

**DE VILLIERS, CHARL JOHANNES**

**THE AWARENESS LEVEL OF DIFFERENT STAKEHOLDER  
GROUPS AND THEIR WILLINGNESS TO SUPPORT CORPORATE  
ENVIRONMENTAL REPORTING IN SOUTH AFRICA**

**DCom**

**UP**

**1996**

**THE AWARENESS LEVEL OF DIFFERENT STAKEHOLDER GROUPS AND THEIR  
WILLINGNESS TO SUPPORT CORPORATE ENVIRONMENTAL REPORTING  
IN SOUTH AFRICA**

by

**CHARL JOHANNES DE VILLIERS**

Submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree of

**DOCTOR OF COMMERCE**

in

**ACCOUNTING SCIENCES**

**FACULTY OF ECONOMIC AND MANAGEMENT SCIENCES**

at the

**UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA**

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My wish to convey my most sincere gratitude to:

1. My Lord and Saviour, the Trinity of the Father, the Son and the Holy Spirit without Whom nothing can be achieved;
2. Prof Quintus Vorster, my promoter. From our very first interview, I was made to feel like a valued customer. I always received feed-back immediately, yet I was never forced in a particular direction. I always had to make the decisions, yet I always knew the parameters for those decisions precisely. Prof. Vorster ensured that I will always remember my studies with fondness;
3. Prof JS Maritz for assistance with statistical manipulations;
4. Me Santie van Tonder for administrative assistance;
5. Colleagues at the University of Stellenbosch and at the University of Pretoria for useful comments and encouragement;
6. Rouxelle, my wife, for encouragement and perseverance;
7. The Public Accountants and Auditors Board for financial assistance;
8. The Centre for Science Development for financial assistance.

Opinions expressed in this thesis and conclusions arrived at are those of the author and are not necessarily to be attributed to any of the parties above.

**CONTENTS**

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	i
CONTENTS	ii
LIST OF TABLES	viii
LIST OF FIGURES	x
LIST OF APPENDIXES	xi
<b>CHAPTER 1</b>	
<b>THE RESEARCH PROBLEM AND BACKGROUND</b>	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background	1
1.3 The Problem	3
1.4 The Importance of the Study	4
1.5 Delimitations	4
1.6 Hypotheses and Recommendations	5
1.7 The Outline of the Study	6
<b>CHAPTER 2</b>	
<b>REASONS FOR AND AGAINST ENVIRONMENTAL DISCLOSURE</b>	
2.1 Introduction and Overview	8
2.1.1 Introduction	8
2.1.2 Overview of reasons for and against environmental reporting	9
2.2 Accounting Theory	11
2.2.1 Introduction	11
2.2.2 The Purpose of Accounting	12
2.2.3 User Groups and their Information Needs	13
2.2.4 Overview of Different Accounting Theories	14
2.2.5 Traditional Approaches to Accounting Theory - Non-theoretical Approaches	14
2.2.6 Traditional Approaches to Accounting Theory - Theoretical Approaches	15

	a.	Deductive Approach	15
	b.	Inductive Approach	16
	c.	Ethical Approach	17
	d.	Sociological Approach	18
	e.	Economic Approach	19
	f.	Eclectic Approach	20
2.2.7		New Approaches to Accounting Theory	20
	a.	Regulatory Approach	20
	b.	Events Approach	22
	c.	Behavioural Approach	22
	d.	Predictive Approach	23
	e.	Positive Approach	24
2.2.8		Section Summary	24
2.3		Ethical Theory	25
	2.3.1	Introduction	25
	2.3.2	Consequentialism vs Non-consequentialism	26
	2.3.3	Utilitarianism	27
	2.3.4	Deontology	28
	2.3.5	Natural Law	30
	2.3.6	The Application of Ethical Theories	31
	2.3.7	Section Summary	32
2.4		Business Ethics	33
	2.4.1	Introduction	33
	2.4.2	Capitalism and Justice	34
	2.4.3	John Rawls - A Theory of Justice	35
	2.4.4	Corporate Governance	37
	2.4.5	Social Responsibility	38
	2.4.6	Environmental Responsibility in Business	40
	2.4.7	Externalities	41

