestuur en te remedieer.

Die nalatenskap van impakte wat met MOA’s verbind word veroorsaak ná sluiting veral in die lang termyn ‘n al hoe meer ingewikkelde regulatorende stelsel. Goedkeuring vir die opgradering van ou fasilitete, vir die ontwikkeling van nuwe fasilitete, en vir sluitingsplannet is moeilik om te verkry weens die gebrek aan ‘n geskikte raamwerk waarbinne besluite geneem kan word. Aangesien die doeltreffende ontwikkeling van die Suid-Afrikaanse mynsektor noodsaaklik is, solank ‘n veral reguleerders in staat te stel om slikdamskemas te evalueer en te bekrachtig nie.

Die navorsing wat deur hierdie studie voorgelê word is multidissiplinêr. Dit integreer inligting uit ‘n reeks vakgebiede, waarvan verskeie deur analitiese strukture en versperrings geskei word. Die resultate van spesialisstudies word normaalweg aan dié binne die dissipline oorgedra, en selde aan spesialiste in ander dissiplines, en nog meer selde aan insethouers buite die beplanning- en ontwerpspan. Hierdie studie beskryf ‘n stelsel om verskillende omgewingsimpakte en ingenieursontwerpaspekte te integrer, met die doel om die resultate op ‘n rasionele en verstaanbare manier voor te lé.

Die navorsing pas beginsels van geïntegreerde omgewingsbeplanning en -ontwerp op die ontwerp van slikdamme toe. Die resultaat is ‘n geïntegreerde omgewingsimpak- en ingenieursontwerp teststelsel wat gebruik kan word om tipiese stroomop gedeponeerde ringdyk slikdamme te konfigureer. ‘n Teoretiese ekologiese en volhoubare filosofiese benadering is aangeneem en gebruik om omgewingsimpakte krities te evalueer, te takseer en te ontlee, en om oplossings te formuleer vir die nasluitingsgrondgebruik van slikdamme.
Die navorsing is vernuwend omdat dit slikdamme vanuit die oogpunt van landskapargitektuur beskou en ook omdat dit die beginsel van visuele impakte op ‘n nuwe manier bekendstel. In wese moet daar ‘n klemverskuwing plaasvind vanaf die ontwerp en bedryf van ‘n opdamming om uitskot vir ‘n periode van 20 jaar te bevat, na die ontwerp van ‘n mensgemaakte landvorm in die landskap waar die konfigurasie en grondgebruik aan die einde van die leeftyd daarvan reeds vóór konstruksie oorweeg word. Generiese modelle vir die omgewingsimpakte en ingenieursonkoste dwarsdeur die lewensiklus van ‘n slikdam word beskryf, sodat die ontwerp van die begin af ten opsigte van die omgewingsimpakte en onkoste geoptimaliseer kan word.

Die navorsing steun op die gebruik van modelle en eksperimentele werk. Dit was ‘n uitdaging om ‘n stelsel te ontwikkel wat ‘n werklke situasie sou weerspieël. Daar bestaan onsekerheid ten opsigte van die gedetailleerde prosesse wat die omgewings- en ingenieursaspekte beheer en tot hulle bydra. Onsekerhede word by die voorspellings ingelyf deur ‘n sistematiese en rasionele benadering te volg. ‘n Stelselbenadering vereker dat die omgewingsprobleme wat met slikdamme gepaard gaan nie in afsondering nie, maar eerder holisties oorweeg word.

Die stelsel vir die beoordeling van die lewensiklus van slikdamme met besondere klem op nasluitingsgrondgebruik, kan aangewend word om:

- insethouers reeds in die beplanningstadium aan te moedig om alternatiewe konfigurasies te oorweeg;
- besluitneming te vergemaklik;
- ‘n podium te bied vir opbouende besprekings met die betrokke owerhede; en
- deursigtige skakeling met insethouers te vergemaklik.

Reguleerders, voorstanders en konsultante kan die stelsel gebruik om die implikasies van alternatiewe konfigurasies, soos die afplatting van die kantwalle van slikdamme en die verandering van bedekkingstipes, beter te verstaan.

Deur middel van uitskakeling is die volgende belangrike omgewingskwessies wat die ontwerp van slikdamme beïnvloed, vasgestel:

- visuele aspekte;
- luggehalte-aspekte; en
- wateraspekte.

Hierdie studie kombineer en integreer hierdie omgewingsaspekte met ingenieursonkoste.

Reeds vroeg in die navorsing het dit duidelik geword dat ‘n volledige model verskeie aspekte wat tans nie ingesluit is nie, soos erfenis, toerisme en die lewende omgewing, sou kon bevat. Die uitsluiting van omgewingsaspekte beteken nie dat hulle enigsins minder belangrik is nie. Die uitgangspunt was egter dat slegs sleutelaspekte ingesluit sou word, met die doel om ‘n krachtige, doeltreffende stelsel te skep.