2.4.8	Efficient Market Hypothesis	42
2.4.9	Section Summary	43
2.5	Environmental Ethics	45
2.5.1	Introduction	45
2.5.2	Economics and the Environment	45
2.5.3	Biocentric Ethics	47
2.5.4	Ecocentric Ethics	47
2.5.5	Rolston's Value System	48
2.5.6	Section Summary	50
2.6	Pragmatic Reasons for Environmental Reporting	50
2.6.1	Introduction	50
2.6.2	Profitability and Environmental Disclosure	51
2.6.3	Corporate Image	51
2.6.4	Employee Considerations	52
2.6.5	Competitive Advantage or Peer Pressure	52
2.6.6	Banks and Creditors	53
2.6.7	Insurance	54
2.6.8	Ethical Investment	54
2.6.9	Third Party Disclosure	55
2.6.10	Build Expertise in Advance of Legislation	56
2.6.11	Obviate the Need for Legislation	56
2.6.12	Legitimacy	57
2.6.13	Section Summary	57
2.7	Arguments Against Environmental Disclosure	58
2.7.1	Cost	58
2.7.2	Relevance of Information	59
2.7.3	Secrecy	59
2.7.4	Information Overload	60
2.7.5	Section Summary	60

2.8	Voluntary vs Mandatory Environmental Disclosure	60
2.9	Chapter Summary and Conclusions	62
2.9.1	Summary	62
2.9.2	Conclusions	63

### CHAPTER 3

#### CURRENT REQUIREMENTS AND THE STATUS QUO OF ENVIRONMENTAL REPORTING

3.1	Introduction	64
3.2	Current Environmental Reporting Requirements	65
3.3	The Status Quo of Environmental Reporting	67
3.3.1	Introduction	67
3.3.2	Content Analysis	68
a.	Conventional Environmental Reporting - Global Perspective	68
b.	Conventional Environmental Reporting - South African Perspective	70
c.	Sustainable Development Reporting	71
3.3.3	Criteria Used in Content Analyses	72
3.3.4	Standards	73
3.4	Conclusions	82
3.5	Linkages Between the Theory and the First Empirical Study	83

### CHAPTER 4

#### RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND RESULTS OF THE FIRST EMPIRICAL STUDY

4.1	Introduction	84
4.2	Questionnaire Content	85
4.3	Population	87
4.3.1	Introduction	87
4.3.2	Auditors	88
4.3.3	Managers	88
4.3.4	Users	89
4.3.5	Summary	91
4.4	Distribution of the Questionnaire	91

2.8	Voluntary vs Mandatory Environmental Disclosure	60
2.9	Chapter Summary and Conclusions	62
2.9.1	Summary	62
2.9.2	Conclusions	63
CHAPTER 3		
CURRENT REQUIREMENTS AND THE STATUS QUO OF ENVIRONMENTAL REPORTING		
3.1	Introduction	64
3.2	Current Environmental Reporting Requirements	65
3.3	The Status Quo of Environmental Reporting	67
3.3.1	Introduction	67
3.3.2	Content Analysis	68
a.	Conventional Environmental Reporting - Global Perspective	68
b.	Conventional Environmental Reporting - South African Perspective	70
c.	Sustainable Development Reporting	71
3.3.3	Criteria Used in Content Analyses	72
3.3.4	Standards	73
3.4	Conclusions	82
3.5	Linkages Between the Theory and the First Empirical Study	83
CHAPTER 4		
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND RESULTS OF THE FIRST EMPIRICAL STUDY		
4.1	Introduction	84
4.2	Questionnaire Content	85
4.3	Population	87
4.3.1	Introduction	87
4.3.2	Auditors	88
4.3.3	Managers	88
4.3.4	Users	89
4.3.5	Summary	91
4.4	Distribution of the Questionnaire	91

4.5	Response Rate and Representativeness of the Results	92
4.6	Responses to the Questions in the First Empirical Study	94
4.7	Awareness Levels of Individuals of the Three Groups of Current Implications of Corporate Environmental Reporting	161
4.8	Willingness of Individuals of the Three Groups to Support More Corporate Environmental Reporting	161
4.9	Recommendations for the Accounting Profession and Government regarding the Future of Corporate Environmental Reporting in South Africa	163
4.10	Cost/Benefit and Information Overload	164
4.11	Recommendations for the Accounting Profession and Government regarding the Minimum Requirements for Corporate Environmental Reporting in South Africa	165
4.12	Conclusions and Recommendations	166

CHAPTER 5  
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND RESULTS OF THE SECOND EMPIRICAL STUDY

5.1	Introduction	169
5.2	Questionnaire Content	170
5.3	Population	172
5.3.1	Introduction	172
5.3.2	Auditors	172
5.3.3	Managers	173
5.3.4	Users	173
	a. Chartered Accountants Not Registered with the PAAB	173
	b. Stockbrokers	174
	c. Bankers	174
	d. Assurance Companies	174
5.3.5	Summary	174
5.4	Distribution of the Questionnaire	175
5.5	Response Rate	176

5.6	The Possibility of Bias towards the Environment Inherent in the Respondents	176
5.6.1	Auditors and Managers	176
5.6.2	Users	177
5.6.3	Final Number of Respondents	178
5.7	Representativeness of the Results	179
5.8	Responses to the Questions in the Second Empirical Study	179
5.9	Willingness of Individuals of the Three Groups to Support More Comprehensive Corporate Environmental Reporting	194
5.10	Recommendations for the Accounting Profession and Government regarding Minimum Requirements for Corporate Environmental Reporting in South Africa	195
5.11	Conclusions	195
5.12	Comparison Between the Results of the First and the Second Study	197
CHAPTER 6		
SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS		
6.1	Introduction	199
6.2	Conclusion Regarding the Awareness of Environmental Impacts	199
6.3	Conclusions Regarding the Willingness to Support More Environmental Reporting	199
6.4	Recommendations for the Accounting Profession and Government Regarding Corporate Environmental Reporting	200
6.5	Recommendations Regarding Minimum Requirements for Corporate Environmental Reporting	201
6.6	Recommendations for Future Research	202
6.7	Summary of Results	203
APPENDIXES		204
REFERENCES		333
SUMMARY		342
OPSOMMING		344

## LIST OF TABLES

	Page	
2.1	Reasons for voluntary disclosure or non-disclosure	10
2.2	Users and their information needs	13
3.1	Some areas in which the statutory financial statements and audit will need to reflect environmental considerations	66
3.2	Summarised UN recommendations on environmental disclosure	74
3.3	Summarised framework of the Canadian Institute of Chartered Accountants on environmental disclosure	75
3.4	Summarised framework of the Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales on environmental disclosure	76
3.5	Summary of the Hundred Group of Finance Directors, Environmental Working Party, statement of good practice, environmental reporting in annual reports	77
3.6	PERI guidelines on environmental reporting	78
3.7	Summary of environmental reporting standards	82
3.8	Linkages between the theory and the first empirical study	83
4.1	Summary of populations and samples	91
4.2	Summary of mailings and respondents	92
	Responses to each question in the first study	95-159
4.3	Summary of Sections 3 and 4 of the empirical study	160
4.4	Aggregate of answers to Section 2 of the questionnaire	161
4.5	Aggregate of answers to Sections 3 and 4 of the questionnaire	162
5.1	Linkages between the questionnaires used in the first and the second study	171
5.2	Summary of populations and samples	175
5.3	Summary of mailings and respondents	176
5.4	Final number of respondents	179
	Responses to each question in the second study	180-192
5.5	Summary of Section 2 of the empirical study	193

5.6	Aggregate of answers to the second section of the questionnaire	194
6.1	Recommended minimum requirements for corporate environmental reporting	202

**LIST OF FIGURES**

	Page
Responses to each question in the first study	101-159
4.1 Summary of first study - awareness of legislation	121
4.2 Summary of first study - awareness of GAAP	121
4.3 Summary of Section 3 Questions 2 to 6	130
4.4 Summary of first study - willingness	160
Responses to each question in the second study	182-192
5.1 Summary of the results of the second survey	193

**LIST OF APPENDIXES**

1	Questionnaire for auditors of financial statements	204
2	Questionnaire for managers	208
3	Questionnaire for users of financial statements	212
4	Individuals who reviewed the questionnaires	216
5	Individuals included in the pilot run	217
6	Covering letter to accompany the pilot run	219
7	Letter to SAICA	220
8	Top 300 companies according to the Financial Mail 1994	221
9	Letter to CIMA	226
10	Letter to ACCA	227
11	Letter to the Institute of Internal Auditors	228
12	Letter to banks	229
13	Registered banks in South Africa	230
14	Bank covering letter to accompany the questionnaire	236
15	General covering letter to accompany the questionnaire	237
16	Addendum to the questionnaire (List of BIG37)	238
17	Questionnaire used in the second survey (for all but accountants)	239
18	Questionnaire used in the second survey (for accountants)	240
19	List of auditors in the second survey	241
20	List of directors in the second survey	246
21	List of users in the second survey	252
22	Covering letter of the second survey	256
23	Covering letter of the second request	257
24	A comparison between the responses received by mail and those solicited by telephone	258
25	Fisher's exact test of differences between the responses of the three groups in the second study	273

26	Co-efficient of variation of the mean to assess the representativeness of the respondents in the second survey	302
27	Fisher's exact test of first vs second study responses	303