Sommige invoerparameters in die stelsel is nie finaal nie en vereis dat konserwatiewe waardebepalings toegepas word. Toekomstige navorsing kan die voorspellingsmodelle verfyn deur langtermyn moniteringsprogramme in te stel. Hoewel daar onsekerhede bestaan wat sommige van die parameters in die studie betref, kan dit gekonstateer word dat die benadering wat in hierdie tesis ontwikkel en beskryf word ‘n ingewikkelde probleem op só ‘n wyse aanbied dat dit rasionele besluitneming
vergemaklik. Hoewel die gebruik van die stelsel nie ‘n aanvaarbare uitslag kan waarborg nie, sal dit waarskynlik die konflikte ten opsigte van slikdamkonfigurasie verminder.

Hierdie studie demonstreer dus dat werklike onkoste aan omgewingsimpakte toegeskryf kan word en dat hierdie koste by die direkte ingenieursonkoste gevoeg kan word om ‘n totale kostemodel te produseer. En dit is hieruit waar rasionele besluite geneem kan word. Byvoorbeeld, alternatiewe slikdamkonfigurasies en nasluitingsgrondgebruike word vergelyk deur omgewingsveranderings te evalueer, en dit help om kritieke aspekte ten opsigte van die volhoubaarheid van die voorgestelde grondgebruik te bepaal.

Hoewel daar baie uitdagings bestaan wat waardebepaling betref, identifiseer en bespreek hierdie studie die vereistes wanneer visuele, lug- en waterimpakte wat met slikdamme gepaard gaan, geëvalueer moet word.

Sleutelwoorde in alfabetiese volgorde:
Besluitneming, ingenieursonkoste, integrasie, konfigurasie, luggehalte, nasluitingsgrondgebruik, omgewingsimpakte, omgewingsimpak- en ingenieursonkostestelsel, slikdam, sulfaatmassavloeiing, valuasie, visuele waarnemingsafstande.
Acknowledgements

The research presented in this thesis is drawn from a study on the influence of environmental impacts on tailings impoundment design at the Department of Civil and Biosystems Engineering, University of Pretoria (UP), supported financially by Anglo Platinum, Strategic Environmental Focus (SEF), Steffen Robertson and Kirsten (SRK) and the National Research Foundation (NRF). The NRF provided funds through its Technology and Human Resources for Industry Programme (THRIP).

A specific word of mention is firstly due to my study leader and supervisor Prof. Eben Rust, for providing me with the necessary guidance. I also wish to thank my co-supervisor Prof. Gary A. Jones, for mentoring and encouraging me on the many occasions when progress stalled. Both Professors Rust and Jones assisted me in various selfless ways during the preparation of this thesis. I thank them warmly.

I deeply appreciate the selfless input and assistance of the following persons during the past couple of years, listed in alphabetical order:

- Brenda Freese (personal capacity)
- Elizabeth Marsden (Anglo Platinum)
- Erich Heymann (Anglo Platinum)
- Heidi van Deventer (Strategic Environmental Focus)
- Jabulile Sibanyoni (University of Pretoria)
- Jaco Viljoen (University of Pretoria)
- Johan van der Waals (University of Pretoria)
- John Wates (Fraser Alexander)
- Ken Lyell (Anglo American)
- Louis Keynhans (Crown Gold Recoveries)
- Lukas Niemand (personal capacity)
- Nicola Liversage (Read) (personal capacity)
- Pierre Rousseau (personal capacity)
- Sanchia Holmes (personal capacity)
- Sean Lindsay (University of Pretoria)
- Steven Bullock (Anglo Platinum)
- Tim Liversage (personal capacity)
- Vee Wolder (Strategic Environmental Focus)
- Wim Mandersloot (personal capacity)
- Yvonne Scorgie (Airshed Planning Consultants)

The overall system described in this study required specialist input and predictive modelling of various aspects. People who provided input and assistance require acknowledgement and a special word of mention. Hennie Geldenhuys (AngloGold Ashanti) provided background information on the case study site, ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment. Permission was also granted to photograph the impoundment as part of the visual perception study.
Mader van den Berg (UP) assisted with the field work and manipulation of the photographs as part of the study to quantify visual perception distances for tailings impoundments. The nominal group technique (NGT) study method was used and required the participation of experts, mentioned in alphabetic order in Appendix A.1, as well as students and academic staff.

The engineering cost model, commissioned as part of this overall study, was developed in collaboration with Caroline Holmes (SRK) (Holmes, 2006). The engineering cost model is based on a system for the costing of environmental mine closure liabilities described by Rademeyer, Jones and Rust (2003). The engineering cost model includes the specific variables required to allow integration with the environmental aspects.

Hanlie Liebenberg-Enslin (Airshed Planning Consultants) provided assistance with the predictive modelling of the air quality impacts (Liebenberg-Enslin, 2006). The roughness height parameter used in the airborne dust dispersion from area sources (ADDAS) model was calibrated as part of this study. This involved field work and required the iterative comparison of predicted results with monitoring data until key parameters were calibrated. The calibrated air quality models used predict the change in dustfall for the various tailings impoundment configurations as part of the overall system requirements. The calibrated models can be used in future to assess the environmental impacts of impoundments with comparable physical tailings properties.

Similarly, the development of the analytical sulphate mass balance model was undertaken in collaboration with Koos Vivier (AGES) as part the input requirement of the overall system (Vivier, 2006).

The following computer software is used:
- ARC/INFO™ geographic information system software is used to spatially represent visual perception influence zones.
- Airborne dust dispersion from area sources (ADDAS) software is used to calculate particulate emission rates. The United States Environmental Protection Agency (US EPA) approved industrial source complex short term (ISCST) Breeze Version 3 dispersion modelling software is used to compute spatial ambient particulate concentrations. Air quality results are mapped as isopleths using Surfer Version 7.
- Both the engineering cost model and analytical sulphate mass balance model uses Microsoft Office™ EXCEL 2003 spreadsheets to analyse information and perform calculations.
- Maps are compiled using ARC/INFO™ geographic information systems software, Corel Draw 12™, Corel Photopaint 12™, and MapSource Version 6.8.0.
- All other text, tables and graphs in the thesis uses the Microsoft Office™ 2003 Suite.

The following organisations are acknowledged for information used to reproduce maps:
- Chief Director: Geological Survey, Council for Geoscience, Pretoria.
- Chief Director: Surveys and Land Information, Mowbray, Cape Town.
- Water Research Commission, Pretoria.

Lastly, I would like to thank Wendy Jones for much needed professional editing pointers over the past couple of years.
# Table of contents

Summary ................................................................. b
Samevatting ............................................................. e
Acknowledgements ..................................................... h
Table of contents ....................................................... i
List of tables ........................................................... ix
List of figures .......................................................... xiii

## CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION 1

1.1 The need for a more sustainable legacy for mine residue deposits 1
1.2 Problem statement 5
   1.2.1 Typical issues 5
   1.2.2 Planning constraints 7
   1.2.3 Modelling liability and cost 8
1.3 Hypothesis 12
1.4 Problem solution 13
1.5 Thesis organisation and structure 14

## CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW 15

2.1 Manmade landforms within the natural landscape 16
2.2 Minerals and mining 18
   2.2.1 Introduction 18
   2.2.2 Mineral wealth of South Africa 18
2.8 Environmental planning framework 63
2.9 Environmental impact estimation 66
  2.9.1 Introduction 66
  2.9.2 Valuation of impacts 66
  2.9.3 Multiple accounts analysis 71
  2.9.4 Summary 75
2.10 Visual 76
  2.10.1 Visual impact assessment 76
  2.10.2 Photorealistic computer imaging 83
  2.10.3 Summary 84
2.11 Air 86
  2.11.1 Introduction 86
  2.11.2 Fugitive dust impact assessment 89
  2.11.3 Dust deposition and suspended particulate standards 91
  2.11.4 Fugitive dust zone of influence 93
  2.11.5 Valuation of air quality impacts 102
  2.11.6 Summary 104
2.12 Water 106
  2.12.1 Introduction 106
  2.12.2 Decision-support system 108
  2.12.3 Tailings characteristics 108
  2.12.4 Groundwater quality problem 113
  2.12.5 Acid mine drainage 113
  2.12.6 Liner systems 115
  2.12.7 Seepage 115
  2.12.8 Standard practice 117
  2.12.9 Groundwater and contaminant modelling 119
  2.12.10 Steady state flow 121
  2.12.11 Unsaturated flow under steady state conditions 123
  2.12.12 Pollution transport models 123
  2.12.13 Treatment of discharges 124
  2.12.14 General treatment technologies 124
  2.12.15 Sulphate removal treatment technologies 126
3.4.3 Mitigation 190
3.4.4 Study method 192
3.4.5 Configurations 192
3.4.6 Selection of test impoundment 192
3.4.7 Photography of test impoundment 194
3.4.8 Manipulation of site photographs 196
3.4.9 Assessment of visualisations 199
3.5 Air 201
3.5.1 Introduction 201
3.5.2 Calibrating the emission estimation software 201
3.5.3 Summary 217
3.6 Water 218
3.6.1 Introduction 218
3.6.2 Predictive modelling of impacts 218
3.6.3 Water impact model 218
3.6.4 Summary 223
3.7 Engineering cost model 224
3.7.1 Introduction 224
3.7.2 Components 227
3.7.3 Modelling 230
3.8 Summary 231

CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS 233
4.1 Introduction 233
4.2 Visual perception 234
4.2.1 Validation of results 238
4.2.2 Observations 243
4.2.3 Visual perception results 244
4.3 Visual perception zone of influence 251
4.4 Air quality zone of influence 252
4.5 Water quality influence 255
7.3 Valuation of environmental impacts 318
7.4 Sphere of influence 321
7.5 Sustainable development 323
7.6 Rehabilitation 324
7.7 Integrated environmental planning and design 327
7.8 Meeting legislative requirements 331
7.9 Summary 331

CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSIONS 335
8.1 Decision-making system 335
8.2 Engineering costs 337
8.3 Visual perception 337
8.4 Air quality 340
8.5 Water quality 340
8.6 Environmental impact valuation 341
8.7 Recommendations 342

List of references 344
List of acronyms and abbreviations 358
List of technical terms 364

APPENDICES 378

APPENDIX A: VISUAL A.1
Appendix A1: Details of the NGT study participants A.2
Appendix A2: Presentation of visual perception study A.19
Appendix A3: Presentation of visual perception results A.34
Appendix A4: Zone of visual perception influence results A.50
APPENDIX B: AIR

Appendix B1: Zone of air quality influence results

APPENDIX C: ENGINEERING COST MODEL

Appendix C1: Engineering specification sheets
List of tables

| Table 1: | South Africa’s precious metals production, 1994 – 2003. | 20 |
| Table 2: | World PGM reserves and supply, 2003. | 23 |
| Table 3: | The role of South Africa in world mineral supply reserve base. | 23 |
| Table 4: | Typical buffer distances. | 42 |
| Table 5: | Valuation methods for environmental impacts (Dixon et al., 1995:30). | 67 |
| Table 6: | Environmental impacts and typical mitigation measures. | 68 |
| Table 7: | Subdivision of the scaling system (indicator value) (Robertson and Shaw, 1998a). | 73 |
| Table 8: | Example of a ledger with indicators for sub-accounts (Robertson and Shaw, 1998a). | 74 |
| Table 9: | Dustfall categories published by the DEAT (1994). | 91 |
| Table 10: | Air quality guidelines and standards for total suspended particulates and ambient dust concentrations. | 92 |
| Table 11: | Morbidity dose-response relationships typically used to quantify exposure per person to change in PM$_{10}$ ($\mu$g/m$^3$). | 103 |
| Table 12: | Costs due to respiratory hospital admissions and inferred respiratory treatments due PM$_{10}$ exposures. | 104 |
| Table 13: | Comparison of typical acid and alkaline mill effluents (Vick, 1983). | 110 |
| Table 14: | South African Water Quality Guidelines (DWAF, 1996). | 111 |
| Table 15: | South African Water Quality Guidelines of selected elements (DWAF, 1996). | 115 |
| Table 16: | Comparing the costs of sulphate removal for different technologies. | 129 |
| Table 17: | Proposed waste discharge charge for sulphate removal. | 132 |
| Table 18: | Typical embankment slope configuration when flattening side slopes. | 157 |
| Table 19: | Embankment slope configurations modelled. Production and height are kept constant. | 160 |
| Table 20: | Engineering scenarios modelled. | 162 |
Table 21: Visual perception configuration scenario modelling codes and buffer distances.

Table 22: Air quality modelling scenarios and area of influence codes for the isopleths.

Table 23: Groundwater quantity and quality modelling scenarios.

Table 24: Long-term average monthly rainfall for O.R. Tambo International Airport (Schulze, 1986).

Table 25: Minimum, maximum and mean temperature (°C) for O.R. Tambo International Airport for the period 1951-1984 (Schulze, 1986).

Table 26: Atmospheric stability classes.

Table 27: Surface soil sampling point co-ordinates.

Table 28: Surface sample soil analysis results from the ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment site.

Table 29: Analysis results of surface soil samples collected from the ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment site indicating micronutrients.

Table 30: Springs RWB and Nigel - 1 measuring station localities (Midgley et al., 1994).

Table 31: Preliminary estimate of surface runoff over pond surface, basin and embankment.

Table 32: Plant species that occur on site.

Table 33: Commonly occurring bird species.

Table 34: Commonly occurring mammal species.

Table 35: Commonly occurring herpetofauna.

Table 36: Typical fish species that occur in the rivers of Eastern Gauteng.

Table 37: Breakdown of visualisations by slope, season and cover.

Table 38: GPS points and coordinates of the DRD 2L24 tailings samples.

Table 39: Mean fraction of the particles smaller than 75 µm.

Table 40: Mean fraction of the particles smaller than 10 µm.

Table 41: The typical range of roughness heights.

Table 42: Percentage (%) of particles smaller than 2 µm, i.e. clay particles.

Table 43: Coordinates of samples and GPS points for XRF analysis.

Table 44: XRF results of elements as oxides in DRD2L24 tailings samples.
Table 45: XRF results of elements present in the DRD2L24 tailings samples. 214
Table 46: DRD 2L24 tailings impoundment dimensions. 215
Table 47: Dust fallout bucket coordinates. 217
Table 48: Modelled data compared to measured data from the DRD Tailings Impoundment. A surface roughness height of 0.0012 m provided the best correlation. 217
Table 49: Analytical water flow and mass balance assumptions and qualifications. 221
Table 50: Daggafontein tailings impoundment water and mass balance model. 222
Table 51: Conceptual engineering model costs the different tailings impoundment stages. 226
Table 52: Engineering schedule of quantities for selected closure cost items. 229
Table 53: Quantifiable elements for the various environmental aspects. 233
Table 54: Typical scenario descriptions for impoundment with a 1:3 side slope and grass cover. 234
Table 55: The following mean perception distance values were used for combined slopes. 247
Table 56: Maximum, mean and function visual perception distances measured from the edge of the impoundment for 1:3 overall embankment side slope. 249
Table 57: Maximum, mean and function visual perception zone widths for 1:3 overall embankment side slope indicating. 249
Table 58: Varying parameters of each scenario for the ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment configurations. 253
Table 59: Groundwater quantity and quality modelling configurations. 255
Table 60: Comparison of the results of the mass flux of sulphates for the various scenarios. 256
Table 61: Scenario codes used in the study for calculating the engineering costs and predicting the change in effect on key environmental aspects for an embankment slope of 1:3. 268
Table 62: Engineering costs for covers ES2, ES6, ES10 and ES14. 269
Table 63: Scenario codes used to illustrate the influence of change resulting from a change in slope. A grassed armouring cover is used in the scenarios. 277
Table 64: Engineering life-cycle costs for scenarios ES9, ES10, ES11 and ES12 indicate the change in costs relative to the change in embankment slope. 277
Table 65: Significant construction cost items for scenarios ES9, ES10, ES11 and ES12.  
Table 66: Comparison of closure stage cost items for the various embankment side slopes modelled.  
Table 67: Influence of changes in slope on mass flux.  
Table 68: Proposed compatible and incompatible land uses within the recognition and detection visual perception zones of influence.  
Table 69: Property values in the area of the ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment.  
Table 70: Land values used in the quantification of land use incompatibilities.  
Table 71: Typical land values for agricultural and game farming land in the North West and Limpopo Provinces.  
Table 72: Potential health risk costs as a result of a 25 µg/m³ increase in PM₁₀. The costs reflect the change in population density within the influence zone.  
Table 73: Comparison of annual sulphate removal costs of various treatment technologies.  
Table 74: Total integrated cumulative environmental and engineering aspect costs.  
Table 75: Simplified total environmental and engineering costs for different impoundment cover types. The costs are grouped into two categories namely development and operation cost, and closure and post-closure costs.  
Table 76: Average yields and prices for cash crops (van Rooyen, 2006).  
Table 77: Potential loss in production due to the permanent loss of land under the impoundment.
List of figures

Figure 1: Footprints of mine residue deposits in and around the Gauteng province, South Africa (Rademeyer and van den Berg, 2005). 2

Figure 2: Schematic illustration of perceived increase in tailings impoundment cost over time. 3

Figure 3: Land development pressures often lead to the reclamation of old mine residue deposits to make space available. Rehabilitation of existing tailings impoundments also takes place to create some sort of appropriate landform while also addressing significant environmental impacts. 3

Figure 4: Reshaping an abandoned tailings impoundment into a sculptural landscape. 4

Figure 5: The land use selection process for developed sustainable land use (Roberson et al., 1998a). 8

Figure 6: Conceptual environmental liability over the life of an impoundment. 9

Figure 7: Total tailings impoundment life-cycle costs combining environmental impact costs and engineering aspect costs. 10

Figure 8: Three components of sustainable development. 11

Figure 9: Components of the overall costing system. 12

Figure 10: Representation of environmental and engineering aspects in the planning continuum. 13

Figure 11: Ancient man’s expression within the landscape. 16

Figure 12: The Egyptian pyramids are perhaps the simplest and most fundamental man-made landforms in all of landscape architecture. 17

Figure 13: Simplified geological map of the Witwatersrand Basin with the principal gold fields delineated (Robb and Robb, 1998:296). 19

Figure 14: A geological map of the exposed limbs of the Bushveld Complex indicates the extent of inferred PGM and other mineral resource. 21

Figure 15: Surface area covered by mining residue deposits within and around Gauteng Province (Rademeyer and van den Berg, 2005). 24

Figure 16: Footprints of mine residue deposits in and around the Rustenburg Region, South Africa. 25

Figure 17: Views of upstream constructed ring-dyke impoundments. 26
Figure 18: Typical mineral process indicating the context of tailings disposal.

Figure 19: Typical particle size envelopes for gold and platinum tailings (CM, 1996:19).

Figure 20: Schematic of upstream deposited ring-dyke tailings impoundment (CM, 1996:169).

Figure 21: Cross-section through an upstream deposited ring-dyke impoundment embankment.

Figure 22: Angles of repose for various types of slope materials (Marsh, 1997:81).

Figure 23: Typical slope safety factors for various slopes given a critical state parameter for the tailings of 37°.

Figure 24: Bafokeng tailings impoundment slurry flow zone of influence.

Figure 25: Aerial photograph showing the slurry flow physical zone of influence after failure at Merriespruit tailings impoundment.

Figure 26: Biophysical environmental aspect pathways.

Figure 27: A tailings impoundment impacts the environment resulting in landscape impacts and finally leading to visual impacts (Turner, 1998:34).

Figure 28: Schematic representation of typical buffer distances.

Figure 29: Closed loop decision-making process comprising typical steps common to most decision-making circumstances (Moody, 1983:1).

Figure 30: The theoretical optimum decision-making point lies at the cross over point of cost and benefit (Moody, 1983:5).

Figure 31: Top down structure of questions for the environmental aspects being considered.

Figure 32: Conceptual DSS framework indicating decision-making paths (Rademeyer et al., 2007).

Figure 33: Important decision-making points during tailings impoundment configuration (Rademeyer et al., 2007).

Figure 34: MPRDA closure planning process.

Figure 35: Closure options (Robertson, Devenny and Shaw, 1998b).

Figure 36: Integrated impoundment environmental planning and design process (Rademeyer and van den Berg, 2005).

Figure 37: Context of design (Rademeyer and van den Berg, 2005).
Figure 38: Overall simplified environmental aspects diagram. Highlighted blocks indicate the environmental aspects that must be built into the initial model.

Figure 39: Simplified valuation flowchart for environmental impacts (Adapted from Dixon and Sherman, 1990).

Figure 40: Simplified illustration of boundaries limiting tailings impoundment locality.

Figure 41: Fundamental accounts for comparing configurations using the MAA methodology.

Figure 42: Simplified environmental aspects flow-diagram indicating the context of visual quality.

Figure 43: Zone of visual influence terminology and concepts.

Figure 44: Subdivision of zone of visual influence into visibility distance zones.

Figure 45: Photographs demonstrating how shape, colour and texture influence the visual perception of a landform in the landscape.

Figure 46: Visual perception thresholds (Shang and Bishop, 2000:126).

Figure 47: Simplified environmental aspects flow-diagram. The highlighted blocks indicate the context of the air quality aspects relevant to most tailings impoundments.

Figure 48: Wind entrainment of particulates from exposed tailings impoundment surface areas.

Figure 49: Dust blown from a tailings impoundment. Typical equipment for measuring dustfall and particulates.

Figure 50: Relationship between particle size and threshold friction velocity using the calculation method proposed by Marticorena and Bergametti (1995).

Figure 51: Contours of normalised surface wind speeds (US EPA, 1996).

Figure 52: Percentage change in the occurrence of various health endpoints as a result of changes in ambient PM$_{10}$ concentrations (WHO, 2000).

Figure 53: Simplified environmental aspects flow-diagram indicating the context of the water sub-account.

Figure 54: Water quantity and quality decision framework (Rademeyer et al., 2007).

Figure 55: Typical impacts of mine waste water on the environment.

Figure 56: Schematic representation of information required to calculate seepage potential (CM, 1996:136).

Figure 57: Generic range of mine water treatment technologies (van Niekerk, 2005).
Figure 58: Simplified schematic of the integrated limestone/lime treatment process.

Figure 59: Photographs of the limestone and BioSure® processes.

Figure 60: Simplified schematic of the BioSure® process.

Figure 61: Simplified schematic of a desalination membrane-based process.

Figure 62: Simplified soil and land environmental aspects diagram.

Figure 63: State of a typical un-rehabilitated gold tailings impoundment.

Figure 64: Surface stability decision framework (Rademeyer et al., 2007).

Figure 65: The erosion rate surface showing the effects of slope length and slope angle on rates of erosion from the outer slopes of tailings impoundments (Blight and Amponsah-Da Costa, 1999).

Figure 66: Effect of slope length and slope angle on rates of erosion from the outer slopes of tailings impoundments (CM, 1996).

Figure 67: Slope geometry factor based on steepness and length.

Figure 68: Tailings impoundment embankment side slope and berm details (CM, 1996).

Figure 69: Panorama photograph of a proposed tailings impoundment site in the Rustenburg platinum mining belt.

Figure 70: Water erosion thresholds for natural soil particles with the shaded section indicating the area where it is expected that tailings anthropogenic soils would fit (Marsh, 1997:231).

Figure 71: Basic slope profiles.

Figure 72: Effects of erosion and deposition (Marsh, 1997:102).

Figure 73: Slopes profile of a natural landform.

Figure 74: Typical side slope profile of an upstream constructed ring-dyke gold tailings impoundment.

Figure 75: Shaded section indicates area where it is expected that tailings anthropogenic soils would fit if the soil texture triangle for natural soils is applied (Marsh, 1997:96).

Figure 76: Local types of vegetation communities can be of uses when selecting suitable plant species for rehabilitation purposes (van den Berg, 2004).

Figure 77: Typical land uses as a function of slope steepness.

Figure 78: Visual simulations for different tailings impoundment surface covers.
Figure 79: Schematic illustrating the flattening of the embankment slope of a tailings impoundment.

Figure 80: Photographs of impoundment embankment comparing the overall slopes.

Figure 81: Views of the ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment.

Figure 82: Total environmental sphere of influence anticipated as an outcome of this study.

Figure 83: Typical land uses as a function of maximum slope gradients.

Figure 84: Regional locality map of the ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment.

Figure 85: ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment aerial photograph.

Figure 86: Typical section through ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment embankment.

Figure 87: The ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment lies within an area with a rural character and rolling topography.

Figure 88: The land surrounding the ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment is extensively used for grazing and the cultivation of cash crops such as maize, sunflowers and soya beans.

Figure 89: Graph indicating annual average, minimum and maximum rainfall figures.

Figure 90: Graph indicating average, minimum and maximum temperature figures.

Figure 91: Period-average, day-time and night-time wind roses depicting the wind profile in Springs for the period January 1998 to December 2002.

Figure 92: ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment site geology and structures.

Figure 93: Surface soil sampling points.

Figure 94: ERGO Daggafontein soil sampling points.

Figure 95: Shallow root zone of a typical profile of the ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment surface previously vegetated.

Figure 96: Water monitoring points.

Figure 97: Delineation of the impoundment catchments for quantifying runoff.

Figure 98: Conceptual water balance diagram.

Figure 99: Mitigation procedure for a typical scheme (Smardon et al., 1986:216).

Figure 100: Visual configuration attributes and corresponding design responses for a tailings impoundment.
Figure 101: Landscape setting of the ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment.

Figure 102: The test impoundment was photographed at various distances.

Figure 103: Looking South to a Grootvlei Proprietary Mine tailings impoundment.

Figure 104: Looking south-east towards the ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment.

Figure 105: Looking north-west towards the ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment.

Figure 106: Photographs taken to form a 124° panorama scene.

Figure 107: Visualisation of impoundment with no cover.

Figure 108: Visualisation of grass covered impoundment.

Figure 109: Rock-clad tailings impoundment visualisation.

Figure 110: Visualisation of tailings impoundment covered with diverse vegetation.

Figure 111: Determining the computer screen viewing target size.

Figure 112: Example of questionnaire to assess each visualisation.

Figure 113: DRD 2L24 tailings impoundment top surface.

Figure 114: Views of the DRD 2L24 tailings impoundment embankment.

Figure 115: Regional locality of the DRD 2L24 tailings disposal facility.

Figure 116: DRD 2L24 tailings impoundment environmental setting.

Figure 117: Current and proposed extensions of Bram Fischerville adjacent to the DRD 2L24 impoundment.

Figure 118: Monthly rainfall data for the Roodepoort weather station.

Figure 119: Temperature data for the Roodepoort weather station.

Figure 120: Sampling of tailings for particle distribution analysis.

Figure 121: DRD 2L24 layout plan indicating the sampling points.

Figure 122: Dust fallout monitoring sites in the vicinity of the DRD tailings impoundment. Predicted total daily average dust fallout (mg/m²/day) from the DRD tailings impoundment.

Figure 123: Schematic representation of the model.

Figure 124: Typical components of the engineering cost model.

Figure 125: Cumulative engineering costs for the life cycle of tailings impoundments.
Figure 126: Basic elements of the engineering cost model. 227

Figure 127: Schematic of the multi-sheet engineering cost model. 230

Figure 128: Initial results of all participants for the grass covered 1:3 side slope scenario. 235

Figure 129: Initial results of all participants for the tailings in situ covered 1:3 side slope scenario. 235

Figure 130: Consensus results and envelope indicating the range of perception level distances for the grass covered 1:3 side slope scenario. 236

Figure 131: Consensus results and envelope indicating the range of perception level distances for the tailings in situ covered (no cover) 1:3 side slope scenario. 236

Figure 132: Mean perception over distance functions for all scenarios. 237

Figure 133: ERGO Daggafontein visibility map indicating photographing points. 239

Figure 134: Photograph 1 taken at a distance of 2720 m from the impoundment presents a view of the impoundment looking in a south-easterly direction. 240

Figure 135: Photograph 2 presents a view at 6435 m of the impoundment looking South. 241

Figure 136: Photograph 3 is a view from 8810 m looking South towards the impoundment. 241

Figure 137: Photograph 4 was taken from 6230 m looking in a southerly direction towards the impoundment. 242

Figure 138: Photograph 5 was taken looking northwest towards the impoundment at a distance of 8190 m. 242

Figure 139: Photograph 6 was taken towards the a northwest view of the impoundment at a distance of 5150 m. 243

Figure 140: Using tree planting as screening of impoundments. 244

Figure 141: Mean visual perception distances for the scenarios visualised is stacked according to the increase in visual recognition. 245

Figure 142: Maximum visual perception distances for the visualisations. The results are arranged according to the increase in visual recognition. 245

Figure 143: Visualisation of a view at a distance of 8200 m with an overall embankment of 1:6 and with no cover. 246

Figure 144: Visualisation of a view at a distance of 8200 m with an overall embankment of 1:3 and with no cover. 246

Figure 145: Probable mean visual perception functions of 1:3 and 1:6 slope data combined. 247
Figure 146: The conceptual illustration of visual perception distances and widths.

Figure 147: Visual perception zones of influence for an impoundment with a 1:3 overall embankment side slope and no cover.

Figure 148: Visual perception surface areas for modelled configurations VS1 to VS8.

Figure 149: Plot of the dustfall and concentration isopleths for impoundment configuration AS1 with an overall embankment side slope of 1:1.5 and no cover.

Figure 150: Air quality areas of influence for modelled configurations AS1 to AS16.

Figure 151: Mass flux for modelled configurations WS1 to WS16.

Figure 152: Modflow finite difference grid.

Figure 153: Simulated steady-state groundwater flow and sulphate transport.

Figure 154: Comparing the dilution with distance from source results of the analytical model with Modflow.

Figure 155: Normalised engineering costs to deposit tailings.

Figure 156: The total engineering costs for all the scenarios modelled indicating the relative costs for the different tailings impoundment construction stages.

Figure 157: Cumulative engineering life-cycle costs for the 28 scenarios modelled.

Figure 158: Comparing total cumulative costs for deposited and mechanically flattened slopes.

Figure 159: Comparing the costs of flattening embankment slopes for various covers to scenario ES2.

Figure 160: Comparing the engineering life cycle costs for an impoundment with no cover and a 1:9 deposited slope (ES4) and a 1:9 mechanically flattened slope (ES19). ES1 represents an impoundment with an overall side slope ratio of 1:1.5 with no cover.

Figure 161: Cumulative engineering impoundment life-cycle costs indicated for ES2, ES6, ES10 and ES14.

Figure 162: Influence of change in cover types on engineering stage costs.

Figure 163: Comparing the various covers modelled shows a marked reduction in the critical visual perception zones of influence.

Figure 164: Combining visual perception zone of influence and engineering costs for different cover types.

Figure 165: Influence of change of cover on air quality zone of influence.
Figure 166: Combining air quality zone of influence and engineering costs for different cover types. 273

Figure 167: The comparative bar chart illustrates the influence of change in cover on mass flux. 275

Figure 168: The combination of mass flux and engineering costs for changes in cover types. 275

Figure 169: Combined environmental aspect influences and engineering costs for changes in tailings impoundment cover types. 276

Figure 170: Cumulative engineering impoundment life-cycle costs indicated for scenarios ES9, ES10, ES11 and ES12. 278

Figure 171: Comparative bar chart results for the engineering scenarios costs ES9, ES10, ES11 and ES12. The development cost is split into design and construction cost items. 279

Figure 172: Change in engineering cost for changes in slope for a grassed armouring covered impoundment. 280

Figure 173: Combining visual perception zone of influence and engineering costs for change in slope. 281

Figure 174: Influence of change in slope on air quality zone of influence. 282

Figure 175: The combination of air quality zone of influence and engineering costs for changes in embankment slopes. 282

Figure 176: The combination of sulphates expressed as mass flux and engineering costs for different slopes. 284

Figure 177: The combination of environmental aspect influences and engineering scenario costs for changes in embankment slopes. 285

Figure 178: Land value map (R/ha) around the ERGO Daggafontein tailings impoundment. 292

Figure 179: Total existing value of land within the visual perception zones of influence. 293

Figure 180: Residential development in the visual perception zone of influence. 294

Figure 181: The potential total loss of property development value. The loss is the difference between high and medium cost residential property values within the visual impact zone. 295

Figure 182: Potential visual impact life-cycle cost, spread over 20 years, resulting from the conflict in land use between the development of high cost residential property and the tailings impoundment within the visual perception impact zone. 296

Figure 183: Potential visual impact life-cycle cost indicated as an event during closure resulting from the conflict in land use between the development of high cost
residential property and the tailings impoundment within the visual perception impact zone.

Figure 184: Proposed heritage corridor linking the Pilanesberg National Park with the Madikwe Game Reserve (SEF, 2002).

Figure 185: The potential total loss in game farming land value. The impact is the difference in values between game farming and typical farmland used for grazing within the tailings impoundment visual impact zone.

Figure 186: Potential visual impact life-cycle cost, spread over 20 years, resulting from the conflict in land use between the use of land for game farming with tourism potential and the tailings impoundment within the visual perception impact zone.

Figure 187: Population densities in the vicinity of the ERGO Daggafontein case study site.

Figure 188: Indication of annual respiratory treatment costs for different population densities.

Figure 189: Total cumulative respiratory treatment costs over a 20 year post-closure period for various exposures.

Figure 190: Integrating air quality life-cycle costs for 5 people/ha in the air quality zone of influence with the engineering costs.

Figure 191: Integrating air quality life-cycle costs for 25 people/ha in the air quality zone of influence with the engineering costs.

Figure 192: The column chart compares the cumulative water treatment costs for different treatment technologies.

Figure 193: Impoundment life-cycle costs for various covers integrating the engineering and water treatment costs using the slaked lime process.

Figure 194: Total environmental and engineering costs for scenario without any cover.

Figure 195: Sphere of influence for the impoundment scenario without any cover.

Figure 196: Total environmental and engineering costs for rock covered impoundment scenario.

Figure 197: Sphere of influence for the impoundment scenario covered in rock.

Figure 198: Total environmental and engineering costs for a grassed armouring.

Figure 199: Sphere of influence for the impoundment scenario with a grassed armouring cover.

Figure 200: Total environmental and engineering costs for a diverse vegetative cover.
Figure 201: Sphere of influence for the impoundment scenario with a diverse vegetative cover.

Figure 202: Total integrated cumulative costs for the various impoundment covers modelled.

Figure 203: Total integrated environmental and engineering life-cycle costs for the different cover types modelled. The dashed lines indicate only the engineering costs whereas the solid lines are the total integrated environmental and engineering costs.

Figure 204: Combined visual perception and air quality environmental influence zones for the various impoundment covers modelled illustrating the change in possible impact zone as a result of change in impoundment design.

Figure 205: Simplified integrated environmental and engineering costs for different cover types.

Figure 206: Schematic illustration of simplified environmental impact and basic engineering costs.

Figure 207: Regional land use map around the ERGO Daggafoontein tailings impoundment.

Figure 208: Total environmental sphere of influence modelled and spatially represented.

Figure 209: Comparing modelled zones of influence with typical policy buffer distances.

Figure 210: Creating stepped embankment slopes at the ERGO Daggafoontein tailings impoundment using heavy machinery.

Figure 211: Stepped sloped grading balancing cut and fill.

Figure 212: Woody vegetation planted in situ on tailings impoundments.

Figure 213: Integrating tailings impoundment design with long-term regional land development objectives.

Figure 214: Hypothetical regenerative impoundment landform (Rademeyer and van den Berg, 2005).

Figure 215: Typical tailings impoundment profile (van den Berg, 2004).

Figure 216: Tailings impoundment profile that is sensitive towards the natural landscape (van den Berg, 2004).